Palestinian Women Teachers in East Jerusalem: Layers of Discrimination in the Labor Market

Rawan Asali Nuseibeh

This article focuses on the multiple layers of structural discrimination that Palestinian women face in finding employment in occupied East Jerusalem. Faced with limited opportunities in a stagnant economy, isolated from the rest of the Palestinian periphery, and not fully integrated into Israeli society, they are often more educated than their male peers, but family considerations and gender norms shape their educational and professional decision-making processes, trapping them in "feminized" professions such as teaching. As a result, Palestinian women in East Jerusalem have some of the lowest levels of labor participation, regionally and globally.

This article explores the intersectionality of oppression that Palestinian women face in occupied East Jerusalem. The feminist discourse surrounding the experiences of Palestinian women residing under Israeli occupation cannot be detached from their status as both women and as an indigenous minority in a settler-colonial context.[1] Anti-colonial feminist accounts "position 'gender' and 'sexuality' alongside 'race' and 'nation' as analytical categories . . . that call for critical and creative engagement."[2]

In gender studies there has been a shift from the white liberal feminist approach, which tends to group all women into one category when analyzing their oppression or the barriers they face, toward a theoretical analysis that gives voice to the oppressed in the subgroups within a social category.[3] The intersectionality of gender, class, and race is becoming a prominent theoretical framework, not only in the field of women's studies but in social sciences in general.[4]

Rawan Asali Nuseibeh is a lecturer at the Hebrew University, teaching in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology and at the School of Education. She recently finished a two-year postdoctoral fellowship at the Hebrew University, where she researched the layers of discrimination Palestinian women face in the labor market in Jerusalem. Her research interests include social exclusion, inequality, education, gender, and youth.

1. Sarab Abu-Rabia-Queder, "Feminist Activism in a Settler-Colonial Context: The Case of Bedouin Palestinian Women," *Counter/Action*, June 8, 2017, https://counteractionmag.com/current-issue/2017/6/6/feminist-activism-in-a-settler-colonial-context-the-case-of-bedouin-palestinian-women.

2. Scott Lauria Morgensen, "Theorising Gender, Sexuality and Settler Colonialism: An Introduction," *Settler Colonial Studies* 2, no. 2 (2012): 5, doi:10.1080/2201473X.2012.10648839.

3. Wini Breines, "What's Love Got to Do with It? White Women, Black Women, and Feminism in the Movement Years," *Signs* 27, no. 4 (Summer 2002): 1,095–133. doi:10.1086/339634; Evangelina Holvino, "Intersections: The Simultaneity of Race, Gender and Class in Organization Studies," *Gender, Work and Organization* 17, no. 3 (May 2010): 248–77. doi:10.1111/j.1468-0432.2008.00400.x; Ange-Marie Hancock, "When Multiplication Doesn't Equal Quick Addition: Examining Intersectionality as a Research Paradigm," *Perspectives on Politics* 5, no. 1 (Mar. 2007): 63–79. doi:10.1017/S1537592707070065; Leslie McCall, "The Complexity of Intersectionality," *Signs* 30, no. 3 (Spring 2005): 1,771–800. doi:10.1086/426800.

4. Averil Y. Clarke and Leslie McCall, "Intersectionality and Social Explanation in Social Science Research," *Du Bois Review* 10, no. 2 (Fall 2013): 349–63. doi:10.1017/S1742058X13000325.

HTTPS://DOI.ORG/10.3751/73.2.12

Gender cannot be regarded as a homogenous category.[5] Grouping all women together is reflective of "hegemonic discourses of identity politics that render invisible experiences of the more marginal members of that specific social category . . ."[6] Intersectionality goes beyond the naive "global sisterhood approach," when liberal feminism claims to speak for all women and hence fails to explore the multiple layers of discrimination that women from certain ethnicities, religions, sexualities, abilities, classes, and geographic locations suffer from.[7]

It is not possible to analyze the barriers that Palestinian women face in finding job opportunities either by grouping them with Israeli women based on gender or with Palestinian men based on nationality. Nor is it possible to compare the cases of Palestinian women living in East Jerusalem with those living in the West Bank or with Palestinian women in Israel who have Israeli citizenship. To reach a more complete and accurate analysis of the restrictions Palestinian Jerusalemite women face in the labor market, it is crucial to look at gender, class, and ethnicity as simultaneous processes that affect power relationships in the city and determine what opportunities are available.

Looking at labor force trends in Jerusalem for populations in peak working ages (25–64), Palestinian women participation stands at 18% in comparison with 79% of Israeli Jewish women.[8] These statistics are based on Israeli government sources, so they reflect official data on Palestinians who are registered as employed or unemployed in Israel. In the context of occupied East Jerusalem, statistics should be viewed with suspicion. There are cases of Palestinian Jerusalemites who work in the West Bank but register in Israel as unemployed. There are also cases of Palestinians working in Jerusalem in the informal domestic labor market and register themselves as unemployed as well. Palestinian Jerusalemites can pursue job opportunities in the Israeli labor market of West Jerusalem, the Palestinian market of East Jerusalem, or across the Separation Barrier in the West Bank. However, there are limitations and restrictions on Palestinians' job opportunities in each one of these markets. This article reflects on the barriers and restrictions they face.

This study relied on eight focus groups from late 2012 and early 2013, which included 28 Palestinian women from East Jerusalem as well as secondary statistical data. I analyzed the data within the context of a half-century of occupation of East Jerusalem; the ethnocratic ideology of the Israeli occupation; the double patriarchy of the occupation and Palestinian culture; and intersectionality that links gender, nationality, and class in the labor market. The article aims to contribute to the literature on the intersectionality of inequality by showing how the multiple layers of oppression affect the work prospects of Palestinian women residing in the city.

5. Shehla Riza Arifeen and Caroline Gatrell, "A Blind Spot in Organization Studies: Gender with Ethnicity, Nationality and Religion," *Gender in Management* 28, no. 3 (2013): 151–70. doi:10.1108/GM-01-2013-0008.

6. Nira Yuval-Davis, "Intersectionality and Feminist Politics," *European Journal of Women's Studies* 13, no. 3 (2006): 195, doi:10.1177/1350506806065752.

7. Holvino, "Intersections," 259. Indeed, some intersectional feminist approaches have pointed out that looking only at women perpetuates a binary gender system, when "There are no longer two genders but countless ones, no longer two sexes but five." McCall, "Complexity of Intersectionality," 1,778.

8. Maya Choshen, Michal Korach, and Dafna Shemer, "Jerusalem: Facts and Trends 2016 — The State of the City and Changing Trends," trans. Merav Datan, Jerusalem Institute for Policy Research, publication no. 461 (2016): 48.

