ART HISTORY TEACHING IN TEACHER EDUCATION IN SOUTHERN BRAZIL: A STUDY OF AN ALTERNATIVE PROGRAMME AND ITS RELATION TO CULTURAL IDENTITY AND SOCIAL ASPIRATIONS

ROSEMEIRE ODAHARA GRAÇA

PhD in Education
Institute of Education, University of London
2009

Supervisor: Professor Andrew Brown
Faculty of Culture and Pedagogy
Department of Learning, Curriculum and Communication
ABSTRACT

This thesis provides a critical account of a practitioner research project in which an alternative art history teaching programme was designed and undertaken in 2002-2003. This was run as part of a fine arts teacher-training course at a culturally-diverse college in Southern Brazil. The project arose from a perceived need to transform art history teaching in Southern Brazil from being an instrument of acculturation to a process of cultural empowerment, and to enable it to be more closely aligned to the current requirements of preparing art teachers to be educators of culturally reflective visual readers. The design of the alternative programme requires changes in course content and teaching strategies. The research into the processes and impact of the alternative programme involved collecting data through observations, semi-structured interviews (individual and group), questionnaires, and tasks (assignments, reading, and critical appraisals). The analysis of this data showed that changes were possible without impairing the students’ engagement with art history as a field of study. It was also found that art education and history can play a role in shaping the aspirations of immigrant families and their plans for social mobility. In examining the influence of their descendants’ education in the arts on their families’ plans for social mobility, it became apparent that Eurocentric art history education, which the alternative programme had sought to avoid, could still be appropriate to the social context of the students because of the value placed on it by their families. The findings of the study suggest that the students benefited from the changes introduced to the teaching programme since they led them to reflect on their own social and cultural structures, and allow them to become teachers able to employ the kind of art history teaching they prefer, even if it retains Eurocentric features.
I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person or material which to a substantial extent has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma of the university or other institute of higher learning, except where due acknowledgment has been made in the text.

Word count (pages 9-163): 63414 words

Rosemeire Odahara Graça
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS** ............................................................... 7  
**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** ............................................................... 8  

**CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION** ........................................................ 9  
  1.1 Purpose and structure of this thesis .................................................. 20  

**CHAPTER 2 - SEARCHING FOR ANSWERS IN THE LITERATURE** ............................................................... 22  
  2.1 Art history in art education ................................................................. 22  
  2.2 Art history in visual literacy ............................................................... 25  
  2.3 Art history and its approaches to art ................................................ 27  
  2.4 Art history teaching ................................................................. 38  
  2.5 History teaching ................................................................. 45  
  2.6 Summary and conclusions ................................................................. 46  

**CHAPTER 3 - THE SOCIETY FOR WHICH THE ALTERNATIVE PROGRAMME WAS DESIGNED** ............................................................... 49  
  3.1 The cultural context ................................................................. 49  
  3.2 The educational context ................................................................. 68  
  3.3 Summary and conclusions ................................................................. 72  

**CHAPTER 4 - THE ALTERNATIVE ART HISTORY TEACHING PROGRAMME** ............................................................... 74  
  4.1 Educational goals ................................................................. 75  
  4.2 Syllabus ................................................................. 75  
  4.3 Learning activities ................................................................. 76  
  4.3.1 Assignments ................................................................. 77  
  4.3.2 Reading activities ................................................................. 79  
  4.3.3 Critical appraisals ................................................................. 80  
  4.4 Teaching procedures ................................................................. 81  
  4.5 Assessment ................................................................. 82  
  4.6 Outline of the programme ................................................................. 83  
  4.7 Summary and conclusions ................................................................. 83
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Figure 1 - Alfredo ANDERSEN (1860-1935) *Retrato de Anna, esposa e mãe* (Portrait of Anna, wife and mother). 1931, oil on canvas, 50x59cm. Curitiba, Alfredo Andersen Museum collection. .... 34

Figure 2 - Structure of the Nessi method of analysing works of art .... 39

Figure 3 - Percentage of ethnic groups that migrated to Paraná State before 1934 ................................................................. 61

Figure 4 - Group folk dancing ................................................................. 62

Figure 5 - *Pysanky* ............................................................................. 62

Figure 6 - An immigrant house preserved in its original setting in Curitiba ................................................................................... 63

Figure 7 - The exterior of an original immigrant house which has been moved from its original setting ............................................. 64

Figure 8 - The interior of an traditional immigrant house which has been moved from its original setting ......................................... 64

Figure 9 - A Japanese memorial erected in a public square in Curitiba .... 65

Figure 10 - Entrance of a doorway ........................................................... 65

Figure 11 - OSWALD LOPES (1910-1964). *Paisagem* (Landscape). 1938, oil on canvas, 67,0x80,0cm. Curitiba, ‘Escola de Música e Belas Artes do Paraná’ collection. ................................................................. 66


Figure 13 - GIBA (Gilberto Kosiba, 1970). *Ausência* (Absence). 2004, mixed technique on wood, 120,0x185,0 cm. Curitiba, the artist’s collection. ................................................................. 68

Figure 14 - Curriculum of the fine arts teacher-training course of FAP (1990-2005) .................................................................................. 70

Figure 15 - Chart showing how the main syllabus of the alternative art history teaching programme was organised ....................... 77

Figure 16 - Outline of the alternative teaching programme ................. 84

Figure 17 - Schedule for the administration of the programme and data collection ........................................................................... 92

Figure 18 - Schedule followed for the administration of the programme and data collection ................................................................. 97

Figure 19 - Example of buildings chosen by students to carry out *Assignment 1* .............................................................................. 110
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis would not have been possible without the generous support, interest, and encouragement of a number of people. I particularly wish to thank the students of the fine arts teacher-training course at the Faculdade de Artes do Paraná (FAP) who kindly agreed to take part in the study. This thesis is dedicated to all of you, who provided me with an intellectual stimulus throughout. I would also like to express my deepest gratitude to Professor Andrew Brown, my supervisor at the Institute of Education, who oversaw this, my first real world research project, and whose generosity, patience, and insights were of such value in assisting me to complete the study. I would like to thank all the other lecturers and supervisors at the Institute of Education who kindly devoted time to discussing different aspects of this study with me. My thanks, too, must go to the Secretaria de Ciência e Tecnologia (SETI; Secretariat of Science, Technology, and Higher Education) of the Government of the State of Paraná that partly sponsored my studies. Among all my colleagues at FAP whose encouragement enabled me to undertake this research, I would particularly like to thank my superiors at FAP, who believed in my potential from the beginning, and my colleagues at the Departamento de Ciências Humanas (Department of Human Sciences) who encouraged me and respected the fact that I needed time for my studies. I would also like to acknowledge the invaluable help of the following: Roberto Capparelli Figurelli and Fernando Antônio Fontoura Bini for their helpful advice that was always of benefit to me in my studies; Gil Harris, Francisco Trento, and Alexandre Wolf for their linguistic and technological expertise; Maria Amélia Dallagassa and Key Imaguire Júnior who shared their expertise in architecture with me and the students; and Jonildo Bacelar, João Urban, Charles Vega Parucker (Grand Master of the Ancient and Mystical Order Rosae Crucis, AMORC, Grand Lodge for the Jurisdiction of Portuguese), Roseli Fischer Bassler (Director of the Museu Alfredo Andersen), and Gilberto Kosiba who gave me permission to display and reproduce some of the pictures used in this study. I am grateful to the coordinators and colleagues of the Brazilian Programme whose suggestions and encouragement were helpful on several occasions. Since translation into languages is a very complicated process, I wish to express my gratitude to Frank Hanson, a language specialist and native English speaker, for his assistance. Finally, I am truly grateful to my husband, Rodrigo André da Costa Graça, and the other members of our family, without whose love, support, care, and patience this thesis would never have been undertaken.
CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this thesis is to explore the extent to which art history teaching in culturally pluralistic societies such as Brazil (the legacies of former European colonies), can be transformed from a form of acculturation to a significant means of making art teachers aware of the social and cultural differences in their country. This process involves engaging with the cultural complexity of these societies and examining some of the underlying tensions teaching and learning art history can cause students. Moreover, as a result, the content and pedagogical aims of the programmes can come into conflict with elements of the culture and lived experience of the students, sometimes in unexpected ways. One particular area of tension that arises, and is explored in this study, is the relationship between forms of art history and the plans the immigrant families had for social mobility.

My interest in carrying out this study arose from my knowledge of the role art history has been playing in the education of art teachers. My experience since 1997 as an art history teacher in teacher training courses in a culturally pluralist region of Southern Brazil, has given me the opportunity to observe how art history teaching has been used as a means of blurring cultural differences in Southern Brazil, and catering for the art preferences of wealthy groups. Moreover, I observed that there is a mismatch between the ways my colleagues and I have been teaching art history in the university and the kind of art teachers that colleges are expected to prepare and the field requires. As a result, some institutions have even been considering removing art history from the curriculum of their art teacher training courses.

Teaching art history from a Eurocentric perspective has prevented pre-service teachers from reflecting on their own personal and cultural values and identities. Moreover, since our lecturers are wholly preoccupied with examples of Western art, they are unable to train professionals to be teachers who can help young students to analyse and combat the social structures that legitimise the cultural and economic dominance of the most powerful social groups. In effect, the art history teachers in Brazilian universities act as advocates of foreign and classical art, thus encouraging acculturation and making the students feel alienated from the cultural concerns of modern society.
The arts have been taught since Brazil was first colonised in the 16th century and for many generations formed a part of the professional education of artisans and provided wealthy people with an understanding of 'classical art'. As in the case of other former colonies, it has always followed the ideas, teaching procedures, and interests of foreign groups. In Brazil, education in general has been strongly influenced by France (together with England and North America), and this influence has become a tradition in the arts in higher education.

Three key concepts of art education can be found in Brazil. The first concerns technical education, where there is a stress on copying masterpieces, and mastering skills in handling the materials used for representation. In contrast, the second concept values free expression rather than improving the students' technical ability. The third concept is something between the two, and attaches importance to teaching theoretical subjects in art classes, such as art history. As a result, a number of educators from different times have been and remain influential in art teaching in Brazil.

Art history was first taught formally as a subject in 1855 at the Academia Imperial de Belas Artes, an independent college of fine arts that followed the French neo-classical model of education, which believed that the teaching of arts should be based on technique and the reproduction of classical styles. The role of its art history lecturers was to provide a European-centred art education for future official artists of the country (Ades, 1997, pp. 27-40).

It was only in the first 40 years of the 20th century that art history subjects began to be taught in university courses (Zanini, 1994) and since then, art history lectures continued to be based on European art.

---

1 The expression 'classical art' refers here to art that follows the principles of Ancient Greece and Rome, namely the art created by these societies and by Renaissance and Neo-Classical artists.
2 With regard to the influence of foreign cultures on art teaching in Brazil, see Barbosa, 2001, pp.33-53.
3 On the cultural exchange between France and Brazil, see Carelli, 1994. The cultural exchange between these two countries was/is such that 2005 was designated the 'Year of Brazil in France' and 2009 will be celebrated as the 'Year of France in Brazil'.
4 Some of the authors on art education that are most read by Brazilian educators (owing to their availability in Portuguese translations) are Herbert Read (1893-1968), Viktor Lowenfeld (1903-1960), Edmund Burke Feldman (1924-), and Ana Mae Barbosa (1936-).
5 It was situated in Rio de Janeiro (the formal capital of the country from 1763 to 1960). Since 1965, the Academia Imperial de Belas Artes has been called Escola de Belas Artes and is part of the Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro.
Brazilian universities only began to offer teacher-training courses in art in 1972, when art became a compulsory subject in schools. Despite the importance now attached to this subject, no significant studies have been carried out into the role art history plays in these professionals’ education, and in many colleges, art history is taught in the same way as in other university courses. The lectures tend to be teacher-centred\(^6\) and only focused on the ‘masterpieces of Western art’. The programmes are usually designed on the principle that ‘quantity is better than quality’, since it is taken for granted that the works of art under consideration are of a high standard.

As a result of this outlook, many art history lecturers in Brazilian colleges simply display a large number of works of art, in chronological order, using a slide projector as their main visual aid. Although many Brazilian art history teachers adopt a Marxist approach in their lectures, their main concern is the ‘style theory’ (the particular way of doing art that is typical of an artist, group of artists, place or period). Moreover, they do not usually recommend a textbook for their students, although a wide range of relevant literature is recommended as an optional extra-class activity. Their bibliography usually consists of new editions of art history ‘encyclopaedias’ first published in the 1950s and 1960s\(^7\).

At present, none of the few university and post-graduate courses in art history in the country, train people to learn the processes and practices of learning and teaching art history. As a result, most educators in the field that work as art history teachers in universities have been educated in the fine arts, art history, architecture or history colleges, and are unconcerned with art history teaching. Moreover, they continue to apply the Euro-centric educational model of the Academia Imperial de Belas Artes, and thus only reproduce the kind of teaching they themselves had as students. This is contrary to the interests of the colleges and the requirements of the field\(^8\) for art teachers.

\(^6\) The expression ‘teacher-centred approach’ that is used throughout this thesis refers to a system where the main teaching activities are conducted through lectures. In contrast, the term ‘student-centred approach’ is used where the teacher is regarded as a ‘facilitator’ and the students carry out the main activities.

\(^7\) Among the publications usually found in the list of references of Brazilian art history courses are different editions of the following books: The Story of Art (1950) by E.H. Gombrich, The Social History of Art (1951) by Arnold Hauser, and History of Art (1962) by H. W. Janson.

\(^8\) The requirements both of the colleges and the schools are based on the standards for education laid down by the Brazilian Government in the 1990s [Parâmetros Curriculares Nacionais (PCNs; National Curricular Parameters)].
who are receptive to the various ways art is produced and seen by a wide range of social groups.

Art history only began to be formally included in art education classes in Brazilian schools at the end of the 1990s, when the national standards for education\(^9\) were laid down. However, despite the recommendations that art history topics be included in art classes, the nature and aims of art history teaching in art classes was widely misunderstood.

In the 1980s the role of ‘the teacher’ became a significant educational issue in Brazil and elsewhere. Since then, there has been worldwide research into these professionals’ education, training and careers (e.g. Schön, 1987 and 1988; Kramer and Souza, 1996; Ball and Goodson, 1997; Brewer, 1999; Addison and Burgess, 2000 and 2003; Anderson, 2000; Bates, 2000; Nóvoa, 1995 and 2002; Iavelberg 2003; Galbraith, 2001 and 2004; Pavlou, 2004; Hargreaves et al., c2006; Day et al., c2006; Day, 2007; O’Donoghue, c2008). In view of this, it is surprising that researchers have paid so little attention to the education of art teachers (e.g. Addison and Burgess, 2000 and 2003; Iavelberg 2003; Oliveira and Hernández, 2005; Rosa, 2005) or to the specialist subject matters which it requires (e.g. Vasconcellos, 2007).

However, among the recent studies on teachers’ education and training, two lines of argument have been influential in determining the way art teacher training courses in Brazil are designed. One argument supports an education of teachers that is based on the ‘positioning’ of identity\(^10\). This argument prevails in the critical pedagogy and multiculturalism studies that follow the educational concepts of authors such as Paulo Freire (1921-1997), Henry Giroux (1943-), Peter McLaren (1948-), and James Albert Banks (1941-).

Brookfield (1995, pp. 208-209) explains that a key feature of critical pedagogy is the role of the teacher as a ‘penetrator’ of false consciousness, and that teachers have a choice, - either to work in ways that legitimize and support the status quo or that

---

\(^9\) As explained in the previous note, these educational standards are called Parametros Curriculares Nacionais (PCNs; National Curricular Parameters).

\(^{10}\) The word ‘identity’ and the expression ‘identity position’ that frequently occur in this thesis, refer to how an individual views and positions him/ herself as a person in relation to other people, or the cultures and artifacts created by others.
provide new opportunities for people in their lives. In his view, critical pedagogy regards education as a process through which dominant social and economic groups impose the values and beliefs that legitimize their own power and authority. Consequently, it is the teacher’s task to expose and resist this process by finding and creating ‘public spheres’ in which students can learn to become aware of how the process works and how to combat it.

Brookfield explains that if education is properly conducted, it can be viewed by critical pedagogy as a dialogue between equals and an endeavour to engage in collaborative learning. Through this dialogue, students are helped to describe, value and understand their own experiences. The author states that they can employ their own analytical methods to achieve this rather than relying on what has been imposed on them by the dominant culture. In his opinion, critical pedagogy maintains that the purpose of education is not just to understand the world, but also to change it, often through collective endeavour.

Brookfield argues that the analytical concepts that lie at the heart of this tradition, are those of class, power, gender, ethnicity, and conflict, and that the terms used to describe the process of critical pedagogy are ‘transformation’, ‘liberation’, ‘emancipation,’ and ‘empowerment’. Moreover, he believes that critical pedagogy can free students from habitual ‘oppressive’ ways of thinking that have been imposed by the dominant culture. By means of this pedagogy, students are helped to create forms of thinking and living that are more democratic, harmonious, and true to their own experiences. As a result, teaching for critical pedagogy is by definition political.

The authors who are associated with critical pedagogy often refer to the type of teachers they favour as ‘reflective teachers’ (Brookfield, 1995; Pollard, 2002). According to Pollard (2002, p.93), ‘reflective teachers’ are professionals who are aware that their perspectives and viewpoints influence what they do, both inside and outside of the classroom. They know that often the values they hold are reflected in their behaviour, and thus, in their teaching.

Multiculturalist authors suggest that societies comprise distinct cultural groups of an equal status. Grant and Ladson-Billings (1997, p.182) based on Banks & Banks (1993) explain that:
Multiculturalism is a philosophical position and movement that assumes that gender, ethnic, racial, and cultural diversity of a pluralistic society should be reflected in all of its institutionalised structures but especially in educational institutions, including the staff, norms and values, curriculum, and student body.

Like those who adopt a position of critical pedagogy, the authors who are concerned with multiculturalism require ‘effective teachers’ or ‘multicultural teachers’ (Banks, 2001) so that they can provide a more socially inclusive education. Banks (2001, pp.305-306) explains that multiculturalism regards teachers as human beings who bring their own cultural perspectives, values, hopes, dreams, prejudices, stereotypes, and misconceptions to the classroom. In the view of this author, multiculturalism rests on the assumption that the teacher’s values and perspectives mediate and interact with what they teach and influence the way messages are communicated to and perceived by their students. Banks explains that since multiculturalism sees the teacher as mediating the messages and symbols communicated to the students through the curriculum, it is important for teachers to be aware of their own personal and cultural values and identities so that they can help students from diverse racial, ethnic, and cultural groups to understand their identities and form meaningful relationships with each other.

Another argument of significance to contemporary art teacher colleges in Brazil is that which stresses the importance of reforming teacher education to take account of the fact that teachers should be regarded as professionals in continuous development. This argument, which is found in contemporary studies by authors such as Philippe Perrenoud (1944-), has its origins in the educational concepts of Donald Schön (1930-1997).

The works of the North American theorist Schön have been of considerable significance to contemporary theories and practices of professional learning. Within his theoretical output, two works stand out: The Reflective Practitioner. How professionals think in action (1983)11 and Educating the Reflective Practitioner (1987). In these works, Schön examines professional contexts, knowledge and judgement, and the move from technical rationality to reflection-in-action. Moreover, he supports the need for skills in professional education, and thinks that, for instance, the architectural studio could serve

---

11 The dates given above beside the names of Donald Schön’s books indicate the years in which they were first published and not of the editions that I used.
as an educational model for reflection-in-action because it exemplifies how the ‘reflective practicum’ works. Although most of Schön’s works are aimed at improving education in university for the non-specialist, in some of his papers he has shown a particular interest in the education of teachers as reflective practitioners (Schön, 1987 and 1988).

In his studies for educators, Schön has concentrated on analysing what skills teachers should be trying to help students acquire, what kinds of knowledge and know-how these teachers require to do their jobs well, and what type of education is most likely to help them teach effectively.

In these papers, Schön adopts a position that is opposed to the supremacy of what he refers to as ‘school knowledge’ or ‘the epistemology of the schools’, - the prevailing view of knowledge that is instilled in schools and other educational institutions. He explains that this body of knowledge, which is the outcome of research carried out in universities, engenders a sense that every question has a correct answer. Furthermore, Schön says that those who are in favour of ‘school knowledge’ assume that the business of teachers is to know what the right answers are and to communicate them to the students. In Schön’s view, this is a formal and categorical form of knowledge, and one of the key features that separates schools from life.

Schön also points out that, in this view of ‘school knowledge’, there is a notion that the more general and theoretical the knowledge is, the greater its status. In addition, he states that ‘knowledge is molecular’ and built up of components which are basic units of information or basic units of skill which can be assembled together in more complex patterns. Thus, this attitude fosters the notion that it is the business of the teacher to communicate this knowledge in a progressive way, and of the students to receive and absorb it. In other words, it is the business of students to ‘get’ it, and of the teachers to ‘see that they get’ it. Moreover, the teachers account for students’ failure to do so by categorising them as ‘slow learners’ with ‘poor motivation’ or ‘a short attention span’. Schön maintains that this categorisation is a way of separating the students’ failure from the teacher’s other activities.

In contrast with this ‘school knowledge’, Schön explains that there is a kind of ‘knowing-in-action’ and a ‘reflection-in-action’ that are more natural and that should be
taken into account by educationalists. In his opinion, ‘knowing-in-action’ is a capacity to give the ‘wrong answer’ and yet do the right thing. It is an ability that is apparent in what people do, rather than the way that they do it. Schön thinks that ‘reflection-in-action’ is a tacit and spontaneous activity that involves new ways of thinking and responding to a phenomenon. He explains that when teachers turn their attention to giving students reasons so that they are aware of what they are saying or doing and allowing themselves to be surprised by it, teaching itself becomes a form of ‘reflection-in-action’. Hence, he believes ‘the art of teaching’ involves ‘reflection-in action’. In his view, from the perspective of the teacher, ‘the art of teaching’ means allowing one to be surprised or puzzled by what is achieved and reacting to this bewilderment by carrying out an on-the-spot study that responds to what the students say or do. It involves meeting the students, in the sense of addressing their understanding of what is going on, and helping them combine the everyday ‘knowing-in-action’ that they bring to the educational institution with the privileged knowledge that they find there.

In encouraging teachers to introduce a reflective practice inside institutions of education, Schön offers the following advice:

- You must work against the view that theory is a privileged form of knowledge.
- You must work against the doctrine that teachers are to be taught the results of research carried out by researchers (...).
- You work uphill against the notion that the teacher is a blank slate who needs to be trained and has nothing to bring.
- And you work against what I am describing as the ‘squeeze play’ currently operating in the profession as in many professions where, on the one hand, the actual institutional conditions of practice restrict what it is that a practitioner can do… (1987, p.10)

At the beginning of his study, Schön explains that his ideas on education are in fact part of a tradition of reforms that have been made for many years by theorists such as Jean-Jacques Rousseau (1712-1778), Leo Tolstoy (1828-1910), John Dewey (1859-1952), Ludwig Wittgenstein (1889-1951), Kurt Lewin (1890-1947), Lev Vygotsky (1896-1934), and Jean Piaget (1896-1980).

Apart from similarities with the educational ideas of other North American theorists, of the 20th century, like Eduard C. Lindeman (1885-1953) and Malcolm Shepherd Knowles (1913-1997), Schön’s studies of education were strongly influenced by the
concepts of John Dewey and Carl Rogers (1902-1987). Unlike Lindeman and Knowles who were concerned with non-formal adult education, Schöen mainly concentrates on the education of professionals in universities. Although in some of his papers, he simply uses alternative names for familiar educational problems and processes, he is a pioneer of professional education in higher education, and the importance of distinguishing between theory and practice in the academic world. In particular, Schöen claims that practice and previous experience are valuable sources of knowledge, as opposed to the arguments of elitist academics that only see value in traditional theory.

These lines of arguments show why there are clear directives against acculturation, teacher-centeredness, and reproductive teaching in the syllabus of current art teacher-training courses in Brazil. The Brazilian teacher-training colleges of today expect teachers to use their own initiative, and act by themselves, even while complying with the teaching guidelines recommended by the schools. Furthermore, they must be willing to enter into a dialogue with groups on physical, social, and, above all, cultural matters. On the basis of the Brazilian national standards for the education of art teachers, as well as discussions that have been held in this field, it can be stated that both colleges and society expect art teachers to be capable of dealing with all areas of the arts (fine arts, music, dance, etc.) and with the different kinds of art found in society (whether naive or sophisticated; from the past or the present; or utilitarian or aesthetic). In summary, the colleges and society at large are eager to have art teachers with a wide knowledge of aesthetics, art history, art production and criticism. They must also have an ability to deal with social differences and an awareness of their own social and cultural origins, position and responsibilities.

Thus, some changes in the design of art history classes need to be introduced in Brazil. The first of these is that art history teaching in Brazilian teacher training colleges should become both a part of the process of the general education of teachers as university students and of their training as professionals.

In the light of Schöen’s ideas, when preparing art history teaching in teacher training colleges, teachers should bear in mind the following: what skills they should be trying to help their students to acquire in art history, what kind of knowledge these students need in art history to carry out their prospective jobs in a satisfactory way, and what type of education would be most likely to help future teachers prepare to teach art
history effectively. Thus, the concern of teachers should be to make art history a subject-area that can help students to analyse and combat the social structures that legitimise cultural and economic dominance.

A second change is that art history lectures and activities should be occasions when pre-service teachers can reflect on their own personal and cultural values and identities, as well as those of others, while working with the arts. In this way, trainee teachers can have the chance to reflect on their personal and professional choices and preferences, how these are influenced by the life experiences of individuals, and how these life experiences define the way teachers work.

Finally, art history teachers should attempt to narrow the wide gap that has opened up between academic theory and everyday practice, (which includes both the students’ practice and their previous experience) and instead, regard them as valuable sources of knowledge. By doing so, they can encourage students to become more critical since they will be sharing experiences and knowledge. Thus, art history lectures should become forums where teachers can discuss the identities that are expressed by/through works of art, during their training and as a part of their preparation. Art teachers can also become aware of the fact that these objects were created by various societies at different times and places and examine the uses art education can make of them.

I decided to carry out a practitioner research study to evaluate the potential of these changes for art history teaching. This entailed designing and experiencing an alternative art history teaching programme which reflected the prevailing circumstances of the students of the fine arts teacher-training course in which I work in the capital of the Southern Brazilian state of Paraná.

This alternative programme focuses on discussions about the means people employ to establish their social and cultural identity and position themselves with respect to others. It also rests on the assumption that the art object should be the focal point of art history lectures, and that any theories about art styles and art history which are adopted, should be derived from the particular features and historical periods of the art of the locality in which the course is taught. The activities of the programme were planned to encourage students to play a more active and critical role than usual in their learning process, and a small number of visual sources were carefully chosen to be displayed in the classes.
The programme involved two groups of pre-service art teachers from the college where I work in Curitiba, during the 2002-2003 university year. In carrying out the research, I acted as a participant observer, since I decided to play the roles of both teacher and researcher.

My method of collecting data while running the programme, was as follows: to take notes on the educational processes and behaviour of the students; draw up a questionnaire to collect data on the students’ cultural and educational backgrounds, educational needs, and previous knowledge of art history; and conduct semi-structured interviews (both individual and group) to gather personal information about the participants, establish a relationship with them, and explore their reflections on the programme.

Although the programme was conducted with a total number of 34 students, the qualitative data drawn on in this thesis are confined to the 13 students who participated in all stages of the research. The results, (which will be examined later in the thesis), showed it to be a worthwhile experience from both the students’ perspectives and my own as a teacher. The students became more involved and interested in art history, since it was more closely related to their everyday lives, and enhanced their awareness of their visual language and cultural traditions. In addition, the students became more critical in their attitudes to art, history, and cultural influences.

The results demonstrated that changes in art history teaching are possible without impairing the study of the particular features of the art history field. They showed that discussions about cultural and economic differences between societies can be incorporated in art history lectures if students are encouraged to observe, in a critical way, not only the style and formal aspects of a masterpiece, but also the way the authors, teachers and museums from different times and places have analysed and exhibited works of art of diverse social groups. The research demonstrated that art history teachers can help teachers to be trained in how best to spend their time in studying art history and to reflect on their own social and cultural attitudes towards the groups, institutions and visual features that define certain works of art as ‘masterpieces’ and worth preserving.
Moreover, the findings of this research show that an education in art history plays an important role in the plans for social mobility adopted or designed by immigrant families. On the basis of studies on immigration, education, and social mobility, I realised that the interest displayed in the study of art and art history by second (or earlier) generations of participant students from immigrant families were more than merely a matter of personal choice. This interest could be understood to arise from the plan for social mobility that the older members of their families had designed for their descendants. Paradoxically, whilst the experience of the descendants of the immigrant families with the alternative programme led them to reflect on their cultural identity, social position and the ‘plan’ for social mobility of their families, the focus of the alternative programme on local culture was seemingly against the ‘interests’ of their families, and thus caused them a good deal of stress. Thus, the experience with the alternative programme suggested that changes in art history teaching, (designed in part to dispel any possible feelings of social inferiority that the privileged groups might cause by attempting to impose on them their notions of taste) should still, in some ways, benefit those who are seeking social mobility.

The results also showed that inducing an awareness of ‘identity positioning’ (by encouraging students to observe that showing a preference for certain works of art is closely associated with a desire either to resemble or differ from certain cultural and social groups) can require great effort on the part of the art history teachers and entails a willingness to change.

1.1 Purpose and structure of this thesis

This thesis has been structured as follows: Chapter Two provides an outline of the literature which deals with art education, visual literacy, art history, art history teaching, and history teaching, and that have influenced the design of the alternative teaching programme. Chapter Three introduces the features of the cultural and educational contexts of the students who participated in this research, since the alternative programme was especially designed to reflect this reality. Chapter Four describes the

---

12 Since translation is a very delicate process, it was decided that the original versions of the texts published in languages other than English and the quotations from the students’ interviews, which are translated into English in the main text, should be given in the footnotes.
alternative programme, and provides an outline of its educational goals and structure. *Chapter Five* explains the methodology employed in the study of the alternative programme. This includes a description of the means that were employed for collecting data and an account of the process by which the data collected was analysed. *Chapter Six* provides a summary and discussion of the main data collected from the students during the two years that the programme was undertaken. *Chapter Seven* discusses the findings with regard to the students that are descendants of immigrants and examines the relationship between art history teaching and the projects for social mobility of the immigrants’ families. Finally, *Chapter Eight* discusses the findings that were obtained from the study with the alternative programme when viewed from the perspective of the teacher/researcher, and evaluates the conclusions reached in this study.

The desire to record and make public the results of the experience with the alternative programme, stems from the lack of significant studies carried out in the area of art history teaching, in particular art history teaching in teacher education.\(^{13}\)

\(^{13}\) The study and the discussions that were carried out and are outlined in the following chapters drew on the ideas of authors from various backgrounds and periods, with particular reference to three areas: the arts (art history), education (art education, art history teaching, history teaching, teacher education and training, and visual literacy), and the social sciences (cultural identity, identity, migration, social memory, social mobility and visual studies). A wide range of literature was reviewed as a basis for this study. This included books and journals, published on the arts, art and design education, visual literacy, art history, history, education, and social sciences since the 1960s. This material was mainly reviewed in Portuguese and English, but a less systematic search was carried out in Spanish and French to obtain a comprehensive view of what has been discussed in art history teaching. However, it was discovered that throughout this period, (in comparison with the number of art history monographs published) not many studies on art history teaching had, in fact, been conducted. Most of the studies were carried out by English and North American researchers on art history teaching at the basic levels of teaching, who designed their studies specifically for the cultural and educational contexts of their societies. Among the studies that discuss art history teaching in university, a small number address the question of art history teaching in the education of art teachers, and focus on introducing students of different university courses to art history, with a particular emphasis on the approaches to art adopted by art historians. Thus, although a large number of publications appear in the list of references at the end of this thesis, it should be pointed out that most were of limited relevance to the research study, since the contexts that they explore diverge significantly from the particular features of the social and cultural context of Southern Brazil.
CHAPTER 2 - SEARCHING FOR ANSWERS IN THE LITERATURE

The following review of the literature was undertaken in an attempt to tackle the complex problems found in art history teaching. It focused on the role this teaching has played in the education and training of art teachers\textsuperscript{14}. In view of the almost entire lack of specialist literature on this subject\textsuperscript{15}, a wide range of literature was reviewed in related fields to obtain a broader and deeper understanding of this area.

The following section reveals the main subjects of interest I found in the literature reviewed on art education, visual literacy, art history, art history teaching, and history teaching, especially in the studies of authors such as Addiss and Erickson (1993), Yenawine (1997, 1999), Nessi (1968), McCarthy (1978), and Fonseca (2003). Although some of these are comparatively old publications, the arguments they offer remain valid, since not much has been added to the question of art history teaching in recent years.

2.1 Art history in art education

The review made clear that the way art history teaching has been understood has changed considerably throughout history. This is illustrated by Erickson’s discussion of the relationship between art history and art education in schools in the United States\textsuperscript{16}, which she summarises as follows:

\textsuperscript{14} The expression ‘education of teachers’ refers to a process that is more complex than ‘teacher-training’ and will be used to describe different aspects of the preparation of these professionals, including the whole process of education which pre-service teachers experience in colleges. The expression ‘teacher-training’ will only be used to refer to their preparation for work.

\textsuperscript{15} As stated earlier in this thesis, only a few of the large number of published art history monographs have been about art history teaching. Most of the studies were designed as teaching guides for teachers that work at the basic levels of teaching (e.g. McCarthy, 1978; Addiss and Erickson, 1993; Saccardi, 2006, Mathews, 2008), others were written for university students (e.g. Pointon, 1989; Argan and Fagiolo, 1992; Barral i Altet, 1994; Lagoutte, 2001; Arnold, 2004; Maranci, 2004; D’Alleva, 2006; Pooke and Newall 2008), and a few were devoted to art history teaching in university (e.g. Donahue-Wallace, La Follette, and Pappas, 2008). Some of these publications are discussed on item 2.4 (Art history teaching) of this thesis.

\textsuperscript{16} The focus of my review of the literature on art education was on the studies carried out in a North American context. This involves the discipline-based approach to art education (DBAE) which has had a great influence on the way art and its history has been taught in Brazil. An introduction to the discussions on the role of art history in art, design, and museum education in a British context can be found in Taylor, 1990 and 1992; Addison and Burgess, 2000 and 2003; and Hickman, 2005 and 2008.
In the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, art history, especially as a part of art appreciation, was considered helpful to moral development and improving one’s social standing. In the middle years of the twentieth century, two trends emerged in art education that influenced the teaching of art history. First, the range of objects that might be studied was broadened beyond Western fine arts to include such items as consumer goods, domestic architecture, and, sometimes, art from non-Western cultures. Second, in the 1950s and 1960s, a strong focus on psychological development and creativity sometimes actually discouraged the teaching of art history as a part of art education. More recently, discipline-centered curriculum visions of the 1960s and discipline-based approaches beginning in the 1980s once again have promoted the teaching of art history as a significant component of art education. (In Addis and Erickson, 1993, p.96)

Basically, the North American discipline-based approach to art education (DBAE)\(^{17}\) which Erickson refers to above, is a comprehensive approach to art education that combines four disciplines (art production, art criticism, art history, and aesthetics); these are involved in the creation, understanding, and appreciation of art. In this approach, students are introduced to a variety of visual texts produced by social groups in different places and eras, and to particular objects which can be classified as belonging to ‘fine’, applied, industrialised, or folk art. In DBAE, the role of art history is to help students acquire knowledge of the contributions artists and art have made to cultures and societies\(^{18}\).

DBAE supports a system of teaching the arts that incorporates elements from theories of creative expression (which argue for an education in the arts based on the self-expression of students), as well as the traditional system of teaching the arts in school (which favours a type of education that is based on observation and the reproduction of masterpieces, and the development of skills both in composition and handling different materials used in visual representation). On account of this, DBAE advocates a critical use of reproductions of works of art in art classes and believes that art history should be studied with the aim of broadening the students’ visual repertoire and improving their reading skills.

\(^{17}\) The DBAE approach to art education holds a great influence in the way art and its history has been taught in Brazilian schools since the 1980s. This is particularly due to the way this approach has been adapted to the Brazilian context by the art educator Ana Mae Barbosa.

\(^{18}\) For a broader understanding of DBAE, the role of art history in this approach and Neo-DBAE see: Kleinbauer, 1987; Smith, c1989; Hamblen, 1988 and 1993; and Dobbs, 1992.
The implementation of the DBAE concepts in schools has generated a certain amount of discussion about the education of art teachers (Lovano-Kerr, 1985; Sevigny, 1987; Zimmerman, 1994), but not much has been said about what kind of art history teaching should occur in teacher-training colleges to prepare pre-service teachers to include art history subjects in their prospective art classes.

