

Re-thinking medicine

There's something going on out there

Martin Marshall, *Vice-Chair Royal College of General Practitioners*¹

Jocelyn Cornwell, *Chief Executive, Point of Care Foundation*²

Alf Collins, *Clinical Director for Personalised Care, NHS England*³

On behalf of the Re-Thinking Medicine working group

1. Martin Marshall (corresponding author)
Professor of Healthcare Improvement
Department of Primary Care and Population Health, UCL
UCL Medical School, Upper 3rd Floor, Royal Free Campus, Rowland Hill Street,
London NW3 2PF
martin.marshall@ucl.ac.uk
Mobile: 07796 993597
2. Jocelyn Cornwell
Chief Executive, Point of Care Foundation
3rd Floor, CAN-Mezzanine, 7-14 Great Dover Street, London SE1 4YR
Jocelyncornwell@pointofcarefoundation.org.uk
3. Alf Collins
Clinical Director, Personalised Care Group, NHS England
Skipton House, London Road, London SE1 6LH
alf.collins@nhs.net

806 words

Re-thinking medicine

There's something going on out there

Modern medicine is one of humanity's great achievements. It improves, prolongs and saves lives by applying the biomedical and clinical sciences to the diagnosis and treatment of disease. Its strength lies in its clarity and focus, making it an easy model to explain, to understand and to put into practice. People have found it powerful, beguiling, seductive even. It is not surprising that the medical model is proving so popular: it serves society well.

But there's something going on out there. A growing number of doctors and patients are questioning whether medicine has over-stretched itself [1], whether it is always as effective as proponents claim and whether there are instances where the side effects and unintended consequences outweigh the benefits. This critique is not new [2,3] but it has recently found a common voice in initiatives which transcend health systems and national borders, such as 'Minimally Disruptive Medicine' [4], "High Integrity Care' [5] and 'Re-think Health' [6].

In the United Kingdom unease with the medical model may be contributing to doctors' low morale and to problems with the recruitment and retention of the medical workforce. But the unease is also being expressed in how doctors are thinking about and practising medicine. Some doctors are expressing concern about over-diagnosis and over-treatment and the attendant potential for harm and waste [7], particularly with respect to people with multiple conditions, and people who are frail or at the end of their lives. Others are concerned about the limited effectiveness of what they have to offer in the face of the wider social determinants of health, such as poor education, unemployment and the unequal distribution of wealth.[8] They are increasingly 'prescribing' social interventions [9] and are mobilising the established collective strengths which exist within many local communities to improve health and wellbeing.[10]

Some doctors are trying to change their relationships with patients, to listen more carefully to their narratives and work alongside them, sharing information about diagnoses and options for treatment, and offering more personalised care and support.[11] Others are

focusing on helping schoolchildren to understand and manage their own health and wellbeing and to understand where doctors do and do not add value.[12] Still others are attempting to improve the context within which clinical medicine is provided, drawing on organisational and systems perspectives and on approaches to quality improvement originating from the manufacturing sector.[13]

We see these evolving activities in which doctors are choosing to focus their energies as connected. We believe that underlying them is an awareness that some things doctors do are effective for some clinical problems but that different approaches are required to respond to an increasing number of the challenges that doctors face. Rather than becoming entrenched in traditional ways of working, doctors are searching for alternative ways to make clinical practice more effective and more doable.

Some initiatives are being developed at a national level to support this process. *Prudent Healthcare* in Wales [14] and *Realistic Medicine* in Scotland [1] represent concerted efforts to create a new set of principles and activities to guide clinical practice, and a narrative which builds on the ground-up energy for change. Early evidence suggests that this work is engaging clinicians who want to have greater impact, patients who want to be listened to and policy makers who want to optimise value from the health care spend. Similar work is starting in England, led by the Academy of Medical Royal Colleges.[15]

We believe that the process of re-thinking medicine is a necessary challenge. We need to more clearly define where the application of a disease-focused medical model adds value and where it doesn't, to help doctors actively develop more productive relationships with patients and to help them incorporate social interventions into the more traditional armoury of biological and psychological interventions. This will require radical changes to undergraduate and postgraduate training curricula and the content of continuing professional education. It will require a strong focus on personalised care, community and population health, and on the skills required to develop new ways of working with people in local government, the voluntary sector and local communities.

