

TEACHERS under siege

Sandra Leaton Gray

The background of the cover features a blurred image of a castle with multiple towers and battlements. In the foreground, a metal fence with vertical bars is visible. A white rectangular sign with a dark border is attached to the fence, containing the text 'RY SCHOOL'. The overall scene is set against a bright, hazy sky with some lens flare effects.

RY SCHOOL

Teachers Under Siege

Teachers Under Siege

Sandra Leaton Gray



Trentham Books

Stoke on Trent, UK and Sterling, USA

Trentham Books Limited
Westview House 22883 Quicksilver Drive
734 London Road Sterling
Oakhill VA 20166-2012
Stoke on Trent USA
Staffordshire
England ST4 5NP

© 2006 Sandra Leaton Gray

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical including photocopying, recording or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

First published 2006

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN-13: 978-1-85856-363-3
ISBN-10: 1-85856-363-1

Designed and typeset by Trentham Print Design Ltd, Chester and printed in Great Britain by Cromwell Press Ltd, Trowbridge.

Contents

Acknowledgements • vi
Chapter 1
Introduction • 1
Chapter 2
The Beginning of Hostilities • 7
Chapter 3
The Neo-conservative Offensive • 39
Chapter 4
Finding a Voice for Teachers • 63
Chapter 5
Despatches from the Front – Key Drivers • 74
Chapter 6
Delving Deeper – Linguistic Analysis • 119
Chapter 7
Towards a Vision of the Future: Causal Layered Analysis • 139
Chapter 8
Entente Cordiale? • 159
References • 173
Index • 185

Acknowledgements

The development of this book was greatly influenced by discussions and debates with Rob Moore, John Beck, Graham May, Geoff Whitty, David Hursh and Mike Baker. Thanks must also go to David Hargreaves for suggesting the original research area, and Basil Bernstein for giving me early encouragement to explore teacher identity.

There was valuable help from other quarters as well. I am grateful to the Parliamentary Office for Science and Technology, and the Department for Trade and Industry for arranging for me to attend their Futures Training Course in March 2003, as well as the Economic and Social Research Council and the Newton Trust, for their awards. The British Sociological Association Summer School 2004 was particularly influential in helping me to formulate the plan for the book, and to ensure its successful publication. My colleague Catherine Howell took the trouble to read the first draft and make helpful comments at a time when she was particularly busy with her own professional commitments. Gillian Klein at Trentham Books supported me unstintingly throughout, and for that I will always be grateful. Thanks also must go to friends and family members who proof read drafts: David Gray, Gordan and Hantje Bradley, and Fred Hauptfuhrer.

I would also like to thank all the teachers whom I now realise helped to bring my thinking to this point, including those who took part in the research, particularly Mrs Eluned Rees, for inspiring and nurturing an early interest in educational processes and outcomes.

Finally, I must express my gratitude to James Leaton Gray, my husband, for offering the most remarkable support and belief.

1

Introduction

It is late morning in 2020. You have dropped the children off at their local neighbourhood learning centre, put some clothes into the water-free washing machine, and finally settled at your desk armed with a herbal stimulant drink and a couple of Jaffa cakes. It is time for work...

You log on and check your electronic mail. Soon it is time for your teleconference with a new pupil, who lives in Alaska. He has been experiencing some difficulties with sentence construction, so you send him a piece of software down the network that will diagnose his problems and report back to you later on. You schedule in another teleconference for late afternoon. After backing up some data at the online Virtual Teachers' Centre and checking the contents of your electronic in-tray, you notice that the power is getting low. You wind the computer up again for a few more hours' work.

Your next task is to improve your invoicing arrangements. The inspection team, EuroInspect, has been cracking down on sloppy record-keeping and, in some cases, withholding Independent Teacher licences. You spend the rest of the morning designing a new system to cope with the documents electronically.

The monthly Independent Teachers' lunch takes place at the local Meditation Centre. After an organic lunch and a gossip with colleagues, some of you go on to a Mindfulness of Breathing session in the Shrine Room, while a couple of you stay behind to thrash out the details of the 85-90 year age group ElderLearn session. Even though it is still three months away, there are already problems with co-ordinating the waiting list. Things haven't been

helped by the diktat by the European Minister for the Learning Society that priority should be given to victims of the recent Teachers' Pension Agency collapse.

Does this sound far-fetched? Everything within it is based on widely reported social trends and statistics, a fictional scenario used as part of a recent research project which asked teachers to think ahead twenty years and discuss their views of the future of education. This was seen as a useful way of discovering how they positioned themselves in relation to changes in their profession and the society around them.

The starting point for this book, which is based on the research described above, is the critical question of teachers' professional identity in the modern age. As it is, the contemporary educational landscape is riddled with confusions and disagreements regarding teacher identity, and even the nature of teaching itself. The problem of defining teacher professionalism has further implications for the future of education as a whole.

The distinctive contribution made by the research was to address how the definition of the teacher is located within broader discourses of educational and social change. This approach began with the observation that government initiatives for educational change invariably employ a rhetoric of social change. This not only provides a model for what kind of teacher is now required under newly emerging conditions, but also presents a challenge to the existing workforce: they must adapt themselves to the challenges that these new demands make. Thus, government and policymakers use the rhetoric of social change as a rationale for imposing policy interventions which may feel uncomfortable to teachers. In turn, this affects teachers' professional roles and sense of self-efficacy, which can have a detrimental effect on their overall self-image. A central concern of this book is the analysis and deconstruction of this process, and of the ways in which concerns with time – the past, the present and the future – inform and shape the views of education professionals at all levels.

Questions of professional identity cannot be separated from issues of control and the institutional and managerial arrangements within which they are structured and regulated. The general historical trend in the UK in the post-war period has been for increased central control over teachers' work. For older members of the profession this trend can be seen in terms of deprofessionalisation, in which teachers lose control over their work and become increasingly con-

trolled by external agencies. In this case, the historical view will tend to be pessimistic and recounted in terms of decline. For new entrants these conditions might be seen more positively as creating the opportunity for new models of professionalism. Perceptions of this type have important implications for the reception of reform proposals and the enthusiasm with which they might be implemented. Hence, this book is also concerned with teachers' views of what educational policy means to them personally. Sadly, it soon became apparent during the course of the research that many teachers felt negative about the changes within their profession, a feeling one teacher memorably described as 'being under siege'.

This book starts by locating the issues of teacher professionalism within a theoretical framework. Chapter 2, *The Beginning of Hostilities*, starts by exploring modes of teacher professionalism and teacher vocation, particularly with relation to current recruitment and retention problems. It finds that teacher professionalism is a complex issue. Since the 1988 Education Reform Act, successive Governments have intervened in education to an increasing degree. Consequently recruitment and retention policies frequently make assumptions about what it means to be a teacher. It is argued that these policies fail to take into account the wide range of professional identities in existence, so that teachers face many tensions in their work. A fuller understanding of this range of personal and professional motivations can make for more effective implementation of education policies.

In the aftermath of the 1988 Act, a notional ideal type of professional is emerging. Chapter 3, *The Neoliberal Offensive*, elaborates upon this. The Government is anxious to create an impression of rapid change within society. As a means of appearing to make an impact, teaching is being reframed as a new kind of public sector profession comprised of political handmaidens, in which teachers are forced to become technicians delivering well-intentioned government policy initiatives, rather than being true professionals in the traditional sense. Educational values are being left behind, as teachers hurry to respond to the demands of education policy.

In Chapter 4, *Finding a Voice for Teachers*, the research project that lies behind this book is described. It was entitled *Mapping Professional Conceptions of Learning Futures: Teachers and their Professional Identities in the Knowledge Economy*. It discusses how the project asked teachers about their conceptions of the future, as a way of indirectly accessing their views on the present. It gives a

psychological rationale for this approach, and moves on to describe the nuts and bolts of the research project, such as the sampling, the conduct of the research, the construction of questions for the interviews and questionnaires, and the fieldwork process.

An initial (and relatively conventional) presentation and analysis of the data appears in Chapter 5, *Despatches from the Front*. It discusses the main themes that emerged during the course of the interviews and surveys, such as the influence of Government policy on teaching, globalisation, funding issues, the role of business and industry on education, and the relationship between home and school. This analysis is deepened in Chapter 6, *Delving Deeper – Linguistic Analysis*, by an additional approach that employs some more recent techniques. Linguistic analysis has been used to examine how research participants use pronouns. The findings are employed to explore how individuals position themselves in relation to groups and agencies with whom they are professionally involved. Finally, in Chapter 7, *Towards a Vision of the Future – Causal Layered Analysis*, a relatively new method of data analysis is used. This technique has precedents in educational research, such as *The Sociology of Teaching* by Waller (1932), which employs a similarly reflective, narrative style. Causal layered analysis allows a wide-ranging and insightful analysis of qualitative data. This chapter highlights the low status of youth within society and, by association, the low status of teachers. It touches on how youth as a group can seem threatening or puzzling to older generations, and how this can lead to a desire to corral ever older age groups within education, as a kind of social holding bay. The successive application of the three data analysis methods, and in particular the use of causal layered analysis, is therefore aimed at putting the opinions of the education professionals into a broader context.

Chapter 8, *Entente Cordiale?* is something of a clarion call, encouraging teachers to galvanise their energy, and directing them towards a remodelling of the teaching profession on their own terms. It urges them to become more interested and involved in the processes of the General Teaching Council, through lobbying and special interest groups as necessary. It argues that until teachers are more prepared to attend meetings and stand for election, their collective bargaining power will be undermined by their own apathy. The chapter also urges teachers to take control of teaching training processes, so once again, these are grounded in the idea that teachers are professionals with a vocation, rather than technicians delivering Government initiatives. Teachers are encouraged to help

INTRODUCTION

raise the status of youth within society by forcing improvements in teaching and learning conditions in schools. Finally, it is argued that education needs to value its human face over its organisational one.

2

The Beginning of Hostilities

This chapter, and the next, outline the broad theoretical framework behind the research. The aim of this is to allow readers to engage with the different debates surrounding teacher professionalism in general, which in turn will put the research into context. The book tightens its focus as it progresses, looking at increasingly more specific examples of the tensions between contemporary Government and education. The balance between the early theoretical chapters and the later empirical and analytical ones is important, as it allows readers to achieve a rich understanding of the complex situation of teachers within modern-day society.

Around the time of the UK's 1988 Education Reform Act, there seemed to be a major shift in attitudes towards both schools and teachers, contemporaneous with similar developments in other countries such as the US. The ground for this had been set in a variety of ways, including the publication of the Black Papers¹, a series of pamphlets published by two academics, Tony Dyson and Brian Cox, criticising child-centred, progressive education. Prime Minister James Callaghan's Ruskin College speech of 1976 was also anti-progressive in tone, and was a significant factor in further opening the education debate. There was an enquiry into the William Tyndale school in Islington, a comprehensive school run as a co-operative. In this way, teacher professionalism was systematically undermined, both politically and by the media. Pay strikes and intense union activity were an additional factor in loss of public support.

By the late 1980s, there was an increasingly managerialist Government administration, mistrustful of teachers, and determined to reform and control education centrally. This thrust towards reform has persisted over time, firmly rooted in the accountancy-driven culture of the modern civil service. It sits in the background of contemporary society, and the thread of its arguments, which can be both benign and malign, can be seen in the policies of both Conservative and Labour governments.

Within this critical, unsettled environment, teachers and teaching were gradually subject to a rhetoric in which they were described as increasingly inadequate, and the effects of this within the profession were widespread. For example, the intellectual independence of Initial Teacher Training was undermined by attempts to transfer teacher training from universities to schools. Teacher effectiveness was questioned, and statutory assessment and centralised school inspection were used as a means of forcing standardisation. Measures such as the introduction of Ofsted (Office for Standards in Education) and SATs (Standard Assessment Tests) meant that teachers were under scrutiny as never before. Consequently, there were local and national incidences of industrial action as the reform agenda began to hit home. Local Education Authorities did not escape unscathed. They were attacked via the introduction of Local Management of Schools and Grant Maintained Schools, which were used as a means of reducing their power and autonomy. Overall, this politicisation of education had a destructive effect on the professional identity of teachers, particularly those who had trained before the introduction of the 1988 Act. As a profession, teaching was undermined and disempowered, and the scene was set for turbulent times ahead.

Public sector professionalism during the 1970s and beyond

This section takes an overview of the recent role of the public sector professions within society over the last three decades. This will act as a means of highlighting the difficulties teachers experience in achieving balance in the different aspects of their working lives. Such a balance is particularly elusive within a critical and managerialist political structure. The section also compares and contrasts the situation of other public sector professions, to establish whether teaching is, in fact, in an unusual and anomalous situation in relation to other areas of the public sector.

If pressed, we could all probably think of many examples of teachers demonstrating vocation over and above the minimum requirements of the job. My favourite example is probably that of Mr. Chips, the novelist James Hilton's fictional schoolmaster in his 1934 book *Goodbye, Mr Chips*. This character is based on various inspiring characters from Hilton's youth, most particularly Mr Balgarnie, a Classics master at the Leys School in Cambridge. While World War I Zeppelins are raining down on the school, Mr Chips continues to teach Classics to his anxious class, merely pausing to point out that the Germans have been a political problem since Caesar's time. Clearly other readers have been similarly struck by Mr Chips' *sang froid* and impressive levels of professionalism over the years, as the book has been in continuous print since its first publication.

The discourse of the professional often includes references to altruism, vocation or the idea of the public good. Does this still apply in the case of teachers? On the other hand, are they simply self-interested individuals, concerned only with their own careers? Such a question was of great interest to the sociologist Talcott Parsons. Friedson (1994) describes Parsons as one of the first sociologists to identify professionals as a distinct sociological group. For our purposes, this classification is a useful starting point. It allows us to examine public sector professions in general, as a means of better understanding the changes taking place within teaching. The theoretical debates outlined below therefore reflect some of the main structural changes within the different professions over the past few decades. This provides a broad overview of the changing role of the professions within society itself.

Parsons appeared to dominate the theoretical study of the professions until the 1960s, locating it within a functionalist framework. He attempted to examine the issue of altruism in the light of conflicting utilitarian views that all behaviour is essentially self-interested (cited in Friedson, *ibid.*, p. 2). However, during the 1960s, there appeared to be some kind of intellectual watershed (*ibid.*, p.3) whereby historians and sociologists paid closer attention to the relationship between membership of a particular profession, and power and control over others who were not members of a particular professional group. This undermined the notion that the professions were neutral within society. Instead, they were recognised as having their own motivations and interests, which sometimes brought them into conflict with other groups. Friedson describes how this trend continued throughout the 1970s, with professions no longer being seen as holding society together, but instead seeking to

exercise control over society. For example, whilst Johnson (1972) may have seen the existence of a profession as a means of controlling work, with a profession acting as a mediating agency between producer and consumer, this could also be regarded as maintaining an unjustifiable monopoly. Larson (1977) brought a Marxist analysis to this, identifying the different professions as interest groups linked to the class system of capitalist societies, giving social standing and prestige at the expense of subordinate groups.

This quest towards improved social standing accounts for the desire of many occupational groups to take on the mantle of professionalism. We see this in the increasing numbers of occupational groups that now class themselves as professions. Whereas the original professions were traditionally considered to be medicine, law and the clergy (including university teaching), many other occupational groups also now regard themselves as professions, including school teaching, nursing, social work, accountancy, and town planning, to name a few. Amongst other things, they have in common the ability to provide and control expertise that is in relatively scarce supply (Perkin, 1996). However, many of these professionals work within the framework of the public sector in complex, tightly controlled working environments, and this has played a significant part in the restructuring of professionalism over the last thirty years.

The tight control referred to above has, in part, come about because of the increasing managerialisation that has occurred in the public sector. In the academic literature there is no clear definition of the meaning of this term, but for the purposes of this analysis it will be considered to have three main aspects, based on Clarke and Newman (1993):

- The important role of senior managers, and the reclamation of the right to manage. This establishes managers as a distinct occupational group in their own right, as opposed to a professional peer who happens to occupy a position of leadership amongst equals.
- The need for accountability and responsiveness to a client or user group. This suggests that services should be grounded in the needs of the users.
- The advent of changes in existing power relations between manager, employee and client group. This builds on the above idea, and suggests that different parties should be regarded as stakeholders as opposed to benefactors or recipients of any particular service.

Encroaching managerialism affected professional groups in different ways, although there are some themes in common. During the 1970s and 1980s, economic restructuring was used as a means of redefining the complexities of the public sector for the modern age. Rose (1999), in relation to the concept of the construction of governable spaces, describes such change thus.

This is a matter of defining boundaries, rendering that within them visible, assembling information about that which is included and devising techniques to mobilize the forces and entities thus revealed. For example, before one can seek to manage a domain such as the economy it is first necessary to conceptualise a set of bounded processes and relations as an economy that is amenable to management. (Rose, 1999, p.33)

In practice, there were diverse ways of defining boundaries. The introduction of technology meant that tasks could be automated, and relatively sophisticated tracking systems were a workable option for management teams, leading to an audit culture within the public sector. The decline of national pay agreements, and the unions, meant that employers benefited from a flexible workforce and reductions in costs (for employees there was increased insecurity as a result of casualisation). The introduction of notions of competition and consequently compulsory competitive tendering led to outsourcing of many tasks to the private sector, and increased recruitment of managers from the private sector. These changes in turn all influenced changes within the professions themselves, some of which will now be examined in the light of the managerialist trends discussed above. Table 2.1 on pages 12/13 will compare and contrast four different public-sector professions in relation to managerial changes that have taken place since 1970.

From the table, derived from the literature and developed further, we see that the four different public sector professions appear to have different areas in common, as far as their position within the late 20th century British economy was concerned. As discussed previously, concern about rapidly increasing costs led to a desire to reduce costs through mechanisms such as the introduction of competition and internal markets, and this is seen in aspects of all of the professions considered. In practice, this meant schemes such as contracting out responsibilities such as school dinners, hospital cleaning, and maintenance contracts. Workforce costs were streamlined in many cases by introducing new contracts or using casual labour on fixed-term contracts, sometimes using the same workers who had been on more favourable permanent contracts previously.

Table 2.1 Managerialist changes taking place within public sector professions, 1970 onwards
(based on Clarke, Cochrane and McLaughlin, 1994 and Rose, 1999)

	Perceived concerns	Managerialist solutions	Implications for professions
Social Security²	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Steep increase in costs ■ Lack of transparency ■ Client dependency culture 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Target-setting ■ Review-based achievement ■ Casualisation of workforce ■ Emphasis on positive behaviour 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Career path dependent upon meeting quantitative targets ■ Employment insecurity ■ Increased workload in response to accountability
NHS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Multiple chains of command ■ Steep increase in costs ■ Poor efficiency ■ High levels of consultant autonomy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Introduction of NHS managers ■ Priorities based on budget not medical need ■ Increased surveillance of consultants ■ Internal markets 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ New consultant contracts that increase time as NHS employee and decrease time available for private practice ■ Control in favour of health trusts ■ Increased opportunities for career advancement for nurses, e.g. as nurse practitioners ■ Increased workload in response to accountability

	Perceived concerns	Managerialist solutions	Implications for professions
Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Lack of administrative efficiency ■ Low educational standards ■ Low levels of accountability 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Heads trained as managers via NPOH (National Professional Qualification for Headteachers) ■ Marketisation of parental choice ■ Extrinsic controls (National Curriculum, Ofsted) ■ Shift in Initial Teacher Training, from university-based to school-based 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ External controls over initial teacher training and continual professional development ■ Power of teaching unions reduced ■ Increased workload in response to accountability ■ Erosion of teacher autonomy, both of time and task ■ Performance related pay ■ Increased diversity of routes into the profession (e.g. Graduate Teacher Programme) ■ Introduction of Higher Level Teaching Assistants
Police	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Increase in crime rates ■ Decline in success rates ■ Service heavily centralised ■ Lack of accountability 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Decentralisation ■ Sharing of information via technology ■ Increased transparency 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Pay index-linked to average earnings rather than inflation ■ Increased diversity of routes into policing (e.g. graduate entry) ■ Increased diversity in recruitment ■ Increased workload in relation to accountability

Lower-ranking employees, such as nurses and classroom assistants, were encouraged to develop their skills so that they could be appointed into new roles, such as nurse practitioners and (more recently) Higher Level Teaching Assistants. This would allow them to take over some of the responsibilities of doctors and teachers, but at reduced cost. Additionally, increasing the workloads of professionals in general terms meant that fewer employees were required overall.

These new employment practices led to increased unionisation in some cases and, in the case of education, strike action. This could sometimes be regionally based, when disputes involved managerial procedures that were regarded as inappropriate. Occasionally there would be national strikes or other industrial action (such as a work to rule), relating to pay or workload disputes, and these were timed to cause maximum disruption to schools, during examination periods, for example.

As far as reducing costs from the client end was concerned, there was a trend towards pathologising the end user in some instances. For example, the unemployed were required to participate in training and development activities, otherwise their benefit was reduced. The unhealthy were required to take steps to improve their overall levels of health, such as giving up smoking or alcohol, or they were threatened with having treatment limited in the future. These are examples of Government seeking to control costs via controlling the behaviour of a sub-section of its electorate, and 'othering' a group of its own citizens by seeking to brand them as being outside mainstream society. We see the professions apparently complicit within this, for example with doctors refusing to take high-cost patients onto their practice lists, and with numbers of school exclusions increasing as teachers reject non-compliant pupils.

The UK Government quest for professional accountability is also embedded within the list in table 2.1. As a means of ensuring increased transparency, from the late 1970s onwards, regular reviews were set in place, and linked to quantitative measurements of outcomes. In education, for example, these reviews were carried out by Ofsted and linked to league tables of educational attainment. In healthcare, similar league tables existed, giving details of successful outcomes, waiting list lengths, and so on. In policing, crime figures were published regularly. This was ostensibly a means of allowing both Government and members of the public to track the effectiveness of the public sector. However, it had the additional effect of removing autonomy of time and task from these professional groups, as they were obliged to conform to the centralised standards frame-

work outlined by the Government. It also involved increased workloads, as protocols relating to the accountability process were imposed, resulting in increased paperwork and monitoring systems. This increased workload in turn required a shift in training methods, to enable professionals of the future to become more compliant with respect to auditing requirements. Training was in some cases moved away from the university sector, and replaced with on-the-job training, such as the Graduate Teaching Programme. This meant that training became more practical, rather than theoretical, possibly leading to a more compliant and task-orientated workforce. To service these extensive changes, there needed to be increased technology to reduce data handling costs, streamline work patterns and generally to facilitate the processing of increasingly large quantities of data. Investment in technology paradoxically led to increased demands for further auditing as new protocols became possible.

Upon examining table 2.1 to see where different areas contrast, it appears that some professions were subject to more radical restructuring than others, and some were subject to more negative rather than positive changes. For example, many of the changes taking place within the teaching profession appeared to be negative in character, involving increased levels of external scrutiny and control. This increase in negative change took place in the NHS as well, particularly in relation to the work of consultants. However, in contrast to teachers, NHS consultants were still able, in many cases, to maintain levels of private practice outside their normal duties, that allowed them autonomy of task as well as favourable income levels. This was an option not open to teachers in any useful sense, as their hours had been strictly defined. In comparison with other public sector professional groups, changes that were more sweeping were introduced within the teaching profession, and this meant that the stage was being set for teachers to feel professionally undermined, and subsequently to experience the crisis of vocation referred to earlier in this chapter. This may go some way to explaining why teachers were initially so quick to resort to industrial action, and subsequently to leave the profession.

The next section will discuss particular changes that took place in the education profession, with specific reference to the 1988 Education Reform Act.

After the 1988 Education Reform Act – a brave new world?

An overview of the 1988 Education Reform Act is a crucial part of the enquiry into the role of teachers within society, and vital if we are to understand how the political climate changed in relation to teaching. However, first of all, it needs to be considered within the context of post-war British education as a whole.

Until 1988, the most significant event in 20th century education policy had been R.A. Butler's 1944 Education Act. This was brought in under a Conservative administration, towards the end of the Second World War, and was responsible for dramatically changing the social landscape of education in Britain. The war had led to a desire for increased social equality in accessing education. Therefore state funding for universal education up to the age of 15 was introduced, later to be raised to the age of 16. Although not specified in the 1944 Act, a tripartite system of secondary education was widely used to select pupils early on for specialism via an examination at the age of 11. This proved to be more or less bipartite in practice, with a grammar school stream working towards examinations, and a secondary modern stream being given a more practically-based education that some regarded as inferior. This clearly was not a perfect solution, particularly as the selection process presented its own problems (for example, girls continually outperformed boys in the 11+ selection examination, yet successful girls were allocated fewer places). However, eventually this system evolved into the comprehensive system of secondary education, in which, theoretically anyway, children of all abilities were educated together.

Over time there were refinements to the system. As mentioned above, the school-leaving age was raised to 16 in the 1970s. Comprehensive education meant that, in many areas, selection processes were abandoned in favour of catchment areas being used to define intake.

Yet by the 1980s, there was significant dissatisfaction with the 1944 Act, particularly as it did not reflect the neoliberal³ and neoconservative⁴ agenda of the Conservative government. In the 1988 Education Reform Act, there was political impetus to see education marketised, allowing good schools to compete against bad ones for pupils, theoretically forcing the bad ones to close. There was a political desire for increased centralisation of education, which eventually led to Local Education Authorities being systematically undermined, mainly by allowing schools to opt out of local authority control, and

become directly-funded, or ‘Grant Maintained’ from central Government. A National Curriculum was introduced, as a further standardisation measure, along with new public examinations, called the General Certificate in Secondary Education, to replace the existing Ordinary Level and Certificate in Secondary Education examinations. Further assessment and quality control mechanisms were introduced, including Standard Assessment Tests, aimed at assessing pupils’ progress in relation to the National Curriculum at ages 7, 11 and 14, and school inspections via the Office for Standards in Education (Ofsted), which replaced the existing Local Authority inspection systems. Overall, it was seen as essential to align educational structures in the UK with neoliberal political ideology.

Consequently, since the Act was passed, there have been fundamental changes to the nature of teacher professionalism on many levels. Teachers were told what to teach and, in many situations, how to teach it. They were scrutinised and controlled as never before, to ensure standardisation of delivery. Table 2.2 compares and contrasts different themes of professional life. This will act as a useful signpost for the main ideas and arguments to follow.

The table gives some characteristics of teacher professionalism in a general sense but for a full understanding, it is important to look also at how professionalism is defined and constructed in a broader, theoretical sense.

Table 2.2: Characteristics of teacher professionalism before and after the 1988 Education Reform Act

(Table developed from Beck (1999, 2002), Bernstein (1996), Education Reform Act (1988))

Pre-1988	Post-1988
Autonomous work	Directed work
Lifelong habituation (known sociologically as <i>habitus</i>) alongside peers	Infinitely retrainable according to needs of economy or state agency
Industrial action	Locally-negotiated agreements
Moral imperative	Audit
Public service ethos	Technical efficiency
Individualism, holism	Standardised product
Ownership of pedagogy	National Curriculum
Vocation	Career

The work of Nias (1981, 1987, 1996, and 1997), and Mitchell and Webber (1999) looks at teacher identity as a socially constructed phenomenon, which is based on a collective impression of the role and image of teachers in society. This impression is not necessarily based on the realities and practices of contemporary professionalism. This conception rings true for the 1934 example of Mr Chips, given at the beginning of this chapter. Whilst the Zeppelins may clearly date the example to World War I, the vocationally based behaviour, or Chips' moral imperative in the face of adversity, has a certain timeless quality about it. This type of teacher morality is socially perceived as being endemic to teaching, underpinning professional practice. It is seen as constant, rather than ebbing and flowing according to the vagaries of history. The idea of a moral imperative of this nature offers reassurance and stability at a time of great social change.

In their different research projects, Nias, and Mitchell and Webber, ask interesting questions about these perceptions of teachers, and how teachers perceive themselves. For example, a constant theme throughout all of the works referenced above is the ubiquitous nature of the chalkboard when children play schools. Its presence is intriguing, especially when it is considered that these days, chalk and talk teaching comprises such a relatively small part of the school day. Equally, Nias and Mitchell and Webber found that asking teachers about their own experiences as pupils reveals a good deal about their own mental schemata, or understanding of educational processes.

This is revealing work, but it does have some limitations. All of the original studies tended to involve research subjects who grounded their practice in a holistic pedagogy, in a primary school environment. By confining their research to thoughtful primary school teachers who were generally used to engaging in reflective practice, the research outcomes were bound to be limited to data that represented a restricted view of the profession.

To make this clearer, it is helpful to dissect it further, using an educational model grounded in post-1960s UK education theory. Primary schools of the 1970s and early 1980s could probably be classified as Progressivist. In this type of learning situation, there is a relatively fluid body of knowledge, with the teacher carefully interpreting the needs of each individual pupil. Research into teachers' professional identities might have looked wholly different, had it involved British teachers from boys' selective independent schools, for example. Such schools place great importance on quantifiable educational

outcomes. As the HMC (Head Masters' and Head Mistresses' Conference)⁵ puts it, 'Most HMC schools are highly academic institutions where there will be a good deal of emphasis on examination results' (UK Parliamentary Select Committee on Education and Employment, 1998). Here, teachers might reasonably be expected to be more engaged with a traditionalist model of education, stressing a fixed body of examination-orientated knowledge originating from outside the pupil, and a relatively formal, structured learning environment aimed at preparing pupils for such examinations. These different types of educational environment involve different approaches to the craft of teaching, and correspondingly different models of professionalism.

Regardless of the type of individual chosen as a research subject, however, such perceptions of teacher professionalism have one thing in common. Perceptions are frequently analysed subjectively in relation to the life experiences of individuals, to examine the effect that they have had on career paths. In other words, they are highly subjective, and are essentially self-perceptions. If a teacher was spoken to unkindly at an early age, this observation might figure prominently in the data.

For example, in Mitchell and Webber (1999) an early childhood instructor describes having suffered at the hands of her second-grade teacher:

Memory: Valentines Day. It is my turn to pass out the cookies and milk for snack time. I have laboriously figured out the calendar and have been waiting for this day. The cookies will be heart shaped ... Don't you ever wash? Someone else will have to hand out the snack. She goes on talking, someone else is given the box of cookies. I remember looking at my hands as if they belonged to someone else. It had never occurred to me that there was an underside to nails, that one was supposed to do something to them.

Recent memories: I still carefully clean under my nails before any faculty meeting, interview, speech, conference. It is a source of great frustration to me that I cannot grow long nails.

(Source: Edwards, 1995, quoted in Mitchell and Webber, 1999, p. 60)

If a teacher were inspired by the dedication of an individual, this too would feature. Again, such observations are extremely self-reflexive, in that sense, and subjective. Quoting again from Mitchell and Webber:

Janine: Who would have ever thought that a teacher could be a hero and someone to admire? I never realised how much I appreciated my teachers until this semester. I really hope to make a difference in my students' lives ... (Source: *ibid.*, p.41)

In light of the current chronic recruitment and retention crisis in the English education system, there are clearly larger issues that need addressing as well, issues beyond the personal experiences of individuals. Bernstein (1996) and Beck (1999) offer highly relevant arguments about the role of educational sociology in understanding wider professional issues. They share concerns about what they consider to be a rupture in education, which can largely be tracked back to the 1988 Act. They argue that previously pedagogical processes were assumed to be part of a teacher's professional domain. As a professional, the teacher would develop a curriculum that would meet the needs of his or her pupils in terms of their individual abilities, ambitions and general all-round education. During the course of these pupil-teacher interactions, the teacher was mainly answerable to fellow professionals and parents, and indirectly moderated by the outcomes of any public examinations taken by his or her pupils. Other than that, the teacher had dominion over the sacred space of the classroom.

This changed with the introduction of the National Curriculum, centralised school inspection services and centralised testing services. Centralised control meant that teachers were now answerable to the Government, in effect. The Department for Education told teachers what to teach via the introduction of a standardised National Curriculum, how they were supposed to teach it and how they should measure any success. This undermined the status of the professional and turned the teacher into a technician, delivering a model for education that had been developed elsewhere. Subsequently, school inspectors from the Office for Standards in Education (Ofsted) visited periodically to ensure that teachers were 'on message', delivering this official model for education.

Even supposedly independent schools such as Summerhill⁶ were under pressure to conform to this regime. This caused problems. By not insisting that pupils attend lessons, Summerhill failed its Ofsted inspection. The Ofsted school inspection report of 1 March 1999 made the following criticisms of Summerhill.

60. The requirement from the DfEE following the previous inspection for the school to produce an action plan has led to some constructive discussion. When HMI visited the school in 1998, they

noted some promising early developments in relation to assessment, record keeping and peer support. However, there has been only very limited implementation of these plans and the constant revision, for example in the draft assessment policy, is likely to undermine further progress. More seriously, despite the Action Plan, it remains clear that there are major areas of unresolved difficulty where the school's philosophy is in conflict with wider external expectations of pupils' levels of achievement and progress. The most serious difficulty for the school is that it does not agree that identified weaknesses in its provision are weaknesses: such judgements are seen as external impositions at odds with the school's beliefs and values. The principal and staff do not acknowledge the need to monitor or to evaluate teaching or the curriculum because they do not see it as their responsibility to improve pupils' attainment. The result is that only a small minority of pupils receive education that is good or satisfactory. For the great majority, their education is fragmented, disjointed and likely to adversely affect their future options. Quite how the school reconciles such high levels of under-achievement, together with a high proportion of unsatisfactory teaching, with the democratic principles it purports to promote is very difficult to understand. In other words, the approach seems to entrench weaknesses in teaching and learning which sell pupils short rather than prepare them fully for living in a democratic society. (Ofsted, 1999)

There are two key points in the extract above, that usefully illuminate the impact of the 1988 Education Reform Act on schools, and its effect on conceptions of teacher professionalism.

it remains clear that there are major areas of unresolved difficulty where the school's philosophy is in conflict with wider external expectations of pupils' levels of achievement and progress (lines 6-8)

In this statement, there seems to be an assumption upon the part of the Ofsted inspectors⁷ that there are convergent views within society regarding expectations of pupils, and that such expectations should be expressed academically. It does not seem to be satisfactory that parents, pupils and teachers develop their own definition of relative success, with different criteria, which in the case of Summerhill might mean effective participation within a self-governing, democratic community. (Interestingly, during the year of this inspection, Summerhill pupils achieved GCSE results that were better than the national average. This throws into doubt the whole question of their apparent under-achievement in the eyes of the Ofsted inspectors.)⁸

A second key point in the extract gives us a useful insight into teacher autonomy versus government influence.

The most serious difficulty for the school is that it does not agree that identified weaknesses in its provision are weaknesses: such judgements are seen as external impositions at odds with the school's beliefs and values. (lines 8-11)

Here we see teachers at Summerhill insisting that the school has its own individual philosophy and that this is valid and appropriate. The Ofsted inspectors, on the other hand, feel that the school is refusing to conform to a particular model for education, and that this model is threatening the well-being of the pupils. Summerhill teachers are not considered by Ofsted to be at liberty to decide what is best for their pupils and their insistence on doing so is heavily criticised.

Subsequent to the school inspection report of 1 March 1999, a formal Notice of Complaint was issued by Ofsted to the school, despite the statistical evidence to suggest that the school offered a great deal to pupils. In the light of this Ofsted report, it begins to become apparent that, when confined to one educational model, teachers become increasingly dominated by the governmental processes outlined above. This means that knowledge is becoming dehumanised, and divorced from the knower. Teachers are subject to broader societal pressure, and this finds form in the managerialisation of the teaching profession which drives the apparent dehumanisation of the profession. As Bernstein argues,

Knowledge, after nearly a thousand years, is divorced from inwardness and literally dehumanised. Once knowledge is separated from inwardness, from commitments, from personal dedication, and from the deep structure of the self, then people may be moved about, substituted for each other and excluded from the market. (Bernstein, 2000, p. 86)

Following Bernstein's train of thought, in the post-1988 education landscape, knowledge is external to the individual, and exists as a published document, with success or failure determined by conformity to the documentation. Beck (1999) argues that increasing marketisation within education has the effect of deskilling the workforce, by making them less able to trust their own judgement. At a practical level, the arguments of Beck and Bernstein suggest that teachers are likely to lose the ability to formulate their own personal constructions of pedagogy or to draft their own curricula. They are discouraged from deciding their own educational priorities in

the light of their pupils' needs or practising the art of teaching in a way that suits their temperaments and personalities, and those of their pupils. In short, they become technicians. Bernstein saw this as a crisis between faith and reason.