However, Addiss and Erickson in their book ‘Art History and Education’ (1993), (which is about the teaching of art history in art classes for elementary and secondary grades), provide a basis for selecting the kind of subjects that should be included in teacher training colleges, (particularly in the context of Brazil) that adopt some of the DBAE teaching recommendations. These can be listed as follows:

a) aspects of the art created in different epochs, places and societies
b) the wide range of approaches to art found in art history studies
c) the work of the art historians
d) history of art history teaching
e) the relevance of art history teaching
f) sources and teaching procedures in art history education
g) art history at different educational levels
h) the art history curriculum
i) the influence of the art education curriculum on art history teaching.

In recent years, a large number of studies have been carried out to examine the role of art education in schools\(^{19}\) and to determine its relationship with visual literacy, visual culture, and the global society (for example, Freedman and Wood, 1999; Duncum, 2001 and 2002; Addison and Burgess, 2000 and 2003; Boughton, 2005; Hickman, 2005 and 2008). Some of these studies suggest that there is a deep-seated problem in the field of art education, and that it is this problem which allows art history to remain in the curricula of art teacher-training colleges and the art education programmes of schools that follow the DBAE recommendations. If improving pupils’ skills in interpreting and expressing feelings and thoughts through visual texts is among the current objectives of art lectures in schools, rather than preparing them as artists, the use of terms such as ‘art education’ (education for art and of artists) and ‘art history’ (the study of the objects that societies call ‘art’) gives a misleading idea of what has been done.

\(^{19}\) After years when there was a need to make art a formal subject in schools, the field is now defining the objectives of this discipline, discussing the problems arising from changes, and redefining its terms.
What 'art educators' might be seeking is not a different way of teaching the history of art, but of teaching the history of the various visual texts produced by the societies within which the history of art occurs. This is supported by Duncum who explains that:

What the field of art education needs is a concerted effort to incorporate the sites of the everyday into art education theory and practice. This would be to take as our subject the mainstream of cultural life in the contemporary world. It would involve trading in, to use Bourdieu’s (1984)[20] useful terms, the cultural capital of high art for the social and educational capital of the everyday as lived by the great majority of people. It would involve abandoning the margins of the curriculum to situate ourselves at its very heart. (1999, p.309)

Thus, the kind of history which ‘art educators’ are seeking can be identified with what has been called ‘visual culture’ studies[21], or what Gaskell (1991, in Burke, 1992, p.238-244) calls ‘visual history’[22]. According to Cherry (2004, p.491), art history and visual culture share theories and approaches, despite requiring skills and procedures that are distinct.

2.2 Art history in visual literacy

In recent years, greater prominence has been given to the role art classes play in educating visual readers (for example, Addison and Burgess, 2000 and 2003). Although the interest in how to encourage people to improve their ability to read visual texts is not new (Arnheim, 1954; Feldman, 1970; Dondis, 1973; Berger, 1977)[23], it was only in the 1980s that a shared interest in this subject began to emerge in research fields beyond art education. Since then, studies on the education of visual readers have been found in different areas such as linguistics (Joly, 1996; Kress and Leeuwen, 2000), museum education (Yenawine, 1999), psychology (Parsons, 1987), and the social sciences (Walker and Chaplin, 1997; Rose, 2001; Elkins, 2003)[24].

21 For a broader understanding of the discussions about visual culture and art history, see Walker, 1998; Elkins, 2003; pp.21-25; and Cherry, 2004.
22 It is worth pointing out that the ideas ‘art educators’ are introducing to the teaching of history subjects in art lessons, correspond to what has been described since the 1970s as the ‘new history’ (Le Goff, 1993), and not to the arguments of the ‘new art history’.
23 The dates given above beside the names of authors indicate the years in which they were first published and not necessarily of the editions that I used.
24 For a broader understanding of visual literacy studies, see the International Visual Literacy Association (IVLA) web site at http://www.ivla.org/.
According to Yenawine:

Visual literacy is the ability to find meaning in imagery. It involves a set of skills ranging from simple identification—naming what one sees—to complex interpretation on contextual, metaphoric and philosophical levels. Many aspects of cognition are called upon, such as personal association, questioning, speculating, analyzing, fact-finding, and categorizing. Objective understanding is the premise of much of this literacy, but subjective and affective aspects of knowing are equally important. (1997, p.1)

As in the case of verbal literacy, in the visual literacy process, two key skills are gradually acquired at the same time: the ability to ‘read’ visual texts and the ability to ‘write’ concepts through the use of visual elements.

Yenawine goes further in his attempt to understand the organisation of this educative process and claims that frequent exposure to visual texts is important for the improvement of visual literacy, although ‘it is incorrect to assume that we learn to negotiate meaning in imagery simply by exposure. Increased capacities require both time and broad exposure as well as educational interventions of various sorts’ (1997, p.1).

As in the case of verbal literacy, two key evolutionary stages can be identified in visual literacy:

a) an initial stage in which a person begins to be familiar with the elements of the visual language, and to acquire the ability to recognise levels of meaning in the images

b) and an advanced stage in which a person seeks to observe complex visual texts because he/she realizes that the images are social creations that vary in structure, use and interpretation depending on the places, periods and social groups in which they were created or exist.

---

25 When discussing visual literacy many authors, such as Yenawine (1997), tend to compare it with verbal literacy. As the research in this paper is linked to two cultural contexts, English and Brazilian, it is important to explain here that in this study the words ‘literacy’ and ‘alfabetização’ are not exact synonyms in different languages. This study rests on the assumption that the word ‘letramento’ as used by Soares (2002), is the best translation of the English word ‘literacy’ into Portuguese.

26 The stages above identified are based on the literacy stages referred to by verbal literacy authors such as Soares (2002) not on the five stages of aesthetic development defined by Housen (1987).
One peculiarity of visual literacy is that although it is an evolving process like verbal literacy, it is not directly linked to age, so both children and adults can be found at either the initial or the advanced stages (Yenawine, 1999, p.14).

The authors that have studied the visual literacy process (Housen, 1987 and 1992; Yenawine, 1997) explain that a specialist knowledge of art history is of considerable importance to those who are in the advanced stage of visual literacy. This is not only because art history is a theoretical subject, but also because visual readers at this stage have already learned that interpretations of visual sources are made on the basis of cultural assumptions and that they depend on their ability to use their own visual repertoires.

2.3 Art history and its approaches to art

The expression ‘art history’ is used to designate a branch of cultural history that involves studying all the arts and making their subjects known by visual means. These embrace areas such as painting, sculpture, architecture, engraving, photography, cinema, and so on, all of which can, today, be classified as ‘visual arts’.

Although texts on the visual arts were written in ancient times and the Early Renaissance, there is a general consensus that the first ‘history’ on art written in the West is ‘The Lives of the Artists’ (1550) by Giorgio Vasari (1511-1574). Since that time a large number of books, journals and articles have been written on the visual arts and many of them can be classified under the umbrella term ‘art history’.

Most of the books written about art history since the time of Vasari have provided a chronological study of the characteristics of the plastic arts, particularly painting, which have prevailed in European countries or in those cultures that have influenced European art. Many of these books resemble art history encyclopaedias (e.g. ‘The History of Art’ by E.H. Gombrich) or descriptions of the works and lives of individual artists (for

---

example ‘Van Gogh - The Complete Paintings’ by Ingo F. Walther and Rainer Metzger).

The authors from different backgrounds that have undertaken studies on art history tend to concentrate on one of the following areas:

- a) the lives of the artists and the mental, aesthetic and technical processes that they employ when creating works of art
- b) the identities and values of the societies in which the artists or works of art were conceived
- c) works of art and their interpretations and meanings.

The different areas outlined above can be grouped into three ways of analysing art and these can be drawn on to bring together the various approaches to art which are frequently found in art history studies.²⁹

The first is the oldest and most common in art history. It focuses on the study of the lives and work of artists, particularly because the authors that adopt this approach believe that the nature of the artist is the principal means of explaining a work of art. Since these authors are largely concerned with the biography of artists, their main sources are written documents, especially the artists’ personal records such as letters and diaries. This is considered to be the oldest line of study in art history because the first texts which are recognised as belonging to art history, like those produced by Vasari, tend to dwell on the lives and careers of the artists. Among the most recent studies in this mode of analysis, have been a number of studies adhering to psychoanalytical principles. These studies, like those written by Sigmund Freud (1856-1939), the key founder of psychoanalysis, state that the ‘significant meaning’ of a work of art is the personal meaning that the artist consciously or unconsciously endows it with.

The second mode of analysis examines the social relations of the groups that created the works of art, and the way the art objects represent the values of these groups. It gives rise to four lines of study.

²⁹ For a broader understanding of the different approaches to art adopted in the field of art history, see: Preziosi, 1998, and Fernie, 1996.
The first is linked to the area of social history, and regards works of art as objects whose existence is dependent on social values. As a result, this line of thought sees works of art, like all other artefacts, as being representations of the historical, cultural and political ideas of the time in which they were created.

The second line of study is influenced by Marxist theories, and asserts that works of art are objects created to support the ideology of some privileged group in society. Some authors who follow this line lay stress on the political and economic roles of patronage.

The third line claims there is a certain historical determinism in art creation. Authors that follow this line of thought believe that civilisation and the environment are the main sources of artistic development. These authors are particularly concerned with the relationship between patronage and the audience, since, in their view, the artist is above all a commissioned worker. In the texts that follow this line of reasoning, it is common to find discussions about ethical principles and the moral effect that art should have on society.

The last line is the most recent and has been called ‘New Art History’. Authors, who follow this line, regard works of art as reflecting the ideals shaped in specific historical, political and social circumstances. These authors claim that works of art reproduce ideologies of class, power, race, sexuality and gender and often result in certain kinds of social and political behaviour. The most prolific discussions in this line of study concern questions of gender which the authors view as something that is socially created, and associated with ideals and patterns that change from one epoch or culture to another. There is a strong tendency for these studies of gender to analyse women both as the subject of art and in their role as artists. They also attempt to illustrate how sexual orientation defines the way artists represent their themes and how art is understood.

The authors whose works contain some of the most interesting criticism on the relation between art history and social issues include the following: Johan Winckelmann (1711-1768), Pierre Francastel (1900-1970), Meyer Schapiro (1904-1996), E. H. Gombrich (1909-2001), Frederick Antal (1887-1954), Arnold Hauser (1892-1978), Nicos Hadjinicolau (1938-), T. J. Clark (1943-) and Griselda Pollock (1949-).
The second mode of analysis (and others applied in alternative fields of studies) regards material artifacts created by humans as being the means of representing and establishing identity positions. In their view, some material artifacts that surround the human race, can be regarded as special in some way and called *art objects*, because of the distinct and creative way their parts - normally the materials and subject-matter - are arranged.

Since these are special objects, they are often displayed in a way that differentiates them from other elements of the real world. When they are two-dimensional images, we enclose them in richly-decorated frames. When they are small three-dimensional figures, we display them at the top of elegant bases or plinths and, sometimes, inside glass shades. When they are buildings, we raise them above the human level of the cities.

The expression ‘art objects ’ covers a wide range of things, which can be classified into two categories: 1) objects of art that were primarily created to contain or convey information, - in other words, that were created to serve functional purposes, 2) objects of art that were specially conceived to provoke certain emotional reactions from the observers.

The existence of objects of art which have been solely created for aesthetic purposes, is quite recent in history (Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton, 1987, p.63), and the large majority of objects of art found in publications on art history were originally created for practical, social or religious ends. These are constructions that were conceived for the purpose of being public (e.g. temples), or private buildings (e.g. palaces or houses), sculptures erected as monuments in memory of distinguished individuals or images for religious devotion, or portraits of members of famous families or for social display, and illustrations of stories or historical events.

Like every other artifact, the objects of art have a direct association with the taste, social status, and ideology of the person whom they were created by, the individuals or social groups whom they were created for or owned by, and the places in which they were designed to be exhibited30. The subjects represented in objects of art, the materials in which they are made, their sizes, and number extant, give us clues about the recognition

---

30 With regard to the possession of objects of art and other artifacts by individuals, see: Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton, 1987; and Miller, 2001.
of the life of their creator, even when these objects are exhibited in contexts that try to minimize human characteristics and highlight compositional and formal qualities instead.

Certain objects of art were created as records of the experiences of individuals or groups, either in private or public spheres, and acted as memorials of those that participated in these experiences, or of those that regard it as important to remember what has been experienced by others.

As there are still certain fragile objects of art from ancient societies in existence, and given the fact that art is not a basic need for human survival (Roskill, 1976, p.182), a direct link can be established between the ordering and collection of art objects, and the accumulation of economic capital by individuals or groups. In other words, fragile objects of art may have been carefully assembled and survived the ravages of time because it was believed by their owners that these material items were of importance as an expression or enhancement of their social status.

Many objects of art that today make up the collections in museums around the world were arranged and preserved by wealthy individuals or groups whose private collections were, for different reasons, partially or completely made public. The growth of these private collections over many years depended on various factors, and the different objects of art that they contained were mostly chosen by collectors more because of the subject they represented than for their aesthetic or technical qualities. These are works that were primarily portraits of the noblest individuals of societies and pictures of some of their heroic acts, or else still lifes that express the abundance of food or the dilettante taste for gardening by wealthy people, scenes that describe religious figures with a certain intimacy or a distant and ideal past, or representations of workers doing routine work which could be gazed at by those that exploit their own work force. Despite this, certain collectors have sought for excellence in the forms of representation achieved by works of art. This is because:

The presence and control of objects of art provide a permanent mirror of superiority into which the upper classes can look and always see what they believe to be their own excellence, thus reinforcing one of their principal claims to superiority, their belief in their own good taste. (Warner, 1963, p.235 quoted in Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton, 1987, p.18)
Since the majority of the objects of art which are exhibited in museums or that form our national heritages were arranged and preserved to serve the interests of wealthy groups, it can be argued that these rich people play a predominant role in determining what should be regarded as be ‘art’ by society in general.

The upper class, or those eager to belong to it, were, for many generations (particularly before the 1970s), those who made the selection of the works that art history had to take account of, and tended to write the history of art from the perspective of their own social positions. Thus, for many years, art history had become a way of determining the relationship that certain groups wish to have with art and its production, and a useful means of asserting these groups’ status and social superiority

In summary, a work of art, like other human creations, is something that makes one aware of the cultural aspects of the society in which it was created, and enables one to identify the technological stage of development of a particular social group. This is because a work of art portrays a cultural understanding of the society and time in which it originated; it achieves this through the subject-matter and the way this is represented by the artist. Similarly, a work of art reflects the stage of technological development of the society in which it was created through the materials and techniques used in the creative process. In addition, the original purpose of a work of art and the way it is used, displayed and preserved, tells us something about the values and beliefs of the society in which it was created. Throughout history, new and diverse interpretations - such as those derived from historical, economic, religious or emotional concepts - are added to a work of art and some of them conflict with its original purpose.

Figurative works of art also represent different identities by means of the different visual elements they reflect. Works of art comprise two levels of meaning, the iconographic and the formal, and each of these levels consists of denotative and connotative meanings that can both represent or support the presentation of the identities (see Figure 1, p.34).

31 For discussions on this matter see: Hadjinicolaou, 1978; Bourdieu, 1994; and Bourdieu and Darbel, 2002.
32 As in the case of works of art, different objects have their original purpose or values disrupted or changed in the course of time. A good example of this fact is shown in fictitious terms in the movie ‘The Red Violin’ (1998), directed by François Girard.
At an *iconographic level*, the main elements that define the meaning are the images. In a work of art, every image or group of images has some particular meaning, and together they define the main meaning of the representation. In a figurative work of art, the images define aspects of the story that is being told, while, at the same time being representations of concepts which have a more universal significance. Some of these concepts are abstract and have cultural roots, and the representations of the images that are linked to them, define the particular uses or interpretations of the works of art. In visual texts, artists often represent identities by means of stereotypes or through the reproduction of the visual aspects of the elements that define the identities.

*Physical appearance* is the first element to denote and express identity, and its clear outlines in visual texts allow the readers to choose whether or not they wish to identify with the characters and situations represented. In other words, the representation in works of art of physical aspects that are used to define and recognise characteristics such as race, gender, age and disease, are the determining factor in the question of whether or not the readers feel an affinity with the characters and situations encountered.

*Material items* are an effective means of showing the extent of the technical know-how and prosperity of social groups, and also of expressing a cultural understanding of those identities which are defined by particular physical appearances. The representation of clothes and objects in works of art are often signs of historical and social identities, and the way they are interpreted allows the spectators to recognise whether or not they have a geographical and historical affinity with what is represented.

*Cultural practices* are abstract elements that characterise the identities of the social groups and their representation in visual texts often pervades all the people or objects in the scene, and also simulates their postures in the real world. Unlike other elements that express identity, the representation of cultural practices in works of art only occurs as a result of an interrelation of images.

At a *formal level*, the elements of the visual language that make up the images are the main factors that express a meaning. Visual elements such as colour, shape and lines convey particular meanings, and their relationships and distribution inside the space of the representation, define or strengthen the cultural identities expressed in works of art.
In this painting by Andersen, it is possible to identify the two levels of representation of identities. At the iconographic level the physical appearance makes it possible to recognise this as a representation of a woman, of a certain age, who looks a bit tired. The clothes and the style of the hair suggest that it is likely the woman lived in the past, and that she is not wealthy. If the physical appearance, the expression of the character and the title of this painting are correlated, it can be assumed that this is a representation of mature motherhood. At a formal level, there are three important visual elements that corroborate the characteristic of tiredness and the fact that this is a portrait of mature motherhood: the descending lines that define the character (particularly the face) and its clothes, the converging lines at the belly that draws attention to the region of the breasts and womb, and the opaque chromatic range selected by the artist in which tonal contrasts are avoided.

The third mode of analysis comprises a group of approaches to art that consider the works of art themselves and their objective meaning as their main topic of study. This is the most influential line of study in art history, and tends to analyse artistic creation from a ‘scientific’ perspective. Some authors who adopt this approach regard art history as a ‘science’ and devote their time to the study of the evolution of the visual language. The iconographic, iconological, stylistic and structuralist approaches can be included in this group.

The two first approaches have the most in common. Briefly, it can be said that what distinguishes them is that the iconographic approach studies the meaning of the image that gives shape to the subject-matter of the work of art, in relation to its original context, while the iconological approach studies the iconography and investigates the changes in significance of similar images over a period of time. As can be seen, the iconological approach or iconology is the more complex of these two approaches. This is particularly the case because it interprets changes in images by drawing on literary, philosophic and/or religious sources, and is concerned with those cultural postures that led to the theme being expressed in works of art. Argan (in Argan and Fagiolo, 1992,
p.38) states that the iconological approach regards art history ‘as a history of transmissions and mutations of meanings in images’\(^{33}\). Some of the studies on art undertaken by Erwin Panofsky (1892-1968) are examples of the way this iconological approach is applied.

While *iconology* treats the artistic object ‘as if it were a hieroglyphic text of ideas’ (Berger, 1978, p.199), the *stylistic approach* views it as a group of formal elements that display ‘distinguishing characteristics (...) that mark an artist, or a period, or a culture’ (Barnet, 1997, p.78). Analyses which are based on the stylistic approach, like some studies carried out by Heirich Wölfflin (1864-1945), are quite easy to identify because they:

a) adopt a formal procedure in investigating the use and distribution of plastic elements such as shapes, lines, colours, textures and brushwork in the composition of a work of art, and examining how this arrangement gives meaning to the visual text
b) study the materials and techniques applied when defining a work of art, and how their selection defines the aesthetic reactions of the spectators
c) interpret the elements displayed in artworks on the basis of psychological theories such as those concerned with the unconscious depths of the creative personality and artistic creation, and those concerned with aesthetic enjoyment and appreciation.

The *structuralist approach* is the most recent in art history and according to Femie it:

...looks for meaning at a level below that of surface content, a technique, which can be applied to visual material by, for example, ignoring the iconographic identification of the figures in an image and using, instead paired concepts such as male/female, nude/clothed and light/dark in order to define and explore the content. This approach was applied by art historians in conjunction with that of semiotics\(^{34}\) or the study of signs. (1996, p.19)

---

\(^{33}\) ‘...a história da transmissão, da transmutação das imagens’ (Argan in Argan and Fagiolo, 1992, p.38).

\(^{34}\) Femie explains that: ‘Semiotics or semiology is (...) structuralism applied to signs instead of language, and is the study of how sign systems produce meanings. It contains three categories of signs: the iconic, where the sign resembles what it stands for, as with a picture of an object; the indexical, where the sign is related to what it stands for by association, as with lightning and speed; and the symbolic, where the link with the referend is purely conventional. (...) Semiotics is therefore closely related to some of the methods of art history, since it is possible to describe aspects of such traditional art-historical methods as (...) iconography and (...) connoisseurship as types of sign systems.’ (2001, p. 359)
Structuralism is an approach which has been applied to studying a wide range of areas (e.g. psychology, linguistics, anthropology). Fernie explains that:

Structuralism in the broadest sense can therefore be defined as the establishing and examining of the general and particular laws by which structures work. The structuralist extracts principles of classification from the confusion of individual messages. Since structuralists are not interested in immediate or surface content they are not primarily concerned with the world at large, with what people actually say or with the making and using things. (2001, p.352)

Briefly, structuralists can be defined as those who study the underlying structures of meaning.

Structuralism, as a line of research, has it origins in the 19th century in the studies of the founding father of experimental psychology Wilhelm Wundt (1832-1920) and his follower Edward B. Titchener (1876-1927). However, the concept became influential in the first half of the 20th century due to the studies on linguistics of Ferdinand de Saussure (1857-1913), and some members of the ‘Prague School of Linguistics’ such as Roman Jakobson (1896-1982) and Nikolai Trubetzkoy (1890-1938), as well as the structural studies on anthropology of Claude Lévi-Strauss (1908-).

From the mid- to late 1960s, some theorists affiliated to structuralism [such as Jacques Lacan (1901-1981), Roland Barthes (1915-1980), Michel Foucault (1926-1984) and, Jacques Derrida (1930-2004) – later described as post-structuralists] began to criticize what they understood as its theoretical limitations. The concepts of structuralism and post-structuralism have been influential in art history as in many other areas devoted to the study of visual texts. However, their influence is more apparent in the way art historians theorise about works of art than in the analysis of any specific examples. This is particularly the case, because, as in the case of semiotic analysis, art historians tend to see works of art from different perspectives. First, they see art as a medium.

35 It is interesting to observe that in some studies of the so-called ‘New Art History approach’ there is a convergence of Marxist and Poststructuralist principles.
36 Two texts of Foucault can be considered as examples of structuralist analysis of works of art. These texts are: Las Meninas (reproduced in The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences in 1966) and This is not a pipe (written in 1968).
37 Art theorists have been discussing and applying semiotic analysis much more than structuralism and post-structuralism, particularly Italian visual researchers in the study of architecture. Examples of the use of the semiotic analysis in the study of works of art can be found in Metz, 1974; De Fusco, 1988; and Calabrese, 1997.
Second, although they recognise that there are differences among the real object, its visual representation in bi and tri-dimensional techniques, and its textual representation, but do not treat these differences as problems that do not allow them to see art as a language. Finally, the distinction between the concepts ‘fine arts’ and ‘applied arts’ must be abandoned, since all these arts are used by societies as communicative media.

The two post-structuralist concepts which have been most influential in art history are those of the ‘death of the author’ outlined by Barthes and ‘deconstruction’ which is championed by Derrida. As regards the first concept, Fernie explains that:

...poststructuralists argue that we cannot know anything of the author’s intentions, as even when writers give an account of them we cannot be certain that they are telling the truth or are not mistaken. Poststructuralists thus move the stress from the author to the reader: everyone who reads a text brings to it different experiences and degrees of competence, and hence will take different things away from it, reinventing it. Meaning, in so far as it can be established at all, exists in the space between the reader and the text. (2001, p.253)

In distinguishing deconstructivism from structuralism, Fernie explains that:

While structuralists believe that there are meanings for the critic to decipher (those in the structure behind the content), the deconstructionist sees the search for meaning as endless and the content as something of pure ambiguity. Similarly with signs: for a sign to be a sign it must be repeatable, but in being so it will also be infinitely variable in meaning, because meaning changes with context and no two contexts are the same. (2001, p.253)

Although linguistic approaches, such as structuralism and post-structuralism, have not often been applied to studying of works of art, in 1968, the Argentinian art historian Ángel Osvaldo Nessi wrote a book called ‘Técnicas de Investigación en la Historia del Arte’ (Techniques for Investigating Art History) in which he sets out a method for analysing works of art that combines the concepts of formal analysis and structuralism.

38 A discussion of dogmas in the field of art analysis - which have to be examined before one can apply linguistic approaches to analysing art - can be found in Calabrese, 1986.

39 Good examples of the encounter of the structuralist with formal and iconological methods can be seen in the documentaries called Palettes, directed by Alain Jaubert. In these documentaries Jaubert analyses some of the well-known Western masterpieces found in French collections. Jaubert’s analysis in some ways resembles Nessi’s approach. For information on the Palettes series see: http://archives.arte-tv.com/special/palettes/ftext/
Nessi thinks that:

…the structuralist method consists of examining the work of art as a whole, as if its parts were the elements of a language. Thus it can be regarded as a system of signs with reciprocal functions, solidarity and coherence, or rather, it is competing with its stated objective. One notices the links between each syntagma and the way its functional characters coincide with those that follow… (1968, p.67)

In explaining the approach he designed, Nessi says that it consists of analysing and interpreting the meaning of works of art through observing their formal structure (p.73). He provides an illustrative diagram and fully exemplifies his method by analysing several Western masterpieces of different types, styles, and periods. However, he is aware that ‘the results must be temporary, since every work of art is, by its nature, ambiguous in its meanings. The diagram serves as an ideal model and organises the formal syntax and the way it works in a schematic way’ (p.73).

Nessi’s method is not sophisticated, and formalist rather than structuralist when compared to the kind of analysis recommended by linguists. However, it is set out in a didactic manner and thus helpful to those who are being trained as visual readers, since it enables students to be aware of the different levels of significance and meaning that can be found in visual texts. The chart shown in Figure 2 sets out the main elements that comprise Nessi’s method.

2.4 Art history teaching

As stated earlier, there have been few studies about teaching art history or analyses of the contribution made by art history teaching to art education, and none which discusses the role of art history in the education of art teachers. However, in the limited number of publications that correlate art history and education, there are two categories of interest: undergraduates’ textbooks (Poitoin, 1989; Argan and Fagiolo, 1992; Barral i Altet, 1994;

\[40\] ‘...el método estructuralista consiste en el examen de la obra como totalidad; como si sus partes fuesen los elementos de un lenguaje – por lo tanto un sistema de signos con funciones recíprocas, solidarias y coherente – dicho mejor, concurrentes a finalidad expresiva. Se observan los enlaces mutuos de cada sitagma y la coincidencia de sus caracteres funcionales con los de los demás...’ (Nessi, 1968, p.67)

\[41\] ‘...los resultados deben ser provisionales, ya que toda obra es, por naturaleza, inagotable. El diagrama, como un modelo ideal, condensa esquemáticamente la sintaxis formal y su funcionamiento.’ (Nessi, 1968, p.67)
Lagoutte, 2001; Arnold, 2004; Maranci, 2004; D’Alieva, 2006; Pooke and Newall 2008), and teaching-guides for elementary and secondary-school teachers (McCarthy, 1978; Addiss and Erickson, 1993).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information from the compiled catalogue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The author and his/her dates. Title of the work. Date. Techniques and materials. Measurements. Site (museum, collection, gallery). History of the work: origins, execution, sequence of owners, vicissitudes, accidents, restoration, reproductions and important exhibitions, bibliography.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pattern and significant links to the plastic structure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) <em>Form</em> (thematic features and the signs that express them). Imitation, assimilation, recreation and invention. Thematic originality - its formal and sensory basis. Sources of both aspects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) <em>Relations between the perceived space and the expressive function</em>. The enclosed frame - rectangle, circle, tympanum, niche, inner space, frieze etc. Relations between the figure and the page, volume and space, the composition with the surroundings. A correspondence between the form and modelling, form and material, form and style etc. The way the shape of the frame functions; alterations caused by structural requirements. The <em>Gestalt</em> of the enclosed space (by points, form, colour, value, texture, dominance, contrast etc).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) <em>Grouping and the boundaries of forms and the landscape</em>. Enhancement and unity. The perceptible conditions of the composition. Grouping by similarities of mass, materials, modelling, colour and texture; also by spatial tension, axes, contact, overlapping, entwining, proximity, transparency and resonance; also by subjects, hierarchies and symbolism; and by symmetry, asymmetry, coordination and subordination. Ambiguous visual space. Relations between the arabesque, picturesque and pure forms. Organicism and abstraction. Drawing, space and rhythm as expressions of the relationship between the artist and reality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) <em>The chromatic structure</em>. The palette, descriptive, suggestive and symbolic harmonies. Disturbance of chromatic harmony and feelings in modern art. Tonal key and its meaning - factors of light and contrast in the formative act. The formal aesthetics of colour. Local colour and its variants. Monochromatics and achromatics and their interpretation. Correspondences with formal sintagmas. The effect of the surface; the dynamics of colour: surface colouring, modulated colour, the perspective of colour; soothing, uplifting and aggressive colour.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) <em>Form as image The role of feeling</em>. Appearance. The image as a ‘conductor’ of the real. The inner structure of the shape and its meaning; an interpretation of the categories of thought: mental, sensory and magical. The linked significance to plastic sintagmas: alluding to the elusive; finding and conveying meaning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) <em>Meaning and the interpretation of works</em>. Reduction of form to content as a relation between the signifying and the signified. The immanent and transcendent content of form.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2 - Structure of the Nessi method of analysing works of art

---

Nessi describes these items on pages 74-76 of his book. A copy of the Spanish text is given in Appendix 1.
The undergraduate textbooks are introductory publications to the study of art history. Most of them briefly outline the following items as being subjects of interest in the study of art history:

a) art, history and art history
b) different points of view held by professionals in the area of the arts while working with the artistic object
c) art history and visual culture
d) art history linked to other areas of knowledge
e) art history and the theory of art
f) the preservation, study, exhibition, appreciation and criticism of art
g) research into the history of art
h) connoisseurship in art history
i) resources and technology used by art historians when studying art
j) the main periods and styles of art history
k) materials and techniques used in fine arts
l) the place of Western and non-Western art in the history of art
m) the literature on the history of art
n) the main authors and texts in the history of art
o) the history of art history
p) the main approaches to art adopted by art historians.

The ‘approaches to art adopted by art historians’ and the ‘literature on art history’ are the subjects that receive the most attention. A reason for this might be that the study of these subjects can enable undergraduates to understand that the texts on art history are as wide-ranging as the interests of the researchers and societies that produced them.

Teaching-guides for elementary and secondary-school teachers basically consist of introductions to art history theory and guidelines for teaching procedures to be adopted in art history classes. These books date from the period when there were discussions about the formal inclusion of art history subjects in the basic levels of teaching in North America, and some of them are related to the DBAE approach to art education.

was first published some time ago, it is still the most comprehensive art history teaching-guide available. This book raises interesting topics for someone designing a teaching programme in art history, regardless of what level it is.

McCarthy provides introductions to the history of art history teaching, discussions of art history theory, examples of teaching procedures, and blueprints for art history lectures for children and teenagers. Interestingly, he opposes the absolute refusal of some educators to employ a chronological approach when teaching art history. He ascribes this attitude to the fact that educators associate this approach with the ‘survey’ courses they experienced at university. McCarthy defines the expression art history ‘survey’ courses as being ‘designed to acquaint the class with the major monuments of western art in chronological sequence, from the pyramids to Picasso’ (p.7). In arguing for the maintenance of a chronological approach in art history teaching for teenagers, McCarthy states that:

a) ‘works of art are, among other things, manifestations of the ideals of their age, and to divorce them from their setting in time and place is tantamount to depriving them of their spiritual energy’ (p.8)
b) the ‘art teacher who approaches the work of art in terms of its historical context is in fact acting on the sound pedagogic principle of working from the known to the unknown’ (p.8)
c) every ‘masterpiece displays a selection of elements from the artistic heritage of civilization, and it also adds to that heritage’ (p.8)
d) a ‘reason for adopting the chronological approach in teaching art history in secondary school is connected with the character of adolescence’ (p.9).

Further on in the book, McCarthy wonders whether pursuing ‘an overall chronological approach to teaching art history does not preclude the use of alternative approaches on occasion’ (p.21). This leads him to set out three alternative approaches: thematic, biographical and the use of a monograph.

However, as he is concerned with reproducing the university ‘survey’ courses in art history teaching for teenagers, McCarthy offers two suggestions of teaching programs for secondary schools that ‘could satisfy the requirements of the chronological approach while avoiding the disadvantages attendant on the survey course’ (p.9). These programmes are similar in content but organise the subjects in a different way so that
they correspond to the needs of the two separate divisions of the school year. McCarthy’s programmes focus on the study of the following epochs: Greek, Roman, Medieval, Renaissance, Baroque, Eighteenth-Century, Nineteenth-Century, and Twentieth-Century Arts and Architecture; North American Painting to 1950*; Contemporary North American Art*; Photography and Film*; Architecture and Design, 1750 to the present*43.

One of McCarthy’s most interesting discussions about these alternative programmes is the case he makes for the inclusion of North American art subjects in art history lectures in Canadian secondary schools:

The art of North America may not be as important as the art of Italy or Holland in absolute terms, but American high school teachers must take stock of their responsibilities to the many students who will never have the opportunity to travel to Italy or Holland and encourage in them an appreciation of their own national art and their national collections. This does not mean that the art history course need be confined to a study of the development of national art. On the contrary. A valid appreciation of the art of any nation is probably only possible by a comparative study of the art of several nations and historical periods. (...) examples of North American art are generally more available for study than are examples of European art. (p.13)

As is the case elsewhere in the American continent, in Canada, most art on public display dates from after the 18th century, and many of the works reflect the influence of European art styles ‘that are themselves an amalgam of ancient art and later interpretations of ancient art’ (p.12). This leads McCarthy to claim that comparative analysis ‘is an indispensable teaching tool in art history’ (p.12), and advises that when ‘selecting what works to include in a course, the teacher must be especially careful not to omit works of art that have stood as examples of the style of the age and as models for later generations of artists’ (p.12).

As well as arguing in favour of the study of one’s national heritage, McCarthy recommends giving priority to a kind of art history teaching that is primarily concerned with the study of visual creations that daily surround the students, and supports teaching applied arts such as design, photography and film.

43 Asterisks indicate variables in the McCarthy programmes.
McCarthy outlines two teaching models and also supports adapting art history programmes to educational contexts where they are applicable. In his view, teachers who design a teaching programme should bear in mind the following (pp.15-20):

a) their own knowledge of art history
b) local interests, such as the presence of ethnic groups in the locality in which the course is being run
c) the works of art available for students to study at first hand
d) the subjects of other areas of knowledge that the class is studying
e) the need to take into account the time available for the study of art history in schools when dividing up the art history topics.

McCarthy highlights the fact that when they design the content and sequence of their courses, teachers must give prominence to the following key areas:

1. Accurate and full knowledge of the works of art studied.
2. Understanding of the forces - artistic, personal, and social - that gave form to the works of art.
3. Realization that the works of art of later periods depend on those of earlier periods.
4. Development of aesthetic awareness. (p.20)

In discussing classroom practices, McCarthy’s understanding of the teacher’s role when lecturing on art history diverges from what is commonly understood. While not going deeply into student-centred teaching theories, he states that, in his view, the role of the art history teacher is to facilitate the students’ access to sources of data, and assist them in defining the precise area of the subject they want to study.

