

Title: Challenges of Cultivating Critical Citizens in Hong Kong

1. Introduction

This paper attempts to offer empirical findings of the latest development of citizenship education in Hong Kong from the perspective of pre-service teachers. In the recent decade, citizenship and citizenship education have become an important topic on a global scale. According to the document *Rethinking Education* (2015) published by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), the international organization calls for a reaffirmation of humanistic approach to education, with one of the pillars being ‘learning to live together’, which stresses the importance of developing global awareness and appreciating diversity within the community. Despite Hong Kong’s cosmopolitan outlook, its implementation of citizenship education has been trailing behind its counterparts in the Asia-Pacific region. Owing to its colonial history and its unique political entity upon the transfer of sovereignty in 1997, the notion of national identity remains controversial in the past two decades. While the Chinese government has been eager to reiterate Hong Kong’s Chinese cultural roots, the emergence of an indigenous local identity, along with its allusions with the social development in the colonial years, constitutes an oppositional force and continues to make schools an instrumental battlefield in the development of citizenship education.

Liberal Studies is a compulsory subject under the New Senior Secondary (NSS) curriculum, which aims at promoting critical thinking and cultivating positive values among students, enabling them to become active citizens in the society (CDC and HKEAA, 2007, 2015). Nevertheless, the promulgation of Liberal Studies has not met without criticisms and controversies. Legislator Regina Ip Lau Suk-yee criticized the subject for being too focused on discussing topical events, lacking theoretical support as the over-arching theme for the curriculum. She called for a reversion of the subject back to an elective – as it was in the Hong Kong Advanced Level Examination (HKALE) syllabus (SCMP, 31st January, 2014). Meanwhile, another lawmaker Priscilla Leung Mei-fun lamented the subject for its emphasis on political events, which underlies an instillation of anti-Chinese mindset among secondary school students. She then

advocated the substitution of the subject with Chinese History (Yeung, 15th July, 2015). Departing from the conventional knowledge-based approach to teaching, Liberal Studies is taught with an issue-based approach, which involves the discussion of social issues from various perspectives, hoping to achieve a more comprehensive understanding of society before putting forward their arguments based on solid evidence. From a broader perspective, Liberal Studies also marked the watershed of the paradigm shift towards knowledge-based societies and life-long learning. Liberal Studies teachers are then assumed a greater role in developing critical thinking and reasoning skills among students as well as cultivating a sense of belonging to the city and its country through a cross-modular curriculum.

Given the novelty of Liberal Studies as a compulsory subject and its specificity in Hong Kong education system, the amount of literature devoted to this area has been inadequate; among the available studies, the majority tend either to focus on the macro level, addressing the area to the broader narratives of education policies and curriculum studies (e.g. Fung and Yip, 2010; Cheung and Leung, 1998), or to discuss the topic with exclusive reference to political transition and post-colonialism (e.g. Morris and Chan, 1997). Studies on the micro level, particularly at Liberal Studies pre-service teachers, who receive authentic Liberal Studies training in their undergraduate programmes, have largely been neglected. Therefore, this study aims to identify challenges of teaching experienced by pre-service Liberal Studies teachers amid the heightened political atmosphere in Hong Kong. This study is significant in two aspects. First, it helps to enrich the understanding of NSS Liberal Studies through the perspective of pre-service teachers of this subject, revealing how teachers devise pedagogies to promote critical thinking among students. Second, the recent heightened political atmosphere provides a timely opportunity to address the social conditions of schooling, exploring the impact of social change on the pre-service teachers in school settings. It is hoped that this study can shed light on the latest development of citizenship education in Hong Kong through the case of NSS Liberal Studies.