To theorise this new aspect of teacher professionalism, this chapter will now combine the person-centred approach of researchers such as Nias with the highly theorised, more neutral focus of Bernstein, to explore notions of teacher identity in the light of changes in the balance of power and control between teachers and Government. It also looks at the new managerialism discussed earlier, that is a characteristic of the knowledge economy, and the consequent shifts from internal regulation to external regulation. Bernstein would no doubt define this as a type of symbolic control of teachers. Finally, the chapter asks whether there is a conflict between the role of teachers before the 1988 Education Reform Act and after it. It asks whether teachers have been deprofessionalised, and whether views of the self have changed.

Teaching as a vocation

As argued earlier, the traditional view of the teacher is one that suggests an underlying sense of vocation. It is useful now to expand this further, to help establish how important vocation is perceived to be within modern-day teaching. Sociological theory allows useful insights into this issue. It offers a way of analysing and tracking the structural changes that have occurred within the teaching profession over the last two decades, in terms of what it means to be a true professional. This helps us to achieve an understanding of the societal issues that might have tacitly influenced the responses of the research participants that will be discussed later in the book.

Durkheim's (1997) and Bourdieu's (1977) concept of *habitus* suggests inculcation into certain values, an adoption of a total personality type that represents what it means to be a teacher. This is to be achieved after a period of apprenticeship, with any changes being gradual, over time. Weber (1993) also supports the idea of a gradual growth towards the ideals of a group, or developing a professional persona over time, as can be seen in his analysis of sanctification of the priesthood. There are definite parallels to be drawn between the priesthood as a social institution in Western culture, and teaching, as discussed earlier. For example, both require the following: qualifications for entry (in the case of teaching, it is now a graduate-entry profession); ongoing training (Initial Teacher Training followed by

Continuing Professional Development, in the case of teachers); and it could be argued in a looser sense, borrowing from religious imagery, that both involve what we could term a state of grace (Qualified Teacher Status, in the case of teachers). To develop these ideas further, it is necessary to analyse the relationship between education and the educator.

Table 2.3: Relationship between internal and external regulation of teachers

(Based on Beck (1999), Bernstein (2000) p. 36-38)

External Regulation	Internal Regulation
No prior assumptions made regarding the inner state of the teacher.	Assumptions made about the prior existence of a teaching vocation.
Teacher is infinitely adaptable to circumstance.	Teacher has adopted a personality type or <i>habitus</i> .
Use of state agency for regulation.	Guarantee of professional integrity through the use of a moral code.

Where does Mr Chips' model of professionalism fit within this framework? Clearly his strong personal and moral commitment to teaching is an important factor here. Yet he adapts to circumstance as necessary. Perhaps it is his overarching integrity that allows adaptation of this nature. These are important considerations to bear in mind when examining professionalism.

Durkheim (1957) subscribed to a less individualistic view of professionalism in some senses, regarding the professions as constituting a link between a central authority, or state power, and the development of civic morals by individual citizens. Like the Roman god Janus, the professions therefore look in two directions at once. As far as teaching is concerned, this double perspective causes a conflict between the need for external regulation, and the assumption of internal quality control.

This conflict was particularly evident in the aftermath of the 1988 Education Reform Act, as we saw in the extract from the Ofsted inspectors' report on Summerhill school. As professionals, teachers in general were not particularly committed to reflecting or delivering the government policies of the time. Indeed, it would have been surprising if they had done so. Highly unionised⁹ and bringing their

own unique pedagogies and ideologies to the classroom, teachers had worked hard to classify themselves as professionals, with the autonomy and status due to members of an exclusive body of this type. The teaching profession therefore regarded any interference on the part of any Government with great suspicion. This situation was untenable for a Conservative government seeking to make radical social reforms. Hence the Government was forced to introduce a range of measures designed to evaluate success in conforming to various ideals. An example of this would be Ofsted inspections, which measured success in conforming to the National Curriculum, using the National Curriculum as a normative model. The teacher who conformed became an ideal teacher, who demonstrated ideal teacher behaviour. The introduction of external regulation in this way contributed to the increasing secularisation (Beck, 1999) of the profession and, in doing so, initially undermined the inner commitment teachers brought to their work.

There were also changes to teacher training. Instead of encouraging trainee teachers to develop an inner vocation over the duration of a four-year B.Ed course, teachers were trained in a year on PGCE (Postgraduate Certificate in Education) courses. The training they were given became increasingly secularised¹⁰, to conform to the demands of the Teacher Training Agency. This is summarised in table 2.4 below.

Measures such as Ofsted and changes to teacher training programmes gave an overarching, legitimising rhetoric to the political position of the time, which was one of central control. Teachers were forced to adapt their models of professionalism accordingly or, at

Table 2.4: Changes in Teacher Training in relation to secularisation

(Table developed from Durkheim (1957), Weber (1993), and Bernstein (2000)

Sacred Model for Teacher Training	Secular Model for Teacher Training
Institution accountable to religious body.	Institution accountable to government.
Development of teaching habitus over time.	Practical course in instructional and administrative techniques.
Teaching by example.	Teaching by task completion.

the very least, adapt their own discourses to acknowledge the dominant ideology, as part of their own impression management (Goffman, 1971). It is easy to see how this could lead to personal conflict, if there were an increasing dissonance between the public and private faces of the teaching professional. In the right circumstances, this might be relieved by adopting different types of teacher talk or ways of discussing professional issues, according to the audience and situation: pupils, inspectors, staff room, parents' evenings. These discourses will have differing degrees of formality and informality; the staff room reference to a child being a nuisance translates into a child having challenging behaviour on school reports, for example.

This type of behaviour demonstrates a difference between words and deeds (Keddie, 1971). Keddie reported similar contradictions in other teacher discourses in the 1970s. There were official discourses used to draft departmental policy documents (for example, where setting and streaming were considered to be ideologically flawed). This contrasted with the staff room discourses used to describe pupils (where they were classified into A, B and C stream pupils, depending upon achievement levels, social class, motivation, and so on). While this does not conclusively prove an epistemological or moral contradiction for teachers, it does tell us a great deal about the ways in which teachers attempt to navigate different professional paths, that are sometimes conflicting. Monitoring this shifting of teacher talk proved to be a vitally important aspect of the research, particularly in relation to the use of pronouns, as will be discussed in Chapter 8. It is also a useful illustration of the ongoing tensions that exist between teachers' internal and external environments.

Typologies of professionalism

The focus will now turn to identifying different aspects of professionalism more precisely. Mapping out typologies of professionalism is useful in developing a better understanding of the complexities that surround teachers' engagement with their own profession. It also provides additional context for the different responses made by the research participants, which will be discussed in detail in Chapter 7.

Nias (1981) argued that, depending on their personal circumstances, teachers adopted one or more of four main forms of commitment to teaching. (The typologies listed below are those of Nias, and I use her terminology, but in each case I have paraphrased her

explanations and, in one or two cases, added useful links to points made earlier in this chapter). Additionally, if we consider these typologies in the light of the comments made by the research participants who took part in the *Mapping Professional Conceptions of Learning Futures* study, this allows us to test Nias's theoretical perspectives against a particular set of teachers.

- **Commitment as Caring** – This assumes that teaching has a vocational element, which involves putting the children first. In terms of this analysis, it reflects the Weberian construct of the inner nature of vocation. For example, many comments made by teachers during the course of this research referred to the importance of carefully considering the role of pupils within institutions, and the importance of good home/school relationships.
- **Commitment as Occupational Competence** – This refers to professional standards. Nias explains that teachers who are committed to teaching well make frequent references to standards of punctuality, reliability, efficiency and concern for children, judging their colleagues accordingly. Being seen to be working hard, sometimes to the point of exhaustion, is seen as a benchmark of success in this area. In this study, there was little reference to professional standards, or being seen to be working hard, apart from one fleeting observation about the possibility of the 24-hour school being established.
- **Commitment as Identity** – This involves identification with what it means to feel like a teacher. Durkheim's and Bourdieu's notions of *habitus* as a total personality type, described previously, applies here. Teachers in the study readily discussed the changing nature of teacher professionalism in this regard, and what it meant to them personally.
- **Commitment as Career-Continuance** – A desire to build a career, perhaps to support dependants. There was little reference to this by the research participants, other than concerns expressed about the sustainability of public sector pensions, and the level of public sector salaries in relation to private sector remuneration.

This is clearly an interesting set of typologies. As stated, the idea of caring, or vocation, clearly links to the Weberian concepts outlined above, as the sense of identity links to Durkheim, Bourdieu, and notions of *habitus*. The two other categories appear more contemporary. Professional skills are assumed to be readily evaluated,

hence the introduction of Ofsted on the post-1988 education landscape, as described later in this chapter. Likewise, an assumption of career-continuance, or career management, also links to a new, managerial age that equates progress with advancement. The research participants expressed views on all of these areas, and often located themselves within more than one of Nias's categories simultaneously.

Lacey (1977), on the other hand, narrows the idea of vocation down to two categories: *quest for education* for its own sake, or in other words idealism, and *professional skill*, which was to be found in those dedicated to career advancement. These typologies are similar to those of Nias, who also narrows the categories down to two: those that require a readiness to devote personal resources (for example time or money), and those that suggest an intention to make a career in teaching. These categories are not mutually exclusive, of course, but they do paint a picture of notions of teacher professionalism before the 1988 Act. The research participants felt that the former was important, in teaching the young to value education intrinsically. However they also appeared to be mindful of the latter, aware that their professional skills were continually under scrutiny and needed to be effectively demonstrated in order to justify their standing as teachers and also as professionals within a wider society.

Post-1988, Goodson and Hargreaves (1996) use six categories to classify professionalism, which give a great deal more insight into changes over time. Again, these categories are linked to the data gathered from the research participants in the *Mapping Professional Conceptions of Learning Futures* project.

- **Classical Professionalism.** This is characterised as seeking professional status and recognition, in the manner of law and medicine. It includes a shared technical culture, a strong service ethic, self-regulation, and collegial control. There are problems with this approach. It has been described as self-serving, and in the case of education, related attempts to create a codified body of knowledge have been problematic. Teachers in the Learning Futures study spoke of the need for this model of professionalism, as a means of raising the status of teachers within society. However they did not report approaching their professional practice exclusively with this model in mind, although they did value the notion of a strong service ethic.
- **Flexible Professionalism.** This seeks to build on a sense of a shared professional community, but runs the risk of being

contrived, if aspects of it are made compulsory, such as peer-to-peer coaching, for example. Many teachers in this study expressed the desire to participate in more of these initiatives, and communicate with other teachers globally.

- **Practical Professionalism.** This version of professionalism attempts to respect the practical, experiential knowledge of the teacher. This is rooted in the discourse of reflective practice. Such a discourse has its own problems, however. It can lead to an introspective, isolationist approach to professional practice. During the course of this research, teachers did not seem to link the idea of reflective practice with their visions of the future. An exception to this was the case of one class music teacher, who appeared to engage constantly with her subject on many levels, precisely with the purpose of long-term future development within society for her subject.
- **Extended Professionalism.** This approach seeks a balance between the introspective analysis of practical professionalism, as defined above, and a more extrovert engagement with the external world. This allows the teacher to locate his or her practice within a wider theoretical perspective. Amongst the research participants, teachers who had studied for higher degrees were more likely to comment on the relationship between their professional practice and the external world. This suggested that the act of taking part in sustained study validated by external organisations is important. This is because it produces a better understanding of broader issues relating to teaching, rather than simply self-reflection alone.
- **Complex Professionalism.** This discourse emphasises the task complexity of the teacher's workload, arguing that professions should be judged by such complexity of work tasks. Teaching is therefore presented in a favourable light. However, it allows an insight into issues relating to teacher fatigue, which will be discussed later in the chapter. This model of professionalism links to Etzioni (1969) in which teaching was described as a semi-profession alongside social work and nursing; these are all groups who work in complex organisations, usually under the control of others. Teachers in this study did not appear to conceptualise their own experience in these terms, preferring to see themselves as higher-level professionals.
- **Towards Post-modern Professionalism.** This involves seven aspects: discretionary judgement, collaborative cultures, hetero-

onomy (through working with other professionals as well as pupils and parents), active care of pupils, continuous learning, and recognition of high task complexity. Many research participants spoke of these aspects of professionalism as being important, and considered that they would be more likely to occur in the future. This model is similar to that described by Whitty (2002) as democratic professionalism. This promotes the ideals of altruism and public service, whilst harnessing teachers' expertise and building links with other stakeholders in education, as well as other progressive movements.

Considering all the above typologies, it becomes clear that there have been radical changes in the nature of professionalism since Nias and Lacey were writing in the late 1970s and early 1980s, but that aspects of the frameworks they have developed still apply today. Many, if not most, of the professionalism categories described above seemed to apply to the teachers taking part in the study. However, the whole professionalism debate has become increasingly complex. The trigger for this seems to have been the 1988 Education Reform Act, with its escalating demands on teachers. This led to a significant change to the nature of professional identity, reinforced by the introduction of school inspection at the hands of Ofsted. During this period, Government sought to impose a form of idealised professional identity on teachers, that conformed to its public policy directives. There seemed to be little understanding or acceptance of different professional types within this construction of the ideal professional. This was to have serious consequences for the profession as a whole.

With such a significant change in the nature of the dominant discourse, from vocation-led to policy-led, there was no longer any need for teachers to be internally committed, only that they should succeed in delivering the National Curriculum. In other words, instead of teachers grounding their professional practice in their own beliefs and customs, developed over the course of years in conjunction with fellow-professionals, teachers had to change. They needed to teach in a way that reflected the dominant political discourse of the time, whatever that might be at any given time, reflecting the priorities of the day. This meant they had to adopt a more short-term view of their work. They were successful if they managed to deliver the National Curriculum in the appropriate manner. If the National Curriculum changed, then they had to change. This is in contrast to the vocational model of professionalism, where a teacher would come up with his or her own set of be-

liefs and values, and seek to share these with pupils, as a preparation for life. That is not to say that there was no sense of vocation involved in post-1988 teaching. It was simply that the overall emphasis changed.

As discussed previously, this shift could lead to internal dissonance, causing stress for some teachers. Others played the game opportunistically, depending upon their desired outcomes, and their ability to have command over a number of discourses simultaneously.

Ofsted was such a significant regulating discourse in its own right that there will now be a broader analysis of its effect on teacher professionalism.

State Control and Ofsted as Qualitariat

This section examines the role of quality assurance in relation to teacher professionalism, as this featured prominently in the responses of the research participants, and clearly loomed large on their professional landscapes.

Since the 1988 Act, there have been many changes to the UK education system, and one of the biggest indicators of this has been the introduction of centralised control mechanisms. This manifested itself in the form of Ofsted, which acted as a state-appointed qualitariat, ensuring the effective delivery of the National Curriculum, and a related model of teacher professionalism as defined centrally. As we saw, Bernstein (1996) argues that this externally regulated knowledge requires inner emptiness and a detachment of knowledge from the knower. Beck (1999) develops this argument by claiming such emptiness is a characteristic of the Learning Society, and that constant refashioning of professional identities is therefore unavoidable. Therefore, the demand for flexible employees means that people should be malleable and ductile, able to retrain repeatedly for new jobs, new roles, and new workplace philosophies. At the dawn of the 21st century, the ultimate accolade for an organisation is that it is a Learning Organisation, with people engaging with retraining and renewal at every level. This is a good example of the contemporary thrust towards flexibility.

Yet, in terms of education, what was so remarkable about the 1988 Act? As discussed earlier, this Act provided a radical redirection for the education service. The previous Act, created by a Conservative government in 1944, had been based on a consensual political and social agenda, whereas the 1988 Act was the result of a shift in

political opinion to the New Right, so did not have the same degree of consensus. Therefore it was the cause of conflict between demands of centralisation, and the growth of an individualistic culture.

To expand on the earlier brief description of the 1988 changes, the main consequences of the Act were as follows:

- Removal of some power from the hands of Local Education Authorities.
- Establishment of new types of school, such as City Technology Colleges.
- Open enrolment, which allowed greater parental choice in schooling.
- Local Management of Schools (LMS), which allowed schools largely to control their own budgets.
- The introduction of the National Curriculum, which insisted upon a standardised education product throughout all maintained schools.
- The introduction of the Office For Standards in Education (Ofsted), a new school inspection body, which was meant to give objective feedback about school standards.
- Standard Assessment Tests, to generate quantitative data about attainment levels in maintained schools.

For the purposes of this chapter, the most significant developments were the introduction of the National Curriculum and the introduction of Ofsted, as they involved the most direct control of the teacher in the classroom and, therefore, teacher identity.

The National Curriculum and Ofsted are interlinked insofar as Ofsted inspects whether the National Curriculum is being implemented effectively. Implicit within this is the idea that the National Curriculum provides a canon of knowledge that is self-sufficient and complete. Ofsted is there to inspect whether a school succeeds or fails in delivering this particular canon. However, as Gadamer (1986) claimed, administration is not neutral, so Ofsted was forced to take on the political stance of the time, as it had been founded by the Conservative administration. This led to the rise of a highly technicised qualitarat that had the effect of mystifying evaluation processes, and dominating those subjected to its regime (Casey and Apple, 1989; Jeffrey and Woods, 1996). Conducting itself in an authoritarian manner, many teachers felt that it largely de-

humanised the delivery of education (for an account of how this impacted on the personal lives of teaching professionals, see Jeffrey and Woods, 1996). This reflects contemporaneous debates in Management Science. In an article that examines the failure of management to professionalise, Grey (1997) argues that increased managerialism in the public sector has led to new constructs of governable persons. If this is the case, then surely the imposition of a standard curriculum twinned with a regimented and rigorous inspection regime may have led to a change in the way that teachers perceive themselves? Teachers had suddenly become subject to considerable external control, and this could easily be expected to affect their sense of professional autonomy. As Daley writes:

But the answer cannot be to lay down ever more definitive rules and formulae, to take away every shred of professional independence and innovation from the professionals who are themselves responsible for delivering these labour-intensive services. By its nature, teaching is a deeply personal and infinitely varying task. If it does not permit responsiveness and flexibility, intuition and spontaneous judgement, then it is scarcely worth having – and still less worth doing. Some system of schools organisation must be found which can encompass imaginative, individual styles of teaching (and the job satisfaction that goes with them) and the accountability that parents and employers require from education. (Daley, 2002)

There appeared to be something of a generational divide amongst the research participants. Those who trained before the 1988 Act reported valuing professional autonomy, whereas teachers who trained after 1988 appeared to consider this type of control and accountability to be a natural part of their professional environment. Therefore it is useful at this point to consider whether teachers' individual career stages are likely to affect their views on such areas of professionalism.

Teachers and individual life-cycle stages

Whitehead, Preece and Maughan (1999) argue, in relation to the training of mature PGCE students, that teachers are not a collectivity. Denying differences in life cycle stages, age, gender, personal responsibilities, qualifications, prior and current experience and purposes is unhelpful. This is another factor that affects any sense of professional identity, and should be taken into account when evaluating views of the self.

It is useful at this point to trespass briefly into the discipline of psychology. Sociology usually concerns itself with aggregates, but it is important to maintain sight of the fact that aggregates are composed of individuals. A teacher exploring notions of sociological identity asks the question, 'what are the characteristics of the group to which I belong?' On the other hand, a teacher exploring notions of psychological identity asks the question, 'how am I similar or different from the group of people around me?' It is by asking the latter question that we identify instances of *anomie*, with people feeling significant dissonance between themselves and the environment around them. If there is an apparent crisis of vocation in teaching, is this reflected in increased feelings of *anomie* amongst teachers?

For our brief incursion, if we examine the question of age in particular, there are interesting issues to do with teachers' mental health that start to offer answers to the question of *anomie*. Bowers (2002) suggests that teachers over the age of 45 may be more susceptible than other teachers to crises and mental health problems relating to personal life circumstance or the workplace. Ostell (1995) in his study on headteacher stress, argues similarly that such mental health problems result from absolutist thinking, as he has termed it. Such thinking is deeply rooted in the personality of the individual. Ostell defines absolutist thinking as fixed and inflexible, characterised by latent anger, taking workplace difficulties to be personal issues. For example, an absolutist thinker in this context might make statements along these lines: 'I was furious with the year nines for disobeying me like that. They know the standards of behaviour I expect. They let me down badly', or 'I will not have my deputy undermine me like that in front of other members of staff. I will discipline her for this'.

A deeper psychological analysis of this issue would go well beyond the remit of this book. However, there is an interesting link to be made. Bowers (2002) and Ostell (1995) both argue that older teachers are prone to mental health disorders. Day and Bakioglu (1996) support this view in their study of the professional lives of headteachers. They mapped out four stages in a headteacher's career: initiation, development, autonomy and disenchantment. The last stage was characterised by feelings of a lack of control over one's own destiny, a concern for one's own mortality, a sense of frozen professional expertise, and a desire for early retirement.

Such a retreat to an individualistic notion of selfhood is seen by Storr (1988) to be a characteristic consequence of ageing. Coincidentally,

this age group includes the same teachers who experienced the effects of the 1988 Education Reform Act most dramatically. Therefore it is hard to establish whether any professional *anomie* is a consequence of the Act, or merely age-related. Where some teachers may demonstrate manifestations of being under stress, others may seek to play the game to their advantage in an opportunistic fashion, managing different discourses accordingly, as argued previously in this chapter. What is clear, however, is that some teachers might feel alienated by the post-1988 regime, if they are prone to have trouble managing discourses in this way.

In an article examining market competition for post-16 pupils, Maguire *et al* (2001) provides a good example of the contrasting approach of different generations of teachers to school administration in the post-1988 environment. The old head of the sixth form at Northwark Park School believed that schools should work collaboratively to ensure the best for all their pupils. The new head of the sixth form, on the other hand, was aware of heightened competition in his geographical area, and took a sharply stratified, differentiated approach in targeting different client groups. This was sometimes hard for him to reconcile with his belief in comprehensive education, and he tended to use a discourse rooted in the notion of caring values to present a marketised model of sixth form recruitment:

So, it is I suppose contextualising. I mean, that is more, I don't know if we see that as much as recruitment although that is part of it. It is more really a service to our parents and our students. Maguire *et al*, 2001, p.40

This conflict between marketised and non-marketised approaches to pupil recruitment is a good example of how a change in culture can cause internal dissonance resulting in problems for some teachers. If the ability to cope with such dissonance is rooted in the personal resources of the individual, it would explain why teachers adopt different models of teacher professionalism, with varying degrees of success.

Conclusion

There is no conclusive way of arguing that teachers' sense of professional identity was clearer or more positive before or after the 1988 Education Reform Act. What is apparent on the surface is that there were political changes, and that teachers reacted in a negative or positive way, according to their personal situations.

There is also another, deeper issue underpinning this. Weber asked, in relation to science, whether serving progress as an entity in its own right was a meaningful vocation. Is the aim of a professional to help develop the discipline or profession, or is it to serve humanity in some way? Perhaps it is both of these, and perhaps there should be other aims as well. This is something of an existential problem, and in Weber's case, it takes a pessimistic view of life beyond vocation. It links to what Bernstein and Beck would describe as soulless technicism, symbolising rationality without a heart.

In UK education, there has been the introduction of a regulative discourse that shapes teachers, even if they are not internally committed to it. A politically led, Fordist-style system of assessment and evaluation has been given a legitimising rhetoric that fails to take into account the reflexive nature of many teachers' professional activities and individual pedagogies. As Tomas Englund writes (1996), the fact that teachers appear professional does not necessarily mean that they are didactically competent. They are therefore forced to do a difficult balancing act, managing personal and professional discourses, whilst not being immersed in either of them. This leads to an ambiguous professional state, and one where the position of vocation is uncertain. As demonstrated above, there can be dissonance, and subsequent *anomie*.

It might be that the need for teachers to demonstrate continuous improvement in every aspect of their working lives, in a manner that can easily be measured quantitatively, is problematic. The use of league tables, Standard Assessment Tests and downward staff appraisal highlights whether teachers adhere to a politically normative model of teacher professionalism. It does not highlight whether a teacher's subject knowledge is particularly extensive. It fails to demonstrate whether he or she has an intrinsic understanding of his or her pupil group at any given time. It cannot measure whether the teacher is imparting skills and knowledge to pupils that will only bear fruit after they have left school.

The independent sector probably comes closer to demanding this from its teachers than the maintained sector. Parents paying high fees for their children to attend independent schools believe the ethos of independent fee-paying schools is likely to encourage their children to work harder, producing better academic results. However they also believe that independent schooling is likely to improve self-discipline, have a positive moral impact on their children, and encourage maturity and culturally appropriate behaviour and interests (Walford, 1986; Fox, 1985 and 1986). In other words,

parents are looking beyond government notions of education, towards an education for life (and indeed social and cultural reproduction, in the case of culturally appropriate behaviour and interests). These are all aspects of teachers' work that cannot easily be measured quantitatively.

The government-influenced approach to continuous improvement fails to take into account more intangible aspects of education, including the independent school examples given above. It could be a less meaningful path for many than more traditional approaches to professional development. This might explain the difficulty that some teachers have had in coming to terms with the post-1988 educational landscape, and the associated feelings of alienation that they have reported. It certainly suggests that there is a crisis in vocation, in both the sacred and secular sense. The next chapter will examine how this unfolded after Labour came to power in 1997, and how it might have influenced the way the research participants conceptualised their professional world.

Notes

1 Called the Black Papers in contrast to the Government White Papers (Command Papers)

2 In the US, the closest corresponding term for this would be social welfare.

3 Neo-liberalism advocates freedom of choice, marketisation, minimal government and political laissez-faire – in other words, allowing market forces to prevail.

4 Neoconservatism advocates social authoritarianism, disciplined society, the nation state, and strong government. Theoretically, neo-liberalism and neo-conservatism share a desire to secure a free market economy not controlled or influenced by government. They consider that the moral authority of the state has been severely weakened through inadequate economic performance and permissive behaviour, and that drastic measures are necessary to restore a state of equilibrium.

5 The HMC is a professional association of Head Teachers of 240 highly selective independent secondary schools in the UK, and 70 overseas schools. The organisation originally included boys' boarding schools only. Girls' schools had their own professional associations, including the GSA (Girls Schools Association) and the GPDST (Girls Public Day School Trust). Over time, increasing numbers of boys' schools have started to accept girls, thereby becoming co-educational. The organisation, therefore, now embraces boys' schools, girls' schools and co-educational schools. There is also a further organisation called the SHA (Secondary Heads Association) that is a merger of the Association of Head Mistresses, and the Association of Head Masters. Such mergers reflect the move away from the gender-segregated secondary education of the nineteenth century, towards co-educational provision generally.

6 Summerhill is an independent, progressive co-educational boarding school based in Suffolk. It was founded by A.S. Neill in 1921 with the aim of promoting pupils' individual freedom through membership of a self-governing, democratic community.

7 Technically, HMI (Her Majesty's Inspectorate) is the correct name for school inspectors working within Ofsted, however in current popular terminology, HMI and Ofsted appear to be almost interchangeable.

8 In 1998, 67% of Summerhill school leavers achieved 5 or more GCSEs at grades A-C. The national average during 1998 was 54.6% (source: QCA [Qualifications and Curriculum Authority].)

9 The main teaching unions in the UK are the NUT (National Union of Teachers), the NASUWT (National Association of Schoolmasters Union of Women Teachers), the ATL (Association of Teachers and Lecturers), and the PAT (Professional Association of Teachers). Membership of these organisations is optional, but teachers who wish to work in the maintained sector are obliged to be members of the GTC (General Teaching Council).

10 The first teacher-training organisation in the UK was the SPCK (Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge) that was founded in 1698. In this sense, however, the term secularisation is used to mean training that prepared teachers to deliver the National Curriculum in a technical sense, rather than encouraging them to develop a sense of teacherness.

3

The Neo-conservative Offensive

This chapter gives an account of post-1997 politics, and how this has affected education in general. It does this by offering a detailed analysis of how collective understandings of time within society have been manipulated in various Government education policy documents to create an impression of political and social progress. This is sometimes at the expense of teachers' self-regulation and autonomy. The chapter concludes that an unstable discourse is emerging from Government policy documents, in which teachers are expected to react constantly to external demands whilst maintaining stability as professionals. This has the effect of leading teachers to feel disempowered as professionals, as many of the research participants verified.

After Labour came to power in 1997, teachers might have hoped for some respite from the constant flow of Whitehall education initiatives. This was not to be. As a senior teacher said to me during an interview, 'I blame the Civil Service Fast Track Scheme. The kids who think up these initiatives have two years in post to make a splash, otherwise they don't get their promotions. But nobody ever thinks about the follow-through. It's left to us to pick up the pieces.'

New Labour certainly continued the work of the Conservative party, trying to consolidate and adapt education along neoliberal lines. It attempted to reframe teachers as a new kind of public sector professional of the future, as can be seen in three different education reports. These include the Dearing Report, *Higher Education in the Learning Society* (NCIHE, 1987), which pre-dates Labour's coming to power but sets the stage for subsequent policy, the Fryer Report, *The Learning Age* (DfEE, 1998) and the Kennedy Report, *Learning Works:*

Widening Participation in Higher Education (FEFC, 1997). In these reports, teachers are shown as gradually moving towards a flexible professional model, apparently desired by the Government. However there are dangers inherent within this shift. If teachers are continually forced to react to external changes, then they lose the ability to construct their own notions of professionalism, and they may begin to feel under threat. In the light of this, what is the relationship between political influence and teachers' sense of their own professional identity within a wider society?

Contemporary political influence on education

Once, teachers had a real sense of standing within the community. For example, a retired secondary school headmistress recounted once how some former pupils react to her at alumni meetings. 'Sometimes they aren't sure who I am, particularly if they attended the school long before I was in post. But when they find out that I was the headmistress, they always stand up to attention and start pulling their skirts into place.' To some extent, that sense of status probably still exists. However there are other forces at work that have a negative impact on teachers' views of themselves and their profession.

Political influence is an important example of this. It has caused categories of professional identity to shift over time, to accommodate a desire for momentum and change, particularly since the 1988 Education Reform Act. However there are dangers inherent in becoming too reliant on a post-industrial, free market economic model as the means to underpin social policy innovations. As Beck warns, in relation to the apparent rebranding of the Teacher Training Agency:

... once education has become so thoroughly subordinated to such instrumental purposes and agencies, what may be left of education itself? ... [this] may portend not merely a fashionable 'makeover' of education in a modernised New Labour image, but rather, a far more significant and insidious process of takeover, in which any significant set of educational values may be increasingly at risk. (Beck, 1999, p. 224)

These 'instrumental purposes and agencies' to which Beck refers represent a standard rhetoric employed in policy documents such as those listed above. It is unclear whether such rhetoric is truly representative of contemporary society as a whole. If it is representative, it is equally unclear how we should react to this. The situation is

complex, and this chapter will seek to explore the complexity. This is important if we are to understand how teachers feel in relation to their external environments. If we consider the hypothesis that teachers feel under siege from the myriad of external bodies around them, all of which have a vested interest in configuring education to their own ends, then we need to explore society's view of itself, and how teachers fit within that image.

There has been a fundamental shift in the locus of control in the teaching profession, from internal to external. This means that teachers must engage with constant self-renewal, which leads in turn to a crisis of continuity. If teachers are continually forced to react to external changes, they lose the ability to construct their own type of professionalism, grounded in their own personalities and interests. This is a type of de-skilling, and its success as a policy is contingent upon external forces remaining stable. Should any instability occur, such de-skilling will have proved to be short-sighted indeed. This problem is compounded by the existence of other issues to do with reconstruction of notions of teacher professionalism. For example, if the environment were to continue to remain stable, it might be that this new type of de-skilled teacher would simply act as a technician, delivering a national curriculum designed by others. This model of the teacher as technician is a worrying one. Such a professional would be unable to engage properly with the holistic development of the child, including pastoral care. Is this the root of the problem? Are teachers being denied the opportunity of finding ways to deal with the contemporary situation around them?

The problem of periodisation

To understand the different ways that policy can impact on the professional lives of teachers, it is useful first of all to travel off briefly at a slight tangent, and examine how history is divided into periods by human society. This suggests how notions of social order have changed, and how ideas to do with time can act as metaphors for social order, which is not an idea widely discussed or recognised beyond relatively specialist literature. This conception of time in relation to social order is, however, endemic in the way individuals make sense of society, and the research participants were no exception to this.

The sociology of time is a large and growing area of enquiry. Until comparatively recently, it has been largely taken for granted that

sociology should use a rigid Newtonian framework for time, and confine its own research within this (Adam, 1990; 1995; cited in Newton, 2003, pp. 434-435). This could be termed clock time. Such a notion of time is derived from the physical sciences, and has limited bearing on the social interactions of individuals, beyond their function as biological organisms. An over-reliance on this makes it hard for us to understand other phenomena such as social pace, in which time seems to speed up or slow down, according to our individual circumstances, or busyness (Brannen, 2002).

It might at first seem relatively simple to divide history into different periods. We are all familiar with the notion of looking at history century by century, for example. However, even though a system like this seems fairly straightforward and easy for everyone to understand, it is a good demonstration of the first problem we meet in relation to deciding how best to compartmentalise time itself. Many commonly-shared time periods are based on astronomical phenomena, such as the rotation of the earth on its own axis (the 24-hour day), the lunar cycle (the month) and the rotation of the earth around the sun (the year). These divisions of time were recognised by pre-modern societies and cultures, and were described by Lévi-Strauss and Alexander as 'anthropological' time (Lévi-Strauss, 1996; Alexander, 1995). These astronomical events were important distinguishing features that allowed some aspects of time to be demarcated in many societies and cultures. However in other respects, time was less important. Social constructions such as the week and the century are essentially socially constructed by people, having no basis in nature. Dividing time using these artificial constructions highlights the problems of trying to categorise history into different periods.

Western systems of periodisation often use different theoretical standpoints to describe and classify time. For example, time might be related in terms of conceptualisations of social progress, such as utopianism (things can only get better) and declinism (things can only get worse). Alternatively there could be an emphasis on national and international politics (such as the First and Second World wars), the reign of different monarchs, economic changes (such as before and after Black Monday), or changes to political structures (such as before and after the UK's entry in to the European Community). These might not be mathematically calculated divisions of time, but they are valid social constructions of periodisation nonetheless.

In this type of categorising, Perkin (1996), for example, describes three main phases in the history of Western development. On one level, each phase seems to have been triggered by the invention of new technologies, causing far-reaching and lasting changes in economic processes and societal structure. The three phases are described below.

1. The agricultural economy – Neolithic revolution to industrial revolution

The catalyst for the rise of the agricultural economy seems to have been the invention of the plough. As Perkin puts it, the agricultural economy was characterised by an emphasis on the ownership of land, as the means of production. It allowed surplus production of food, thereby liberating individuals to adopt trades not aligned to food production, such as craftsmen, priests, artists, rulers and warriors. This led to the growth of culture and intellectual life. However for many there was a transformation of the quality of life, to heavy and continuous labour.

2. The industrial economy – 1700 to mid-twentieth century

The catalyst in this instance was the invention of the steam engine, which allowed production of standardised goods on a large-scale basis, and facilitated their transportation. This type of production allowed economies of scale to be made, which resulted in cheaper unit costs for the manufacturer and end-purchaser. This led to dramatic improvements in living standards for many, exponential growth in population, urbanisation and bureaucracy, and improvements in communication and scholarship. The professional classes began to increase their hold on power (*ibid*).

3. The knowledge economy – 1980 to the present

This phase of economic development was permitted by the invention of the microchip, which allowed information to be manipulated quickly and accurately, in digitised form. This allowed knowledge, or information, to be marketed as a commodity in its own right. It also allowed goods and services to be tailored to the customer in increasingly precise ways.

When classified in this way, the above phases can be represented as the following diagram.

Figure 3.1 – Linear model of economic development, 1100 – present day



To summarise, Perkin argues that there is a division between pre-modern and modern time. The former is influenced heavily by the natural environment, and the social and cultural environment influences the latter. [Adam (1990, 1995) terms these ‘natural’ time and ‘social’ time respectively]. Periodisation is a means for society to cope with conceptualising the passage of time. It is not simply an abstract exercise. However, periodisation can sometimes appear arbitrary. The more modern a society becomes, the faster and more unstable the pace of change appears to be (Castells, 1996). This can make some divisions unequal.

Inevitably, perceptions of the pace of change have an effect on the way public policy is drafted. Therefore, at this point, when we are thinking about teachers’ changing self-perceptions, it is important to start examining the relationship between time and social order. As touched on earlier, human beings can be uncomfortable with the perception of history as a block. Invariably they seek to make sense of past time and events retrospectively, by imposing some sort of artificial order and dividing time into smaller units. However, this means that some events are bound to be prioritised over others, depending upon who is involved in the creation of the framework for these smaller units.