In 1974 Richard Smith, then an idealistic medical student who was later to become an editor of BMJ, attended a lecture by Illich entitled '*Limits to Medicine*'. The lecture gave voice to his deep but poorly formed concerns about medicine and he immediately decided to drop out of medical school. Three days later, uncertain what else to do, he dropped back in. Forty years on, a growing number of doctors with similar concerns are experimenting with alternatives to ceasing clinical practice. Medicine is being re-thought and doctors have an opportunity to contribute to the wider initiatives taking place in Wales, Scotland and England, or to incorporate the different elements of these initiatives into their clinical practice. Doing so is likely to revitalise what it means to be a doctor.

1. Calderwood C. Realistic Medicine. Chief Medical Officer's annual Report 2014-15. <https://www.gov.scot/Resource/0049/00492520.pdf> (accessed 24th August 2018)
2. Limits to Medicine: nemesis: the expropriation of health. Ivan Illych, London: Marion Boyars, 1976
3. Engel GL. The need for a new medical model: a challenge for biomedicine. *Science* 1977; 196:4286 129-136
4. Leppin AL, Montori VM, Gionfriddo MR. Minimally Disruptive Medicine: A Pragmatically Comprehensive Model for Delivering Care to Patients with Multiple Chronic Conditions. *Healthcare* 2015; 3(1): 50-63 doi:10.3390/healthcare3010050
5. Mulley A, Coulter A, Wolpert M, Richards T, Abbasi K. New approaches to measurement and management for high integrity health systems. *BMJ* 2017; 356 doi: <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.j1401>
6. Ripple Foundation, Re-think Health. <https://www.rethinkhealth.org> (accessed 24th August 2018)
7. Treadwell J, McCartney M. Overdiagnosis and overtreatment: generalists – it's time for a grassroots revolution. *British Journal of General Practice* 2016; 66(644): 116-117
8. Fair Society, Healthy Lives. The Marmot Review. <http://www.instituteofhealthequity.org/resources-reports/fair-society-healthy-lives-the-marmot-review/fair-society-healthy-lives-full-report-pdf.pdf> (accessed 24th August 2018)

9. Bickerdike L, Booth A, Wilson PM, Farley K, Wright K. Social prescribing: less rhetoric and more reality. A systematic review of the evidence. *BMJ Open* 2017;7:e013384. Doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2016-013384
10. New NHS Alliance. A manifesto for health creation. May 2017. <https://www.nhsalliance.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/A-Manifesto-For-Health-Creation.pdf> (accessed 24th August 2018)
11. Mulley A, Trimble C, Elwyn G. Patients' Preferences Matter; Stop the silent misdiagnosis. Kings Fund, London 2012
12. Facts 4 Life <https://facts4life.org> (accessed 24th August 2018)
13. Berwick D. The science of improvement. *JAMA* 2008; 299(10): 1182-4
14. Prudent Healthcare <http://www.prudenthealthcare.org.uk> (accessed 24th August 2018)
15. Rethinking Medicine <http://www.rethinkingmedicine.co.uk> (accessed 7th October 2018)

Competing interests: We have read and understood the BMJ Group policy on declaration of interests and have declared them using the online form.

The Corresponding Author has the right to grant on behalf of all authors and does grant on behalf of all authors, a worldwide licence to the Publishers and its licensees in perpetuity, in all forms, formats and media (whether known now or created in the future), to i) publish, reproduce, distribute, display and store the Contribution, ii) translate the Contribution into other languages, create adaptations, reprints, include within collections and create summaries, extracts and/or, abstracts of the Contribution, iii) create any other derivative work(s) based on the Contribution, iv) to exploit all subsidiary rights in the Contribution, v) the inclusion of electronic links from the Contribution to third party material where-ever it may be located; and, vi) licence any third party to do any or all of the above.