2. Citizenship Education in NSS Liberal Studies

Citizens are not born but created, which follows that the cultivation of citizens i.e. citizenship education necessarily involves the process of learning and socialization. However, academic discussions have yet to conjure up a consensual view on the notion of citizenship, owing to its intricate relationships with the cultural, social and political dimensions. As stated by Gearon (2014), the notion of citizenship does not materialize out of air but yields from the very experience of understanding and participating in contemporary societies. In terms of citizenship education, Hong Kong has taken a peculiar path and thus needs to be understood in specific socio-historical contexts. Such argument is most poignantly delivered by Tse (2004) who argued that the constant tensions between the British colonial government and the Chinese authorities have yielded a narrow definition of citizenship in the civic education curriculum, resulting in the making of ‘deformed citizenry’ among secondary school students. According to Tse (2004), the resultant ‘deformed citizenry’ was the outcome of a triangle tensions between the colonial government, the Chinese government and the Hong Kong citizens, which will be further discussed and elaborated later in this article. One of the implications is that the rise of the civil society in Hong Kong, coupled with the heightened awareness of a local identity, has effectively urged the Curriculum Development Council to revise the civic education curriculum in order to equip students with the necessary skills to cope with the challenges in the 21st century. Such transformation is supported by empirical educational studies conducted by Fairbrother (2005) and Kennedy (2010), who suggest that local students are becoming more eager to identify themselves as ‘active citizens’ with their critical perspectives on the social environment in accordance to the core values of Hong Kong society, such as rule of law, justice as fairness and human rights.

In another article, Tse (2010) has casted some hope on the re-introduction of NSS Liberal Studies in rectifying the ‘deformed citizenry’, tackling the truncated practices between the ‘macro-politics’ in the society and the ‘micro-politics’ in school settings. Through comparing the 1996 Guidelines on Civic Education in Schools with the 2007 Guidelines on NSS Liberal Studies, they bear striking resemblance in terms of cultivating citizens who can critically understand the characteristics of Hong Kong society and develop nuanced perspectives in relation to core values such as democracy, liberty, human rights and rule of law (See Table below), which reflects that civic

education occupies a significant portion of the NSS Liberal Studies curriculum and thus constitutes a plausible vantage point to probe the development of citizenship in Hong Kong, since the subject differs from other conventional subjects such as history and science, which are usually characterized with a relatively more identifiable content knowledge. As an integrated curriculum, Liberal Studies is characterized by its breadth and flexibility, which enables subject teachers to adjust their teaching materials according to current social affairs. Also, in terms of pedagogy, students are encouraged to analyze social issues from multiple perspectives, allowing them to understand the values and beliefs embedded in the stakeholders and critically evaluate the validity of their arguments. Ultimately, Liberal Studies aims at cultivating students' generic skills rather than implanting a specific stock of knowledge. Such sensitivity to social changes will facilitate the pulse-tapping of adolescent citizenry and offer more empirically-informed findings for further analysis. Against the backdrop of post-colonial Hong Kong and the tensions in citizenship education, this paper attempts to answer the following questions:

- (1) What are the difficulties and challenges encountered by pre-service Liberal Studies teachers during their teaching practices?
- (2) How does the critical pedagogical principles help mediate the tensions of citizenship education in Hong Kong?

Table: Comparison between Civic Education and NSS Liberal Studies (Extract)

1996 Guidelines on Civic Education	2007 Guidelines on Liberal Studies
1. To enable students to understand how the individual, as a citizen, relates to family, the neighbouring community, the regional community, the national community and the world; and to develop in them <i>positive attitudes and values</i> conducive to the development of a sense of belonging to Hong Kong and China	To enhance students' understanding of themselves, their society, their nation, the human world and the physical environment; To enable students to develop multiple perspectives on perennial and contemporary issues in different contexts (e.g. cultural, social, economic, political and technological contexts);
2. To help students understand the characteristics of Hong Kong society, and the importance of democracy, liberty, equality, human rights and rule of law.	To develop in students a range of skills for life-long learning, including <i>critical thinking</i> skills, creativity, problem-solving skills,

<p>3. To develop in students <i>critical thinking</i> dispositions ... to analyze social and political issues ... and arrive at a rational appraisal of these issues.</p>	<p>communication skills and information technology skills;</p> <p>To help students appreciate and respect diversity in cultures and views in a pluralistic society and handle conflicting values; and</p> <p>To help students develop <i>positive values and attitudes</i> towards life, so that they can become informed and responsible citizens of society, the country and the world.</p>
---	---

