

1 **Health Status of Stateless Children in**
2 **Tak Province, Thailand**

3

4 **Word count:** Abstract (293), Main text (4,338), References (43)

5 **Running head:** Health Status of Stateless Children

6 **Keywords:** Health status; Pneumonia; Stateless insurance scheme; Stateless children;
7 Electronic medical records; Tak Province; Thailand

8

9

10

11 **ABSTRACT**

12

13 **Purpose**

14 Statelessness is the worst possible form of violation of fundamental human rights which can
15 lead to serious adverse health outcome in children. The purpose of this study is to assess the
16 association between insurance affiliations and health status of stateless children in terms of
17 incidence of pneumonia compared to Thai children with the universal coverage scheme
18 (UCS), and the uninsured children.

19 **Design/methodology/approach**

20 The study used medical records of children aged 0-15 years who were admitted to four
21 selected district hospitals in Tak Province from January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2017.

22 Multivariate logistic regression was applied with binary outcome data (pneumonia: yes/no).

23 Exposure was three types of insurance while covariates were the age, sex, and domicile of the
24 children.

25 **Findings**

26 Of 8,167 hospitalized children between 2013 and 2017, 1,668 were identified who were
27 diagnosed with pneumonia. The risk of pneumonia was 1.7% higher in the stateless children
28 than in the uninsured children (adjusted odds ratio [AOR]=1.017, 95% confidence interval
29 [CI]=[0.527,2.080];p= 0.960). The risk of pneumonia was 13.2% higher in the UCS children
30 than in the uninsured children (AOR=1.132,95% CI=[0.613,2.233];p =0.706). Results remain
31 similar after sensitivity analysis.

32 **Social implications**

33 The incidence of pneumonia, after adjusting for covariates, were similar for children with
34 Stateless Insurance compared to uninsured, suggesting that health insurance might not be a
35 good predictor of health status of vulnerable children especially in presence of multiple
36 health interventions for uninsured and/or undocumented children in Tak. **Originality/value**

37 The study has discovered that the age and domicile of children are independent predictors of
38 incidence of pneumonia in Thailand. Despite similar benefit package, the Stateless Insurance
39 seems to have greater effect than the UCS as the risk of pneumonia is found to be much lower
40 among the Stateless insurees compared to the UCS beneficiaries.

41

42 **Keywords:** Pneumonia; Stateless insurance scheme; Stateless children; Electronic medical
43 records; Tak Province; Thailand

44

45

46 **Introduction**

47 Stateless person is defined as “a person who is not considered as a national by any State
48 under the operation of its law” (Batchelor, 2005). Statelessness is the worst possible form of
49 violation of fundamental human rights (Institute on Statelessness and Inclusion, 2014).
50 Without any nationality, stateless persons may have difficulty in accessing a wide range of
51 human rights including civil, cultural, economic, political, education, and healthcare
52 (Edwards and Van Waas, 2014). The violations of human rights can lead to serious health
53 outcomes as the health and human rights are inextricably intertwined (World Health
54 Organization, n.d.). In Thailand, stateless people are defined as nationals without a birth
55 registration document stating Thai citizenship and who have been residing in the country for
56 generations especially along Thai-Myanmar border area (Archavanitkul, 2011,
57 Suphanchaimat et al., 2016a). There are over 2-3 million unregistered stateless persons who
58 are at risk of statelessness in Thailand (Rakkanam, 2017). The stateless persons are denied
59 the right to vote, travel, own property, work legally, and have access to education and
60 healthcare (Rakkanam, 2017, The Thailand Project, 2014). Consequently, the stateless
61 children are unable to receive a formal healthcare services unlike Thai children in the
62 country. Lack access to healthcare among children might deteriorate their health status that
63 could eventually impede greater human development. In this study, the health status is
64 measured in terms of incidence of pneumonia among children in the country.

65

66 Pneumonia is the inflammation of the tissue in one or both lungs which is usually caused by a
67 virus or bacterial infection (MSD, 2019, NHS, 2019). Globally, pneumonia is the leading
68 cause of death in infants and under-5 children (Pratheepamornkull et al., 2015, Nguyen et al.,
69 2017). There are an estimated 150 million episodes of childhood pneumonia per year and 7-
70 13% of them are hospitalized (Turner et al., 2013a). Recent estimates show that pneumonia

71 accounts for 16% of under-5 child deaths in the world (William, 2018). In the Pacific region,
72 over 75% of pneumonia deaths occurred in six countries, including Cambodia, China, Laos,
73 Papua New Guinea, the Philippines, and Vietnam (Nguyen et al., 2017). In Thailand, stateless
74 children are particularly vulnerable with vaccine preventable diseases such as pneumonia due
75 to lower coverage of immunization (Canavati et al., 2011, Kaji et al., 2016, Williamson et al.,
76 2017).