INTERSECTIONALITY IN THE CONTEXT OF COLONIALISM

Daiva Stasiulis and Nira Yuval-Davis noted that — while class, race, and ethnicity have been given prominence in settler-colonial studies — the gendered construction of colonialism itself is crucial and has not gained enough attention.[9] Several feminist scholars who have researched Palestine/Israel noted the importance of looking into the dual patriarchy of the occupier and local traditional rules. When looking at the case of Palestinian women residing in occupied East Jerusalem, it is worth using Kimberle Crenshaw's original concept of intersectionality.[10] Crenshaw coined the term in 1989 when studying discrimination against black women in the United States. The idea of intersectionality is that "social identities and social inequality . . . are interdependent and mutually constitutive . . ."[11] One cannot study the different forms of discrimination independently, but one must rather look at their simultaneous effects on groups in society who suffer due to their social identities.

In a study on Palestinian women in the Israeli labor market, Suheir Daoud noted that there is no single theory that can explain the complex reality of Palestinian women's marginalization in the Israeli labor market. She noticed how previous theories — which either focused on the status of Palestinians as a "trapped" indigenous minority or on Palestinians' forced dependency on the Israeli economy and the delegitimization of their institutions — failed to address gender issues, thus overlooking the simultaneous systems of oppression that Palestinian women face. She looked, instead, into theoretical frameworks of patriarchy and socialization.[12]

Meanwhile, Nadera Shalhoub-Kervorkian noted in her research that Palestinian women have to fight several structures of oppression. They face the dual patriarchy of Israeli colonialism and Palestinian traditionalism. Using Michel Foucault's theories of power, Shalhoub-Kevorkian argued that, in the Palestinian context, the imbalance of external Israeli and internal Palestinian control means that "returning control" tends to be directed at community insiders who have less power, primarily women. She further argued that daily practices of hegemonic powers of formal and informal social institutions control Palestinian women's bodies.[13] In a separate study on Palestinian women's bodies as central sites of the struggle between the state and the Palestinian community, Kim Jezabel Zinngrebe similarly noted that — even when she did not discuss issues of the body, sexuality, or gender — the vast majority of her research participants cast their

9. Daiva Stasiulis and Nira Yuval-Davis, eds., *Unsettling Settler Societies: Articulations of Gender, Race, Ethnicity and Class* (London: Sage, 1995).

10. Kimberle Crenshaw, "Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics," *University of Chicago Legal Forum* (1989): 138–67.

11. Lisa Bowleg, "When Black + Lesbian + Woman ≠ Black Lesbian Woman: The Methodological Challenges of Qualitative and Quantitative Intersectionality Research," *Sex Roles* 59, no. 5–6 (2008): 312, doi:10.1007/s11199-008-9400-z.

12. Suheir Abu Oksa Daoud, "Palestinian Working Women in Israel: National Oppression and Social Restraints," *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies* 8, no. 2 (Spring 2012): 78–101. doi:10.2979/jmiddeastwomstud.8.2.78.

13. Nadera Shalhoub-Kevorkian, "Racism, Militarisation and Policing: Police Reactions to Violence against Palestinian Women in Israel," *Social Identities* 10, no. 2 (2004): 171–93. doi:10.1080/1350463042000227344.

bodies as central sites of daily struggles with both the patriarchal Israeli state and the patriarchal Palestinian society.[14]

In her research on the economic situation of Palestinian Bedouin women in Israel, Sarab Abu-Rabia-Queder also noted how their marginalization is mediated by their position as women in the national (Israeli) and ethnic (Bedouin/Palestinian) collectives alike. She wrote that the symbolic representation of women's bodies, which produce life, places women as key figures in the struggle of "us" versus "them." Abu-Rabia-Queder relied on Crenshaw's concept of intersectionality as a theoretical and methodological approach to studying inequality, arguing that Palestinian Bedouin professional women in Israel who attempt to enter the economy as equals are liable to upset the balance of power on three levels. They challenge the symbolic boundaries of colonial power relations between the Israeli state and Israel's Palestinian population, gender power relations between women and men in the economy, and the tribal power of the collective in favor of individual-professional power that is manipulated by the state. She examined these intersecting structures, which lead to the marginalization of Palestinian Bedouin women in the Israeli labor market.[15]

This article, meanwhile, looks at the intersection of the different structures of oppression that reproduce the marginal status of Palestinian Jerusalemite women in the labor markets of East Jerusalem, West Jerusalem, and the West Bank. Similar to Abu-Rabia-Queder's and Daoud's theoretical frameworks, I will look into the interrelated discrimination structures that determine the open and closed spaces for Palestinian Jerusalemite women in the economic sector.

THE CONTEXT OF EAST JERUSALEM

Since 1967, when Israel occupied the eastern parts of Jerusalem that had been under Jordanian rule after 1948, Israeli politicians have upheld the entire city as their country's "eternal and indivisible" capital. After the war, the municipality of Jerusalem was expanded to include the eastern parts of the city, and in 1980, Israel's parliament passed a basic law that constitutionally enshrined the city — "complete and united" (i.e., including East Jerusalem) — as Israel's capital.[16] Israel granted Palestinian Jerusalemites residency status but not citizenship.[17] However, the international community recognizes East Jerusalem as occupied Palestinian territory. Passed shortly after the 1967 war, United Nations Security Council Resolution 242 reaffirms "the inadmissibility of the acquisition of territory by war" and calls for the "withdrawal of Israel armed forces from territories occupied in the recent conflict."[18]

14. Kim Jezabel Zinngrebe, "Palestinian Women in Israel: Embodied Citizen Strangers," *Settler Colonial Studies* 9, no. 1 (2019): 117–34. doi:10.1080/2201473X.2018.1487272.

15. Sarab Abu-Rabia-Queder, "The Paradox of Professional Marginality among Arab-Bedouin Women," *Sociology* 51, no. 5 (2017): 1,084–1,100. doi:10.1177/0038038516641621.

16. Rawan Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion in Jerusalem: The Provision of Education and Social Services* (Abingdon, UK: Routledge, 2015), 23.

17. B'Tselem, "East Jerusalem," November 11, 2017, www.btselem.org/jerusalem/.

18. Olivier Legrand and Oren Yiftachel, "Sovereignty, Planning and Gray Space: Illegal Construction of Sarajevo and Jerusalem," in *Cities to be Tamed? Spatial Investigations across the Urban South*, ed. Francesco Chiodelli et al. (Newcastle, UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2014), 217.