Source: CDC (1996); HKEAA and CDC (2007) [Emphasis added]

3. Social Conditions of Schooling

The role of teachers has undergone tremendous changes over the past few decades. One of the recent paradigm shifts could be traced back to the millennium when the educators called for a shift from teacher-centred learning to student-centred learning. This change implies that teachers are no longer perceived as knowledge dispensers; rather they are regarded as facilitators of students' learning. According to Hargreaves (1994), the previous direct-teaching model was developed out of economic needs in the post-war period. Back then, many countries were on the course of reconstruction, which required a substantial amount of manpower in the long run. Birth rates were rising in response to that projection and it brought along the development of schooling system, and its primary function was to socialize the young into the ways of mainstream culture and equip them with the necessary vocational skills so as to meet the needs of the labour market (Jenlink, 2014). Thus, teachers become a key constituent in the schooling system to help the young realize their life goals in relation to the expanding economy. Nevertheless, the economic agenda of education began to lose its credibility when the global economy reached its peak in the 1980s and started to recede after a few decades of prosperity. The shift from labour-intensive industries to knowledge-based economies compelled the government officials as well as academic scholars to confront the pitfalls of the existing public schooling system, which was criticized for encouraging conformity, compliance and maintaining social inequality.

Meanwhile, the education for social justice agenda began to gain currency, which is evident from the "Education for All" campaign initiated by UNESCO in 1990.

Education, with its literal meaning of ‘leading the people to better than before’, came to be realized as the key to fighting against poverty and achieving social justice. In this regard, the role of schools has switched from being conservative to being transformative. Such change is partly attributed to the prevalence of knowledge-based economies, where growing proportions of jobs require specialized knowledge and post-secondary education. The other part of the change is triggered by the need of cultivating future leaders who can challenge existing social structures and bring about a more equitable society (Bell, 2007). As Astuto (1994), puts it, ‘the schools are active participants in the reconstruction and reinvention of a more effective social order’ (p.23).

4. Liberal Studies and the Politics of Education

The controversy of Liberal Studies is only tip of the iceberg when it comes to the larger dynamics of political transition and citizenship education. Dated back to the post-war period, citizenship education took the form of ‘Social Studies’ (1953-1996) in primary education and ‘Civics’ (1942-1965) – later to become ‘Economics and Public Affairs’ in junior secondary education. (Tse, 2010). These subjects inclined to provide mere background knowledge regarding the social development of Hong Kong. In other words, citizenship education was only achieved at a rather superficial level; discussions of political issues and cultivation of civic virtues were largely downplayed. Nevertheless, negotiations between the British colonial government and the Chinese authorities in the 1980s raised concerns regarding the future of Hong Kong among the public. Citizenship education, upon the transfer of sovereignty, became one of the acute issues to be addressed in the agenda of education policies.

Education is always connected with politics. While NSS Liberal Studies, at its early stages of promulgation, was regarded as another milestone of advocating active citizenship education in response to the emergence of knowledge societies and the significance of life-long learning, Scott (2000) argues that the liberal constituents in Liberal Studies, including critical thinking and independent learning, are fundamentally in tension with the maintenance of the state. Through illustrating a ‘disarticulated’ political system in Hong Kong, he revealed the conservative agenda from the government, which accounted for the gaps between the policymakers and their implementation in schools. Framed in the dynamics of de-colonization and re-

sinicization (Tse, 2010), Liberal Studies is then placed at the very heart of various threads of political struggles for cultivating students as critical citizens to challenge mainstream social values and beliefs.

Aside from the citizenship education narrative, the increasing dissatisfactions with the political development of Hong Kong among the citizens also correspond to the post-materialist shift of social values (Wong and Wan, 2009). Inglehart's modernization theory (1997) argues that value conflicts served as an instrumental drive for social development, in which young people, who grew up in the period of economic prosperity and social stability, tend to develop a different world view than their previous generations and are inclined to embrace values such as human rights, civil liberty and democracy. The phenomenon of youth political activism has been evident from the emergence of new waves of social movements over the last decade, including the Anti-Express Rail Link in 2010, the Anti-Moral and National Education campaign in 2012 and, more recently, the Occupy Movement (also known as the Umbrella Movement) in 2014.