77

78 Previous research demonstrates that the incidence of pneumonia among under-5 children is
79 high in rural provinces in Thailand (Fry et al., 2010, Lu et al., 2016, Piralam et al., 2015,
80 Simmerman et al., 2009). The incidence rates of pneumonia are highest among children under
81 one year old, followed by children between 1-4 years old in the country (Fry et al., 2010).
82 Empirical evidence shows a high incidence of pneumonia in young children in the Maela
83 Refugee Camp along the Thailand-Myanmar border (Turner et al., 2013a, Turner et al.,
84 2013b). Pratheepamornkull et al. (2015) explored the seasonality of pneumonia cases
85 associated with environmental factors in Chiang Mai Province using time-series models that
86 predicted the average monthly incidence of pneumonia was 1.17 times smaller than the real
87 number of pneumonia cases. Pratheepamornkull et al. (2015) suggest that young and preterm
88 (premature) infants with community acquired pneumonia (CAP) are at high risk for
89 developing serious complications by virus infections at Chonburi Hospital in eastern
90 Thailand. Williamson et al. suggest that the risk of a vaccine preventable diseases (VPDs)
91 requiring hospitalization is strongly correlated with lack of vaccination among ethnic
92 minorities such as the Amish in Pennsylvania State (Williamson et al., 2017). This
93 phenomenon is comparable with the stateless population in Thailand.

94

95 The Thai Cabinet introduced the “Health Insurance for People with Citizenship Problem (HI-
96 PCP)” scheme (‘Stateless Insurance’ hereafter) in 2010 to increase health service utilization
97 including routine immunization among the stateless population without catastrophic spending
98 (Suphanchaimat et al., 2016a). The benefit package the stateless insurance scheme is
99 comprehensive and quite similar to that of the universal coverage scheme (UCS) for Thai
100 citizens, including outpatient and inpatient services, health promotion and disease prevention,
101 and high-cost care (Suphanchaimat et al., 2016b). However, previous studies suggest that the
102 health service utilization is consistently lower among the stateless insurees compared to the
103 UCS Thai population (Suphanchaimat, 2017, Suphanchaimat et al., 2016b). Nevertheless,
104 none of the prior studies looked at the health status of stateless children in terms of the
105 incidence of pneumonia in Thailand.

106

107 The purpose of this study is to assess the association between the incidence of pneumonia in
108 children and three insurance affiliations: the stateless insurance, the UCS and the uninsured.
109 Uninsured children are those who are the children of undocumented or irregular migrant
110 workers in the country, mainly from neighbouring countries, such as Cambodia, Myanmar,
111 Lao PDR, and Vietnam, without health insurance. They are supposed to pay out-of-pocket
112 (OOP) and/or enjoy fee waiver, if cannot afford their medical bills from humanitarian
113 grounds, at the government health facilities. Uninsured are coded in the health database as
114 8200, 8400-8406, 9100 (Supplementary file-2). To estimate the association between exposure
115 and outcome, the study applied multivariate logistic regression analysis using five full-year
116 electronic medical records of children aged 0-15 years from four selected district hospitals in
117 Tak Province.

118

119 **Methods**

120 ***Data sources***

121 The study used an electronic medical database (popularly known as "43-files database"). The
122 data is hosted by the Bureau of Planning and Strategy (BPS) under the Thai Ministry of
123 Public Health (MOPH). The BPS has been collecting administrative data for the purpose of
124 reimbursement and health service utilization since 2007 (Saokaew et al., 2015). The required
125 data for this study was retrieved from January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2017 through the
126 Provincial Public Health Office (PPHO) in Tak Province.

127

128 ***Study design, setting and participants***

129 The study applied a retrospective study design (Kanchanomai et al., 2015) with five full-year
130 electronic medical records from four district hospitals in Tak Province. Tak Province is in the
131 north of Thailand along the Thai-Myanmar border. Four border district hospitals, namely
132 Mae Ramat, Phop Phra, Tha Song Yang, and Umphang, were selected for the study based on
133 the high concentration of stateless people in the province (Jitthai et al., 2010). The study
134 included children aged 0-15 years who had a hospital admission between January 1, 2013 and
135 December 31, 2017. International Classification of Diseases, Tenth Revision Thailand
136 Modification (ICD10-TM) codes (Pakphayun Hospital, n.d.) were used to identify
137 hospitalized children diagnosed with pneumonia (Skull et al., 2008, Williamson et al., 2017).
138 The study population was limited to three insurance types (uninsured, stateless, UCS) while a
139 total of six types of insurance appeared in the raw dataset. The corresponding insurance codes
140 were used to identify the three insurance types as recommended by Tak PPHO
141 (Supplementary file-1).

142

143

144 ***Variables***

145 Three sets of variables were used in the analysis: outcome variable, exposure variable, and
146 covariates/confounders. The outcome variable was the incidence of pneumonia (ever had
147 pneumonia) during the study period. The exposure variable was the three levels of insurance
148 status (uninsured, stateless, UCS). Note that the UCS children are the most common
149 comparable group as used in the previous research (Suphanchaimat et al., 2016b). The key
150 covariates, namely age (years), sex (male/female), and domicile (districts) were used as
151 confounders. Table 1 displays a detailed description of the outcome, exposure, and
152 confounders used in the quantitative analysis.