Some groups of people are invariably going to be silenced in this prioritisation process. For example, for many years, books on the history of music only covered music in the Western classical tradition. World music (i.e. music other than in the Western Classical tradition) was conspicuous only by its absence, and was considered to be irrelevant for the purposes of musical analysis. However, the reason for this had more to do with world music belonging predominantly to an oral tradition, whereas Western music belonged to a written one. The presence of written materials made it relatively simple to process, codify and classify Western music, which was one reason that led to its apparent global dominance as some sort of higher culture. This was despite the fact that music exists through all cultures, and world music sometimes requires a greater degree of technical competence for performers than Western music (Blacking, 1973).

This editing and silencing process appears to take place within contemporary policy documents as well. In such documents, there is invariably some discursive advice on the role of time in implementing policy. Indeed, as the pace of change appears to become more rapid, a new language of time has evolved. A high value is placed on being up to date, and those who do not conform to new policies are described as out of date or outmoded, regardless of whether this is the case. In this way, policy is increasingly orientated towards a time-limited period of political administration. In his work on professional identity, Bernstein describes these categorisations as 'prospective identities' (for modern and forward thinking) and 'retrospective identities' (for old-fashioned and backward looking) (Bernstein, 2000, pp.66-67). Those considered to be behind time are effectively silenced. Additionally, Bernstein classifies retrospective identities as being shaped by 'national religious, cultural, grand narratives of the past' (*ibid.*, p.66). For us there is one significant question in relation to this. How far are teachers subject to this phenomenon?

To find the answer, we need to examine how social change is perceived within society. Alexander (1995) introduces ideas of epistemology and escatology that are helpful in understanding this phenomenon. Epistemology provides us with a substantive description of what is actually the case. This is how policy documents present themselves – as factually correct documents that are uncontroversial. Escatology, on the other hand, allows us to examine how people think about social change, which is in turn reflected in Government policy statements. It is a useful way of understanding time and periodisation as a more subjective, movable phenomenon. For example, a policy document might state a desired outcome rather than an actual one, such as the title of the Fryer Report *The Learning Age*, in which we are all supposed to be members of a knowledge-based society that engages in lifelong learning. This is the reality behind the presentation of time within policy documents. Simply by merit of the fact that they have been published, they urge change.

Thus there is danger inherent in any simplistic classification of time in relation to social policy. It could be that claims to societal change are overstated. If we are in the middle of the process of change, it is hard to know whether this is permanent, or simply a mood that mistakes itself for social reality. We might place too much importance on the idea that significant change is taking place, when the fullness of time might demonstrate that this particular type of change is not so

significant after all. We are too close to events to be able to evaluate which is the case.

Although change in this respect may not appear to have a definitive and apocalyptic scale, politically some things have changed in the UK. In relation to the substantive concerns of this study, the New Right shift is possibly the most significant of these changes. The knowledge economy described by Perkin (*op.cit.*) and others appears to involve a move away from social democratic government, rather the start of an entire new phase of economic development. There is the emergence of a new kind of governance, representing late liberal, or neoliberal values. (Rose, 1999). Within this governance model is the prototype of an ideal kind of citizen: self-helping, entrepreneurial, self-investing and shrewdly navigating through marketised and semi-marketised provision. It positions individuals in terms of how they conform to such a prototype. Those individuals who fail to conform are pathologised. This can be uncomfortable for some individuals, which is why there might be a tendency to perceive society as having undergone radical change. For example, those who fail to engage with lifelong learning might be described as out of touch or out of date by Government, while those who demonstrate flexibility in their approach to careers and training might be described as forward-thinking. As mentioned earlier, Bernstein might describe such identities as 'retrospective' and 'prospective' (Bernstein, 2000, pp.66-67). This does not mean that the individuals concerned really are out of touch or out of date. Rather, it shows how Government uses relatively emotive terminology and classification processes to exclude groups within society that are resistant to Government policy.

The next section will explore this notion of identity further, with a view to establishing how politicians seek to position different groups of people within society during times of change, and how this affects social order. For example, if education professionals are perceived by civil servants and politicians as being behind the times, because they are reluctant to hand over their autonomy to a standardised, centralised education service, this potentially affects their standing within society, and their ability to influence wider society.

Bernstein and identity

Bernstein argues that identity has traditionally been given a biological focus, such as age or gender. In contemporary Western society, this basis for constructing social identity has been

weakened, however. Age, for example, no longer provides a stable basis for identity. In other words, you are said to be as old as you feel. Likewise, identity based on social class and occupation has been eroded as a basis for stable identity. Social mobility is commonplace, and so is portfolio working, where individuals hold down several different types of job in the course of a working life. This phenomenon of unstable, shifting professional identity has been described by many other writers (Goffman, 1971; Handy, 1994; Toffler, 1994).

It is worth exploring Bernstein's classifications of identity further, as these contribute to our understanding of societal changes surrounding the knowledge economy. Let us take Bernstein's argument that there are three fundamental identity constructions: de-centred, retrospective and prospective. Table 3.2 below outlines how these constructions differ from each other.

Table 3.1: Characteristics of Bernstein's three fundamental identity constructions (Bernstein, 2000).

Decentred	Retrospective	Prospective
Constructed from local resources.	Constructed from grand cultural or religious narratives, for example liberalism, progress, Darwinism, humanism, Marxism, etc.	Constructed from narrative resources that create a recentring of the identity.
Instrumental, eg use of consumer goods to create lifestyle, or Therapeutic, eg interpretation of self in opposition to such use.	Fundamentalist, eg Islamic or Christian fundamentalism, or nationalism, or Elitist, eg resource of high culture, <i>Bildung</i> .	Launched by social movements; quasi-evangelist.

A retrospective identity is therefore one that is perceived as being backward-looking, or behind time, using conceptions of the past as a means of stabilising the past within the future. An example of this might be the role of the trade unions in relation to Old Labour, in which they funded the party and, in return, expected their membership to benefit from improved working conditions, amongst other things. The prospective identity, on the other hand, aligns

itself to contemporary society, and is modern, forward-looking and new, hence 'New' Labour, which has distanced itself from the trade unions.

Bernstein's notion of prospective identity is particularly interesting for our purposes. As Bernstein argues, a fusion of nation, family, individual responsibility and individual enterprise allows the state to recontextualise *selected* features from the past so that the future can be stabilised. This might be achieved by referring to the need for citizens to change as individuals, to reflect government priorities of the day. It might also refer to the concept of 'youth as future' (Commons), inviting schools, parents and teachers to work together to educate children to be a future workforce, to give another example. This practice is undoubtedly manipulative. By demanding that teachers are infinitely flexible, it pathologises those teachers who decide that such malleability is undesirable and unnecessary. It closes off opportunities for debate.

This model, prospective, flexible citizen did not come about in political isolation, however. It has already been argued above that the knowledge economy has been facilitated by the invention of the microchip, which has led to a whole range of new technologies. These include desktop PCs, telecommunications equipment, financial audit techniques, performance audit techniques, and software development. Such technologies allow increasingly rapid change. Toffler (*op.cit.*) used the term 'the information age' in *Future Shock*, and suggested that rapid change was causing social dysfunction, splitting communities apart, as the individual became increasingly isolated. Castells (*op.cit.*) on the other hand calls such change 'Informationalism', with the source of social and economic productivity and growth lying in the generation of knowledge, via new technologies. This change has promoted globalisation of the economy, developing networks across the globe. Figure 3.3 clarifies this position. The Utopian/Dystopian polarisation it uses is a recurrent aspect of social futures research and uses terminology recurrent in the literature.

Figure 3.2: Utopian/Dystopian divide between the work of Toffler and Castells



Within the work of Castells and Toffler, therefore, we start to see that perceptions of the future can vary, and can be positive or negative. This seems to reflect teachers' apparent difficulties in reconciling their existing professional identities with their external professional environments. This dilemma featured in the responses of the research participants. On the one hand, there was a desire to take advantage of growing international professional networks. On the other hand, some of the respondents saw the teaching profession as relatively isolated in relation to parents, pupils and policymakers, and seemed to think that this situation would only deteriorate in the future.

The role of political influence

The section above examined the relationship between time, social order and sociological identity, setting the general context. It argued that, in the eyes of Government, individuals appear to occupy different positions on a social time line in terms of the surrounding political environment. This position influences their social identity. Such an awareness of the role of time in society is important to the Government, as it needs to justify its own existence in order to remain electable. It invariably invokes a rhetoric of future change, as a means of giving its policies momentum and direction. This certainly appeared to happen in relation to New Labour and its policies, as will be seen later in this chapter.

There will now be a discussion in more depth about the wider political context within the UK. Exploring this issue allows us to understand the effect of late twentieth century reform on education policy. The chosen examples are illustrative of the contemporary rhetoric.

Of the reports and policy documents that emerged on the post-1988 educational landscape, Dearing's *Higher Education in the Learning Society*, Kennedy's *Learning Works: Widening Participation in Further Education* and Fryer's *The Learning Age* are the most significant for our purposes.

Higher Education in the learning society (1997)

This report, published by the National Committee of Inquiry into Higher Education, came out shortly after Labour came to power in 1997. Sir Ron Dearing was chair of the Committee. The report had bipartisan support, and was designed to make recommendations on how the purpose, shape, structure, size and funding of higher education should develop over the next twenty years in the UK. It begins

by setting out a vision for higher education over the next twenty years, and any recommendations are aimed at enabling this vision. By doing this, it provides us with an interesting example of historicist perceptions of time once again. The report states that it has 'learnt from history' (p.57), locating itself chronologically. It implies a past state of social disorder, leading to a future state of social order.

The report moves on to outline the current state of higher education. It then examines demand, delivery and content of programmes, standards and framework of awards, and the local and regional role of institutions. The report then looks at staffing and staff development, the implications of information and communications technology, institutional organisation and governance, and differential characteristics between institutions. Finally it examines funding, and priorities for action.

The following extract is typical of the report, in that it emphasises an instrumental relationship between education and employment.

A Transformed Labour Market

4.16 Increasing international economic competition, the emergence of once poor countries as major international competitors, new technology and social, cultural, political and legislative changes have all contributed to major changes in the UK labour market.

Significant features include:

- a large rise in the proportion of women who are economically active;
- an increase in the proportion of the workforce who work part-time;
- a shift towards employment in small and medium sized enterprises and self-employment;
- increases in the proportion of professional and skilled jobs and a decrease in the proportion of unskilled jobs;
- decreases in primary and manufacturing employment and an increase in employment in the service sector.

4.17 Other significant changes include, for example, an increase in the number of qualifications and of their use in employment selection. Teaching and chartered accountancy, for example, are now largely graduate entry occupations and it seems likely that other occupations, such as nursing, will move in this direction. This may be seen as an indicator of the need for higher skill levels, although to some extent it is a consequence of the expansion of higher

education, and employers and professions seeking to attract their share of talent.

4.18 Looking to the short-term future, employment growth is projected to be 0.8 to 0.9% a year over the next few years and all the labour market trends of the last few years are expected to continue. Within jobs there may be a shift away from routine processes within narrowly defined functions and towards teamwork which crosses functional boundaries. If organisations continue to remove layers of management, there will be an increasing range of responsibilities between jobs.

4.19 We recognise the fragility of attempts to forecast the demand for specific skills in the longer term. Recent history is littered with failures to forecast needs successfully, and as the pace of change in industry quickens, the task of forecasting is becoming still more difficult. But, even with the lessons of history to caution us, we believe that the broad direction of change for the long term can be described.

4.20 Looking ahead over the next twenty years, the UK labour market will undergo further fundamental changes. The number of graduates in the workforce is likely to more than double by 2020. Increasingly, graduates will enter jobs not traditionally filled by graduates, causing their jobs to be redefined and reducing the number of layers needed in the organisation.

4.21 To survive in the labour market of the future, workers will need new sets of skills, to work across conventional boundaries and see connections between processes, functions and disciplines and, in particular, to manage the learning which will support their careers.

NCIHE (1997), pp.56-57

Within this extract, we see an interesting range of uncertainties and contradictions. For example, in paragraph 4.17 there seems to be some uncertainty as to whether the professions are becoming increasingly skilled, or whether there are simply more qualifications in circulation. This is answered in paragraph 4.20, where it is suggested that increasing numbers of graduates will be forced into jobs that are not traditionally filled by graduates. This appears to undermine the argument in paragraph 4.21 that increasing worker skills within society is necessary or desirable.

Paragraph 4.18 refers to the need for moving away from carrying out routine processes with narrowly defined functions, towards teamwork. This fails to take into account the 'political and legislative'

changes referred to in paragraph 4.16, which could be taken to mean, amongst other things, the increased bureaucratisation and managerialisation evident in post-1988 education, such as Ofsted inspections, the National Curriculum, and centralised Standard Assessment Tests. All these functions standardise tasks and remove the ability of the individual to define their own role as professionals.

If we consider the report as a whole, it appears to employ the rhetoric of new Labour. Early on, there is a clarion call concerning the foundation of a 'Learning Society' (p.9). This will allow citizens to navigate 'rapid change' (p.9) in a 'transformed labour market' (p.56) that exists within a 'globalised' economy (p. 9). Education will bring about a new 'shared set of cultural norms and values' (p.63) that will eventually lead to greater social inclusion within society.

This narrative demonstrates an interesting tension between two ideas to do with the purpose of education: education as an end in its own right, and education as a means of becoming employable within a market economy. The report recognises that education can be essentially altruistic, benefiting society as a whole. As the report puts it so eloquently, 'education serves democracy and civilisation' (p.79). However, education is also regarded as serving the needs of potential employers, and the economy as a whole (p.76). For example, in many cases, studies should be 'broad' rather than 'deep' (p.131). Courses should include 'key skills', such as communication skills, numeracy, the use of information technology, and 'learning how to learn' (p. 133). This instrumental approach to education also applies to higher education funding proposals. Several assertions are made concerning the economic benefit of a degree to individuals, and 'externalities' (p.95) such as gender and social class are excluded from calculations on the basis that they are based on economic theories that are unproven.

Within this report, therefore, there is a notion of the ideal type, or as Bernstein would put it, the 'prospective' citizen. Such a citizen would engage with learning throughout his or her life. This would allow flexible working and ongoing personal reinvention (p.9). Such endeavours would be funded at the citizen's own expense, regardless of personal circumstances. In return, the citizen could expect to earn more.

However, non-participants are pathologised. Reading between the lines, those who choose not to take part in this constant quest for personal reinvention, this neoliberal commitment towards self-help, are regarded as being out of touch, throughout the report. Even

though there is some recognition of social divisions within society, and the growing gap between rich and poor, this does not seem to translate into policy. In this sense, the report is internally inconsistent. For example, it refers to the growing financial independence of youth within modern day society (p.63). It then proposes a system of higher education funding that is predicated on the notion that parents are willing and able to support their offspring well into their early twenties. The logical progression from this is that, should students be unsupported by their parents, it would be more difficult for them to engage with higher education. They would then be pathologised, in the terms of this report. This would not provide the 'inclusive education' that the report claims is so important (p.7).

Learning Works: Widening Participation in Further Education (1997)

This report was published by the Widening Participation committee of the Further Education Funding Council, which was chaired by QC Helena Kennedy. Its brief was to examine the ways in which participation in FE (Further Education) could be increased. However this brief was modified by the committee, who instead examined how participation could be widened. Their argument for doing so was that the marketisation of FE had resulted in the social exclusion of some sections of society, such as those in lower socio-economic groups.

This report is markedly different in tone to the Dearing Report discussed above. Again, an extract is reproduced here, which looks at the economic justification for Further Education.

Education must be at the heart of any inspired project for regeneration in Britain. It should be a springboard for the revitalisation that our communities so urgently need. However, in all the political debates, it is the economic rationale for increasing participation in education which has been paramount. Prosperity depends upon there being a vibrant economy, but an economy which regards its own success as the highest good is a dangerous one. Justice and equity must also have their claim upon the arguments for educational growth. In a social landscape where there is a growing gulf between those who have and those who have not, the importance of social cohesion cannot be ignored.'

FEFC (1997) pp.5-6

In this extract, we see criticism of economic success as an end in itself: 'an economy which regards its own success as the highest

good is a dangerous one.' The Kennedy report suggests that contemporary individuals are not solely rational economic actors, successfully navigating their way through the workplace, and contributing to the gross national product of UK PLC, as might have been intimated by the Dearing report quoted above. There are deeper and darker forces at work, as can be seen in the reference to social cohesion: 'In a social landscape where there is a growing gulf between those who have and those who have not, the importance of social cohesion cannot be ignored.'

The problem of achieving social cohesion appears throughout the report. Previously, social change was presented as a positive consequence of the progression of time. However, in the Kennedy Report, social change is perceived as threatening and negative, and external to the student and education provider. The British economy is 'suffering due to the lack of skills-based training' (p.2). People who have not participated in the growth of the knowledge economy have been 'forced by circumstances to make unfulfilling choices' (p.2). There is 'social exclusion of disaffected youths, working class women, and ethnic minorities' (p.3). Redundancy causes 'emasculatation' (p.8). This sets the stage early on for Further Education's therapeutic role within British society.

This therapeutic role is further developed through the promotion of 'active citizenship' (p.4), which results in 'improved social inclusion' (p. 6) that 'works for the economic good' (p.6), or in other words, social capital being justified by being economically desirable, which is one reason the report argues for 'welfare to learning' as a viable alternative to 'welfare to work' (p.12). Indeed, the ideal hallmark of a college's success is supposed to be its ability to provide a humanist, non-instrumental education, steeped in public service values (p.5). This is in tandem with its need to provide training for employment, and act as a kind of 'University for Industry' (p.8).

To take Bernstein's notion of retrospective and prospective identities once more, it is interesting that this is only applied in one respect. When the report discusses the changes that have taken place in FE since the 1980s, it has two clear models of provision. The 'past' model refers to 'producer dominance' (p.2) since the powers of the Local Education Authority were reduced. This was followed by a period of tension, when colleges tended to recruit those easiest to train, as competition between colleges was so intense (p.3). There was little thought given to strategic planning, or collaboration between colleges. The modern, forward-looking model for provision looks quite different, on the other hand. A spirit of entrepreneurship

prevails, which allows colleges to govern themselves with increased efficiency (p.3), whilst taking their therapeutic roles much more seriously.

Learning for the 21st Century (1997)

This report was published by the National Advisory Group for Continuing Education and Lifelong Learning, chaired by Professor R H Fryer. The Group had been asked to provide a Government White Paper¹ on lifelong learning, and this report consists of the advice contained within that paper. It refers to both the Kennedy and Dearing reports, and states that it draws upon their content.

In the Fryer Report, we see social change once again presented as inevitable, as can be seen in the following extract.

2. CHALLENGES

Change

2.1 As we approach the twenty-first century, the people of this country, in common with those of many others, face a bewildering mixture of uncertainty, risk, insecurity, division and yet opportunity. The challenges of rapid change are evident all around. They can be seen in rapid shifts in the organisation of industry and labour markets. They are apparent in rapid changes in occupations and the demand for skills. They are occurring in the structure of communities and in family forms, roles and relationships. They manifest themselves in new technologies and patterns of communication. They impact upon individual identities, produce new opportunities for active citizenship and affect even the nature and form of knowledge itself.

2.2 These challenges can be met, at least in part, by moving towards a learning culture for all. We do not think that the only response should come from learning, nor do we claim that the development of a learning culture will itself produce automatic or ready-made answers to the challenges our country now faces. To make such claims would be to foster illusions and would do damage to the promise of lifelong learning, when inevitably it failed to live up to them. Learning can make its valuable contribution to the resolution of problems, but it cannot and should not be a substitute for politics, economy and society.

DfEE (1997) pp. 11-12

In the Fryer report, therefore, the notion of change has become even more alarming. The extract states 'As we approach the twenty-first century, the people of this country, in common with those of many

others, face a bewildering mixture of uncertainty, risk, insecurity, division and yet opportunity.' In the face of this apparent social disorder, the Fryer report sees lifelong learning as a kind of 'spiritual refuge' for the citizen. This is additional to, but not a substitute for, the types of economically-driven values evident in the Dearing report, and the social values expressed within the Kennedy report.

The major social changes to which the report refers include globalisation (p.11), the need for social cohesion (p.4), social uncertainty and risk (p.11) and the gulf between the 'employment-poor' and the 'employment-rich' (p.12). However the Fryer Report takes a slightly more gentle approach to the role of the individual within this framework. In this sense it positions itself somewhere between the Dearing Report and the Kennedy Report. On the one hand, the Dearing Report has a robust view of Higher Education as a means towards self-help and opportunity. On the other hand, the Kennedy Report sees Further Education as having a primarily therapeutic role, albeit framed in terms of what potential employers might need. Fryer seems to synthesise the two approaches, whilst at the same time using many ideas that originate from New Labour policies.

The Fryer Report takes for granted the fact that there is now a learning society. Non-participants are required to subscribe to this belief, and make some attempt to remedy their own learning needs. Indeed, the notion of a learning society is a convenient one for Fryer, as it helps meet the needs of employers, and therefore the economy. The responsibility for learning should be shared between the individual, the employer and the state (p.5). This permits increased equality (p.17), improved self-esteem (p.5), reduced social exclusion, and improved 'family learning' (p.59), which is particularly important in the light of societal changes to family structure. In this sense, it could be said that education in the learning society is essentially altruistic.

Yet the needs of employers must also be recognised in any provision. This can be facilitated by such measures as outreach work, workplace learning (p.5), credit transfers (p.7) and technological convergence of information and communications technology (p.18). This allows employees to train whilst in post, as a continuous improvement exercise. This employability education offers a purely instrumental approach towards lifelong learning. In other words, if the employer demands it, then the education provider should provide it, and if there is an altruistic, holistic benefit to the employee, this can

be regarded as an added benefit. This is the nature of a very modern education system.

Summary

All three reports share a set of political assumptions firmly rooted in the rhetoric of late 20th century reform, as described above. The reports also assume that education should serve the needs of politicians, commerce and industry. The prototype model citizen outlined above would fit into this framework very easily, organising his or her own learning and career path, with a distinct emphasis on individual growth. After all, if each individual works towards the goal of maximising his or her employability, then surely it is to the benefit of society as a whole? Yet the reports are inherently contradictory, representing simultaneous efforts to lower Government welfare costs, create the public perception of political action and achievement, and promote social inclusion and economic participation within society. This is an example of how, in New Labour's policies, the link between social exclusion and poverty has apparently been broken, and the alternative idea of a moral economy has been promoted (Levitas, 2005).

Real life situations are significantly more complicated than this. Not everyone is at liberty to pursue individual or career goals freely. Those with caring responsibilities, illnesses or non-economic priorities might find such goals limiting, or even irrelevant.

This view, of the individual as more than an economic actor, is reflected in Tight (1998). He argues that these reports are fundamentally flawed, as they make the following assumptions:

1. Non-participants are threatened with social and economic exclusion. This pathologises the individual who chooses a course of non-cooperation.
2. Participants are supposed to finance their own training.
3. Training is aimed at fulfilling the wishes of employers.
4. Individuals are positioned in time according to how far they conform to this ideology (i.e. as 'retrospective' and 'prospective' identities, as argued above).

Building on Tight's and Hughes' concerns, there is a further argument to be made, regarding the role of the individual within this neoliberal ideology. According to human capital theory, there is a further presumption in reports such as the Kennedy Report, the Dearing Report and the Fryer Report. The reports see individuals as

rational economic agents, who want to invest their own time and resources in increasing intellectual capital, improving their health, increasing their social status, and so on (Maranda and Comeau, 2000). The best-qualified individuals are assumed to hold the best-paid jobs, with the most favourable working conditions. However this argument predicates social and economic progress on market development and economic growth. It also disregards differences such as race, gender, ethnicity and social background. Indeed, this was quite explicit in the case of the Dearing Report, as discussed previously.

This type of analysis, used in the Fryer, Dearing and Kennedy Reports, makes significant assumptions about the personal decision-making process of individuals. Taylor (1973) describes the process of individuals 'drifting' into crime, rather than making conscious decisions to do so. To a large extent, this also seems to happen with careers. As discussed previously, life is much more complicated than the rational action theorists would have us believe. Social, cultural and intellectual capital as well as chance all play a part in influencing our choice of career. Parental expectations, life events, geographical location and luck also influence our choices strongly. Therefore there is a case for being sceptical about a direct cause and effect relationship between an individual's input (time, human resources) and output (profitable, satisfying career).

This is of particular interest in relation to teaching careers. Teaching is now a graduate-entry profession, with few opportunities for financial advancement compared to some other public sector professionals². Working conditions can be poor, with long hours, difficult pupils, and buildings in poor repair. If individuals are only motivated by their desire to hold the best-paid jobs with the best working conditions, according to human capital theory, then it is hard to see why individuals would join the teaching profession. To put this another way, if the teacher is a rational, calculative actor, there appears to be no good reason why he or she should choose such a career. We know from the previous chapter, however, that there are many different, complex reasons for choosing to become a teacher. Vocation features prominently in many of these reasons. Yet human capital theory does not appear to take into account the pull of vocation in this context. Likewise, it is clear that in the Kennedy, Dearing and Fryer Reports, the role of vocation also fails to feature very prominently on the neoliberal landscape.

The relationship with professional issues

Clearly then, there is a conflict. On the one hand, there is a fundamental desire for teachers to be professional and offer inner regulation of their own work, with a moral guarantee of quality. Teachers are encouraged to be reflective practitioners to this end, continually developing and refining their professional practice over a period of years, if not a lifetime. On the other hand, there is a desire for teachers to conform to a politically constructed model of professionalism that is regulated externally. Quality is guaranteed through the use of performance audit, including Ofsted inspections, league tables of school performance and, increasingly, student and parent feedback. At its most benign, this practice can be seen as the application of the Russian proverb 'trust but verify'. In practice, however, it can have the effect of undermining teacher professionalism.

There is a presumption that this type of external audit and quality validation is simply a post-1988 re-engineering of the teaching profession. In terms of imposing policy, this is a useful way of perceiving the situation. It allows any objectors to be classified as being unaware or, using the time analogy that permeates this research, behind time or out of date. In this way, the validity of any changes will remain unchallenged in any significant sense. Indeed, this argument recalls post-colonial feminist arguments, which suggest that men are unable to see their own dominance due to their hegemony. Therefore it is a problematic response to any objections.

If this desire for external validation is married with a rhetoric of caring, it further undermines the validity of any objections to policy implementation. The argument goes like this: you object, therefore you cannot be a caring professional. Teachers are required to be caring professionals, as they are supposed to have a vocation, as discussed in the last chapter. If you are not a caring professional, you cannot be a good teacher. Therefore your objection is based on a lack of knowledge and understanding of what is best for pupils and schools.

Surely there is an even bigger question at stake? In a managerialist system, quantifiable measurement of achievement is central to any appraisal of the structure. Indeed, the system is configured explicitly to allow quantifiable results to be recorded and analysed. This sits uncomfortably with the rhetoric of caring. The education system is supposed to offer a bespoke, differentiated smorgasbord of educational opportunities to pupils. This has to be compromised if teachers are then forced into a position where they have to teach to

the test, for purposes of assessing children at seven and eleven years of age, for example.

Conclusion

There is an unstable discourse emerging on teachers as professionals. If teachers are gradually becoming imbued with a new professional philosophy, which is grounded in the regulative discourse of the free market, they are likely to start developing a new kind of professional *habitus* as a consequence (Bottery, 1998). A worse case scenario might be that they fail to develop any robust *habitus* at all. As Bottery puts it, 'If and when this happens, the welfare state will not have to be legislated out of existence: it will have died from within'. (*ibid.*, p.146)

Without a secure sense of professional identity, there is an associated demise in the nature of professional commitment. The inner emptiness on the part of teachers, described at length in the last chapter, is related to a relocation of the locus of control, from internal to external. Task, time, text and place are dictated and regulated by central Government. In the light of this, individuals will be required to self-renew continually, to reflect changing political priorities.

If the knowledge economy means that individuals will be forced to engage with this perpetual self-renewal, then there is a crisis of continuity. Constantly reacting to the demands of the external environment does nothing for stability. In a recession, if the controls were to stay in place, there would be no particular ill effects as far as the teaching profession were concerned. Indeed, the profession would look relatively secure and attractive to new entrants. If the controls were to collapse, however, then the whole structure is at risk of collapsing, rather like a house of cards. At that point, the uncommitted, inwardly empty teacher would be likely to reinvent him or herself, and move on to other types of work.

This may sound alarmist, but if our entire political and social structure were based upon notions of economic growth, a deflationary period would be disastrous. As far as the teaching profession is concerned, the professional de-skilling that occurred in the post-1988 period may yet prove to have been severely short-sighted. Whilst it may have resulted in inadequate teachers receiving supplementary training to bring them up to scratch, it will have created a profession over-reliant on central control. Through measures such as funding strategies and the National Curriculum, the Government dictates

pedagogy, location, and timing of education, and teachers are rarely at liberty to challenge such aspects of their work. Without the opportunity to challenge this standardised model for education, and establish alternative provision where it seems necessary, teachers increasingly become unable to contextualise their work. In defining the knowledge economy, therefore, it is clear that it is a political construction, and one with inherent tensions between the desire to maintain public sector educational provision, and the marketisation of teacher careers.

In seeking to understand the nature of contemporary teacher professionalism, therefore, we should be mindful of the close relationship between time, social order, and social identity. This relationship has an important effect on the way teachers perceive themselves within society at large. Successive governments use the rhetoric of change in modern cultures to give their policies momentum and meaning. This has an effect on the way social identities are constructed, as those citizens who fail to conform to the government's notion of the ideal citizen are penalised. Teaching is no exception to this rule. Consequently, many assumptions are made about teachers being rational actors who are totally in control of their own life path, when this is not necessarily the case.

These flawed assumptions seem to underpin the government's view of teacher professionalism, particularly in relation to the increasingly centralised administration of education. This has had the effect of disempowering teachers, and holds inherent dangers. In particular, the way individuals and governments think about time can be contradictory, and this can cause conflict and confusion in establishing social constructions of identity. In the case of the teaching profession, this leads to difficulties in reconciling professional responsibilities with any expected position within society as a professional. Understandably, teachers appear to have strong views on this, as will be seen in the next few chapters.

Notes

1 The terms 'Green Paper' and 'White Paper' both refer to documents published by the UK Government known as 'Command Papers'. Generally a Green Paper consists of proposals published as an aid to public debate, whereas a White Paper acts as a statement of Government policy.

2 Examples of typical pay rates for some public sector professionals at age 40 in 2004:

Teacher £26,460; GP £40,608-£48,550; Social Worker £20,400-£34,000; Chartered public finance accountant £40,000-£100,000; Police Officer (Inspector) £27,084-£31,590. (Source:<http://www.prospects.ac.uk/links/occupations>)

4

Finding a Voice for Teachers

This chapter moves on from explaining the theoretical basis for teachers' professional problems in contemporary society. It examines the structure and process of the research project behind this book, which was designed explicitly to gauge the views of teachers towards their own profession at grass-roots level.

Is there any hope for teacher professionalism within the current socio-political environment? I spent several years designing and carrying out a study entitled *Mapping Professional Conceptions of Learning Futures: Teachers and their Professional Identities in the Knowledge Economy* (Leaton Gray, 2004). The research was aimed at encouraging teachers to help me find the answer to the question above, and was originally part of a larger-scale research project initiated by Tom Bentley of Demos and Professor David Hargreaves at Cambridge University, although over time it grew into a discrete study in its own right, with its name shortened to the Education Futures project for everyday use. In order to achieve the objective, the research participants needed to be encouraged to think beyond their immediate worlds. This was no easy task.

This chapter explains the techniques used in the research. It starts by describing the background to the research, before outlining the research design. It then moves on to a description of the research population and sample, and how research participants were selected. It then moves on to examine the research instruments that were used: interactive surveys, semi-structured interviews and focus groups. The instruments are assessed in terms of reliability and validity. There is a description of how the instruments were con-

structured and refined. The chapter concludes that the sample, instruments and data analysis methods employed generated useful research outcomes.

It is always difficult for a social scientist to discover what research participants are thinking. For example, subconsciously, participants might be eager to give the researcher the answers that he or she wants, therefore they try to second-guess the researcher's own attitudes. The fact that I am a former teacher played an important part in gaining access to schools, but it also led teachers to pre-suppose various attitudes towards schooling on my part. If a research project includes issues that deal with morality, then participants might elect to paint their own behaviour in a positive light. This certainly became evident, as teachers tried to show themselves as caring and altruistic in their responses. If a researcher demonstrates particular personality traits, this might also influence the type of answers participants give. In the case of this research, there was a fine line to be drawn between being accessible and approachable as a researcher, and maintaining an objective view of responses. All these issues influenced the eventual research design, as did issues of teacher workload and general malaise within the profession, as will be described in more detail later in this chapter.

To examine issues relating to teacher professionalism fully, we need first to look at the context of the research. There seems to be very little literature examining teachers' conceptions of their own profession, or its future. One reason for this might be that it is very difficult to invent a research tool that works well in a busy school environment or working life. There are also issues surrounding the way teachers are seen in society. Oddly, despite the fact that teachers are given the task of preparing a country's young people for the future, a task that is regarded as very important, it is not considered particularly necessary to discover teachers' views of this task. Therefore, the research project's emphasis on the future was deliberately designed to remedy this situation.

There were further aspects to choosing the future as the focus of the research project. Some psychologists argue that the way individuals perceive the future affects their everyday behaviour (Byrne and MacLeod, 1997). For example, if you believe that there will always be a welfare state, you might choose to make less provision for your old age. If you believe that there is likely to be a cataclysmic event that destroys the world, you might choose not to have children. This type of analysis can be applied to professional issues as well. If you believe that there will always be schools, you will gear your

professional development accordingly. If you believe that teachers' pay will remain at a level consistent with current rates, you might choose to change professions when you reach the top of the basic scale, if your projected salary is unlikely to meet your needs. Despite these obvious links between perceptions and behaviour, however, there had been no research into teachers' views of the future of learning.

Defining the future

There are interesting philosophical questions surrounding the concept of the future, which must be allowed to inform any enquiry. It is very useful to look to historical research to explain this. We could argue, along the lines of the historicists, that narrative identity has a part to play in the responses of individuals to any questions asked during the course of this research. If each of us configures our life as a narrative to make sense of the past events that have affected us, then it seems likely that we do this to future events as well. Our conceptions of the past and of the future are merely virtual worlds that are configured in this moment we call the present. This has to affect research participants' reactions, and therefore work needs to be done to develop this idea. To date, this has not been considered an important area of futures research, with there being a continuing tendency to engage in prediction instead. Futures research cannot be considered academically valid unless it addresses such challenging issues. An integral part of developing the field is working on suitably rigorous research instruments. Therefore the Education Futures research project attempted to reflect on such instruments, as well as the research methodology framing them.

Administration of the Enquiry

Sample

After initially contacting over 200 potential research participants, the final sample consisted of 40 education professionals, drawn from the administrative regions of four Local Education Authorities in England during 2002. Drawing together a truly representative sample proved frustrating, as this was at the height of teacher workload problems in the UK, which led to understandable reluctance on the part of teachers to take on extra projects. However, the LEAs were selected carefully so that they included different types of local areas, thereby giving a purposive sample. The LEAs can be classified as follows:

- A Predominantly areas with high levels of unemployment, incidences of ethnic tension, economic deprivation and generally lower levels of educational attainment. Inner city.
- B Predominantly areas with highly mobile, sometimes transient population, and significant class divide in educational opportunities and achievement. Inner city.
- C Predominantly areas with primarily suburban/rural provision, with significant commuter population, limited unemployment due to proximity of area to major conurbation. Little evidence of economic deprivation. Generally average or above average levels of educational achievement.
- D Predominantly rural areas, with medium levels of regional unemployment, some pockets of economic deprivation, and generally average or below average levels of educational achievement, although some class divide evident.

Within each of the localities, data collection was confined to two approaches: semi-structured interviews (directors of education and headteachers), and an interactive online survey (classroom teachers). This was to ensure a wide spread of responses across different age groups and backgrounds. Interviewees were selected by inviting headteachers in each LEA to participate. They were then asked to encourage the teachers in their schools to respond to the interactive survey. The interviews took between 30-45 minutes to administer, and the interactive survey took 20-45 minutes to complete, on average.

Interactive¹ Survey

At the time, the use of online media was considered a relatively innovative approach to data gathering. It was highly cost-effective, and the novelty of the approach was appealing. Technically, it could handle large numbers of respondents, and it was relatively straightforward to invite selected groups to respond (in this case teachers were contacted via their school-based email addresses as part of a mailshot). This type of instrument is easy to standardise, and this would make any future research replication straightforward. The fact that data existed in a digital format also made rapid statistical analysis simple. The technological nature of the instrument was congruent with the forward-thinking nature of the research, as well as the design of the project web site.