5. Critical Pedagogy for Teacher Identity Development

In this regard, the emergence of critical pedagogy can be interpreted as the response to the factory model of teaching and the persistence of social inequalities worldwide. One of the central tenets of critical pedagogy is to perceive schools as agents of change. Scholars such as Giroux (2011) recognizes the potential of schools being a public space constructed for teachers and students to interrogate mainstream ideologies, unsettle common-sensical assumptions and realize the historical contingency of forms of knowledge. In following Giroux's footsteps, Danielewicz (2014) proposes that the essence of becoming a teacher lies in the mastery of pedagogy, which happens to be the key to the construction of teachers' professional identities. Distinguished from simply methods which are de-contextualized practices that seem to be transferrable to other teachers, she conceives pedagogy as 'ways of structuring activities and conditions that facilitate student learning' (p. 15). Identities, as she further argues, are not fixed or unified entities inside individuals, achieved moment by moment in the course of establishing relations between individuals; rather they are the representations of

recognizable selves at critical junctures.

Therefore, Danielewicz (2014) advocates for a critical pedagogy comprising of ten principles, of which two of them are of particular relevance to this study, given the nature of NSS Liberal Studies as an inter-disciplinary humanities subject that aims to cultivate students as critical citizens (CDC and HKEAA, 2015). The first one is *deliberation*, which refers to teachers selecting elements of habits and impulses according to the characteristics of class and predicting their responses to address learning outcomes. The second principle is *reflexivity*, which points to the propensity of a teacher to review his or her performances in order to achieve a deepened understanding of himself or herself in relation to the critical moments of teaching. Danielewicz makes a clear discernment between reflection and reflexivity. While the former may be casually regarded as quiet thinking with no inherent critical function, reflexivity involves a person's 'active analysis of past situations with the explicit purpose of attaining an understanding that can lead to changes in thought or behaviour' (p.155).

6. Methodology

In this study, qualitative methods will be employed. As teaching concerns the totality of the learning experiences between teachers and students, conventional methods such as semi-structured interviews may not be adequate in capturing the essence of tension and negotiation encountered by teachers. As an alternative, 'dialogues of enquiry' happen to be a suitable method to explore the inner landscape of student-teachers. According to Kwo (2004), dialogues of enquiry involve the participants recounting their critical incidents, in which they come across situations that challenge their beliefs and values. Resembling the nature of narratives, which are defined as 'sequence of events into a whole so that the significance of each event can be understood through its relation to that whole' (Elliot, 2005, p.3), these incidents thus pave the foreground for deeper reflexive practices so as to incur a heightened awareness and deeper understanding of the events.

6.1 Data Collection

The data will be drawn from the final-year cohort of the Bachelor of Education (Liberal Studies) programme at the University of Hong Kong. A total of four students, three women and one man, will be invited to engage in two rounds of dialogues of enquiry with the researcher to explore their journey of undertaking teaching education and to recount their struggles throughout their previous teaching practicum. The real names of the interviewees will be kept confidential and pseudonyms will be used. The dialogues will be audibly recorded and transcribed into word form.

6.2 Data Analysis

The stories collected from the dialogues of enquiry will be analyzed according to the pedagogy for identity development framework as suggested by Danielewicz (2014). First, difficulties and challenges that invoked reflections from the interviewees are identified by the researcher, followed by sorting them into common themes. Second, the themes are then analyzed according to the two pedagogical principles, namely deliberation and reflexivity, to reveal their strategies in executing the citizenship component of NSS Liberal Studies. Third, such negotiations are then discussed in accordance to the broader perspectives of citizenship education development.