153

154 [INSERT TABLE 1 HERE]

155

156 *Statistical methods*

157 The Chi-square test was applied to determine statistical significance between three exposure
158 groups on a categorical variable (Hoskin, 2012). The multivariable logistic regression was
159 applied for the binary outcome variable (occurrence of pneumonia: yes/no). The model tested
160 the association between insurance status and outcome taking confounders into account which
161 is crucial in statistical modeling with observational data (Cochran, 1968). Goodness of fit and
162 model specification were tested by the Likelihood Ratio test (LRT). All statistical analyses
163 were done using R version 3.5.3 (R Core Team, 2019). This study was reviewed and
164 approved by the Naresuan University Institutional Review Board (COA No.039/2019, IRB
165 No. 1035/61, dated 23 January 2019).

166

167

168

169 *Data access and cleaning methods*

170 As requested, the PPHO provided data only for those children aged between 0-15 and who
171 had been admitted to any of the four selected district hospitals for inpatient care between
172 January 1, 2013 and December 31, 2017. Therefore, the electronic medical records of
173 children were primarily filtered and cleaned at source. The PPHO also provided
174 corresponding code files linked to the raw data to be recoded for further analysis. As such,
175 the researchers recoded variable value levels to create exposure, and domicile or permanent
176 residence variables (Supplementary files-1&2). Regarding the outcome, to identify
177 pneumonia episodes, multiple principal diagnosis codes that appeared in the dataset were
178 filtered for all-cause of pneumonia cases among hospitalized children using recommended
179 ICD10-TM codes (Skull et al., 2008).

180

181 The exposure variable (insurance affiliation) was cross validated by checking the first digit of
182 redacted 13-digit national identification number that should have corresponded to the
183 respective insurance affiliations. For instance, as recommended by the PPHO, the insurance
184 code “83XX” should correspond to national ID “0XX” to be stateless insurance
185 (Supplementary file-3). After crosschecking, the researchers found that the insurance
186 affiliation codes perfectly corresponded to the respective national identification numbers.
187 Thus, the researchers validated the reliability of classification of insurance status which was
188 the key variable for data analysis. Duplicated observations and other insurance beneficiaries,
189 namely civil servant medical benefit scheme (CSMBS), social security scheme (SSS), and
190 traffic were dropped from the data analysis. Additionally, within the study population who
191 changed insurance status, namely UCS to uninsured and vice-versa, were dropped to avoid
192 misclassification of exposure (Suphanchaimat, 2017). Finally, newborn admissions were
193 dropped from the analysis as they were not admitted for any childhood diseases. The
194 common identifiers for linking between data files were 100% complete. However,

195 researchers performed sensitivity analysis by repeating the multivariate analyses with all
196 children including newborn admissions (Coker et al., 2012, Thabane et al., 2013).

197 **Results**

198 *Participants*

199 Of 8,167 hospitalized children (after excluding 2,357 new-born admissions), the researchers
200 identified 1,668 children diagnosed with pneumonia during 2013 to 2017. The youngest
201 group (0-1year) accounted for approximately 29% of all patients while this figure varied for
202 subsequent older groups: 2-3year (~20%), 4-5year (~12%), 6-10year (~20%), and 11-15year
203 (~19%). Approximately 55% of all hospitalized patients were males. The highest proportion
204 of patients was drawn from Mae Ramat Hospital (51%) followed by Tha Song Yang (~21%),
205 Umphang (~20%), and Phop Phra (~8%) from respective districts.

207 *Descriptive statistics of hospitalized patients*

208 Table 2 compares personal attributes of hospitalized patients by their insurance affiliations:
209 the uninsured, the stateless, and the universal coverage scheme (UCS). It shows that the
210 majority of the hospitalized patients belonged to the UCS (~92%), followed by the stateless
211 (~7%), and the uninsured patients (~1%). Similarly, the proportion of pneumonia patients
212 was the highest in the UCS group (~21%) followed by the stateless (~18%) and the uninsured
213 (~17%) hospitalized children. The greatest proportion of hospitalized children was under two
214 (0 -1year) in all insurance types. The proportion of males outnumbered the females in all
215 beneficiary types. The largest proportion of admissions took place in Mae Ramat Hospital of
216 the Mae Ramat district for the stateless and the UCS while the uninsured were mostly
217 admitted to the Tha Song Yang Hospital of the Tha Song Yang district (Table 2).

218

219

[INSERT TABLE 2 HERE]

220

221 ***Outcome data***

222 Table 3 displays all-cause of pneumonia cases among hospitalized children using
223 recommended ICD10-TM codes. It shows that the majority of the pneumonia patients
224 belonged to the UCS, 1552 of 1,668 (~93%), followed by the stateless, 103 of 1,668 (~6%),
225 and the uninsured patients, 13 of 1,668 (<1%). As mentioned earlier, the proportion of
226 pneumonia patients was the highest in the UCS group. Researchers also observed that (not
227 shown in the table) the incidence of pneumonia varied by age groups. Around 57% of the
228 youngest group (0-1 year) were diagnosed with pneumonia which was the highest followed by
229 2-3 years (~42%), 4-5 years (~20%), 6-10 years (~8%), and 11-15 years (~2%).