There were some disadvantages to the use of this technique, however. There was a response rate of around 10%, which meant that a

relatively limited amount of data was available for analysis. Shared computers at school meant that there was occasional reluctance to monopolise equipment for long enough to complete the interactive survey. This directly contradicted Government reports at the time, claiming that teachers were increasingly using IT on a day-to-day basis, and that 50% of teachers had a school-based email address. Without sufficient school-based computers of their own, it was hard to see how the IT revolution was having any real impact on teacher professionalism.

For the purposes of the research, it was important for professionals to imagine ahead, to think what it might be like in the future. A horizon year of 20 years ahead was chosen, as this is common practice in fields such as management science and futures research. It is sufficiently distant so that research participants will feel able to play with ideas in a theoretical sense, whilst at the same time it is near enough to allow these ideas to be rooted in the present situation.

The interactive survey was tested on different types of computer, and then the help of a commercial research centre based at a teacher training college was enlisted, to host the interactive survey on their server. The interactive survey was online for nine months, to allow plenty of time for teachers in different LEAs to respond, as the project became more widespread. Individual emails were sent to teachers, inviting them to respond to the interactive survey. Embedded within each email was a hyperlink that allowed them to click straight onto the project website, and from there, onto the interactive survey. This made it convenient to respond, and taking participants via the website meant that they were able to read about the background to the project if they wished. Finally, the information was gathered as a database, printed off, and coded in the same way that a pen-and-paper questionnaire might be.

Justification for choice of questions

The survey had four sections: political, economic, social and technological. Such sections form part of a management science PEST analysis (a straightforward acronym that stands for Political, Economic, Social and Technological), and are chosen to give a full picture of the external environment.

Firstly, it is important to explain the general principle behind the design of the questions. Foddy (1993) argues that insufficient prompts lead to misapprehension, as research participants misunderstand what is required of them. It was therefore important to

ensure that there were sufficient prompts in each question. In the words of Semeonoff (1976) 'It is better to suggest too much than to run the risk of missing information through too cautious questioning'. In this survey, therefore, leads follow many questions. These leads give guidance as to the type of reply anticipated. There will now be an examination of each question in the interactive survey, to explain the decisions behind each choice.

Policy issues

The term policy rather than the word political was chosen, as it was felt it would be less emotive.

1. What major changes might there be to education delivery systems by 2020, in your opinion? You might want to consider aspects such as the role of schools and colleges, the role of business and industry, developments in information technology, and similar issues.

There were many interesting comments about the demise of schools, as we know them, in the pilot study. It was therefore important to find out whether teachers thought schools would still exist in 2020, without leading them too much by asking them directly. Teachers are often accused by policymakers of being innately conservative, and having a vested interest in maintaining the status quo. Clearly, if schools ceased to exist, so might their career structure, so this question was important. However, there was a problem that they might not fully understand the term education delivery system, which is rather clumsy. It was decided to add the second sentence so it would clarify issues and help to define the type of answer expected.

2. Who do you think will have input into the design of the curriculum in 2020? Politicians, parents, teachers, pupils, or others?

The National Curriculum, initially introduced in 1993, was undergoing revision, so this was a subject that was being discussed widely at the time. It was necessary to establish whether teachers thought the curriculum of the future was likely to be a holistic, therapeutic model, or whether it was likely to become increasingly geared to the needs of business and industry.

3. What sort of testing and assessment arrangements do you anticipate being in place in 2020?

4. What sort of school/institutional inspection procedures do you envisage being used in 2020?

These were also topical subjects, and linked to the previous question on the National Curriculum. It was necessary to establish views on the role of Government centralisation in the future, and any possibilities for institutional accreditation. It was also important to find out whether teachers felt that testing, assessment and inspection procedures were likely to enhance or undermine their professional roles. Any reduction in autonomy would have suggested the latter.

5. How do you think education will relate to the employment situation in 2020? What role might business and industry play?

This referred particularly to changes in the 14-19 curriculum, with a view to developing opportunities for vocational education. The interactive survey was also seeking responses to do with business sponsorship and manipulation of the curriculum (linking to question no. 2).

6. Please add any further comments you wish to make.

In view of the dangers of asking closed questions, this seemed necessary as a means of encouraging participants to give as much data as possible.

Economic issues

1. Do you think education will be adequately resourced in the future? Will central Government distribute funds, or will the money come from elsewhere? Will education providers have sufficient funds to run the necessary courses and buy the materials and equipment they need?

Once again, this question was designed to examine the role of Government, business and industry in funding education. There are also further possibilities to do with answers regarding parental funding and two-tier education systems. This type of question is debated frequently in the *Times Educational Supplement*, as well as other professional publications, and it was therefore familiar to the respondents. This meant that it provided a useful introduction to the section on economic and financial issues.

2. Do you consider that education needs to be funded differently in the future?

This question looked for the personal opinions of the respondent, rather than asking him or her to make a judgement on the current situation extrapolated into 2020. In this way, it was more probing than the previous question.

3. As far as your own personal financial planning is concerned, do you anticipate having sufficient income from salary, investments or pension, to meet your needs by 2020?

This was another topical subject, but the question was included for a different reason. Senge (1993) argues that individuals build up their own mental models of the future, and that this influences their day-to-day decisions. If teachers have concerns about financial security, this could influence any decision to leave the profession. Current trends have indicated that there are concerns about such matters as high house prices in some areas, which would imply that the choice of question is a valid one.

Social issues

4. Which issues do you envisage making the headlines in 2020 in relation to education?

This question was designed in an attempt to provide the broadest possible stimulus for a response. It also allows participants to assess the relative importance of their answers up to this point.

5. How important might parents be to the education process?

Policy makers from the time of the Plowden Report (CACE, 1967) onwards have attempted to bring parents into the arena, as stakeholders and participants in education. This is another example of a debate that is conducted regularly in professional publications.

6. What position might the teaching profession occupy in society as a whole?

In this question, teachers were asked to reflect on their status as professionals, in an attempt to find out whether the profession was perceived as rising or falling in the social hierarchy.

Technological issues

1. How might Information and Communication Technology be exploited, both in and out of the classroom?

Subsequent to the 1988 Education Reform Act, we have seen huge increases both in the quality and in the quantity of technology-based classroom teaching. There are ongoing criticisms about the amount of money spent on such initiatives, and whether the learning outcomes are appropriate. There was no need to ask teachers to consider the ICT (Information and Communications Technology) debate in this way, however. Instead, there was an opportunity to ask

a question that might inspire blue skies thinking about an existing issue.

2. If the boundaries of learning were to widen beyond the classroom, how could learning be managed to ensure continuity? For example, if increasing numbers of parents chose to educate their children from home, as in the US, how could we deal with this?

The interactive survey needed to probe a little further on issues to do with institutional reorganisation, as the pilot study had implied that this was likely to be an area of particular controversy.

3. How might Information and Communications Technology be used to encourage Continuous Professional Development for teachers?

Until now, teaching has been classified as a profession that has exclusive ownership of a particular canon of knowledge. Continuous Professional Development (CPD) is an integral part of maintaining this canon, and indeed its exclusivity. It is important to stimulate thought on CPD in a useful way; had teachers just been asked about the rate or content of such development, the question would have been unduly speculative.

There will now follow an analysis of the role of the semi-structured interview in this research.

Advantages and disadvantages of semi-structured interviews

This approach allowed some limited but useful ethnographic insight into the research participants. It was possible to probe their answers in some cases, and therefore this approach yielded rich data. There was a high response rate, as it was easy to select appropriate candidates to approach via letter and email. The main disadvantage was the travelling time, which was considerable, requiring multiple visits to key areas.

It would have been perfectly possible to build a research project around the use of an interactive survey alone. This had some limitations, however. Simply using one research instrument to gather data would have been a risky strategy. An interactive survey, by its very nature, appeals to the technologically enfranchised and those who enjoy sitting over a computer. This makes assumptions about the kind of research participants likely to be involved in the project. It does not necessarily lead to a balanced research sample.

There were concerns that higher-ranking education professionals would be reluctant to spend 30-45 minutes filling in an interactive

survey, whereas it seemed that they might be much more willing to discuss their ideas on a face-to-face basis. These are people who are comfortable talking, who like to share ideas, and feel they have a great deal to say that is of importance to the debate. They rehearse their ideas aloud in meetings and when giving presentations. An interview allows them to function in the way they feel most effective, particularly when it takes place in their own office.

There is a further reason for using semi-structured interviews in such situations. The success of the project relied on directors of education and headteachers encouraging classroom teachers to respond to the interactive survey. Teachers are the most elusive group of research participants. They have constant calls on their time during the school term, and are consequently very reluctant to add surveys to their already lengthy to-do lists. It was felt that meeting directors of education face-to-face in the first instance would allow the researcher to ask directly for their support for the project. The researcher was then in a strong position to tell headteachers about the support of the LEA, which made them see any requests in a more favourable light, and in turn, these headteachers would lean on their staff to respond.

This was a very successful strategy. It was easy to arrange access to comprehensive email lists of all local maintained schools, which cut down administrative workload, as well as giving official recognition to the project. There was also plenty of advice on which local schools might be the best to contact. The directors of education arranged for short articles about the research project to be published in local schools bulletins, which helped considerably in publicising the work. Therefore, even though it would have been possible to collect broadly similar data using the interactive survey for this group, the physical presence of a researcher in the interviews facilitated a host of other benefits.

Construction of the instrument

The first step was to draft a range of questions that broadly resembled those in the interactive survey, so the data generated was sufficiently similar. The questions were tested for timing until there was roughly 30-40 minutes' worth of interview time. This seemed long enough to allow research participants to play with ideas, whilst at the same time reducing the opportunities for non-relevant data to creep in, such as polemic regarding historic policy decisions, for example. It was vital to use a fairly well defined question schedule so

that there was the possibility of accurate replication in each case. Interviews took place in participants' own offices so that there was likely to be a reasonable similarity between environments.

Notes were taken during the interview process and each interview was recorded and later transcribed. The procedure in each instance was straightforward. After initially outlining the framework of the questions, there was an introduction of the idea of a PEST analysis of the external environment (which was already familiar to most participants). Next, the researcher would ask a question, the participant would reply and the researcher would probe a little deeper until there was a sufficiently detailed answer. The researcher then moved on to the next question and repeat the process, until the end of the schedule.

Data analysis

This research project generated fieldwork data that painted a picture of how research participants viewed the future of the teaching profession, and how this related to their notions of professional identity. In total, three different techniques were used to analyse these responses.

The original aim of the fieldwork phase of this project was to gather data about the way education professionals in a range of situations conceive the future. The initial idea was that the data would be processed to map out future drivers of change and that these drivers would be compared to the earlier theoretical work regarding time in education, teacher identity and the knowledge economy.²

When analysing the fieldwork data for this research project, however, some further theoretical issues arose. The most important of these concerned the way that education professionals position themselves in relation to policy issues and to changes in education practices. It soon became evident that they were using a variety of rhetorical devices that revealed the way they were positioning themselves, both personally and professionally, in relation to the topics that they were discussing. This did not appear to be conscious on their part. It was nevertheless very useful for the purposes of this research, not least because it revealed so much about prospective and retrospective identities, which is a key theme of this research.

In the next three chapters the data are reported and analysed in different ways. First, they appear as originally anticipated. Future drivers for change are listed and put into a simple context. (This resembles the traditional approach often adopted by futures work of

this kind, as discussed earlier, and in essence is a form of selective coding). These drivers will be referred to as key drivers. This is a technical term derived from many areas of management science literature. It implies that these are the drivers that appear most frequently within the responses from research participants.

It soon became clear during the course of the project that a deeper layer of analysis was needed. There is an important rationale behind this. Rosaldo (1994), when writing about subjectivity in social analysis, suggests that ethnography has a fundamental flaw, in assuming that each individual belongs to one, discrete, unambiguous culture. Rosaldo argues that this is not the case, and describes a 'partially disjunctive, partially overlapping' community (*ibid.*, p.179). This could be applied to the sample group for this research. They can be divided on the basis of jobs, age, gender, length of service, type of school and so on, but this does not give a great deal of information about which participants are likely to answer in particular ways, as the sample size is too small. As argued earlier, there are other categories, possibly more appropriate, that might apply to the responses, such as typologies of teacher professionalism. These categories shift according to how education professionals position themselves in relation to the subject matter – whether they feel as though they care, how they relate to external organisations, whether they think it is important to appear professionally competent, and so on.

This apparent phenomenon of shifting identity is of great interest to us, as it explains why there might be confusion in relation to the role of the teacher within contemporary society. In the same chapter, Rosaldo refers to the work of the social historian, E.P. Thompson, in which the author has a clear moral vision that informs his work (*ibid.*, pp.179-180). This leads to the shifting use of pronouns within his writing. Rosaldo attributes this to the complexity of Thompson's identifications with the people he is writing about. It seems, therefore, that there is some virtue in looking at issues such as pronoun use within this project, as a means of establishing how individuals locate themselves in relation to the subject matters discussed. Mindful of this, two further data analysis techniques have been adopted, as a means of examining apparently hidden social processes.

During the course of the research, the next system of analysis was an examination of how teachers used linguistic devices, in this case pronouns, to position themselves in relation to change. This told us

a great deal about linguistically imbued social practices, local cultures, and grammatical models of the self. It built on a precedent for examining the use of pronouns within social psychology literature, which will be further explained in Chapter 6. Finally, the research used a third reading of the data. One of the younger, more innovative analysis techniques was chosen, termed Causal layered analysis (Inayatullah, 1998). This was a deliberate choice, as it was felt that such an approach would link to the highly theoretical work undertaken earlier in the enquiry, which had examined the role of education professionals within wider society as a whole, and pull many other strands of argument together.

Conclusions

Sometimes, in qualitative research, it is easy to take research tools and methods for granted, or to assume that every researcher uses them in similar ways. If research methods are to become increasingly rigorous over time, it is vitally important that researchers compare notes about their work in the most minute detail, exposing their methods to increasing levels of scrutiny by their professional peers. It is also useful for the next generation of researchers to have access to detailed accounts of research. This avoids the phenomenon of publications giving the impression that research is effortless and slick. Research is neither of these things. Like surgery, research is a humble, messy business at the best of times.

As for many studies in the current research environment, the main concern was the population of the research, and how best to select a balanced sample. Consequently this had a strong influence on the research design. By constructing a purposive sample of forty participants across four LEAs, attempts were made to ensure that a reasonable cross-section of the education profession had responded to the research. Clearly, the relatively small size of the sample meant that the research was not truly representative. This is a frustration for many qualitative researchers in education. However, within the constraints of what proved to be possible in the field, the research went some way towards achieving this goal, particularly as there were to be three readings of the data.

There was also some concern about the use of research tools within futures research. Therefore, two different instruments were used to carry out the fieldwork phase of the research: an online interactive survey and semi-structured interviews. These instruments both had different advantages, and addressed different needs. The interactive

survey theoretically made it possible to contact extremely large groups of teachers who were busy, but who were likely to respond to an email invitation to complete the interactive survey, complete with a hyperlink for their convenience. It also made the project appear very forward-looking. The semi-structured interviews on the other hand allowed rich data to be collected from less technologically-minded professionals, whilst assisting in negotiating contact with other sample groups. By using these methods, it was possible to generate a range of data that usefully informed the project and complemented the theoretical aspects of the research.

Data analysis was carried out using three complementary techniques: a key driver method, a linguistic analysis method and a causal layered analysis method. These allowed the data to be viewed in three different ways. Initially, there was an analysis of how education professionals seemed to be positioned within their external environments. After this, the linguistic analysis allowed examination of how education professionals appeared to be positioning themselves within these environments. Finally, a causal layered analysis examined the external environment itself, within a wider sociological context. Using these three data analysis techniques allowed greater depth in analysing the data, which in turn helped to compensate for a relatively small sample size.

The next three chapters will take us on something of an archaeological journey, delving through different layers of the data, to look in detail at the complicated, shifting terrain that constitutes real life in education.

Notes

1 The word interactive in this instance is used purely as a technical term. It means that the research participant interacts with the interactive survey by sending it back to the researcher electronically, in this case by clicking on the send button.

2 The use of the word drivers in this context needs brief explanation. It is a commonly used technical term in areas such as strategic planning and futures studies. It implies a certain forward force or momentum and some steering via political direction. This all fits with the context of the research and therefore it seems an appropriate term to use. It is also a commonly used term in related literature so, again, this seems a good reason for choosing it.

5

Despatches from the Front – Key Drivers

Early on in the Education Futures project, the research started to paint a disturbing picture, showing individuals who felt as though they had little control over their professional environment. Has the locus of control really shifted so far away from individual teachers? When answering such a question, a key driver analysis is invaluable. It gives a systematic framework for assessing the content of the responses made by the different research participants. In this way, it is possible to gain an initial understanding of the issues perceived by teachers and education professionals as important, without falling into a common trap in futures research, of attempting to assess the likelihood or probability of future events without supporting quantitative data (GTC, 2004).

Key drivers technique – background and history

As much futures research originated from the large-scale quantitative studies carried out by business and government, it was imperative to anticipate political, economic, social and technological change in a methodical and rational way, which could be easily replicated and justified. This was necessary for the purposes of effective administration. Since the 1960s and 1970s, however, it became apparent that such predict and control methods were inappropriate for use in certain situations, particularly when a political situation underwent periods of rapid change.

A good example of this can be found in Figure 5.1, which shows comparative birth rates between 1951 and 1999. (This is an example



Figure 5.1

often used by other practitioners of futures research to demonstrate the shortcomings of statistical modelling¹).

If we were to travel back in time to approximately 1963-64, we would see from a similar chart that there had been a sharp increase in the number of births from about 1953 onwards. In the absence of any other information, it would not have been unreasonable for us to assume that this trend might continue indefinitely. This would mean that by now the number of births would have well exceeded 1 million per year. Of course, we know from the graph that this did not happen and that, instead of numbers continuing to rise, there was a sharp drop between 1964 and 1973, when the number of births eventually reached a plateau. In terms of educational planning, this meant falling school rolls and associated school closures, amongst other things.

There has since been an increased interest in developing a wider range of techniques for undertaking futures research. Ultimately these techniques all tend to reduce to a common approach. They seek to identify drivers of change, levers of change and barriers to change (although the term drivers is often used as an all-encompassing term to include all of these.). The key drivers are more than simple agencies of change, as there is a political direction behind them.

How the method was adapted for this research

Mapping the drivers was done by using standard business tools as a guide. As we will see throughout the responses from the research participants, educational administration in the UK today often employs a managerialist discourse. This is a discourse familiar to the public sector, grounded in the Conservative reforms of the late 20th century, so it is helpful as an initial means of classifying and analysing data. The analysis is deepened using other methods later on, to avoid over-reliance on this method. As stated previously, the word driver is used for the purposes of convention. It would have been just as appropriate to use the word theme as driver, if more unusual in such a managerialist style of initial analysis. For the purposes of this research, the drivers were formulated by the researcher, through grouping the comments made by topic.

The two business tools that appear to be in most common usage as a framework are the PEST (political, economic, social and technological) analysis defined and explained earlier, and the SWOT analysis, although there are others available, such as the Porter's Five Forces analysis. The origins of the PEST analysis are obscure, but this is a tool used widely in business and industry, and also in management science research. The acronym SWOT, also used widely in business and industry, stands for strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats, which is more useful when analysing the market position of a company.

This research does not make any claims to empiricism so the quantitative aspects of the data are not particularly significant. Frequency of comments has been taken into account in a limited way, however. An arbitrary frequency of six was set, as the tendency seemed to be that many drivers received one or two comments, and many received six or more, but there were few drivers that received three, four or five comments. Drivers that received six related comments or above were therefore included in the list, so that the list was a manageable length and represented the recurrent concerns of the research participants involved.

For the purposes of argument, the method assumes that collapsing data into categories based on a PEST framework is a valid exercise and gives an accurate view of the external environment. Assumptions are also made about research participants being truthful in their responses and, particularly in the case of the interactive survey, having sufficient time to complete their replies adequately.

Overall, the technique was useful in that it allowed the data to be reported and organised in a reasonably straightforward manner, whilst allowing some early analytical insight into the meanings behind the comments of the different participants. The limited sample size meant that it was hard to establish whether the views expressed were in any way representative, however. Additionally, it was also unclear how the participants positioned themselves in relation to the subjects they discussed, other than whether they felt positive or negative about each situation or topic. This suggested that other data analysis methods were required in addition to the key drivers technique.

In total, there were fifteen categories, which were grouped according to the framework of a PEST analysis. This grouping technique has been discussed at length in the last chapter. The comments were also reviewed in the light of the professional typologies categorisations employed by Goodson and Hargreaves (1996) and Nias (1981), where appropriate. Such categorisations have already been explained and discussed in Chapter 2, which examined the relationship between teacher vocation and professionalism. There are also some references to the Plowden report, particularly in relation to home/school relationships, child-centred education, and holistic education.

Throughout the chapter, the sampling categories for each quotation are provided in the form of endnotes, although it was rare to find any noticeable trend, other than the difference between classroom-active and non-classroom-active respondents. This was due to the relatively small size of the sample.

The PEST categories will now be introduced, to be followed by a detailed discussion of each quotation.

Key Drivers for Change – summary

Political

- Increasing influence of national Government policy
- Diminishing influence of local government and LEAs
- Role of testing
- Role of inspection
- Globalisation

Economic

- Funding
- Influence of business and industry on the curriculum
- Expectation of pupils as workforce of the future

Social

- Role of pupils within institutions
- Changes in society
- Changing nature of teacher professionalism
- Changes in institutional structure
- Home/school relationships
- Growth of standardised educational model

Technological

- ICT in the classroom

There will now be an analysis of each main driver, along with examples of appearances.

Political

Increasing influence of national Government policy

It was clear throughout all the interview and interactive survey responses that, in the post-1988 world of education, Government policy has a great deal of influence on what goes on in the classroom. By this I mean the Conservative/New Labour managerialist agenda, referred to in Chapters 2 and 3. Indeed, it would not be going too far to say that managerialist language permeated virtually every conversation. There were frequent references to assessment, setting and meeting targets, league tables, policy implementation, uniformity of provision, Private Finance Initiatives, and Government-led school inspection. This relates to the ‘commitment as occupational competence’ typology of teacher professionalism put forward by Nias (1981). The vocabulary used was very precise, and participants spoke at length about these issues. The following examples are typical responses.

Example 1: Assessment

I suspect there'll be more school assessment, in terms of school inspectors. I mean, recently things have just kind of really become hyped up, and national league tables and SATs and examinations for children are just kind of ... it seems like that's the whole

priority. And, when we're teaching children, the focus and the drive is always aimed at 'what are these children going to get in their SATs results?'. Trainee teacher²

In this quotation, which is only three sentences long, we see references to assessment, inspection, league tables, SATs and examinations. It is clear that assessment is at the forefront of this trainee teacher's mind, which is evident in her statement that the focus for classroom activity invariably seems to be quantifiable outcomes, in her opinion.

Example 2: Setting and meeting targets

I think what we do need to do a lot more of is actually tracking the students and how they're doing, and being much more analytical about their performance and the performance of teachers in order to improve our planning and then our delivery. And I think computers give you an opportunity to hold a lot more information and to be a lot more specific in your analysis. Deputy headteacher³

This participant touches on the role of statistical information in evaluating performance. For her, high hopes are vested in ICT as a tool to achieve standardised ongoing measurement of pupil outcomes. It is not questioned whether statistical information of this type is more or less analytical than verbal or intuitive information. This faith in quantitative measurement, and the precise coding of task and outcome, harks back to Taylorism, which was described in the earlier theoretical section of this book.

Example 3: League tables

What politician can possibly say, standing for election, that 'I think standards are good enough now. We'll jack it in, we'll settle for consolidation for a decade!' What family will ever say, 'I don't want things to be any better for my children than they were for us.' It's just human nature, isn't it? So we'll have to go on getting better. But what we mean by getting better will change. I guess that when we get to 110% of 11-year-olds being at Level 4⁴ that will cease to be the gold standard!' Director of Education⁵

The Director of Education makes an important point about the use of public policy as a tool for change, and uses statistical language to demonstrate his point. If 'youth is future', as was quoted earlier (Hansard, *op.cit.*), then it will continue to be vitally important for politicians to be seen to be engaging with education.

Example 4: Policy implementation

In the future there will be new testing and assessment arrangements, that are different from those of the year before, rushed into place with little thought or consideration for those who use them.
Classroom teacher⁶

This comment was typical of those made by serving classroom teachers, who felt that they were required to respond to government policy, but were not able to influence its creation. Again, the language of government testing and inspection is used, this time to criticise the existing regime. Interestingly, this respondent is a teacher at an independent school, which may have meant that he felt more able to be openly critical of government than if he were working in a maintained school. Walford (1986), in his study of life in public⁷ schools, argues that professionally autonomous positions of this type are often taken by teachers in leading independent schools.

Example 5: Uniformity of provision

There's this terrible danger of not seeing people as individuals, you know, and thinking of them as groups of people with numbers and levels and all the rest of it, and not thinking beyond that, really. Headteacher⁸

I would like to see schools being able to take children beyond the normal expectations. Certainly I am talking about schools like ours, to provide aspirations and expectations which go beyond teaching basic skills, which is really all we're doing at the moment. Headteacher⁹

In the two quotations above, it is possible to see the frustrations which some holistically-inclined headteachers experience in being forced to deliver a standardised national curriculum that emphasises basic skills above everything else. Both these headteachers had trained in the period immediately after the publication of the Plowden report, when it was felt that education needed to become increasingly child-centred. Yet both were sitting in schools that had been built in the nineteenth century, surrounded by heavy traffic, and which would have been classified by the Plowden report as 'behind time'. The curriculum they were required to deliver contained a significant amount of literacy and numeracy-based education, and went against the grain of what they believed as educators. Yet in the quotations above, this is not explicitly stated. Instead, they hint at the dangers of classifying and typing pupils, and encouraging limited aspirations, without directly criticising the policies that have

led to their present predicament. They carefully couch their concerns in the language of policy rather than polemic. This is more in tune with the idea of ‘commitment as caring’ (Nias, 1981), which puts the child at the centre of the educational process.

Example 6: Private Finance Initiatives

We have building works in our dining room which is like a mini PFI we have set up with a catering company, so they are putting money into it, in exchange for longer term contracts with us. It may be that schools will need to try and be more into that sort of thing. Acting headteacher¹⁰

This demonstrates how the philosophy of the Private Finance Initiative appears to have permeated even the humble school dinner. This school was one of the first schools to be made Grant Maintained¹¹ in the 1990s, and now enjoys Foundation status. Control of its own budget may have influenced this apparently entrepreneurial approach to its own affairs. This might be described by Bernstein (2000, p.73) as a ‘de-centred, instrumental’ identity; that is, the identity has an economic, instrumental basis not necessarily located in time.

Example 7: Government-led school inspection

I think that the inspection regime is a bit like auditors, you should be able to manoeuvre [sic] it that the auditors are coming and that is good, as they can help and advise. I would hope that inspection might develop into that, a helpful thing and not something to worry about. Acting headteacher (as previous quotation)

The language of finance is clear in use of the term auditors. Once again, as in the case of the use of ICT in target-setting and tracking quoted above, there is a desire to look to objective measurement of school progress as a means of enhancing educational outcomes. However, according to the acting headteacher, the current inspection regime is associated with performance anxiety rather than performance improvement.

Overall this quality drive and its associated audit culture seemed to be regarded as inevitable and the research participants appeared to be resigned to the fact that their professional activities were audited and controlled politically, both locally and centrally. Beck (*op.cit.*, p.235) describes this type of authority as a ‘partially marketised form of technical-bureaucratic authority’ which focuses on technical

matters of managerial competence rather than education in a broader sense.

The respondents referred to the associated loss of professional autonomy as well. This tended to be in the context of a desire for some form of accreditation, so that individual schools could be relied upon to assess the quality of their own work, rather than external bodies having to do this for them.

The next thing that you start saying is that if you are inspecting externally so much, aren't you taking away some of the responsibility that should really rest with the individual institution? I'm glad to see the accredited school review and evaluation, which is effectively like an interim audit in accounts. You check the processes in an individual school are sound, and then basically you say, well as far as we're concerned you can fly now, we won't bother you. Now whether this should be done for an institution or whether it should be done for an individual headteacher is an issue to be debated. LEA Director¹²

Once again, we see the language of accountancy emerge in the phrase 'like an interim audit in accounts'. This seems to imply that performance can be assessed and reviewed using quantifiable data. The question in this case seems to be whether this should apply to individuals as opposed to institutions, rather than whether this is a valid exercise in its own right. It is another example of how the language of managerialism was taken for granted by many research participants in this study, without any consideration being given to the implicit values embedded within this language.

This is not a new phenomenon. Indeed, in relation to school self-evaluation, such lack of attention to these issues was being criticised as far back as the early 1980s (Becher *et al*, 1981, cited in Kogan, 1989, p. 148). With reference to the ILEA (Inner London Education Authority) and HMI (Her Majesty's Inspectorate) 1978 surveys of primary education, Becher argued that they had a 'strong management orientation' and contained questions 'imposed from above'.

However there is also a deeper issue at stake within this response. Perhaps the participant is unwittingly referring to what Bernstein would term a 'weakening' of the sacred (Bernstein, *op.cit.*, p.77). In other words, external school inspection has weakened trust in the ability of professionals to measure their own effectiveness. This response certainly suggests an underlying tension between internal measures of quality, and external validation.

Despite the use of language in the example above, total acceptance of governmental priorities throughout the rest of the responses was not the case, however. Some participants also felt that, despite the use of rhetoric that emphasised education, Government was not always as effective as it might be in prioritising and implementing change.

Government priorities can change like that, can't they, for political reasons. You've already seen 'education, education, education'. Now it's very much the street crime agenda ... There is a conspiracy theory that says that it might have missed the boat a bit, because a lot of money was pumped into education from 1997 onwards and the funding improvement strategy for that had only really kicked in during 2000. So we perhaps didn't get the benefit of two or three years of growth that we could have had. LEA Director¹³

So not withstanding the discourse of centralised management, illustrated by many of the responses above, participants could in some cases be cynical about how effective Government policies had been in practice. This suggested that whilst they had taken on the mantle of continuous improvement in some senses, teachers were still quite resistant to the actual processes involved. They also doubted whether there were likely to be effective outcomes.

This is an interesting shift in the power relationship between the inspectors and the inspected. As Bernstein writes in relation to his formulation of power and control, 'Power always operates to produce dislocations, to produce punctuations in social space' (Bernstein, 2000, p.5). The resistance expressed by the research participants appears, in this case, to act as a kind of dislocation, in which some power is reclaimed by the knowledgeable professional. This seizing of power is also an example of the 'classical professionalism' described by Goodson and Hargreaves (1996), in which the profession has its own status, with its culture of self-regulation and shared technical culture. In this case, the respondent implies that the profession would have been better able to achieve its objectives, had the Government been straightforward and transparent in its conduct.

Diminishing influence of local government and LEAs

The role of the Local Education Authority (LEA) in maintained provision has traditionally been an important one, but the introduction of Grant Maintained schools in the aftermath of the 1988 Education Reform Act started to undermine their role, as increasing centralisa-

tion of education provision took place. This has been further exacerbated by the Government requirement that some local authorities outsource their services to private companies.

Unsurprisingly, the comments of research participants seemed to reflect this decline in the importance of the LEA. There was little general reference to the activities of the LEAs, except in the cases of Local Authority Directors of Education and education committee members. For reasons of confidentiality it is impossible to report many of the most illuminating comments, as it soon becomes clear which LEA is concerned. However the comment below represents the generally held point of view that the LEA is under threat.

The LEA still exists but it does not have the capacity to deliver support services. We haven't got any staff now! It all depends whether you believe in the conspiracy theory really. Member of Local Authority education committee¹⁴

Most participants shied away from controversial terms such as conspiracy theory and expressed a more positive view of what was on offer at LEA level, although there was an awareness that the LEA might be working to its own agenda as well. For example, some headteachers made references to the LEA in passing, explaining how useful it was to be able to ask the LEA to come in almost as consultants to advise on best practice, although this did have limitations. Here we could have an example of a shifting local identity, in which the LEA is given a social identity that varies according to the relative economic or social control accorded to it (Bernstein, 2000, p.79).

The old inspectors¹⁵ used to advise as well as criticise; they use to give advice as well... The first Ofsted feeling was that this wasn't done; it was just a criticism. And now I think they're coming back to this advice ... What I would really like to happen in my school is that I would like to say to Ofsted, 'Could you give me an objective view about this department, about this faculty, and give me some ideas what I could do with them?' I can do that with the LEA ... but they almost have, not a hidden agenda, but they have the agenda that they want to raise standards in our area (well, everyone has that, of course), and that's not as objective. Headteacher¹⁶

It was clear from these references that, despite the possible existence of its own agenda, the LEA was perceived as a type of professional partner in such instances, unlike Ofsted¹⁷, which was perceived primarily as a threat, although the head teacher concerned felt that this might be changing. This is an interesting take on Good-

son and Hargreaves' constructs of 'flexible professionalism' and 'practical professionalism' (1996) in that it seeks to build on a sense of shared professional community, respecting the practical, experiential knowledge of the teacher. This is faithful to the idea of reflective practice.

Role of testing

It is clear from the comments above that the research participants seem to be well-grounded in post-1988 education policies, such as testing, inspection and assessment. However it soon became apparent that, while they might be using the language of audit and policy to explain their professional activities, they did not always believe in its efficacy.

I think there will always be testing and assessment, and I think there are very few people that wouldn't think you ought to do it. I think probably at the moment we're in a situation where some people think that weighing babies makes them grow, because I think probably ... we're more tested and assessed than almost any other nation in the world. Headteacher¹⁸

This trend towards slavish assessment was considered to be dangerous by many participants. The greatest fear appeared to be towards teaching to the test, which meant that other, more worthy aspects of education were likely to be overlooked or ignored. These might include performing arts, physical education, humanities subjects, and so on. This could also be linked to Goodson and Hargreaves (*op.cit.*) and their typology of 'extended professionalism', which seeks a balance between the introspective analysis of practical professionalism and engagement with issues external to education, in this case citizenship.

I think I would like to see schools being able to take children beyond the normal expectations ... beyond teaching basic skills, which is really all we're doing at the moment ... [I would like] to include arts and looking at the creative side of children's lives. And most importantly I would like to see us also having a central role in issues to do with citizenship and addressing the headteacher on issues to do with values. Headteacher¹⁹

Headteachers seemed to think that omitting creative subjects was considered to mean giving children a limited, narrow education that did little to develop them in a more holistic sense. This in turn was likely to lead to them being less well-rounded as human beings and future adults in society. This reflects the Plowden report (CACE,

1967), which takes a similar view on the role of the arts within primary education. For example,

If the word 'frill' is not now often used of it, the attitude that this implies is still widespread ... the practice of art by children is a fundamental and indispensable part of their education. (CACE, 1967, p.249)

Despite this apparent sympathy with the views of the Plowden report, once again, this particular headteacher's concern was couched in the language of managerialism, with the word 'target' used three times in half-a-dozen sentences.

My second biggest fear would be that the drive to raise standards and the target mentality gets completely out of control. I think I could argue it's possibly already about there, and that the focus of teaching and learning and teachers' mindsets narrows to a very reduced spectrum. So basically you go for the targets. That's it. You don't give a damn about the overall development of children and the holistic approach to their needs. But you get a very target-driven, narrow experience. I think there's danger of that. LEA Director²⁰

Some participants felt that the introduction of such frequent testing had led to parents becoming increasingly worried about progress, rather than tests being viewed as a useful educational tool. Parents had responded to this by coaching their own children. Participants reported that parents seemed to see the tests as a value judgement of their own child's development, rather than as a measure of progress of the school, or a measure of accountability. In this sense, it was clear that many parents had misunderstood the exact nature and purpose of the tests, which meant that children were under increased pressure to do well. This in turn affected the role of teachers in the classroom, as pressure was brought to bear on the school as a whole, as well as on individual pupils.

To have parents coaching their children for tests is all wrong, but middle class parents do that unfortunately, because they're only human. Headteacher²¹

Interestingly, this speaker worked in an academically selective school, in an area where, unusually, all local secondary schools (both maintained and independent) require potential pupils to take one kind of entrance test or other. There seemed to be little resistance on the part of the local secondary school teachers to end this situation, despite comments such as the one quoted above.²²

Other participants had different reservations about testing. They felt that existing testing arrangements failed to take into account changes in the nature of teaching and learning. Interestingly, the language in such instances became more technical again, whilst there was a more philosophical approach to the issue.