Being a teacher with extensive experience in the field, McCarthy is able to offer some valuable insights for new art history teachers about the physical arrangement of the classroom, as well as the kind of equipment and resources that can be used. He states that art history is often criticised because of the sheer volume of pictures shown in slides and the time spent on this. McCarthy reminds us that this is often informally called ‘art in the dark’ or ‘history of slides’ by students and teachers of other subjects. However, while recommending teachers minimise the frequent use of slide projections and display printed images instead, McCarthy highlights the fact that slides are still a good source of material for group image analysis and makes some suggestions about how to improve its uses. He refers to the fact that teachers should be aware of how
many pictures can be shown, which details to focus on and which images should be compared.\footnote{44}

In addition, McCarthy asserts that teachers ought to remember that viewing slides is ‘no more than a passive activity’ (p. 78), and that:

> It must be remembered that textbooks, slides, and other visual aids are only aids. The subject of the class’s study is the actual work of art, and the teacher should use every opportunity possible to usher the class into art galleries and museums, giving them the experience of confronting the works of the masters directly (p. 82).\footnote{45}

Finally, in discussing the evaluation of art history teaching, McCarthy states that:

> The principal point to remember is that evaluation is designed to be a teaching aid. Any test, examination, essay, or project should give the students an incentive to learn. If evaluation is done on a regular basis, it also gives the teacher an excellent means of maintaining individual contact with each student. For both these reasons, evaluation forms a vital part of the art history program, but to make the best possible use of evaluation procedures the teacher has to construct assignments in such a way that they allow students to reveal their strengths as well as their weaknesses. If the teacher praises the strengths revealed as a result of evaluation exercises, the students will have a positive attitude towards evaluation and gain the incentive to build from one learning stage to the next. (p. 83)

\footnote{44} “There is no need to darken the classroom for the entire duration of the art history lesson. Particularly in the early years of the program, it is better to construct the lesson in sections featuring different techniques, first spending some time questioning the students to assess and aid their recollection of previous lessons and explaining the characteristics of the works to be discussed in the current lesson, using blackboard diagrams wherever they are appropriate. Over the next ten or fifteen minutes, slides of these art works can be shown, together with related works. The final section of the lesson can then be devoted to an exploratory discussion, preferably with reference to contemporary texts and current art historical or critical thinking, directed to determining the extent of the class’s understanding of the importance of the works for the development of the artist’s style or of the trends in the medium or theme being studied by the class. (...) Because slides are essentially artificial, the teacher must also try to keep in view the need to restore the reality of the work of art by stressing the qualities of the medium in which it is executed and the physical setting for which it was created. This can often be done by comparing the work’s scale to objects in the classroom, mentioning, for example, its size in relation to the dimensions of the screen on which it is shown, or to the blackboard or the walls of the classroom. Similarly, works of architecture can be related to local buildings with which the class is familiar. Works studied in class can also be related to paintings or sculptures done in the same period, medium, or scale that are in local collections with which students might be acquainted.” (p. 74)

\footnote{45} On discussions about the use of new technologies in art history lectures see Donahue-Wallace, L. Follette, and Pappas (2008).
2.5 History teaching

Although history is perhaps one of the fields that is most resistant to changes in teaching procedures, in recent years many studies have advocated reforms (Haydn, 2008; Hoodless, 2008; Phillips, 2008). Some of these studies seek changes to enable students to feel a greater historical empathy with the contexts they study (Davis and Yeager, 2001). Some require changes in subject-matter and teaching procedures to make history less remote from everyday concerns so that it can shape present-day society and be relevant to the contemporary world (e.g. Nikitiuk, 1999; Husbands, 1996 and 2003; Pinsky, 2001; Fonseca, 2003; Karnal, 2003; Timmins, Vernon, and Kinealy, 2005; Murphy, 2007).

Drawing on more student-centred educational theories, many of these studies argue for close ties between the cultural heritage of the global world and the immediate cultural context of the students (e.g. Pinsky, 2003, p.20). They support a kind of history teaching that brings together the past and the present. At the same time, they advocate a study of History with a sense of responsibility for the present, in which the past is only ‘interrogated’ when a better understanding of contemporary society is required (Pinsky, 2003, p.23).

The Portuguese authors Manique and Proença (1994, in Fonseca, 2003, pp.156-161) in their study of how local history can lead to the development of social identities, conduct a valuable discussion on history teaching that can also be applied to art history teaching. Particular importance is attached to studying local history on the following grounds:

a) the study of local history is a stimulus for education because it allows students to carry out educational activities which they are interested in, since this past is still present in their contemporary world

b) the teaching of history which includes conducting research into local history as its principal pedagogical procedure encourages students to improve the intellectual skills required for historians’ work, such as historical analysis and critical examination of facts and documents

c) the closer relationship students form with local institutions and structures while carrying out research, helps to prepare them for social inclusion and critical citizenship.
2.6 Summary and conclusions

On the basis of the review of the literature on art education and visual literacy, it can be stated that the main roles of art history in teachers’ education are: a) to prepare art teachers to enter into a dialogue with different cultures, b) to help them in their education as visual readers, and c) to improve their skills in using and gaining access to visual texts.

The literature review showed that a broader understanding of the different approaches to art adopted by art historians is important for a good education in art history. This is because by reflecting on the opinions of authors that have analysed art throughout history, and understanding how cultural, social and historical perspectives have shaped their views, students can understand both their own identity positions and those of others.

The approaches to art that regard the works of art and their objective meaning as their main topic of study are of particular interest for educating art teachers in art history. This is because these approaches can bring art history closer to the discussions on visual analysis carried out in art teacher-training colleges, (the structuralist approach to art in particular, since it led students to reflect on the levels of significance revealed in works of art).

Throughout the literature review, it was recognised that there are other analytical perspectives that, in some settings, might have superseded formalism, (such as post-structuralism, and other forms of analysis that have been influenced by linguistics, and are concerned with the production of meaning). However, my experience as an art history teacher has led me to feel that, whilst these approaches are clearly analytically productive, they are not pedagogically productive in the kind of setting in which I work. Nessi’s method, in contrast, is easy for students to understand and use in the analysis of works of art and other visual texts.

The literature review also showed that since students are more interested in learning subjects that are closely linked to their immediate reality, they will have a greater understanding of the subjects being studied (particularly if they are abstract, theoretical, or distant in time and space) if an experiential approach is adopted. Thus, an alternative
art history teaching programme that seeks to educate teachers to become reflective should be organised in a way that allows students to move gradually away from the real to the conceptual world, for example, from their own culture to a foreign culture. In this way, students can become more active and critical in their learning processes, as these take into account their own experience in society. Moreover, they will be encouraged to understand art history texts as theoretical constructs of societies and epochs so that history can be regarded by them as a human science and not just a description of a series of events that cannot be questioned.

The review of the literature has shown that some factors should be given prominence when designing an alternative art history teaching programme: in particular, teaching methods, teaching procedures, study topics, and assessment. On the basis of McCarthy’s discussions of these subjects, it was concluded that the problem can be defined as not arising from employing a chronological approach in the study of art history, but rather, in adopting it as the only method of teaching this subject. Moreover, I realised that although it involved encouraging students to broaden their contacts with their local culture, this did not imply rejecting foreign art subjects in art history lectures. If one accepts that the influence of other cultures (especially European) was a characteristic of the local culture, and it was necessary to employ a comparative study of cultures as a teaching method, the study of foreign art in the curriculum should be retained since it would be only regarded as an outside influence on the locality and not as a cultural model to be followed.

McCarthy’s comments about teaching procedures, particularly about the use of visual aids, made me realise that the problem of passivity (which is often encountered in art history teaching) could be avoided and students could be helped to acquire visual literacy if various types of visual aids were used, instead of just slides, and if the number of examples in the lectures was reduced.

A further change needed was an improvement in the kind of assessment included, so that it ceased to be a cause of tension in the relationship between the teacher and the students. It could be delayed until the students’ progress could be observed and when the individual anxieties and needs that arise in the process of studying art history could be attended to. In this way, the art history teachers would not just classify their progress by means of the scores they achieved in the activities they carried out.
However, McCarthy’s comments made me conclude that it is important to strike a balance between types of assessment aimed at the particular progress of each student, and others that reflect the requirements of the college. In view of the number of changes which I believe should be applied to art history teaching and the complexity of conducting assessment procedures, I decided I should use different forms for evaluating the students’ development while respecting the periods outlined by the college.

In conclusion, the part of the literature review concerning ways of educating art teachers to become skilful visual readers who are willing to enter into a dialogue with different cultures, should focus on discussing the ideological assumptions that are expressed in: a) works of art, b) an analysis of these objects, and c) the act of preserving works of art.

This programme should also open up a dialogue between cultures that are distant in time and space, and bring about mutual influences between members of the groups. The focus of these approaches should be on the object of art itself as the main point of interest since this will help students acquire a critical reading of visual texts. There should also be a study of the cultures and reality closely linked to the everyday life of the students to encourage them to adopt more natural, participative, and analytical attitudes. Finally, differences in teaching procedures and assessment must be implemented to bring about radical changes in traditional art history teaching. However, this does not imply completely rejecting some aspects of the way this subject has been traditionally taught (e.g. chronological study, periods of assessment defined by the college), since they remain valid and have a relevance to life outside the classroom.
CHAPTER 3 - THE SOCIETY FOR WHICH THE ALTERNATIVE PROGRAMME WAS DESIGNED

As explained in Chapter One, the alternative art history teaching programme was designed to reflect the peculiarities and historical circumstances of the art in the locality where the course was run. Since the programme was undertaken in a real setting, it was also designed to respect the educational structures and requirements of the college chosen for the research. This chapter provides a brief outline of the cultural features of this locality and thus, provides an overview of the context within which the alternative programme, (described in Chapter Four), was undertaken.

3.1 The cultural context

Brazil, the largest and most distinctive country of South America is a former Portuguese colony \(^{46}\) which covers a huge area of land of great geographical diversity that can be divided into five different regions \(^{47}\).

The current population of Brazil is as varied as its geography. This is because its population has been formed by a continuous process of miscegenation involving diverse people and cultures, most of them migrants from other continents \(^{48}\). There has been migration to the American continent since the ‘period of discovery’ (16th century); however, immigration was most intense between 1870 and 1930.

---

\(^{46}\) Brazil was a Portuguese colony from 1530 to 1822.

\(^{47}\) North - dominated by the Amazonian rain forest; Northeast - region along the Atlantic coast, where the most beautiful beaches of the country can be found; Southwest - the economic centre of Brazil, which includes the two major cities of the country (Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo); Centre-west - the region of greatest biodiversity in Brazil which includes the Pantanal (a large area of swampland) and the capital of the country, Brasília; South - the coldest region of the country, the economy of which is mainly based on agricultural production and cattle-raising.

\(^{48}\) According to Darcy Ribeiro (1995, p.19) the first ethnic matrix of Brazil evolved in the period from the 16th to the 19th centuries, and included a mixture of diverse groups of Native Americans (the original inhabitants), Portuguese (colonisers) and Africans (slaves). There is still much to be done in exploring and understanding the cultural influences on present society of the different groups of Indians and Africans who inhabited the Paraná territory. This study takes very seriously the significance for contemporary society and its education, of the traditional art of the region and of the different social and cultural groups that comprise the cultural complexity of present day Paraná. In designing the programme discussed in this thesis, however, I had to consider only art produced from the 19th - 21st century largely because there is a lack of reliable sources for studies of the art created earlier than this.

---
The southern region of Brazil comprises the states of Paraná, Santa Catarina, and Rio Grande do Sul, and is one of the wealthiest parts of the country. This region first began to be inhabited in the 17th century but includes many towns that are less than a hundred years old. This is because the people that moved there between the 19th and 20th centuries, (mainly Europeans), remained for many years in the agricultural colonies where they first settled.

Although figures regarding migration to the American continent vary, depending on what sources are drawn on, it can be stated that almost 31,000,000 people migrated to America in this period (Oliveira, 2001, p.22). The majority of these immigrants came from the overpopulated peasant communities of Europe (Italy, Portugal, Spain, Germany and East Europe), Asia (Japan and China) and the Middle East. This population explosion was mainly brought about by the first signs of industrialization in these countries (Oliveira, 2001, pp.22-24) and, also by the invention of steamships which made travelling by sea faster and safer.

Between 1808 and the first decades of the 20th century, there were two distinct immigration policies adopted by the government. These policies allowed different groups to move here and determined the type of relationship that certain ethnic groups formed with Brazilian society.

The first of these policies, which was implemented at the beginning of the 19th century49, was to send peasant-farmers and artisans to colonize the empty lands of the country, and, hence, encourage their social and economic growth. This involved the government setting up agricultural ‘colonies’50, particularly in Southern Brazil, and made it easier for immigrants to acquire property. As a result of this measure, a considerable number of immigrant families that moved to Brazil during this period decided to settle there51.

49 This policy was implemented in 1808 just after Dom João VI (1767-1826), ordered the transfer of the Portuguese royal court to Brazil, when Portugal was threatened with invasion by Napoleon (1769-1821). The Portuguese royal family took refuge in its then vice-royalty of Brazil under the escort of the British fleet (England and Portugal had been allies since 1373).

50 Some of these old agricultural colonies still exist, although the nearby towns have swallowed up others, noticeably in Curitiba where a lot of the colonies established at that time are now residential neighbourhoods. It is interesting to observe that a considerable number of the descendants of these immigrants still live in the remotest parts of the regions where these old colonies had been set up.

51 For information regarding this period, see: Alencastro and Renaux, 1997; Alvim, 1998; and Urban and Urban, 2004.
The second immigration policy resulted from the abolition of slavery in Brazil in 1888\textsuperscript{52}. After the 1880s, Brazilian farmers required a larger number of immigrants to replace the steady supply of slaves that had worked in the coffee plantations\textsuperscript{53} of Southwest Brazil. Since there was now a shift in economic priorities from occupying empty lands, to employing agricultural workers, the Brazilian government changed its immigration policy regarding the acquisition of property: immigrants were only allowed to buy small properties in Brazil after they had worked for a time on the coffee farms. However, the government welcomed the fact that immigrants could contribute to economic growth and thus took measures to facilitate the permanent legal residence of foreigners in the country. For instance, the Brazilian Constitution of 1891 guaranteed that foreigners who had been living in Brazil for more than six months would be granted an automatic right to naturalization (Oliveira 2001, p.18).

This alternative strategy led to different kinds of immigrants arriving in Brazil and these included a considerable number of redundant artisans and workers from Europe. As soon as these people had worked long enough on a farm to cover the cost of their passage to Brazil, they tended to abandon agriculture and move to the emerging towns to work in local industry and commerce, and were largely responsible for the development of the South and Southwest\textsuperscript{54}. For example, in Paraná the German immigrants, who settled in Curitiba, developed the graphic and metal crafts industry\textsuperscript{55}.

Another consequence of the second immigration policy was the arrival of temporary immigrants at the beginning of the 20\textsuperscript{th} Century, who wished to earn enough to support a higher standard of living in their home country. This particularly applied to the Japanese immigrants, most of whom only intended to come for three or four years, but in fact remained much longer.

\textsuperscript{52} The Portuguese colonisers and Brazilian farmers relied on the labour of Native Americans and African slaves from the 1530s to 1888 (when slavery was officially abolished).

\textsuperscript{53} Between the end of the 19\textsuperscript{th} and first half of the 20\textsuperscript{th} century, Brazil was one of the most important producers of coffee in the world, and during these years, coffee production was the main economic activity of the country. It remains the leading producer of green coffee.

\textsuperscript{54} On these immigrants see: Petrone, 1982; Bosi, 1994; and Fausto, 1998.

\textsuperscript{55} On the role of German immigrants in the graphic industry in Curitiba see Odahara, 1996, and on their presence in Paraná see Banco de Desenvolvimento do Paraná, 1979.
Despite their different cultural backgrounds, the majority of the families that moved to Brazil shared a past of poverty and a desire to improve their standard of living\textsuperscript{56}. They were seeking a sufficient degree of economic and cultural capital to allow them to go at least one step further in obtaining social status\textsuperscript{57}. These families attached great importance to formal education and to those subjects that could help them achieve their desired social mobility\textsuperscript{58}.

The immigrants that moved to Brazil were usually people who had experienced poverty and difficulty in obtaining employment in industrialized societies (Alvim, 1998, pp. 219-231). On leaving their home countries, they devised a plan for social mobility, which in some cases included a wish to be reintegrated in their society of origin. This plan was particularly noticeable among families of immigrants that did not intend to settle in the new country, like the Japanese immigrant families. However, those affected by this process were not always conscious of it or able to rationalise their course of action.

The plan for social mobility was not confined to individuals but was a family project, in which all the participants had to make a collective effort and share their profits. Thus, in this kind of venture, the interests of the individual are minimized, while the success of

---

\textsuperscript{56} The majority of immigrants that moved to Brazil are of peasant stock; they were forced to abandon their home countries because they were undergoing a process of industrialization. The attitudes of these immigrants towards the place and culture they moved to are different from those that were driven out of their homes because of war. This can be particularly observed in comparing the Polish groups that moved to Brazil at the end of the 19\textsuperscript{th} century and in the first decades of the 20\textsuperscript{th} century. The groups that arrived during the 19\textsuperscript{th} century were from peasant families and mostly Catholics or Orthodox Christians. They settled in colonies and their aim was to become plantation owners. They hoped in this way to recover from their losses and in some cases severe hunger, and eventually prosper [see Urban and Urban (2004)]. This contrasted with the peasant families that came to Brazil during the first decades of the 20\textsuperscript{th} century. These were individuals that had a good level of schooling, were handcraft workers or professional employees, and mostly Jewish [on the way some of these immigrants concealed their origins and lived among the German community in Brazil see Buchmann, 1995]. A broader understanding of the differences between immigrants that moved because of hunger and those that moved to avoid war can be obtained from the works of Pollinari (2004) and Burrell (2006). Although these authors discussed the lives of the immigrants and their descendants from different ethnicities (Italian; Polish, Greek-Cypriot and Italian), that moved to different places (such as Brazil and Britain), their main concern is with the way these immigrants negotiated and constructed their new identities in the context of migration. There are very interesting discussions about the way the groups suffered repeated persecution because of their cultural identities or religious beliefs, particularly in periods of war. The authors also discuss how they organized their traditions in oral forms and build and remembered the stressful moments they or other members of their communities had experienced. Most of these works were written by intellectuals from or about the Jewish community, like Maurice Halbwachs (1877-1945), Michael Pollak (1877-1945) and Zygmunt Bauman (1925-).

\textsuperscript{57} For discussion of the roles of cultural capital in social mobility, see the seminal text of Bourdieu and Passeron (1990).

\textsuperscript{58} Interesting discussions on the role of schooling in social mobility of immigrant families can be found in Vermeulen and Perlmann (2000).
the immigrant group is regarded as paramount (Vermeulen and Perlmann, 2000). The family is the ‘owner’ of the individuals’ destiny and decides what choices in life they will have. As a result, every member of the immigrant families had a very clear idea of the role he/she would perform in the group. These roles were defined by gender and age; moreover, power in the family depended on the responsibilities each individual had (in other words, the most valuable man was the main breadwinner of the group, while the most important woman acted as the housekeeper and kept the group united) (Petrone, 1982; Buchmann, 1995).

Since the main objective of these immigrants was to return to their home countries, the family had to apply strict control over each individual to avoid acculturation or miscegenation, factors that could threaten their ability to be reintegration with their society of origin.

These immigrants sought to obtain social mobility for the family during the lifetime of the principal members (the parents); however circumstances arose which forced them to delay putting their original plan into practice. The groups that moved to Brazil at the beginning of the 20th century, such as the Japanese immigrants59, suffered persecution during the 2nd World War, particularly after 1942, when Brazil declared war on the Axis powers (Oliveira, 2001, p.21). This was partly due to the fact that they had little contact with the local community and also, of course, because of the political stance adopted by many people in their home country. The activities of these immigrants was tightly controlled, and some families had their possessions and property confiscated60.

The wartime years disrupted the plans of the immigrant families, since it meant the groups were unable to save up money as quickly as they had hoped. Thus, their social mobility project had to be redesigned, so that some responsibilities could be

59 The Japanese community is one of the largest and most influential migrant groups in Paraná, and displays features of both permanent and temporary migration. In view of this, I would like to draw on the Japanese immigrant families’ experience here to illustrate my thoughts on the projects for social mobility that were planned by the immigrant families. Another factor is that I was raised in a multi-ethnic family where the cultural heritage was largely Japanese and I have had close contact with the experience of other Japanese families that have moved to Brazil. I am a member of the third generation of a Japanese immigrant family that arrived in Brazil in the 1920s. Since my great grandparents were attracted to Western culture and willing to accept inter-ethnic marriage, my family grew up apart from the traditional Japanese community, although it remained on friendly terms with it. This means that my family did not share the same cultural attitudes as many immigrant families that moved to Brazil, or unconsciously adopt the mentality that still prevails among many immigrant descendants today.

delegated to the youngest generations, and they had to accept a certain degree of integration into Brazilian society. As a result of this adjustment, the roles of certain members of the immigrant families began to be clarified, or defined, particularly in the case of the first three generations.

It is clear that the first generation of immigrants (the real immigrants, the people that were born in a foreign country and that moved to Brazil, - called isseis by the Japanese community), had strong roots in its culture of origin, and was responsible for beginning the process of the family’s social mobility. They were the most respected members of the family, since they were responsible for overseeing its work and progress and ensuring that their plot of land could keep the family united and lead to its prosperity. Although the nature of their employment prevented them from practising their traditional culture and observing all the religious traditions of their home countries, the members of the first generation strongly encouraged setting up institutions [such as schools, social clubs (mainly to play games and enjoy dancing) and churches] that could be actively involved in preserving the traditions of their culture^61.

Unlike this group, their children (the second generation called nisseis by the immigrant Japanese families) were expected to preserve their family’s traditional pattern of life. Since many of them were born in Brazil, apart from helping to improve the standard of living of the family, they had to observe the traditions of their home country within the group, maintain the role of the family inside the ethnic community, particularly on important religious and social occasions, and get married to someone from a similar family background. In general, the second generation is the group of immigrant families which experiences most stress. They feel burdened with a heavy responsibility, since they feel compelled to attempt to fulfil the family project for social mobility or, at least, give birth to a new generation who will be able to carry out the family plan. When the families found that they had to postpone returning to their home country, the second generation was expected to make useful contacts with other families within the local culture, and learn the rudiments of the mainstream language.

---
^61 For a discussion on the ethnic self-identification of the first-generation immigrants, particularly in Germany, see Zimmermann, Zimmermann and Constant (2007).
As explained above, the second-generation members are under family pressure to get married to a member of the community or someone who shares the same ethnic roots. However, a considerable number of inter-ethnic marriages can be found in this generation. Its members are often in a state of conflict - this particularly applies to those that bear the physical signs of their ethnicity like Japanese descendants - because they dream about a place and way of life that, in fact, they do not know. Moreover, they are prevented from becoming permanent members of the local community, and, on account of this, have to live in a state of limbo between two cultures. Adelina Nishiyama, a paranaense contemporary artist, (and herself a descendant of immigrants), exemplifies clearly the feelings of this generation in the following comments:

As a Nissei, I belong to a generation that lives a double life. We certainly suffer from an identity crisis: despite having been born in Brazil, we are considered foreigners. It is almost inevitable, as someone only has to look at the oriental features of our faces and they can always tell our origins. Sometimes we are proud of our ancestry; at other times we distance ourselves from everything that relates to it. In our hearts we have the feeling of not having a definite home country, as if we had been born on a boat trip. (Nishiyama, 2001, p.14)

Since the 1980s, the nikkeis (people of Japanese origin of any generation) from Brazil have been migrating to Japan in a movement that is similar to that of their elders. Various interesting studies have been carried out on this subject (Toma, 2000; Fukasawa, 2002; Galimbertti, 2002). It has been called the dekassegui movement (a Japanese expression referring to people who temporarily reside abroad to earn money). These studies show that the reasons that lead a large number of second generation Brazilian nikkeis to become dekasseguis are often either economic or cultural (the need to return to their cultural origins, and rediscover family pride and honour). This is a very complicated process since the descendants return to Japan to work in KKK (kitsui = hard; kitanai = dirty; kiken = dangerous) jobs and this represents a failure in the Japanese immigrant families’ project for social mobility. It worth noting that, before

62 'Como nissei, faço parte de uma geração que vive uma grande dualidade. Vivemos certamente um conflito de identidade: apesar de termos nascido no Brasil, somos apontados como estrangeiros. E isso é quase inevitável, basta olhar para os nossos traços orientais estampados no rosto, que estão e estarão sempre ali a nos delatar. Ora nos orgulhamos da nossa ascendência, ora nos distanciamos de tudo que se refere a ela. Guardamos no peito um sentimento de não possuir uma pátria definida, como se tivéssemos nascido num barco em viagem.' (Nishiyama, 2001, p.14)

63 According to the Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatistica (IBGE; Brazilian Institute for Geography and Statistics) in 2000 there was almost 200,000 Brazilians (most of them descendants of Japanese) living in Japan.
they leave Brazil and go back to Japan, most Brazilian *nikkeis* are better off economically and better educated than the large majority of the rest of the Brazilian population (Galimbertti, 2002, pp.147-148).

Many of the *nisseis* that went back to Japan as *dekassegui* faced problems since the Japanese society which they were eager to ‘return to’ had changed, and the language they had learned was that of the poor peasants of the beginning of the 20th century. These reasons, together with the fact that they had been born Brazilians, made a considerable number of *nikkeis* want to return to Brazil, regardless of their financial position. In many cases, the second generation could not fulfil the wishes of its elders and this led its members to feel protective towards the *third generation*, since this group might be better prepared to complete the family ‘saga’.

The *third generation* (called *sansei* by Japanese immigrant families) is the most ‘Brazilian’ of the immigrant families, since they are the second generation born in that country. If the objective of the other two generations was confined to saving up money, the *third generation* is expected to master the structures and languages of the two cultures they belong to. The family still expects them to fulfil the original objective of their ancestors – to return to their country of origin with a view to changing the former social position of the family. However, they also have to acquire some complementary cultural skills to complete their task and break free from the constraints imposed on some members of the second generation. Thus, if in some cases there is less pressure on the third generation to work in a family business, as a rule there is greater pressure on them to succeed in their schooling.

The Japanese immigrant families are one of the communities that have given most priority to formal education, and their experience exemplifies the complexity of the educational process in Brazil.

As explained earlier, most Japanese families that migrated to Brazil between 1908 and 1950, planned to return to Japan soon afterwards and were thus unprepared to adapt to

---

*Other ethnic groups who returned to their countries of origin have experienced the same phenomenon with regard to culture and language. Some of the languages and traditions of certain migrant groups in Paraná have been obsolete for many years in their land of origin and become the object of study by foreign scholars (see Epp, 1993).*

56
life in Brazil or learn the language spoken there (Portuguese)\textsuperscript{65,66}. Moreover, they avoided close contacts with the local culture since they believed it could deprive them of the qualities needed for a perfect re-integration into Japanese society (such as language fluency and cultural norms). As a result of this attitude, a large number of isseis that stayed in Brazil never really learned Portuguese.

The isseis used to regard ethnic schools as important institutions for preparing their children (whether born in Japan or in Brazil) for the Japanese way of life, and, thus, for being able to become integrated into the life of Japan. When the Brazilian police closed down the ethnic and bilingual schools in the country, in compliance with the Brazilian Constitution of 1937, teaching foreign languages to young children was forbidden. This meant that Japanese immigrant families suffered a severe setback in their plans for social mobility, since:

\[\ldots\text{without a Japanese school, children would be deprived of learning the} \] \textit{Yamatodamashii} \textit{– the doctrine of the ‘Japanese spirit’ and of the ‘Japanese way of life’}. It was in school that boys and girls used to learn the standards of Japanese behaviour... (Morais, 2000, p.49)\textsuperscript{67}

A further reason was that:

The Japanese immigrants had to return to Japan as success stories. They could never think of taking back their children, born (...) [in Brazil] as \textit{gaijin} [foreigners]. They had to learn and speak the Japanese language. This was the only way to prevent their children from being considered as foreigners by the Japanese, when they returned to Japan. (Sakurai, p.43, in Fausto, 1998, p.52)\textsuperscript{68}

\textsuperscript{65} Despite this, it is interesting to note that of the ethnic groups that moved to Brazil between the 19\textsuperscript{th} and 20\textsuperscript{th} centuries, the Japanese are those that had the highest educational standards before migrating. This can be illustrated by the considerable number of Japanese men (over 15 years old) that went to Brazil as immigrants, between 1908 and 1950, after completing secondary or university education (Suzuki, 1998, p.106). It should be noted that prior to the 1920s there were no official universities in Brazil and that higher education was only accessible to those able to pay the costs of their studies in foreign universities (mainly in Europe), which, of course, was not the case of the immigrant families already settled in Brazil.

\textsuperscript{66} For discussions on the distinction between voluntary and involuntary migration and their preparation for this process, see Burrell (2006, p.185).

\textsuperscript{67} ‘Os imigrantes japoneses tinham o compromisso de honra de só retornarem ao Japão como vencedores. Não podiam sequer pensar em levar seus filhos, nascidos (...) [no Brasil] como \textit{gaijin} [estrangeiro]. Era preciso que eles aprendessem a ler e a falar a língua japonesa. Esta era a maneira que eles encontraram de não terem seus filhos considerados como estrangeiros pelos japoneses, quando retornassem ao Japão.’ (Sakurai, p.43, in Fausto, 1998, p.52)
The restrictions imposed on Brazilian immigrants during the 2nd World War - in particular the ban on speaking foreign languages in public places and the compulsory teaching of Portuguese, compelled the second generation of immigrant families to live two separate lives, which were defined by their use of languages. Thus, at home and with friends, they spoke the language of their ethnic group (i.e. Japanese), but they had to speak Portuguese in public places and for any form of communication in society.

The Brazilian government’s ban on foreigners communicating in their mother tongue led a large number of nisseis to think that the nihongo (Japanese language) was a private language to be used at home. Moreover, contact with burajirugakko (Brazilian schools) meant that, at times, the second-generation felt ashamed of their parents for reasons explained by Fausto (1998, pp.54-55):

In the context of the family, the language is a source of estrangement between the generations or else acts as a barrier. The former is bound up with the influence of teaching: when they learn a high standard of Portuguese, the second generation will realise how badly their parents and relatives speak the language. In the presence of their schoolmates and friends, they often felt ashamed of the mispronunciation of their elders (...)

In the case of the parents, the language of their home country allowed a coded form of communication to be employed. In this way, the husband and wife could make private exchanges, which were beyond the understanding of others...

Since the isseis used to have problems in communicating in Portuguese, they rely on their children to act as interpreters whenever the family need to make contact with the mainstream of society.

After the 2nd World War, it became clear that the elders would not return to their home countries as planned. The immigrant families sought opportunities to succeed in

---

69 Spoken Portuguese was a particularly complicated matter for those like the nisseis who had been largely educated in a foreign language which was completely different from Portuguese, and they used to speak Portuguese with a strong accent.

70 "No ambiente familiar, a língua constituiu uma fonte de estranheza entre as gerações ou, com outro sentido, de delimitação de fronteira. O primeiro caso vincula-se à influência da instrução: ao aprender a norma culta do português, a segunda geração perceberá como seus pais e parentes falam mal a língua. Muitas vezes, diante de colegas e amigos, sentiam vergonha da fala mais ou menos estropiada de seus ascendentes (...).
Para os pais, a língua de origem possibilitava a comunicação cifrada. Desse modo, ela servia de veículo para as conversas íntimas entre marido e mulher, longe do alcance de terceiros..." (Fausto, 1998, pp.54-55).

71 Particularly because of their ages and the condition of that country after 2nd World War.
Brazilian society, and, at the same time, to learn skills that could be useful when they eventually returned to their home-country.

Thus, many of them decided to abandon agriculture and move to urban areas where there were better educational prospects for their children and as a result, a large number of *nisseis* graduated in higher education\(^{72}\). However, the time spent on improving their skills in Portuguese meant that many *nisseis* became barely able to read or write in Japanese.

It should also be noted that even though many of the *nisseis* had obtained the necessary educational qualifications for better professional positions, many of them continued to work in their family businesses\(^{73}\). Thus, despite forging links with mainstream society, many *nisseis* do not fully participate in it, and still pursue the hard routine of agriculture. This is a means for them to continue with their family project for social mobility; it is a strategy whereby accumulating wealth and obtaining educational qualifications can be geared towards their successful reintegration into Japanese society in the future. Paraphrasing Galimbertti (2002, p.17), it can be said that *nisseis* live: “...from fantasy to fantasy, abandoning the idea of living in reality, and putting off the ‘complete fulfilment of a subjective life’ to another time and place.”\(^{74}\)

Added to the fact that the second generation is under pressure from their families to help support the group’s financial position and preserve the traditions of the ethnic community, it should be underlined that most of the members of this generation experienced life under two dictatorial governments – either the *Estado Novo* (New Regime) 1937-1945, or the *Regime Militar* (Military Regime) 1964-1985. Moreover, the economic crisis in Brazil that followed the country’s return to democracy in 1985 led many of them to work as *dekassegui* in Japan.

---

\(^{72}\) For discussions on the second-generation of immigrant families and higher-education in general, and particularly the case of the Chinese and Dominicans in the United States, see Louie 2006, and on the different job occupations of immigrant families and the education of their second-generation, particularly the case of Korean immigrants in the United States, see Kim, 2006.

\(^{73}\) Some of the commercial activities normally associated with Japanese immigrants do not have a high status in Brazil, activities such as selling fruit and vegetables, and running a dry-cleaner’s.

\(^{74}\) “...de imaginário em imaginário, deixava-se de viver a realidade, adiando para o próximo tempo e lugar a ‘plena realização da vida subjetiva’.” (Galimbertti, 2002, p.17)
The difficulties the second-generation experienced, (particularly in learning Japanese), often made the nisseis feel protective towards the third generation, and give a high priority to formal education by enrolling their children in nihongakko (Japanese schools). Since many nisseis had had their formal education in Japanese interrupted during the 2nd World War, they learned their culture and language from their family or other interested people rather than from professional native Japanese teachers. This explains their problems in Japan later on, particularly their use of old-fashioned vocabulary when communicating in Japanese. It also explains why the nisseis encouraged their children to be formally educated in Japanese.

Although they retained their hope eventually to undertake their family project in Japan, the nisseis prepared their children for a life in Brazil too, particularly those that lived in the more urbanised areas. As a result, there is a considerable number of third generation students that have completed university courses in areas different from those of their parents. There was a tendency among the second-generation undergraduates to take courses that would be useful for improving the family business (such as Business Studies, Mathematics and Economics) or that could have been of value for reintegrating the family into Japanese society after the 2nd World War (Technology or the Sciences). In contrast, the third-generation students tended to prefer courses in areas such as Arts (Architecture, Fine Arts) and Human Sciences (Languages, Education, History). Moreover, many sanseis are taking up professional positions in Brazilian society and see Japan not as a home-country but rather as a place that can provide them with a complementary professional education.

Thus the sansei, like many other members of the third generation of immigrant families who have had close ties with Brazilian society, have a different understanding of their immigrant roots, and are regarded by the ethnic group as being ‘distinct’, particularly since their Portuguese skills are improving, whereas their desire to speak and learn their home language is declining.

---

75 For information on the presence of Japanese descendants in the Brazilian higher-education system (both as students and teachers), see Ninomiya (2006, p.6).

76 The Japanese government offers annual scholarships for Brazilians in post-graduation courses and a considerable number of the third generation of Japanese immigrant families have been going there to complete their education.
As stated in the Introduction, the fine arts teacher-training college in which the research was carried out, is situated in the city of Curitiba, the capital of the State of Paraná.\footnote{This is a city that was founded in 1693 and currently has almost 1,600,000 inhabitants. Curitiba is the sixth largest city in Brazil, with flourishing urban, commercial and industrial activities, and is internationally renowned for its public transport system.}

It is widely recognised that the growth of Curitiba, as well as the State of Paraná, can be attributed to the efforts of many immigrant families, particularly from Europe, Asia and the Middle East, who moved there in large numbers between 1855 and 1950 (Figure 3). The current population of this city consists of the descendants of these immigrants and a number of internal migrants (especially from the State of São Paulo).

The nationalities mentioned above in the category of 'others' include Africans, French, Japanese, Lebanese, Portuguese, Spanish, Syrians, and Swiss. It should be added that a considerable number of immigrants from Asia, particularly from Korea and China, came to Paraná after World War II.

The public administration of Curitiba often uses the large presence of different ethnic groups in the city as its trademark, and the city is often described as 'one of the great melting-pots of Brazil'. Moreover, it attaches great importance to maintaining the cultural traditions of the foreign cultures found in the city by holding an annual folk festival (Festival Folclórico e de Etnias) in which folk dancers and musicians from a wide range of ethnic groups are invited to perform (Figure 4).

\footnote{The figure is based on numbers supplied by Martins, 1941, p. 61.}
The Polish Folk Group Wisła, like other regional dance groups, takes part in the Festival Folclórico e de Etnias (Folk Festival) held by the local administration of Curitiba.19

In addition, the local administration and media actively encourage the ethnic groups of Curitiba to celebrate religious events, and display their favourite kinds of foods as local symbols. Every week an ethnic fair is held by the local administration, in which the main products sold are the different foods and crafts produced by the immigrants’ descendants (Figure 5).

Pysanky is an old Ukrainian craft product which is mainly found in Paraná, particularly in Curitiba. It is a hand-made coloured egg, which is a symbol of the materialization of good intentions that people want to be fulfilled on significant social occasions such as at Easter, weddings and births. In Brazil, Pysanky is commonly regarded as typical of Curitiba.

The contribution of the immigrants to the culture of Curitiba is also apparent in the measures the community takes to preserve its traditional immigrant architecture, and in the way the local administration has set up memorials to honour certain ethnic groups.

---

79 Figures 2-8 were published in www.guiageografico.com and are reproduced here with the kind permission of Mr Jonildo Bacelar, the organizer of that site.
In Curitiba, it is still possible to find some examples of immigrant architecture from the end of the 19th and beginning of the 20th century\(^8\), which are still in their original settings and used for the purposes for which they were designed. They have been preserved by the ethnic communities or families that built them and are buildings which were designed to be houses, churches, schools, cultural and sports associations, shops or industrial buildings, and were subsequently transformed by the groups into memorials (Figure 6).