230 [INSERT TABLE 3 HERE]

231

232

233 ***Main results***

234 Multivariate logistic regression was performed with the binary outcome variable. Table 4
235 displays the regression results in terms of crude odds ratio (OR) and adjusted odds ratio
236 (AOR). The risk of pneumonia was 1.7% higher in the stateless children than in the uninsured
237 children without statistical significance. The risk of pneumonia was 13.2% higher in the UCS
238 children than in the uninsured children but it was not statistically significant. The children
239 aged 2-3 years were associated with a reduced risk of pneumonia when compared with their
240 younger counterparts (0-1 year). The risk of pneumonia was found to be progressively lower
241 among the older children compared with their younger counterparts aged below two. Female
242 children were at 2.5% higher risk of pneumonia compared to their male counterparts without
243 statistical significance though. The children living in the newer districts, such as Phop Phra
244 (AOR= 0.273, 95% CI=[0.194, 0.373]; p<001), Tha Sing Yang (AOR=0.797,95%

245 CI=[0.689,0.21]; p=002), and Umphang (AOR=0.815, 95% CI= [0.698, 0.949]; p=009) were
246 associated with a reduced risk of pneumonia compared with those living in an older district
247 such as Mae Ramat (Table 4).

248 [INSERT TABLE 4 HERE]

249 In a sensitivity analysis (not shown), the multivariate regressions analyses were repeated
250 using all children who visited the hospitals including new-born admissions as they might
251 affect the analysis. However, results were similar to the analysis with the sample of excluding
252 new-born children. Insured children were more likely to have a diagnosis of pneumonia
253 compared to uninsured but without statistical significance. For instance, the risk of
254 pneumonia was approximately 2% higher in the stateless children than in the uninsured
255 children (adjusted odds ratio [AOR]=1.02, 95% confidence interval [CI] = [0.54,2.07]; p=
256 0.944). The risk of pneumonia was 18% higher in the UCS children than in the uninsured
257 children (AOR=1.18,95% CI = [0.65,2.31]; p =0.602).

258

259

260 **Discussion**

261 ***Key results***

262 The study has shed light on the association between insurance affiliations and the occurrence
263 of pneumonia in children aged 0-15 at four selected district hospitals in Tak Province. The
264 study applied multivariate logistic regression with binary outcome data. The results suggest
265 that the all-cause pneumonia in children does not differ significantly by their corresponding
266 insurance affiliations. The stateless insurees have 1.017 times higher risk of pneumonia than
267 the uninsured patients after adjusting for the effect of potential confounders. The children
268 with the universal coverage scheme (UCS) were found to be at higher risk of pneumonia
269 (13.2%) than the stateless children (1.7%). The youngest group (0-1year) of all hospitalized

270 children were found to be with higher risk of pneumonia as they were more frequently
271 diagnosed with pneumonia. In contrast, older children especially those who are two and
272 above were found to be at lower risk of pneumonia with statistical significance. The
273 incidence of pneumonia was found to be the highest in Mae Ramat district which is the oldest
274 district amongst the four selected districts in Tak Province. Comparing with the oldest
275 district, the newer districts were found to be with reduced risk of pneumonia with statistical
276 significance. Figure 1 displays the factors associated with pneumonia in children by odds
277 ratio (OR) and adjusted odds ratio (AOR) in descending order where AOR provides a more
278 reliable estimate with robust standard error (Knol et al., 2012).

279 [INSERT FIGURE 1 HERE]

280 The top ten most common principal diagnoses among hospitalized children show that the
281 pneumonia was the most frequent vaccine preventable diseases (VPDs) in all beneficiaries.
282 Out of all-cause pneumonia, four major types of pneumonia were more common among
283 hospitalized children, including the unspecified pneumonia (69% of all cases), bacterial
284 pneumonia (14%), Broncho pneumonia (13%), and Lobar pneumonia (3%) (Table 3).

285 ***Interpretation***

286 The above findings were consistent with similar studies conducted in Thailand. Turner et al.
287 found a high risk of pneumonia in young children (OR=2.37, 95% CI=1.56,3.59) in the
288 refugee population in the Maela Refugee Camp in Tak Province (Turner et al., 2013b, Turner
289 et al., 2013a). Fry et al. (2010) reported that the risk of hospitalized Respiratory Syncytial
290 Virus (RSV) pneumonia among children under-5 was high in rural Thailand. Similarly, age
291 below one year (AOR=13.2, 95% CI=7.7,22.5) and 1-4 years (AOR=8.3, 95%CI=5.0,13.9)
292 were independent predictors of RSV pneumonia in the country (Fry et al., 2010). Another
293 domestic study by Lu et al. (2016) demonstrated that the risk of radiographically confirmed
294 pneumonia in young children under-5 was substantially larger (2,394/100,000 person-years)

295 in two rural provinces (e.g. Sa Kaeo and Nakhon Phanom) in Thailand. Simmerman et al.
296 (2009) also found that the average annual risk of influenza pneumonia was greatest in
297 children under-5 (236 per 100,000) in two rural provinces (e.g. Sa Kaeo and Nakhon
298 Phanom) in Thailand.