7. Findings and Discussions

It is prevalent for student-teacher to acclimatize themselves with the schooling conditions and such adaptations are commonly referred to as pragmatic repositioning (Ball and Goodson, 1985), which involves educational practitioners making settlements in face of the tension between their personal pedagogies and changes in education policies. As in the case of Hong Kong, Liberal Studies is positioned as an audacious attempt to depart from subject knowledge-based teaching to promote critical thinking within a cross-modular curriculum. The four pre-service teachers – Olivia, Carol, Natalie and David – despite the challenges from disciplinary issues and the lack of criticality among students, employed various strategies to negotiate with these tensions, through which they embraced the ideals of life-long learning and uphold the integrity of teachers.

7.1 Challenges: Students' Lack of Criticality

According to the Curriculum and Assessment Guide (CDC and HKEAA, 2015), generic skills are fundamental and transferrable attributes which facilitate the acquisition of knowledge across different learning situations, of which critical thinking skills are listed as one of the essential abilities. Nevertheless, the data collected from the interviewees noted a general lack of criticality among the students. In other words, just because this generation of students are becoming more connected to the Internet does not necessarily mean they are more critical. Such weakness among the students was best captured by David,

“Let’s say for a phenomenon to occur, the order should be A leads to B, then to C, lastly to D. Most students simply just made hasty conclusions by jumping from A to D.”

(David)

David noted that his students might be coming across a lot of news information, but most of them obtained merely a superficial understanding of the social issues. This was revealed by several occasions of misquotes from the students due to inaccurate information. For instance, when David talked about political parties in Hong Kong, which falls under the module ‘Hong Kong Today’, most of the students knew about the Democratic Party, but they were unable to name its corresponding lawmakers in the Legislative Council. Some of them even mistook Jasper Tsang Yuk-shing, chairman of the Legislative Council, as a member of that party, but in fact he is from the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong. Such scenarios were also experienced by Natalie, who across students giving brief stances without the intention to further elaborate, which cost her extra efforts to probe their ideas. It is a common practice that discussions of social issues necessitate a sufficient understanding of the background information, and, owing to the issue-enquiry nature of Liberal Studies, such occurrences are expected to pose great challenges to Liberal Studies teachers in general as they have to devote extra efforts in ensuring that students have been acquainted with accurate information, before engaging in open discussions.

7.2 Mediating the Challenges: Deliberate Questioning

In view of students’ general weakness in critical thinking skills, most of the interviewed student-teachers perceived their role as facilitating the development of arguments.

Natalie pointed out that the students were generally weak in showcasing analysis from multiple perspectives when discussing when analyzing social issues. In light of this, she relied on the use of questioning skills in order to sustain the conversation (Lai and Lam, 2011). The following excerpt from Natalie's recount best illustrated the scenario:

Teacher: In the District Council elections, why did some of the veteran candidates lost to young political figures?

Students: Because they all belong to the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Development of Hong Kong (DAB)!

Teacher: What is so special about this party?

Students: They often secure votes through bribery and material rebates (蛇齋餅粽)!

Teacher: Then why did these material rebates work in the past?

Students: (momentary silence, with some puzzled faces)

(Natalie)

Through a series of follow-up questions, Natalie deliberately followed the logic of students, which eventually led to a dead-end – what accounted for the different election results if the DAB were to use to same methods to secure votes? Her intention was not to silence the students to establish teacher authority; rather it was to open up spaces for discussion, guiding them to compare the demography between the elder voters and young voters, thus revealing the factors affecting socio-political participation. The case of Natalie revealed a very typical scenario in a Liberal Studies lesson – critical thinking is developed through challenging take-for-granted claims in the public sphere (Anderson, Howe, Soden, Halliday and Low, 2001). Eschewing from making judgmental statements on student responses, Natalie intentionally played the role of a genuine person who intellectually co-walked with the students and invited students to elaborate more on their answers, which echoed with the fact that questioning encourages students to reflect on their own logic of thinking and thus increase engagement in class (Cotton, 2001).