![An immigrant house preserved in its original setting in Curitiba](image)

**Figure 6 - An immigrant house preserved in its original setting in Curitiba**

*Italian and German immigrant families built many houses like this in the first decades of the 20th century in Curitiba. Some of these buildings still preserve their original appearance and functions, and most of them are maintained by the descendants of these families.*

Although these buildings now act as memorials for the members of the ethnic groups, many of them still retain the purpose they were originally designed for. However, when they are transferred by the local administration to public places such as parks, their original significance changes considerably. Examples of this are the old immigrant houses that were moved from their original settings to the parks of Curitiba, and that are now memorials or museums concerned with immigration (*Figures 7 and 8*).

\(^8\) The choice of materials used in the buildings depended on what they were planned for and the economic status of the person or group that ordered the project, and most of them have an eclectic style. Generally, the immigrant groups who belonged to the economically prosperous classes settled in towns. They were used to building with bricks, and used ceramics and metal imported from different parts of the world for the external design of their dwellings. On the other hand, the immigrants who settled in colonies or who were less wealthy used local wood in their architecture or a mixture of materials (facades built of brick and the interior of the building of wood). For more information on the immigrant architecture see: Imaguirê Júnior 1982 and 1993; and Sutil 1996 and 2001.
The most significant buildings that preserve the heritage of the Polish immigrations to Curitiba are situated in the Bosque João Paulo II (Pope John Paul II Park). These seven cottages from the second half of the 19th century, were built in old agricultural colonies near Curitiba, and were moved to the central park of this city so that they could be preserved and transformed into museums to commemorate Polish immigration. This park is also dedicated to the memory of Catholic immigrants, and was given its name in 1980 after Pope John Paul II visited Curitiba. Figures 7 and 8 show views of one of these cottages.

Some squares and parks in Curitiba were especially designed with the aim of commemorating a particular ethnic group that contributed to the development of the local region. In these places, there are new buildings that reproduce architecture in the style of the country of origin of this ethnic group, and were built as memorials or cultural centres (Figure 9).
The Japanese Memorial built in Japan Square in 1993, contains this pagoda that is the Culture House, a place designed to commemorate Japanese immigration to Curitiba. This memorial also symbolizes the fact that Curitiba is a 'twin-town' of the Japanese city of Himeji.

Doorways are other examples of monuments that have been erected by the local administration in public places in Curitiba in memory of immigrants. These monuments are located along the main routes that lead to what are now the suburbs of the city but which used to be immigrant communities, and it is still possible to observe signs of a distinctive presence of a particular ethnic group (Figure 10).

This doorway depicts elements of typical buildings of the Santa Felicidade district. This district was characterised by a huge presence of Italian immigrant families and culture - it is the main gastronomic centre of Curitiba.
In contrast with the local architecture, the other visual arts which have been created in Curitiba are not drawn on to commemorate and remember the immigrants. However, the history of painting and sculpture in Curitiba is proof of the significant cultural contribution made by the immigrants and their descendants.

Although Curitiba was founded in the 17th century, the growth of a local visual culture only began in the late 19th century, when the city expanded and became the capital of the State. In the period since then, three distinct movements can be identified: the *Eclectic period* (from the second half of the 19th century to the 1940s); the *Modernist period* (from the 1940s to the 1970s); and the *Contemporary period* (from the 1970s until now)\(^8\)!  

The first period corresponds to the time when German and Italian families moved away from the agricultural colonies to the urban centre of the city to work in the local housing market and the first industries. As a result, there were many Germans, particularly painters, among the first group of local artists. Most of the paintings and sculptures of this time are portraits, landscapes (*Figure 11*), and allegorical representations, which

---

81 The division of movements outlined here is a summary and adaptation of those described in Justino, 1986 and Araujo, 2006.

were influenced by European styles such as Neo-classicism, Romanticism, Symbolism and Impressionism. The artists of that time used to work both on a commission basis (particularly when they used to paint portraits of wealthy groups) and as independent ‘producers’ who sold their works (landscapes, interiors or labour scenes) commercially in their own studios.

The Modernist Period corresponds to a different phase of local art and culture. During this time, the first local college of arts was opened, an official art competition was held in Paraná, and new kinds of immigrant arrived in Curitiba, mostly from Italy and France. These new immigrants were from a world which differed from the social and cultural backgrounds of the immigrants that preceded them. Together with some local artists who had lived abroad, they introduced the local community to Modernism. Most of the visual texts created by the artists at that time showed the influence of Expressionism and Cubism, and drew on the people and life of Curitiba as their subjects (Figure 12).

Figure 12 - POTY (Napoleon Potyguara Lazzarotto) (1924-1998). O Largo da Ordem (The extent of Order). 1993, mural on glazed tiles. Curitiba, Travessa Nestor de Castro. Poty is considered to be one of the major artists of Curitiba. Adopting Modernist principles, he designed several murals that are displayed in different parts of the city. The local authorities strategically placed some of these murals, (like the one shown above, which represent the immigrants’ life in Curitiba), in densely populated districts of the city.

---

Unlike the Germans and Italians who soon abandoned agriculture for an urban life in Curitiba, certain ethnic groups, which were rooted in agricultural traditions, took time to change from a peasant life and contribute to the local art. It was only when the local people began to be influenced by different types of art (e.g. abstractionism) and techniques (e.g. engraving and ceramics) that attitudes to art began to change among certain ethnic groups, such as the Polish and Japanese. The art being created in Curitiba at present, is based on international concepts, although many of the local contemporary artists are only from third-generation immigrant families and some of them continue to base their work on concepts derived from their traditional background (Figure 13).

Figure 13 - GIBA (Gilberto Kosiba, 1970). Ausência (Absence). 2004, mixed technique on wood, 120,0x185,0 cm. Curitiba, the artist's collection.\(^{84}\)

3.2 The educational context

In Brazil, teachers who work at various levels of teaching\(^{85}\) are educated in different undergraduate and post-graduate courses. Elementary (from 5\(^{th}\) to 8\(^{th}\) grades)/Secondary teachers are formally educated in undergraduate courses. These courses usually last for

\(^{84}\) The artist kindly gave permission for this image to be reproduced in this thesis.

\(^{85}\) The educational system of Brazil is divided into two levels. The first level is called Basic Education and comprises: Elementary School (Childhood Education (for children up to 6 years old), Elementary Education (for children from 7 to 14 years old; from the 1\(^{st}\) to 8\(^{th}\) grades; it is divided into 4 cycles: 1\(^{st}\) cycle - 1\(^{st}\) and 2\(^{nd}\) grades, 2\(^{nd}\) cycle - 3\(^{rd}\) and 4\(^{th}\) grades, 3\(^{rd}\) cycle - 5\(^{th}\) and 6\(^{th}\) grades, and 4\(^{th}\) cycle - 7\(^{th}\) and 8\(^{th}\) grades)]) and Secondary School (for teenagers from 15 to 18 years old, where it comprises 3 or 4 years of instruction). The second level is called Higher Education. For information regarding the educational system of Brazil, see: portal.mec.gov.br.
four years - the teachers are prepared to teach and at the same time, they are educated in their particular subject areas (e.g. fine arts)\textsuperscript{86}.

Many institutions in Brazil that offer fine arts teacher-training courses, (like the one chosen for this study), set two admission tests for their candidates. The first is a test in fine arts, called Prévia, which assesses the previous knowledge candidates have in artistic and geometrical drawing, as well as art history. If they pass the Prévia, the candidates can take the second test. This is a test requiring a high-school level of knowledge and is usually set for candidates seeking a place in one of the universities. This second test, called Vestibular, assesses the candidates' knowledge of languages (Portuguese and a foreign language), history (Brazilian social and political history, and world history), sciences (physics, biology and chemistry) and mathematics.

The fine arts teacher-training course at Faculdade de Artes do Paraná (FAP)\textsuperscript{87}, the college chosen for this study, has to comply with the official requirements of the Brazilian government for Elementary/Secondary arts teachers training. In other words, in this four-year course, the undergraduates are prepared to become fine arts teachers and, at the same time, they are introduced to the different fine arts languages and techniques. In the fine arts teacher-training course of FAP, as in other fine arts teacher-training courses, pre-service teachers are trained to teach subjects such as painting, drawing, printmaking and three-dimensional construction.

The curriculum of this course basically consists of two interrelated areas of study:

a) \textit{college-based training} - a series of practical art-based workshops, and lectures on arts and education

b) \textit{school-based training} - teaching observation and teaching practice in Elementary and Secondary schools (often carried out in the two last years of the course) (Figure 14).

\textsuperscript{86} For information regarding the way teachers are currently trained in Brazil, see the documents of the Conselho Nacional de Educação (CNE) (National Council of Education) on Formação Superior para a Docência na Educação Básica (Advanced Training for Basic Education Teachers) especially the document CNE/CP 009/2001 at: portal.mec.gov.br.

\textsuperscript{87} FAP is one of the four institutions situated in Curitiba that offer art teacher-training courses. However, this independent college of Arts, which is administered by the Government of the State of Paraná, is the only institution in Paraná that offers a wide range of undergraduate and specialist courses in different areas of the arts, particularly in dance, drama, fine arts, movies and music. Owing to the high standard of the courses that FAP offers, it is considered a model institution in the training of Arts teachers in Paraná, despite being one of the smaller colleges there (at present, there are approximately 900 students at FAP and 100 teachers). For more information regarding FAP, see: www.fapr.br
## COLLEGE-BASED TRAINING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subjects</th>
<th>Total Number of Hours per Subject per Year</th>
<th>1st Year</th>
<th>2nd Year</th>
<th>3rd Year</th>
<th>4th Year</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aesthetics</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis and Exercise of Techniques and Expressive Materials</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anthropology</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Art History</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artistic Drawing</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazilian Folklore</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evolution of Visual Arts</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fundamentals of Art Education</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fundamentals of Human Expression and Communication</td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fundamentals of Visual Language</td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated Projects of Fine Arts</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction to Philosophy</td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods and Techniques of Research</td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Education</td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychology of Education</td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Techniques of Graphic Representation</td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Techniques of Visual Expression and Communication</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dance Workshop</td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fine Arts Workshop</td>
<td></td>
<td>90</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music Workshop</td>
<td></td>
<td>90</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theatre Workshop</td>
<td></td>
<td>90</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## SCHOOL-BASED TRAINING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subjects</th>
<th>Total Number of Hours per Subject per Year</th>
<th>1st Year</th>
<th>2nd Year</th>
<th>3rd Year</th>
<th>4th Year</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Didactics</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure and Organisation of Teaching in Elementary and Secondary Education</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Practice</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 14 - Curriculum of the fine arts teacher-training course of FAP (1990-2005)**

*FAP offers one morning and one evening session of its fine arts teacher-training course, and both follow the same curriculum.*

The objective of the college-based training area is to introduce undergraduates to particular features in the fields of arts and education and hold discussions with them. The workshops\(^{88}\) and theoretical disciplines on visual arts basically focus on the grammatical elements of the visual texts and on the different techniques employed by artists (local or otherwise).

---

\(^{88}\) The practitioner workshops are run by university teachers that are also local artists with experience in the art techniques they teach.
In this course, art history is a theoretical subject in the college-based training area of study, and is commonly taught in the second and third years of the course. Each module consists of 60 hours per year and two-hour classes that are held twice a week. The main study topic recommended by FAP for the first module of this discipline is ‘the diverse artistic expression of the human being throughout history: from prehistoric times to the Middle Ages’ and for the second ‘the diverse artistic expression of the human being throughout history: from the Renaissance to 20th century art’. These study topics, mainly focused on European art, hinder opportunities for students from culturally pluralistic societies mainly formed by immigrant descendants to relate art to the sense of their own identity.

The curriculum of the teacher-training art courses offered by colleges such as FAP, (and administered by the Government), is mainly designed to educate teachers that will later work in the formal public education system. The public system of teaching does not usually contract teachers from different areas of art and expects the students to be introduced to various aspects of visual, physical and musical arts during their years of schooling. In view of this, colleges like FAP concentrate on preparing teachers to work for this system, and often include courses in other areas of the arts to heighten awareness among pre-service teachers of the issues these fields cover.

As in the case of other countries, in Brazil there are considerable differences between public and private schools and also within the same educational system, particularly public schools, where they are evident in the guidelines for teaching the arts. While some public schools are fully equipped and have special classes and materials for art lessons, others give a low priority to the arts, (since art classes are only held once a week for 45 minutes). Hence, many art teachers in Brazil have to teach in more than one school to complete the number of working hours required in the terms of their teaching contract.

The guidelines for art education laid down by the Brazilian government (Brasil, 1998; Brasil, 1999) that form the basis of many of the arts curricula adopted in different schools, recommend a form of teaching based on the development of three abilities:

89 In the Brazilian public system, teachers are normally contracted to work 20 hours (10 hours of teaching and 10 hours of educational extra-class activities) or 40 hours (20 hours of teaching and 20 hours of educational extra-class activities) per week.
expression, reading in a visual language, and the critical judgement of visual texts. These guidelines also advocate a form of visual education that allows different social groups to express their own cultures. They recommend that students at basic levels of education should be encouraged to discuss the various visual texts which have been created by the different cultural groups that comprise Brazilian society (such as fine arts, folk art, and design). The guidelines also suggest the inclusion of art history subjects in art classes as a way of increasing the students’ repertoire in visual analysis. As a result, the schools are currently searching for art educators who are able to teach practical and theoretical subjects in the arts, and deal with the cultural pluralism of Brazilian society from a historical perspective.

3.3 Summary and conclusions

In conclusion, the college selected for the research is situated in a region of Brazil with strong agricultural traditions, and largely inhabited by the descendants of immigrants from different ethnic groups. Most of them are eager to maintain their cultural roots and the administrative authorities of this region have set up memorials to celebrate the ethnic differences between these groups. However, this has meant that many people from the present generation, (like some of the students who undertook the alternative programme), experience a cultural identity crisis, since they are prevented by their family and surrounding society from fully embracing the culture of the place where they live and were born. They are compelled to participate in events that belong to a culture which they have never experienced as a real setting and which is sometimes stereotyped by the local administration and media.

The visual arts practised in this region have been influenced by traditions of the late 19th century and modernist art styles which evolved in Europe, particularly by those that blend older and foreign elements. At the same time, art of this locality owes a lot to the cultural contribution of immigrants, in particular Germans and Italians.

The teacher training course which the alternative programme was designed for, is a four-year undergraduate course comprising two interrelated areas of study (college-
based training and school-based training). In this course, art history is a theoretical subject in the college-based training area of study, and is commonly taught in the second and third years of the course. Each module consists of 60 hours per year and two-hour classes that are held twice a week. The curriculum of the course, offered by a college that is administered by the Government, is mainly designed to prepare teachers that will later work in the formal public education system.

As can be observed, the main study topics recommended by the college for the modules of art history ('the diverse artistic expression of the human being throughout history: from prehistoric times to the Middle Ages' and 'the diverse artistic expression of the human being throughout history: from the Renaissance to 20th century art') were defined to introduce students to foreign art, (especially European), and followed a chronological sequence. When these study topics are compared within the current educational context of Brazil, it is evident that there is a mismatch between what has been required of art educators in schools (teaching art history subjects in art classes as a way of increasing the students' repertoire in visual analysis and as a way of enabling individuals to deal with the cultural pluralism of Brazilian society from a historical perspective) and the art history education they are given in the teacher-training college of art. As stated in the Introduction, this is one of the motives that led me to design the alternative art history teaching programme which will be discussed in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 4 -
THE ALTERNATIVE ART HISTORY TEACHING PROGRAMME

My experience as an art history teacher has shown me that the way art history in the colleges of Southern Brazil is taught (in what is a culturally pluralistic region) has tended to lead to a blurring of cultural differences. This is because in attempting to understand art history, prominence has been given to the art preferences of wealthy groups. Moreover, the fact that there is a sharp difference between our ways of teaching art history in colleges and the kind of knowledge schools require from the art teachers, does not help to prepare them to become educators of culturally reflective visual readers.

In 2001 I designed an art history teaching programme as an alternative to the programmes currently being offered in fine arts teacher training colleges in Brazil. This arose from my belief that different methods of teaching art history could heighten awareness among art teachers of the social and cultural differences within their own country. The programme was designed to take account of the cultural and educational features of this particular society and reflects my engagement with the literature, ideas and theories outlined earlier in this thesis.

This programme is concerned with the means people employ to establish their social and cultural identity and position themselves with regard to others. It also rests on the assumption that the art object should be the focal point of art history lectures, and that any theories about art styles and art history which are adopted should reflect the particular features and history of the art of the region where the course is taught. Moreover, the educational activities of this programme were planned to encourage students to play a more active and critical role in their learning process (unlike the passive stance commonly found in this subject-area). A number of visual sources were carefully chosen to be displayed in the classes so that the time for observation and discussion of visual texts could be used to maximum advantage.

This chapter sets out the educational goals, syllabus, and learning activities of this programme. There is also an account of the teaching procedures adopted and the kind of student assessment it involved during the years when it was administered. The chapter
concludes with an outline of the programme and an explanation of the principles underlying its general organization.

4.1 Educational goals

The main purpose of the alternative programme is to encourage pre-service art teachers to draw on their knowledge of art history to reflect on the question of social and cultural identity as represented in/by works of art created by various social groups (at different places and times).

4.2 Syllabus

The decision about what study topics should be included in the two-year alternative programme was based on a number of considerations. These included the cultural and educational contexts of the college in which the programme would be applied, the study topics recommended by the institution selected for the experiment, the professional requirements of the prospective careers of the students, and the subjects needed for a proper introduction to art history. On the basis of this, the following list of subject-areas was drawn up:

1. materials and techniques used in the visual arts
2. the main characteristics of bi and tri-dimensional visual texts, particularly as regards architecture, painting and sculpture
3. different viewpoints of professionals in diverse areas when working with artistic objects
4. the preservation, study, exhibition, appreciation and criticism of art
5. the question of what art history is, and what the links are between art history and history, artistic theory, and visual culture
6. the history of art history and its teaching
7. the literature on art history
8. the principal authors and texts on art history

91 See Chapter 3.
92 See Chapter 3, item 3.2, p.71.
93 See Chapter 3, item 3.2, p.71-72.
94 See Chapter 2, items 2.1, p.24, and 2.4, p. 40.
9. approaches to art employed by art theoreticians that focus on works of art (particularly stylistic theory, iconology and structuralism)

10. local art styles and chronology [Eclectic period (from the second half of the 19th century to the 1940s), Modernist period (from the 1940s to 1970s), and Contemporary period (from the 1970s till today)]

11. Brazilian art styles that influenced the development of local art [Colonial Art (from the 16th century to the 19th century), Academic Art (from the 19th century to the 1910s), Modernism (from the 1910s to 1950s), and Contemporary Art (from the 1950s till today)]

12. the foreign art styles that influenced the development of local art [art epochs: Pre-historic Times, Pre-Christian Societies (Ancient Egypt, Classical Greece and Rome), Mediaeval Period (Early Christian Art, Romanesque, Gothic), The Renaissance, the 17th century (Baroque), the 18th century (Rococo and Neo-classicism), the 19th century (Romanticism, Eclecticism, Realism, Impressionism, Symbolism, and Art Nouveau), Modernism (Expressionism, Fauvism, Cubism, Futurism, Abstract, Dada, and Surrealism), Contemporary Period (Op-Art, Pop-Art, Conceptual Art, art of the second half of 20th century and the beginning of the 21st century)]

13. representation of identities in works of art

14. research on art history.

Study topics 2, 9, 10, 13, and 14 were defined as core subjects of the programme with the aim of attaining the educational goals which had been laid down.

The chart presented as Figure 15 shows how topics were arranged for the study of the main subjects in the programme.

4.3 Learning activities

Three kinds of learning activities (assignments, reading, and critical appraisals) were chosen for the students to carry out. These activities have correlated themes, although they are aimed at improving the different skills of the students.
4.3.1 Assignments

On the basis of a belief that the students should be responsible for their own education in art history, it was decided that their main educational activity should consist of research. As a result, four research activities were designed with the aim of encouraging pre-service art teachers to:

a) experience research in art history and become familiar with some of the approaches to art adopted by art theorists

b) broaden their contacts with local art and historical sources

c) reflect on the kinds of mental processes found in works of art, the activities undertaken to preserve these kinds of objects, and key studies on art.

The first of these research activities sought to show pre-service teachers how to apply a stylistic theory to studying local architecture. In this activity, the students had to select two local buildings from different eras (for example, the beginning and end of Eclecticism; Eclecticism and Modernism) that originally had the same function (e.g. both buildings were made to serve as houses). This was an extra-class activity that the
students had to carry out in three months, preferably in groups of no more than three individuals. During the time allocated for this activity, they had three research group tutorials with the teacher, as well as one tutorial per month as a training session. If the students needed further tutorials, they were held at a time and place outside their lecture schedule. This research activity was followed by a written assignment.

The second research activity involved conducting a comparative study between a sculpture situated in a public place in the city, and two other works of art (preferably sculptures) on a similar theme, but from a different culture (and created in another space and epoch). The students had to adopt an iconological approach. They were advised to select a group of local figurative sculptures from the Eclectic and Modernist periods and these were similar in the number and complexity of the symbolic elements they embodied. The activity had to be carried out by pairs of students, and each pair had to select a different group of sculptures to analyse. As in the case of the first research activity, this should have resulted in a written assignment. However, the students only had four months to complete the task and three tutorials to discuss the research with the teacher. Moreover, they were required to give an informal oral presentation of their research to their colleagues in a lesson.

The third research activity involved carrying out a structuralist analysis of a figurative painting of the Modernist period. This required the students to select a work of art from a local museum collection, created by an artist from the region. When designing their analytical model, they were asked to employ the method created by Nessi (as outlined in Chapter Two). This is a didactic method that is particularly suited to students who are being trained as visual readers, since it enables them to be aware of the different levels of meaning that can be conveyed by visual texts, and then apply it when analysing works of art and other visual texts. This was an activity that had to be done by each student, individually. They were allowed five months to carry out the task, and had four tutorials with the teacher. Following this, the students had to submit a formal written account of their results and give a presentation to their colleagues in a lesson.

---

95 Brazilian students often have problems in working in groups. This is largely because they tend to organise their study groups on the basis of friendship rather than empathy in work. I decided to vary the sizes of the groups in each research activity to draw the pre-service teachers away from a 'student mentality' and replace it with a more professional frame of mind.

96 See Figure 2, p.39.
The last research activity was to carry out a critical analysis of a work of art from the Contemporary period. The students had to select a work of art that had recently been created in Paraná and compare it with two others of the same period, preferably one from Brazil and another from a foreign country. They were free to select any kind of work of art they wished to study (a piece of architecture, painting or sculpture). They could also choose the artistic feature they wanted to consider in their comparison (e.g. the theme, technique or style) as well as the approach they would like to adopt (this might be based on stylistic theory, iconology or structuralism). This research activity also had to be followed by a written assignment. The students had four months to carry it out and five tutorial sessions to discuss the research with their teacher; they were then required to make an oral presentation of their research to their colleagues in a meeting, in any way they wanted.

4.3.2 Reading activities

It was important to make the pre-service teachers more familiar with the literature on art history and related areas, and introduce them to the vocabulary used in the field. For this reason, certain texts were selected on these subjects for the students to read before the meetings, when they were discussed by the group (see Appendix 2). My experience has shown me that present-day Brazilian undergraduates do not respond very well when working with technical texts, particularly those published in foreign languages\(^97\). Instead of choosing an art history textbook, the pre-service teachers were encouraged to select and think about which authors’ ideology and text they felt most empathy with. With regard to text books and academic readers, the only translated book available at the time the programme was being designed, was ‘Histoire de l’art’ by Xavier Barral I Altet, (a book written in the late 1980s and translated to Portuguese in the 1990s)\(^98\), based on the study of art history in France. A book such as this would not have been appropriate as a key text for these particular students and would not give rise to useful insights in the realm of art and art history in Brazil.

\(^{97}\) In view of this, it was decided to select texts that are basic introductions to the subjects under study, and published in Brazilian Portuguese. However, a small number of texts in Portuguese from Portugal and Spanish from Spain and Argentina were selected, because of a lack of better publications available in Brazilian Portuguese.

\(^{98}\) In 2008 the book ‘Art History: A Very Short Introduction’ by Dana Arnold was published translated into Portuguese.
In addition, some literature was selected that could be helpful to students in carrying out their research activities (see Appendix 3). The students were also advised to look at documentaries on the following artists in the series *Palettes* by Alain Jaubert that can be found in Portuguese: Leonardo da Vinci, Raphael, Paul Veronese, Goya, Ingres, Delacroix, Georges de La Tour, Picasso, and Kandinsky. These documentaries were recommended as examples of how a structuralist method of analysis could be applied to works of art on lines similar to those laid down by Nessi. A number of different publications were recommended to make the students more familiar with the different ways of conducting a piece of research. As some of these publications were not available in libraries, it was a way of encouraging the students to visit different places which had been designed for the study of the history and art of Curitiba, such as the library of the ‘Museu de Arte Contemporânea do Paraná’ (Contemporary Art Museum).

4.3.3 Critical appraisals

The students were encouraged to make critical appraisals of exhibitions and movies as a supplementary activity, with the aim of enabling them to:

a) increase their contacts with the institutions of the locality which had been designated for exhibiting, studying and preserving art

b) obtain a better understanding of the artists’ creative processes

c) develop their skills in writing about art.

These activities were undertaken in texts of no more than 20 lines, and involved each student writing an individual passage about every film and place suggested.

The exhibitions were chosen because it was felt they would lead to discussions during the lectures, and, since they were held in important local institutions, would encourage the appreciation of art (see Appendix 4). Another factor in the choice of exhibitions was that entrance should be free of charge and that the opening time should coincide with the students’ free time. These are important factors since a large number of students from the college are not well-off, and many have to work around eight hours per day. Moreover, the fact that they would take place in historical buildings situated in old parts of the city, could help students make a correlation between arts of the same historical
period (e.g. the painting/architecture, sculpture/architecture of the Eclectic period), and thus strengthen their ties with their local heritage.

Two movies were recommended as a supplementary activity for the students: The Agony and the Ecstasy (1965) and Camille Claudel (1988). These were selected because they explore the creative process of two famous sculptors [Michelangelo (1475-1564) and Rodin (1840-1917)], as well as the fact that the personal, cultural and social contexts portrayed, help to define some aspects of their works. A more mundane reason why these movies were chosen was that the students could easily find them at the video rental shops near the college.

4.4 Teaching procedures

The alternative programme encompasses four teaching procedures which differ from the way art history has traditionally been taught in Brazil. The programme adhered to the principle that a chronological study can increase the students’ understanding of the visual influences between cultures which are distant in place and time. However, the sequence of events and choice of subjects for the programme closely followed the history of the local art of the region. The art created in other places was also, by and large, presented and studied in a progressive chronological sequence, but in the context of the programme, was subservient to the need to obtain a better understanding of local art (see Figure 16, p.84).

Several visual aids were employed during the lectures. This was a deliberate policy (draw on McCarthy’s advices) to avoid the common notion that art history classes have to be taught in the dark and through the use of projected images. However, slides and transparencies were used, as well as large-sized printed images to make comparisons between art styles or themes. The reason for this is that, unlike slide projections, large-sized printed images allow students to explore the different meanings found in works of art in their own time. An attempt was also made to encourage pre-service teachers to realise that the media can generate different interpretations of the messages present in works of art, since different visual sources convey distinct information about the actual scale of the works of art and of the contexts in which they are exhibited. In addition, it was decided to reduce the number of works of art studied in each lecture, and ensure
that the majority of the works of art under study had been created in the region as a means of stimulating the response of the students and engaging their interest in the art history lectures.

The programme was designed to effect a transition from the real to the conceptual world in recognition of the fact that students understand abstract elements better when one adopts an empirical approach to the subject under study. The classes and activities were planned to move away from:

a) the real world experience of the students to more abstract concepts  
b) the study of local art to that created by societies which are distant in space and time  
c) the observation and understanding of the basic concepts of architecture to painting (the most abstract of the visual arts)  
d) firsthand contact with works of art to visual reproductions of masterpieces.

In designing the alternative programme, it was recognised that pre-service teachers are embryo researchers. In view of this, it was decided that the lectures should gradually cease being teacher-centred and become more student-centred meetings; in other words, instead of being meetings in which the teacher would present art history subjects, they would be encounters in which the students would share activities and discuss the texts they had read, and the research activities they had carried out on local art, as well as the films and exhibitions they had seen.

4.5 Assessment

The college required that the students should be assessed at least seven times during the two years of the programme. In order to fulfil these institutional requirements, it was decided that the students would be assessed in the following areas: their participation in the reading activities and group discussions, their responsiveness in tutorials, their performance in undertaking the research activities and their ability to make critical appraisals. Since the aim of the programme was to strengthen the students’ familiarity with art history, the individual progress of each student was thought to be more important than the results which the whole group achieved. Moreover, the assessment periods were regarded as periods of dialogue between the teacher and the students, and
an opportunity for the individual learning process of the students and their expectations from the programme to be discussed.

4.6 Outline of the programme

The diagram on the following page provides a general outline of the alternative programme.

4.7 Summary and conclusions

This chapter has sought to provide a description of the alternative programme which I designed as a part of an experience of art history teaching in a Southern Brazilian art teacher training college. It involved a process of cultural empowerment, which was closely aligned to the current requirements of art education of that region. This programme was discussed by examining its educational goals, syllabus, learning activities, and the teaching and student assessment procedures that were adopted during the time it was administered.

The alternative programme was designed to prepare art teachers to enter into a dialogue with different cultures whilst reflecting on their attitudes to works of art of different times and places, beginning with the observation of the artworks most closely linked to them in time and space. Moreover, research was carried out into the meanings embedded in the visual texts (at both an iconographic and formal level) to help the students in their education as visual readers and to improve their skills in using and gaining access to visual texts.

Throughout this presentation of the alternative programme it has been made clear that this programme was designed for a specific setting, in which the research activities should be carried out by the teacher to reproduce, as far as possible, the actual conditions in which the programme was undertaken, although it should have a broader interest to those more generally concerned about art history in teacher training colleges.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Study topics</th>
<th>Teaching procedures</th>
<th>Learning activities</th>
<th>Assessments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>June</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>July</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>September</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>October</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>November</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>March</td>
<td>Modernist period Painting Structuralism</td>
<td>- tutorials&lt;br&gt;- reading discussions&lt;br&gt;- group discussions on appraisals</td>
<td>- Assignment 3 (painting)&lt;br&gt;- Required reading: De Fusco, 1988; Nessi, 1968; Nuncs, 1999; Stangos, 1993&lt;br&gt;- Complementary reading: Dondis, 1991&lt;br&gt;- Critical appraisals: exhibition at Museu Alfredo Andersen, Solar do Barão, Galeria da Caixa Econômica Federal</td>
<td>- Assignment 3&lt;br&gt;- participation in the group discussion on the readings&lt;br&gt;- presence in the tutorials&lt;br&gt;- presentation of critical appraisals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>April</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>May</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>June</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>July</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>August</td>
<td>Modernist period Contemporary art Painting</td>
<td>- tutorials&lt;br&gt;- reading discussions&lt;br&gt;- group discussions on the research carried out</td>
<td>- Assignment 4 (painting)&lt;br&gt;- Required reading: De Fusco, 1988; Stangos, 1993&lt;br&gt;- Critical appraisals: exhibitions at Casa Andrade Muricy, Museu de Arte Contemporânea do Paraná, and Museu Metropolitano de Arte</td>
<td>- Assignment 4&lt;br&gt;- participation in the group discussion on the readings&lt;br&gt;- presence in the tutorials&lt;br&gt;- presentation of critical appraisals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>September</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>October</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>November</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 16 - Outline of the alternative teaching programme
In this chapter, an attempt is made to explain how the research with the alternative programme was carried out in a real setting. It seeks to address the following points:

a) the practitioner research approach adopted when embarking on this study
b) the questionnaires, interview schedules, observation procedures and assignments used for collecting data during the research
c) the way the research was conducted, together with the schedule followed for organising the programme and collecting the data
d) the procedures adopted for organising and analysing the data collected.

Although the data could help understand some of the procedures adopted and problems faced during the research, it was decided to leave this to the next chapter when a full account of the findings will be provided. This decision was taken to draw a clear distinction between the description of the methodology and the results obtained.

5.1 The research approach adopted

From the beginning of this research, my concern has been to carry out a small-scale study based on the alternative art history teaching programme designed for the students of the teacher training college where I work in Curitiba. My aim was to conduct the research in similar conditions to those in which the research problem had first been identified. I wished to test the programme in a structured setting that I am familiar with, while at the same time, respect the learning processes of the students and, make every effort not to allow the research procedures to interfere too much with the natural dynamics of the classes. Thus, in carrying out the study, I wanted to play the role both of teacher and researcher.

While sharing with my colleagues my desire to undertake this research project, I was, at first, discouraged by some of their comments. These teachers, who had been at my college for many years, thought the research project would interfere with the students’

---

99 Since 1999 I have worked as an art history teacher in the art teacher training courses of FAP.
education. They also expressed doubts about the validity of the data I could collect during the study. It was evident from their comments that they did not regard teaching practices (particularly in higher education) as an important field of study, and were sceptical about the value of practitioner research unless it reflected the experience and opinions of a large number of participants.

My discussions with my colleagues reflected a conflict between post-modern attitudes to research and the positivist and/or technical-rational understandings that Scott and Usher (1999) discuss.

My own concern was to make research a participatory and democratic process that embraced all those involved. Moreover, although the research was designed with a predetermined structure, I wanted the programme to be adaptable to the changing needs of the students. It was essential to introduce changes in the programme whenever necessary and, for this reason, I insisted that the participant group should hold regular discussions to assess their activities. It was essential to encourage the students to play an active role during the administration of the programme, take responsibility for their own educational progress and be critical of what they were experiencing. I wanted to transform the art history lectures from being teacher-centred encounters, to meetings that would lead to student empowerment. Finally, a qualitative approach was adopted to enable me to listen to each student, and heed his/her particular interest or difficulty in studying art history.

All these factors made me realise that I was conducting an *emancipatory action research* project. This is defined by Scott and Usher (1999, p.38) on the basis of the arguments of Carr and Kemmis, as follows:

...action research carried out by practitioners into their own practices is a participatory and democratic form of educational research for educational improvement - a form of practical enquiry but with emancipatory potential. It involves three inter-related and interactive aspects - the improvement of practice, the improvement of the practitioner’s understanding of the practice, and the improvement of the situation in which practice takes place or, to summarise more succinctly, actions, understandings and settings. The process of collaborative work is a spiral of planning, acting, observing and reflecting centred on the interplay of action and critique.
However, on reviewing the varied literature on action research\textsuperscript{100}, it was clear that my study was less emancipatory in character than other action research projects. In the first place, it had not arisen from an interest which was shared by all the people involved in it. Moreover, as the researcher-teacher, I was the person responsible for most of the activities that would be undertaken by the group. Finally, the thesis would only introduce some of the changes that I wished my students to make and to introduce in my future teaching practices.

5.2 The tools used for data collection

I selected a number of research tools (questionnaires, individual interviews, group interviews, field notes and student assignments) with the aim of evaluating the alternative programme. These were designed to collect data on the following: the students’ educational and cultural backgrounds, their reactions to the innovative aspects of the programme, changes in learning art history, and their thoughts about the issue of their cultural identity. In the sections that follow, I examine each of these tools, and explain their peculiar features and the kind of data I expected to collect in using them\textsuperscript{101}.

5.2.1 The questionnaire

The first research tool I decided to use with the students was the questionnaire because this is a good way of collecting detailed data quickly, while, at the same time, allowing one to cover sensitive issues like personal information (e.g. age, educational and family background) before a close relationship with the students has been formed. My reason

\textsuperscript{100} In recent years, many studies have been carried out on the basis of (or by applying) action research principles (e.g. McNiff and Whitehead, c2005; Mertler, c2006; Anderson, Herr and Nihlen, c2007; Hui and Grossman, 2008; McIntyre, c2008; Norton, 2008; Baumfield, Hall and Wall, 2008). One of the most interesting on-line sites is Action Research Resources (www.scu.edu.au/schools/gcm/ar/arhome.html), in which relevant articles, discussions, and studies on this approach are available to practitioner researchers wishing to adopt this approach. The journals Educational Action Research, published by Taylor & Francis, and Action Research, of Sage Publications, are also good sources that include recent discussions on matters related to these projects. The article by Bob Dick published in the issue 4 of 2006 of Action Research provides a good account of the recent literature on this research approach. For a better understanding on the difference between the types of action research studies (particularly on participatory and emancipatory action research projects) see: Scott and Usher, 2000, pp.35-40, Wadsworth, 1998, and Kemmis, 2006.