Palestinians consider the city their capital and refuse to accept Israel's sovereignty. Accordingly, most Palestinian Jerusalemites do not recognize the authority of the Israeli municipal government in the city and have boycotted local elections since 1967. However, this boycott has resulted in Palestinians' lack of access and influence over resource allocation in East Jerusalem, leaving their neighborhoods neglected and underdeveloped. Palestinian Jerusalemites, who constitute more than 30% of city residents, received less than 12% of the municipal budget in 2003 and 7% in 2009, even though they contribute more through the *arnona* municipal property tax (for example, in 2009, Palestinian Jerusalemites paid around 55% of the city's total *arnona* taxes).[19]

In a 2016 article, Oren Shlomo described Israel's governance of East Jerusalem as "a certain type of colonial urbanism, essentially manifested in Israeli political and spatial expansion over Palestinian space and population . . . characterized by the implementation of the policy of Judaization of the annexed areas in ways that prevent any future division of the city . . ."[20] Israel's colonial governance of the city can be witnessed at three policy levels. First, annexing East Jerusalem and populating it with Israeli settlements prevents future division of the city. Israel has been establishing new Jewish neighborhoods, recognized internationally as settlements, that do not cater to the local Palestinian population. It was estimated that the state had settled 209,000 Israeli settlers in East Jerusalem by the end of 2017.[21] The government offers Israelis an array of incentives to populate these "neighborhoods," such as subsidized housing, tax breaks, and low mortgages.[22]

The second policy has been, despite annexation, to deny much of the the city's Palestinian population access to the city core by building the so-called Separation Barrier in the early/mid-2000s through some of the more highly populated Palestinian neighborhoods. Today, almost 40% of Palestinian Jerusalemites reside in neighborhoods disconnected from the rest of the city due to the Separation Barrier.[23] Even though they have Jerusalem residency permits, they still reside in "gray" urban areas, where they are "completely deprived of urban services as basic as rubbish collection and postal delivery."[24]

The third policy used by the state to control the Palestinian population in Jerusalem is the actual revocation of residency permits. In 1995, Israel promulgated a "center of life" policy, giving the Ministry of Interior the power to revoke residency permits of Palestinians who are unable to prove that their "center of life" is Jerusalem.[25] With this

19. United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), "The Palestinian Economy in East Jerusalem: Enduring Annexation, Isolation and Disintegration," doc. no. UNCTAD/GDS/APP/2012/1 (2013): 10.

20. Oren Shlomo, "Between Discrimination and Stabilization: The Exceptional Governmentalities of East Jerusalem," *City* 20, no. 3 (2016): 428, doi:10.1080/13604813.2016.1166700.

21. B'Tselem, "East Jerusalem."

22. Human Rights Watch, "Separate and Unequal: Israel's Discriminatory Treatment of Palestinians in the Occupied Palestinian Territories" (Dec. 2010): 8–14, 46–60; Meron Benvenisti, *The West Bank Data Project: A Survey of Israel's Policies* (Washington, DC: American Enterprise Institute, 1984).

23. B'Tselem, "Separation Barrier," November 11, 2017, www.btselem.org/separation_barrier; B'Tselem, "East Jerusalem." Beginning in 2002, Israel constructed a massive barrier through the West Bank that breaks up Palestinian urban and rural blocs, severing ties both within and between communities.

24. Lengrad and Yiftachel, "Sovereignty, Planning and Gray Space," 222. According to that chapter, *gray space* refers to "legal but unplanned or illegal but planned urban development," see pp. 215–16.

25. Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion*, 78.

regulation, the residency permits of more than 14,000 Palestinian Jerusalemites had been revoked by 2014.[26] This policy has a two-way effect on the city, preventing West Bank Palestinians from being able to enter the city on a regular basis while also causing an influx of those with Jerusalem residency permits migrating into the city to save their permit-holding status. This resulted in a strain on the already weak resources available to the city's Palestinian community.[27]

As a result of these three policies, Palestinian Jerusalemites' disempowerment is manifested formally at the levels of state institutions, laws, and regulations and informally at the level of the community and everyday interactions in the city. Looking at the rights of Palestinians in the city, inequality can be witnessed at the different levels: the lack of civil rights, the division of families, decreased land allocation, Israel's policy of house demolitions, and the lack of development in neglected neighborhoods.[28]

In his 2014 study on Palestinian women living in Jerusalem, Thomas Abowd argued that "racism, national chauvinism, class oppression and gender all impinge on the lives of Palestinian women."[29] Within their community, Palestinian women are still burdened with traditional gender norms, values, and attitudes. The family, with its patriarchal hierarchy is still embedded in all aspects of society, making women face patriarchy in all aspects of their lives.[30] In Palestinian society men are granted considerable power and authority in both the public and private spheres. The conception of men as the stronger, more rational, and more capable gender justifies restricting women's opportunities within the family sphere and outside.[31] Therefore, this article looks into how the oppression of the Israeli occupation and the inequalities resulting from the social construction of gender roles in Palestinian society intersect to affect Palestinian women's labor force participation in East Jerusalem.

26. Hamoked (Center for the Defence of the Individual), "Israel Continues Its 'Quiet Deportation' Policy: In 2014, the Ministry of Interior Revoked the Residency Status of 107 Palestinians from East Jerusalem," March 23, 2015, www.hamoked.org/Document.aspx?dID=Updates1483.

27. Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion*, 93.

28. Yoav Peled, "Towards a Post-Citizenship Society? A Report from the Front," *Citizenship Studies* 11, no. 1 (2007): 95–104. doi:10.1080/13621020601099930; Bethany M. Nikfar, "Families Divided: An Analysis of Israel's Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law," *Northwestern Journal of International Human Rights* 3, no. 1 (Spring 2005): 5–25; Nisreen Alyan et al., "Human Rights in East Jerusalem: Facts and Figures," trans. Adina Sacks, Association for Civil Rights in Israel (May 2010): 41–57; Meir Margalit, "No Place like Home: House Demolitions in East Jerusalem," Israeli Committee Against House Demolitions [ICAHD] (Mar. 2007), available online at www.grafing-evangelisch.de/israel/icahd/no_place_like_home.pdf; Riman Barakat, "Palestinian Jerusalemites: A Slow Process of Displacement, a Permanent Refugee Behavior," *Palestine-Israel Journal* 15, no. 2 (2008), www.pij.org/app.php/articles/1169; Noga F., "July 2017 Demolition and Displacement Summary," ICAHD, July 27, 2017, https://icahd.org/2017/07/27/july-2017-demolition-and-displacement-summary/; Mick Dumper and Wendy Pullan, "Jerusalem: The Cost of Failure" Chatham House, Briefing Paper no. 2010/03 (Feb. 2010), www.chathamhouse.org/publications/papers/view/109245.

29. Thomas Philip Abowd, *Colonial Jerusalem: The Spatial Construction of Identity and Difference in a City of Myth, 1948–2012* (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2014), 151.

30. Amalia Sa'ar, "Feminine Strength: Reflections on Power and Gender in Israeli-Palestinian Culture," *Anthropological Quarterly* 79, no. 3 (Summer 2006): 397–430. doi:10.1353/anq.2006.0041.