Knowledge needs to be measured in new ways to consider the new learning styles and cognitive processes. The old school has to be balanced with the new school. Secondary teacher²³

This is an interesting view, as it again links with Bernstein's notion of retrospective and prospective identities. Presumably participants felt that arbitrary quantitative testing of pupils was in many ways backward looking, grounded in subject-based traditions of the past, whereas a better understanding of cognitive processes in a more holistic sense was considered to be more contemporary. This comment also moves towards the idea of 'postmodern professionalism' (Goodson and Hargreaves, 1996), in which the need is recognised for collaborative, continuous learning within the school as organisation, as well as amongst the pupils.

The role of inspection

It is clear that most of the participants had concerns about the past, present and future role of school inspection. Many expressed a desire for the introduction of a system of accreditation, so that schools or even individual teachers could engage in self-assessment. The present system was seen as undermining professional judgement, as well as being cumbersome and expensive, and sometimes even frightening. In these responses, we see a return to notions of vocation – participants were making the argument that, as they wanted the best for their pupils, this should be sufficient guarantee.

I think Ofsted is a waste of money, because I think there's so much money that goes into providing the paper and all the information for them, where you could actually target that into teaching, and actually produce better results for the children. You've got to have some system of monitoring and evaluating what you're doing, but if you train your leaders in schools to be able to do that, you don't need an external body to verify what's being done anyway. You know, it's really providing them with jobs rather than doing anything for us in schools. Deputy head²⁴

The teachers often seemed reluctant to be overly critical of institutions such as their own LEA. Conversely, this largely critical comment was typical of their comments on Ofsted and centralised

school inspection in general. It reflects the widespread view that Ofsted was out of touch and irrelevant to life in schools. It is important to notice that the comment uses more emotive language than previous quotations, and does not include as many references to total quality management as quotations earlier in the chapter.

I'm all for self-evaluation. I would like to think my professional view was trusted enough to make judgements about my own school because I don't want to hide anything. You know, there's no point because students suffer. Headteacher²⁵

To this respondent, the teacher's role as self-regulating professional is clearly important. This should transcend the need for teachers to be inspected. It demonstrates the 'sense of competence' described in Nias, in which teachers feel able to provide pupils with effective learning situations, through their own commitment and experience (Nias, 1989, pp. 93-95) and Nias's typology of 'commitment as caring' once again (Nias, 1981), in which children are placed at the centre of the educational process.

The next quotation, which is alarming as well as illuminating, uses even more emotive language, in which negative views about school inspection are made extremely clear.

Ofsted inspections were horrific. Everyone was absolutely terrified. If you had a difficult class, you were petrified. There was very little feedback. You didn't even know the names of the inspectors at the beginning. They were like the Gestapo. They made you feel as though you were on trial for your life. There was very little support from colleagues. They were keeping their own powder dry. Ofsted was a terrifying thing. Retired classroom teacher²⁶

In this forthright and disturbing comment, which was the most extreme example of its type, we see the language of battle. We can almost smell the respondent's fear, through her use of terms like 'absolutely terrified', 'petrified' and 'terrifying'. The inspectors are the 'Gestapo' and the teacher is 'on trial for life'. Everything counts on this inspection, which is clearly taken very personally. Colleagues were 'keeping their powder dry', which suggests a group of people who have dug themselves in for the duration, trying to survive the onslaught or attack that is perceived. This comment reveals a teacher who felt under siege from external aggression, and who felt to be victimised by the inspection regime. This personalisation of the inspection process, and feeling of being under stress or under siege, is similar to that described in Jeffrey and Woods (1996). In this article, teachers describe themselves as being unclear what is re-

quired of them, anxious about outcomes, and unable to engage in life outside school until the inspection process is over. They do not feel part of the overall inspection process as stakeholders, but instead take the role of victim. This situation has clearly moved a long way from that described in the Plowden report 'To a unique extent English teachers have the responsibility and the spur of freedom' (CACE, 1967. p. 311). It is interesting to speculate whether the degree of personalisation in the comment above indicates a deep commitment to teaching also at a personal level, along the lines of Nias's 'commitment as identity' (Nias, 1981), in which the professional feels like a teacher, being inwardly habituated in this way. If the individual's teaching is criticised, this is a way of criticising the essence of the individual, so is deeply wounding. This might go some way towards explaining the emotive use of language.

Thus, there seemed to be two main points made by research participants in relation to inspection. We saw a clear desire for other education professionals, such as LEA advisors, to be able to come into schools and give thoughtful opinions about the standard of professional practice and suggest how it might be improved. But participants seemed to want such a process to be initiated and led by the school, rather than imposed by an external body, thus reinforcing professional autonomy rather than undermining it. But centralised inspection processes were seen as expensive and irrelevant at best and psychologically disturbing at worst, and the language used becomes more opinionated and personal, reflecting the strength of feeling involved.

Globalisation

This was an interesting category. On one level, globalisation did not seem to figure particularly prominently in the minds of the participants, except in the case of a few, when fairly general comments appeared. Globalisation as a concept was seen as a contemporary, forward-looking issue, and of great interest to younger generations.

The UK needs to internationalise. Classroom teacher²⁷

This view was not confined to younger generations, however. The following comment refers to ongoing chronic problems with teacher recruitment and retention. It uses rather vague language, and the concept does not seem to be particularly clearly defined in the mind of the respondent.

There clearly is currently a mismatch between what graduates look for in a job, and what teaching offers at present. We need to

find out what that mismatch is. It might be about the ability to innovate. It might be about the ability to travel. Whatever. I guess there's something there about international and national, you know, the breakdown of national boundaries, globalisation. LEA Director²⁸

There was a general feeling that the growth of the European Union acted as a kind of partial globalisation in its own right. It was unclear whether respondents saw this as a benign or malign influence.

The European Union will be a much more significant player in matters of social policy, which of course will include education. LEA Director²⁹

Once the idea of globalisation was linked with technology, a very different picture emerged. The world suddenly became a global village, and this could facilitate all kinds of positive change for classroom teachers, particularly in relation to Continuing Professional Development (CPD).

ICT could be used to put teachers into video conferencing links that would keep them in touch with teachers around the LEA, the nation, Europe and then the global community of teachers. Classroom teacher³⁰

This attitude was fairly common, and reflected the idea that technology would be the catalyst for all kinds of change in the professional lives of teachers. Therefore globalisation was seen both as a problem and a solution. There was little practical reference to how any solution would be achieved, however. The language used appears to be fairly idealistic and imprecise, referring to a 'global community' of professionals, although this 'community' by definition excludes those without access to electricity and computers, amongst other things.³¹

The teachers quoted seem to stand firmly in the globalisers camp, arguing that there is a growing global economy that can be a force for good. It builds on the idea of 'flexible professionalism' (Goodson and Hargreaves, 1996), with its underlying notion of a 'shared professional community'. However there did not seem to be any awareness or scepticism regarding any negative effects of globalisation on their profession as a whole. When discussing global professional society, Perkin describes this type of international growth not as globalisation, but instead refers to it as 'corporate neo-feudalism' (1996, p.185) in which a small number of commercial organisations with trans-national links dominate the global arena. In the case of teaching, one of these dominant groups might be the producers of

information technology tools, who are in a position to decide where provision can most conveniently be concentrated. This effectively puts some members of the global community of teachers at risk of professional exclusion, thus resembling the 'elitist' retrospective identity (Bernstein 2000, pp.75-76), despite its apparent contemporary, forward-looking position (though 'élite' refers here to access to technology rather than Bernstein's high culture). To borrow from Bernstein again, its essential 'narcissistic' nature belies its stated desire to create a 'global community'.

Economic Funding

This was an ongoing area of serious concern for most participants. Years of underfunding seem to have taken their toll, both on the expectations of teachers as well as their morale. Generally this situation was presented largely as a statement of fact. Classroom teachers appeared keen to answer this question, and the following replies are typical of the responses.

Education will require more money – there is not enough money to staff schools at the moment. Classroom teacher³²

Education will always be underfunded. Classroom teacher³³

As capitalism expands, government spending will be influenced more and more by big business ... bureaucracy will be the biggest growth area. Classroom teacher³⁴

Respondents made blunt comments about their lack of faith in Government's ability to rescue the situation, although they did not seem to regard this as negatively as school inspection. Certain respondents were strongly disparaging about government funding policy, generally expressing personal views and not using technical managerialist terminology. This differed from their comments relating to testing and assessment, which used the language of finance, such as 'audits'. Neither were their comments personalised, as they were about school inspection.

The British experimentation with privatisation in the railways, air traffic control and the London Underground has been disastrous for those industries, and has not taken into account the basic concepts of privatisation to make new initiatives a success. Classroom teacher³⁵

This is a useful exemplar of the use of language in relation to funding issues. The respondent does not mince his words, using the term

‘disastrous’ to describe privatisation outcomes. But the comment offers no insight into how this personally affects the teacher.

All the rest of the comments about funding were sceptical about how far private finance could address any shortcomings in education funding.

I'm not a fan of public/private partnerships. Neither the intellectual nor the practical arguments have been put forward convincingly. LEA Director³⁶

However when a school controlled its own quasi-private finance initiatives, they understandably looked upon them more favourably. This suggests a desire for greater autonomy in matters of finance and funding. An earlier reference to a ‘mini’ private finance initiative in a school dining room illuminates this point.

In relation to other entrepreneurial fundraising methods, one headteacher made reference to parental top-up funding of élite maintained schools, despite the fact that these schools were supposed to offer free education to their pupils. Again, the language was straightforward.

You will have to charge parents for the delivery of state education, which élite schools can. The London Oratory charges £25, £30, £50 a month, Wimbledon College does it, although it's technically voluntary. That's excess funding. Headteacher³⁷

Participants therefore painted a picture of significant financial constraint, in which schools were desperately trying to balance their books by being as entrepreneurial as possible. However this often brought only limited educational benefits to the school. Increasing amounts of money needed to be spent on administration and its associated bureaucracy. This was perceived as undermining the educational efforts of the school, rather than enhancing them. From their responses, despite this difficult state of affairs, participants did not seem to feel any personal resentment of, or involvement in, the situation. Nor did there seem to be any difference between the responses from participants working in fee-paying schools, and those working in non-fee-paying schools.

Influence of business and industry on the curriculum and expectation of pupils as the workforce of the future

‘Debates about the school curriculum have a tendency to become heated’ (Moore, 2000, p.17). Business and industry were widely seen as having a pushy, rather negative effect on education. Once again,

the language becomes slightly more emotive, as respondents seem to perceive relevance to their classroom practice.

Business and industry will continue to pressure politicians and education groups into creating curriculum initiatives that will benefit the workplace. Classroom teacher³⁸

Business and industry were regarded by many respondents as having a disproportionate influence on Government, demanding that schools provide a fairly instrumental education that was aimed primarily at preparing pupils for work. This was contrasted with the more holistic approach to education that most participants professed to embrace. The following comments are typical;

If the Government is under pressure from employers to shift the focus of education so that we can match some of the output of countries, the Government needs to be very careful that they are not throwing the baby out with the bath water just to respond to that. Headteacher³⁹

There is a mismatch about what schools are for in terms of broadening the horizon of students, not just in terms of a career, but broadening for broadening's sake. I think that is an inherent mismatch with employers. Headteacher⁴⁰

Many participants considered that business and industry were comparatively fickle, and simply wanted schools to take responsibility for the type of training that should be provided for adults in the workplace, such as computer skills. The demands took no account of the pupil's long-term ability to develop and adapt over time, and accommodate new developments and social situations. Schools were seen by respondents to be more enlightened about the long-term needs of individuals. Moore, however, states that any dichotomy between the traditional (instrumental) and the progressive fails to reflect the contemporary reality of schools and teaching, which could undermine the participants' arguments that they are best equipped to decide appropriate curriculum content for their pupils.

Few participants appeared to have professional experience outside education. Contact with business and industry seemed in many cases to be confined to fundraising projects. This may have coloured responses somewhat. It may also explain why participants appeared to locate themselves outside this argument, resisting business and industry.

Social

Role of pupils within institutions

Since the late 1980s, there has been a shift in the way pupils are perceived within their own institutions. This is symbolised in part by a change in the term used to classify them. Instead of being pupils, in many cases they are officially referred to as students, particularly at secondary schools. This might be partly down to the desire of secondary schools to ape the further and higher education sectors, where characteristics such as high intrinsic motivation to study, self-control, pleasant campus-like working environments and high status within the community are evident. They are regarded as highly desirable in a school context. This is particularly important within a school that has ambitions to succeed in an internal education market. Market success means being able to select the best pupils or, perhaps more importantly, the best parents. Paradoxically therefore, despite their apparent promotion to student status, pupils are increasingly a commodity to the schools they attend.

It was interesting to examine the comments in relation to pupils in the light of this. Many participants painted a picture that implied traditional schooling was becoming increasingly less relevant to learners, as they needed to become more self-directed and auto-didactic. The language used is imprecise however, as are the concepts. In general, it was LEA directors who were keenest to share their views on this subject.

There will be new ways of working that give learners much greater control over their learning. LEA Director⁴¹

Most of children's education takes place outside school. LEA Director⁴²

Despite this apparent idealism, the reality was that schools were seen to be out of touch with this model of learning. Pupils were variously described as difficult to control, reluctant to engage with educational processes, and grouped in unhelpful ways, with chronological age as an organising category, as can be seen in the following examples.

Children are more difficult to control within a school environment and some of that is due to social change ... LEA Director⁴³

Certainly youngsters in the future will progress through learning at very different rates and I think we will see a lot which is much less age-related in terms of pupil groupings than we've had up to now. LEA Director⁴⁴

This all seemed to relate to the way schools are organised institutionally, based on a Victorian model of learning that sits unhappily with the knowledge economy and an increasingly less deferential society.⁴⁵ This links in turn to the theoretical arguments put forward in Chapter 4 about the limitations surrounding the use of time as an organising category within schools.

One of the things we find with teachers from overseas is that they're not used to children who don't want to learn. LEA Director⁴⁶

I think it's rather sad that children, because of the nature of the system, think they're failures at ten years old. Headteacher⁴⁷

It is useful to consider these additional responses in the light of this educational time. In many of the responses, regardless of the type of respondent⁴⁸, there seemed to be indication of a shift away from traditional models of education, with age cohorts following a broadly similar curriculum, in groups of 25-30. The ideal situation appears to be one where children work productively, managing their own learning, through the completion of negotiated tasks. This is a model of education that resembles practices in higher education. However the limited behavioural and social skills of many school-children suggests that implementation could be problematic, in the eyes of the respondents.

Changes in society

Understandably, the participants felt strongly about the way society and education interacted. There was general consensus that things could only get worse, and that teachers would be made responsible for compensating for the shortcomings of society. A fairly bleak picture of the future was painted. Working conditions were in many cases expected to be grim, with unresponsive and resistant pupils.

Classroom conditions will be appalling in the future. Classroom teacher⁴⁹

Pupils will become more violent. Classroom teacher⁵⁰

Participants considered it unlikely that their efforts to manage difficult situations would be recognised or rewarded.

Class sizes will be unmanageable. Classroom teacher⁵¹

Teachers will stage major walkouts over wage issues. Classroom teacher⁵²

It was felt that teachers would continue to see their professional autonomy eroded whilst the burdens of their responsibility increased, particularly in relation to divisions within society. However, there seemed to be within these comments a reference to what Goodson and Hargreaves (1996) would term ‘complex professionalism’, which emphasises the task complexity of the teacher’s workload, working within a complex organisation, under the control of others. But even within this framework, teachers are seeking to regain control of their own working environments, by walking out.

There will be continuing struggles over social inclusion, immigrant education and the professionalisation of the teaching profession. Classroom teacher⁵³

Still, there was a professional pride in the fact that schools were intended to play such an important part in the future of society.

I think recently there has been a renewed awareness that schools are going to be central to the process of bringing about social change. If there is the political will and leadership, then I can imagine that in twenty years’ time the schools are playing a much fuller role in cementing social changes and in making contributions to reforming various aspects of society. Headteacher⁵⁴

Most participants seemed to think that teachers were being given an impossible task including being asked to persuade their pupils of the need to learn. They were expected to act as the glue for society, whilst at the same time their professional autonomy and financial support were being eroded. This endeavour was therefore likely to fail in many cases, resulting in serious classroom management problems in the future and wider repercussions throughout society. There was some optimism, from participants not in teaching posts, that success might be possible. However, it seems that the closer to the classroom participants were, the more dystopian their viewpoint. This is a fairly ominous situation and it is a far cry from the views on education expressed in Mercer’s research into the future of society, for example, in which he spent five years collecting the views of over a thousand organisations, asking them to consider their destinies.

Face-to-face teaching will continue to expand, but in rather different forms. At one extreme it will concentrate on tutoring, to meet the specific needs of individual students. At the other, it will evolve to take responsibility for managing the students’ education portfolio, designed to allow each student to fulfil his or her ultimate potential. (Mercer, 1998, p.143)

Thus we see an interesting divergence between the views of business and industry, in this case exemplified by the quotation from Mercer's work, and the views of serving teachers, who were significantly more negative in outlook. Another way of looking at this tension might be to contrast two professional typologies. As discussed previously, Nias (1981) refers to 'commitment as caring' which in this case would see professionals playing a vital role within society, aimed at developing the next generation. This would lead to positive social change. However, another strand evident in some of the comments above is 'commitment as career-continuance' (*ibid.*), in which the need to earn a reasonable living within a reasonable working environment struggles with any sense of inner vocation that might be felt by the education professional. This explains the idea that teachers might consider walking out.

Changing Nature of Teacher Professionalism

There seemed to be a consensus amongst respondents that teaching as a profession is undergoing difficulties at present, for a wide variety of reasons. The profession was seen as essentially unattractive to new entrants. This unattractiveness is despite the fact that enrolments to initial teacher training were up. Many participants said that they expected newly qualified teachers to leave the profession early on in their careers. Once again, this related to Nias's typology of 'commitment as career-continuance'.

Teaching seems to be a fairly undesirable profession to be in currently, and while Government efforts to attract new teachers may be increasing recruits, I am sure statistics will reflect continuing high numbers of young teachers leaving the profession. Classroom teacher⁵⁵

Relatively low salaries seemed to be a significant factor in the low status accorded teachers. This response from a young, enthusiastic teacher trainee throws the issue of salary levels into stark relief. The social pressure *not* to become a teacher can be significant.

I think that at the moment a lot of people are being turned away from teaching because the financial kind of incentives just aren't there. So often I hear so many of my friends, who would be really, really good teachers, saying 'no way, I'm not going to do that, you just don't get the money'. Trainee teacher⁵⁶

Participants also mentioned other social pressures that acted as a disincentive to teach.

Teaching for the white middle classes in London is a bit of a dropout's job, in many people's eyes. They ask 'Why aren't you in banking? Why aren't you in the media?' Headteacher⁵⁷

Despite this apparent unattractiveness, teaching was seen as a very important job, and one that was crucial to society's wellbeing.

The view of teaching in the future will be the same as now. There will be low salary and status, though teaching is one of the most important professions, along with health and the emergency services. Classroom teacher⁵⁸

The solution, many participants thought, lay in raising the social status of teachers at all costs.

Teachers need a boost in societal social capital ... teachers are a primary key to the success of any society. We teach the future, and without the teaching profession, a culture will be hard pressed to move forwards. Classroom teacher⁵⁹

Participants seemed to feel that teaching as a career was a low-status, low-paid job that was unattractive to new entrants. Reading between the lines helps us to understand what the participants meant. Many referred to pay and status, often linking the two. This suggests an underlying belief in a market economy. In other words, the level of one's salary demonstrates the value put on one's contribution to society. To continue this line of argument, if teaching salaries were higher, teachers would be regarded as more valuable.

Interestingly, no references were made in any of the responses to vocation or the need for professional autonomy, although teachers were regarded as important members of the emergency services. This suggests a different kind of social value, albeit not necessarily evident to members of the public, parents or pupils. Nias refers to this as 'self-defining beliefs and values' (Nias, 1986, p.25) and argues that the classroom is a place where teachers can behave in a manner that is consistent with their beliefs and values. Personal and professional identities are strengthened and reinforced by such behaviour. However Nias goes on to question whether this leads to forms of professional allegiance that are unnecessarily introspective. Considering the responses of the research participants, the negative attitudes expressed in the quotations above might be a way of demonstrating professional allegiance, in other words, 'I must really care about teaching to stay in this profession'. This links to the categories of professionalism described in Chapter 2, and in particular the notion of teachers as caring and competent.

Changes in institutional structure

Many participants anticipated significant changes for the 14-19 age groups, in particular. This was essentially due to the widening of the curriculum to include both vocational and academic subjects. It was felt that no individual institution was likely to be in a position to offer all courses to all types of students all of the time. This meant that the boundaries of institutions would be likely to break down. A new economic system of trading between institutions would mean that students would move relatively freely between schools, FE, and sometimes even HE institutions. Participants seemed to expect this to be reasonably altruistic, devoid of the marketised self-interest displayed by schools and FE colleges in Maguire *et al* (*op.cit*) and rooted in the idea of a shared professional community, as in the Goodson and Hargreaves (1996) construct of 'flexible professionalism'.

It all depends whether you fund the institutions or the individuals ... There will be major transactions between institutions. For example, comprehensive school X identifies 35 students who are going to benefit from a particular vocational course that is going to take place three afternoons a week at a local FE college. They go off to do that, and at the end of the year there's a grand reckoning up and money moves about the system. LEA Director⁶⁰

You will get a chuck [sic] of your money for actually having the student on your register and being his or her pastoral support base. You will get some more money for the various courses, which you will pass on to other institutions. You will get some more money for assessment purposes. LEA Director⁶¹

Some participants felt that there were equally important institutional issues to do with smaller schools, particularly in the primary age ranges. Collaboration appeared to be an attractive option in such situations.

In our local communities many issues could be better managed by pooling both the economic resources in the local area and also the skills of the professionals. So we have two or three schools grouped very closely together, dealing with a highly mobile group of families, but we rarely formally communicate. I think we need to move towards bigger schools, bigger buildings, or a more collaborative ethos in primary schools. Headteacher⁶²

The general tone of the comments was that new ways of working were required, in which different schools and teachers worked more as teams, rather than remaining institutionally separate. This would

strengthen and consolidate work going on in individual schools and offer more support to staff and pupils alike. However, there seemed to be little if any thought given to the impossible situation rural areas might find themselves in as a result of this transfer and collaboration economy.

An element of altruism is needed to prevent schools not being tempted to build up their own reputations at the expense of their local rivals. Can such a harmonious, collaborative situation be possible with the teachers' existing professional training?

English teachers have been, and to a large extent still are, trained to work with children in classrooms, not with adults in schools. They are given little understanding of schools as institutions or preparation for negotiation or conflict-resolution among their colleagues. The myth tends to be perpetuated, by omission, that schools are places in which adults work harmoniously and without fundamental disagreements ... The desire to suppress disagreement because it is not philosophically in tune with the traditions of the profession is strengthened by the absence of structure for expressing it ... Potential conflict is treated as a pathological symptom rather than as a natural phenomenon which occurs in all groups and institutions, the resolution of which can lead to personal and collective growth. (Nias, 1987b, p.31)

What Nias asserts is true. It is hard to see how schools could engage effectively with a situation whereby pupils still in compulsory education belonged to several institutions concurrently, rather than just one. If dealing with colleagues in one school proves to be difficult, surely dealing with colleagues across several schools or institutions is bound to be fraught with serious problems.

As well as expressing a desire for altruistic trading in pupils and resources, many participants identified technology as having an impact on institutional boundaries. Some gave examples of distance learning projects, explaining that this was one way that schools delegated responsibility for certain subjects (such as Latin and ICT) to external organisations. Most participants felt that it was important for most pupils to have adequate pastoral care and face-to-face contact with a teacher or tutor for this to be properly successful.

Research shows that students who study through ICT actually want more face-to-face contact with a teacher/tutor ... I doubt that ICT will remove the teacher. Classroom teacher⁶³

We tried the Thomas Telford GNVQ in IT. They've made a fortune out of that. But again, you have got to have the people. They can

do the course but you've actually got to have the people on site to make it work. Headteacher⁶⁴

One participant reframed the question to refer to home schooling. I was surprised, but this generated interesting questions relating to the role of Government in managing institutional boundaries. Home schooling could be regarded philosophically as the exact opposite to the institutional collaborations discussed above: as the pupil does not belong to any educational institution, the institutional boundaries have broken down completely. This participant felt that there should, however, still be some state involvement in assessing learning outcomes.

There should be portfolio assessment by an educational panel that would be equipped to look at and evaluate a student's progress. Classroom teacher⁶⁵

This comment reflects the Government's official line on assessing children who do not attend school. Yet it raises further institutional issues, and is an interesting point in English law. It is currently the responsibility of parents to ensure that children receive an education appropriate for their ages and abilities. This can be achieved in school, or by offering 'education otherwise'. The key phrase here is education otherwise, which refers to all forms of non-school based education. Traditionally this was taken to mean home schooling, but with the introduction of new forms of distance learning, it could just as easily refer to distance learning using technology. Ultimately, however, it is for the parent to decide what is appropriate for the child. There is no compulsion to follow the National Curriculum, to keep school hours, or to keep school terms.

This is an unsettling situation for the Government, which has been anxious to increase its control over children's physical whereabouts during the school day, arguing that unless children are in school, they cannot receive an education. A recent leaflet urging parents to make sure their children attend school stated that parents were legally obliged to make their children attend school, and that failing to do so was a criminal offence that could result in a prison sentence. This caused serious concern within the growing home schooling community.⁶⁶

Yet despite this drive to compel all children to attend school, there appears to be insufficient attention paid to rates of progress of other children, for example those in hospital schools⁶⁷, pupils excluded from school, or young pregnant mothers. This suggests that current Government policy pays little attention to changing institutional

boundaries, preferring to concentrate on policies of containment rather than facilitation.

So while participants gave examples of different institutional changes taking place, they said less about how best to anticipate and manage these changes. This seemed to reflect the dilemma of the current Government in managing learning, as well as the institutional shortcomings of schools themselves.

Home-school relationships

Good relationships with its parents benefits the school. The way is paved for successful fundraising campaigns, offers of voluntary classroom assistance, support for children's learning at home, and support for disciplinary sanctions put in place by the school.

Many comments were made about home-school relationships. Participants felt that the role of parents was crucially important to the development of pupils and the overall success of school in their lives. This seemed to echo the Plowden Report (1967), that emphasised the need for strong home-school relationships to facilitate children's learning.

Whilst recognising their importance to education, many participants were very negative about how home-school relationships were developing within contemporary society. One participant saw parents as important only insofar as they were responsible for choosing schools for their children, which suggested a market-led view of the home-school partnership, with the parents as clients.

Parents are important due to their option of choosing the schools they like. Classroom teacher⁶⁸

Other participants saw parents as less calculating, and less organised. There were accusations of a decline in social order, with the blame placed firmly on the parents for undermining the efforts of teachers to educate the children in their care.

Parents could be very important, if they could get their own lives in order. I am afraid that the average household is probably in no position to keep itself in order, let alone affect or positively influence life in the community school. Classroom teacher⁶⁹

In the future, people won't be able to function as cohesive groups ... you also see an awful lot of one-parent families, where a lot of mothers are on their own with children, struggling desperately. They're having to work in order to support the children and therefore they haven't got the time to nurture them in the same way as

would be beneficial to them. It doesn't give the children a good foundation on which to build relationships for the future.
Deputy head.⁷⁰

This sense of despair seemed to be grounded in the idea that parents, and more specifically mothers, were seen as a vitally important key to a successful education. In its criticism and pathologising of working mothers, this response also harked back to the Plowden report once again which stated, in relation to the economic argument for working mothers and the provision of nurseries:

We are not saying that it is better or unharmed for mothers with children under five to work. Our conclusions are that many mothers will work, and that their children will, as a result, need places in nurseries. And since, *in the absence of positive steps to stop it*, the number of working mothers will increase, it is possible to offset the contribution made by married women workers against the costs of providing nurseries. (CACE, 1967, p.120. Researcher's emphasis)

This seems to suggest that the notion of working mothers was disturbing to the Plowden committee, and presents a situation that could or should have been suppressed, had the Government sought to do so. It could also be construed as meaning that the Government had been neglectful in its duties by allowing mothers to seek employment outside the home. But this participant appears to think that certain mothers have been compelled to work rather than choosing to work and that this is indeed having a negative effect on their children's education.

As with now, unless we educate the parents of the future to be good educating parents, the situation will be the same as now ...

Without parents reading to children and inspiring them to think and be creative at an early age, the child is left behind her classmates when entering reception classes. Without continued support and discipline throughout the education process, a student might easily get side-tracked. Classroom teacher⁷¹

The participants generally wanted to look to parents for support in the future, but that many parents had little time, energy or interest in being supportive. In turn, parents looked to the school to extend and consolidate its pastoral role in the upbringing of their children. Participants saw this as extending the role of the teacher beyond sensible professional boundaries and were disappointed in parents who they felt abdicated their responsibilities. There appeared to be little willingness to embrace what Goodson and Hargreaves (1996) term 'postmodern professionalism', with its collaborative cultures,

parental links, and active care of pupils, as this was seen as compensating for the shortcomings of the home environment, rather than being a positive process in its own right.

Growth of standardised educational model

The responses showed clearly that participants were excited at the prospect of new developments in education, such as powerful, outward-looking technology, effective use of knowledge gained from neuroscience, and so on. However, they seemed torn between viewing these new developments in education as positive and seeing the nationalised framework within which they were forced to work as negative. The need to conform to centralised Government directives meant that scope for using these new developments to personalise education was likely to be strictly limited.

There will be more uniformity in the future ... Classroom teacher⁷²

The implications of this uniformity were regarded as being serious.

I think there's a terrible danger of not seeing people as individuals, and thinking of them as groups of people with numbers and levels and all the rest of it, and not thinking beyond that really. There's sociable things, and there's community things, and there's attitudinal things, which are very difficult to measure, but I think they are just as important really. Headteacher⁷³

This suggested once again that participants were concerned about how their role was defined. They tended to emphasise the importance of the individual, stating that education should be tailored to the needs of each pupil, according to their inclinations and interests. However, a fairly rigid model had been imposed upon the process, which meant that teaching was based on a model that saw subjects as discrete entities, and pupils as groups to be tested. This created an artificial barrier between accountability and the successful implementation of appropriate pedagogy. Interviewees seemed to perceive the existence of a performance model: specialisation of subjects, skills and procedures, graded performance and strong levels of classification, amongst other things. This was in contrast to a competence model, in which learners have greater control over the content of their own learning (Bernstein, 2000, p.45). Clearly the respondents above perceived a tension between the two. Once again this suggests an allegiance to Nias's model of 'commitment as caring', with the individual child at the centre of the learning process.

Technological ICT in the classroom

Participants were keen to see greater use of technology in the classroom, regarding it as a desirable enhancement to classroom practice.

Within schools there will be a more diverse range of technologies.
LEA Director⁷⁴

There is going to be a revolution in the way that we think about how we deliver education. You're never going to move away from the interface between real adults and youngsters, but the qualifications that adults will have will alter. We won't be quite so frightened about saying that an image of someone from somewhere else is going to explain to us how you deliver this particular lesson or that particular subject area. Director of Education⁷⁵

Many felt that teachers required significantly enhanced training in how best to exploit this. There was also a feeling that some schools had better provision for technology than others, which created an unequal playing field. Currently there seemed to be many limitations to its use.

If all schools had the same access to technology, that would be a good start. Then, you have to train teachers how to use it effectively, in and out of their subject areas. Classroom teacher⁷⁶

There were further questions raised about the involvement of classroom teachers in developing ICT provision. Many participants were concerned that, all too often, provision represented what was possible technologically, rather than what was actually needed or desirable. These sites often did little to enhance learning.

ICT will have to become more global, to take into consideration different cultural and learning styles. ICT will continue to be driven by the computer experts unless action is taken to empower the classroom teacher. Classroom teacher⁷⁷

As far as ICT is concerned, more reliable sites need to be provided that will facilitate a critical, analytical understanding. Classroom teacher (same respondent as above)

It was clear to some participants that there were sociological implications regarding the use of technology in the classroom, and that these were not being addressed.

Information and technology will also have many bad impacts for education. It is introduced and used in a very hasty way. People

are in many cases not socially prepared to receive great amounts of information into their lives. Classroom teacher⁷⁸

Whilst recognising the potential of technology, many participants were seriously concerned about its impact on education.

ICT can be exploited negatively by being used as a babysitter for students rather than actively and meaningfully incorporating technology into regular lesson plans. Classroom teacher⁷⁹

It is all a load of rubbish. The amount of money that has been put into technology over the last five years is shameful, shameful ... Some very serious research work needs to be done to balance the vested interest in schools' hardware ... I do not see an awful lot of evidence that my children are better for the incredible investment the school has made ... What on earth are we doing, spending millions when I could be buying different teachers for the school? Headteacher⁸⁰

Overall, participants seemed to recognise that there was great potential for using ICT in an educational context. However, all too often, the best intentions seemed to be stymied by inappropriate use, and a lack of appropriate training for teachers. A picture was painted of an industry driven primarily by hardware producers, who saw schools as profitable places to sell their wares. In this context, hardware and software producers were seen as dominating an area of provision through their technical culture, which in this case was not shared by education professionals. This was seen as being self-serving and, ironically in many senses, would also relate to the more negative aspects of Goodson and Hargreaves' notion of 'classical professionalism'. In other words, this suggests that teachers saw the ICT industry's approach to professionalism as overly technical and unresponsive to its clients, selling what it can make, rather than making what it can sell.

Meanwhile, teachers were required to use the hardware and software provided in a fairly superficial way, thanks to their limited skills. However the very fact that it had been used was supposed to satisfy the authorities that technology was incorporated into the curriculum satisfactorily, no matter how inappropriate its use had been.

To understand the seriousness of what is at stake, it is useful to give brief consideration of some views of pupils, the consumers of school ICT provision, in relation to this situation. Furlong et al (2000) refer to the limitations of ICT in a school context, in an article that draws on preliminary findings of a 2 year study. This study reviewed how

young people utilised ICT at home, and how this related to the realisation of the Government's policy objectives in terms of access to the National Grid for Learning, which is a learning resource bank available over the internet. As they argue

One of the most striking features of our preliminary work on this topic has been the disjunction reported by many young people between the sorts of learning opportunities afforded by new technologies when used at home as compared with school. Indeed, amongst many of the young people we spoke to, there was a deep sense of disappointment and frustration with their experiences at school. (Furlong *et al*, 2000, p.102)

If this is the case, it would seem to reinforce the view that all is not well with the current state of school ICT provision. Indeed, the authors go on to describe the introduction of ICT into UK schools as a '*frustrating and painful process*' (*ibid.* p.107). The article also made the point that teachers can be perceived as technically incompetent by pupils, giving the following example of a pupil's comment:

Like on my English project I wanted to do it on Publisher instead of Word because then you can move it about and do all sorts of stuff to it but my English teacher didn't know whether I should do it or not because she doesn't know how to work it so she had to go and ask the IT technicians. (*ibid.* p.103)

As Bernstein observed (2000) we again see teachers controlling time, text and space – the time pupils are allowed for ICT, the software and hardware they use, and the location/context in which ICT is accessed in the school. Yet they do not always seem equipped to make judgements that are in the best interests of their pupils. Pupils are aware of this, and consequently locate the teachers outside the domain of technological competence.

Summary of initial analysis

From this initial analysis of the data, we learn much of interest about the attitudes of the research participants towards the future of the teaching profession, particularly in relation to the surrounding environment.

The greatest number of responses was in the social issues category, followed by political issues. This suggests that the participants gave a great deal of thought to the social context of their work, and also to the political influence upon it. Economic and technological issues seemed important. This is not surprising, considering the nature of the profession. Many of the respondents' comments could be classi-

fied as demonstrating the ‘commitment as caring’ professional typology (Nias, 1981). This is also fairly predictable as one would expect teachers to aspire to be caring, vocationally-inspired individuals. Yet as we progress through the data, surprising elements do emerge.