299

300 The researchers observed that, unlike older children (age four and above), the proportion of
301 pneumonia admissions amongst the uninsured children under one year old was higher than
302 that of both the stateless and the UCS insurees. This phenomenon might not necessarily mean
303 that the uninsured older children did not experience pneumonia. There might be some policy
304 implications to be explained. According to the Thai Ministry of Public Health a migrant child
305 aged less than 7 years old is eligible to buy a health insurance card at the cost of 365 Baht
306 (USD11.46) per child per year, while a child aged between 7 and 15 years old is required to
307 buy the same card at 2,200 Baht (USD69.11) which is the annual premium for adults. This
308 might serve as a financial barrier to attaining insurance and most migrant parents might not
309 be willing or able to buy expensive insurance for their children at an adult price
310 (Suphanchaimat, 2017). Another reason might be the clandestine status of low-skilled
311 migrants (e.g. illegal/undocumented, 'fear of arrest'), who are mostly from Myanmar, was
312 found to be the most common barrier to accessing childhood immunization programmes
313 (Canavati et al., 2011, Kaji et al., 2016, Prakunwisit and Areesantichai, 2015).

314

315 The current study is also consistent with the results of other similar studies though context is
316 different. For instance, Duffy et al. (2018) found no significant difference in health status
317 (e.g. dental caries) among for children aged 2-19 years by their insurance affiliations: public
318 insurance, uninsured, private insurance, in the US. Similarly, Coker et al. (2012) found no
319 significant difference between insured children with persistent symptoms to have a diagnosis

320 of asthma and uninsured children with similar symptoms in the US. They argued that
321 children with persistent symptoms might have a higher level of need for acute asthma care
322 regardless of their insurance status. Although, Celhay et al. (2019) found that public
323 healthcare insurance scheme (e.g. SMSXXI) was associated with a reduction in late (e.g. over
324 28 days) neonatal mortality, the insurance was not associated with early (e.g. less than one
325 week) neonatal mortality in Mexico.

326

327

328 As mentioned earlier researchers did not find significant difference between uninsured and
329 insured groups of children regarding effect of exposure on outcome. This may indicate that
330 the exposure (e.g. health insurance) does not always have impact on desired outcome (e.g.
331 incidence of pneumonia among children). In other words, the results suggest that type of
332 health insurance is not a strong predictor of health status (pneumonia in this case) once age,
333 sex, and domicile are controlled for. There are a few plausible practical explanations for this
334 insignificant difference as follows. First, the authors analyzed secondary data of those
335 children who visited hospital for inpatient care. As such, short duration of data with small
336 proportion of undocumented children which might be cause of this insignificant difference
337 (Suphanchaimat et al., 2016b). Secend, the Provincial Public Health Office (PPHO) allows all
338 children, regardless of their legal status, to be immunized at free of cost. Uninsured children
339 might take the benefit of this local initiative along border provinces (Suphanchaimat, 2017).
340 Third, undocumented migrants are sometimes exempted from healthcare charges at the
341 discretion of local providers from humanitarian grounds but enjoy the same quality healthcare
342 services as insured groups (Tangcharoensathien et al., 2017). Finally, there is a private social
343 enterprise initiative known as '*Dreamlopments*' that initiated the Migrant Fund (M-Fund) in
344 2017 along the Thai-Myanmar border districts including Mae Sot, Mae Ramat, and Php Phra

345 in Thailand. It is a voluntary, low-cost, and non-profit health insurance scheme that acts as a
346 safety-net initiative for protecting the health of undocumented or illegal migrants in the
347 country (Pudpong et al., 2019). It is likely that though undocumented children were covered
348 by this insurance but categorized as uninsured in the hospital database.

349

350 These above policy initiatives/interventions might improve children's health service
351 utilization and health outcomes of children regardless of insurance status. For instance, a
352 recent study in Thailand suggests that vaccination rates between Thai and migrant children in
353 the Thai public schools are similar, while personal hygiene behaviours and nutritional
354 statuses are indifferent between Thai children and migrant children in either Thai primary
355 schools or migrant learning centers (Tuangratananon et al., 2019). However, the present
356 study suggests that the risk of pneumonia is relatively higher among younger children, which
357 could be an economic burden for Thailand in the future unless some pragmatic policy
358 measures have been taken to reduce the incidence of pneumonia among under-5 children.
359 Empirical evidence from Vietnam, a neighbouring country of Thailand, shows that the
360 average treatment costs per patient of pneumonia among children under-5 varied from
361 USD180 to USD318) depending health sector and societal perspectives respectively (Le et
362 al., 2014).

363

364

365 ***Limitations***

366 The study has several important limitations. First, the most critical disadvantage of using
367 routinely collected health data is a lack of information on the study (participants) patients (in
368 this case children) who failed to show up at the district hospitals. This issue can be addressed
369 only by collecting primary data at the household level on the health-seeking behaviour of the

370 study population. Second, facility-based health data do not track individual patients across the
371 facilities via unique identifier (e.g. 13-digit unique ID in Thailand). The researchers
372 addressed this problem by using personal identification number (PID) which is unique within
373 the hospital. Thus, same individual might be considered distinct individuals if he/she would
374 visit different hospitals for care. Finally, the data had quite a short time trend with a limited
375 number of stateless and uninsured children, compared to the UCS children. This might be a
376 reason for difference in outcome without statistical significance (Suphanchaimat et al.,
377 2016b).