\textsuperscript{101} Although these tools were administered in Portuguese, only the English version is reproduced in this thesis because of their length.
for seeking this kind of factual information is based on the following definition of Denscombe: ‘Factual information does not require much in the way of judgement or personal attitudes on the part of the respondents. It just requires respondents to reveal (accurately and honestly) information: their address, age, sex, marital status, number of children etc.’ (1999, p.89).

The questionnaire that I designed (see Appendix 5) was based on my wish to obtain a clear picture of the students’ cultural and educational backgrounds, educational needs, and previous knowledge of art history, before I ran the alternative programme. Since the questionnaire was only an exploratory tool, I decided to include closed questions with the answers arranged in the form of a list (e.g. Question 5), ranking (e.g. Question 6), or a category (e.g. Question 11) (Bell, 1995, pp.76-77).

My decision only to set closed questions in this questionnaire was to ensure that the answers I obtained would follow a similar pattern. This would make the process of collecting the results easier and enable me to focus on the most relevant data. Although closed questions are usually associated with quantitative data, my concern was to confine the answers to what had been established in advance. This also explains why, following the advice of Brown and Dowling (1998, pp.66-67) I kept the questions as short and free from ambiguity as possible.

The 12 questions of this research method can be classified in the following four groups:
- students’ schooling (questions 1 and 4)
- students’ professional activities (questions 2, 3 and 5)
- students’ understanding of art history (question 6)
- students’ personal life (questions 7, 8, 9, 10, 11 and 12).

I began with questions on the students’ educational background and professional activities, and ended up with some personal questions. This arrangement was to encourage them to complete the whole questionnaire. I also stipulated that the students should not take more than 15 minutes to answer all the questions and told them that it would be printed on a white sheet of paper. The questionnaire was scheduled to be completed during my first face-to-face meeting with the students in 2002.

---

5.2.2 Individual interviews

I decided to carry out two sessions of individual interviews with each student who agreed to participate in the study so that I could gather personal information about the participants, establish a relationship with them, and find out their opinions about the programme.

These individual research meetings were conducted as semi-structured interviews in which, as Robson (1997, pp.234-235) recommends, the personal questions were left to the end. This is because, as Brown and Dowling (1998, pp.75-76) explain: ‘At this point there will be greater rapport between interviewer and interviewee. Furthermore, if the interviewee is reluctant to address a particular question, all is not lost as the main part of the interview will have been completed’.

Although there were a lot of issues which needed to be addressed, I was flexible about the order in which the topics were answered and let the students develop their ideas and speak freely on the issues I raised. This meant it was necessary to spend between 15 and 45 minutes with each student per interview.

My role as both administrator and researcher compelled me to carry out the series of individual interviews on dates and at places that did not clash with the alternative programme. The reason for this was to encourage the students to distinguish between the ‘researcher’ and the ‘teacher’.

The first group of one-to-one interviews (see Appendix 6) was conducted to obtain some personal information about the students (Questions 1 and 2), explore the relationship between the students and the visual arts of the region (Question 3), and establish a better rapport between the students and myself as a researcher.

During the interview, each student was shown the same photographs of two local artworks (see Appendix 7) and asked to speak freely about what they felt when looking at these images. The purpose of this was to explore the way the students relate to their local culture. The images I chose for this activity are two well-known works of art in Curitiba, which are situated in important places in the city centre - one is the cathedral.
and the other is a sculptured image that forms part of a monument that commemorates an important political event.

In my first individual meeting with the interviewees, I decided to take notes rather than audio record the information I was gathering to put them at ease and thus lay the ground for forming a close relationship with them in my capacity as a researcher.\(^\text{103}\)

The aim of the second series of individual interviews was to collect data on the students’ cultural identity, and the experience they had had with the alternative programme (see Appendix 8). During these interviews, the students were asked questions about the following:

a) their relationship with their local culture (questions 1 and 2)
b) parental influences on their way of observing art (question 4)
c) their experience with the programme in the first year of its administration (question 5)
d) any possible changes they had observed in their relationship with their own culture in the light of their experience of the programme (questions 3 and 6)
e) the extent to which art history theories studied up to that time had given them a better understanding of art and culture (question 7).

I sought their permission to tape-record this second group of one-to-one interviews as their verbatim accounts would provide valuable data in my detailed analysis of the programme. I felt able to do this because my relationship with the students (both as teacher and researcher) had greatly improved by that time.

5.2.3 Group interviews

I conducted a group interview with each group of students during my last meeting with them in 2003 to find out about their final opinions of the alternative programme. This involved observing the role played by each student in the groups and thus sharpen my understanding of the statements they had made in the individual interviews.

\(^{103}\) On the advantages and disadvantages of using audio/video-tape recorders in interviews see: Denscombe, 1999, pp.120-124.
These group meetings were also semi-structured interviews (see Appendix 9), but were carried out in the same places and at the same times as the programme itself. The purpose of holding these interviews in groups and in similar conditions to the scheduled programme, was to make the students feel more relaxed and be able to express their opinions in a more natural way. I obtained the students’ authorisation to record these final interviews.

5.2.4 Field notes

Although I had an official college register to keep a daily record of the administration of the programme, I decided to use a field notebook as well. The purpose of this was to document any chance rearrangements in my teaching procedures, note significant changes that I observed in the students’ behaviour during the activities, record the general reactions of the students to the educative procedures (as soon as the lectures ended), and record any changes in the students’ understanding of art history while I was observing their assignments.

5.2.5 Assignments

I decided to examine the four assignments\(^{104}\) that the students had to carry out as part of the assessment of art history required by the college\(^{105}\). This is because I believed that these assignments would reveal any changes the students experienced in their attitude to local culture, as well as showing the scores they achieved when learning art history.

5.3 Undertaking practitioner research

The programme was run at times that fitted in with the college timetable and at times when the group of students had times set aside for their education in art history. This

\(^{104}\) For information about these assignments see Chapter 4, pp. 77-79.

\(^{105}\) On the students assessment during the years of the programme see Chapter 4, pp.82-83.
meant I was able to run the alternative programme and collect data within the annual school schedule as set out below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Tools to apply for data collection</th>
<th>Subjects that will be studied</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>May</td>
<td>Questionnaire, First individual interview, Field notes</td>
<td>Architecture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>June</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>July</td>
<td>Assignment 1, Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>August</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td>Sculpture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>September</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>October</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>November</td>
<td>Second individual interview, Assignment 2, Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>March</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td>Painting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>April</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>May</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>June</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>July</td>
<td>Assignment 3, Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>August</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>September</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>October</td>
<td>Field notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>November</td>
<td>Assignment 4, Field notes, Group interview</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 17 – Schedule for the administration of the programme and data collection

With the approval of the directors of the college and my colleagues in the fine arts teacher training course, the alternative art history programme was run in the same way for the morning and evening groups of pre-service art teachers who were enrolled in the art history modules 1/2002 and 2/2003 (following what had been planned, from May to November 2002 and from April to November 2003).

During my first meeting with the groups of students in 2002, I explained the nature of the study that I intended to carry out, and pointed out to them the possible educational benefits (or drawbacks) that might arise from this experience. I made it clear that, with their agreement, they would all take part in the alternative programme, and that they would be free to choose whether to join or leave the research group whenever they wanted. In addition, I made myself available for any kind of help the students might need in art history matters. As a result, all the art history students were in favour of running the alternative programme and most decided to join the research group at once,

106 I was in London completing my research training programme when the academic year of 2002 began, and because of this the college ruled that the students should have two months of art history study with another teacher till I returned. This experience with another teacher did not have an adverse effect on their studies because during that time the students were only given a general introduction to the art of ancient civilizations.
although some only agreed to join after the first one-to-one interviews. This was when they observed that the ‘teacher’ and ‘researcher’ were different roles played by the same person; a few students opted to take part in the educational activities but not in the research itself.

In 2003, I gave the same presentation to the new students who had joined the group that term, all of whom agreed to participate both in the educational activities and the research, probably as the result of the encouragement of those already in the programme. Some students, who had been in the groups in 2002, left the research group in 2003, in most cases because they had dropped out of college\textsuperscript{107}.

Although at the outset of the research, I decided it was unlikely that I would take account of the data collected from students who had not participated in the programme for at least two years, I decided to collect data on all the students involved in the programme. This is because I wished to avoid putting students into different categories during their education in art history, and wanted to be open to the views of anyone who could give me some feedback on the programme.

At my first meeting with the students in 2002, after obtaining their approval for the implementation of the programme and their agreement to participate in the research, I set the questionnaire, which, as expected, did not last more than 15 minutes. However, the students misunderstood some of the topics and these had to be explained during the first individual interview (see Appendix 6). The problems encountered in the application of the questionnaire could be attributed to a mistake in sampling at the pilot stage. A sample of five people of different ages was selected to test the questionnaire in a pilot study. As they were unfamiliar with the conditions and level of knowledge of the students, no particular problem was detected during the test. However, when I analysed the answers to the questionnaires, there were clear signs of misunderstanding on the part of the students. This was evident from the way they had been answered (for example some of them were smudged or incomplete).

\textsuperscript{107} In FAP, the students have to register in their undergraduate courses annually. If they are not successful in more than three subjects, they are unable to move on to the next year and might have to spend a whole year just repeating these subjects. Two students that left the research group in 2003 were in this situation. Unfortunately among the students that dropped out of the college in that year, there was one that died of natural causes. Among the students that joined the study group in 2003, there were two that were new in the college, since they had been transferred from other institutions.
Two weeks after embarking on the programme, I began the first series of individual interviews. Before this, I held meetings with each of the students in their school breaks over a period of three months. However, I am confident that this did not affect the quality of the data collected.

Each student was told about the purpose of the interview and the restrictions governing the use of his/her answers, together with an assurance of their anonymity. This made them feel confident enough to speak freely about private subjects like their family backgrounds, religious beliefs and learning processes.

These first interviews were not recorded so that the students would feel more at ease, and the effect of this was to improve their relationship with me as a researcher. However, some students expressed concern that I might make future use of the information that I was collecting because of my role as their teacher. However, I was able to reassure them by allowing them to read my notes, which were short and basically focused on the students’ answers. Not a great deal of data was gathered through this means, since most of the information only supplemented the data I had collected from the questionnaire. However, these meetings succeeded in improving my relationship with the students and in making them realise that I was playing separate roles as a ‘teacher’ and ‘researcher’.

My aim was to collect the students’ personal opinions, particularly on the selected photos. I asked them not to comment on the interviews and images with their colleagues after the interviews to avoid any risk of outside influence and most of them complied with this requirement, which meant there was no interference with the reliability of the data collection.

Throughout the two years when the programme was administered, I took notes on my teaching procedures, and the students’ behaviour and learning when studying art history. The lecture notes were the shortest, and, in my view, the most accurate. This is probably because the students were made aware of my note-taking, and it allowed me not to stay far from the action of the group for too long. Moreover, the fact that this activity was conducted in class, made the students curious about what was being recorded. Since these notes were a professional concern of the ‘researcher’ and not of the ‘teacher’, I showed them to any student that was interested and asked them to read
the comments again in another environment\textsuperscript{108}. This decision was of crucial importance to preserve the trust the students had in me as a researcher.

In 2002, I asked the students to carry out their first research activity (Assignment 1). I was aware that the subjects (architecture/ style theory) might be complex and, to some extent, new for the students\textsuperscript{109}. For this reason, I offered them a little more assistance than I had originally planned and invited some researchers to present their studies to the groups\textsuperscript{110}. This was to make the students realise that local architecture is a field of study, and that research should be integrated with the personal knowledge and interests of the researcher.

However, the students became very involved with the discussions on architecture and when Assignment 1 had been completed, I decided to redesign my plan for the programme and devote the academic year of 2002 to this subject area alone. As a result, it was only at the beginning of 2003 that I embarked on the second series of one-to-one interviews\textsuperscript{111}.

Contrary to what I had expected (although I had set aside enough time for it), the second series of individual interviews lasted for three months. All the interviewees allowed me to record the conversations, and, surprisingly, they felt very much at ease with me in my researcher role, with the result that some of the interviews lasted almost one hour, and occasionally became more personal than was desirable.

During the period of the second series of individual interviews, most of the students were undergoing observation and teaching practice for the first time. The questions in the second interviews were closely linked to their research activities (assignments), the subjects they studied and the schools that they were visiting in a teaching capacity. When they were asked about their relationship with their local culture, some students showed a willingness to explore their emotions and thoughts in this area. It was my

\textsuperscript{108} Each student was only allowed to read the comments I had written on his/her behaviour and learning process.

\textsuperscript{109} Architecture is not a subject which is studied very much in many fine arts courses in Brazil at present and much more attention is devoted to discussions on painting and engraving.

\textsuperscript{110} These researchers were the most respected and specialized professionals in the historical study of local architecture, and included an architect who was carrying out research into an important building in the city and had been my pupil in a specialist course at the college.

\textsuperscript{111} In fact, the college had to make a slight change in its annual schedule due to some renovations being carried out in the building, which meant that I could only continue with the programme in April 2003.
policy not to interrupt them, but soon I realised that this caused practical problems when recording the data and that I had to take extra care when weighing up what was really of importance for an evaluation of the programme.

The students became really involved in carrying out the research activities, and the assignments were a valuable source of data on the way they learnt art history, their changing attitudes to their local culture and their own cultural traditions.

The programme activities were completed in November 2003. I conducted the group interviews during the final meeting with the students. The students and I had previously agreed that these would still count as official meetings and that the conversations would be tape-recorded. However, both groups organised the meetings in the form of farewell parties and brought along food and invited some relatives. Perhaps on account of this, sitting around a big table, eating and drinking, in the place where we had worked for two years, the participants felt released from their role as students and became more sincere than ever in expressing their opinions about the programme. However, the extremely relaxed nature of these meetings had a slightly adverse effect on the validity of the data collected on the students’ behaviour. Some students who had proved to be lively in theoretical discussions or willing to discuss in depth their and/or others identity positions were quiet or reserved in the group interviews.

In view of unforeseen circumstances, the schedule for both the test for the alternative programme and for the data collection was switched to the times presented in Figure 18.

5.4 Procedures adopted for the organisation and analysis of the data

Altogether, the alternative programme consisted of 102 hours of activities (which took place two hours per week over a period of 51 weeks, according to the annual FAP schedule). The amount of data collected during the two years of research can be calculated on the basis of the number of audio CDs recorded\(^\text{112}\) (7 CDs each lasting 80

\(^{112}\) All the interviews were originally tape-recorded. I used a micro cassette-recorder so as not to disturb the students too much with the presence of a tape-recorder during the interviews. Later I discovered that my choice of equipment had been a real mistake. The problem did not arise during the interviews, since at times the students appeared to forget that their comments were being recorded, but only afterwards when
minutes) and of the paper gathered (almost 300 pages, printed in one size, comprising the official papers of the college, notes, and answered questionnaires). As a result of this, during the period the programme was run, I managed to collect a wide range of data. This meant that I had to adopt some special procedures to organise, select and analyse the data collected so that the test of the programme could be properly evaluated.

The first decision I made was to conduct the analysis of the data in Portuguese. This was in the interests of speed because of the sheer volume of research data that had to be processed. Moreover, I was concerned that successive translations (e.g. translation into ideas, cultures, or languages) could distort the original meaning of the data, I decided only to translate the data into English after it had been analysed.

I tried to produce digital copies of them. The quality of recording from this kind of cassette is unsatisfactory and some extra procedures have to be used to enhance the quality of the copies. Since this was a specialized process I had to rely on the skills of the sound technicians of the college to produce the copies. It should be pointed out that these technicians are used to working with private recordings and they were extremely cautious about the activity, with respect to the privacy of the content of the tapes. These professionals strongly advised me to avoid the use of this type of recorder to record more than one voice, and official meetings. They explained to me that this kind of equipment resembles 'voice notebooks', and that because of this, the quality of recording is considerably inferior to the normal-sized model. Despite my mistake, in the end, with the help of these professionals, it was possible to produce reasonable digital copies of the interviews (which I used for the transcriptions) and leave the originals intact.
The alternative programme was carried out with a total of 34 students (16 in the morning group, and 18 in the evening) over a period of two years. Among these undergraduates, 31 students (15 students in the morning group, and 16 in the evening group) agreed to take part in the research. However, only 13 of the students who were involved in all the research methods employed, participated in the study for two years. When assessing the test, my concern was with the quality of the programme rather than the number of people that took part in it. In view of this, only the data derived from the 13 students that took part in all the methods employed for data collection and participated in the study for the full two years, was regarded as a primary source of material for evaluation. The data from the other students was kept in reserve so that it could be used for comparative purposes when some topic from the main sample was unclear and had to be checked or weighed up. Furthermore, I decided to ignore the special features of the groups since I wanted to consider them as two parts of a single large group that belonged to the programme being administered.

Individual files were kept for each of the students who participated in the research so that I could have a deeper understanding of the students’ learning processes and note any changes that occurred during the study. These files basically comprised the following: a form where the main data gathered from the research methods was compiled (see Appendix 10); the originals of the questionnaire forms completed by the students at the first meeting, the notes I had written down during the first individual interview, the transcription of the records of the second individual interview\(^{113}\), and the notes I took on the students during the activities.

There was also a need for a special student file as I realised that some data either referred to the whole group or to me as a teacher. This file was made up of the transcriptions of the group interviews, copies of the official papers required by the institution, and the notes I had taken on my teaching procedures and group behaviour over the period of two years.

The next step I took was to arrange the data in a Table. The data from the questionnaires was transferred to this Table with the addition of the results of the first individual

\(^{113}\) The transcription of the tapes was quite a hard job and something that I did by myself. I took a little time after the interviews to transcribe all of them but took the precaution of making sure that just after the interview, I wrote down some extra comments on some of the subjects discussed in the meetings.
interview. This enabled me to compare the special features of the students, have a broader understanding of their cultural and educational background, and design the sample of the thesis with clarity.

The data I collected from the second series of interviews, the group interviews, and the notes, were the most extensive, complex and important in the evaluation of the study since they revealed the changes the students had undergone throughout the course and their opinions of the alternative programme. This data was arranged and analysed in the light of the innovatory aspects of the programme (teaching methods, study topics, and teaching procedures).

This task was undertaken with copies of notes and transcribed interviews and meant that I had to define some visual coding procedures to mark and bring together similar subjects\textsuperscript{114,115}.

However, it was evident that if I wanted to display the results clearly, I would have to arrange the topics in a different way. I had noticed that when discussing and evaluating the programme, the students used to refer to the research activities (assignments) as the ‘baseline’ for their arguments. Moreover, the four assignments were directly linked to the innovations in teaching methods, study topics, and teaching procedures that arose from the programme. Thus, I decided to follow the students and employ these occasions as focal points in the presentation of the results of the students’ experiences with the alternative programme. Nevertheless, some of the results obtained could not be arranged around these four research activities since they were closely linked to the students’

\textsuperscript{114} I was comparing data collected from different types of tools and searching for qualitative elements rather than quantities of these elements. That is why I chose not to use digital programmes for the data analysis.

\textsuperscript{115} First, I printed copies of the texts that I would be working with. I used larger margins (3cm), small size letters (10p) and spacing (single) to have a clear image of the text and enough space to write down my notes and comments. Second, I employed initials for certain expressions such as ‘teaching method’ (TM), ‘study topics’ (ST), and ‘teaching procedures’ (TP) in different colours of ink (red, green, and blue respectively) to mark the corresponding subjects in the texts. Third, I selected a fluorescent pen to highlight the parts of the interviews I wanted to translate into English and reproduce in the thesis. After marking the copies corresponding to the topics of interest, I returned to the computer and opened three new files with the assembled data. Then I began a new process of gathering together similar subjects by means of printed copies of these files. The topics around which the subjects were now grouped were those that comprised each of the innovations of the programme (e.g. teaching procedures - use of images in lectures, art history theory, etc.). I used a special coloured pen for each subject for this purpose. Although the papers with my notes were rather blurred, the electronic files were well organised and a clear picture of the results emerged.
general experience with the programme. On account of this, I decided to present these results separately.

As I wished to preserve the anonymity of the participants during the second interview, I asked them what name they would like me to use for them when presenting the results of the study. As there was some reluctance to choose code-names, it was clear that I would have to do it for them. I chose realistic names to allow readers to identify the gender of the students, though this caused problems too, since the small number of men in one of the groups would make it easy to identify them. This meant I should take extra care when inventing code-names for the male students.

I also attempted to avoid selecting any names that could in some way identify the ethnicity or religious orientation of the students by providing a clue about their family or cultural backgrounds. Thus, the process of selecting code-names became a complex task and to keep within the parameters I had laid down, I adopted the following abbreviations: FS01 (female student 01) and MS01 (male student 01). The need to consider the data from the two groups in a unified way led me to adopt a numerical sequence and identify the students in the alphabetical order of their first name.

My own participation in the process inevitably meant that there was a degree of personal and subjective engagement in the collection and interpretation of the data, given the period of time I was in contact with the students and my good relationships with them. This relationship was strengthened by my contacts with the students outside of the class (usually by e-mail), and discussions about different subjects in the arts. In addition, while conducting the research project, I completed a study about some new local visual artists that included one of the students as a member of that fraternity. This study, which resulted both in a book and an exhibition, made the students see me as a researcher who was relatively well-respected in the locality too. As a result of this, two students who are pursuing artistic careers asked me to write appreciations of their works for the solo exhibitions they held in 2003 and 2004. This subjectivity entails

---


117 Added to this, in 2004, the students elected me as their spokesperson at the graduation class. I wrote a reference for one student who was seeking to apply for a Master’s degree course, and some of the undergraduates who took part in the programme became students in the specialist course on art history that I coordinated at the college.
both strengths and limitations and I tried to strike a balance between my feelings as someone involved in the experience of the programme, and someone with a personal relationship with the participants of the experience. My interests and responsibilities as a researcher made me aware of the need to make sense of and evaluate the experience objectively.

Finally, it should be pointed out that while taking account of behavioural factors and the fact that there was a certain degree of subjectivity in the discourse of the students, my primary concern was to evaluate changes in the content of the discourse only insofar as they resulted from the learning process.

5.5 Summary and conclusions

This chapter examined the extent to which this study was carried out in a way that allowed me to act both in the capacity of the person who conducted the activities (the teacher) and that collected the data during the process (the researcher). Furthermore, the qualitative results were of greater significance in the evaluation of the programme than the quantitative, and this explains why a small number of participants (13 students) was chosen for the research sample.

It was shown that during the two years of the alternative programme, a large amount of data was collected by means of different tools (questionnaires, individual interviews, collective interviews, field notes and assignments). This data was particularly associated with the students’ educational and cultural backgrounds, their reactions to the innovations of the programme, changes in learning art history, and their thoughts about their own cultural identity. It was explained that owing to the diversity of this data, a form of analysis was required that depended on the relationship of the subjects with the innovations of the programme (teaching methods, study topics, and teaching procedures). Moreover, as will be seen in the next chapter, the four main research activities (assignments) of the programme were chosen as focal points for the presentation of the results of the students’ experiences with the alternative programme.

Finally, as is common with practitioner research, it was observed that some changes had to be made in the plans involving the application of the programme and tools for data
collection, and it was acknowledged that adjustments were made in the way the research was carried out. In addition, it was explained that every effort was made to face the ethical issues that inevitably arise in practitioner research and handle them sensitively.
CHAPTER 6 - THE STUDENTS' EXPERIENCE WITH THE ALTERNATIVE PROGRAMME

This chapter provides a summary of the main data collected from the experiment with the alternative teaching programme. In the interests of clarity, the results that were obtained have been separated into the following areas:

a) the profile of the students who were selected for the sample
b) the experience the students had with the four research activities
c) the students’ general opinions about the programme and their suggestions for its future implementation
d) the students’ perception of the significant role played by their personal values when observing art, and of their relationship with the culture of the society closest to them.

The main reason for reproducing the ‘voices’ of the students in this chapter is that their own comments clearly define the emotions they felt when making their discoveries during the alternative programme.

6.1 An examination of the student sample

The sample which was selected for this study, (as explained in Chapter 5), was made up of undergraduates that: a) were enrolled in both the art history modules 1/2002 and 2/2003 (morning or evening groups) of the fine arts teacher training course of the selected institution b) agreed to take part in the research and cooperate with all the methods of data collection that were applied. Thus, in numerical terms, the sample employed in this thesis comprised 13 undergraduates (9 women and 4 men: 7 students in the morning group - 6 women and 1 man and 6 students in the evening group - 3 women and 3 men).

The answers provided by the students to the questionnaire and the first individual interview allowed me to draw up a list of characteristics of the undergraduates that comprised the sample of this research. In 2002 these students’ ages were as follows: 20 or younger (5), between 21 and 24 (3), 25 and 29 (2), 30 and 34 (1), 35 or older (2). All the students who were selected were Brazilians - 6 were born in Curitiba, 2 in other
towns in Paraná State, and 5 were born in nearby states (Rio Grande do Sul, Santa Catarina, São Paulo and Mato Grosso). The students came from second (1), third (7), or more (5) generations of European (Austrian, German, Italian, Polish, Portuguese, Russian, Spanish, and Ukrainian) or Asian (Japanese) families, and most of them were brought up in inter-ethnic families (only 3 were from a single ethnicity - Italian, Polish and Japanese).

When the students talked about their everyday customs, it was apparent that they were strongly influenced both by the cultures of other parts of Brazil and by the countries of origin of their families. This was particularly the case of those that were still living with their parents. The students of second and third generation immigrant families of Italian, German, Polish and Japanese descent stated that their cultures remained dominant in their social behaviour and food preferences, and the same thing applied to the undergraduates whose parents were mineiros and gaúchos\textsuperscript{118}.

Most of the students grew up in Paraná State (8 in the capital, Curitiba) and the majority of them had been living in Curitiba for more than two years (only 2 of them had been living for many years in small towns nearby). Only one of the students had a degree in another undergraduate course (Pure Sciences)\textsuperscript{119}.

In 2002, few of the undergraduates were practising art teachers and the majority were working in areas unrelated to the arts or education. The 4 students that were practising teachers at that time, used to teach art in the formal public or private sector, and had included art history topics in their classes. Only one student who was working as a teacher in 2002 had a 1st Grade teacher’s certificate (up to the age of 6)\textsuperscript{121}. Six of the

\textsuperscript{118} People that are born in Minas Gerais and Rio Grande do Sul States are called mineiros and gaúchos respectively. These are extremely traditional parts of Brazil, with their own food habits and a strong oral culture. The economy and history of both States is based on cattle raising (Minas Gerais is one of the major producers of milk in Brazil and Rio Grande do Sul of meat), and they are wealthy and politically influential regions in Brazil. The people from these States are normally proud of their culture and traditions and even when they move away usually stick to their traditional food, keep their accent, use their own slang, and observe their religious and social customs.

\textsuperscript{119} For many years the Arts was not as a profession in Brazil. Thus, many undergraduates in Arts courses already had a University degree, particularly in the Pure Sciences, Biology, Medicine, or Education.

\textsuperscript{120} The expressions ‘formal system of education’ or ‘formal sector’ are used in this thesis to define the regular education offered in schools and similar educational institutions since art educators also teach art subjects in ‘informal’ institutions such as workshops or studios.

\textsuperscript{121} The Brazilian private educational sector allows university students or anyone interested to work within these levels of schooling to teach specific subjects like the arts. This is because some of these formal institutions expect that, during this experimental teaching period, these ‘informal teachers’ may wish to become teachers with a recognised certificate.
students were pursuing an artistic career, particularly in the area of drawing and painting.

All the students had been introduced to art history through books, before becoming undergraduates, since this subject was included in their faculty’s admission test. Moreover, during the first individual interview, they stated that they liked art history, in particular Ancient Egyptian and Classical Greek Art; the Renaissance; Impressionism; Art Nouveau; Pop Art and Graffiti. Before joining the alternative programme, the students believed that art history should be taught the following areas (in ascending order of importance):

1. how to recognise the most important art objects in the world
2. how to use materials and techniques in the fine arts
3. how to identify the meaning of the representations of artistic objects
4. how to identify the internal and formal meanings of artistic objects
5. how to use the fine arts as a language to express ideas and feelings
6. how to treat an artistic object as a reflection of society.

The students’ belief that the subject, art history, should lay stress on the 5th and 6th items in this list suggests that they had more than just an understanding of the role of art history and the bearing this discipline has on art. It reflects the influence of what they were taught in the college and their previous education in history. However, the small importance they attached to item 1 shows that they were not understanding art history from a ‘common sense’ standpoint or literalist view of society.

The students responses to the images shown to them during the first interview, led to different interpretations. Their reactions to the first image were as follows:

a) religion: although some of the undergraduates are not Catholics, they all regarded the building as an important religious landmark of the city.

b) style: some students associated the vertical appearance of this cathedral with the gothic style, the medieval period, or as a mixture of styles

---

122 See Chapter 3, p.69.
123 This is derived from analysis of the answers students gave to Question 6 of the questionnaire, which they answered during our first face-to-face meeting in 2002 (see Appendix 5).
124 See Appendix 7.
125 The majority of the students involved in the research are Catholic (the main religion of Brazil). However, among the non-Catholic students are Evangelical Christians from communities that do not approve of their members visiting Catholic churches on moral grounds.
c) **history and geography:** some students recognised the name of the image in the photograph (*Catedral Basílica de Nossa Senhora da Luz dos Pinhais*); one student located the building as being in the centre of the city and remembered that the cathedral stands on one side of an important square (*Tiradentes Square*) and that the *Marco Zero* monument is erected in front of it.

d) **personal relationship:** most of the students said that they had already been inside this building; some of them regarded it as a symbol of the city as it was situated in a much frequented place; others felt it induced feelings of calm and nostalgia although it was located in a ‘dangerous’ part of the town.

When they looked at the second image, the students reacted in the following ways:

a) **style and history:** the majority of the students recognised this picture as a sculpture of the modern period, and its the local nickname (*o homem nu* / the naked man); the picture reminded some students of recent incidents in the local news.

b) **symbolism and personal relationship:** unlike the Cathedral, most of the students did not like this work because it represented human power, politics and State hypocrisy. However, the students displayed considerable interest in the square itself as it is the site of a well-known mural (painted by a leading local artist, Poty Lazzarotto).

The observations of the students showed that some were familiar with the history of the works of art displayed and of their art styles. However, their personal observations of these works show that their relationship with these objects is based on their experience of living in the town, or their social habits and beliefs, but that they do not regard them as being ‘objects of art’. In their view, the building and the sculpture are objects associated with religious and political affairs and have no artistic significance. The fact

---

126 Marco Zero marks the place where the first building was built in Curitiba, in the 17th century. This monument is used as a central point for measuring distances in the city.
127 The cathedral is located in the historical area of the city where there are large crowds of people. It is an area notorious for pickpocketing, and prostitution.
128 When looking at the image, the male students, in particular, remembered that in 1975 a local soccer time (*Coritiba Football Club*) won the regional championship for the fifth time. A local newspaper printed a picture of this sculpture (which is called ‘Paraná’) wearing the stripes of the winning team.
129 This square was planned as a memorial to the *Centenário de Emancipação do Estado do Paraná* (centenary of the emancipation of Paraná from the State of São Paulo) and is located in one of the main streets of the city together with the Curitiba Mayor’s office and the state administrator office. This square is situated between the historical and political centres of the city.
130 Poty Lazzarotto (1924-1998). *Desenvolvimento Histórico do Paraná.* 1953, glazed tile, 3,00 x 30,00m. Curitiba, Dezembro de Dezembro Square.
that the students remembered that the mural of Poty was situated in the same square had nothing to do with its artistic value but was only because the local administration had chosen Poty as their major local artist and elevated him into a powerful, influential figure.

6.2 First research activity

"This is a cultural issue. You do not, not... unconsciously, you do not regard architecture as art. You end up thinking that it is engineering and that it is not art. You cannot look at architecture with this kind of outlook. For example, there are few buildings in Curitiba which make you... you stop and say: 'oh, this is art!' You even feel strange thinking of it as art, don’t you? You end up saying: 'no, this is architecture', ok, it’s nothing special, it doesn’t make you feel anything...” (MS04, group interview)\textsuperscript{131,132}

As explained in Chapter 5, the 1/2002 term was devoted to the study of architectural features and to carrying out the first research activity/Assignment 1.

The students expressed the view that Assignment 1 was one of the most important activities of the alternative programme, since it led them to observe their urban environment in a different way, and to use the theories they were reading about to identify visual features in their everyday lives. They stated that this first activity enabled them to enjoy the study of art history because it could be applied to other contexts outside their college.

\textsuperscript{131} Key to transcripts:
- Quotes from direct speech are given in italics and between double quotation marks.
- Words or expressions within these quotes: if underlined, this denotes emphasis. When it is put between single quotation marks, this represents the students’ thoughts or other expressions.
- Three dots are used to indicate a pause in the speech.
- Three dots between round brackets within the quotes indicate that a small piece of material has been edited out. Three dots, at the end of the phrase, means that a certain amount of text has been edited out.
- Square brackets indicate extra information added to clarify what is being said or to describe non-verbal actions.

\textsuperscript{132} “É uma questão cultural. A gente não, não... inconscientemente, a gente não considera arquitetura como Arte. A gente acaba achando que é Engenharia e não que é Arte. Não olha para a arquitetura como esse olhar. Poucos os prédios de Curitiba, por exemplo, você para e diz: ‘ah, isso é Arte!’ Até você acha estranho achar aquilo Arte, né? Você acaba dizendo: ‘não, é uma Arquitetura!’, pronto, não tem nada de especial, não te causa emoção...” (MS04, group interview)
During the interviews, some of the students stated that they were becoming ‘a bit obsessive’, because they kept looking at the local architecture and trying to recognise the period, style and quality of the buildings. Others experienced this same ‘obsession’ while visiting other cities after the activity, and enjoyed their newly-acquired ability to explain aspects of the local architecture to their relatives and friends.

One student gave a good ironic description of this ‘obsession’ they felt: “Now we walk around the city searching for art... even looking for it on the ground!” (MS03, group interview)

This student expressed as follows the change he experienced in his way of looking at the public places of Curitiba after examining the records of the buildings he chose to carry out in Assignment 1:

“Looking at a pile of photos from Curitiba from the 1910s... Osório square... with lots of little trees [showing a size of about 15cm with his hands]... Gee! Those photos are lovely! Now every time I pass the places shown in those photos, I imagine what it was like at that time. Because it moves you. You look at the photos of another period... you think how long ago it was. I think about the small trees in Rui Barbosa [square]... Very interesting indeed... they go well with the history. They’re really nice!” (MS03, group interview)

Other students expressed their unfamiliarity with the history and icons of the local architecture and their surprise at discovering it:

“We have the first modern house in Brazil and almost nobody has talked about it... I had never even heard of it.” (MS02, group interview)

This student was making a comic allusion because one of the local artists, Frederico Lange de Morretes (1892-1954) whose works I showed them in the lectures was the creator of the pattern that has been used for many years in the pavements of Curitiba.

“Agora a gente anda pela cidade procurando arte... olhando até para o chão!” (MS03, group interview)

The squares which the student is referring to are very well known places in the city that are now very leafy.

“Ficar olhando um monte de fotos de Curitiba de 10 [1910]... Praça Osório... tudo com arvorizinha pequenas assim [fazendo gestos, descrevendo uma altura entre as mãos de aproximadamente 15cm]... Nossa! Muito legal aquelas fotos! Agora toda vez que passo pelos locais daquelas fotos fico imaginando como será que era. Porque mexe com você. Você fica olhando fotos de uma outra época... você pensa como a praça é construída há anos. Fico pensando numas mudinhas pequenas na Rui Barbosa também... Muito, muito interessante. Mexe com a história. Bem legal!” (MS03, group interview)

In fact, the first modernist house built in Brazil dates from 1928, it is located in São Paulo and is a work by the Russian architect Gregori Warchavchik (1896-1972). The house which the student is referring to is a work by an architect of German descent, Frederico Kirchgässner (1899-1988), and was built in 1932.
... it is true! [agreeing with what MS02 had just said] Whenever the architecture of Curitiba is shown, the first thing that appears is that house! They also always show the Guaira Theatre (...), the Public Library building, the group of buildings which comprise the Civic Centre\textsuperscript{139}...