There was a continuing thread through many responses indicating that many other bodies were seeking to influence teachers’ professional practice. It was felt that little trust was put in the professional judgement of teachers and this was seen to have a disempowering effect upon the workforce. This lack of trust also served to undermine the ability of teachers to assert their views publicly about pedagogy and the wider purpose of education. And there seemed little incentive to develop professional practice in an innovative and reflective way. Although teachers wanted to do this and believed it was important, they felt compelled to adopt managerialist terminology, using this as their benchmark for relative success even though they considered such an approach flawed in many senses. Indeed, they appeared to have become so habituated to the discourse of managerialism that this use of terminology was apparently subconscious on their part, or certainly unselfconscious. Returning once again to the different professional typologies discussed throughout this section, there seemed to be an intrinsic tension between the idea of ‘commitment as occupational competence’ (Nias, 1981) and ‘commitment as identity’. On the one hand, teachers felt compelled to prove their competence whereas, on the other hand, this could in some cases conflict with any inner sense of vocation.

There seemed to be little consensus as to the true purpose of contemporary education. In the light of this, it was also unclear who the participants felt the main stakeholders were supposed to be. Teachers seemed to be responding to the demands of different groups at different times, including Government, parents, pupils, business and industry. Unfortunately, the implication of this seemed to be that teachers were trying to please all of the people all of the time and this was proving to be an impossible task. According to the participants, teachers wanted to approach education holistically, developing every aspect of the pupil in a complementary way. Inhibiting this holistic approach was the pressure to provide a more instrumental education instead, that was aimed at preparing pupils for the workplace. This led to an essential tension between teachers as providers of education, and other groups as consumers.

To the participants, increasing globalisation seemed both inviting and threatening. They could see the potential benefits of easier, more frequent contact with other countries. For example, there were

several comments made about the possibilities of communicating regularly with professionals in other countries, as part of teachers' continuing professional development. But participants weren't sure how the United Kingdom fitted within this. As UK teachers were supposed to be primarily responsible to central Government, it was not clear which areas of international collaboration would be the most helpful. After all, each country brings to any education system its own culture and tradition, limiting the scope for shared strategies for success.

There was a darker side to globalisation too. Many participants demonstrated great concern regarding increased individualisation within society. By this they meant the emphasis on individual progress and prosperity, sometimes at the expense of the common good. They feared that society was progressing towards a situation in which the world was peopled by individuals. This went against their desire for a global village with extended communities and a greater emphasis on working together to create a more positively framed global family.

Participants expressed equal concern about the state of society in general. It was generally felt that society was in a state of collapse. Pupils were inadequately supported at home and in society at large. This led to problems with classroom management and the general attitude of youth towards the education services on offer. In turn, this created a cycle of helplessness in which pupils were poorly educated, only to become the inadequate parents of tomorrow. Participants felt that, in many cases, teachers seemed to be relied upon to relieve these problems and act as surrogate parents to pupils who were struggling to cope within the school system. Only by doing this would teachers be able to unlock pupils' native ability to learn. Yet this support in *loco parentis* was neither recognised nor rewarded within the current structure of education.

The attitudes of the participants towards economic issues seemed to grow out of this alienation towards contemporary society. They did not feel that education was adequately funded and they saw the situation as deteriorating in the future. They saw this as likely to cause many practical problems in the classroom, chief among them the ongoing recruitment and retention crisis. Participants argued that teachers were paid inadequately, and that this led to diminished respect for them as professionals. This was an interesting point of view in its own right. The participants seemed to be subscribing to a view that was essentially a rational economic model of professionalism. In other words, they seemed to think that the main indicator of

the social value of a professional within society was the salary level. Vocation did not appear in this equation. As vocation has no monetary value, it cannot be accorded worth within any social hierarchy, which might be why it was absent. I return to this within the causal layered analysis.

Returning first to the theme of inadequate funding, it was clear that nearly all the participants felt that teaching was an unattractive profession for new entrants. Inadequate remuneration was only one of the reasons why; they also cited increasing class sizes, decreasing professional autonomy, increasing amounts of bureaucratic paperwork and the low status of the profession in general. Participants envisaged even greater recruitment problems in the future as a consequence of all this. They saw classes becoming larger and larger, leading to lecture-style teaching supported by classroom assistants, and they felt that this would lead to a more generic education for many pupils, which would not necessarily meet their individual needs. This, combined with a reluctance to allow teachers sufficient professional autonomy, made the prognosis for teaching as a high status profession rather grim.

There was some hope for salvation through developments in neuroscience and technology. Some participants felt that both might provide solutions to some of the practical professional problems outlined throughout this chapter. However, there was scepticism as to whether this could actually be achieved. Technology in particular was regarded as something of a Trojan horse. On the one hand, it seemed to offer the promise of enhanced teaching, in that in general it was relatively easy to differentiate tasks for pupils of different abilities, and offered a window on the world. However, this was only possible in any useful sense if the teaching systems used had been designed by highly skilled classroom practitioners. Currently, technology specialists dominate production for a variety of reasons, including the dominance of large multinational hardware and software organisations in the market. Therefore, technology was also regarded as problematic in the context of education. The enormous capital outlay required to supply schools with even the basics, combined with the inability of most users to maintain and exploit their own equipment, means that implementation can be patchy and ineffective. Any educational outcomes were regarded as being at best uncertain and at worst absent. In the light of this, there was resentment about the cost of technology to schools.

Many touched upon the role of neuroscience. There was little tangible information about what developments teachers expected to

see in the future, other than relatively vague references to better understanding of cognitive processes. It was unclear exactly how this would impinge on classroom practice, but participants seemed to rest a great deal of faith in a scientific solution to their professional problems, rather than a societal one.

Initial conclusions

This first reading of the data has proved useful. It has helped us to understand how the research participants discussed different issues relating to the external environment of education. It has also given an idea of some of the meanings that they make of their professional lives. This is faithful to the interpretivist thrust of the project, which attempts to place importance upon the *process* of data interpretation as well as the content.

As far as the research sample was concerned, the various gender and age groups did not seem to respond to the questions in any strikingly different way. However, as a general rule, it did appear that classroom teachers were more likely to respond to questions in a relatively negative way than LEA directors. This may mean that they were a self-selecting group, who felt particularly disillusioned and were therefore keen to participate in the survey as a way of getting their views across. Alternatively, it may mean that, as classroom teachers, they were closer to everyday reality and their negativity was grounded in an increased awareness of the current climate in education. Therefore, although there was a tension between the two groups (essentially the classroom-active and classroom-inactive), it is hard to assess the root cause in the light of the information available to this project.

There also seemed to be similar difficulties in assessing responses in the light of the different professional identities mapped out in Chapter 2. These seemed to vary according to the subject discussed. When discussing social issues, respondents often tried to portray an impression of professionals as caring and having a vocation. When political matters were discussed, this shifted slightly to emphasise matters of occupational competence. Throughout several of the responses, there seemed to be a desire for a shared professional community, with collaboration across different sectors and institutions, although it was not clear from the responses how this would be achieved.

Overall, however, we see a picture of a demoralised profession under siege from external influences. It is trying to defend its professional autonomy and justify its existence in comparative terms, using a

rational economic model that accords monetary values to intangible assets. From time to time, there are attempts to look outwards for inspiration, from the global community of teachers, from developments in other fields and from developments in society as a whole. These attempts are relatively unconvincing, however. This profession suffers from such low self-esteem in the eyes of the research participants that they see no reason why new entrants should wish to join it and every reason why existing members should leave.

This is clearly an alarming commentary on the nature of contemporary teaching in the UK. In view of the disturbing outcome, a simple analysis such as this is not enough. It is important to move on now to the linguistic analysis described in the research methods chapter. This will allow us to confirm whether such a bleak picture is an accurate one. It will be followed by the causal layered analysis which examines the systems that influence the attitudes of teachers towards their professional identities.

Notes

1 I would like to credit Graham May for demonstrating this to me at the DTI Futures Training Event 'Creating the Future', in March 2003.

2 Female, 21-25, primary BEd course, interview

3 Female, 45-54, large inner-city secondary comprehensive school, interview

4 Level 4 is the National Curriculum achievement level expected of 11-year-olds. Some are entered for Standard Assessment Tests at Levels 5 and 6 (i.e. achieving at a level equivalent to the first two years of secondary school), but this is less common.

5 Male, 45-54, suburban/rural LEA, interview

6 Male, 45-54, Head of Department, inner-city independent co-educational secondary school, interactive survey

7 'Public' in this case meaning independent senior schools.

8 Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school, interview

9 Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school, interview

10 Male, 45-54, inner-city medium-sized maintained girls' comprehensive school, interview

11 Receiving its funding directly from central government, rather than via the Local Education Authority. This allowed schools to be more autonomous. The Labour Government stopped this practice when it came to power in 1997, but schools that had in the past received devolved funding were renamed 'Foundation' schools, although reverting to LEA control.

12 Male, 45-54, inner-city LEA, interview

13 Male, 55-64, inner-city LEA, interview

14 Male, 45-54, inner-city local authority, interview

15 The speaker is referring to the pre-Ofsted inspection regime

16 Male, 45-55, rural maintained co-educational comprehensive school, interview

17 Nias argues that *'Teachers' need to feel in control and their reluctance to listen to one another may relate to a final occupational attribute ... that is, a tendency to prefer agreement to disagreement; to avoid open conflict among adults'*. (Nias, 1987b, p. 30) Possibly in the minds of the participants the LEA offers the former, whereas Ofsted offers the latter?

18 Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school, interview

19 Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school, interview

20 Male, 45-54, Suburban/rural LEA, interview

21 Female, 45-54, independent co-educational selective secondary school, interview

22 Sadly, this point cannot be further expanded and substantiated due to reasons of confidentiality.

23 Male, 35-44, suburban maintained co-educational comprehensive school, interactive survey

24 Female, 45-54, inner-city maintained boys' comprehensive school, interview

25 Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school, interview

26 Female, 55-64, rural maintained comprehensive school, telephone interview

27 Male, 25-34, inner-city maintained co-educational comprehensive school, interactive survey

28 Male, 55-64, rural LEA, interview

29 Male, 45-54, suburban/rural LEA, interview

30 Female, 25-34, urban independent secondary school, interactive survey

31 The Ghanaian teacher referred to in Oduro and Macbeath (2003), who grumbled that educational researchers are driven in cars whilst classroom teachers walk, would probably rightly take exception to a global community that involved a hierarchy based on access to video conferencing links.

32 Female, 25-34, suburban maintained co-educational secondary school, interactive survey

33 Male, 25-34, inner-city independent co-educational selective secondary school, interactive survey

34 Male, 35-44, inner-city independent co-educational selective secondary school, interactive survey

35 Female, 25-34, urban maintained co-educational secondary school, interactive survey

36 Male, 45-54, suburban/rural LEA, interview

37 Female, 45-54, inner-city independent co-educational selective secondary school, interview

38 Female, 25-34, inner-city independent co-educational selective secondary school, interactive survey

39 Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school, interview

40 Male, 55-64, inner-city maintained primary school, interview

41 Male, 45-54, inner-city LEA, interview

42 Male, 55-64, rural LEA, interview

43 Male, 55-64, rural LEA, interview

44 Male, 45-54, inner-city LEA, interview

45 It is interesting to note the use of the term 'youngsters' in this last comment. The use of this word was confined to LEA directors, with teachers opting for the term 'students', as discussed in the opening paragraph of this section.

46 Male, 45-54, suburban/rural LEA, interview

- 47** Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school, interview
- 48** The main organising categories for the sample, which was purposive in nature, were: gender, age band, job title, type of school, and human geography of area surrounding workplace.
- 49** Female, 25-34, inner-city independent co-educational secondary school, interactive survey
- 50** Male, 25-34, inner-city maintained co-educational comprehensive school, interactive survey
- 51** Male, 25-34, suburban maintained co-educational comprehensive school, interactive survey
- 52** Female, 25-34, urban maintained co-educational comprehensive school, interactive survey
- 53** Female, 25-34, inner-city maintained co-educational comprehensive school, interactive survey
- 54** Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school, interactive survey
- 55** Male, 35-44, maintained suburban comprehensive school, interactive survey
- 56** Female, 21-25, primary BEd course, interview
- 57** Female, 45-54, inner-city independent co-educational secondary school, interview
- 58** Female, 25-34, maintained suburban comprehensive school, interactive survey
- 59** Male, 25-34, independent secondary school, interactive survey
- 60** Male, 45-54, suburban/rural LEA, interview
- 61** Male, 55-64, rural LEA, interview
- 62** Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school, interview
- 63** Male, 35-44, suburban maintained comprehensive school, interactive survey
- 64** Female, 45-54, independent co-educational secondary school, interview
- 65** Female, 25-34, suburban maintained secondary school, interactive survey
- 66** The leaflet concerned was issued to all parents of maintained primary school pupils during early 2003, but has been withdrawn, and therefore cannot now be referenced. However the UK home schooling organisation 'Education Otherwise' now issues all parents with membership cards that can be produced should parents and children be stopped by local truancy officers during the school day. See <http://www.educationotherwise.co.uk/Legal/IndexToLegalBits.htm>
- 67** Pupils in hospital have a minimum entitlement of 5 hours per week teaching time, whereas in school this minimum entitlement is expected to be 21 hours per week teaching time. See <http://www.dfes.gov.uk/sickchildren/Pdfs/AccessstoEducation.pdf>
- 68** Male, 35-44, inner-city maintained comprehensive school, interactive survey
- 69** Female, 35-44, maintained secondary school, interactive survey
- 70** Female, 45-54, inner-city maintained boys' comprehensive school, interview
- 71** Female, 35-44, inner-city maintained co-educational secondary school, interactive survey
- 72** Male, 35-44, inner-city maintained co-educational secondary school, interactive survey
- 73** Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school, interview
- 74** Male, 45-54, suburban/rural LEA, interview
- 75** Male, 45-54, inner-city LEA, interview
- 76** Female, 35-44, inner-city independent co-educational secondary school, interactive survey

TEACHERS UNDER SIEGE

77 Male, 35-44, inner-city independent co-educational secondary school

78 Male, 25-34, maintained secondary school, interactive survey

79 Female, 35-44, inner-city independent secondary school

80 Male, 45-54, inner-city maintained primary school

6

Delving Deeper – Linguistic Analysis

The last chapter, on key drivers, examined the factual content of individual statements made by education professionals. Yet this approach fails to paint a full picture on its own of the sociological and psychological factors at work. The use of linguistic analysis to look at how research participants used pronouns allows us to explore their statements in greater depth.

Linguistic analysis

This research project had two main aims: to map out professional conceptions of learning futures, and to establish the relationship between different types of teacher professionalism and the knowledge economy. A linguistic analysis allows us to explore the latter in more detail. But there has to be a caveat. Linguistic analysis of the interactive survey transcripts and the fieldwork tapes could have been a useful subject for an entire research project but it only forms a small part of this research so, by definition, the scope of this second analysis will be somewhat limited. This does not discount its value. It offers useful extra insight into the way teachers perceive the future and how they see their own identities in relation to it. It does this by providing a systematising schema for exploring some of the underlying structures and organising principles of the data.

Within the research project, linguistic analysis was therefore used as a lens to achieve a fuller and more sensitive interpretation of the data than might otherwise have been achieved. This illuminated differences in teacher talk. Whereas teachers tended to use a carefully rehearsed and constructed discourse of professionalism when being

interviewed, underpinning this was a way of selecting pronouns that initially appeared to contradict or undermine the content of what was being said explicitly. Upon further analysis, when this pronoun use was compared to the subject content of what was being discussed, it became apparent that this happened more frequently when negative aspects of teachers' professional lives were being articulated. This has parallels in social psychology research, which has documented the relationship between negative emotion and psychological distancing of the self from the subject under contemplation (Cohn, Mehl and Pennebaker, 2004). In terms of this research project, there appeared to be a tension between the public and private discourses employed by teachers, which seemed to lead them to engage in psychological distancing of this type.

Existing precedents in educational research literature suggest that analysis of this kind, examining the tension between the explicitly stated and the less explicitly communicated, is a potentially fruitful area for sociological enquiry (for instance Maguire, Ball and Macrae, 2001). In their research, these authors found for example that schools and teachers competed for sixth form school students in the educational marketplace, whilst attempting to maintain the impression of a united and co-operative teaching profession.

Background of linguistic analysis

As a research tool, linguistic analysis probably originates from the beginning of the 20th century (Berelson, 1952). At its most basic level, it means the examination of the content and form of different types of human communication. The terminology has been used mainly in relation to four academic disciplines: philosophy, linguistics, social psychology and, more latterly, education. A brief explanation follows of how the term has been used in each discipline.

In the field of philosophy, linguistic analysis dominated philosophical thought during the earlier part of the twentieth century, as part of the logical positivism movement. Wittgenstein (1933, 1953) and Ayer (1971) sought to achieve a philosophy of language as a means of reducing their arguments to refined proofs which paralleled proofs in mathematics, for example. This approach was not used for the purposes of this research, as it was not considered necessary to reduce the speech of the research participants to their logical components in this way.

Linguistics concerns itself with the precise understanding of the parts of speech and the construction of language. The social context

of language can be taken into account, but in a more technical sense (Clark, 1996). This study drew in some sense on the idea of a technical view of language, in its classification and quantification of pronoun use by teachers, but this was not the study's primary concern.

More relevant to this study, linguistic analysis has been used substantially in social psychology, and there is a growing literature on the close relationship between the construction of speech and the psychological state of the speaker (Muhlhausler and Harre, 1990; Ogilvie and Ashmore, 1991; Swann, 1997; Sherlock Campbell and Pennebaker, 2003; Cohn, Mehl and Pennebaker, 2004). Such work is quantitative in nature and proved to be the inspiration for the use of linguistic analysis in this study.

In terms of educational sociology, Bernstein used a form of linguistic analysis termed sociolinguistics (Bernstein, 1971). In this, he introduced concepts of 'elaborated' and 'restricted' code in speech. Such codes were seen by Bernstein as serving both to demonstrate and perpetuate social class. He later modified this analysis to allow for the effect of the surrounding social environment upon the conscious selection of particular speech patterns by individuals. The study of sociolinguistics has also been used by other researchers in a broader sociological sense, for example Goffman (1981).

Other education studies have evaluated classroom talk in particular contexts, concentrating on pupil-teacher interaction. These include patterns of teacher talk in science classrooms (Edwards and Mercer, 1987), primary classrooms (Erickson, 2004) and reading lessons (Heap, 1985). But there is little evidence of enquiry into teacher talk outside the context of the staffroom. So there is a case for the use of linguistic analysis in educational research as a technique in its own right. It allows interaction with the research participants and builds on levels of meaning not easily obtainable via other means.

The growth of linguistic analysis techniques over recent years has been greatly facilitated by corresponding technological developments. Historically, data gathering was generally confined to various forms of written material. It gradually developed to include verbal interactions between individuals or small groups, telephone calls, meetings and so on. The recent growth of technology makes the use of such techniques increasingly accessible to many researchers. The introduction of reel-to-reel tape, cassette tape, videotape and, more recently, digital recording equipment meant that researchers were able to document speech reliably without the assistance of stenographers. This speech could then be analysed at length afterwards.

Additionally, qualitative research software packages such as Transana, NVivo, Atlas-Ti and vPrism have facilitated increasingly sophisticated levels of analysis. The rigour of coding processes during technologically-based analysis has been questioned by some researchers (Crowley, Harré and Tagg, 2002), but it is generally agreed that the coding process itself ensures that data integrity is maintained. Most recently, a textual analysis program entitled LIWC (Linguistic Inquiry and Word Count) searches for words according to 70 pre-determined linguistic categories. This program has been subject to rigorous validation and consequently has given more precise information about the social location of language (Cohn, Mehl and Pennebaker, *op. cit.*).

The task of linguistic analysis can be approached in a variety of ways, and there are a number of levels upon which researchers can work, as shown in table 6.1. These levels can interrelate with each other.

Table 6.1: Possible Levels of Linguistic Analysis

Level of Analysis	Description	Example
Word	Includes compounds and key phrases	Terrorism Social inclusion
Theme	Simple sentence or assertion	There is no such thing as society
Character	Used in analysis of fiction, or to describe traits in an ideal type	The caring teacher
Item	Describes genres if material, such as policy documents, professional journals, press releases and Government directives	<i>Times Educational Supplement</i> leader articles
Space and Time Measures	Wordage, number of lines, seconds, minutes	How many minutes and seconds did the disruption take?

These levels do not represent the only possibilities. Researchers can examine the substance of speech, such as the topics covered. Alternatively they can examine the form of the speech, looking at the actual words or terms used. A third method is to ascribe motive to the speaker. This is more problematic, requiring careful construc-

tion of codes and multiple researchers continually revisiting and cross-checking codes to ensure validity and replicability. While this might prove complex in practice, it is worthwhile, as the insights gained from this process can form part of a 'grounded theory' approach to the research (Strauss and Corbin, 1990). With such an approach, it is possible to theorise findings continually throughout the data collection process.

Alternatively, a researcher might choose to apply the philosophical principles underpinning this approach to research, without necessarily adhering slavishly to the Strauss and Corbin model. This might be the case if a researcher wished to maintain an open mind during the early phases of the research, for example, rather than using a hypothetico-deductive research design. As a reflective practitioner, a researcher might wish instead to acknowledge a particular respect for the personal values embedded within the responses of the research participants, rather than imposing their own values as a researcher upon the process (Roulson, 2001).

Domain of the linguistic analysis

All the interviews were much the same length. The focus of the research was the domain of language employed by native speakers, using natural, spontaneous language. This has been shown to carry important information about the social situation of the speaker (Cohn, Mehl and Pennebaker, 2004). However, this was in contrast to the more professionalised discourse of teachers in the workplace (Maguire, Ball and Macrae, 2001; Baker and Johnson, 1998). An example of the latter might be 'We are anti-bullying in this school'. Noticeable in this sort of statement is the use of the first person pronoun, which implies a collective stance against the evils of bullying. This is quite different in nuance from a statement such as 'Pupils are not allowed to bully each other in this school'. As it was made clear to participants in this research that they would not be identified, there appeared to be less of this deliberate use of the first person, and a greater range of pronouns. It was also assumed that they had been allowed to speak for long enough to fall into more natural speech patterns than those they might use in the classroom.

The use of the method also assumed that it is meaningful to count pronouns and that these pronouns indicate personal positioning in relation to key concepts. It assumed that frequency is equivalent to importance or significance. This assumption was derived from the social psychology literature (Wiener and Mehrabian, 1968; Mull-

hauser and Harre, 1990; Ogilvie and Ashmore, 1991; Sherlock Campbell and Pennebaker, 2003). Interestingly, in educational research literature there appears to be little debate regarding the role of pronoun use in the English language in identifying social identities. So this may also be an interesting new area for research.

How the method was adapted for this research

Sometimes a high degree of precision is crucial. When linguistic analysis techniques are used to analyse classroom behaviour, for example, researchers document the said as well as the unsaid very precisely. It is easy to get answers to research questions such 'How many disruptions are there in the course of a lesson, and how long do they take?' But it was clear from the beginning that this type of approach would not add anything to this particular research project.

There was one main area of data: the key concepts, which represented what was said. We sought to consider the way education professionals positioned themselves in relation to these concepts or, in other words, how it was said. Mindful of the social psychology literature, it therefore seemed appropriate to analyse the use of pronouns to achieve this. The pronouns were analysed according to grammatical structure:

I, We	First person
You	Second person
They	Third person

It was felt that this structure gave adequate precision, as it simply used pronouns as a type of semiotic indicator. With a relatively small sample, this was thought to be more useful than trying to ascribe quantifiable outcomes to all data, with the aim of proving desirable or likely key concepts. This would have been highly artificial and imply a claim to representativeness that might have been unjustified. Nevertheless, careful attention was paid throughout to the precision required to complete the task. Clearly it was important that the results were reasonably replicable and representative, although the small sample size meant that any significant claims along these lines were likely to be problematic. Likewise, it was important to try to be as objective as possible, by being faithful to the obvious intentions of the participants (for example, if a statement was repeated almost verbatim, the pronoun was not counted as appearing twice). The number of key concepts used was carefully limited so that the data analysis did not become too cumbersome

and remained a manageable task. The absence of any particularly large frequencies meant that there were very few surprises and this further simplified the task. And as there was no intention to use complex statistical modelling, there was no need for mathematically strict precision.

There were some limits to the use of the method, however, which need to be considered. Bourdieu (2000) and Goffman (1981) argue that the pronouns 'I' and 'you' could sometimes be interchangeable, designating the same person. An example of this might be 'You know when something is good for you', which could be taken to mean, 'I know when something is good for me'. Such variation in the use of pronouns might well have taken place in the responses of the research participants, particularly in interview situations. But to take this into account for such a small sample would have unnecessarily complicated the data analysis, and there is no guarantee that it would have informed the outcome in any useful sense.

The data analysis itself was therefore relatively straightforward. As described earlier, statements were grouped into key concepts. This can be regarded as a pre-quantitative phase, aimed at discovering and formulating key categories for subsequent quantification. The frequency of each key concept was then tabulated, followed by the frequency of each pronoun. A chart was created that linked the two, revealing how often different key concepts occurred, and which pronouns were linked to them (see table 6.2 on page 126/127). It was now possible to see clusters or relationships.

Explanation: The table is laid out so that the frequency of each comment is shown next to each driver and the total overall frequency appears in the final column. There is no overall frequency for the drivers that only appear in one column, as this is unnecessary. From the cluster of statements in the second person and third person columns, we see that the locus moves gradually further away from the participant.

Analysis of the technique

Linguistic analysis allowed a close examination of the language used. This analysis is based on a set of assumptions. The most important of these is the inference that has been drawn about the participant's choice of pronoun. Following the protocols used in social psychology literature, it has been assumed that the use of the words 'I' and 'we' implies that the participant feels psychological affinity with an issue. The word 'you' implies a degree of psycho-

Table 6.2: Key Drivers and Pronoun Use

<i>First Person</i>	<i>Second Person</i>	<i>Third Person</i>	<i>Total frequency of drivers</i>
Funding 2	Funding 2	Funding 4	8
Policy 1	Policy 2	Policy 4	7
Pupils 1	Pupils 1	Pupils 14	16
Teachers 3	Teachers 2	Teachers 11	16
Testing 1	Testing 3	Testing 8	12
Individualised education 1	Individualised education 1		2
Professionalism 1	Professionalism 4		5
Society 6	Society 1		7
Strategy 2	Strategy 3		5
Teaching 4	Teaching 1		5
Local government 1		Local government 1	2
Parents 1		Parents 12	13
Schools 5		Schools 2	7
Employers 1	Employers 1	Employers 2	3
Inspection 2	Inspection 2	Inspection 9	11
Technology 2	Technology 2	Technology 9	11
Work 1	Work 1	Work 4	5

driver referred to in all three ways

driver referred to in first and second person

driver referred to in first and third person

driver referred to in second and third person

Table 6.2: Key Drivers and Pronoun Use (continued)

<i>First Person</i>	<i>Second Person</i>	<i>Third Person</i>
(Drivers below appear in relation to one pronoun only)		
Future 1	Curriculum change 1	Business and Industry 8 Environment 1 Globalisation 4 Head Teachers 2 Home schooling 1 Interactive INSET 3 Knowledge 1 Learning 2 National government 9 Politicians 4 Sports clubs 1 Standards 1 Unions 1 Uniformity of provision 2
Governing body 2	Government agencies 1	driver referred to in only one way
Institutions 1	Infrastructure 1	
Learning 3	Psychological research 2	
LEA 2	Social welfare 1	
Management 1	Teacher training 1	
Nationalism 1		
Pensions 1		
Personal finance 2		

Shows the use of pronouns in research participants' responses across all sections of sample. Frequency of comments next to driver. Total frequency in last column.

logical distancing, and the words ‘it’ and ‘they’ imply an increased degree of psychological distancing.

We have no way of knowing definitively whether these inferences are accurate or not. However, they have been checked against the content and intonation of the original recordings to ensure that the inference was faithful to the original intention of the participant. In addition, four of the participants (10% of the overall sample) were asked informally to comment on the relationship between their use of pronouns and their intentions as speakers. In this way, they were invited to judge the validity of the analysis. Their responses were favourable. The aim all along was to complement the existing key concept analysis and, in this respect, it seemed to be successful.

The following are all examples from the same interview transcript, which records an interview with a young female trainee teacher, which illustrates how the different pronouns were used.

We need to be able to use computers to do what it is we want the children to learn. (First person/teachers and third person/children)

*When we’re teaching children, the focus and the drive is always aimed at ‘what are these children going to get in **their** SATs results?’* (First person/teachers and, third person/children)

You only kind of really see the money when you climb up the career structure. (Second person/teachers)

*Where I was before, the minority of the children have parental support. The teacher’s role was almost to fill the parents’ shoes when **they** were at school.* (Third person/pupils)

*Some children are going to have a lot and some children are going to have nothing. And **we’re** going to have to help all of **them** as best we can to make sure **they** all fulfil **their** potential.* (First person/teachers and third person/pupils)

It became increasingly apparent throughout the analysis that something intriguing was happening in the teachers’ speech. Significant numbers of people were being corralled within the third person category, suggesting the type of psychological distancing referred to earlier. The use of linguistic analysis thus made it possible to investigate beyond the areas covered by the key driver analysis. Whereas previously the research considers how education professionals seemed to be located by others in relation to their external environments, this analysis allows us to gain a better understanding of how they located *themselves* as professionals within this environment.

The research participants interviewed felt ownership of many day-to-day professional issues concerning society, schools, teaching and learning, as this is evident from the preponderance of such issues in the first column or, in other words, the first person. They positioned themselves closely in relation to these areas of their professional lives, as can be seen in the following examples:

When I think of the issues we have to address in relation to our local communities, many of these issues could be better managed by pooling both the economic resources in the local area, and also the skills of professionals. Headteacher¹ (First person/teaching)

Here the respondent positions himself with a pro-active professional group who are seeking to address change. Clearly he identifies with this controlling group.

We also use reading recovery, to help children who haven't been able to grasp a particular point, and again there can be lots of reasons for that. LEA Director² (First person/teaching)

This respondent identifies with teachers and teaching, even though he is no longer active in the classroom. He also demonstrates a nationalistic view of society, in which he considers himself to be part of a large-scale team effort to improve national prosperity:

We're a country that is blessed with the expertise of its populace. We're not going to make our way in the world because we have massive gold reserves or a fantastic agricultural economy ... if we're going to make our way in the world, it has to be done on the basis of technology. Same LEA Director (First person/society)

We're learners, and if we're not learning as we go along ... then that's a pretty poor example to be setting people. Inner-city LEA Director (First person/learning)

Once again, we have identification with learning, even though the speaker is no longer in the classroom.

These categories (teaching, learning and society) are also the categories that related to 'commitment as caring' and 'commitment as identity' in terms of Nias's professional typologies (1981), in that they build on the idea that teachers like to feel they are making a valuable contribution to society.

The second column shows where participants feel that they have some involvement and control. Examples of this include professionalism, funding, curriculum change and the use of psychological research. The following example includes comments relating to the psychology of learning as well as curriculum change.

If you try to project what the curriculum will be like on the basis of developments in understanding of the psychology of learning, developments in the sophistication of technology, developments in the role of teachers and their supporters, then you could see the curriculum developing quite radically in ... a child-centred way.

LEA Director³ (Second person/psychology/curriculum change)

The use of the second person could be conceived as linking to the wider professional community, with a more extrovert engagement with the outside world. In terms of Goodson and Hargreaves' categorisation (1996), this might be classed as elements relating to 'flexible professionalism' and 'extended professionalism'. This would involve building a professional community with shared values that reflected issues beyond the classroom. Within this model of professionalism, teachers would take responsibility for the holistic development of the child.

In the UK, however, there has been recent debate about whether a multi-agency approach linking up healthcare, social welfare, and education would achieve this degree of holistic development. But it is hard to see how this can happen in a climate of fear, where teachers are afraid of or prohibited from using physical touch and quasi-parental skills. Examples of this from Government-funded primary schools, which will be familiar to many UK parents, include: requiring that otherwise healthy children stay off school as members of staff are prohibited from giving a lunchtime dose of antibiotics, requiring that four-year-olds apply each others' sunscreen before venturing outdoors due to a no touching by adults rule⁴, and a class teacher recoiling from the affectionate advances of a cheerful five-year-old on account of this rule.

Finally, the third column shows us where there has been a shift in the locus of control to external bodies. Examples here include pupils, parents, school inspection, technology and national Government.

The following comments provide useful exemplars of the use of the third person. As can be seen, the analysis soon starts to appear more complex.

Example one: Pupils

*Students should be asked about the type of courses **they** would like to see offered, but not the content of core subject courses.*

Classroom teacher⁵ (Third person/pupils)

This is an interesting example. On the one hand, it suggests that curriculum construction should be a mutually-negotiated act between teacher and pupil. On the other hand, the teacher is referring to the pupils in the third person, which suggests distance between teacher as authority figure, and pupil as potential consumer of education. These two positions appear to be contradictory.

Example two: Parents

*Parents are one of the three key elements to a successful education. Without **them** reading to children and inspiring them to think and be creative at any early age, the child is leaps behind her classmates when entering reception classes. Without continued support and discipline from **them** throughout the education process, a student might easily get sidetracked.*

Classroom teacher (same as above) (Third person/parents)

Once again, the location of parents in the third person belies the content of what the teacher is saying. In essence, the teacher considers that the parent has distinct tasks to undertake at home, so that the pupil is well prepared for handing over to a teacher. This demonstrates a separation between the learning experiences of home and school, with home learning being considered a backup for the learning taking place in school. This could be regarded as a hierarchical view of the professionalisation of children's education.

Example three: School Inspection

*I think **you** should spend that money on the schools and make sure that the children are getting the benefit of the finance that **we've** got within the system, rather than setting up a complete tier of external inspectors who can ... you know, it's really providing **them** with jobs rather than doing anything for **us** in schools.*

Deputy headteacher⁶ (Third person/Inspection)⁷

We have references to 'us', the system, the schools, and 'them', the inspectors and, to a lesser extent, the pupils. From the content of the comment, as well as the use of pronouns, it is possible to see that the teacher finds it hard to relate to the inspection process, and does not see it as relevant to her professional activities. 'You', on the other

hand, appears to refer to the wider society, of which this teacher considers herself to be a part. This is also a good example of shifting pronouns, as Rosaldo might describe it (Rosaldo, 1994) It is unclear from this comment where the speaker feels power to lie – is it with the teachers, the school as institution, society as funding body, or external inspectors as auditors? This confusion appears throughout many similar quotations throughout the research. This is a good example of complex multiple identities existing within the same statement or conception.

Example four: Technology

Teach them how to use it first, the rest they will do on their own.
Classroom teacher (Third person/technology)⁸

Once again, this comment was classified in two ways. It also was labelled third person/pupils. Here the idea underpinning the teacher's words seems to be that she is somewhat distanced from the use of ICT. It seems that ICT is something to be taught, something subject-based, rather than a facilitator of learning. Far removed from this is the idea that pupils may be more adept at using ICT than teachers, as discussed in the last chapter.

Example five: National Government

We are so ludicrously over-examined. It's not driven by an educational agenda. It's driven by a kind of planned economy type of agenda. Or if it's not that, it was the Tories and competition ... with any luck the whole examining system will implode. Headteacher⁹

This quotation appears to represent another them and us situation. The headteacher identifies closely with the educational process, which includes pupils as well as teachers, by saying 'we are so ludicrously over-examined'. She then moves on to refer to testing firmly in the third person, thus distancing herself from it. It may be that she feels disempowered as a teacher, with the Government controlling the activities in the classroom to suit a primarily economic agenda, which does not correspond with her personal beliefs.

There is an inherent tension between the modes of professionalism outlined early in this chapter and this final state, in which teachers as professionals seem to be disempowered. This might imply a more instrumental approach to teaching, grounded in Nias's idea of 'commitment as career-continuance', in which the desire to build a career takes precedence over more altruistic, vocationally-based relation-

ships. Had these responses appeared in the first and second persons rather than the third person, we might have classified this as a move towards Goodson and Hargreaves' category of 'postmodern professionalism', in which teachers engage in teamwork with other agencies relatively seamlessly.

The question is whether teachers are able to balance the desire to care for their pupils with the desire to progress in their careers. In the current unsettled environment, it is hard for teachers to use aspects of a postmodern professional model, such as discretionary judgement and active care of pupils. Teachers cannot unilaterally decide that it would be inappropriate for their pupils to learn particular aspects of the National Curriculum, for example. They cannot withdraw certain pupils from Standard Assessment Tests on the grounds that the pupils find them unduly stressful. Teachers are constrained by a prescriptive Governmental model for education that claims to be individualised, whilst demanding conformity.

At a more personal level, the sheer volume of material using the third person suggests a substantial loss of professional autonomy. Participants clearly felt that many external organisations and groups had a vested interest in education. This undermined teachers' ability to exercise professional judgement in their own right. And it left them in a very difficult position, unable to satisfy the demands made upon them.