7.3 Mediating the Challenges: Recognizing Marginal Voices

Educator Parker Palmer (1997) has always emphasized the importance of passion in teaching, as he famously puts, “good teaching cannot be reduced to technique; good

teaching comes from the identity and integrity of the teacher.” (p.10). When it comes to identity and integrity, he refers to teachers’ capacity for connectedness, advocating pedagogies that acknowledge the teaching self and, at the same time, inspire other selves among the students. This is in line with the notions of democratic education (Freire, 1970), in which principles of democracy, including the respect for minority rights, are practiced in the very fabric of school life. As for the four student-teachers, they have come to realize the impact on students when explicit connections between classroom activities and democratic principles were drawn during their teaching practices.

Natalie realized that, when discussing controversial social issues, most students were inclined to reside with a particular stance, and those students who held different views would be immediately bombarded with ferocious criticisms. On one occasion, when she was discussing the topic of socio-political participation using the issue of the Occupy Movement, the majority of students viewed that the incident affected Hong Kong negatively, citing examples ranging from aggravated traffic congestion to the loss of business in the retail industry. During group discussion, Natalie found that, in one of the groups, a student secretly told her that he had a different view in mind, but was too afraid to voice out his opinions. In face of the populist sentiments, Natalie decided to take the students’ view and presented his ideas anonymously as a dissenting view, stimulating the students to think from alternative perspectives. Knowing that her comments might be received with hostility, her courage to be the villain exemplified how she utilized her teacher authority to bring marginalized voices back to the picture, which affirmed the significance of analyzing issues from multiple perspectives and honoured her aim of cultivating mutual respect among students – one of the positive values promulgated by the Curriculum and Assessment Guide (CDC and HKEAA, 2015).

8. Conclusion and Implications

This study aims to identify the difficulties and challenges experienced by pre-service Liberal Studies teachers amid the heightened political atmosphere in Hong Kong. Through engaging in critical dialogues with four student-teachers, it was revealed that

teaching practicum allowed them to immerse into the authentic school environment and experience the complexity of teachers' work. Challenges revealed a lack of criticality among the students, manifested in forms of misquoted information and the populist sentiments mirrored from mainstream media, establishing a rather mixed relationship between media exposure and critical thinking. Nevertheless, such difficulties have not deterred the pre-service teachers from challenging take-for-granted assumptions and cultivating criticality among their students. The enquiry-based nature of Liberal Studies, alongside with its emphasis on criticality, offered opportunities for teachers to challenge students' habit of mind and develop their reasoning skills through deliberation as a pedagogical principle. Their unflinching endeavours to encourage student participation underlay their bon fide passion for teaching, their vision to cultivate virtues such as empathy and mutual respect among students, and to promote the attitudes of critical citizens in the future. The dynamics of social change, to a certain extent, have made teaching Liberal Studies a challenging task, but these difficulties compelled the teachers to engage in reflexive practices in accordance to the notions of critical thinking and civic education, which enabled them to navigate their directions amidst the competing discourses regarding the social role of teachers. Therefore, the case of Liberal Studies pre-service teachers has offered a nuanced account of how the modern-day teachers negotiate with the tensions of citizenship education through critical pedagogy, which comprises of the interplay of skills, reflexivity and, ultimately, passion.

It is acknowledged that this study draws from a relatively small sample of pre-service teachers and may run the risk of over-generalization. Also, the exclusive focus on the perspective of pre-service teachers implies that most of the stories told are derived from the personal recalls of the interviewees without verification from other sources, which may cast doubts on the credibility of their statements. Moreover, this study tends to neglect other factors such as classroom dynamics, school culture, colleagues' rapport and students' responses. Nevertheless, it is hoped that this study, to a certain extent, is able to shed light on the inner landscape of pre-service Liberal Studies teachers in Hong Kong, understanding how teachers negotiate with the tensions of citizenship education through various critical pedagogical principles and democratic education practices. Drawing from this research, it is implied that further research focusing on the teaching dynamics of Liberal Studies lessons and the students' responses, as well as studies on

the empirical relationship between media consumption habits among secondary school students are suggested in order to generate a more comprehensive picture on the extent to which Liberal Studies has promoted critical thinking and civic virtues under the New Senior Secondary Curriculum.