31. Samia Al-Botmeh, "Barriers to Female Labour Market Participation and Entrepreneurship in the Occupied Palestinian Territory," Birzeit University, Centre for Development Studies (2013), https://pfesp.ps/uploads/Barriers-to-Female-Participation-in-Labour-Market-2013.pdf.

METHODOLOGY

This study looked at teachers' stories and narratives of why they chose the teaching profession, the obstacles they faced in entering the job market, the factors hampering the progression of their careers, and why women are clustered in the teaching profession. Qualitative research methods were adopted to enable the researcher to capture people's interpretations of their realities. Speaking to Palestinian female teachers living in East Jerusalem sheds light on the multiple challenges they face. It also allows us to see how these women "experience subjectively their daily lives in terms of inclusion and exclusion, discrimination and disadvantage, specific aspirations and specific identities."[32] Personal "[n]arrative is a primary means by which we assign meanings to our experience," since they reflect cultural expectations.[33] This narrative method has been developed with intersectional studies.

This study depended on eight focus groups conducted with 28 teachers from the four different education systems that operate in East Jerusalem: the Israeli municipal Jerusalem Education Administration, the *awqaf* or Islamic religious endowments (run in collaboration with the Palestinian Authority's Ministry of Education[34]), the United Nations Relief and Works Agency (UNRWA, which serves Palestinian refugees), and private schools.[35] In each school system, several schools were chosen at random. At each school, the principal invited teachers to join the group — usually those available and willing to join. All the focus groups were held at the schools themselves, lasting between one and two hours. Discussions were conducted in Arabic and were recorded with the consent of the participants. The responses were then transcribed and translated into English. The names of the participants have been changed to ensure anonymity.

FINDINGS

The Effects of Israeli Policies

Palestinian Jerusalemites try to pursue employment in three markets: the West Bank, East Jerusalem, and West Jerusalem. Isolated by the Separation Barrier, Palestinian Jerusalemites are forced to cross checkpoints on a daily basis if they find employment in the West Bank. This results in long travel hours, exhaustion, and humiliation at checkpoints from Israeli soldiers. Salma, a private school teacher in one of the focus groups, explained this clearly:

> I used to work in a company in Ramallah, and I got so tired and exhausted from all the checkpoints and the transportation, and so I found this job here as a teacher, and it is easier. It is much better than finishing your job at four p.m. in Ramallah and spending two hours at the checkpoint to get home.

32. Yuval-Davis, "Intersectionality and Feminist Politics," 198.

33. Kirsi LaPointe, "Heroic Career Changers? Gendered Identity Work in Career Transitions," *Gender, Work and Organization* 20, no. 2 (2012): 135, doi:10.1111/j.1468-0432.2012.00601.x.

34. According to the Oslo Accords, the Palestinian Authority is prohibited from operating in Jerusalem, so the these schools are run by the Directorate of Education in Jerusalem, which had been a Jordanian institution before 1967, in coordination with *awqaf*.

35. Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion*, 49.

If they choose to work in the city, Palestinian Jerusalemites are left with two options: the underdeveloped economy of East Jerusalem or West Jerusalem, which is integrated into Israel. However, the employment mobility of Palestinians has a low ceiling in Israel. As of 2016, even Palestinian citizens of Israel only earned 58.6% of what Israeli Jews earned.[36] Palestinian graduates from East Jerusalem schools have a weak command of the Hebrew language, because they learn Hebrew as a third language, and their instructors are not certified Hebrew teachers.[37] This means that Palestinian Jerusalemites are forced to spend a year of preparation to acquire the language before entering an Israeli university or college. Their alternate options are to attend a Palestinian university in the West Bank or to drop out and enter the unskilled labor market.[38]

The lack of educational and later occupational prospects explains why, when looking at employment trends of Palestinian men in Jerusalem, they are found clustered in gendered professions that are mostly limited to men, such as trade, construction, and manufacturing. For Palestinian Jerusalemite men, finding a job in construction or as an unskilled laborer in Israel is possible, but such prospects are more limited for women. Palestinian Jerusalemite women are at a disadvantage in the labor market when compared to Palestinian men and are also at a disadvantage when compared to Israeli women. Similar to Palestinian women, Jewish women in Israel are clustered in education, health, and social services. However, they have a sector open to them that is restricted to Palestinian women: local and public administration, which is where 13% of Jewish women in Jerusalem work.[39] The restricted access to this sector to Palestinian Jerusalemite women is a result of a combination of factors such as weak proficiency in the Hebrew language, having degrees from Palestinian institutions of higher education, and reluctance to join Israeli institutions.

Palestinian women who are Israeli citizens also lag behind Israeli Jewish women in their labor force participation.[40] Those "who do participate in paid work tend to face a double disadvantage: they are more segregated in female-typed jobs, and they still lag behind all [Jewish] groups" in terms of average pay.[41] Palestinian women with Israeli citizenship earn 56% of the average Jewish Israeli woman's salary. While a large percentage of Palestinian girls in Israel concentrate on science and engineering in high school, they pursue careers in those fields at much lower rates than their Jewish counterparts and tend to work jobs in education instead.[42] This does not guarantee their transition to the labor market, however, as the demand for teachers in the Palestinian education system in Israel

36. Moti Bassok, "Wage Gap between Israeli Jews and Arab Counterparts Widens," *Haaretz*, November 23, 2016, www.haaretz.com/1.5465521.

37. Nisreen Alyan, Ronit Sela, and Michal Pomerantz, "Neglect and Suppression in East Jerusalem: The Policies behind Widespread Poverty and Unemployment," trans. Elli Sacks, Association for Civil Rights in Israel (May 2012): 5.

38. Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion*, 138–41.

39. Choshen, Korach, and Shemer, "Jerusalem: Facts and Trends 2016," 53.

40. Hadas Mandel and Debora P. Birgier, "The Gender Revolution in Israel: Progress and Stagnation," in *Socioeconomic Inequality in Israel: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis*, ed. Nabil Khattab, Sami Miaari, and Haya Stier (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), 156.

41. Mandel and Birgier, "Gender Revolution," 177.

42. Bassok, "Wage Gap;" Hadas Fuchs and Tamar Friedman Wilson, "Arab Israeli Women Entering the Labor Market: Higher Education, Employment, and Wages," Taub Center for Social Policy Studies in Israel, Policy Brief (Mar. 2018): 7.

is not growing to meet the excess number of teachers. Eleven thousand Palestinian teachers are unemployed in Israel and waiting for the Ministry of Education to place them in schools.[43] While a solution to the surplus of Palestinian teachers could be their placement in Jewish schools (which suffer from shortage of teachers in English, math, and Arabic) principals and teachers hold reservations due to the challenging political context.