We saw that school inspection was one noticeable area that tended to use the third person. Inspection processes did not seem to be truly collaborative and the research participants claimed no ownership of it whatsoever.

I think that the current inspection culture is the direct result of the failure of educational leadership over the last fifteen to twenty years. Unless heads and managers get their act together then it will continue and that is quite right. Headteacher¹⁰ (Third person/inspection)

Despite the frequent references to Government policy, there seemed to be an overall de-politicisation of professionalism, with teaching unions and professional associations hardly figuring at all. There seems to be little scope for professional representation in the lives of teachers. Rather than steer developments in policy and practice, teachers seem to be in a position where they are required to react to development imposed from outside the profession. There is little professional autonomy.

Participants seemed unclear about the relevance of the curriculum to the future of education. This tended to appear in the second person only rather than the first, as might be expected from a profession required to engage with it during every day of their working lives, but not responsible for creating it. Noticeable from its absence, however, was pedagogy, which did not appear in a single transcript. This is disturbing in light of the nature of the professional responsibilities accorded to teachers. Overall it appeared that teachers demonstrated little concern about the content of their teaching or its delivery method, relying on outside organisations to organise and control this aspect of their professional lives. Business and industry appeared to play an important role. Participants referred to them frequently, and there seemed to be great uncertainty as to how the education profession should best respond to the demands made by business and industry in order to educate pupils to be the ideal employees of the future. There seemed to be little sense of partnership with employers and the workplace in this respect, or with any other significant agencies. This lack of partnership can be seen in the following quotation:

*If you think about the City Technology Colleges, they were going to be the bright new future, but in the end, the public sector has taken over the costs of running them. That wasn't the idea originally, if you remember. The private sector was going to contribute both to the buildings as well as the running costs. Well, the amount of money **they** invested in the buildings was limited, and **they** haven't paid anything towards the running costs. LEA Director (Third person/business and industry)¹¹*

Pupils did not appear to feature at the heart of education provision either. References to pupils were spread across all three columns of table 2, using the first, second and third persons, but there was a significant concentration in the third column. This suggested alienation from the pupil body. There were no references to learning as a collaborative activity, such as 'we enjoy using online learning in our school'. This is in direct contrast to accepted professional practice within schools, suggesting that such intimations of collaborative learning are, at best, skin deep. There appeared to be little engagement with the views of pupils – or of parents. This indicated that, despite the desire of many teachers to develop productive home/school relationships with parents, as quoted here, it is rarely the case in reality. Teachers seem to regard themselves as keeping social order, surrounded by failing parents, uncivilised pupils and a confusing and critical Government. To expand on an earlier quotation:

Parents could be very important, if they could get their own lives in order. I am afraid that the average household is probably in no position to keep itself in order, let alone affect or positively influence life in the community school. I am sorry to be so cynical about this, but that is the way I see things going. Classroom Teacher¹² (Third person/parents)

Indeed, parents and children came to signify society in a state of collapse. There seemed to be little insight into how to remedy this.

Unless we can educate the parents of the future to be good educating parents, the situation will be the same as now. Classroom Teacher¹³ (Third person/parents)

So a disturbing and pessimistic picture of the profession emerges. In the eyes of the research participants, there appear to be deep fissures within the UK education system. It is not the same sort of phenomenon as the 'Divided School' (Woods, 1979) in which pupils and teachers were at odds about the essential purpose of schooling within society. This research implies a much more politicised situation as a result of post-1980s changes to public sector provision. It is a divide between teachers as *providers* of education, as opposed to parents, pupils and businesses as *consumers* of education, and the Government departments as *regulators* of education. There seems to be tension between the three groups, and this tension is causing teachers to feel alienated and defensive. It confirms the view that teaching is rapidly becoming, to those within it, a profession under siege.

This view was particularly prevalent in the responses of classroom teachers to the interactive survey. The younger the teacher, the stronger this attitude seemed to be. As a self-selecting group, the classroom teachers clearly felt they had a significant contribution to make to the debate. Yet it was found throughout the interview transcripts, which were based on interviews with headteachers and LEA directors in the 45-65 age group, even when participants were trying to be relatively positive in their outlook.

This is a very different picture from that represented by Plowden for example. Whereas pedagogy was then aimed at developing the whole child, now it seems that the teachers' efforts must be aimed at ensuring that children meet extrinsic targets. According to the research participants, there seems to be little collaborative effort between the agencies concerned with education, and conflicts of interest have developed along with a lack of connectivity between different groups.

Conflict seems to be rooted not in time but in constructions of teacher identity. Research participants did not tend to refer to a grand narrative or past age of education in which all had been well. For example, in the words of a male headteacher of a maintained secondary school:

I think we need to think about our priorities and not hanker after the olden days, which may not be relevant. (First person/professionalism)

Participants often articulated personalised concerns about the extent of external interference in the present, whilst at the same time expressing a desire for a more constructive relationship with the outside world. Time did seem to play a part, however, in that the future was used as a metaphor for social change, and sometimes for social disorder or the threat of social disorder. From the same headteacher:

*Thinking about schools of the future, I am well aware that there are views that **they** will not have things like school assemblies and so on, because I actually think **they're** very important for giving a sort of joint ethos, social awareness and teamwork.* (Third person/schools)

Conclusion

Applying linguistic analysis to provide a second reading of the data proved useful. Although the technique is over fifty years old, it allowed further insight into the way in which education professionals position themselves both personally and professionally in relation to various aspects of their professional lives. This was achieved by undertaking a fairly broad brush approach to the analysis, generally giving only one main category to every comment, though with some exceptions. It would have been possible to be more precise, producing different levels of quantitative information, but this would have gone beyond the scope of the project and its statistical validity.

The analysis found that participants created mental models of education through their use of pronouns when they discussed different aspects of their professional environments. In terms of pronoun use, there seemed to be little difference between the responses of men and women of different age groups, and of different professional groups. Neither did there seem to be any significant differences according to location or funding of workplace. Teachers were at the centre of this mental model, along with society, schools,

teaching and learning. This probably implies that the participants accord substantial importance and significance to these issues. Less close to the centre was the wider professional community. Most remote from the centre were government bodies, as well as issues such as testing and inspection. Disturbingly, pupils and parents appeared frequently in this category, which might suggest that home-school relationships are proving problematic and that there is little sense of teamwork, despite the best intentions of the Plowden report and subsequent initiatives.

Overall it seemed as though teachers felt ownership of certain areas of education and accorded them great importance. Yet a sense of true professional partnership between teachers and a range of non-education external agencies, as well as pupils and parents, appeared to be lacking. This implies that members of the teaching profession see themselves as being a long way from the 21st century ideal of democratic professionalism advocated by Whitty (2002), in which teachers make common cause with other interested stakeholders and progressive social movements.

Rather than illustrating teachers' sense of belonging to a society, the pattern of pronoun usage in the transcripts appears to demonstrate psychological distancing, as described in social psychology literature. This distancing suggests that education professionals are beginning to feel alienated, or even under siege in the worst cases, from other groups with a vested interest in education. This raises questions about the relationship between society and education professionals in general. This relationship is considered in the next chapter, where I pull together the different theoretical and empirical strands of the research to generate insights that illuminate the problematic status of teachers within contemporary society. These insights are both disturbing and challenging for the teaching profession as a whole.

Notes

1 Male, 45-54, inner-city LEA, interview

2 Male, 45-54, inner-city LEA, interview

3 Male, 45-55, suburban/rural LEA, interview

4 Often quoted by schools, but rarely explicitly referred to in policy documents

5 Female, 35-44, independent secondary school, interactive survey

6 Female, 35-44, inner-city maintained boys' comprehensive school, interview

7 The comment above was also classified as second person/funding and first person/teaching. This is a good example of how different pronouns appeared within the same context.

TEACHERS UNDER SIEGE

- 8** Female, 35-44, independent secondary school, interactive survey
- 9** Female, 45-54, inner-city independent co-educational secondary school, interview.
- 10** Male, 45-54, maintained primary school, interview
- 11** Male, 45-54, suburban/rural LEA, interview
- 12** Female, 35-44, maintained secondary school, interactive survey
- 13** Male, 25-34, inner-city comprehensive, interactive survey.

7

Towards a Vision of the Future: Causal Layered Analysis

Chapter 6 illuminated important concerns about the way teachers locate their social identities in relation to their external professional environments. The question now is whether this is an issue for teachers alone to address, or whether there are further implications for society. This chapter integrates strands of argument from throughout the book to demonstrate how society's ambivalence towards its young has contributed to the problem of declining teacher professionalism and status.

Until now, this book has dealt with relatively conventional methods of viewing and analysing data, as a way of finding out about the relationship between teacher professionalism and contemporary society. But if we are brave, there is tantalising scope to travel further and illuminate important perspectives on the nature of teacher professionalism and status within modern British society. Consequently, this chapter explores the academic field of futures research, with its new research techniques and methodological arguments. Causal layered analysis, one of the most recent, is used here as a lens through which to view the responses of the education professionals in the Education Futures study. This allows us to get closer still to issues of teacher professionalism in contemporary society.

Futures research as an academic field that has nothing in common with astrology or Nostradamus. It is about challenging existing boundaries of thought, which makes it a worthwhile activity in its own right, particularly when looking at the type of research data

generated in the Education Futures project.

Modern futures research is a very new area of enquiry which grew out of the need for management science to adopt greater levels of rigour in strategic planning. It has critics, as we will see, but as a discipline it is becoming increasingly more established, although it still needs to be approached with some caution (Beck, 1982; de Geus, 1997). It is difficult to ground it within a single paradigm. Futures research was originally born of logical positivism, with its large-scale statistical modelling and emphasis on forecasting and extrapolation. However, there has been a fundamental shift on the part of many researchers towards increasingly qualitative and interpretivist work that seeks to make meaning from a relatively limited research sample. This shift is now examined.

The contemporary period in futures research is generally considered to date from the 1960s and 1970s, when Wack and van der Heijden at the oil company Royal Dutch Shell developed a technique known as scenario planning. This was designed to allow small groups to think up a range of scenarios relating to the future of their industry. These scenarios could be positive or negative or, preferably, have elements of both. All scenarios were considered to have equal validity (Schwartz, 1995; Loasby, 1990; Peters, 1996).

The innovative nature of this work at Royal Dutch Shell can hardly be over-emphasised. Previously, businesses had used the model of predict and control of management. Whilst superficially considered and reasonable, this model made somewhat rash assumptions about all data being empirically valid. An example of this might be the relationship between previous levels of oil consumption and future company requirements for oil transportation systems. If consumption were increasing, as it was during the 1950s and 1960s, then it would be reasonable to assume that it would be necessary to invest more in the means to transport greater quantities of oil in the future. Quantitative research of this nature appears highly replicable and representative. However, by using scenario planning, Royal Dutch Shell was able to consider alternatives to the predict and control assumptions that might otherwise have characterised their investment decisions. They were able to factor in unpredictable elements – for instance, they anticipated the oil crisis of the 1970s. This meant they could cut back transport provision far more quickly than their commercial rivals, or ‘shoot the rapids’ in an unpredictable business environment (Wack, 1985, van der Heijden, 1997). This proved to be a crucial commercial advantage.

Within futures research of this type, we thus see imagery being used to develop meaning (Blass, 2003). Blass describes this approach to research as a kind of philosophical positivism, that is an adapted form of the original paradigm, having re-evolved itself. One main adaptation has been in response to criticism regarding the nature of truth within positivism, and the limitations of ontological claims. This approach, Blass argues, is essentially postmodern, scientific and interpretive, and successfully navigates away from such problems. This is a useful position to take in relation to futures research and its inherent paradigm war. Aligica (2003), on the other hand, admits that this ambivalent view of positivism is a problem for the discipline as a whole. Superficially, futures research appears to fall short of scientific standards of investigation when compared with positivism as a dominant paradigm. Prediction in this sense has a flawed methodology, and is difficult to place within the mainstream epistemology and philosophy of knowledge debate. Generalisation is inappropriate, as data are constructed through social interaction and the relationship between facilitator and participant.

This leaves futures research open to accusations of being an inexact science. Knowledge of the world is not based upon empirical principles, and it is impossible to prove that any outcome is not false. Indeed, paradoxically, the purpose of methods such as scenario planning is to establish a range of true and false scenarios, with the difference only becoming apparent over time. Additionally, relevant data cannot always be observed directly. In the case of this project, for example, it would have been necessary to log teachers' reaction to external professional stimuli longitudinally, in the past, present and future. And large-scale samples would be impractical in view of the amount of detailed work on the data required to achieve a useful research outcome.

Instead, futures research is left with the option of an interpretivist approach. The researcher must seek to interpret the responses of participants, as they are subjective beings who are reporting their views and beliefs. Arguably, more interesting to the futurist than any purely objective outcome is to establish whether different individuals are interpreting the world in different ways. It is possible in this way to start understanding hidden social processes, just as with studying pronoun use via linguistic analysis techniques. It is recognised that personal objectivity is difficult because of the researcher's own personal values which are brought to the research.

From the point of view of research design, recognition of subjectivity is useful in informing a suitable research method. Non-empirical data can be collected, using tools such as semi-structured or unstructured interviews, focus groups, and open-ended questionnaires. This will allow a range of qualitative data to be collected which will be useful in discovering emic views (Guba and Lincoln, 1994). Admittedly, the possibility for truth claims is likely to be limited. However, care in constructing the research design allows for appropriate validity, and rigour in implementation implies reliability. The ultimate goal is to view the data as Guba and Lincoln's 'transformative intellectual' achieving a vicarious understanding of the beliefs and experience of the research participants. Indeed, the case of scenario planning is a particularly interesting one, as the research participants are required to have ownership of the outcome, and all become transformative intellectuals in this sense.

The earlier example of scenario planning, based on the oil industry, is just one case study of this technique. Since Royal Dutch Shell introduced it in the 1960s it has become a well-established business tool. But not all futures research works along similar lines. Table 7.1 demonstrates some of the current range of practices and their inter-relationships.

Hard Futures Research	Medium Futures Research	Soft Futures Research
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Economic and technological prediction ■ Statistical prediction ■ Systems analysis ■ Management science 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Scenario writing ■ Surveys ■ Critiques 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Speculative writing ■ Social networking ■ New social movements ■ Alternative lifestyles
<p>Example used for: Government policy formation Private and public sector organisational planning.</p>	<p>Example used for: Academic analysis Market research</p>	<p>Example used for: Religious and spiritual movements</p>

This requires further explanation. The terminology is taken from the literature. 'Hard' futures research refers to the large-scale quantitative studies undertaken by governments and large public and private sector organisations: in essence, quasi-positivist studies. The school workforce data published annually by the UK government, and referred to earlier, belongs in this category. Such studies align to the predict and control model outlined earlier. Such research is characterised by extremely large sample sizes and comprises empirically-based forecasting and prediction. Further examples might range from weather forecasts to predictions of the number of primary school places needed in five years' time. Lyotard is sceptical about such studies:

The decision makers, however, attempt to manage these clouds of sociality according to input/output matrices, following a logic which implies that their elements are commensurable and that the whole is determinable. They allocate our lives for the growth of power. In matters of social justice and of scientific truth alike, the legitimation of that power is based on its optimizing the system's performance – efficiency. (Lyotard, 1994, p. 27)

'Medium' futures research uses some quantitative data but it also pays greater attention to human influence on the external environment and to attitudinal issues. Here we see a postmodern slant to such research – epistemological arguments regarding the nature of knowledge are abandoned, along with debates concerning the conflict between agency and structure and between materialism and idealism.¹ Hence surveys and scenario writing appear in this category. An assumption of insight is inherent in this model of research, but it still attempts to reference itself externally in a scholarly or professional manner. There appears to be a current trend towards enquiry of this type. The desire is to look at the challenges society faces, such as social or environmental problems, and try to think round the problem in order to address these issues – in other words, to assess the practical purpose of knowledge and the situational impact of the research outcomes.

At the other extreme, we find 'soft' futures research, and the soothsayers. This category embraces various spiritual and religious movements. The primary aim is to address the human need for order, prediction and stability in a more intuitive, subjectively-based manner than in the other two categories. Here we might locate popular futures research which seeks to map out trends for the future (Slaughter, 2002). An example of this is Toffler's *Future Shock* (1970) which paints an alarming picture of societal dysfunction in the

future. These writings are often based on assumptions of capitalist growth and a Western consumerist culture. They can be sensationalist, as in the Toffler example or the work of Handy (1984, 1989, 1994, 1995), Mercer (1998) and Naisbitt (1982). Futures research of this kind is characterised by being media-friendly, with few scholarly or statistical references. Arguably, it overlaps into the area of market research, with its emphasis on guessing future trends. Naisbitt's title *Megatrends* exemplifies this. The research is not replicable nor totally representative, being unscientific by any standards. It is therefore wholly inappropriate for traditional academic enquiry. Lyotard (1994, p. 27) would be critical of this approach because of its tendency towards 'metanarratives', which he describes as 'obsolescent'.

During the last five years the need for more critical futures studies has been generally felt (Inayatullah 1998, 2002; Slaughter, 1998, 2002; Fricker 2000), particularly since existing futures methods have been dominated by a US market-based ideology. Interestingly, a great deal of new thinking about the direction of futures research is coming out of work carried out in Australia (Inayatullah; Slaughter; Fricker; Hutchinson, *op.cit.*). Some areas of Australia have recently introduced a futures content to their standardised curricula for schools.

The new futures methodology has grown out of a desire to move debate beyond the superficial and obvious. This allows us to view the data in a new way, taking into account the social environments of the researcher as well as the subject. In the case of educational research, this is very important. Deciding who is privileged in any construction of knowledge allows us to see who is making assumptions about right and wrong. The desire for power legitimisation by authorities means that the use of large-scale quantitative data is used with increasing frequency, which makes this complementary approach all the more needed. There can be other, similar types of privilege as well, which indicate that an alternative approach is desirable. For example, if we take the case of New Labour's view of the future, discussed in Chapter 3, we see that forward-looking, flexible citizens are regarded as good, whereas backward-looking, inflexible individuals are bad. This is a useful categorisation for politicians. Good citizens are seen to be those who appear to understand why government policy is necessary and who respond by changing themselves in order to implement it, either directly or indirectly. Bad individuals are silenced within this discourse, however. Playing with ideas, we might decide that examples of the silenced

might vary. A list of categories might start with the anti-inclusives – those who believe in segregated education (perhaps on grounds of religion or gender). Next might be the homeschoolers – those who believe in the rights of parents to bring up their children as they see fit, with no reference to government. The professoriat might also be on the list – those who believe that teachers should not be obliged to have a pastoral role. Also the anti-managerialists – those who see no reason for a management-based model of education in schools, such as advocates for Steiner education. Finally, we might see the *laissez-faires* – those who see no reason for using a standardised curriculum, with its limited range of subjects and artificial divisions between the arts, sciences and humanities.

We see that, in education, various assumptions of the future are made preferable by governments. For example, the introduction of a standardised national curriculum assumes that all pupils will have similar objectives in life and will need to learn the same subjects. The tightly-controlled, hierarchical structure of the school appears to offer an induction into a tightly controlled, hierarchical workplace culture for its pupils, on the assumption that all pupils need to become socialised as employees – an assumption not shared by the full range of public opinion. Harking back to Lyotard, these governmental grand narratives of post-1979 social reforms give a false image of a considered, coherent whole rather than of reforms grounded in the cultural framework of the time (Barberis, 1995).

The Education Futures study examined the social world of the teacher through the eyes of education professionals looking towards the future. The researcher, in turn, sought to interpret the data in a way that is faithful to the original aims and intentions of the research participants, whilst at the same time being critically reflective. This relatively new methodological position for futures research has become increasingly common over a decade or so (Inayatullah, 2001). It rejects the aim of social prediction that is carried out by gathering quasi-empirical data about the possibilities of future events and formulating the findings into trends². Such an approach denies the possibility that the ideas being put forward by research participants are incomplete or influenced by the research process. As Geertz states:

We are in sum incomplete or unfinished animals who complete or finish ourselves through culture ... Our ideas, our values, our acts, even our emotions, are, like our nervous system itself, cultural products – products manufactured, indeed, out of tendencies, capacities and dispositions with which we were born, but manufactured nevertheless. (Geertz, 1973, pp.49-50)

Background to causal layered analysis

The conceptual framework for this method of analysis is grounded in post structuralism. It rejects the idea that there are definite underlying structures to explain the human condition and assumes that it is impossible to step outside the discourse in order to find objectivity. This allows the ambiguous nature of a situation to be expressed. A practical example might be asking: 'If learning is a human condition, is teaching one as well?' or 'Why has education been nominated as a problem area, and who stands to gain from this?' It is through asking such questions that we can challenge contradictions and prejudice within our own view of the world, as well as within a societal worldview.

As the future is unclear and ambiguous, causal layered analysis allows us to demonstrate humility in relation to our natural human desire to search for truth. It allows us to illuminate the different discourses that dominate, and to show how they interrelate. We can thus create and shape different explanations and insights, without placing them in a hierarchy. This multiplicity of understanding might seem uncomfortable at first, but this is the same kind of discomfort that characterises the responses of the research participants in this project. By accepting complexity, we are better able to understand their experiences.

In turn, causal layered analysis provides us with a disciplined framework for working with different hidden meanings and ideologies. It allows us to move continually up and down different levels, asking similar questions, but receiving different answers. This allows us to go beyond an initial data analysis, towards a deeper understanding of issues that relate to the research in hand. Causal layered analysis does not attempt to answer problems, and therefore is not appropriate for all areas of social research, or all topics. However, as a third analysis process, it allows us to contextualise the problem of teacher professionalism in a new way, giving new insight. It adds to a slowly growing number of case studies in the field, in the same way that symbolic interactionists tried to build up the number of case studies in the 1960s and 1970s using their systems of analysis. (Woods, 1979)

Inayatullah (1998) describes this technique as being well situated in critical futures research. He goes on to state:

This tradition is less concerned with disinterest, as in the empirical, or with creating mutual understanding, as in the interpretive, but with creating distance from current categories. This distance allows us to see current social practices as fragile, as particular, and not as universal categories of thought. (Inayatullah, 1998, p.816)

Causal layered analysis was not the only possibility for this type of analysis; a grounded theory approach might have been appropriate. Theory would then have been discovered, developed and refined from the data collection and analysis process. This fits one of the stated aims of the research, in that it rejects the positivist method of social science research already discussed, in which a hypothesis is put forward to be tested.

Deconstructing this research, however, we see a process more akin to that described by Peirce (1965), in which three distinct processes generate theory: deductive, inductive, and abductive. The application of these processes sequentially is important in the intellectual structure of this study. According to Peirce, deductive theories are formed from general rules – in this case the pre-existing theoretical basis underpinning the research. Inductive theories are formed from systematic empirical data collection – in this case the fieldwork phase of the project, and the subsequent data analysis. Finally, abductive theories provide an imaginative leap to new theories, without necessarily demonstrating the required steps. These theories can be tested later against deductive logic and inductive empirical comparisons, if required.

Using causal layered analysis in this research gives a formal framework within which abductive leaps of this type can be made, without compromising the overall integrity of the data collection and analysis process. The method has its own limitations as, being highly speculative, it is difficult to make claims of accuracy or reliability. But it has the potential to make a stimulating contribution to the ongoing debate surrounding teachers' professional identities at the beginning of the 21st century, and can be further tested by later, larger-scale, empirically based studies.

Academic aspects of causal layered analysis

Causal layered analysis was pioneered in the 1990s by Inayatullah in Australia (Inayatullah, 1998, Slaughter, 2002). Inayatullah saw Futures Studies as fundamentally divided into three areas: empirical, interpretative and critical. Each area made different assumptions about the nature of reality, truth, society and the role of the research subject. Inayatullah sought to move beyond this by developing a method of analysis that incorporated all three. This rejected the idea that the researcher had to be disinterested, or that research had to be empirically based. Equally, it did not assume that the sole purpose of research should necessarily be the creation of

mutual understanding. Instead, using this approach allows the researcher to critique the dominant Western culture that appears to characterise much contemporary management science research.

Consequently, this method has been described as going ‘beyond the mundane’ (Slaughter, 2002), allowing Futures research to become both broader and deeper. Just as it is a reaction against the ready acceptance of researchers to frame their work in terms of a dominant Western culture, it is also a reaction against popular futurism, which is often presented as research. This research tends to paint the same utopian or dystopian vision of the future repeatedly, in different ways. Slaughter describes this as the ‘Nostradamus industry’, and examples might include Toffler’s *Future Shock* and Naisbitt’s *Megatrends*. Both were felt to provide an unnecessarily simplistic, sensationalist approach to the subject matter, based on little more than anecdotal data.

Toffler described a world in which a sense of community was gradually eroded, as people increasingly become geographically mobile. The focus of society became work and the economy, which undermined the importance of human relationships. Toffler regarded this as a fundamental change in the nature of civilisation, and articulated the dread many felt about the encroachment of technological development. Thus his work represents a dystopian vision of the future.

Naisbitt, on the other hand, coined the term ‘megatrend’ to identify socially significant movements that grow from the ground upwards, and result in societal change. After analysing substantial numbers of newspaper reports over a twelve-year period, Naisbitt suggested ten likely projections of the future. These included the global economy, a renaissance in the arts, the emergence of free-market socialism, global lifestyles and cultural nationalism, the privatisation of the welfare state, the rise of the Pacific Rim, women in leadership, the age of biology, the religious revival and the triumph of individualism. Some of his predictions proved accurate and some less so – for example, that there would be greater use of hand-written notes as the desire for human contact grew. With hindsight we see that many of his projections proved insightful. Naisbitt’s work is situated somewhere between the utopian and dystopian positions, but has great popular appeal. It could not be regarded as particularly scholarly.

Consequently it seems even more important to seek new methods of analysing data at different levels with a view to creating an understanding of the future but without necessarily only striving to make

definitive predictions or projections, to the exclusion of everything else. Having three methods of data analysis allows us to move beyond a conventional reading of the data, whilst working within a structured framework that is transparent and reliable.

Assumptions behind the use of the method

It is important to address the assumptions behind the use of causal layered analysis, as this is a new method that is unfamiliar beyond a still small group of users.

- Empiricism is considered to be of limited value, because it promotes quantitative approaches above qualitative ones. This prevents exploration of different issues that might be difficult to quantify in any useful sense.
- Critiques of discourse or societal worldviews are by their nature tainted by the discourse or worldviews of the person undertaking the critique. They cannot be impartial.
- Truth is relative and varies according to the beholder. It is possible to have several concurrent truths. This makes it possible to see the consensus and conflict between different situations.
- The Western worldview tends to dominate social science research and, most particularly, futures research. This comes from the idea that historically, much social science research has originated in the United States. A capitalist philosophy prevails there and, until recently, few alternative viewpoints were accorded the same value. This does not mean that they have no value.
- There can be no definitive answer to a research problem. The aim is to explore a range of different situations and issues, rather than make a conclusive decision about the solution to a problem.
- The aim of research is greater understanding, rather than mutual understanding. In particular, this assumption rejects grounded theory, which argues the need for research to grow out of the views and responses of the research subject.
- Every situation or dilemma is thought to have a social cause.
- The fact that this method is new and relatively untested should not preclude its use, particularly in cases where alternative analysis methods are also being employed.

How the method was adapted for this research

Causal layered analysis is often used in a group situation, whereby different scenarios are created from the collective knowledge and ideas of several individuals coming together especially for the purpose. But there is no reason why it cannot be used in this context as well. Fricker (2000) and Inayatullah (1998, 2002) have both used the method to theorise social situations.

Causal layered analysis has four analytical levels, each of which relates to this research:

- Litany
- Social causes
- Discourse/worldview
- Metaphor/myth.

Litany

This is the initial level often employed in popular futures work. It lends itself to presentation by the mass media and it can be categorised into simple trends. The results can be fairly polarised. Either there is a dystopian reaction, which manifests itself as a sense of helplessness or disempowerment, or alternatively there is a utopian reaction, which sees the future as bright, cheerful and optimistic. Toffler (1970) and Naisbitt (1982) are both examples of this approach, which has great popular appeal.

For the purposes of this research, issues and problems relating to teacher identity are articulated so as to provide an initial framework for more detailed analysis.

Social causes

This level attempts to find a sociological explanation for the issue under observation. It might include examining economic, cultural, political and historical factors. There is some interpretation of quantitative data where appropriate. Many think-tanks adopt this kind of approach to their work. There is often a particular emphasis on the interaction between the state and the individual. Johnson and Hallgarten (2002) produced a very interesting example of this, in *From Victims of Change to Agents of Change: the future of the teaching profession*. Here, different specialists were asked to review the field and invited to attempt to come up with suggestions for improving Government policy in relation to recruitment and retention within the teaching profession.

In this part of the analysis, there will be an initial probing of the issues and problems, but whilst remaining within the existing system of social organisation. In other words, it will be undertaken as an educational researcher, probing the education system. Economic, cultural and historical factors will be taken into account to allow suggestions and solutions to be put forward, which conform to the existing worldview of education, namely, that education is important and an end in itself.

Discourse/worldview

This is a deeper level that examines structure and the discourse or worldview that endorses it. It is necessary to determine deeper social, cultural and linguistic structures that are independent of individuals. This is characteristic of Bernstein in his examination of pedagogy, symbolic control and identity. Bernstein classifies and codifies different devices used in education to control education, for example how pupils are grouped into set age cohorts for the purposes of schooling, regardless of their intrinsic academic abilities. Bernstein describes this use of age stages as ‘wholly imaginary and arbitrary’ (2000, p.35). It is possible to expand on Bernstein for a wider understanding of the discourse underpinning the education system as a whole. Grouping pupils into age-based cohorts, and using this to inform expectations of progress, has more to do with the way the young are perceived in relation to teachers and institutions than with cognitive development. The underlying discourse is that youth needs to be grouped thus, spatially dislocated from the outside world, as a means of achieving control over a group that is potentially challenging to adults.

This part of the analysis will challenge the worldview of the social organisation that created the social problem. It aims to challenge the assumptions, contradictions and prejudices that inform this worldview. It looks for factors rather than actors.

Metaphor/Myth

The essence of the researcher’s beliefs is challenged by providing a range of unsubstantiated alternative scenarios and sets of reasons behind different social dilemmas. Going beyond any conventional patterns of academic analysis, it can on first encounter feel uncomfortable to the researcher, and the reader. However, there are precedents within educational research. Waller (1932) explores anecdotal evidence to create his *Sociology of Teaching*, which is widely

recognised as being a seminal work with enduring characteristics. His research is essentially literary in fashion, rather than empirical. Waller makes claims that, upon first reading, seem unlikely and at times outrageous, such as arguing that some teachers need psychiatric help. But later research to do with teachers' professional life cycles has revealed that statistically this is true, especially among the over-45s (Bowers, 2002). It seems fitting that research such as this should take this tradition into account, when seeking to explore the changing nature of teacher identity.

This will therefore be a fluid, literary overview of the social dilemma, evoking emotive language that draws on the 'heart rather than the head' (Fricker, 2000). In this sense, it is the least scholarly part of the research, which makes such analysis a very brave leap. But it remains faithful to the aims of Waller (1937), in moving away from an empirical basis for research and uncompromisingly towards a human understanding of the social problem. Unless academic researchers move beyond existing methodologies towards new ways of generating knowledge, there can be no innovation in understanding. Doing so may involve risk, but if this risk is tempered with respect for earlier traditions, it is worth taking. As Ezzy writes:

Qualitative researchers should aim for a balance between systematic observation, unsystematic observation, and metaphor. As with Goffman's research, the correct mixture of these methods leads to research that is both evocative, in the sense that it produces new insights, and convincing, because it rests on systematic research. (Ezzy, 2002, p. 109)

Using terminology from the literature, this final analysis starts by examining the litany of the problems surrounding teacher professionalism in the contemporary knowledge economy. It then addresses a range of social issues that relate to these problems. This is followed by an examination of the discourse or worldview, which will allow us to understand the wider perspective within which the problem has occurred. Finally, the analysis examines the metaphor, otherwise known as the myth. This final investigation seeks to understand the nature of social order in Western society, and how this relates to the professional identity of teachers.

LITANY

The question of teacher identity in the UK is of great concern to many interested parties, such as parents, government, business and industry.

Traditionally, teachers were regarded as being a special group of individuals, marked out as having a vocation or calling to teach. As Bernstein (2000) explained, this was a kind of true professionalism resulting from long-term habituation into the ways of the profession. It came with its own inner guarantees of quality and integrity: teachers liked to think of themselves as being dedicated and hard-working, taking pride in their craft.

However this is not the full picture. In the past, teachers were viewed as leaders within society and consequently accorded respect. The apotheosis of teacher professionalism in the UK was probably around the time of the Plowden report in the mid-1960s. There was little accountability, either within or outside the profession. Rates of pay were relatively low, but this seldom seemed to cause concern except when salaries fell badly behind other rates of pay in the public sector. Teachers eventually received appropriate pay awards to compensate, so the profession remained attractive to new entrants.

After the 1988 Education Act, this situation appeared to change. Teachers were required to be increasingly accountable to external bodies, such as the Government. The amount of centralised Government control of education also increased rapidly. Instead of being respected within society, teachers internationally began to feel that the status of their profession was in decline (Education International, 2004).

This shift in teacher identity led to the profession becoming less attractive to new entrants, as many of the interview and survey responses show. We are left with a recruitment and retention crisis in teaching, with many teachers citing work overload, poor pay, lack of respect, poor discipline and having to teach outside their subject as reasons for leaving the profession (Smithers and Robinson, 2003). This has serious consequences for economic growth in the UK. Without a highly skilled workforce, it will be difficult for the UK to compete in a global market-place.

SOCIAL CAUSES

If we look at the key drivers for change discussed in Chapter 5, we see a range of issues that appear to explain the changes taking place in terms of teacher identity.

Increasing centralisation of control has increased emphasis on standardised curricula and delivery methods. This is reinforced by centralised inspection procedures. Such measures cause teachers to lose professional autonomy. Rapid developments in technology

have facilitated the growth of an audit culture, in which significant amounts of quantitative data can be rapidly processed. Now that the means exists to do such processing, the temptation is for Government to require teachers to collect and forward large amounts of quantitative data on a continuing basis. An example of this is the requirement for children to take Standard Assessment Tests, from which school league tables are produced. This auditing removes formal pupil assessment from the domain of the teacher, placing it instead with central Government. Consequently the research participants frequently referred to external quality control mechanisms, and at times it permeated almost every comment that they made.

From the interview and survey transcripts, it seems as though teachers generally appear to consider that the proportion of GDP (Gross Domestic Product) allocated to education funding is inadequate, and that this situation will continue for the foreseeable future. This is demoralising for the profession as a whole. Yet business and industry have a vested interest in manipulating the curriculum for their own ends, which is understandably resented by the teaching profession. Teachers in this study tended to see the role of education as essentially holistic, aiming to develop pupils as a whole. Any benefits to the economy or to business were seen as secondary; they did not view their role as solely preparing future employees for the workforce.

Additionally, the nature of schools as institutions is currently in a state of change, and the preferred outcome has not yet been determined. Despite some recent efforts on the part of the General Teaching Council, the profession has done little to influence social developments that will directly affect its day to day activities, such as lifelong learning, remote or distance learning, the future pastoral support needs of pupils, and the relationship between pupils, institutions and parents. This lack of engagement with change suggests a significant degree of disempowerment on the part of education professionals.

DISCOURSE/WORLDVIEW

There has been a fundamental shift in social relations for the teaching profession. Much of this hinges around the idea of vocation. Historically, vocation has religious origins, and is related to the notion that knowledge is sacred and belongs to the knower (Bernstein, 2000.). Thus the act of becoming a teacher used to involve adopting a total personality type, or *habitus*, over time, of which a sense of

vocation was an essential part. Consequently, being a teacher came with intrinsic guarantees of quality, supported by a valuable body of professional knowledge, and this ensured that teachers were accorded respect. This allowed them considerable professional autonomy which, in theory, led to job satisfaction.

The rapid expansion of education in the nineteenth century meant that schools, like prisons, adopted many of the social theories and practices of the era, and this can still be seen today. Control over time and space were distinctive features of such an environment, as is surveillance of the inmates, restriction of movement, and control over choice of activity. Additionally, schools still work to a quasi-agricultural timetable, with peaks and troughs of activity that do little to promote or consolidate effective learning (UCET, 2002). Schools have been slow to change such practices, so were ill-equipped to challenge recent criticisms about their value to a wider society.