(FS07, group interview)\textsuperscript{140}

One student expressed the changes she had felt when carrying out this assignment:

"It changed us, changed us completely. For good, I think. We began to see things better... we began to go out to look at the facades of the buildings which we pass by. It makes you more sensitive..." (FS03, group interview)\textsuperscript{141}

With regard to how studying the features of the local architecture helped them to identify cultural aspects of different social groups, the students stated the following:

"This is easier to observe when you go somewhere else. (...) When you go to another town you observe this better... if in some ways it is more backward in its cultural development, or if it is a more advanced society. When we are here [in Curitiba] we don't notice the differences, we are used to what we see." (FS05, group interview)\textsuperscript{142}

"In a place like Curitiba with such a mixture of ethnicities, we get accustomed to the large variety. When you go to another town, by looking at the architecture, you wonder what kind of ethnicity colonised the place..." (MS03, group interview)\textsuperscript{143}

"Some members of my family live in Santa Catarina state, but not in the capital. When I go there I feel I am in another world. Everything is different, from the houses, the way they live, the food... even the clothes are different. The commercial centre of the town is small... those small streets, the shops... so old, so different." (FS04, group interview)\textsuperscript{144}

\textsuperscript{138} "Temos a primeira casa modernista do Brasil e ninguém quase ouve falar dela... nem eu mesmo havia ouvido falar dela." (MS02, group interview)

\textsuperscript{139} It is interesting to observe that the two students just focused their comments on buildings of the local modern style.

\textsuperscript{140} "...verdade! [concordando com o que o MS02 havia acabado de falar] Toda coisa que aparece da arquitetura de Curitiba, a primeira coisa que aparece é essa casa! Aparece sempre também o Teatro Guaira (...), a Biblioteca [Pública do Paraná], aquele complexo do Centro Clívio..." (FS07, group interview)

\textsuperscript{141} "Mudou, mudou completamente. Para melhor, eu acho. A gente começou a perceber melhor... começamos a sair para observar as fachadas que a gente passa. Nós ficamos mais sensíveis." (FS03, group interview)

\textsuperscript{142} "Isso é mais fácil de perceber quando você vai para fora. (...) Quando você vai para outra cidade você percebe mais isso... se a cidade é mais pobre culturalmente, ou mais moderna. Quando a gente está aqui [em Curitiba] a gente não consegue perceber, a gente acostuma o olhar." (FS05, group interview)

\textsuperscript{143} "Numa cidade com tanta mistura de etnias como Curitiba a gente acostuma com uma grande variedade. Quando você visita uma outra cidade é que você pensa (...) qual etnia colonizou essa cidade, pela arquitetura..." (MS03, group interview)

\textsuperscript{144} "Tenho uns parentes em Santa Catarina, mas no interior. Quando vou para lá me sinto em outro mundo. Tudo é diferente, desde as casas, a maneira como eles vivem, as comidas... as roupas até são
Assignment 1 was the first occasion that the students themselves chose the works of art they would analyse. Although this activity was carried out by groups of three students, it was easy to identify the personal taste of individual students in making their choice because the person whose preference prevailed was often very talkative. In some cases it was clear for instance, that the students of German and Italian origin chose buildings associated with the history of their communities.

In selecting two buildings that had the same original functions but were built at different times, most of them chose buildings that were located along their everyday journeys and had particular symbolic meanings for them. Some chose the buildings they had once seen as symbols of their childhood dreams. They claimed that as children they used to draw on their imagination or stories told to them to fantasize about the people who lived in those buildings, seeing them as the palaces of Prince Charming or a Princess or as places of evil. The students’ selection was based on two further factors: the chance to go inside the buildings (which most students wished to do, although the assigned task was just to analyse the facades of the buildings) and their right of access to libraries and other public, historical archives to examine the original documents of the periods when the buildings were constructed.

Most of the buildings selected are situated in the historical parts of the city, and were originally built to be either houses of different social classes, or public buildings (such as schools, churches, and hotels). Today these buildings are schools, shops, offices, churches, or museums.

Figure 19 – Example of buildings chosen by students to carry out Assignment 1.


diferentes. O centro da cidade é pequenininho... aquelas ruazinhas, as lojas... bem antiga, bem diferente. " (FS04, group interview)

110
The contact students had with the owners or caretakers of the buildings increased their interest in their history and encouraged them to go inside. In addition, an enthusiastic lecturer that I had invited to speak to them, led them to feel more confident about their selection.

The learning process that the students experienced was so emotional that about six months after the activity was carried out, one of them recalled it as follows:

"... how well I remember that girl who came to talk about the church, and what she said. Wow, it changed everything... 'It's like a fairy tale to me'; that, was the expression she used. So I thought about it and looked at her, and the sensation I had was that she was feeling the same thing as when she thought about it for the first time. This is the same sensation I have when I remember that house. I don't just remember the house, I remember everything that happened, and everything that I studied. Thus, it was a subject that made an impression on me, in an involuntary way, do you understand? I remember the architecture, I remember the period, I remember everything about it." (FS01, second individual interview)

In view of the students' interest in the subject, at the beginning of the second month of the study, I recommended some extra references to them and some study sources on the history of architecture that I had selected.

Assignment 1 and the activities that accompanied it were successful in enabling students to compare styles, look up sources that could be useful for the study of local art, and meet different professionals that are involved in the arts. However, the students encountered certain difficulties with the theoretical texts I recommended on the approach to art they were adopting. This led me to add some introductory texts on this matter.

After they had carried out Assignment 1, the students felt closer to their colleagues, discovered their abilities and limitations when working in groups, and began to reflect

---

145 "...como eu me lembro daquela menina que veio falar sobre a igreja, do que ela falou. Nossa, mudou uma coisa... 'Aquilo para mim é um conto de fadas', foi essa frase que ela disse. E daí eu fiquei pensando e fiquei olhando para ela e a sensação que eu tinha é que ela sentia a mesma coisa do que o primeiro dia que ela pensou aquilo. E é a mesma sensação que eu tenho quando eu me lembro daquela casa. E eu não lembro só da casa, eu lembro de tudo que aconteceu, de tudo que eu estudei. Então, foi um conteúdo que me marcou, sem querer, sabe? Eu me lembro da arquitetura, eu me lembro da época, me lembro de tudo aquilo." (FS01, second individual interview)


147 Wöfflin, 1996.

148 Coli, 1990.
on their relationship with the local culture. One student summarises a generally held
opinion about the activity in the following way:

“...I was studying it, wasn’t I? I was... was learning about architecture, what it is like and what it isn’t like, which period it comes from... just in a way that was completely... comfortable I would say (...). Suddenly I found that I was not just reading about it, or studying it, in a thick book - this size [describing with her left hand a size of about 7cm], I was involved in it, I was inside it, I was living it...” (FS01, second individual interview)

6.3 Second research activity

The second research activity/Assignment 2 was carried out at the beginning of the 2/2003 term, and consisted of undertaking an iconological study of a recommended sculpture from the Eclectic or Modernist local periods. Assignment 2 involved the students in utilizing art history, the city, and the local culture in a different way from that of the first research activity.

The students experienced significant changes in the way they observed the city and local culture while carrying out Assignment 2. The students experienced significant changes in the way they observed the city and local culture while carrying out Assignment 2. One student stated what she felt had been the major change resulting from the activities carried out in Assignment 1:

“... I believe that this awareness of what is near to you... sometimes goes unnoticed... for example, this thing, this statue on the street... you don’t really look at it... or the building that you pass by every day (...) and you don’t regard it as art (...) the painting you look at has an ‘aura’ about it. People think of it as a work of art: the ‘painting’, that object that is in a museum, that sometimes we look at and, sometimes don’t. This is a part of our everyday life. It was great to have this [assignment] on sculpture and architecture because the art you usually study in art history is only painting. It was really good for us to have a perspective (...) [as art], not

149 “...eu ‘tava estudando, né? Eu ‘tava... ‘tava adquirindo aquele conhecimento da arquitetura, de como que é, como que não é, de que época... só que de uma forma totalmente... light eu diria (...). De repente eu me encontrava não lendo aquilo, estudando aquilo, num livro deste tamanho [fazendo gestos, descrevendo uma espessura entre os dedos da mão esquerda de aproximadamente 7cm], eu estava inserida naquilo, estava dentro daquilo, vivendo aquilo...” (FS01, second individual interview)
Unlike in Assignment 1, they became aware of the relationship between the artistic object and its cultural and social environment. In particular, they began to observe how the urban characteristics of the city affect the way a piece of sculpture is observed and interpreted.

I observed that the students had more problems in ‘decoding’ visual texts than I had expected. In the first place, they understood the expression ‘a symbolic interpretation of a work of art’ as meaning ‘a personal interpretation of a work of art’ and interpreted the sculptures they had chosen on the basis of common sense, only decoding the meanings in the light of their current symbolic significance. As a result, the students were encouraged to look up sources to show how the meanings of symbols alter in different historical eras and cultures (for example, dictionaries of symbols). This did not involve a ‘proper’ iconological analysis, since this would require a highly specialized kind of knowledge. Moreover, I had previously selected a group of sculptures for the research and invited the students to make their choice. This was to reduce the complexity of the study because many students lacked an adequate visual vocabulary for this task. Thus, they had to be assisted (more than I had planned), to choose a piece of sculpture that could be suitably compared with a local work. As well as this, I recommended sources and visual arts publications where the students were likely to find comparable works of art for analytical purposes.

In carrying out Assignment 2, the students had to use different sources of art history and local culture from the first research activity. This enabled them to increase their understanding of art history and their contacts with local art institutions and become more aware of the existence of works of art around them in the city and elsewhere.
“Now whenever I pass through a public square, I look to see whether there is a piece of sculpture or not. (...) I went to see the sculpture of ‘Tiradentes’ and I didn’t even know that the square was called ‘Tiradentes’! (...) Later I looked at the corner and saw a sculpture, a ‘small’ sculpture at the ‘little’ corner of the square! So, after that, I take a close look at every public square I visit...” (MS03, group interview)

“There are many sculptures by Turin at the Lapa. I didn’t know that! This is an example. I used to think that there were only sculptures by him in the museum. But there are so many [making a gesture with her hands to show the number]!” (FS06, group interview)

In addition, the selected texts and supplementary sources on sculpture were of crucial importance in broadening their understanding of sculpture.

A further point was that they helped the students to improve their specialist vocabulary:

“... before we used the term ‘statue’, now we call it a ‘sculpture’; it seems that we are beginning to value the work.” (FS06, group interview)

As the undergraduates had to carry out this activity in pairs, it made them think about their relationships with each other. Some had had difficulties in working with their colleagues in Assignment 1 and in other course activities and this led them (particularly the evening students) to join colleagues who might have a similar working style, even if they did not have a close relationship with them.

---

151 The student is referring to a sculpture in one of the main squares of the city. The sculpture of this historical character - Tiradentes, Joaquim José da Silva Xavier (1746-1792) who was the leader and martyr of a conspiracy that took place in Minas Gerais and sought to make Brazil independent from Portugal - is extremely visible (it is almost 3m high) and stands at the main corner of the square.

152 “Agora tudo que e praça que eu passo eu olho se tem uma escultura ou não. (...) Eu fui para ver a escultura do Tiradentes e nem sabia que se chamava Tiradentes a praça! (...) Depois que eu olhei na esquina e tinha uma escultura, uma ‘pequena’ escultura no ‘cantinho’ da praça! Então, depois dessa, toda praça que eu vou eu fico olhando...” (MS03, group interview)

153 The student is referring to the historical city of Lapa in Paraná, which she has close ties with, and to the sculptor João Turin (1878-1949) generally regarded as one of the most important artists of Paraná state.

154 “Lá na Lapa tem muita escultura do Turin. Eu não sabia! Ai a gente vê. Eu achava que só tinha lá no museu dele e pronto. Mas lá ta assim [fazendo um gesto ascendente de união dos dedos da mão que designa muito]!” (FS06, group interview)

155 “...antes a gente falava ‘estátua’, agora a gente fala ‘escultura’, parece até que valoriza a obra.” (FS06, group interview)

156 This tendency was more apparent among students of the evening group, especially as many of them did not have much time to spend on extra-class activities because of their jobs and family commitments.
As planned, in the second year of the programme, my role as a teacher changed so that in our meetings the students and I became fellow ‘researchers’.

The second activity also led to a written paper. However, the students also had to give an informal presentation of what they had found out to their colleagues in the classroom. The reaction of students during the presentations and their comments in the interviews showed that most students found this task stimulating.

On two different occasions during the group interview, one student explained how the second research activity affected her response to sculpture:

“I used not to have a relationship with sculpture; I looked at it and that was it. Not anymore. Now I’m concerned with looking at the space, the shadow and the light. (...) In the past, I used to look at a sculpture [and say in an offhand way]: ‘oh, it’s a sculpture.’ Now there is a history behind it, a lot of things behind it!” (FS09, group interview)\textsuperscript{157}

\section*{6.4 Third research activity}

Most of the students thought the hardest part of the alternative programme was the third research activity/\textit{Assignment 3} because of the subject, the approach required and the methods needed to show the results.

\textit{Assignment 3} consisted of an individual research activity, in which the students were asked to analyse a figurative painting of the local Modernist period by employing the structuralist method of analysis of Nessi (1968) (see \textit{Chapter 2}, p.39). This method entails providing a description of the work of art based on the images represented, the study of the formal organization of representation, and the symbolic interpretation of the visual elements displayed in the artwork.

Nessi’s method requires a certain acquaintance with the other two methods used in Assignments 1 and 2 (the style theory and the iconological approach). If one takes

\begin{quote}
\textsuperscript{157} “Eu não tinha muita relação com escultura, olhava acabou. Hoje não. Eu me preocupo em olhar a questão do espaço, da sombra, da luz. (...) Antes eu olhava para uma escultura [fala com certo descaso]: ‘ah, é uma escultura.’ Agora tem uma história por trás, um monte de coisa por trás!” (FS09, group interview)
\end{quote}
account of the difficulties in Assignment 2, caused by the different levels of significance in works of art, it is understandable that the students found the third research activity complex too.

Assignment 3 had to be undertaken individually, which meant that for the first time the students had to make their own research decisions and explain their procedures.

As explained earlier, the students were asked to write an academic paper, and give a formal oral presentation to their colleagues on the results of their work in Assignment 3. Many of the students found it an arduous task to meet the high standards that I required in their presentation. Nonetheless, they agreed that it made them aware of their individual problems in dealing with the visual language.

“We realised how ‘blind’ we are and that we don’t really see. Studying visual arts and we can’t see... and we want to teach others to see! Impossible! So, it was really important, I learned a lot.” (FS02, group interview)\(^{158}\)

“Gee! How many things we look at and don’t see! This was the hardest assignment in my opinion.” (FS04, group interview)
“Utter despair!” (MS03, group interview)
“Well, in the end, this is an extremely basic topic in our field, and we had to solve it in at least two hours and look at what an effort it cost us...”\(^{159}\) (FS02, group interview)

It is worth pointing out that some of the paintings chosen by the students included representations of buildings in an eclectic style (the subject of the first research activity). Furthermore, the students were guided by their own interests and feelings, and selected works by artists they wished to know more about or with whom they had a personal affinity.

During the third research activity, the students’ meetings with me were like tutorials and occasionally, I resumed my role as coordinator of the groups’ activities, and discussed

\(^{158}\) “A gente percebeu o quanto a gente é ‘chapado’ e não olha. Fazendo artes visuais e não olha... e quer ensinar os outros a olhar! Impossível! Então, foi bem importante, aprendi muito.” (FS02, group interview)

\(^{159}\) “Nossa! Quanta coisa a gente olha e não vê! Esse trabalho foi o mais difícil para mim.”(FS04, group interview)

“Desesperador!” (MS03, group interview)
“Mas, afinal da contas, é uma coisa extremamente básica, e que era para a gente resolver em duas horas e olha o quanto a gente penou...” (FS02, group interview)
prepared topics with them in a study-group. When visual aids were needed, I used large-sized reproductions of the works of art to avoid reverting to the traditional position of the teacher standing in front of the group of students, and ‘controlling’ their activities.

An interesting phenomenon emerged from this assignment which is that after some students experienced changes in their way of looking at works of art, they decided to repeat the experience in a similar way with their students. They described in a very relaxed way how interesting it was to observe changes both in their students and in themselves:

“This assignment of ‘reading’ works of art that all of us did, and really looking at the art was carried out in a detailed way... when (...) [FS06] and I did a course about Realism... Almeida Júnior160... we began to interpret the painting for the kids, we analysed every little detail [showing the size of about 1cm with his hand], about this and that, and there was a time when I said... [asking his colleagues if they knew this] I don’t know if you are familiar with that painting ‘Saudade’ [Longing], with a woman with her back against the wall? I told the kids to look at something that I hadn’t seen before either: ‘- Look, there is a detail in this painting that tells you that a man lives or used to live in this house.’ (...) [FS06] was amazed because she had never expected or noticed that... The kids began to look for it... and I said: ‘- Look, it is here, in the corner... a hat... a hat, it’s hanging up there!’ It’s a dark scene, so it’s a dark hat. When they made this discovery [of the hat] I told them: ‘- Look at this ...... look at that... and they found other things too! In this way, you learn how to look at every little detail! Very nice indeed! They will always remember this... they loved it!” (MS03, group interview)

“... we began to try and guess what time of the day it was when the girl was at the window!” (FS06, group interview)

“... and we did that with the kids! ‘- Do you think that it is day or night?’” (MS03, group interview)

“... do you think that it is almost midday because the light is so bright? (laughing)” (FS04, group interview)

“... it is important to make clear that this is not a woman but ‘a representation of a human figure with female features!’161 (...) But, it was really nice to do the ‘reading’. They loved it! They appreciated every single detail... they said other things too... in this way, we learn things, and they become fixed in our memory... (...) we always allow people to

160 The student is referring to the work ‘Saudade’ [Longing] (1899, oil on canvas, 197x101cm. São Paulo, Pinacoteca do Estado) by the artist José Ferraz de Almeida Júnior (1850-1899), considered to be one of the most important painters of the Realism movement in Brazil
161 The students treated these commentaries on the ‘light’ and ‘figure of the woman...’ in a lighthearted way because during their discussions with me on the works of art when they carried out Assignment 3, I used to tease them as a way of encouraging them to improve their way of looking at and describing the works of art they had chosen.
make their own interpretations in this way... this is what is really nice!”
(MS03, group interview)

“... my students are as young as 3+ (...) and it is difficult to take small children to public places in the town centre (...) there are teachers who have resigned themselves not to do it anymore... I’m still at the beginning of my career as a teacher, I’m still enthusiastic about it and want to remain so. It’s really enjoyable! Because the kids are experiencing art in the city. I took my students to see the murals of Poty. We did some preparatory work in advance... we took some reproductions with us [so the students could see the details]... when they arrived there... those small children in front of that huge mural... they ran about from one side to another so they could see the details... and they knew what they were looking at and were able to tell the story! Some days ago one of my students went to the airport. He stopped in front of the mural and began to explain what he saw to his father... because he already knew about it! A child of 4 teaching someone! This was really impressive... and [it was good] to encourage them to visit the place where the works of art are.”
(FS08, group interview)

162 “Essa atividade da leitura de obra que cada um fez... de ver uma obra... foi bem detalhada... quando eu e a (...) [FS06] fomos dar aula sobre o Realismo... Almeida Júnior... a gente começou a fazer a leitura da obra com as crianças, a gente pegou cada detalhezinho assim [descrevendo com a mão uma altura de cerca de 1cm], disso, daquilo, e ai teve uma hora que eu disse assim... [perguntando se seus colegas de turma conheciam] não sei se vocês conhecem aquela obra ‘Saudade’, da mulher encostada na parede? Dai eu falei na hora, [porque] eu também não tinha percebido [aquilo] antes: ‘ Olha, tem um detalhe nessa obra que diz que um homem morou ou mora nessa casa.’ Até a (...) [FS06] ficou assim: ‘- Como é que é? ’... Dai a criança começou a procurar... e eu falei: ‘- Ah, tá aqui, bem no cantinho... um chapéu... um chapéu pendurado!’ Porque é um cenário escuro, um chapéu escuro. Só na hora de fazer aquele processo [de descoberta do chapéu] é que eu falei para eles: ‘- Tem isso, tem aquilo... e eles acharam! Então, ai você aprende a olhar cada detalhezinho (...). Muito legal! Fica gravado isso... eles adoraram!’ (MS03, group interview)

“... a gente fica imaginando até que horário do dia é que a moça está na janela!” (FS06, group interview)

163 “... e gente fez isso com as crianças! ‘- Será que era de dia ou de noite?’ ” (MS03, group interview)

“... será que é por volta do meio-dia? Pela intensidade da luz? (rindo)” (FS04, group interview)

“... tem que deixar claro aqui que isso não é uma mulher! Mas, ‘uma representing de uma figura humana de aspecto feminino’! (...) Mas, foi bem gostoso a leitura! Eles adoraram a leitura! Ficaram valorizando cada detalhezinho... eles falaram de outras coisas também... então, a gente aprende, e acaba ficando gravado... uma maneira de fazer a leitura sem estipular é isso e aquilo... a gente sempre deixa no ar para as pessoas interpretarem... isso é que é legal!” (MS03, group interview)

163 “... meus alunos são a partir dos 3 anos de idade (...) é muito complicado levar crianças pequenas para a cidade, em lugares públicos (...) tem professores que se acomodam e não levam mais... eu estou no início da carreira, estou empolgada e ainda quero levar. É tão gostoso! Porque eles estão vivenciando dentro da cidade. Levei eles para ver os painéis do Poty. A gente fez atividade prática por vários dias... tiramos fotos [para os alunos verem detalhes]... quando eles chegaram na frente... aqueles tamanhos em frente daquele painel enorme... eles corriam de um lado para outro para ver todos os detalhes... e eles sabiam dizer as coisas e contavam a história! Esses dias um deles foi ao aeroporto. Parou na frente de um painel e começou a explicar tudo para o pai dele... porque ele já conhecia! Uma criança de 4 anos dando uma aula! Isso foi muito gostoso... e incentivar a visita ao espaço.” (FS08, group interview)
6.5 Fourth research activity

The last research activity/Assignment 4 was, to some extent, a combination of all the other activities carried out by the students during those two years. Moreover, it offered them an opportunity to stand by and justify their attitudes and the opinions they had expressed when undertaking the research.

I advised the students to keep within certain parameters when carrying out this activity\textsuperscript{164}, and to pick topics that best suited their interests and justified their preferences.

For a number of reasons the students found this the least enjoyable of the activities. First, it coincided with a stressful time near the end of the term when the participants (many of whom were teaching in school for the first time) had to prepare reports on their activities. Second, the subject of study, contemporary art, was unpopular (during the in-class meetings, some students expressed their dislike of contemporary art, although they recognised its intrinsic merit and its relevance to modern society). Third, since it was based on their previous studies, some students felt that nothing new was being experienced, and lost interest (evidence of this is shown in the poor standard of their reports). Finally, it was a demanding activity, and during the interviews, some students, (already tired because of their other commitments) expressed a desire to return to the role of spectators in the old teacher-centred method of teaching.

As a result, most students decided to work in pairs, with the colleagues they most enjoyed working with. They selected paintings or objects from reproductions that could easily be found on the Internet or in the local libraries, and adopted a stylistic or biographical approach as a basis for their analysis.

Despite this, the analysis the students conducted was satisfactory, and some of them noticed an improvement in their ability to appreciate art:

\textsuperscript{164} The students had to write a critical analysis of one example of the local art of the Contemporary period, and correlate the concepts present in this work of art with those found in two other works of the same period, preferably one national and one international work of art. The students were free to do the following: choose to work in pairs or individually, select the art they would like to analyse (architecture, painting or sculpture), and use the method of analysis from those studied (style theory, iconology or structuralism) they felt would be best suited to analyse the work of art they had selected.
I began to notice what I like and what I don’t like, or know why I don’t like it, do you see? Try to understand... I wondered: 'Why do I like this?' or 'Why don’t I like this?' (...) I also learned to be a bit detached when I’m working with the image, when observing... making a report, and not suddenly come out with my personal preferences... but give other reasons, not express my personal preferences” (FS01, group interview)

6.6 The students’ opinions of the programme

Most of the students praised the alternative programme for the experience it had given them; however, they suggested some improvements for future programmes, and recommended changes in the curriculum for art history teaching. Since the second year of the programme gave the students their first experience of teaching observation and practice, in the final meetings with them, it was interesting to observe that they often expressed opinions from the perspective of both students and teachers.

Since the students were in the third year of their course, they felt confident enough to raise points about the curriculum, in the light of their personal education and their training as teachers. During the group interviews, most of the students stated that more time should be allocated for the study of art history in the fine arts teacher-training course curriculum. This would enable them to find out about subjects they had missed out on. In addition, they stated that in the fine arts teacher-training course curriculum, there should be a stronger link between the different subject-areas, particularly art history and aesthetics, to deepen their understanding of all aspects of the arts.

The students laid emphasis on the fact that a larger number of visual aids should be used during the teacher’s presentations and said that their brief introduction to art history was not enough to enable them to follow my lessons easily. They believed that, at the outset of the course, there should have been a brief chronological and stylistic outline of Western art to fill in any possible gaps in the students’ previous knowledge of art history. In the students’ opinion, the teacher should require them to visit exhibitions from the beginning of the art history course, since this activity strengthened their

165 “... eu comecei a ver o que eu gosto ou não gosto, (...) ou saber porque eu não gosto, sabe? Tentar entender... eu pensei nisso: 'Por quê eu não gosto disso?' ou 'Por que eu gosto disso?' (...) também aprendi a distanciar um pouco isso na hora de trabalhar com a imagem, de ver, de... fazer um relatório, e de não colocar o gosto pessoal de repente... falar... por outros motivos, não pelo pessoal.” (FS01, group interview)
relationship with local culture and art history. Two students made the following observations:

"...we, (...) students don’t know very much, we are lazy and don’t go to visit certain museums. We don’t know what we have inside the town. This business of being required to go to a place and write a report about the visit, is also important, even though it may be an effort.” (FS05, group interview)\(^{166}\)

"How many places we’ve visited this year! I had never visited most of the places which I wrote a report about before, it was really important.” (FS04, group interview)\(^{167}\)

The students wished they had had in-class experimental activities before carrying out their research activities and be able to experience similar activities with other subjects under the guidance of the teacher.

The students were at first opposed to being required to give a more formal and academic presentation of the results of the research and argued that other theoretical disciplines in the college were less demanding in this respect. However, during the group interview at the end, they agreed that it was a valuable experience and a good preparation for their careers as teachers. This particularly applied to one student who attributed his high scores in an entrance exam to teach at a private school to the fact that he had followed the requirements I had laid down for the activities in the art history lectures.

Some students claimed that the research activities in the alternative programme helped them to plan their classes later on. The inclusion of art history subjects in their programmes was of particular value for two reasons; it led them to be more practical in their work and made them more familiar with the use of images in art classes. In addition, those who had worked as guides in local museums\(^{168}\), stated that the research activities also helped them to avoid being mere ‘visual pointers’ to visitors. The reason

\(^{166}\) "nós, (...) alunos não conhecemos muito, a gente tem preguiça de ir a tal museu, não sabe o que tem dentro da cidade. Então essa parte assim de ter de ir até o local para fazer o relatório, isso é importante também, apesar de trabalhoso.” (FS05, group interview)

\(^{167}\) "Nesse ano quantos lugares a gente visitou? Eu mesmo não conhecia a maioria dos lugares do quais eu fiz relatório, foi muito importante.” (FS04, group interview)

\(^{168}\) In Brazil most people that work as guides in museums are undergraduates doing courses such as fine arts, architecture, art education, design, and history. During the period of this administered programme, a new local museum was opened (Museu Oscar Niemeyer - MON) and many of the students involved in this research worked as visitors’ guides for the first exhibitions of that institution.
for this was that, while explaining the works of art in the exhibitions, they were also making their own investigations.

"Even when you work as a guide in a museum, you must have some knowledge of art history. You need it so that you know how to talk about it. If somebody comes up and asks you something, you can be confident about giving the right answer. You have to study a lot in advance before you are in a position to give a guided tour; you must know everything about the exhibition - everything related to it. To be really sure you can do this... and it is essential to carry out some research. You learn how to select what is of value by learning and not just by reading, and remembering. You must really learn... what is worth talking about, is of special interest... when you're working, it's not just a question of remembering or reading a text prepared by others, in a mechanical way. You must really understand everything so that people become aware of what they are looking at. [Unless he/she carries out some personal research] the museum guide will end up becoming like a robot instead of building a bridge to enable the visitor to reach out to the [meaning of] work of art, and this is what the guide must be [a bridge between the visitor and the work of art]. I learned a lot when I conducted research in art history." (MS03, group interview)

The students agreed that the departure from the 'traditional Brazilian way of teaching art history' (as advocated by the alternative programme) enabled them to understand some of the 'complex' subjects in history. This new approach entailed a movement away from the following: from local to foreign art; from specific to general knowledge; from analysing works of art to the study of style, the artist, movements, periods and the context; from the recent to the remote past and from the object of art to its reproduction.

In evaluating the experience she had with the alternative programme, one student made the following point:

"...the most important thing [regarding the experience with the programme] was managing to make art history relevant to me, to my
world, and to my town... Before, art history was over there, in Europe, far away. It seemed, that I had to go there to learn about it. Now, I realised that here there are things that are similar to the [artistic] movements that took place over there, (...) so I saw that it wasn't so far from me, and that here there are examples... of art... of art history.” (FM09, second individual interview)

With regard to the gap that students found between what the programme was expecting from them and their actual repertoire of art history, another undergraduate stressed the following point:

“Regarding the activities, I realised that it is a broader view, isn’t it? This allows you to have a different understanding of what art history is, particularly because of the study of the theories. You do have to study in a chronological order, as I thought would be the case (...) but, I also miss having a more... let's say, chronological basis. I feel that... that this method, it is really good but only for those that already have a basic understanding of art history. It should be the right thing. Those who enter a college of Arts already have a grounding in their studies. The problem is that this generally doesn’t happen. We enter with a limited amount of knowledge. And we end up doing other activities in the course and haven’t enough time to study by ourselves. So, it was really good, - on the one hand, it opens up new avenues but at the same time it's lacking something... the most basic knowledge, I think. But it could be easily supplemented by individual study. And readings... as well.” (FS02, second individual interview)

In the light of this experience, a student that was already a practising teacher said that:

“Because of my experience as a teacher, if I hadn’t gone beyond (...) what was set out I (...) would have had problems with the programme. Because last year we studied up to a certain period of Western art and then we changed to local art (...). In the second year, we only studied
Another student evaluated his experience with the alternative programme by pointing out the difference between the way the programme was designed and the way they studied history in high school:

“I missed out a little because of the way of studying history that we were taught at high school. (...) The way that the lectures were planned was different. For example, we were taught different techniques and different ways [of doing art]. You taught us how to do research and we were not fixed to any particular point in history. We learned by conducting research, by what we could find out and ask... what was being added to our knowledge, and how we could be guided in certain ways... Crooked paths sometimes, but we ended up by finding the way, they were often hard and made of stones, but it was ok, we managed to find it [laughing]. This was how we were able to make contact with certain [artistic] movements, and so forth...” (MS03, group interview)\(^{173}\)

One student summarized the experience with the programme as follows:

“[the programme] did not teach art history, but it taught us how we can carry out research into art history.” (FS04, group interview)\(^{174}\)

Another student disagreed and said that:

“I believe that the programme did not just teach us to do research, but also to think about the image.” (FS09, group interview)\(^{175}\)

---

\(^{172}\) “Pela experiência que eu tenho lá na sala de aula, se eu não fosse além do (...) que foi proposto, algumas coisas eu (...) teria sofrido, em relação ao programa. Porque no ano passado a gente viu até um determinado ponto da história universal e daí passou para a história local, (...) a partir do lugar. No segundo ano, só na segunda parte que a gente veio estudar a arte contemporânea, moderna. Então, essa lacuna eu acho que se eu não tivesse ido por conta eu sofreria na sala de aula. Talvez um panorama rápido ajudasse bastante. Se não tudo bem, foi legal.” (MS04, group interview)

\(^{173}\) “Sentiu um pouco de falta do modo de como estudávamos história no colégio. (...) O modo como as aulas foram planejadas foi diferente, por exemplo, abordou técnicas diferentes, maneiras diferentes [de fazer arte]. Ensaiou como pesquisar e não o ensino de história numa sequência. Fomos estudando pela pesquisa, pelo que íamos achando e íamos perguntando para você... que ia complementando, ensinando a gente ir por esse ou aquele caminho... Caminhos meio tortuosos algumas vezes, mas acabávamos achando um caminho, sofrido, feito de pedras, mas tudo bem, encontravam [risada]. Mas por esse caminho iam entrando em contato com tal movimento [artístico], isso ou aquilo...” (MS03, group interview)

\(^{174}\) “[o programa] Não ensinou história da arte, mas como a gente fazer pesquisa em história da arte.” (FS04, group interview)

\(^{175}\) “Acho que o programa não ensinou a gente somente a pesquisar, mas também a pensar a imagem, porque essa imagem.” (FS09, group interview)
In the case of another student, the experience of analysing the meaning of works of art was more important than what she understood as being questions of art history:

“This matter of ‘pouring over’ a work of art, and... ‘dismembering’ it, this was really important to me. I don’t know about the others of the group. I believe that perhaps art history... we could study it easily alone, I don’t know, with books. I believe that this business of ‘pouring over’ and getting hold of every part and studying it, being meticulous, trying to understand, for me... it was really great.” (FS07, group interview)

Finally, the students came up with a number of reflections about studying the theory of art history:

“[studying the theory of art history] gives you a more critical point of view. Normally we look at a book, just to get information, and end up accepting this as the truth. If you look at it in a more critical way, you more or less know the ideological approach the author is following. When you compare it with others, it gives you a more critical point of view.” (FS02, second individual interview)

“This business of questioning, of questioning other things. I believe that we learned a lot this way. For example, in selecting a work of art and... observing it, and... analysing it. This helps you a lot (...) in the process of becoming a critic.” (FS03, group interview)

6.7 Ways students changed during the experience

During the interviews, some students declared that they had observed a significant change in their relationship with images, particularly after the third research activity and that the programme led them to think about the question of their identity within the local culture. They thought they were more sensitive, curious, and critical with regard to
visual texts, particularly while observing them in their leisure time, reading magazines, choosing clothes, watching television, or walking along the street. They felt that they had become aware of the elements of the visual discourse and of the composition behind the visual texts, which created a kind of ‘abstract vision’.

“I remember that you once said (...) that the way of seeing the visual elements inside an image should be natural for us, since we’re in this area (...) and that when we become aware of this, that it was becoming natural, and we could arrive somewhere and look at an image and observe everything in it, our eyes would fill with tears... And it is true! Wow! You begin to see... another image, (...) you see behind it, I don’t know, you begin to observe more. It’s also changed what it’s like watching films... everything, anything that you look at even, a magazine... Wow!” (FMS01, group interview)

Some of the students stated that the most important change they observed in their attitude towards art was with regard to local art.

“It was the way of seeing... I think that it was the way of seeing [where I changed most]... the way you designed the programme, from the specific to the general, I believe that this was the most important aspect of the programme.” (MS04, group interview)

“I also think that it was this business of local art, you know. The way we look at it [that changed]... so much that even in the teaching training period we had with high school students, we talked a lot with them about the places they should visit in the town, and that they should look at the streets and pay attention to things like this.” (FS07, group interview)

“I also remembered it in my teaching training period.” (MS01, group interview)

The students also observed a qualitative change in their way of creating visual texts, especially those that were practising artists. Some students shared my view, that these transformations did not result from the alternative programme, but to the close link they had with the other subjects they were studying. Some students who are practising artists

179 “Eu lembro uma vez que você falou pra gente (...) que aquela análise de ver os elementos numa imagem deveria ser natural para a gente, por a gente ‘tar nessa área (...) e que quando a gente se desse conta disso, que fosse natural, de chegar num lugar e olhar uma imagem e perceber nela tudo isso, o olho ia encher de lágrimas... E é verdade! Nossa! Você começa a ver... outra imagem, (...) ‘cê vê por trás dela, não sei, começa a reparar mais. No cinema também mudou... com tudo, qualquer coisa que você vai olhar, uma revista... (...) Nossa!” (FMS01, group interview)

180 “Foi o olhar... eu penso que foi o olhar [que mais mudou]... a maneira como você direcionou a disciplina, no sentido do particular para o geral. Eu penso que esse aspecto foi bastante importante.” (MS04, group interview)

“Eu também acho que essa coisa da arte local, sabe? O olhar sobre isso [que mudou]... foi tanto que no estágio do segundo grau a gente até falou bastante com os alunos assim dos lugares aqui da própria cidade, para eles olharem na rua, prestarem atenção.” (FS07, group interview)

“Eu também lembrei disso no estágio.” (MS01, group interview)
described how the activities of the programme enabled them to be aware of how the
‘visual texts’ they create have an influence on some aspects of their own culture.

“I believe that my way of seeing and representing things reflects the way
that people who live in colonies see things. I had never noticed this before.
This is something that... I don’t know... I began to observe. I don’t know if
when we think about it, we begin to build... or if it is really a part... of the
way of living in the country and seeing things.” (MS02, group
interview) 181

Unlike when they were questioned about visual education, many students had
difficulties in giving a direct answer when asked if the activities had changed their
relationship with their local culture. This was not unexpected given the fact that these
were the first occasions that they had been asked to think critically about this matter,
and thus caused some discomfort. However, despite their occasional difficulty in
discussing this subject rationally, they tended to improve (particularly in the second
individual interview). In contrast, the students who were accustomed to being seen as
‘different’, were clear in affirming their identity and in defining how exactly the
programme showed them where they stood with regard to their local culture.