In East Jerusalem the education sector is more complex. It is divided into four sections based on different systems of education: In the *awqaf* schools, 71% of the teachers are women; in UNRWA schools, 72% of teachers are women; in private schools, 75% are women; and in public schools for Palestinians in Israel (not just in Jerusalem), 70% are women.[44] The working conditions of teachers differ based on the system that they work in. *Awqaf* and UNRWA schools offer lower salaries; they have poor school facilities and buildings in comparison with both private and Israeli municipal schools. In my focus groups with teachers from the four different systems, however, the majority said that they did not pursue the teaching profession until left with no other options: "None of us really wanted to be a teacher, it just happened because the job opportunities in Jerusalem are slim. Being a mother and a wife also restricts you as you need to be home early for the children, so that's why I became a teacher"[45]

The job opportunities in East Jerusalem are limited. The economy has been in a fluctuating state, as a result of the political unrest. Judging the state of East Jerusalem's economy from its contribution to the Occupied Palestinian Territories' gross domestic product (GDP), the economy has been in decline. East Jerusalem's contribution went down from an estimated 14–15% before the First Intifada began in 1987, to just over 8% in 1994, to below 8% by 2000 — a strong indicator that East Jerusalem did not benefit from the peace negotiations of the 1990s.[46] Separating East Jerusalem from the rest of the Palestinian periphery has stifled East Jerusalem's economy further. According to UN data, as of 2013, "there were a total of 51 obstacles to movement in East Jerusalem, including checkpoints, road blocks, road gates and other barriers, such as the [S]eparation [B]arrier."[47] This restricts Palestinians in the West Bank from access to markets in East Jerusalem. According to a report by a head of East Jerusalem's chamber of commerce, more than 5,000 enterprises were closed between 1999 and 2010.[48] Similarly, East Jerusalem being cut off from the West Bank has also meant that the city has lost access to products from the area. Meanwhile, starting in 2010, Israel has "banned pharmaceutical, dairy and meat produced in the West Bank from entering East Jerusalem (and Israel), claiming that Palestinian standards were not suitable for the Israeli market and thus causing an estimated annual $48 million in losses to the Palestinian economy."[49]

43. Yarden Zur, "11,000 Arab Teachers in Israel Unemployed While Jewish Schools Face Teacher Shortage," *Haaretz*, December 18, 2017, www.haaretz.com/1.5628951.

44. Palestinian National Authority, Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics, "Jerusalem Statistical Yearbook, 2012" (June 2012): 82; State of Israel, Ministry of Education, "Facts and Figures in the Education System, 2013," (Mar. 2013): 63–64.

45. Lara, teacher at a private school; quoted in Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion*, 98.

46. UNCTAD, "Palestinian Economy in East Jerusalem," 11–12, 48.

47. UNCTAD, "Palestinian Economy in East Jerusalem," 7.

48. "Palestinian Workers Rights in the Israeli Labour Market and Settlements," Al-Maqdese for Society Development (Dec. 2011): 6.

49. UNCTAD, "Palestinian Economy in East Jerusalem," 8.

Limited opportunities in the labor market in every potential location of employment were a recurring theme in the testimonies from the focus groups held for this study. In East Jerusalem, job opportunities are limited; in the West Bank, daily checkpoints complicate an already difficult commute; and in the Israeli market of West Jerusalem, Palestinian women face language barriers and prejudice from employers in the few jobs that are either open to them or that they are able to apply for.[50]

The Effects of Palestinian Authority Policies

The Palestinian Authority (PA) is dominated by President Mahmud 'Abbas — who monopolizes executive, legislative, and judicative power — and has appointed mostly male members of his party, the Palestinian National Liberation Movement (Fatah, a reverse acronym for the Arabic *Harakat al-Tahrir al-Watani al-Filastini*). In addition to PA laws, centuries of foreign domination in Palestine have resulted in a legal system that consists of "a patchwork of historical laws" that originate from various codes, including the Ottoman, British, Jordanian, and Egyptian.[51] The PA still follows the 1976 Personal Status Law of Jordan, which discriminates against women and requires them to have a male "guardian" approve their marriages, grants them only half of men's share of inheritance, and, in instances of divorce, denies them the custody rights over sons more than 10 years-old and daughters above 12.[52] As for the labor market, the Palestinian Labor Law of 2000 still does not guarantee equal rights for women in domestic, agricultural, and informal labor.[53] While the PA ensures women get 10 weeks of maternity leave, it does not provide any compensation to their employers, adversely impacting small companies' profits and leading businesses to hire fewer young, married women or dismissing them once they get married.[54] In Palestinian society men dominate all fields of work except education and nursing. According to the Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics (PCBS), the labor market in the West Bank and Gaza is male-dominated: men represent 84.3% of physicians, 68.0% of dentists, 89.3% of civil servants at or above the general director level, 96.2% of police officers, 79.1% of lawyers, 77.8% of engineers, 75.0% of journalists, and 94.9% of ambassadors.[55] In addition, 88.0% of the members of the cabinet are men. This raises questions as to how women are expected to shape Palestinian society if their participation in leading positions in society is restricted. The only two professions where male and female participation appears nearly equal are nursing (49.3% women and 50.7% men) and teaching, where women surpass men (55.9% in the West Bank and Gaza and approximately 75% in Jerusalem, based on the earlier numbers).[56]

50. Hila Weissberg, "Survey: 42% of Employers Prefer Not to Hire Arab Men," *Haaretz*, March 31, 2014, www.haaretz.com/1.5341704.

51. Reem Al-Botmeh et al., "A Review of Palestinian Legislation from a Woman's Right Perspective," trans. Jihad Hamdan, United Nations Development Programme (Mar. 2012): 7.

52. Sophie Richter-Devroe, "Gender Equality and Women's Rights in Palestinian Territories," European Parliament, Directorate-General for Internal Policies, Policy Department, doc. PE 453.212 (2011): 14.

53. Richter-Devroe, "Gender Equality and Women's Rights," 8.

54. Samia al-Botmeh, "Unlocking the Labor Market for Palestinian Women," al-Shabaka, policy brief, July 22, 2015, https://al-shabaka.org/briefs/labor-market-palestinian-women/.

55. State of Palestine, PCBS, "المرأة والرجل في فلسطين: قضايا وإحصاءات" ["Women and Men in Palestine: Issues and Statistics"], report no. 2171 (Dec. 2015): 41, 52, 56–58; State of Palestine, Ministry of Women's Affairs, "National Action Plan: Unofficial Translation" (Apr. 2015): 22

56. State of Palestine, PCBS, "المرأة والرجل في فلسطين" ["Women and Men in Palestine"], 29, 42, 56.

Palestinian women are not only limited to certain types of professions, they are also held back from managerial positions in "female-dominated" professions. Looking at senior positions in the education sector — such as general director, unit head, adviser, or higher — female participation is 21.9%.[57] Playing off the concept of the "glass ceiling," Christine Williams defined this phenomenon as the "glass escalator," wherein men who work in female-dominated professions assume leadership positions as a result of preferential treatment regarding promotions.[58]

Palestinian women's organizations work both independently and within the framework of the PA to fight for women's rights and improve their work conditions and opportunities. Among these organizations are the General Union of Palestinian Women, the Women's Center for Legal Aid and Counselling, the Women's Studies Centre, Miftah, the Jerusalem Center for Women, the Arab Women's Union, Inash Al Usra, and the Young Muslim Women Association.[59] However, the struggle of these institutions against the occupation takes priority over gender and social change in the Palestinian community. As long as Palestinian women are living under occupation, gender equality remains restricted.