378

379 ***Generalizability***

380 The primary concern is the lack of generalizability of the findings for all stateless children in
381 the country as the study population was drawn from only four district hospitals in Tak
382 Province. Additionally, results may not be generalized for all non-Thai children as the
383 stateless children is just one group among many non-Thai populations in the country, such as
384 legal and undocumented/illegal migrant children, international students, children of
385 diplomats, and refugees who are unique from each other based on its own characteristics
386 (Suphanchaimat et al., 2016b).

387

388 ***Conclusion***

389 In conclusion, this is probably the first study to investigate the association between the health
390 insurance affiliation of children and incidence of pneumonia among children in Tak Province,
391 Thailand. The risk of pneumonia was found to be 1.7% and 13.2% higher in the stateless
392 children and the UCS children respectively when compared with the uninsured children.
393 However, this difference did not show statistical significance. Age and domicile of children
394 were independently associated with the incidence of pneumonia in children.. The incidence of

395 pneumonia, after adjusting for covariates, were similar for children with Stateless Insurance
396 and UCS insurance compared to uninsured, suggesting that health insurance might not be a
397 good predictor of health status (pneumonia in this case) of children in presence of multiple
398 healthcare services for the uninsured children who are mainly children of undocumented or
399 irregular migrants in the country. In other words, some essential vaccination services and
400 health promotions are offered to all children irrespective of their legal status in Thailand,
401 which might reduce disparities in health status of all children including uninsured children.

402

403 Although benefit package of two insurance schemes: Stateless Insurance and UCS, are quite
404 similar, the risk of pneumonia was found to be much greater in UCS beneficiaries (~13%).
405 than stateless insurees (~2%) compared to uninsured children, suggesting that the Stateless
406 Insurance seems to have greater effect than the UCS in reducing pneumonia. Additionally,
407 the greater prevalence of pneumonia among children under-2 demands for pragmatic health
408 policy initiatives, such as coordinated and integrated health promotion and prevention, to
409 reduce the risk of early childhood diseases including pneumonia and healthcare cost in the
410 future.

411

412 **Additional Information**

413 **Funding**

414 The author (PB) received PhD scholarship from Naresuan University, Thailand. The study
415 was conducted without external funding

416 **Declaration of conflicting interests**

417 The authors declared no potential conflict of interest with respect to the research, authorship,
418 and/or publication of this article.

419 **Research ethics and patient consent**

420 This study was reviewed and approved by the Naresuan University Institutional Review
421 Board (COA No.039/2019, IRB No. 1035/61, dated 23 January 2019).

422

423 **References**

424

425

426 Archavanitkul, K. 2011. Towards managing stateless people in Thailand's context. *In:*

427 PHANPHUENG, S. & SANPUWAN, M. (eds.) *Thailand's Population in Transition:*

428 *a Turning Point for Thai Society*. 1st ed. Nakhon Pathom, Thailand: : Institute for

429 Population and Social Research, Mahidol University.

430 Batchelor, C. 2005. The 1954 Convention Relating to the Status of Stateless Persons:

431 Implementation Within the European Union Member States and Recommendations for

432 Harmonization. *Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees*, 22, 31-58.

433 Canavati, S., Plugge, E., Suwanjatuporn, S., Sombatrungjaroen, S. & Nosten, F. 2011.

434 Barriers to immunization among children of migrant workers from Myanmar living in

435 Tak province, Thailand. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*, 89, 528-531.

436 Celhay, P., Martinez, S., Muñoz, M., Perez, M. & Perez-Cuevas, R. 2019. Long-term effects

437 of public health insurance on the health of children in Mexico: a retrospective study.

438 *The Lancet Global Health*.

439 Cochran, W. G. 1968. The effectiveness of adjustment by subclassification in removing bias

440 in observational studies. *Biometrics*, 295-313.

441 Coker, T. R., Kaplan, R. M. & Chung, P. J. 2012. The association of health insurance and

442 disease impairment with reported asthma prevalence in US children. *Health services*

443 *research*, 47, 431-445.

444 Duffy, E. L., Kranz, A. M., Dick, A. W., Sorbero, M. & Stein, B. D. 2018. Association

445 between type of health insurance and children's oral health, NHANES 2011–2014.

446 *Journal of public health dentistry*, 78, 337-345.

447 Edwards, A. & Van Waas, L. 2014. *Nationality and statelessness under international law*,

448 Cambridge University Press.

449 Fry, A. M., Chittaganpitch, M., Baggett, H. C., Peret, T. C. T., Dare, R. K., Sawatwong, P.,
450 Thamthitiwat, S., Areerat, P., Sanasuttipun, W., Fischer, J., Maloney, S. A., Erdman,
451 D. D. & Olsen, S. J. 2010. The burden of hospitalized lower respiratory tract infection
452 due to respiratory syncytial virus in rural Thailand. *PloS one*, 5, e15098-e15098.