Accepted Manuscript

References

- Astuto, T.A. (1994), *Roots of Reform: Challenging the Assumptions That Control Change in Education*.
- Ball, S.J. and Goodson, I.F. (1985), Understanding teachers: Concepts and contexts, *Teachers' lives and careers*, pp.1-26.
- Bell, L.A. (2007), Theoretical foundations for social justice education, *Teaching for diversity and social justice*, 2, pp.1-14.
- Cheung, C.K. and Leung, M. (1998), From civic education to general studies: the implementation of political education into the primary curriculum. *Compare*, 28(1), pp.47-56.
- Cotton, K. (2001), Classroom questioning, *School improvement research series*, 3.
- Curriculum Development Council (CDC) (1996), *Guidelines on Civic Education in Schools*. Curriculum Development Committee, Hong Kong.
- Curriculum Development Council and Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (CDC and HKEAA). (2007). *Liberal Studies curriculum and assessment guide (Secondary 4 – 6)*, Government Logistics Department, Hong Kong.
- Curriculum Development Council and Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (CDC and HKEAA). (2015). *Liberal Studies curriculum and assessment guide (Secondary 4 – 6)*, Government Logistics Department, Hong Kong.
- Danielewicz, J. (2014), *Teaching selves: Identity, pedagogy, and teacher education*, SUNY Press.
- Elliot, J. (2005), *Using Narrative in Social Research: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*, SAGE Publications.
- Fairbrother, G.P. (2005), Power and right in Hong Kong's citizenship education. *Citizenship Studies*, 9(3), pp.293-308.
- Fung, C. and Yip, W. (2010), The policies of reintroducing Liberal Studies into Hong Kong secondary schools, *Educational research for policy and practice*, 9(1), pp.17-40.
- Gearon, L. (2014), *Learning to teach citizenship in the secondary school: A companion to school experience*. Routledge.

- Hargreaves, A. (1994). *Changing teachers, changing times: Teachers' work and culture in the postmodern age*, Teachers College Press.
- Inglehart, R. (1997), *Modernization and postmodernization: Cultural, economic, and political change in 43 societies*, Princeton University Press.
- Jenlink, P.M. (ed.) (2014), *Teacher identity and the struggle for recognition: Meeting the challenges of a diverse society*, R&L Education.
- Kennedy, K.J. (2010), Young citizens in Hong Kong: obedient, active and patriotic?. *Social Psychology of Education*, 13(1), pp.111-127.
- Kwo, O.W. (2004), Understanding the awakening spirit of a professional teaching force, *International Journal of Educational Research*, 41(4), pp.292-306.
- Lai, E. and Lam, C.C. (2011), Learning to teach in a context of education reform: liberal studies student teachers' decision-making in lesson planning, *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 37(2), pp.219-236.
- Palmer, P. J. (1997), *The Courage to Teach: Exploring the Inner Landscape of a Teacher's Life*, Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
- SCMP. (2014, 31st January), Fake liberal studies will do Hong Kong more harm than good, *South China Morning Post*, Hong Kong.
- Scott, I. (2000), The disarticulation of Hong Kong's post-handover political system, *The China Journal*, (43), pp.29-53.
- Tse, T.K.C. (2004), Civic education and the making of deformed citizenry. *Remaking Citizenship in Hong Kong*, p.49.
- Tse, K.C. (2010), State and civil society embattled in colonialism, capitalism and nationalism: Civic education and its politics in Hong Kong. *Globalization, the Nation-State and the Citizen*, Routledge, New York, pp.97-113.
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO). (2015), *Rethinking Education: Towards a Global Common Good*, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.
- Wong, K.Y. and Wan, P.S. (2009), New evidence of the postmaterialist shift: The experience of Hong Kong. *Social Indicators Research*, 92(3), pp.497-515.
- Yeung, S.C. (2014, 15th July). Will schools again become political battleground?, *Economic Journal*, Hong Kong.