Legal provisions in Palestine are fragmented and impeded as a result of Israel's imposed "mobility restrictions and lack of jurisdictional power," especially in Area C (the 61% of the West Bank under direct Israeli military control) and East Jerusalem.[60] As a 2010 report on women's rights in the Middle East points out,

> all discussions about Palestine's constitution, its laws, and their impact on women must take into account the restrictions imposed by the Israeli occupation, which heavily influences the ways in which the PA conducts its affairs . . . The areas under PA rule are not contiguous, but are separated by numerous checkpoints, and barriers erected by the Israel authorities. These barriers have significantly curtailed Palestinians' freedom of movement, and combined with a general lack of security, ... have had a devastating effect . . .[61]

The isolation and desperation has pushed some communities to self-isolate, become more conservative, and depend more on informal tribal laws.

The influence of the PA in East Jerusalem is limited. While most of its institutions in the city were shut down by Israel during the Second Intifada (2000–2004), the PA does continue to subsidize *awqaf* schools to a limited degree under the supervision of the Directorate of Education in Jerusalem. In 2005, *awqaf* schools served around 18% of Palestinian Jerusalemites. In the 2013/14 academic year, they served 14% of Palestinian Jerusalemites.[62] *Awqaf* schools have the poorest facilities of any

57. State of Palestine, Ministry of Education and Higher Education, "National Assessment for Education for All (2015–2000) [*sic*]" (Dec. 2014): 231.

58. Christine L. Williams, "The Glass Escalator: Hidden Advantages for Men in the 'Female' Professions," *Social Problems* 39, no. 3 (Aug. 1992): 253–67. doi:10.2307/3096961.

59. Richter-Devroe, "Gender Equality and Women's Rights," 6.

60. Richter-Devroe, "Gender Equality and Women's Rights," 12.

61. Suheir Azzouni, "Palestine (Palestinian Authority and Israeli-Occupied Territories)," in *Women's Rights in the Middle East and North Africa: Progress amid Resistance*, ed. Sanja Kelly and Julia Breslin (New York: Freedom House, 2010), 360.

62. Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion*, 59.

Palestinian schools in Jeruslaem, which are mostly old housing units transformed into classrooms, and they are often unable to pay sufficient salaries for their teachers. Student attrition at *awqaf* schools is high, as students leave this system to join the Israeli municipal system, which is better funded.

AGENCY LIMITED BY CULTURAL EXPECTATIONS

In formulating their choices for education, and later their careers, women face societal pressures that can restrict them. In most societies, women are still expected to shoulder the burden of domestic work and childcare, which frames their educational and occupational choices. As Thomas Turner and Juliette McMahon wrote, "Women tend to gravitate towards educational programs that reflect the more traditional societal views of what are acceptable roles for women and these 'choices' often determine their subsequent career patterns."[63] Popular discussions of women choosing new careers that emphasize agency alone "ignore the gendered constraints that are manifested" on "women's work" and their struggles with career choices.[64] Or as one of the teachers I spoke with recounted: "I thought very well about this, and I think [teaching] is the best career for a woman because, this way, when she sends her children to school, she can go to work. And then, after work, she takes them back home; so I think it's suitable for a woman."[65]

There are three interrelated dimensions in women's ability to make choices: available resources, agency, and desired achievements. However, this does not imply that women are able to make choices in their best interest merely from the availability of resources. The power of societal norms, projected through social institutions (family, religion, education, and media), can shape and constrain women's choices, pushing them to conform to societal expectations.[66]

Gender stereotypes originate from the physical and emotional associations around pregnancy and motherhood. The "appropriate" role of women in society — stemming from the physical act of childbearing and the expected roles of women as nurturers and homemakers — all influence women's choices.[67] Gender norms, which are reflected in the portrayal of women as mothers and wives in school curricula, can be influential on women's educational and career choices.

For the past 20 years, studies of the Palestinian education system have shown how curricula reflect gender stereotypes. A 1999 study of gender roles in Palestinian and Jordanian school curricula shows that

63. Thomas Turner and Juliette McMahon "Women's Occupational Trends in the Irish Economy: Moving towards High-Skilled Occupations or Evidence of Deskilling?" *Gender, Work and Organization* 18, no. S1 (2011): 225, doi:10.1111/j.1468-0432.2009.00508.x.

64. LaPointe, "Heroic Career Changers?" 134.

65. Maysa, teacher at a municipal school.

66. Naila Kabeer, "Resources, Agency, Achievements: Reflections on the Measurement of Women's Empowerment," *Development and Change* 30, no. 3 (July 1999): 435–64. doi:10.1111/1467-7660.00125.

67. Kathryn A. Sweeney and Delores P. Aldridge, "Blocked Opportunities and Gendered Power: Inability to Attain Preferred Gender Roles," in *Notions of Family: Intersectional Perspectives*, ed. Marla H. Kohlman, Dana B. Krieg, and Bette J. Dickerson (Bingley, UK: Emerald, 2013), 29–47.

> Qualities and traits associated with gender [were] clearly represented in the tendency to portray males as possessing rationality, leadership qualities and creativity, while females reflect[ed] the voice of care, emotions, mannerisms and sensitivity. . . . females [occupied] traditional subject-positions such as those of nurses, secretaries and teachers, while males in the workplace [were] vested with a wide array of jobs.[68]

Similarly, a 2010 paper analyzing gender in seventh- to twelfth-grade history and civics textbooks in Jordan and Palestine finds that the curricula portrayed "men as the more superior, capable, creative, productive, and therefore dominant [gender], and women as weaker, inferior, dominated, and thus unable to play more than minor roles."[69]

Women are pushed to find jobs that they can balance with household responsibilities due to "the social definition of women as primarily mothers and hence responsible first and foremost for the welfare of their families."[70] This not only explains how the sex-segregated fields in higher education lead to sex-segregated occupations but also reflects how much time women invest outside of professional work with domestic labor. Palestinian women spend 14.0% of their time on household work, while Palestinian men only spend 2.0% of their time on such tasks.[71]

Indeed, maternal priorities were a deciding factor for Dima, a private school teacher who participated in a focus group for this article:

> I think the best job for a woman is to be a teacher, because of the short school day and the vacations. It is suitable for a mother, because you get back home in time for the children. My husband advised me that this was the best job for me. Originally, I was hoping, unrealistically, to work in a company in Ramallah, but my husband made me understand that this job [as a teacher] is much better for me.[72]

Societal pressures on young Palestinian women — whose value is measured by marriageability, having children, and providing full childcare — influences their educational choices and later their career choices. This phenomenon is not limited to East Jerusalem. The feminization of the teaching profession has become a global phenomenon as a result of the position of women in society, gender norms, childcare options, and economic development.[73] As noted in a 2008 article about why women choose teaching as a profession, "it remains the task of mothers to organise childcare, and this [negatively] impacts . . . women [who] made their career decisions according to notions of 'good mothering' . . ."[74] This means that many women not only end up in a limited

68. Salam Al-Mahadin, "Jordanian Women in Education: Politics, Pedagogy and Gender Discourses," *Feminist Review* 78, no. 1 (2004): 31, doi:10.1057/palgrave.fr.9400188.