453 Hoskin, T. Parametric and nonparametric: Demystifying the terms. Mayo Clinic, 2012. 1-5.

454 Institute on Statelessness and Inclusion 2014. The World's Stateless. The Netherlands

455 Jitthai, N., Yongpanichkul, S. & Bijaisoradat, M. 2010. *Migration and HIV/AIDS in*
456 *Thailand: Triangulation of biological, behavioural and programmatic response data*
457 *in selected provinces*, International Organization for Migration, Thailand.

458 Kaji, A., Parker, D. M., Chu, C. S., Thayatkawin, W., Suelaor, J., Charatrueangrongkun, R.,
459 Salathibuppha, K., Nosten, F. H. & Mcgready, R. 2016. Immunization Coverage in
460 Migrant School Children Along the Thailand-Myanmar Border. *Journal of Immigrant*
461 *and Minority Health*, 18, 1038-1045.

462 Kanchanomai, S., Janwantanakul, P., Pensri, P. & Jiamjarasrangsi, W. 2015. A Prospective
463 Study of Incidence and Risk Factors for the Onset and Persistence of Low Back Pain
464 in Thai University Students. *Asia Pacific Journal of Public Health*, 27, NP106-
465 NP115.

466 Knol, M. J., Le Cessie, S., Algra, A., Vandenbroucke, J. P. & Groenwold, R. H. H. 2012.
467 Overestimation of risk ratios by odds ratios in trials and cohort studies: alternatives to
468 logistic regression. *CMAJ : Canadian Medical Association journal = journal de*
469 *l'Association medicale canadienne*, 184, 895-899.

470 Le, P., Griffiths, U. K., Anh, D. D., Franzini, L., Chan, W., Pham, H. & Swint, J. M. 2014.
471 The economic burden of pneumonia and meningitis among children less than five
472 years old in Hanoi, Vietnam. *Tropical medicine & international health*, 19, 1321-
473 1327.

474 Lu, Y., Baggett, H. C., Rhodes, J., Thamthitiwat, S., Joseph, L. & Gregory, C. J. 2016.
475 Bayesian latent class estimation of the incidence of chest radiograph-confirmed
476 pneumonia in rural Thailand. *Epidemiology and infection*, 144, 2858-2865.

477 Msd. 2019. *Community-Acquired Pneumonia - Pulmonary Disorders* [Online]. Available:
478 [https://www.msdmanuals.com/en-gb/professional/pulmonary-](https://www.msdmanuals.com/en-gb/professional/pulmonary-disorders/pneumonia/community-acquired-pneumonia)
479 [disorders/pneumonia/community-acquired-pneumonia](https://www.msdmanuals.com/en-gb/professional/pulmonary-disorders/pneumonia/community-acquired-pneumonia) [Accessed].

480 Nguyen, T. K., Tran, T. H., Roberts, C. L., Graham, S. M. & Marais, B. J. 2017. Child
481 pneumonia - focus on the Western Pacific Region. *Paediatr Respir Rev*, 21, 102-110.

482 Nhs. 2019. *Overview: Pneumonia* [Online]. Available:
483 <https://www.nhs.uk/conditions/Pneumonia/> [Accessed].

484 Pakphayun Hospital. n.d. *Data-Check:ICD-10 standard code search* [Online]. Available:
485 <http://61.7.219.187/datacheck/frontend/web/index.php?r=icd10%2Findex> [Accessed].

486 Piralam, B., Tomczyk, S. M., Rhodes, J. C., Thamthitiwat, S., Gregory, C. J., Olsen, S. J.,
487 Praphasiri, P., Sawatwong, P., Naorat, S., Chantra, S., Areerat, P., Hurst, C. P.,
488 Moore, M. R., Muangchana, C. & Baggett, H. C. 2015. Incidence of Pneumococcal
489 Pneumonia Among Adults in Rural Thailand, 2006-2011: Implications for
490 Pneumococcal Vaccine Considerations. *The American journal of tropical medicine*
491 *and hygiene*, 93, 1140-1147.

492 Prakunwisit, D. & Areesantichai, C. 2015. Factors associated with Immunization status
493 among Myanmar migrant children aged 1-2 years In Tak Province, Thailand. *J Health*
494 *Res* □ *vol*, 29.

495 Pratheepamornkull, T., Ratanakorn, W., Samransamruajkit, R. & Poovorawan, Y. 2015.
496 Causative agents of severe community acquired viral pneumonia among children in
497 eastern Thailand. *Southeast Asian J Trop Med Public Health*, 46, 650-6.

498 Pudpong, N., Durier, N., Julchoo, S., Sainam, P., Kuttiparambil, B. & Suphanchaimat, R.
499 2019. Assessment of a Voluntary Non-Profit Health Insurance Scheme for Migrants
500 along the Thai–Myanmar Border: A Case Study of the Migrant Fund in Thailand.
501 *International journal of environmental research and public health*, 16, 2581.