The data gathered on this subject varied as much as the individual participants in the
experiment. However, the data collected from the second series of individual interviews,
(together with the notes I took during the administration of the programme), revealed
three distinct positions on the question of identity (students that have close ties with the
local culture – ‘insiders’; students unable to identify with the local culture – ‘outsiders’;
students with a long history in the city but unable to see themselves as ‘insiders’).
Moreover, in an indirect way, this data showed how these students had experienced the
activities of the programme which involved an engagement with local art.

Many more participants182 in the experiment showed they had close ties with their local
culture. These can be identified as the ‘insiders’, because they showed a sense of
ownership in the city and of belonging to the local culture. Many were born in Curitiba

181 “Eu acho que a identidade visual minha esta relacionada com a identidade da vila que eu tenho, então
eu nunca tinha me percebido disso. Isso é até uma coisa que... eu sei lá... eu fui me apercebendo. Não sei
se por ir pensando a gente vai construindo, ou se realmente faz parte... do rural nessa coisa da
identidade visual.” (MS02, group interview) 182

182 The number of the students in the sample who could be linked to each identity position reflected the
total number of students involved in the programme.
and came from long-established families. Consequently, the history of their families is associated with local history, and the close ties they have with their family origins, customs and traditions, characterise the bond they have with the city and what can be called ‘local culture’. Some of these students had not had the opportunity to travel, and they stressed their attachment to parts of the city where some family members live/d, or in which they live/d with their family. During the experience of the programme, these students gave the impression that the whole town was their ‘home’. When asked where they felt most ‘at home’ in Curitiba, they mentioned the public places, and also referred to the local weather conditions which are factors usually highlighted by tourism and advertisements. However, the students felt extremely uncomfortable with the stereotypes of local behaviour and culture that are employed by people from outside.

Two students exemplify the attitudes of the group of ‘insiders’ in the following remarks:

“[Curitiba] is the town were I was born; my family has been living here for 40 years. Well, I live in the neighbourhood of Água Verde where there used to be a wood, so I like the town very much indeed. (...) I like the city, everything that I see, that I can identify as Curitiba, the people too... ‘Oh, curitibano is this, curitibano is that’. I don’t agree with this! Curitibano has its imperfections, it is true, but I think that it is not that bad. (...) When we began to carry out this study (...) of identifying this and that, of sculpture, of architecture, and so on, everything helped, I really began... ‘oh, this is part of the history of the town’... And I used not to look at it as a curitibana, how...could I? So this is a mistake in general education, why don’t they focus on the town?” (FS08, second individual interview)

“...I was born here. I grew up here, I have never lived in another town... and I wouldn’t like the idea of living in another town. (...) I like the city, I like walking around the city, I like my city. In spite of being a big city, it is still... it’s good living here. I see people...who move from the small towns complaining, while those who move from the bigger towns, like it, I’ve often noticed that. (...)

---

183 The altitude of Curitiba is 908m above sea level. It has a temperate climate, with 1500mm/annual rainfall, and average temperatures of 21°C in the summer and 13°C in the winter. It is considered one of the coldest places of the country and with the least sunlight. The people that were born and live there -called curitibanos- think the rapidly changing weather conditions (e.g. morning: cold and cloudy; afternoon: warm and sunny; evening: cold and rainy), and the frequent cloudy sky are characteristic features of the climate.

184 Curitibanos are usually regarded as reserved and aloof. Some people attribute this characteristic to the local weather.

185 “[Curitiba] é a cidade em que eu nasci, minha família veio para cá há 40 anos, então moro no bairro da Água Verde onde tudo era mato antigamente, então eu gosto muito da cidade. (...) eu gosto da cidade, de tudo o que eu vejo, que eu reconheço como Curitiba, as pessoas também... ‘Ah, o curitibano é isso, o curitibano é aquilo’ Eu não concordo! Curitibano tem defeito, tem, mas eu acho que não é assim. (...) Quando a gente começou a fazer esse trabalho (...) de reconhecimento, isso e aquilo, de escultura, da arquitetura, então, tudo isso contribuiu, eu comecei realmente... ‘ah, puxa, faz parte da história da cidade’... E passava batido para uma curitibana, como... pode, né? Então isso que é uma falha no ensino geral, porque não chamar atenção para a cidade?” (FS08, second individual interview)
I believe that it’s a bit confusing, this business about the ‘culture’ of Curitiba. Sometimes I hear people saying some things that I don’t agree with. Like: ‘Oh, curitibano is like this, curitibano is like that’. But for me all this is so relative. I believe that it depends on each person; there isn’t something like ‘since you live in this city you are like this or like that’, ‘that curitibano doesn’t talk to everybody’ (...)

There are things that I don’t really agree with, there are others that I agree with, like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...) there is not much sunlight, but when there is wonderful weather, we can’t complain. And even in the winter, Curitiba has amazing sunny days, do you know what I mean? Despite being cold. (...)

I don’t know if I identify myself very much with the local culture. I don’t like generalizing in this way, I don’t like this, but this way... I regard myself as curitibana. (...)

I like being a curitibana, I like it here, I like living here, I like... I don’t know if it is because there aren’t many alternatives, but this idea that curitibanos always visit shopping malls, or always visit indoor places, I don’t know if it is because of the weather... when it is raining, curitibanos don’t have much to do, as it rains a lot (...
private places instead (particularly the institutions where they study or work). When describing their relationship with the city or the local culture, these students tended to draw comparisons with other cultures, and believed in the stereotypes that were rejected by the students of the other group. Some of them stressed that they felt uncomfortable at being seen as ‘different’.

“I (...) am not from here. I believe (...) that the fact you are not from here and have moved here, means that from the moment you arrive you become a stranger, and are treated as a stranger. And when you are treated as a stranger over a long period of time, you end up believing this and you really become a permanent stranger. (...) I never felt I was a curitibano, I’ve been living here for 30 years and I don’t see myself as a curitibano, and what’s more I don’t like Curitiba, I don’t like it.” (MS04, group interview)

Some students of this group stressed that their concept of ‘cultural identity’ is not defined by the place where they were born or are living, since they are able to adapt to different contexts.

“I don’t feel like a stranger (...) but at the same time, I don’t (...) feel like a proper ‘curitibana’, do you know? But I don’t feel like a stranger either. I believe in the following: this is the culture of the place in which I’m living, it’s fine, I’ve adapted to... do you know, I fit in. (...) I was born in Santa Catarina, I have lived in almost every part of the country, you know I have moved from place to place since I was a child. Just (...) it is there in Mato Grosso where I believe that it is (...) the place where I... where I felt most at home, where I... when I think this way: ‘oh, my birth- place!’, do you know, I think of that place, I don’t think of the place where I was born (...) So, I don’t know if it is because... I don’t feel this business of being seen as different exactly, because I’ve spent so much time in this situation of being in different places... that I’ve ended up getting used to this situation of arriving in a place and ok, I’m at home, every place is a place... there are things that I think that just grow, do you understand? (...) Living in Curitiba suddenly changed many things (...) in my view, I’ve learned a lot of things, met so many different people and, seen such different things, I think that it is something that you bear with you, do you know? But this is not my place, so... this identity isn’t... isn’t mine.” (FS01, group interview)
Some of the students have spent a long time in the city but do not see themselves as ‘insiders’. Many of them were born and grew up in Curitiba and are the second or third generation of immigrant families. Some of them have lived abroad or have a strong desire to do so. These students are fluent in two or more languages, and maintain regular contact with the culture of their family origins. They have close ties with Curitiba, since this place is bound up with the memory of the history of their families. However their relationship with the locals can best be described as ‘functional’ since the contact they have with other inhabitants or ethnic groups, is based more on work and needs than on friendship. This was the smallest group among the students, but the most affected by the discussions on identity positioning and the local culture held in the alternative programme. Some had a mature attitude to these subjects, but others only discovered their identity position during their experience with the alternative programme.

[the alternative programme] showed me that something that I really need to look for is an identity. (...) It upset me, knocked me out [rapping the table to emphasize what he was saying], and showed me that I have to look for... that is something that... that I don’t know how... [rapping the table to emphasize what he was saying] that is something that I have to search for - this identity... this is because... the identity that I was part... something like that... is an imaginary part of something that doesn’t exist in reality, of immigrants... that I’m not here, nor there, in an identity sense... this became clear to me. (MS02, group interview)

lugar que eu...onde mais me senti em casa, onde eu... quando eu penso assim: ‘ah, minha terra natal!’

sabe, eu penso no lugar onde eu nasci (...) Então, eu não sei se é por eu não sentir essa coisa de estranheza porque eu justamente passei por essa situação muitas vezes de ‘tar em lugares diferentes... que acabei me acostumando com essa situação de chegar e pronto, tô em casa, qualquer lugar é lugar... são coisas que eu acho acrescentam, sabe? (...) Viver em Curitiba de repente mudou bastante coisa (...) na minha maneira de pensar, eu aprendi muita coisa, conheci muita gente diferente, vi muita coisa diferente, isso ali que eu acho que é bagagem, você leva, entendeu? Mas não é aqui o meu lugar, assim... essa identidade não... não é a minha.” (FS01, group interview)

189  “[o novo programa] me mostrou que na verdade eu tenho alguma coisa a buscar que é a identidade. (...) Me colocou fora, botou fora [batendo de leve na mesa para dar ênfase ao que dizia], fora, e då assim me mostrou que eu tenho de buscar isso... que é uma coisa que... que eu não sei como... [batendo de leve na mesa para dar ênfase ao que dizia] que é uma coisa que eu tenho como ir buscar essa identidade,... assim porque... a identidade assim que eu tinha me percebido... uma coisa assim... que faz parte de um imaginário de uma coisa que na verdade não existe, do imigrante... que eu não to cá, nem lá, num termo assim de identidade... ficou claro para mim isso.” (MS02, group interview)
6.8 Summary and conclusions

On the basis of the data collected, the experience with the alternative programme was generally successful, and proved to be a valid response to the problem identified, since the planned objectives were attained. Nevertheless, there was scope for improvements within the context of this research.

The alternative programme witnessed a growth in the students’ relationship with art history and the local institutions devoted to the study, preservation, and exhibition of art. The students displayed a considerable interest in studying art history once it was made available in a more accessible way, and combined with activities that focused on the art that was physically and culturally closer to their reality. Despite this, however, it was clear that the students still needed a general introduction to the main styles and movements of the history of Western art, in a chronological order, as, at times, most of them could not follow the discussions.

As some students pointed out, this gap could have been due to their previous experience of art at school, or to the conventional attitude to studying and teaching history found in Brazilian schools (in other words, a method that is teacher-centred, based on a guidebook, chronological, and designed to be factual). The persistence of these problems in the Brazilian educational system, has a bearing on how future programmes should be run. At the beginning of the course, students should be given a grounding in art history, as a valuable prelude to the art history course.

In view of the difficulties students have in identifying the main art styles of Western art, reproductions of masterpieces should feature prominently in lectures. However, the experiment with the alternative programme showed that the use of different kinds of media can encourage students to adopt a significantly active and critical position to the image. When large-sized printed reproductions were used, the students appeared to be more concerned about discussing their meanings. I believe that when the spotlight was on the students, they were indirectly forced to switch from the role of spectators to that of actors. In addition, it is likely that increasing the time spent on looking at the images, as well as using pictures of local works of art, enabled the students to become, the ‘owners’ of the images they were observing, and, thus, feel more confident about discussing them.
Although the students had difficulty in understanding art history theory and in working with different approaches to art, the research activities proved to be effective tools to encourage them to adopt critical positions while analysing works of art. Moreover, it encouraged pre-service teachers to seek the sources of art history. I noticed that the difficulties that many students had in understanding art history theory arose from their problems in reading complex academic texts in a critical way. In view of this, I now believe that all the important literature that is recommended should be read, explored, and discussed in the meetings, which would, thus become in-class activities (although this differs from what actually took place in the research). In this way, the teacher could help the students with their needs and ensure that all of them acquire at least a basic understanding of the theory that lies behind the activities they want to carry out.

As a few students suggested, some classroom exercises in areas similar to the research activities should be included in the programme. In this way, they could be better prepared to perform their ‘real’ activity, and the research orientation meetings could be based on more complex subjects.

The experience showed that although the subjects and teaching procedures selected were in tune with the context of the research, they were not always adequately exploited. This was because the wide range of features I had included complicated the teaching process. For example, the inclusion of topics on architecture and sculpture in discussions and activities was really important to improve the relationship students had with art history and their local culture. However, the change of procedures when carrying out research on these subjects, (such as the number of students in the groups), created unnecessary difficulties in class management.

Another problem was that my concern with the academic education of the students may have led me to exert undue pressure on them to obtain a better formal presentation of the results and this may have distracted them from the real purpose of the activities. In summary, all the subjects and teaching procedures selected were valid and significant. However, in a future programme it would be advisable to define the main focus of the course, and work out what should really be taught or recommended to the students, and at what level of importance.
Conducting critical appraisals of movies and paying visits to exhibitions proved to be valuable extra-class activities which enhanced the students’ visual repertoire, their contact with issues regarding the preservation of art, and their relationship with the local culture. In fact, the students enjoyed these activities, and, perhaps as a result of my request to write short reports, made a considerable improvement in their critical writing. Thus, in future programmes, more of these activities should be included to improve their educational effectiveness.

The discussions carried out on identity positioning were significant both for the education of the students and their preparation as teachers. However, they had several important implications. For example, the changes in the behaviour of the students both inside and outside of the classes, which arose because they were experiencing a crisis in establishing new identities. Moreover, the trust the students felt for the teacher when she engaged in a dialogue with them on the question of identity position led some of them, to see the art history teacher as their ‘mentor’ in educational and professional matters. They often asked the teacher’s advice about problems they faced as students and new teachers. Given the large number of students it was difficult for me to deal with these issues in my capacity as a teacher. Art history teachers should attempt to take into account the realistic conditions they have to face before they can assist every student. Their aim should be to guide the students to be aware of and reflect on the relationship between their sense of identity and the understanding they have of art in its diversity and history.

When I analysed the data collected from the students and the notes I took during the administration of the programme, I found that some students had been troubled by the changes in my style of teaching. There were striking differences between the students in their knowledge of local and other cultures, their degree of interest in becoming teachers, and their awareness of their identity positions with respect to different types and styles of art, although most of them shared a similar economic status (the majority came from a middle-class background). Analysis of the data collected showed that these differences within the sample were due to a number of factors, most of which could be attributed to the period of residence of the students’ family in the town, the degree of integration of these families in local culture and history, and the particular generation of these families the students belonged to.
Some of the data gathered on questions of identity was so surprising that it was clear that studying art history for some students had a different meaning from what I had initially thought.

Interestingly, the ‘insiders’ (students who have close ties with the local culture) underwent the least change during the programme. This may have been because the changes in the content of the programme included art from the local culture, and could be seen as glorifying their heritage and showing approval of their immigrant families’ decision to stay there and help build its culture.

The group of ‘outsiders’ (the students unable to identify with the local culture) shared the ‘insiders’ positive view of the changes in the alternative programme and some agreed there was a need to include the local culture as a key feature of the course content. However, this group displayed two distinct attitudes towards the programme. Some of them were against the idea of concentrating on the local culture since they thought the innovations of the programme would not allow them to integrate with other cultures when necessary. In contrast, other ‘outsiders’ saw it as an opportunity to learn more about the culture of the place where they would be staying for a short period of time. Despite these opposing viewpoints, everybody in this group appeared to be detached from the changes. The students appeared to see them as a situation which they could either accept or reject depending on their personal outlook on the events in their lives. They felt they had no right to oppose decisions made by the ‘insiders’, since this group is more closely attached to the local culture.

The third group, (students with a long history in the city who do not see themselves as ‘insiders’), was most affected by the changes in the programme. This group included the following: most of the students who were professional artists, those from second and third generations of immigrant families, those brought up in inter-ethnic families, those fluent in two or more languages, the inhabitants of places that were former immigrant colonies, and those with characteristics that define them as foreigners. These students showed an interest in learning about the local culture, and becoming integrated with the local people. However, they felt inhibited from doing this because of the traditions of their families.
The behaviour displayed by two students in this group, were of particular interest to me since they were diametrically opposed.

The younger, who had the experience of becoming ‘different’ in the home country of her family, showed maturity in the way she discussed aspects of the programme, both with respect to art history and cultural identity. The other, in contrast, despite being well informed about art history matters, was mainly concerned with the discussion of identity. In the course of the programme, he changed his physical appearance (hair-style and beard), and unlike the female student who embraced the culture of her family, he appeared to experience some conflict with certain aspects of his culture of origin.

The changes and discussions provoked by the new teaching programme appeared to be of greater significance to these two students than to the others in this group, and the discussions about cultural identity had a greater impact on them. However, although they fully embraced the objectives of the new programme, they seemed to be struggling with some inner contradictions. At different moments in the research, they showed that the characteristics of the new programme helped them to reflect on their identity positions towards art and its history, as well as the local culture. Yet, at times the way they reacted to certain educational activities and the different way they discussed the matter of cultural identity in the individual and in the group interviews, suggested that they felt they were opposing the wishes of the others.

These three distinct positions led me to reflect on the different stages of cultural integration of the immigrant families in a new society. As a descendant of immigrants myself, I realise that my interest in carrying out the changes and conducting this research could have arisen from something older than myself, and like the students I was moved by the experiment. This conclusion led me to see art history teaching in culturally diverse societies from a different perspective. The conclusions that were drawn from this observation will be discussed in the next chapter.
In the last chapter there was an examination of the results obtained from the experience of the students with the alternative art history teaching programme. The results of the practitioner research showed that the change in attitude to matters of local culture and identity positioning that were a feature of the programme raised some unexpected issues for the descendants of immigrants.

As explained earlier in this thesis, most of the students that took part in the research share the cultural characteristics of their region, and are second or later generations of immigrants. Thus, students are in different stages of integration to the local community, depending on the particular features of the ethnic group they belong to (e.g. physical, religious, and cultural, and whether it is a permanent or temporary migration).

This chapter examines the role education in art history can play in the plans of the immigrant families for social mobility.

**7.1 Immigrant families and an education in art history**

As stated earlier in this thesis, there is a general consensus in Brazil that art history should be understood as the study of the visual traditions of Western civilization (particularly European). This means that studying art history can provide people from immigrant families with a chance to acquire the knowledge of the culture admired by the wealthy classes in both their home and adopted countries. These families believe that apart from requiring the financial resources for this, they must also be able to master the cultural means of engaging in a dialogue with this social group.

There is a difference between the kind of art the immigrant families practise or have everyday contact with and what they study in school or see in art history books. This is because many teachers or authors of art history books regard the kind of art produced by immigrant communities as ‘folklore’. At the same time, the students from immigrant families in Brazil do not object when their culture is treated as something inferior to ‘high art’. There are social reasons for this since in furthering their families’ plan for
social mobility, they attempt to identify with the culture that they recognise as the upper classes their families want to merge with. The result of seeking to identify with the values and interests of a class whose historical experiences they do not share, is that they undervalue their own cultural traditions, and, what is worse, believe that there is only one ‘correct’ type of art (which, of course, is not theirs) and regard cultural diversity in Brazil as an exotic curiosity and not the social reality of their existence.

If one draws on Pierre Bourdieu’s (1973; 1986; and 1996) concepts, it can be said that when the immigrants’ descendants study art history, they are either consciously or unconsciously appropriating the cultural capital of their families. In other words, in neglecting the cultural aspects of their social origins, the descendants of the immigrants are respecting one principle of their social/ethnic group. In switching their preferences in the arts to the tastes of the upper classes/mainstream of society, they are not repudiating their roots but adopting a position that corresponds to what their previous generations had designed for them. It was the projects and actions of these generations for social mobility that had set them apart from the immigrant group. By acting in a different manner from their elders in so far as they do not speak the language of their ancestors, or like the same kind of art, or behave in the same way, or share the same attitudes (with regard to work, schooling, and so on), the young generations of immigrant families show that their family has achieved success in their plan for social mobility, even if it occurs in the adopted country.

Moreover, they are not opposing the interests of their families by learning about the art produced and admired by the upper class and treating the art created by their family and friends as folklore, but in fact, espousing them. It is in the social interests of the family to exchange their cultural capital (the knowledge, experience and social connections they have, as well as their taste in art) for the cultural capital that belongs to the upper classes. Thus, the descendants of the third generation in becoming ‘distinct’ have formed the pattern of a different habitus (thought, behaviour and taste).

The immigrant families know that economic capital is not enough for this change in habitus, and that a ‘bona fide’ cultural capital, obtained from formal institutions, like mainstream schools, can become an way of establishing an unassailable position among the upper classes. One way to fulfil this ambition is to obtain a formal education in art history in a school or university. It is even better if this institutionalised education
awards the student (and the family too) the certificate of an ‘art history teacher’. This is because it not only provides one with the necessary credentials to express opinions on the art produced by/for the upper classes, but also because it allows this individual/family, (recently accepted by the socially well-established groups), to express points of view which draw on the traditions of the history of the art created by/for the upper classes.

7.2 Changes in art history teaching and the emergence of identity crises in descendants of immigrants

The experience with the alternative programme helped the descendants of immigrants to understand that their interest in the arts and art history has been influenced by the ‘plan’ of their families to move up the social ladder (inter-generational mobility). They became aware that their role in this ‘plan’ is to go on changing their social status throughout the course of their lives (intra-generational mobility) by acquiring the cultural capital which is able to change the habitus of future generations. However, if by reflecting on their identity positions, the students become aware of their social and cultural contexts, they are faced with a dilemma. This lies in the fact that if the topics of study selected for the art history lectures depart from the canons of Western art, they will not correspond to the repertoire expected by the immigrant families, and thus not help them to undertake the social mobility desired by their elders. It was this that formed the basis of their identity crisis.

According to Kath Woodward (2002, p. vii) identity is something which ‘offers a way of thinking about the links between the personal and the social; of the meeting place of the psychological and the social, of the psychic and the society’. Identity is a social and cultural construction that is characterised by degrees of difference, in which individuals or groups see themselves as ‘us’ or ‘insiders’, and those that differ as ‘them’ or ‘outsiders’.

In discussions of identity, theorists commonly explain that there are different dimensions - social, symbolic, biological and psychoanalytical - in which each identity is rooted190. These studies of identity show that the process of identification occurs at

190 For an introduction to a discussion on the different dimensions of identity, see: Woodward (1997, 2000 and 2002).
global, national, local or personal levels, and that these dimensions and levels are sometimes in conflict. This is because the identities of certain individuals or groups contrast with the conventions of mainstream society and are stigmatised by them. This means that they have to adopt distinct private or public positions so that they can be ‘accepted’ and ‘respected’ by the wider group with whom they are engaged in a dialogue.

The demarcation of identities is often a cause of conflict, and maintaining the borderlines is complex because they reflect different understandings within groups that share a common existence, history and/or geographical locality. As a result, some individuals and groups lay claim to essential truths that could ensure the security and stability of their identities in times of conflict. On these occasions, physical appearance is often regarded as an important element in the inclusion or exclusion of individuals in identity groups.

Since identity involves recognition and the exercise of some kind of compartmentalisation on the part of those who identify themselves with a particular position, certain representational systems are needed to denote and reproduce identities in a symbolic way. Some of these representational systems have material bases, for example, social, economic, and political, and these underline or strengthen the importance of physical appearance. Many identities bear the hallmarks of a shared history. However, identity can be seen as something which is defined in historical terms, although some individuals and groups that share an identity argue that it is fixed and trans-historical.

In the personal sphere, individuals hold different identity positions; some are consciously built, others are shared simply by living inside a group or sharing some physical characteristics of the group.

Some students express pride in being able to state an identity position that is different from that of their family, by becoming university students, choosing Art as their profession, and living among people with different customs (e.g. tastes, behaviour, clothing, etc.) from those of their families. Throughout the experience with the alternative programme, these students realised that in departing from their parents’ way of life, they are unconsciously acquiring the social identity designed by them for their
grandparents. Thus, they realised that they are not really opposing the interests of their families but acting on their behalf.

At the outset of the research, the students that are the descendants of immigrants fully embraced the changes recommended by the alternative programme - probably because it provided opportunities to discuss the differences between the groups. They had always lived on the border-line between different social classes. Although they were educated in the *habitus* of the middle-class (that is, they were taught to play certain musical instruments, practice sports, and learn languages which were outside both the mainstream and the education of their elders), they lived in working-class neighbourhoods. Moreover, they had the physical appearance of their elders and were thus generally regarded by the mainstream as ‘foreigners’, despite living in direct contact with established or upper-class social groups. Added to this, they understood art and life in a different way from their elders and thus stood apart from the rest of their family.

They recognised that by discussing the local culture and identity positions towards art, the alternative programme was enabling them to become reflective teachers and this was important in helping them to deal with their own identities as well as those of others. However, they also became aware that an acceptance of the Eurocentric way of teaching art and its history, (something that they had sought before the experiment with the alternative programme), meant that they would be embracing their role in the plan for social mobility designed by their elders and fulfilling the dream of their families, - (something that they had formerly regarded as impossible). Neither of the identity positions appeared to be satisfactory to them as was borne out in the comments of one student that was quoted earlier in this thesis:

> [the alternative programme] showed me that something that I really need to look for is an identity. (...) It upset me, knocked me out [rapping the table to emphasize what he was saying], and showed me that I have to look for... that is something that... that I don't know how... [rapping the table to emphasize what he was saying] that is something that I have to search for - this identity... this is because... the identity that I was part... something like that... is an imaginary part of something that doesn't exist in reality, of immigrants... that I'm not here, nor there, in an identity sense... this became clear to me. (MS02, group interview)

---

191 | "[o novo programa] me mostrou que na verdade eu tenho alguma coisa a buscar que é a identidade. (...) Me colocou fora, botou fora [batendo de leve na mesa para dar ênfase ao que dizia], fora, e dai
Thus, before these students could become reflective teachers, who were able to deal with the different identity positions of others, they would have to adopt a new identity position towards art, local culture, their roots and families. Although this process is a worthwhile experience, it is individual, painful and complex. The students did not expect to experience something as complicated as this when studying art history.

7.3 Summary and conclusions

This chapter has provided a brief discussion about the role of education in art history in the way the immigrant families in Brazil planned their social mobility.

It was shown that immigrant families attach particular importance to formal education in general and especially in art history, a cultural capital that is needed for their social mobility.

The discussions showed that the changes in the study of local art that were included in the alternative programme and the opportunity they provided to reflect on identity positions, helped the descendants of immigrants to become aware of their identity positions. It also showed that changes like that can affect students' attitudes towards local and foreign art, the traditions of their communities in that locality, and their role in their families’ plans for social mobility. When facing these situations, the students entered into an identity crisis, and discovered that before they could become reflective teachers and able to prepare students to be critical visual readers, they must first adopt more conscious identity positions towards art, local culture and their roots. This was a hard and intensely personal journey for the students.

In conclusion, it can be stated that the changes incorporated in the programme were positive even though after reflecting on the identity positions, the teachers subsequently reverted to the traditional methods of art history teaching. Hence, even if they chose to use a more teacher-centred method of teaching, rely on lots of visual sources, and adopt
a Eurocentric approach to art, this decision was based on their own experience and they would not just be blindly following the kind of teaching they had learned in college.
CHAPTER 8 - AN ANALYSIS OF THE GENERAL DESIGN OF THE ALTERNATIVE TEACHING PROGRAMME

My observations of the results of the practitioner research showed the strengths and weaknesses of the programme and suggested a number of ways in which its design and structure could be improved. In this chapter, these improvements will be discussed under the following headings: educational goals, syllabus, teaching procedures, learning activities and assessment. In the final part of this chapter, there will be a discussion of the implications for practice that emerged from the analysis of the practitioner research.

8.1 Educational goals

The experience of designing and applying an alternative art history teaching programme for the education of art teachers led me to reflect on the role of the teacher when training these professionals. When I reviewed some of Schön’s statements (1987, 1988) in the light of the programme I had designed\(^{192}\), it became evident that art history teachers that work in teacher-training colleges must take account of both the personal education of their students and the volume of knowledge that will be needed for their prospective careers. These teachers should bear in mind that they are not educating either art historians or teachers of art history, but art teachers who will teach art history topics (among other arts subjects) when teaching art to children and young people. Thus, they should remember that their lectures should aim at introducing pre-service art teachers to a knowledge of art history and teaching them how to draw on art history appropriately when teaching young people in school.

This was one of the problems of the alternative programme I designed. My concern to make art history teaching an occasion for encouraging pre-service art teachers to reflect on their cultural identities and preferences, and thus more relevant to the field of art education, meant that I overlooked the main reason for teaching this discipline. Moreover, the students were asked to carry out certain research projects (such as Assignment 3, which required a structuralist analysis of a figurative painting of the Modernist period). These showed that what the research required from them was not of

---

\(^{192}\) See Chapters 1 and 4.
direct relevance to their prospective careers or personal education, although it involved an awareness of their limited ability to read visual texts.

My preparation of art teachers to deal with the question of cultural differences in the schools of South Brazil, raised issues about how identity is established and its representation in my art history lectures (see Chapter 7). The results outlined in Chapters 6 and 7 suggest it was a worthwhile choice, although it caused some serious problems because of the unfamiliarity of this question in historical studies. I felt that the students would have gained more if I had shared these discussions with other teachers who have been educated as psychologists or social scientists and that the discussions on identity positions and symbolizations should have been carried out in the whole college, and not been confined to art history.

Finally, in the light of the students’ recommendations to bring art history closer to disciplines such as aesthetics, I also began to speculate about the value of my ideas about education in art history. While the programme was run, I asked the students to give critical appraisals of exhibitions and movies, which were activities that were simple in their aims, structure and form. However, there was a feeling that these activities should be carried out in disciplines other than art history, such as aesthetics, because they require an understanding of art criticism that is distinct from historical analysis\(^{193}\).

### 8.2 Syllabus

Despite the changes I made to the course content in the programme I designed (see Chapter 4, pp.75-76), an attempt was made to maintain the character of the ‘survey courses’ discussed by McCarthy\(^{194}\). I was concerned to provide students with opportunities to study relatively neglected subjects such as architecture and sculpture\(^{195}\),

\(^{193}\) For discussions on art criticism in art education see: Geahigan, 1998, 1999a, and 1999b.

\(^{194}\) As explained earlier in this thesis, McCarthy defines the expression art history ‘survey’ courses as being ‘designed to acquaint the class with the major monuments of western art in chronological sequence, from the pyramids to Picasso’ (p.7)

\(^{195}\) As I studied industrial design for many years (high-school and an incomplete industrial design undergraduate course) and worked as an art history teacher for almost 6 years in design colleges, I have a keen interest in discussions about 3-D space. I have observed that the majority of fine arts teacher training colleges of Brazil neglect the special features of sculpture and architecture.
and encourage them to make contact with local art history. However, this process led to an excessive number of subjects being included in the art history lectures and the students were unable to cover everything.

The particular interest students displayed in studying architecture (see Chapter 6, pp. 107-112) can be understood from three different points of view. First, they enjoyed the experience of being tourists in their own city, and discovering that some of the buildings they had always liked were regarded as ‘art’. In addition, even though most of the participants were undergraduates, they preferred being more conscious of the physical world and practical ideas than making abstract interpretations of reality. A further point is that, since they were already familiar with the subject under study (architecture) and the method of analysis used (style theory), they felt confident and willing to demonstrate their expertise.

Thus it became clear to me that the study of architecture was one of the highlights of the programme I had designed. In addition, it aroused the students to feel a natural historical empathy with the epoch they were studying (particularly when the buildings were historical houses), and this made the process of doing research and studying art history stimulating. However, I believe that my use of terms such as ‘architecture’, ‘sculpture’, and ‘painting’ to distinguish the nature or genre of different works of art did not help the students to engage in discussions of contemporary art later. The use of expressions such as ‘two-dimensional works of art’ and ‘three-dimensional works of art’ are preferable in helping students understand the special features of works of art, in the real or virtual world, of past and present societies, and ‘pure’ or ‘applied’ functions.

My lectures could have omitted certain areas such as the ability of individuals to read visual texts and the materials and techniques used in the visual arts. However, I decided to include them in my programme, as my previous experience had shown me the difficulty students experience in following the lectures without a previous acquaintance of certain issues (e.g. levels of meaning in visual texts, and the peculiar features of certain techniques used by individuals or groups). Since the students only made a limited improvement in these areas, except in the area of vocabulary (see Chapter 6, p. 114), I believe that in future a different approach is required. I did not realise that it was inadvisable to attempt to fill in the gaps of the students’ art education. Problems of poor understanding and limited vocabulary among the second year students suggest there are
possible shortcomings in the basic theories of art adopted in the practical workshops in the first year of the course.

A further point is that the workshops on visual arts and the teaching of theoretical disciplines involving spatial arrangement (composition), and the perception of visual texts (gestalt), are not enough to bring students to the initial stage of visual literacy. As was demonstrated in the experience with the alternative programme, certain aspects of the art history course content can only be defined within the context of a broader discussion in the teacher training course. Thus, the main questions are a) in what year(s) the art history course should be taught, and b) how many hours of art history should be taught to pre-service teachers in art colleges.

In my view, art history should keep to the same timetable currently used in art teacher colleges of Southern Brazil. However, this subject should be taught in the last two years of the course, (following the students’ training as teachers), after the basic studies in the arts. In this way, the students would be given an introduction to the field of Arts by practising different ‘languages’ (e.g. painting, sculpture, engraving, etc.) and techniques (e.g. oil painting, stone carving, xylography, etc.). They would also become more interested in seeking theoretical knowledge in this field, and the discussions on art history teaching would be of more relevance to them since they would have teaching practice in schools.

Despite the difficulties experienced by the students, the programme should include discussions on approaches to art since this is linked to their personal education in art history. My observations of the students’ reactions to this subject suggest I had underestimated its importance and should have given it greater prominence in the programme. I only explored one line of argument in depth - the approaches to art adopted by art theorists that focus on the analysis of the meanings of images in works of art (stylistic theory, iconology and structuralism) (see Chapter 2, pp.34-38). This was because I thought students should experience these approaches when carrying out research on local art. As I am educating art teachers (not historians), I should have linked it more closely to the literature on art history, and the principal authors and texts in art history. It would have been better for the students to examine the different approaches from the perspective of art history, rather than experience their practical application in research.
The programme benefited the students by allowing them to make contact with real works of art, the places where they can be studied and the different ways of preserving them. Some of the students stated that they were not accustomed to visiting exhibitions in local museums and galleries regularly, although they were in the second year of a fine arts course (*Chapter 6*, p.120-121). However, art history teachers should bear in mind that writing critical reports of exhibitions is more the concern of aesthetics than art history. Contact with objects of art in museums, galleries or in the streets is important for everybody that studies the arts, and the teacher-training courses should introduce them to the field of art history. Group visits with the teacher to these places could replace individual visits. In this way, the art history teacher could clearly show the complex ways professionals approach the study of artistic objects, as well as the structures and systems adopted for the preservation, study, and exhibition of works of art. My experience as a teacher showed me that, apart from those who work as guides in museums, the majority of students from art teacher-training colleges in Southern Brazil rarely have the opportunity to witness activities related to the study of works of arts.

The use of chronology to display art history proved to be of value since students showed a need to study art history as a sequence of facts in time. However, some undergraduates had some problems in following discussions in which achronological sequence of information was adopted. This suggested that they still had difficulties in designing a mental frame of reference for temporal facts, which is one of the essential elements required in the teaching of history at basic levels of teaching. They also stressed that they felt there was a gap in their knowledge with regard to art styles and the styles of different historical epochs. However, this does not mean that art history lectures should revert to becoming traditional ‘survey courses’, but that a chronological sequence is required when introducing the foreign styles that influence local art.

The study of the local art of different epochs was of crucial importance in allowing students to reflect on their identity positions with regard to foreign and local cultures. Although local art is a neglected area, art history teachers should give it prominence in their programme. In my role as an art historian, I put students in contact with the local institutions and acquainted them with recent research that has been carried out in the locality. This is important to ensure more studies on local art are conducted and more teaching material produced. Finally, it was the interviews rather than the conversations
with the students about local art that enabled the students to explore the question of identity positions in greater depth.

It should be pointed out that the participants who had roots in a particular culture or cultures (Western or otherwise) did not show a noticeable interest in studying the art of their ancestors. This suggests that the acculturation process has had a strong influence, and that they have become alienated from their origins and might undervalue the art created by their family communities. Moreover, the experience with the programme showed that it should include at least one section introducing the particular characteristics of non-Western art and the related literature. This is because some students always show an interest in studying non-Western art (Indian art in particular because of their philosophical attraction to certain principles of that culture).