69. Samira Alayan and Naseema Al-Khalidi, "Gender and Agency in History, Civics, and National Education Textbooks of Jordan and Palestine," *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, And Society* 2, no. 1 (Spring 2010): 78, doi:10.3167/jemms.2010.020105.

70. Nelly P. Stromquist, "Gender Inequality in Education: Accounting for Women's Subordination," *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 11, no. 2 (1990): 147, doi:10.1080/0142569900110202.

71. State of Palestine, PCBS, "المرأة والرجل في فلسطين" ["Women and Men in Palestine"], 34.

72. Quoted in Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion*, 98.

73. Sheelagh Drudy, "Gender Balance/Gender Bias: The Teaching Profession and the Impact of Feminisation," *Gender and Education* 20, no. 4 (July 2008): 309–23. doi:10.1080/09540250802190156.

74. Andrea Raggl and Geoff Troman, "Turning to Teaching: Gender and Career Choice," *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 29, no. 6 (2008): 592, doi:10.1080/01425690802423254.

range of lower-wage jobs, but many end up competing over part-time work.

My focus group participants expressed this view clearly. As Katiya, a teacher at a municipal school, pointed out, "For a married woman, working as a teacher is very suitable. You have a summer vacation and a winter vacation, lots of holidays, you work five days a week and two of those are half-days. For a woman who is married and has children, this is very convenient."

The value of education in terms of human capital is proposed as a solution for gender inequality, since it is supposed to lead to women getting paid jobs.[75] This does not apply to the case of Palestinian women, as statistics show that they are more educated than their male peers. Among Palestinian women residing in the Occupied Territories, educational attainment is higher than that of men at all educational levels. Girls are enrolled in primary education at a rate of 96.5%, compared to 94.2% of boys. This gender gap gets larger in secondary schools, where 80.1% of young women are enrolled, compared to 61.2% of young men. Women's enrollment in Palestinian universities has also improved in the past 20 years and surpassed that of men more than a decade ago. For instance, Palestinian universities had 47% women students in the 2000/2001 academic year, which jumped up to 61% women students by the 2014/15 academic year.[76]

In East Jerusalem, in particular, as of 2014, "27% of Palestinian women had a postsecondary school diploma or academic degree, compared with 20% of Palestinian men in the city."[77] However — because Palestinian women in higher education institutions are clustered in the fields of education, humanities, and social sciences — they show similar trends in the labor market. Palestinian women who manage to secure a job in Jerusalem are clustered into two domains: 28% are employed in human health and social work services, and 44% work in education.[78]

In some cases, if a woman does not conform to societal norms by "choosing" a career in a "feminized" profession like teaching, her family will impose such a career on her. Pressures on women by their families, manifested in their inability or unwillingness to fund a degree other than education — or their husbands' refusal to "allow" them to join other careers — contributes to the overrepresentation of women in this profession.

This was, indeed, the case for some of the participants in the focus groups for this article — among teachers from different school systems. According to Widad, a teacher at an *awqaf* school:

> I did not even think about it, but back then there were not many universities. Colleges back then were popular, and my parents were conservative and did not want to send me to study abroad, but most of the people who graduated with me went to study at the University of Jordan. My school principal sent my papers to the college that taught education and, since then, I have been teaching.

Meanwhile Taliya, at a municipal school, recalled:

75. Sucharita Sinha Mukherjee, "More Educated and More Equal? A Comparative Analysis of Female Education and Employment in Japan, China and India," *Gender and Education* 27, no. 7 (2015): 846, doi:10.1080/09540253.2015.1103367.

76. State of Palestine, PCBS, "المرأة والرجل في فلسطين" ["Women and Men in Palestine"], 28, 31.

77. Marik Shtern, "Polarized Labor Integration: East Jerusalem Palestinians in the City's Employment Market," Jerusalem Institute for Policy Research, publication no. 469 (2017): 24.

78. Choshen, Korach, and Shemer, "Jerusalem: Facts and Trends 2016," 53.

> I did not want to be a teacher. I wanted to be a pharmacist, but my father would not let me leave the country and study abroad, so I studied English at Bethlehem University, which is the only thing I am good at. Then I came here and fell in love with the children . . . and now I love my job.

Lastly, Hanan, a private school teacher explained, "I never wanted to be a teacher, but it is easy to be a teacher. I could not afford to go to university and do something else."

After acquiring a degree and managing to secure employment, women with children are faced with an additional financial challenge of paying for day-care centers. There is a severe shortage of nurseries in East Jerusalem, making mobility difficult for women with children. Out of 15,000 Palestinian children between the ages of three and four living in East Jerusalem, only 443 (less than three percent) have a place in municipal preschools.[79] Subsidized day-care facilities help in increasing women's participation in labor markets,[80] but private nurseries in East Jerusalem are only available to middle- and upper-class women due to the high fees they charge. This means that socioeconomic factors also determine women's ability to penetrate the labor market. To overcome the shortage of nurseries, some women rely on their mothers or mothers-in-law for the care of their children, which allows them more mobility but traps elderly women in further unpaid childcare work. Within Israel, as of 2011, only about a third of Jewish mothers of children under age four worked full-time and around 15% of Palestinian mothers[81] — one can assume the number would be even lower among Palestinian women in East Jerusalem.

GENDER PAY GAPS IN JERUSALEM AND THE FEMINIZATION OF THE TEACHING PROFESSION

In the West Bank and Gaza, Palestinian women who manage to penetrate the labor market earn 71% of what males earn.[82] A similar gap exists in Jerusalem (East and West), where women earn 79% of what their male counterparts earn.[83] This inequality in wages also has implications for dynamics within marriages, as wives earn less than their male partners.[84] A wife's income remains secondary in the household, which devalues her paid work, even if she has a higher education level than her husband. Societal views of masculinity, which regard the husband as the main economic provider for the family, can help explain why men do not generally become teachers.[85] The prevalence of men in teaching differs from one country to another, based on how the teaching profession is viewed in terms of prestige and salary.

