

INTELLECTUAL DISCOURSE 2022

Inclusive music making can be a
lonely experience: Does it have to be?

Gigi Lam, Royal College Music, London

[*chiying.lam@rcm.ac.uk*](mailto:chiying.lam@rcm.ac.uk)

Stephanie Chan, Institute of Education, UCL

[*stephanie-chan@ucl.ac.uk*](mailto:stephanie-chan@ucl.ac.uk)

INCLUSIVE EDUCATION IN HONG KONG

- Inclusive education = Special educational needs (SEN)
- Aims of inclusive education in Hong Kong: to respect individual differences and celebrate diversity and differences in the school community
- All pupils are educated in the same curriculum - 'One curriculum framework for all'

CHALLENGES FACED BY MUSIC TEACHERS IN HONG KONG INCLUSIVE MUSIC EDUCATION

- Limited specific SEN training for music education (pre-service or in-service)
- Limited administrative and classroom support
- Large class size

A case study: Using technology in inclusive music classroom



Interviews, analysed by thematic analysis



Valerie, a novice primary music specialist, 2 years teaching experiences



Composition major, teach about creativity and make use of technology in music lessons



Valerie finds it very challenging to handle a class with different SEN students

IS THIS THE END OF THE STORY...?

- The case study of Valerie showcased what is commonly understood as ‘inclusive music education’ in Hong Kong
- The case study also shows the challenges of music teachers who work in an inclusive education setting
- However, we argue that providing equal opportunity for SEN students by inclusive education is only one of the *many facets* of inclusive music education
- E.g. student’s ability, musical genres etc.

FORMAL SCHOOL MUSIC EDUCATION IN HK

Due to colonisation, music teachers in are educated and trained in a Western-centric model

2003 Music Curriculum Guide

‘Understanding and respecting traditions as well as values of other cultures through appraising music from different cultures’

Ho (2003) response to China’s particular socio-historical needs

Cultivate national identify through performing and appraising the music

Encouraged to emphasize local traditions through singing and appreciating Cantonese Opera

Learning the Chinese National Anthem to increase students’ patriotism

Cultural Hegemony (Wright, 2019)

BACKGROUND OF CANTONESE OPERA DEVELOPMENT IN SCHOOL EDUCATION

- Not enough training for preservice teachers
- Leung (2014), students in HK tend not to be very highly motivated to learn about Cantonese Opera due to the conflict between their social identity and traditional image of the genre. Not only students, but teachers lack teaching motivation and confidence towards traditional ethnic music as most of their training is based in western art music.
- Currie, Gibson, Lam (2020) It is common to see schoolteachers actively seeking intervention and opportunities from the communities, to deepen students' learning experiences in Cantonese Opera and as an active intervention of preservation of the cultural heritage

The case study: Cantonese Opera



Teaching artist supporting School music teacher in delivering Cantonese opera



One teaching artist visiting 3 different schools



Workshop content on introduction of Cantonese opera elements (music, singing, martial arts, acrobatics and acting)



One of the case studies from my doctoral thesis



Interviews, observation field notes and thematic analysis



TEACHER-ARTIST COLLABORATION MODEL (LEUNG, 2014, 2018)

Scenario I

- Artist as ‘the teacher’ , Teacher as the ‘assistant’

+

Professional knowledge can be delivered

-

Teacher become inferior in terms of
artistry skills



TEACHER-ARTIST COLLABORATION MODEL (LEUNG, 2014, 2018)

Scenario II

- Teacher as the 'Teacher' , Artist as the 'assistant'

+	-
Better Class management control	Artist can only sit aside and wait for teachers' request for help and demonstration. No active involvement and input.



TEACHER-ARTIST COLLABORATION MODEL (LEUNG, 2014, 2018)

Scenario III

- Artist as the ‘Teacher’ , Teacher as the ‘Observer’

+	-
<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Different Dynamics in the classroom, students are more engaged, treat artist as a friend than a teacher- Teacher learn together and increase motivation of students’ learning	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Workshop content matches the school curriculum?- Student prefers’ artist ‘s teaching as more freedom in the classroom?

THE EXISTENCE OF 'UTOPIA'?

Scenario IV??