Comparison is one of the basic ways to study objects created by societies that are different in culture, place and time. However, the students showed some scepticism about the value of this procedure as a basis for their activities. The use of comparison as a means of analysing influences between cultures was important in helping students to acquire a visual vocabulary of local, national and international art. It was a complex task to construct this in my region because it was an innovative step. However it allowed me to avoid repeating subjects and heightened the students’ awareness of other cultures.

Finally, I devoted less attention to the question of how far teaching art history could be enhanced if it prepared pre-service teachers for their future activities, because I did not wish to encourage the students to carry out studies in this area. However, I believe now that research by the students into art history, should focus on the resources produced for art history teaching, especially when this subject is taught in school.

8.3 Teaching procedures

The experience with the programme showed that art history lectures do not need to become a ‘slide-show’ or a meeting for ‘reading books’. We live in a different society from that in which the discipline of art history first appeared, and the interest, time and perception of static images have changed since then. It was interesting to observe how students reacted to the use of different forms of media, and how they depended on
images and technology. They search for ‘high definition’ images but they do not create images of high quality\textsuperscript{196} and they use the media without thinking about what it means to them.

The constant changes I made in displaying images made the students uncomfortable. However, it led them to reflect on various factors including the following: the nature of the visual aid in use, the locality in which the lecture was taking place, the tolerance time for looking at an image as well as its source, and the influence of certain visual aids in the presentation of images. Although some literature on this question may be dated (e.g. Taddei, 1981; Tardy, 1976) and linked to theories about communication and information, or to technical education, these authors provide some insights that should be taken into account by art history teachers in their lectures\textsuperscript{197}.

After the experience with the programme, I realised that this kind of discussion should not be confined to art history teachers, although they could employ some of it in their teaching. A limited number of images is preferable to allow students to explore the meaning of the visual texts they are observing more fully. However, since the students wish to enlarge their visual repertoire of the arts, the number of images shown to them should be increased when the question of the influence of cultures is discussed.

As stated earlier in this chapter, a chronological study of art history helps students in their learning. However, it should be stressed that a chronological method of displaying subjects in art history and making comparisons between cultures to reveal foreign influences on certain works of art, does not mean that history must be seen as ‘the study of the evolution of art’, or that the local art should be treated as of less importance than that of foreign places.

As there was some building being undertaken at the college while the alternative programme was being run, some of the lectures took place in different classrooms (such

\textsuperscript{196} Some students experienced problems in displaying images of quality in their oral presentations and written reports. The definition, point of view adopted, and scale for presentation showed that certain students lacked skills in reading and working with images.

\textsuperscript{197} It is worth pointing out that although we are living on a world of images not much has been said about the use of visual sources on education (except the use of ‘new’ technology, such as computers and the Internet). A large number of visual aids have been produced and used in schools but their impact on learning has not been studied to the same extent. Many discussions have been carried out on visual literacy but not much has been said about the impact of the media on this process. For discussions on teaching art history with new technologies see Donahue-Wallace, La Follette, and Pappas (2008).
as studios, and seminar rooms). This caused some distress to the students and made me realise that the kind of classroom that could be the dream of any art history teacher (the chance to have a completely darkened room or to use all types of equipment to display images, etc.) would be the worst kind of place to teach art history to pre-service art educators. This is because the ‘ideal’ classroom would probably be in the form of an auditorium, and the students would be seated in a fixed pattern. The experience with the alternative programme showed that when using the different media, it is necessary for students to be able to view and handle these instruments in the space allowed by the classroom. Moreover, if one wishes to open up a dialogue between the students and the teacher, they should not be confined to ‘protective’ objects (such as tables). The shift from a teacher-centred to a more student-centred format was a benefit to the alternative programme since it led students to feel more confident in expressing their ideas and opinions.

Finally, the alternative programme showed that it is the attitudes of the teachers in the classroom towards the subjects in the study, rather than the subjects themselves, that led students to reflect more on the cultural and social positions of groups or individuals. Thus, I realised that art history teachers can help their students to become culturally reflective teachers more effectively, if they, themselves, display these qualities in their lectures rather than talk endlessly about it with their students.

8.4 Learning activities and assessment

The work on a selected bibliography was important to help students to increase their vocabulary in the arts. It also introduced them to more theoretical discussions on art history although this caused them some difficulties. Since their preparation as professionals is closely linked to the theoretical world, it is important that all the theoretical disciplines should encourage them to exercise critical reading; this is because, there is a natural unwillingness, in the field of the arts, to engage in theory. Comparative studies could be carried out in this process. A selection of texts written by different authors, from various places and times, can help students enter into contact with the literature in the field and reflect on the attitudes of different authors to certain subjects.
The video sessions and the visits were also of value since the students stated that these activities helped them to understand certain aspects of the contexts more clearly. More visits (as suggested by the students) could be planned, as well as class activities with videos. In this way, the art history teacher could draw the attention of the students to the peculiar features of the historical reconstruction of a film and the historical sources the producers were able to draw on\textsuperscript{198}. Moreover, the students can explore the distinction between static and moving images, and the interpretation of fine arts/visual arts made by the film industry.

As well as this, it is important for art history teachers to make pre-service teachers aware of the value of sources of art history in their prospective careers. The fact that the students had never visited museums before studying art history means they must be encouraged to visit art objects in the city while at university. This contact with the arts world was perhaps of more value to the students than the demanding essays they were set. Art history teachers must be aware that learning can be an enjoyable process even in higher education and that the results of an educational process cannot be quantified after the first contact with a particular subject.

Despite the interest students showed in the four assignments (see \textit{Chapter 4}, pp. 77-79, and \textit{Chapter 6}, pp. 107-125), I believe that they should all be redesigned. They were planned to complement the study units (regional and foreign art styles and periods and art under study - architecture, sculpture or painting - and approaches to art adopted by art theorists), as well as to assist students prepare to conduct research, become professionals (working as individuals or in groups), and carry out assessment. They were tough assignments for the students and I may have put more pressure on them than was needed. Since the purpose of art history teaching is not to educate teachers to be art historians, its aim should be to encourage them to make contact with their local culture and the sources of art history. Perhaps, only one activity, such as one of the assignments of the alternative programme, should be undertaken by the students at the end of each academic year, since they are very demanding. In addition, some short reviews of texts, works of arts, or exhibitions should be recommended during the term to help the students improve their academic writing and art history analysis, and some of these

\textsuperscript{198} For discussions on the relationship between film and the historical records see: Carnes, 1996; and Roquemore, 1999.
could be in-class activities (following the suggestion of the students) involving study practice with the teacher.

The question of whether activities should be carried out individually or in groups needs to be addressed, as well as how they conform to the best academic standards. In my view, every teacher should encourage students to make the best possible use of their abilities in a discriminatory way. Teachers are professionals that must develop the skills needed to work alone and in groups. Research activities should be planned on an individual basis to allow the students to employ their own skills in accessing different sources of art history and deciding on their priorities. However, the results should be shared with their colleagues. The art history teacher could form research groups with students studying similar subjects so that they can share their sources. They could also give a presentation of the results together with their colleagues, either orally or at conferences and thus bring about a discussion about what they have done.

Finally, the alternative programme provided evidence to show that the assessment of art history education in art teachers’ colleges is in urgent need of reform. Although reluctant to classify the students in terms of scores, I was still concerned about the results they achieved at the end of the activities. Art history teachers must devote more time to assessing the degree of engagement of the students with the activities and with art history rather than evaluating the results they achieve at the end of the study. This is because it is important to introduce pre-service art educators to the art history field and make them reflect on the proper use of this knowledge at basic levels of teaching.

8.5 Summary and conclusions

On the basis of my experience with the alternative programme, I believe that the following conclusions comprise the main implications for practice that emerged from the analysis of the practitioner research.

Art history is a theoretical discipline that requires both the ‘college-based’ and ‘school-based’ training of fine arts teachers. Although it should be included in the ‘college-based training’ syllabus of fine arts teacher-training courses, art history should be more closely linked to the ‘school-based training’ syllabus. This is because it is one of the
subjects that current educational legislation stipulates must be taught to students at basic levels of education.

It is the responsibility of art-history teachers in teacher-training courses to assist in the personal education of pre-service teachers, by helping them to:

a) acquire a visual vocabulary based on the critical observation of works of art of different genres (in particular, painting, sculpture, and architecture) and styles created by people in different places, cultures and epochs;
b) be acquainted with the work of art historians and understand their different approaches to art, the various sources they draw on and the kinds of publications they produce;
c) be familiar with the vocabulary of art history and the whole field of arts.

As well as this, it is the responsibility of the teachers of art history in teacher-training courses to prepare pre-service teachers to teach art history topics at a basic level, by encouraging them to: i) reflect on the teaching of history and apply it to the cognitive development of children and teenagers; ii) learn how to apply visual sources to teach art history in a critical way; iii) make a critical selection of works of art to be included in art lectures on the basis of historical knowledge.

Art teachers should acquire the following two abilities when they study art history, and the group of subjects which are of importance for their education should be associated with these skills: *a personal education in art history*, and *how to teach art history at the basic levels of teaching*.

A personal education for art teachers should include the following subjects in their art history lectures: a) different kinds of two and three-dimensional works of art; b) an introduction to the field of art history; c) the places used for the preservation, study, and exhibition of works of art; d) the work of art historians and what distinguishes them from other professionals that work with objects of art; e) the sources used by art historians in their studies; f) the literature on art history; g) the principal authors and texts on art history; h) the different approaches to art adopted by art historians; i) the vocabulary employed in the field of art history; j) the main styles of art created by people at different places and times and with distinct cultural understandings.
particularly those of the cultures that influenced local art); k) the main periods, styles, artists, and works of art of the locality

The following subjects should be taught to prepare art educators to teach art history at the basic levels of teaching: a) the distinctive features of the teaching of history and the teaching of art history in line with the cognitive development of children and teenagers; b) the literature on art history for younger people; c) research on art history teaching programmes; d) the different visual sources applicable to art history teaching; e) a critical selection of works of art to be drawn on in art lectures based on historical knowledge.

The art history teachers should make variety the hallmark of their teaching procedures. Different media for displaying images should be used and discussed by the teacher and students to avoid the apathy often associated with art history teaching, and to make pre-service teachers realise how aids and equipment can enhance the value of the images used in lectures. Art history lectures can be divided into different times, or there can be meetings of different designs to help students to be in contact with works of art and with the world of art historians (visits), or to engage in theoretical discussions on art history and its teaching (in-class activities). The class in which art history lectures take place should be designed to be as flexible as possible to allow students to be fully engaged in the different activities planned, but also should allow teachers to adjust the intensity of the lighting, with the help of visual aids, to ensure the images in the study can be seen more clearly. Since some students have difficulties in designing a mental map that can help them to understand the sequence of events in time, the study of art-styles and movements should follow a chronological sequence.

Art history teachers should concentrate on three different types of learning activities:

---

Among the undergraduates’ textbooks reviewed when undertaking this study (see Chapter 2, p.38-39), after the experience with the alternative programme, Poiton (1989) proved to be the best for use in art teacher-training colleges. Unfortunately this book has not been translated into Portuguese yet.

An introduction to the teaching of art history in accordance with the age and educational levels of younger people can be found in Addiss and Erickson, 1993, pp.134-147.

Since the 1980s, different kind of books on art history specially written for younger people have been published for school or other uses (Figueiredo, 1982; Janson and Janson, 1988; Proença, 1999 and 2005; Mange, 2000; Dickins, 2006; Saccardi, 2006), as well as, famous artists’ biographies of different natures (e.g. Bjork, 1987; Venezia, 1991; Sabino and Scliar, 2006). Despite the widespread use of these kinds of books for teachers in schools (particularly in Southern Brazil), there is a lack of studies and discussions on their educational value.
a) critical reading activities (mainly art history texts);
b) critical appreciation of works of art *in loco* and films and/or documentaries about the visual arts world;
c) writing activities on art history (short essays and annual research activities).

The critical reading activities should be planned to allow pre-service teachers to become familiar with the principal art historians and their approaches. Since the aim is to enable the teacher students to understand the peculiar features of each critical method employed to analyse art, it is advisable to adopt a comparative approach as far as possible. Thus, it is preferable to use texts that analyse the same work of art or period from different perspectives.

The practice of making a critical appraisal of works of art *in loco* and films and/or documentaries about the visual arts world, is one of the best ways for pre-service teachers to increase their contact with the world of art and its history. It is also of value in training their skills in reading visual texts of different kinds (static images and motion pictures). Apart from making the experience with works of art more pleasurable, these activities allow pre-service teachers to have a better understanding of the cultural background of these texts. The activities can also encourage them to understand how the place in which a work of art is exhibited affects the way it is seen and understood.

Writing activities on art history, like short essays and annual research activities, are recommended both to encourage student teachers to practise the use of appropriate expressions and vocabulary and also to improve their skills in describing the images they observe in words. The short essays would also be useful to help them to improve their skills in writing about art (using academic writing). The students must also show that they are able to carry out research activities every year. These activities are important to encourage pre-service teachers to find out about the sources of art history, practise their skills in working in groups (sharing sources and information with their colleagues) and conduct theoretical research.

If one takes into account the fact that the field of art history involves individual studies, the educational activities should be carried out by students on an individual basis. However, as their preparation requires group skills, the art history teacher should provide incentives for research groups to be undertaken, in which students studying
similar subjects can share their ideas and sources. At the same time, the teacher should also allow students to share the results of their individual activities with the whole group of students.

Finally, on the question of assessment, art history teachers should be aware that the evaluation of the process of students’ engagement with the study and their activities in art history is of greater relevance to the education of their students in teacher-training colleges than the scores they obtain at the end of the process.
CONCLUSION

The research findings show that a knowledge of art history and study methods are still very useful in educating students and enabling them to be more open and critically-minded in their attitude towards visual texts and their cultural roots\textsuperscript{202}.

I hope that the discussions I carried out with the alternative programme I designed have shown that art history lectures can be changed and improved so that they more closely reflect the current concerns of the teacher training colleges in preparing more open-minded and socially engaged art teachers. I also sought to make clear that these improvements could address the concerns of some art historians and art history teachers, without impairing the teaching of particular features of art history as a field of study.

I have also attempted to show how some of the problems commonly addressed in art history teaching, that have been well described by McCarthy (1978)\textsuperscript{203}, can be avoided in art teacher training colleges. These are problems such as the use of the chronological approach, the incorporation of too many topics in the lectures, and the use of certain visual aids that can often lead to students showing apathy. The problem of using the chronological approach in the teaching of art history, as described by McCarthy (pp.7-20), lies in the way it is employed, particularly when this is designed to show the supremacy of one culture compared with another. With regard to the art history survey courses which are usually run in universities, I expected that the art from different cultures would only be found to be of major interest when it had an impact on the local culture. Moreover, I thought that the time we should devote to their study in the lectures should vary in accordance with their relevance to the local culture. Finally, with regard to the problem of the art history lectures being described as 'art in the dark' or the 'history of slides' I sought to show that with the use of different media to study objects of art and with the appreciation of works of art in their real setting, students can become more engaged with their own learning process and adopt a critical attitude towards the objects of art they are studying and the use societies makes of these objects.

\textsuperscript{202} Particularly the changes students presented in perception of the social and formal discourses presented in visual texts (see Chapter 6, from item 6.2 till 6.5), and the changes in behaviour they demonstrated towards questions of cultural identity (see Chapter 6, item 6.7).

\textsuperscript{203} See Chapter 2, item 2.4, pp.41-44.
It was important to stress that we, art history teachers, must constantly seek for clarity in our objectives, particularly when designing teaching programmes for art history courses in teacher training colleges. We have to bear in mind that in art teachers’ colleges we are teachers of pre-service teachers and not of future art historians. This means that we should be attentive not only to the topics of our lectures but to everything from the prominence of the subject in the curriculum, to the procedures of the teacher in the classroom, since these can have a decisive influence on the attitudes and professional behaviour of future teachers. I hope to have shown that we must focus on the kind of professionals we are preparing both in mentality (e.g. whether they are open-minded, and committed to improving the social reality of their students) and in practical terms (teachers of arts that are going to teach art history among other art subjects). Drawing on Schöns’ statements (1987 and 1988) I hope I have shown that we must bear in mind what skills we should be trying to help students acquire, what kinds of knowledge and know-how our students require to do their future jobs well, and what type of education is most likely to help them teach effectively in the years ahead.

It has been argued that in making art history teaching a more enjoyable, worthwhile and empowering experience for students, we should design our lectures for real and not ideal students. We should take into account the fact that, for example, in cultural contexts such as those of Brazil, the culture naturally created and absorbed by Europeans is only a form of ‘literary’ knowledge to students in other countries. We should always bear in mind that students in countries like Brazil live in social groups, times, culture and environment that are completely different from those of the arts and artists found in the materials we sometimes choose for our classes. This means that the students lack the suitable knowledge that would make their learning of art history more natural and enjoyable, and that during the lectures the majority of them have to draw on their imagination rather than their memory or experience of history. Thus, I have attempted to show that in focusing their discussion on examples of local art and comparing them with those of other cultures, art history teachers are not only making their lectures more enjoyable to their students but also helping them to value and have a better understanding of their own culture. In this way, art history teaching in places like Brazil can change from being an instrument of acculturation to one of cultural empowerment.
A further point that has been underlined is that art history lectures can become occasions when student teachers can reflect on how far their preferences are rooted in their personal history. Moreover, they should be aware that their art preferences are not universal, that they can be changed whenever they wish, and that they are different but not inferior to those of others, as have been stressed by many researchers such as Chalmers (1996). Art history lectures can be times when art teachers can realise that if they wish to become individuals able to engage in a dialogue with other cultures, as well as reflecting on their cultural roots, they must adopt a secure position with regard to identity and, thus, be open to alternative influences without losing their own identity.

This study has attempted to show that any innovation in education can create a new set of situations and questions and that teachers must be willing to embrace the need for constant changes. Thus, the changes I introduced in the alternative teaching programme are not definitive, but part of a constant process of becoming aware of problems that should be avoided and improvements that should be made in lectures.

These changes require a great effort on the part of the art history teacher since (as stated above) it involves adapting to constant changes and reflecting on the question of identity positioning (with regard to oneself, authors, and students) and education (the education and training of the teachers). The voices of the students themselves have been drawn on to illustrate that this continuous process of improvement is not like the burden of Sysiphus, but really enjoyable and rewarding and evidence for this was provided in the fact that there were considerable positive changes in the students’ behaviour and that they became more lively and critical in the lectures.

On the matter of ‘listening to the voices of students’ I hope that by pointing out my mistake in not being more attentive to them before the design of the alternative programme, I was able to offer a useful example of what should be avoided. Although I believe that I achieved a satisfactory outcome with the improvements I introduced, I now strongly believe that if I had carried out an exploratory study with the students, such as that suggested by Paulo Freire’s Literacy Teaching Methodology (Freire, 2006), I could have obtained even better results.

Finally, this study has addressed some of my concerns, and those of my colleagues, about the failure of art history teaching to adapt to changes in society and colleges. I
hope to have shown that art history teaching can change and that there is no need to remove it from the curriculum of the art teacher training courses.

Thus, there is still space for art history and art history teachers in art teacher training colleges. However, other kind of art history teachers are now needed in arts teacher training colleges. This means having teachers who are more closely associated with history and the design fields than with the arts, as well as professionals that have a broader understanding of the role of images in industrial societies, and can analyse works of art from a perspective that blends linguistic and social approaches. As have been suggested by studies on art education and art teacher education such as Duncum (1999, 2001, 2002), Addison and Burgess (2000 and 2003), and Hickman (2005 and 2008). For this reason, we must become art history teachers who are willing to enter into a dialogue with other fields of study, like social sciences and education, and who are, above all, teachers engaged in discussions about the field of teacher education and concerned with the social implications of our activities in colleges.

**Evaluating the research work:**
**achievements, limitations, contributions and recommendations for further studies**

Although some of the changes advocated in this study are not innovatory and the results obtained not unexpected\(^{204}\), they can bring about a new way of thinking among art history teachers, especially if they were not educated as teachers but rather as historians or artists. This is because many of them had probably never been subjected to any method apart from that practised by traditional teaching or even considered art history teaching as a field of study.

The predisposition of art history (and other teachers of specialist disciplines that are largely taught in universities) to reproduce the methods of teaching they experienced when they were their students, can be attributed to the limited number of studies on education conducted at universities, most of which concentrate on discussing teaching procedures (e.g. Hayes, 2006), literacy or continuous learning (e.g. Rogers, 2003; Knowles, Holton, and Swanson, 2005). In undertaking the review of the literature that

\(^{204}\) As presented in Chapter 1, the argument for preparation of more socially engaged and critical teachers have been stated by researchers of the field of education since many years, and form the base of lines of arguments such as *critical pedagogy* and *multiculturalism*. 

161
formed the underlining theoretical basis of this thesis, I observed that many of the studies carried out in masters’ and doctorate courses on education in the last few decades, have been mainly concerned with addressing key educational problems related to the basic levels of teaching. Researchers have tended to ignore the education undertaken in university and as a result, there is a lack of studies on the nature of the learning of undergraduates. This is rather odd when one considers that one of the objectives of universities in providing masters’ and doctorate courses is to prepare professionals to work in undergraduate courses.205

Thus, although this study was confined to a small sample and a particular context, it was conducted in an awareness that there is a lack of studies in art history teaching, art history teaching in teachers education, and teaching in university. My hope is that one way this research may have made a contribution to knowledge is in revealing the urgent need for changes and research in art history teaching, particularly in teacher-training colleges, and the need to conduct more studies on the teaching of specialist subjects in universities.

Since this thesis was developed as a part of a bigger personal action research project my aim in the next few years is to undertake two particular studies.

One is a comparative study. The results of this research showed that some improvements are needed in the programme before it is run again (see Chapter 8, item 8.5, pp.153-157). Thus, I intend to carry out a research project similar to this with the improved programme and compare the results with those of this thesis.

Another study I intend to carry out is about to what extent the experience with this alternative programme changed the lives and attitudes of the students that participated in it. I believe that a future study based on the observation of the teaching procedures the students/practising teachers that participated in this research adopt when teaching art history would be of great value. It could also explore how the experience with the programme helped them to become reflective and culturally sensitive professionals.

205 Among the small number of studies published on education in universities that deserve attention are the following: Masetto, 1998 and 2003; and Vasconcelos, 2000. It is notable that these publications stand out from the main practical guides for teaching in college that have been produced for new teachers in recent years (e.g. Bain, 2004).
Since art history teaching in general is a relatively unexplored field\textsuperscript{206}, researchers beside me can extend this study in various ways. For example, a comparative research could be carried out into the teaching of art history topics in the visual arts teacher-training courses which are currently being offered in countries such as former European colonies. Designing and testing art history teaching programmes for different levels of teaching and educational systems could comprise further useful research in this area. Finally, a deeper study could be undertaken of the role education in the arts and its history play in the social mobility of immigrant families.

\textsuperscript{206} In recent times, a number of studies on the education of art teachers have been carried out (e.g. Vasconcellos, 2007); some of them include discussions on art history teaching (e.g. Bisognin, 2005), but much more still needs to be done.
REFERENCES


* Those references used in foreign languages that in this list have in parentheses their titles translated to English, have version or were originally written in this language.

164


Curitiba: UniverCidade.

UniverCidade.


Galimbertti, P. (2002). *O Caminho que o Dekassegui sonhou* (Dekassegui No Yumê-Ji):
*Cultura e Subjetividade no Movimento Dekassegui*. São Paulo: EDUC.


178


Towards a Critical Multiculturalism’, and ‘Border Disputes: Multicultural Narrative, Rasquachism, and Critical Pedagogy in Postmodern America’).


Novoa, A. (coord.) (1995). Os Professores e a sua Formação. 2nd ed. Lisboa:
Publicações Dom Quixote.
Oliveira, M. O. de and Hernández, F. (2005). A Formação do Professor e o Ensino das Artes Visuais. Santa Maria: Editora UFSM.
Palettes: Une série écrite et réalisée par Alain Jaubert. [On-line]. Available at:

Renascença’ (‘Introductory’ to Studies in Iconology: Humanistic Themes in the Art


Perrenoud, P. e outros (2002). As Competências para Ensinar no Século XXI: A


Paulo: Brasiliense.

London: SAGE.


Crítica de um Conceito. São Paulo: Cortez.

Paulo: Com/Arte.

Pinsky, J. (org.) (2001). O Ensino de História e a Criação do Fato. 9th ed. São Paulo:
Contexto.

and How Should We Teach It?’, in Rees, A. L. and Borzello, F. (eds.)(1986). The

ANPAP, Universidade de São Paulo. Available at:


Context of Studio-Based Art Students and Art History Educators. Dissertation:
Master in Art and Design in Education. University of London, Institute of Education.


Curitiba: Instituto Histórico, Geográfico e Etnográfico Paranaense.


*What is Discipline-Based Art Education?* Available at:
   Last accessed: 12th September 2003


b) CONFIGURACIÓN Y SIGNIFICACIONES LIGADAS A LA ESTRUCTURA PLÁSTICA. - 1) Forma (aspectos temáticos y signos que la expresan). Imitación, asimilación, recreación e invención. Originalidad temática, formal y su fundamento sensible. Fuentes en ambos aspectos.

2) Relaciones entre el espacio perceptivo y la función expresiva. - Marco de encierro - rectángulo, círculo, timpano, nicho, recinto, friso, etc. Relaciones de figura y fondo, de volumen y espacio, articulación con el ambiente. Correspondencia entre forma y formato, forma y materia, forma y estilo, etc. Funcionamiento de la ley del marco: deformación por exigencias estructurales. La Gestalt del cerramiento (por puntos, forma, color, valor, textura, dominancia, contraste, etc.).

3) Agrupamiento y formas delimitantes y de pasaje. Riqueza y unidad. Condiciones perceptivas del conjunto. Agrupamiento por semejanza de masas, materias, modelado, color, textura; por tensión espacial, ejes, contacto, superposición, entrelazado, proximidad, transparencia, resonancia; por temas, jerarquías, simbolismo; por simetría, coordinación, subordinación. Espacio visual ambiguo. Relaciones entre las formas dibujísticas, pintorescas y puras. Organicidad y abstracción. El dibujo, el espacio, el ritmo como expresiones de las relaciones del artista con la realidad.

4) Propiedades vectoriales (Whitehead) y tensionales (Mouloud) del campo visible. Mapa estructural y su función expresiva. Esquemas “tranquilo”, “alegre” y “triste” (Seurat). La composición: de la naturaleza a la geometría (Cézanne); de la geometría al objeto (Juan Gris). Equilibrio, ejes, centros, “movimiento”. El contraste como fuente de energía visual, haptica, etc. Exaltación y saturación. La incitación dinámica del ritmo - repetición, crecimiento. Proporciones de áreas, distancias, del ritmo - repetición, crecimiento. Proporciones de áreas, distancias, masas, volúmenes. Circuitos visuales. Aspectos estilísticos y semánticos del cerramiento, las estructuras nucleadas, desinminadas, gravitantes, flotantes, opacas, transparentes, abiertas, boqueadas, concentradas, dispersas, precisas, borrosas. Estética del soporte, el avance, el pasaje, la tensión, la gravitancia, la hapticidad, la textura.

5) La estructura cromática. Paleta, armonías descriptivas, sugestivas, simbólicas. Ruptura de la armonía cromática y su sentido en el arte más reciente. Clave tonal y su significado - factores de luz y contraste en el acto formativo. La estética formal del color (Hesselgren). El color local y sus variantes. Lo monocromático, lo acromático y su interpretación. Correspondencias con los sintagmas formales. Efecto de superficie; dinamismo del color: tinta plana, color modulado, perspectiva de color; color sedante, exaltante, agresivo.

6) La forma como imagen. La carga de sentido. El ser de la apariencia. La imagen como un “conductor” de lo real. Relación interna de la figura y el significado; su traducción analítica a las categorías del pensamiento: lo mental, lo sensible, lo mágico. La significación ligada a los sintagmas plásticos: aludir eludiendo; obrar y significar.

7) Significados e interpretación de la obra. Reducción de la forma al contenido como relación entre significante y significado. Los contenidos inmanentes y trascendentales de la forma.

* The names of certain authors and artists included in the text correspond to Nessi’s concerns and reflect how one can arrive at an approximate understanding of the expressions he was using.
APPENDIX 2 - TEXTS SELECTED AS READING ACTIVITIES
(GROUP DISCUSSION)


* The texts presented above between parentheses and in italic correspond to the title of the texts or books in English.
APPENDIX 3 - TEXTS SELECTED AS READING ACTIVITIES
(RESEARCH ACTIVITIES)


- Imaguire Júnior, K. (1993). *A Casa de Araucária: Arquitetura Paranista*. Thesis submitted to the award ceremony where the honorary title Professor for the Undergraduate Course of Architecture and Urbanism of the *Universidade Federal do Paraná* (Federal University of the Paraná State) was conferred. (A study of the history of wooden architecture in Curitiba)


APPENDIX 4 - INSTITUTIONS CHOSEN FOR STUDENTS VISITS
(CRITICAL APPRAISALS)

- Casa Andrade Muricy (an official gallery for exhibiting 20th century art)*
- Casa João Turin (a biographical museum that honours the memory and displays the works of art of the local sculptor, João Turin)
- Galeria da Caixa Econômica Federal (a private gallery of one of the national banks set aside for art exhibitions)
- Museu Alfredo Andersen [a biographical museum that honours the memory and displays the works of art of the painter, Alfredo Andersen (1860-1935)]
- Museu de Arte Contemporânea do Paraná (a museum for the preservation, study and exhibition of Modern and Contemporary art)
- Museu de Arte Sacra (a museum of religious art - particularly of the Baroque style of the Colonial Period)
- Museu Egípcio da Ordem Rosacruz (a private museum, mostly comprising replicas of Ancient Egyptian objects)
- Museu Metropolitano de Arte (a museum for the preservation, study and exhibition of Modern and Contemporary art)*
- Solar do Barão (centre for the practice, study and exhibition of different engraving techniques)

* Most of the exhibitions recommended included the collections of these institutions.
* In Curitiba, two government institutions are responsible for fostering and preserving art: Secretaria de Estado da Cultura and Fundação Cultural de Curitiba. The first is a sector of the government of the State that among other institutions combines Casa Andrade Muricy, Casa João Turin, Museu Alfredo Andersen, and Museu de Arte Contemporânea do Paraná. The second is a sector of the civic administration that among other institutions combines Museu de Arte Sacra, Museu Metropolitano de Arte, and Solar do Barão.
The aim of this questionnaire is to collect information to form a profile of your class. It has been approved by your course directors. All the information obtained from this questionnaire will be used for further research into the teaching of art history. The data collected will be made available to the public in a way that preserves the anonymity of the respondents. You may leave out a question if you do not feel comfortable answering it. The Questionnaire should take about 15 minutes.

Date: ____________________________

1 Have you ever studied art history before?

Yes □
No □

Orientation Point 01
How did you answer the question above?
Yes \textit{continue with this section}
No \textit{proceed directly to Question 2}

How have you studied it?
(If you have studied it in more than one way, rank the items below from 1 to 3)
(1 = more contact; 3 = less contact)

Through a book □
Through a short-course □
Through a module □

2 Are you a practising art teacher at present?

Yes □
No □

Orientation Point 02
How did you answer the question above?
Yes \textit{continue with this section}
No \textit{proceed directly to Question 3}
What kind of educational system do you work in?

- Formal public system (e.g. public schools)
- Informal public system (e.g. municipal workshops)
- Formal private system (e.g. private schools)
- Informal private system (e.g. private workshops)

Do you teach art history topics in your art education classes?

- Yes
- No

3 Have you ever pursued an artistic career?

- Yes
- No

Orientation Point 03

How did you answer the question above?

Yes ➔ continue with this section
No ➔ proceed directly to Question 4

What is your subject area?

- Collage
- Painting
- Drawing
- Photography
- Engraving
- Other

When was the last time you exhibited your work?

- This year
- Last year
- 2 years ago
- More than 5 years ago
- More than 10 years ago
- I have never exhibited my work
4 Is this your first university course?

Yes □

No □

Orientation Point 04
How did you answer the question above?
Yes → continue with this section
No → proceed directly to Question 5

Have you done any other undergraduate courses?

Yes □

No □

If the answer was 'Yes', indicate which subject-area it was

Arts □

Biology and Health □

Education □

Humanities □

Pure Sciences □

Where did you study?

Institution

City ________________________________

State ______________________________

Country ______________________________

5 Do you obtain a teacher's certificate?

Yes □

No □

6 In your opinion, art history as a subject should involve:
(Rank the items below in the following order:
from the most important meaning (6) to the least important meaning (1))

Teaching how to identify the internal and formal meanings of artistic objects. □

Teaching how to identify the meaning of the representations of artistic objects. □

Teaching how to use materials and techniques in the fine arts. □

Teaching how to identify an artistic object as a mirror of society. □

Teaching how to use the fine arts as a language to express ideas and feelings. □

Teaching how to recognise the most important art objects in the world. □
7 Where were you born?
City
State
Country

8 Where did you grow up?
City
State
Country

9 How long have you been living in Curitiba?
Since I was born
For 2 years
More than 2 years

10 Please complete the following diagram with information about your family's descent (or mixed
descent) (e.g. Italian, Portuguese, etc.):

Grandparents

Father's side:

Grandfather
Grandmother

Mother's side:

Grandfather

Parents:

Father

Mother

11 How old are you?
20 or younger
21-24
25-29
30-34
35 or older

12 What is your name?

If you think this questionnaire has failed to ask about a significant aspect of your art history education,
please use the space below to write about it.


201
1. Do you like the idea of studying art history in your undergraduate course? What periods, styles or artists do you prefer?

2. If you have any free time, how do you like to spend it? Do you like reading?

3. Do you speak any languages other than Portuguese?

4. Are you married or still living with your parents?

5. Could you please tell me what comes into your mind when looking at these images? (Looking at Figures 1 and 2 of Appendix 7 separately)

The following questions were included in the list above as soon as the problems with the questionnaire were detected, which happened before the beginning of the series of interviews. The questions below became the first questions of the interview.

1. Did you ever study art history before FAP? How did you study it?

2. Are you a practising art teacher at present? Where?

3. Do you teach art history subjects in your art education classes?

4. Have you ever pursued an artistic career? What is your subject area? When was the last time you exhibited your work?

5. Is this your first university course? Have you done any other undergraduate courses?

6. Could you please explain to me how you answered Question 6 of the questionnaire? Do you agree with the answer that you gave? (observing the questionnaire answered by the student)

7. Where did you grow up? How long have you been living in Curitiba?

8. Could you please explain to me how you answered Question 10 of the questionnaire? Do you believe that you are influenced by your origins in your everyday way of life? Is this influence reflected in your home, behaviour or food preferences?
APPENDIX 7 - IMAGES OF REGIONAL ART SHOWN TO STUDENTS DURING THE FIRST INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEW

Figure 1
_Catedral Basílica Menor de Curitiba._
1893, Tiradentes Square. Eclectic, Neo-Gothic style.

Figure 2
Erbo STENZEL (1911-1980).
Paraná. 1953, Height: 8m, granite, Curitiba, sculpture integrated with a monument in honour of the emancipation of Paraná from the State of São Paulo. Dezenove de Dezembro Square, Modernism.
1. Could you describe your relationship with Curitiba city?

2. Do you feel that you have any links with your regional culture? If not, can you identify with any other culture that you feel you have links with?

3. Can you recognise the cultural signs of the region which you have links with?

4. What kind of parental influences do you feel have affected your way of observing Art?

5. Could you please give me your opinion about the activities we carried out last year?

6. Did the art history subjects we worked with change your way of regarding your own culture?

7. Do you think that the art history theories which you have studied up till now, can help you in some way to obtain a better understanding of art and culture?
APPENDIX 9 -
QUESTIONS FROM THE GROUP INTERVIEWS

1. What is your opinion about the new art history programme? (the subjects, the
teaching methods, the sources drawn on and the activities carried out ?)

2. In your opinion what were the most important subjects studied and activities carried out in the two years of the organised programme? Do you believe that they could be useful for you when teaching Art in the future?

3. In your view, what are the most important art history subjects that should be taught to future art teachers in countries such as Brazil?

4. Do you feel that the activities carried out during these two years have, to some extent, changed your way of regarding your own visual culture? Could you give an example to illustrate this?

5. Do you feel that the art history lectures and activities we carried out during these two years have helped you to recognise some features of your own visual cultural identity?

6. Have you noticed if your relationship with the images has changed in any way?

7. What, in your opinion, could be done to improve the programme?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place of birth</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Place of residence (city/district) | Number of years spent in Curitiba |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ancestry</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>From father’s side</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grandfather</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From mother’s side</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grandfather</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Data from the Questionnaire |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluations:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01/ 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02/ 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03/ 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04/ 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02/2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03/2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04/2003</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Data from the first individual interview*

*Data from the second individual interview*