79. Alyan, Sela, and Pomerantz, "Neglect and Suppression in East Jerusalem," 7.

80. Helle Holt and Suzan Lewis, "'You Can Stand on Your Head and Still End Up with Lower Pay': Gliding Segregation and Gendered Work Practices in Danish 'Family-Friendly' Workplaces," *Gender, Work and Organization* 18, no. s1 (Summer 2011): 202–21. doi:10.1111/j.1468-0432.2009.00501.x.

81. Mandel and Birgier, "Gender Revolution," 159.

82. State of Palestine, PCBS, "Press Release on the Eve of International Women's Day," March 7, 2018, www.pcbs.gov.ps/portals/_pcbs/PressRelease/Press_En_7-3-20148-women-en.PDF.

83. Choshen, Korach, and Shemer, "Jerusalem: Facts and Trends 2016," 54–55.

84. Sweeney and Aldridge, "Blocked Opportunities and Gendered Power."

85. Fatimah Kelleher et al., *Women and the Teaching Profession: Exploring the Feminisation Debate* (London: Commonwealth Secretariat, 2011).

Research suggests that the more "feminized" a profession is, the more likely it is to be poorly paid.[86] The "feminization" of teaching has caused it to lose status within society, leading to lower earnings and a loss of professional credibility. The UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization's 2012 *World Atlas of Gender Equality in Education* cites a trend among the 50 countries studied where the proportion of female teachers tended to increase in places where teachers' salaries were relatively low and tended to decrease where teachers' salaries were relatively high. The data show that in Chad and Mali, where teacher salaries were more than four times GDP per capita, women made up only 14% and 27% of teachers, respectively. In contrast, countries where teachers' salaries were below GDP per capita, women tended to dominate teaching — constituting 90% of teachers in Austria, the Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Italy, and Kazakhstan (and there were, of course, exceptions to this trend, so additional factors were at hand).[87]

In Jerusalem, teachers' salaries vary depending on the type of school system. In 2014, salaries ranged between 3,500 Israeli shekels (ILS, approximately $950) and 6,000 ILS ($1,700) per month. Those earning 3,500 ILS received an additional 1,500 ILS ($420) in Jerusalem allowance. The minimum monthly wage in Israel was 4,300 ILS ($1,200), so teachers were around minimum wage.[88] The focus group participants expressed their dissatisfaction with their salaries, according to Mina, a private school teacher:

> You know, the teachers in Jerusalem are the most marginalized people. They have so many expenses to meet. . . . Yes, I want to work hard, but I would like to be appreciated and to cover my expenses. When I do not have enough money to buy the necessities for the house, I curse education and the work I do.[89]

Since the teaching profession has lost its prestige in East Jerusalem, the education sector mainly attracts people who cannot find better-paid jobs or who need short working hours. To compensate for their low pay, some male teachers combine teaching with another job. As Mina put it: "Male teachers, who are the sole supporters of their homes and families, need to get another job as well; for example, as a taxi driver, or some other job, to be able to meet their expenses."[90]

In a study on occupational feminization and pay based on US Census data, female-dominated occupations were found to pay less than male-dominated ones due to employer preference and that proportion of women in a field negatively affects pay.[91] This devaluation of female-dominated jobs explains why women are more likely to desire male-dominated jobs and not the other way around. When thinking about labor market desegregation, women who attempt to join male-dominated jobs will be faced with discrimination; and if men turn to a female-dominated job like teaching, they will suffer from loss of money and prestige.[92]

86. Drudy, "Gender Balance/Gender Bias."

87. Edward B. Fiske, *World Atlas of Gender Equality in Education* (Paris: UNESCO, 2012), 104.

88. Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion*, 95.

89. Quoted in Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion*, 97.

90. Quoted in Asali Nuseibeh, *Political Conflict and Exclusion*, 97.

91. Asaf Levanon, Paula England, and Paul Allison, "Occupational Feminization and Pay: Assessing Causal Dynamics Using 1950–2000 U.S. Census Data," *Social Forces* 88, no. 2 (Dec. 2009): 865–92. doi:10.1353/sof.0.0264.

92. Paula England, "The Gender Revolution: Uneven and Stalled," *Gender and Society* 24, no. 2 (Apr. 2010): 149–66. doi:10.1177/0891243210361475.

Palestinian women not only face limited options for work, but also a devaluation of their work. In the focus groups, teachers explained that they depend on their spouses' income to supplement theirs. As Raniya, a teacher at a municipal school, recounted: "I am OK, but only because my husband also has an income. I always feel sorry for the male teachers who have to support their families. A family needs at least 10,000 ILS [approximately $2,600 in 2012/13] to live a normal life here; an OK life, not a good one."

CONCLUSION

Palestinian women's participation in the labor market in East Jerusalem is influenced by multiple layers of inequalities and restrictions manifested in the colonial governance of the city. Israel is expanding over Palestinian spaces; limiting the development of Palestinian residential areas; preventing economic exchange and freedom of movement between the city and the rest of the Palestinian periphery; and impeding civil, political and social rights — all leading to the disempowerment of the Palestinian community.

This article has explored the employment opportunities that are available to Palestinian Jerusalemite women. These women try to pursue employment in three markets: the West Bank, East Jerusalem, and West Jerusalem. However, they are faced with limitations and restrictions in each one of these markets. Isolated from the West Bank market by the Separation Barrier, commuters face long travel hours, exhaustion, and humiliation at checkpoints from Israeli soldiers. Pursuing employment in East Jerusalem is equally hard as a result of the underdeveloped economy and lack of opportunities. As for the Israeli market in West Jerusalem, the employment mobility of Palestinians is constrained, and even when East Jerusalemite Palestinian women — who are not citizens of Israel — do find employment, they earn less than their Israeli counterparts. For Palestinian women, jobs in trade and construction, which are open to Palestinian men, are restricted. Similarly, jobs in public administration, which are open to Israeli women, are also hard to secure. The very small percentages of Palestinian women who do manage to secure employment in Jerusalem are clustered in education, human health, and social services.

Palestinian women face layered challenges as a result of their gender and ethnicity, experiencing an intersection of patriarchy from the colonizer as well as patriarchy in their social, cultural, and gender norms. Cultural expectations, confined gender roles, constrained movement, and limited opportunities constrict their educational and occupational decision-making processes, resulting in extremely low levels of labor force participation when compared to women in the region and globally.

Even though Palestinian Jerusalemite women are more educated than their male peers, they are unable to secure employment and remain dependent on the male members of their family. Their lack of access to capital — due to unjust inheritance laws, discrimination in the labor market, and the need to work unpaid or low-paid jobs through informal labor markets or family businesses — denies them the ability to be financially independent and perpetuates their socioeconomic subordination.