- Parallel Collaboration between Artist and Teacher
- Not possible ? teachers and artists have different training, experience, responsibilities and positions.
- The difference needs to be recognised.
- promotion of safe space in the session for both parties to be freely critical in sharing their practices without fear of causing offense to each other.
- Constant state of negotiation (Wiggins, 2011, p.89)
- According to Freire (1996), we can only become more fully human, never fully human. Freire sees humans as unfinished beings, always in a process of becoming.

WAY FORWARD

- Ensure teacher able to perform and understand the aesthetic , demonstrate the understanding of the historical and cultural background of the genre.
- Promotion of high level artistry should be introduced during teacher's training
- Artists should develop understanding of school culture

Join together as a collaborative voice to break the hegemony of the current school music education. However, we need to make sure this collaborative voice is bringing us more possibilities but not limiting our practices and resulting less.

A diverse, personally and culturally relevant music educations that develop the musical talents and abilities of all young people. A music education which consists of a social goal of provide access to rewarding music learning throughout the life course.



REFERENCE

- CDC (Curriculum Development Council, Hong Kong) (2003). *Arts Education key learning area: Music curriculum guide (Primary 1 – Secondary 3)*. Hong Kong: Government Print.
- CDC (Curriculum Development Council, Hong Kong) (2017c). *Arts education: Key learning area curriculum guide (Primary 1 – Secondary 6)*. Hong Kong: Government Print.
- Currie, R., Gibson, J., & Lam, C.Y (2020). Community music as intervention: Three doctoral researchers consider intervention from their different contexts. *International Journal of Community Music*, 13(2), 187-206. DOI:[10.1386/ijcm_00019_1](https://doi.org/10.1386/ijcm_00019_1)
- Education Department Bureau, Hong Kong (n.d.). *Special Education Needs*. Accessed on August 20, 2021. <https://www.edb.gov.hk/en/curriculum-development/curriculum-area/special-educational-needs/index.html>
- Freire, P. (1972). *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. 1968. Trans. Myra Bergman Ramos. New York: Herder.
- Freire, P. (1996). *Pedagogy of the oppressed (revised)*. New York: Continuum.
- Ho, W. C. (2003). Gender differences in instrumental learning, preferences for musical activities and musical genres: A comparative study on Hong Kong, Shanghai and Taipei. *Research Studies in Music Education*, 20(1), 60-76.
- Law, W. W., & Ho, W. C. (2009). Globalization, values education, and school music education in China. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 41(4), 501-520.
- Leung, B. W., & Leung, E. C. K. (2010). Teacher-artist partnership in teaching Cantonese opera in Hong Kong schools. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 11(5), 1-26.
- Leung, B. W. (2014). Teachers' transformation as learning: Teaching Cantonese opera in Hong Kong schools with a teacher–artist partnership. *International Journal of Music Education*, 32(1), 119-131.
- Leung, B. W. (2018). Teaching Cantonese opera in Hong Kong schools: Interaction and collaboration between music teachers and artists. In C. Christophersen & A. Kenny (Eds.), *Musician–Teacher Collaborations* (pp. 85-95). Routledge.
- Liu, J. (2010). *A critical history of new music in China*. Chinese University Press.
- Wiggins, J. (2011). When the music is theirs: scaffolding young songwriters in a cultural psychology of music education , edited by Margaret S. Barrett 83-114 Oxford: oxford university press
- Wong, M. (2015). Adapting the music curriculum for senior secondary students with intellectual disabilities in Hong Kong: content, pedagogy and mindsets. *Music Education Research*, 17(1), 71-87.
- Wong, M., & Chik, M. (2016a). Inclusive education policy in the Hong Kong primary music classroom. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 117(2), 130-140.
- Wong, M., & Chik, M. (2016b). Teaching students with special educational needs in inclusive music classrooms: Experiences of music teachers in Hong Kong primary schools. *Music Education Research*, 18(2), 195-207.
- Wong, M., Chik, M., & Chan, E. (2016). Measuring concerns of inclusive music teaching in Hong Kong: scale development. *Music Education Research*, 18(3), 317-330.
- Wong, M., Chik, M., & Chan, E. (2019). Primary music teachers' efficacy in Hong Kong's inclusive classrooms. *Music Education Research*, 21(5), 517-528.
- Wright, R. (2019). Envisioning real Utopias in music education: prospects, possibilities and impediments. *Music Education Research*, 21(3), 217-227.