502 R Core Team. 2019. *R: A language and environment for statistical computing*. R Foundation
503 *for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria* [Online]. Available: [https://www.R-](https://www.R-project.org/)
504 [project.org/](https://www.R-project.org/) [Accessed].

505 Rakkanam, P. 2017. *Thailand Opens Citizenship Path for 80,000 Stateless People* [Online].
506 Available: [https://www.benarnews.org/english/news/thai/stateless-](https://www.benarnews.org/english/news/thai/stateless-12302016172431.html)
507 [12302016172431.html](https://www.benarnews.org/english/news/thai/stateless-12302016172431.html) [Accessed].

508 Saokaew, S., Sugimoto, T., Kamae, I., Pratoomsoot, C. & Chaiyakunapruk, N. 2015.
509 Healthcare databases in Thailand and Japan: potential sources for health technology
510 assessment research. *PloS one*, 10, e0141993.

511 Simmerman, J. M., Chittaganpitch, M., Levy, J., Chantra, S., Maloney, S., Uyeki, T., Areerat,
512 P., Thamthitiwat, S., Olsen, S. J., Fry, A., Ungchusak, K., Baggett, H. C. &
513 Chunsuttiwat, S. 2009. Incidence, seasonality and mortality associated with influenza
514 pneumonia in Thailand: 2005-2008. *PloS one*, 4, e7776-e7776.

515 Skull, S. A., Andrews, R. M., Byrnes, G. B., Campbell, D. A., Nolan, T. M., Brown, G. V. &
516 Kelly, H. A. 2008. ICD-10 codes are a valid tool for identification of pneumonia in
517 hospitalized patients aged > or = 65 years. *Epidemiology and infection*, 136, 232-240.

518 Suphanchaimat, R. 2017. "*Health Insurance Card Scheme*" for cross-border migrants in
519 *Thailand: Responses in policy implementation & outcome evaluation*. London School
520 of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine.

521 Suphanchaimat, R., Mills, A., Pudpong, N., Putthasri, W. & Kantamaturapoj, K. 2016a.
522 Health insurance for people with citizenship problems in Thailand: A case study of
523 policy implementation. *Health Policy and Planning*, 31, 229-238.

524 Suphanchaimat, R., Prakongsai, P., Limwattananon, S. & Mills, A. 2016b. Impact of the
525 health insurance scheme for stateless people on inpatient utilization in Kraburi
526 Hospital, Thailand. *Risk Management and Healthcare Policy*, 9, 261-269.

527 Tangcharoensathien, V., Thwin, A. A. & Patcharanarumol, W. 2017. Implementing health
528 insurance for migrants, Thailand. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*, 95, 146.

529 Thabane, L., Mbuagbaw, L., Zhang, S., Samaan, Z., Marcucci, M., Ye, C., Thabane, M.,
530 Giangregorio, L., Dennis, B. & Kosa, D. 2013. A tutorial on sensitivity analyses in
531 clinical trials: the what, why, when and how. *BMC medical research methodology*,
532 13, 92.

533 The Thailand Project. 2014. *Statelessness in Thailand* [Online]. Available:
534 <http://www.thethailandproject.org/who-we-help-stateless.html> [Accessed May 23
535 2019].

536 Tuangratananon, T., Julchoo, S., Wanwong, Y., Sinam, P. & Suphanchaimat, R. 2019. School
537 health for migrant children: a myth or a must? *Risk management and healthcare*
538 *policy*, 12, 123-132.

539 Turner, C., Turner, P., Carrara, V., Burgoine, K., Tha Ler Htoo, S., Watthanaworawit, W.,
540 Day, N. P., White, N. J., Goldblatt, D. & Nosten, F. 2013a. High rates of pneumonia
541 in children under two years of age in a South East Asian refugee population. *PloS*
542 *one*, 8, e54026-e54026.

543 Turner, P., Turner, C., Watthanaworawit, W., Carrara, V., Cicelia, N., Deglise, C., Phares, C.,
544 Ortega, L. & Nosten, F. 2013b. Respiratory virus surveillance in hospitalised

545 pneumonia patients on the Thailand-Myanmar border. *BMC infectious diseases*, 13,
546 434-434.

547 William. 2018. *Pneumonia accounts for 16% of deaths* [Online]. Available: [https://klebsiella-](https://klebsiella-pneumoniae.blogspot.com/2018/11/pneumonia-accounts-for-16-of-deaths.html)
548 [pneumoniae.blogspot.com/2018/11/pneumonia-accounts-for-16-of-deaths.html](https://klebsiella-pneumoniae.blogspot.com/2018/11/pneumonia-accounts-for-16-of-deaths.html)
549 [Accessed].

550 Williamson, G., Ahmed, B., Kumar, P. S., Ostrov, B. E. & Ericson, J. E. 2017. Vaccine-
551 Preventable Diseases Requiring Hospitalization. *Pediatrics*, 140.

552 World Health Organization. n.d. *The linkages between health and human rights* [Online].
553 Available: <http://www.who.int/hhr/HHR%20linkages.pdf> [Accessed March 27 2018].
554
555