In the 1980s, under a Conservative government, there was a political shift to a New Right economic rationalism in the UK, as in other countries (Barton *et al*, 1994, p.532). This informed the 1988 Education Reform Act. Education was considered to have an essentially utilitarian function, aimed at preparing future workers for life as employees within an economically-based society. This rather narrow view of human endeavour was based on the notion that economic behaviour is innate, and that humans are rational actors within this system (Collin and Young, 2000).

This interpretation of the role of teaching and learning within society has more serious consequences for the profession as a whole. From a utilitarian point of view, teachers were previously in the business of exchanging their insight and professional skills in return for financial reward and a certain position of respect within society: their value in exchange (Mill, 1984). But after 1988, teaching as a profession suddenly seemed to be devalued. Salaries fell behind other areas of the public sector. There was a loss of professional autonomy after the introduction of the National Curriculum and Ofsted inspections. Teachers were openly criticised and accused of being inadequate. Unsurprisingly, this made the profession considerably less attractive to new entrants, sowing the seeds of the current recruitment and retention crisis. The rational economist discourse found it difficult to accommodate a profession that failed to subscribe to its values in every respect. By valuing vocation over economic return, the teaching profession was out of step with changes within society as a whole. This left it open to attack, as

teachers were challenged by parents and pupils who perceived themselves as customers of a public service as opposed to apprentices of a form of life (UCET, 2002). This may also explain why the research participants often painted a picture of a profession under siege from a hostile external environment.

METAPHOR/MYTH

One of the myths underpinning the above appears to be the expectation that children's learning can be managed and controlled by adults. This is a convenient position for society as a whole. It allows children and young people to be segregated geographically for long periods of time in school buildings. It removes children and young people from the workforce, theoretically allowing adults a higher likelihood of employment and a higher rate of pay. It offers free time to parents, by providing holding bays for the young whilst parents are out at work or engaged in domestic tasks. But the wider implications of continuing to structure education on this basis warrant examination.

The growth of technology has greatly added to the ways of providing education. From BBC schools' programmes on radio or television, to distance learning via the Internet, individuals can now access a vast range of educational opportunities. Outside school, the young enjoy new ways of communicating with friends via email, chat rooms, or by text messaging on mobile telephones, often leaving the older generations behind. These are indeed the 'retrospective identities' Bernstein described (Bernstein, 2000). Though adults dabble with these technologies, they rarely feature at the core of the educational experience.

Many areas of young people's lives may now be beyond the reach of adults. The scope for influencing children's behaviour or learning is shrinking rapidly. The new young citizens are rapidly becoming autodidacts, comfortable to navigate the educational landscape on their own. They see little reason for involving adults in this journey.

The traditional school structure is based on a factory model for learning, adapted into a managerialist model. It uses complicated classification systems to organise and deliver learning. But the frustration of the research participants indicates that such classification systems are outgrowing their usefulness. They report a world in which pupils refuse to be compliant in the classroom. Parents make increasing demands of teachers. Business and industry seek to mould the pupil body into the service industry of tomorrow.

Government looks to education to remedy a failed free market ideology that puts economic profit as its bottom line. The research participants see little hope of these conflicting views ever being resolved.

We start to understand that the utter frustration evident in the responses of the research participants is simply a symptom of a wider malaise. In our risk-sensitised society, our young seem out of control (Griffin, 1993; Hall and Jefferson, 1975) and, as parents, teachers, employers or politicians, we fear the consequences. We give little attention to what younger generations are saying about the future, and limit their means of democratic expression to those most convenient to us as their elders (Hutchinson, 1999; Lee, 2004). In this changing situation, teachers are charged with educating the young, and preparing the society of tomorrow. Yet changes to teacher professionalism have meant that their ability to control the young is limited, leaving them with an apparently impossible task. Perhaps this is why they are claiming to feel under siege.

Conclusion

The use of a causal layered analysis allowed the data to be examined in a different and more challenging way. It enabled insight into the litany behind the problem of changing teacher identity, the social causes that might be attributed to this problem, the discourse underpinning assumptions regarding the problem and, finally, the myth surrounding its continuing existence. It made it clear that the problem is less to do with changing teacher identity, and more to do with the way education professionals are starting to feel besieged by different external bodies, who all believe they have a vested interest in influencing education. Education is not the only area that has become confused as a result of this free-for-all. Teachers are charged with creating future society by educating the young, but feel they have limited control over young people. This may explain why many teachers feel increasingly ambivalent about their role within society.

The prognosis for the teaching profession looks increasingly bleak in the light of ambivalence. How can teachers possibly resolve such tensions? How can they regain a sense of control and responsibility in the face of the political, economic and societal interference they perceive existing on so many levels? The final chapter explores the options open to teachers, if they are to regain control of their professional environments.

Notes

1 See Siedman (1994).

2 A good example of this type of work is Mercer (1998), in which 'empirical' data were collected from a thousand organisations over a period of five years.

8

Entente Cordiale?

This final chapter takes an overview of all the research in the book. It considers the strategies open to the teaching profession, arguing that the profession as a whole needs to ensure a greater degree of professional autonomy in future. It emphasises the need for every teacher to take personal responsibility for the well-being and status of their own profession, through their involvement in professional associations and through building solid and respected relationships with external agencies. If teachers are to lead the way in ensuring the welfare of future generations, this is imperative.

Basis for research

A popular American science fiction television programme, replete with aliens, secret agents and conspiracy theorists, began almost every episode with the words *The Truth is out there*. The positivist, hypothetico-deductive model of social science research, strongly prevalent until the 1960s, would arguably affirm this view. But contemporary social science research is far more complicated. Truth is no longer a finite, solitary entity, arrived at by scientific processes grounded in the traditions of the natural sciences. Truth is much more elusive. It is often argued that there are multiple truths, just as there are multiple voices. This book tries to be faithful to this idea, by offering a contribution to an ongoing conversation, rather than a definitive statement about the social reality of the research participants.

Whilst offering empirical research into the views of education professionals towards the future, the research upon which this book is based is grounded in the tradition of critical and epistemological Futures studies (Slaughter, 2002, p.494). The entire field of social relations is open to question. The book challenges presumptions that existing social institutions and classifications will continue. It aims to reveal the location of social interests and power, and to establish whether the locus of control has shifted. My research thus goes beyond simply developing recommendations for policy and practice. It seeks to challenge the existing order.

Theoretical aspects of the research

The Education Futures research asked three fundamental questions: how education professionals conceive the future, what this reveals about their professional identities, and how this relates to the knowledge economy. It also addressed a dual methodological challenge – to offer an empirical study, and to explore the shifting locus of control within education.

Initially, the research examined pre-existing theory to do with time, social identity and teacher professionalism. Time seemed in some circumstances to be acting as a metaphor for social order, as individuals positioned themselves at different points within it, depending upon how threatened they felt by the pace of societal change. I labelled these identities, according to terminology used by Bernstein, retrospective and prospective. The former used a type of grand narrative that harked back to a more stable, fruitful age, whereas the latter looked forward to a brave new world that would promote contemporary societal values of prosperity and equality of opportunity. In some cases, these identities were seen to exist concurrently within the same person or organisation, and even within the rhetoric of New Labour. Their rhetoric promoted an educational system based on neo-liberal, neo-conservative values, grounded in a chronologically fixed, subject-based model, as opposed to a child-centred, progressive model. It existed alongside references to youth as future, and a stated desire to develop educational provision to meet the demands of the new Millennium. Such contradiction was also evident within the everyday organisation of schools – for example the use of the age-related, cohort based system, which can make inadequate allowances for children ahead of time or behind time. The system exists side by side with a stated desire to provide differentiated education that meets the needs of individual children.

After considering the relationship between time, social order and identity, the book moved on to examine teachers' professional identity, and locate it within existing social and political structures. Many different categories of professional identity were evident in the literature, and it soon became apparent that teachers were constantly moving between the categories, according to their personal beliefs and values, their life stages and their need to earn a living. Even within the same person, different identities were adopted. For example, while teachers used an inclusive discourse to underpin their teaching, they nonetheless employed a market-based discourse when talking about other schools in the area. This was a good example of instrumental, pragmatic 'impression management', as Goffman would term it (1981).

Research method

Chapter 4 discussed the sampling of the research, as this was originally thought to be the key to carrying out the project successfully. But in the event, only two aspects of the sample appeared to be relevant for this purpose: whether participants were classroom-active or classroom-inactive, and their age. This seemed to influence their responses. The classroom-active participants tended to be more negative in relation to external influences, and the younger participants tended to be more critical generally. Other than that, no particular pattern to the responses was apparent, although this may have been due to the small size of the sample. A larger-scale research project would allow more detailed consideration of the effect of sample composition on research outcomes in this type of study. Currently the Teacher Status project funded by the ESRC (Economic and Social Research Council) is attempting to do exactly that, by studying 2500 teachers.

Two complementary methods of data collection were used: semi-structured interviews and an interactive survey, both based on similar questions. The interviews were used as a way of gaining access to more senior people involved in education, whereas the interactive survey was used as a way of enticing time-poor classroom teachers to take part in the research. The strategy worked reasonably well in this respect, although a future project might wish to address the issue of publicising interactive surveys more widely through organisations such as the teaching unions, professional associations and the teaching press, so as to increase the response rate and achieve more representative results. However, researchers must face the stark fact that teachers are complaining not only of

workload issues but also of being over-researched. So response rates are likely to become an increasing problem for those trying to talk to them.

Objectivity

My own professional experience played a part in the research outcome during the course of the interviews. As I am a former teacher and promised complete confidentiality, interviewees felt free to speak in a frank and forthright manner, using professional jargon and making assumptions about what I would understand. On several occasions, before the cassette tape was turned on, I was issued with an enthusiastic invitation to apply for work in a particular school or local authority, on the basis that they were desperate for good teachers. 'Are you sure we can't tempt you back into the classroom?' one participant asked. The interviewees clearly felt they had a sympathetic ear from the researcher.

Likewise, whilst I as a researcher tried to maintain objectivity, it is inevitable that elements of subjectivity crept into the interviews. Some of the more worrying comments related to many of my own experiences as a teacher. Try as I did, it was not always easy to keep these thoughts in check during the fieldwork and analysis processes.

Data analysis

Initially, the data was analysed using a key driver method familiar in Futures research. It soon became clear that the participants were conforming to different typologies of professionalism. There seemed to be a struggle going on. On the one hand, there was a desire to promote teaching as a profession in the classical sense, standing shoulder to shoulder with law and medicine, for example. On the other hand, teachers felt they should be working towards a model of professionalism that recognised the uniqueness of individuals, by reflecting constantly on their own professional lives, learning environments, the pupils in their care, the relationship between schools and other agencies (such as healthcare and social welfare) and life outside the school in a broader societal sense. A barrier to change seemed to be the rigid constraints on education put in place by successive governments, which the respondents felt stifled worthy efforts to do the best for pupils.

Unsurprisingly, this muddle was apparent in the way teachers spoke about their professional worlds. Just as retrospective and prospective identities could exist concurrently, these different professional

identities seemed to be evident within the same transcripts or survey responses, usually according to the subject discussed. Evidence of ‘commitment as caring’ was frequent, the participants expressing a sense of vocation in relation to their professional work. This manifested itself, for example, in references to teachers compensating for the shortcomings of poor parenting. References to ‘commitment as occupational competence’ were frequent, in which participants tried to appear keen to comply with directives on testing, inspection, target-setting and policy implementation. ‘Commitment as career-continuance’ was used to classify responses pertaining to recruitment and retention problems in teaching – ‘I don’t know why anyone would want to come into teaching’ was a typical comment.

Other professional types that appeared frequently included ‘classical’ professionalism (Goodson and Hargreaves, *op.cit*), in which teachers sought to seize power on grounds of possessing a closed body of professional knowledge. Such responses were common with reference to curriculum innovation and similar matters. There were some references to shared professional communities, and these could be classified as flexible or practical professionalism or perhaps democratic professionalism (Whitty, 2002) in which teachers build relationships with other educational stakeholders and movements. These classifications tended to occur when participants were reflecting on the possibilities offered by working in partnership with colleagues from other countries or from other non-education organisations, such as social services. This developed into extended professionalism, when they refer to issues such as the role of schools in developing citizenship. Some recognition of ‘complex professionalism’ appeared in relation to describing the tasks of teachers and how they were located within existing organisational structures.

Linguistic analysis

Because these different professional typologies appeared throughout the key driver analysis it was clear that the nature of reality, as conceived by the research participants, was constantly changing. The second reading of the data involved a type of linguistic analysis that examined the use of pronouns by the participants so as to establish how individuals positioned themselves in relation to this changing environment. To which aspects did they feel they related? From which did they distance themselves?

The linguistic analysis was designed to be applied quickly and simply to a research situation. I noted in the chapter on research

design that an entire research project could have been constructed around a detailed discourse analysis of the data. Indeed, a future secondary analysis of the data along such lines could be an interesting and highly fruitful project. In this instance, however, a straightforward technique was needed that could be replicated if necessary, but which didn't involve a great deal of subsidiary cross-referencing or overly detailed inferences about true meanings. To achieve this simplicity, the data were coded once again according to the key drivers categories, and then each comment was tabulated in relation to any pronouns attached and charted accordingly (see pages 126-127).

This process allowed more detailed exploration of the relationship between the research participants' experience and meaning. It soon became apparent that there were certain areas with which the participants identified closely, whereas there were others from which they seemed to feel relatively alienated. There was occasional evidence of a pronoun shift, from I to you, for example, but this was less frequent than the shifts in professional typology had been during the first reading of the data. Overall, references to issues such as teaching, learning, society and schools tended to appear in the first person. Strategy, funding and professionalism were generally referred to in the second person. But there was a large concentration of comments in the third person, including significant references to policy, pupils, testing, parents, inspection and technology. (Teachers also featured in this column, but this was slightly anomalous as the LEA directors used this form of speech more often, because they were no longer active in the classroom and were being asked questions about teachers). Did this mean that teachers were starting to feel under siege from the external influences on their professional practice? A third and final reading of the data seemed necessary to establish whether this was the case.

Causal layered analysis

Consequently, I decided that it would be useful for the voices of the participants to inform the research design. A causal layered analysis was carried out so as to reflect upon the possible implications of the findings so far, bearing in mind that it was impossible to go back to ask the original participants to comment on these conclusions. This technique was based on the idea that a form of synthesised knowledge could be created from the initial data readings that would show how the existing, empirically-derived knowledge fits into the broader issue of societal change.

Initially, the causal layered analysis stated that teachers had traditionally enjoyed high professional status and a high degree of task autonomy. This was linked with the idea that teaching was a vocational act requiring a long apprenticeship so that an individual could become a teacher by adopting a total personality type or *habitus*. And vocation provided a guarantee of quality and integrity. But this situation changed with the 1988 Education Reform Act. Suddenly teachers were required to be accountable to multiple external influences. A rhetoric of economic return superseded the rhetoric of vocation, and teaching appeared out of step with the current social climate. The reaction of the profession to this was to feel under siege from external influences.

So far, the findings from the causal layered analysis seemed unsurprising, but I thought it necessary to extend the conceptualisation of the problem in order to establish its location within a wider societal context. Delving deeper revealed a range of issues that related to current views of the future held by education professionals. The data analysis shows that many of the participants spoke of the difficulties in controlling and supporting children, and about inadequate home situations. This suggests that a range of problems might well be embedded within the contemporary relationship between adults and children, or in adult conceptions of childhood. Geographical segregation of the young during the working day appeared to be contributing to this problem, as teachers and pupils were obliged to inhabit the same social and institutional space even though technological change had influenced the ability of children and young people to explore different ways of knowing and gathering knowledge on their own. This could on occasion make children resistant to the ministrations of their teachers, whom they sometimes saw as behind the times.

Underpinning these changes was a major societal shift. Previously, vocation was regarded as sacred and essential to the role of the teacher. Now however, there seems to be a more instrumental, utilitarian approach to education generally. This, along with the difficulties of relating to contemporary youth, and the obligation to be constantly accountable to multiple external influences on an almost daily basis, might be the root of the problem. Teaching seemed to be becoming an almost impossible task, and teachers were consequently feeling ambivalent about their role in society.

Summary

I argued earlier that social order is reflected in the concept of time. If so, the observations made by education professionals in the course of this research are worthy of serious attention. When asked to reflect on the future, many of their comments reflected the confused, shifting, unsettled environment within which they are expected to work. This thinking seems to represent the notion of living in Lévi-Strauss's (1966) hot chronology, which seems eventful and unstable, with periods of rapid, unpredictable change.

The tendency to view time in this way is not confined to education professionals. Contemporary government education policy is peppered with references to time. Citizens are urged to remodel their identities continually to fit a supposed new era of rapid change, through lifelong learning and workplace training. The implications for teachers are serious: if they are required to move towards a flexible professional model, promoted by the UK government¹, they will lose more and more professional autonomy. Eventually this will threaten their ability to trust their own professional judgement, so undermining their professional identities.

To evaluate the seriousness of this claim, consider what it means to be a teacher in the early 21st century. To date, one orthodoxy in education that appears unchallenged is that a teacher has a calling or vocation to teach. Since the 1988 Education Reform Act, successive Governments have increasingly intervened in education. Recruitment and retention policies are all too often developed that make assumptions about what it means to be a teacher without taking account of the considerable range of existing professional identities. Without a better understanding of the personal and professional motivations of teachers, it is hard to see how effective education policies can be developed.

Consequently things look dark. Perhaps the most positive thing that can be said is that teaching is in a period of transition. In the aftermath of the 1988 Act an ideal type of professional is emerging, as far as the Government is concerned. This new breed of teacher represents the post-industrial age, so is grounded in the ideology of the free market economy. Such an employee is supposedly infinitely retrainable, responding immediately to direction from the Government. Although it might seem desirable for public servants to behave in this way, it is very dangerous for the teaching profession. Without teachers inwardly developing a deep-seated professional identity, or *habitus* (Bourdieu and Passeron, 1977), there is no

ultimate guarantee of quality and reliability in their work. The teachers become dependent upon Government maps to guide them in their work. Should these maps prove flawed, the teacher would be unable to spot the flaw, and the risk of failure in the role would be high. Yet centralised control is what the knowledge economy demands.

My research consequently aimed to evaluate the views of a range of education professionals about the future of their own industry, with a view to establishing the relationship between professional identity and the new, knowledge-based economy that features so prominently in documents such as the Dearing, Fryer and Kennedy reports. Some interesting issues arose. Classroom teachers were reluctant to participate in the research. 'We are far too busy with paperwork to get involved with questionnaires and interviews', came the refrain over and over again, even though the activities were presented to their headteachers as a useful and versatile staff training exercise, and had the support of each of the Local Education Authorities. Such reluctance was both frustrating and possibly symptomatic of changes taking place within the profession. Increased bureaucracy and teacher workloads appear to have left little time for reflection. But politicians and directors of education were unsurprisingly keen to share their strategic visions for the future and it was much easier to make appointments to interview them than the teachers.

Thus a revealing picture emerges of a divided profession. Those in the process of delivering education appear to be so preoccupied with the day-to-day management of their task that they are unable or unwilling to participate in wider education debates. They are, in effect, voiceless and disenfranchised. Those who map out strategy, on the other hand, appear to have the time and energy to dominate education debates, and steer policy accordingly. Instead of teaching being a self-governing profession, with its own standards and priorities, it now responds to Government direction. This is in stark contrast to the stated aims of organisations such as the General Teaching Council, which was set up with the explicit purpose of reinforcing teaching's status as an autonomous profession². The collective bargaining power of the teaching profession is similarly undermined by the existence of competing unions, predominantly the NUT³, the NASUWT⁴ and the ATL⁵, rather than one dominant organisation speaking for all teachers.

This does not augur well. The profession as a whole has been battling for recognition of its status for years, with associated improvements in pay and conditions. Yet the emergent ideal type described above seems to be more a technician than a skilled professional. Teachers do demonstrate some interest in future developments in the profession, as was shown in the reported key drivers or future trends, for example. But in the responses of the research participants, we see a profession under siege from a whole host of external organisations. Teachers are frantically fire-fighting in the face of rapid social and political change. They are required to be custodians of youth, educators of youth and accountable for youth, yet the very nature of youth itself seems to be changing. How far teachers will be able to rise to the challenge of managing such change remains to be seen. The removal of much of their professional autonomy has undermined them as educators and their pupils as learners.

If this is the nature of modernity, we need to ask hard questions about contemporary society. What should the relationship be between past, present and future generations? What is the role of moral agency in defining educational structures? How far should the state intervene in the education process? As Ulrich Beck states:

Schools, welfare institutions, law and order policies, and so on, extend problems and produce new ones rather than solving them ... This is a new form of constructed barbarism, that is, these are second-order problems. This barbarism is the paradoxical and scarcely understood sum of all attempts to prevent, found and construct a humane society. The expression 'barbarism' is apt in the sense that it designates the opposite of civilization and re-emerges at the culmination of civilization. (Beck, 1997, p.53)

If we are to achieve the 'humane' society to which Beck refers, it is our responsibility as parents, educators and leaders to act as role models to the young. This involves establishing a shared set of values that transcends any immediate national or personal economic imperative. It means collectively contributing to, and valuing, the nurturing of young people in ways other than the purely financial or instrumental. Only then will the task of our teachers become manageable. At the time of writing, a Steiner school in Herefordshire has applied to be a new City Academy and become part of the maintained sector, and a failing primary school in Manchester is running a Government-funded experimental Montessori programme. Are these early clues that the education landscape is about to change and become more humane?

In a move towards a more humane society, teachers need to take responsibility for certain issues that currently lie just beyond their grasp. Etzioni (1969) described teaching as a semi-profession, because it failed to meet conventional criteria for professionalism, such as monopoly, regulation, task autonomy, control over time and ability to set own fees. Teaching falls at many of these hurdles (Revell, 2005). Yet while this is the case now, it need not be so in future.

In order to reposition the teaching profession successfully, the balance between the profession and the outside world needs to be realigned. Teachers need to scrutinise their ways of working, and the education they deliver, as well as the ways in which they engage with external agencies, such as pupils, parents and politicians. But teachers must avoid trying to be all things to all people. They must bring to their work a new professional confidence, with intrinsic guarantees of quality and reliability. This will allow them to assert their relevant professional knowledge and understanding in the best interests of their pupils.

In practice, this is complicated. Teachers will have to walk a fine line between appearing to be self-interested, and serving the public. They will have to do something they will find immensely uncomfortable: to invoke the invisible hand and argue that the best result is achieved when each teacher does what is best for themselves as well as what is best for the group. In terms of professional identity classifications, this means that models such as *commitment as caring* gradually become less important, as visible exhaustion no longer acts as a measure for professional competence. On the other hand, models such as *commitment as career continuance* become more influential, as teachers seek to build sustainable and personally rewarding careers. This is not pure self-interest, however it appears – society will benefit from teachers adopting this approach.

Professional commitment of this kind opens up great possibilities in terms of developing teachers' roles to the benefit of both teachers and pupils. For example:

- More funding for Continuing Professional Development would allow more teachers to study for higher degrees in their specialist subject areas, particularly if this were rewarded with increases in salary. It would allow teachers to develop a sense of perspective beyond their immediate school. It would encourage them to engage with the intellectual aspects of their work, and to experience professional renewal. In turn, pupils are more

likely to benefit from thoughtful, highly skilled teachers with a vested interest in professional reflection.

- Redesigning the school day or school year away from the prevailing agricultural and religious model would allow teachers to sustain external relationships outside their school more effectively, and husband their energies better, so providing greater opportunities for outward reflection, and better liaison with outside agencies such as parents, professional associations, social services, local and national government, non-governmental organisations and healthcare services.
- Allowing teachers to have greater say in their working conditions and school environments would allow them to carry out their responsibilities in surroundings best suited to the pupils in their care. Teachers might, for example, assess local socio-economic conditions and decide to introduce alternative provision, such as the Montessori or Steiner approaches mentioned earlier, so as to improve learning outcomes.

By engaging more forcefully with their professional associations and teaching unions, teachers can take responsibility for remodelling their own profession to reflect their levels of vocation and commitment. Until teachers grasp the opportunity to attend professional association meetings, stand for election and use the democratic process to give themselves a voice, they can expect to people policy but not to influence it. Until genuinely democratic professional associations take responsibility for teacher training processes, vocation will continue to be poorly translated into a series of competences, delivered according to the Government policy imperatives of the day. Until teachers scrutinise their own practice as described here and question the teaching and learning environment around them, there can be no move towards an inclusive education community that adequately respects the role of young people within society or of those who care for them. Education needs to learn to value its human face over its organisational one, and teachers need to be at the vanguard.

Notes

1 See DfES (2002) pp.5,13,18,27

2 There are various references to this on the GTC's website, most notably the following:

Ten-point plan to address concerns over teacher shortages [online] Available at: [//www.gtce.org.uk/gtcinfo/ten%5Fpoint.asp](http://www.gtce.org.uk/gtcinfo/ten%5Fpoint.asp), accessed 3 October 2003

Transcript of the speech delivered by the Chair of the GTC, Lord David Puttnam, at the Secondary Heads' Association conference, March 2001 [online] Available at <http://www.gtce.org.uk/gtc/gtcinfo/features/feat59.asp>

Teacher Professionalism [online] Available at <http://www.gtce.org.uk/news/featuresDetail.asp?ezineld=72>

3 National Union of Teachers

4 National Association of Schoolmasters Union of Women Teachers

5 Association of Teachers and Lecturers

References

- Adam, B (1990) *Time and Social Theory* (Cambridge, Polity)
- Adam, B (1995) *Timewatch: The Social Analysis of Time* (Cambridge, Polity)
- Ainscow, M *et al* (1994) *Mapping Change in Schools: The Cambridge Manual of Research Techniques* (Cambridge, Cambridge Institute of Education)
- Alexander, J C (1995) *Fin de Siecle social theory: relativism, reduction and the problem of reason* (London, Verso)
- Aligica, P D (2003) 'Prediction, explanation and the epistemology of futures studies' in *Futures* Vol 35 No 10 Dec 2003 pp1027-1040
- Alheit, P (1996) 'From 'labour society' to 'learning society' in *Adults Learning* Vol 7 No 10, June 1996 pp 251-255
- Ayer, A J (1971) *Language, Truth and Logic* (Harmondsworth, Penguin)
- Ayer, A J (1974) *The Problem of Knowledge* (Harmondsworth, Pelican)
- Baker, C D and Johnson, G (1998) 'Interview Talk as Professional Practice' in *Language and Education* Vol 12 No 4 pp 229-242
- Barber, M (1996) *The Learning Game* (London, Gollancz)
- Barberis, P (1995) 'The Civil Service from Fulton to Next Steps and Beyond – Two Interpretations, Two Epistemologies' in *Public Policy and Administration Journal*, Vol 10 No 2, Summer 1995
- Barton, L *et al* (1994) 'Teacher Education and Teacher Professionalism in England: some emerging issues' in *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, Vol 15, No 4, pp 529-543
- Bayliss, V (1998) *Redefining Schooling – A Challenge to a Closed Society* (London, RSA)
- Bayliss, V (1998) *Redefining Work – An RSA Initiative* (London, RSA)
- Becher, T *et al* (1981) *Policies for Educational Accountability* (London, Heinemann)
- Beck, J (1999) 'Makeover or Takeover? The strange death of educational autonomy in neo-liberal England' in *British Journal of Sociology of Education* Vol. 20 No 2, June 1999
- Beck, J (2002) 'The Sacred and the Profane in Recent Struggles to Promote Official Pedagogic Identities' in *British Journal of Sociology of Education* Vol 23 No 4, Dec 2002

- Beck, P W (1982) 'Corporate Planning for an uncertain future' in *Long Range Planning* Vol 15 No 4 pp 12-21
- Beck, U (1997) *The Reinvention of Politics: Rethinking Modernity in the Social Order* (Cambridge, Polity)
- Bell, W and Mau, J (1971) *The Sociology of the Future: Theory, Cases and Annotated Bibliography*. (New York, Russell Sage Foundation)
- Berelson, B (1952) *Content Analysis in Communication Research* (New York, Hafner Press)
- Bernstein, B (1971) *Class, Codes and Control Vol 1* (London, Paladin)
- Bernstein, B (1996/2000) *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique* (London, Taylor and Francis)
- Bilton, T *et al* (2002) *Introductory Sociology* (Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan)
- Blacking, J (1973) *How Musical is Man* (Washington, University of Washington Press)
- Blass, E (2003) 'Researching the future: method or madness?' in *Futures* Vol 35 No 10 Dec 2003 pp 1041-1054
- Bottery, M (1998) *Professionals and Policy: Management Strategy in a competitive world* (London, Cassell)
- Bottery, M (1999) 'Education under the New Modernisers: an agenda for centralisation, illiberalism and inequality' in *Cambridge Journal of Education* Vol 29, Issue 1, pp103-120
- Bowers, T (2002) 'Over 45? Watch out for stress' in *The Times Educational Supplement*, 4.10.2002, pp26-27
- Bourdieu, P and Passeron, J-C (1977) *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture* (2nd edition) (London, Sage Publications)
- Bourdieu, P trans. Nice, R (2000) *Outline of a Theory of Practice* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)
- Brannen, J (2002) *The work-family lives of women: autonomy or illusion?* (Working paper, Gender Institute/ESRC 'Work, Time and Life in the New Economy' Seminar series, 25 Oct 2002)
- Brannen, J and Nilsen, A (2002) Young people's time perspectives: From youth to adulthood, *Sociology*, Vol 36, No 3 pp 513-537
- Byrne, A and MacLeod, A K (1997) 'Attributions for positive and negative future events in anxiety and depression' in *British Journal of Clinical Psychology*, Vol 36 pp 505-520
- CACE (1967) *Children and their Primary Schools* (the Plowden report) (London, HMSO)
- Casey, K and Apple, M W (1989) 'Gender and the conditions of teachers' work: the development of understanding in America' in Acker, S (Ed) *Teachers, Gender and Careers* (Lewes, Falmer Press)
- Castells, M (1996) *The Rise of the Network Society* (Oxford, Blackwell)
- Chatwin, B (2003) *Songlines* (London, Vintage)
- Clarke, J., Cochrane, A. and McLaughlin, E (Eds) (1994) *Managing Social Policy* (London, Sage)
- Clarke, J and Newman, J (1993) 'The right to manage: a second managerial revolution?' *Cultural Studies*, Vol 1 No 3 pp 427-441

REFERENCES

- Coffield, F (1997) 'Introduction and overview: attempts to reclaim the concept of the learning society', *Journal of Education Policy*, Vol 12, No 6, Nov-Dec 97, pp 449-455
- Cohn, M, Mehl, M and Pennebaker, J (2004) 'Linguistic Markers of Psychological Change surrounding September 11, 2001', *Psychological Science* Vol 15 No 10 pp 687-693
- Commons Hansard* Vol 254 Col 454
- Commons Hansard* Vol 326 Col 956
- Commons Hansard* Vol 327 Col 512
- Crowley, C, Harré, R and Tagg, C (2002) 'Qualitative research and computing: methodological issues and practices in using QSR Nvivo and NUD*ST', *International Journal of Social Research Methodology* Vol 5 No 3 pp 193-197
- Dalin, P and Rust, V D (1996) *Towards Schooling for the Twenty-First Century* (London, Cassell)
- Daley, J (2002) 'Centralised control blotted the education copybook', *The Daily Telegraph*, 24.10.2002
- Dator, J (2002) 'The future lies behind – Thirty years of teaching futures studies', Dator, J (Ed) *Advancing Futures*, pp 1-30 (Westport CT, Praeger)
- Day, C and Bakioğlu, A (1996) 'Development and Disenchantment in the Professional Lives of Headteachers', Goodson, I and Hargreaves, A (Eds) *Teachers' Professional Lives* (London, Falmer Press)
- DfEE (Department for Education and Employment) (1997) *Higher Education in the Learning Society/National Committee of Inquiry into Higher Education. Report of the National Committee.* (Dearing report) (London, NCIHE)
- DfEE (Department for Education and Employment) (1998) *The learning age: a renaissance for a new Britain: presented to Parliament by the Secretary of State for Education and Employment by command of Her Majesty, February 1998* (Fryer report) (London, HMSO)
- DfEE (Department for Education and Employment) (2000) *Statistics of Education* (London, HMSO)
- DfEE (Department for Education and Employment) (2002) *Time for Standards: Reforming the School Workforce* (London, HMSO)
- Drucker, P (1993) *Post-Capitalist Society* (Oxford, Butterworth-Heinemann)
- Durkheim, E (1957) *Professional Ethics and Civic Morals* (tr. Brookfield, C) (London, Routledge and Kegan Paul)
- Durkheim, E (1997) *The Division of Labour* (New York, Free Press)
- Edmunds, L F (1987) *Rudolf Steiner Education: The Waldorf School* (London, Rudolf Steiner Press)
- Education International (2004) *Quality Teachers for Quality Education* Press Release 4/2004, dated 21 September 2004 Accessed at <http://www.ei-ie.org>, 18 April 2005
- Edwards, D and Mercer, N (1987) *Common Knowledge* (London, Methuen)
- Edwards, L (2002) *How to Argue with an Economist* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)
- Elias, N (1991) *The Society of Individuals* (Oxford, Blackwell)
- Elias, N (1992) *Time: An Essay* (Oxford, Blackwell)

- Elster, J (1995) 'Rational Choice Theory' in Giddens, A (Ed) *The Polity Reader in Social Theory* (Cambridge, Polity)
- Englund, T (1996) 'Are Professional Teachers a Good Thing?' in Goodson, I and Hargreaves, A (Eds) *Teachers' Professional Lives* (London, Falmer Press)
- Eraut, M (1997) 'Perspectives of defining the "Learning Society"' in *Journal of Education Policy*, Vol 12, No 6, Nov-Dec 97, pp 551-558
- Erickson, F (2004) *Talk and Social Theory: Ecologies of Speaking and Listening in Everyday Life* (London, Blackwell)
- Etzioni, A (ed) (1969) *The Semi-Professions and their Organization* (New York, Free Press)
- Ezzy, D (2002) *Qualitative Analysis: Practice and Innovation* (London, Routledge)
- Fischer, P (1990) *Education 2000* (London, Cassell)
- Foddy, W (1993) *Constructing Questions for Interviews and Questionnaires* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)
- Fontana, A and Frey, J (1994) 'Interviewing – The Art of Science' from Denzin N and Lincoln Y (eds) *Handbook of Qualitative Research* (London, Sage)
- Foddy, W (1993) *Constructing Questions for Interviews and Questionnaires* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)
- Fox, I (1985) *Public Schools and Private Issues* (London, Macmillan)
- Fox, I (1986) 'The demands for a public school education: A crisis of confidence in comprehensive schooling' in Walford, G (Ed) *British Public Schools: Policy and Practice* (Lewes, Falmer Press)
- Fricke, A (2000) 'Poverty Amidst Plenty: a role for Causal Layered Analysis' (Proceedings of the DEVNET *Poverty, Prosperity and Progress Conference*, Wellington, Nov 2000)
- Friedson, E (1994) *Professionalism Reborn: Theory, Prophecy and Policy* (Chicago, University of Chicago Press)
- Furlong *et al* (2000) 'The National Grid for Learning: a curriculum without walls?' in *Cambridge Journal of Education*, Vol 30 No 1 Mar 2000
- Furlong *et al* (1997) Further Education Funding Council (FEFC) *Learning Works: Widening Participation in Further Education/Further Education Funding Council Widening Participation Committee; [chaired by] Helena Kennedy* (Coventry, FEFC)
- Gadamer, H-G (1986) 'Über die Planung der Zukunft' from Gadamer, H-G *Gesammelte Werke* (Band 2) (Tübingen, Mohr J C B)
- Gage, N (1989) 'The paradigm wars and their aftermath: An 'historical' sketch of research and teaching since 1989' in *Educational Research*, Vol 18 pp 4-10
- Geertz, C (1973) *The Interpretation of Cultures* (New York, Basic Books)
- Gellner, E (1992) *Postmodernism, Reason and Religion* (London, Routledge)
- Gerth H H and Wright Mills, C (1991) *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology* (London, Routledge)
- de Geus, A (1997) *The Living Company: Habits for Survival in a turbulent business environment* (Boston, Harvard University Press)
- Giddens, A (1991) *Modernity and Self-Identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age* (Cambridge, Polity)

REFERENCES

- Gidley, J (1998) 'Prospective youth vision through imaginative Education' in *Futures* Vol 30 No 5 pp 395-408
- Goffman, E (1971) *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life* (London, Pelican)
- Goffman, E (1981) *Forms of Talk* (Philadelphia, University of Philadelphia Press)
- Goldthorpe, J H *et al* (1968) *The Affluent Worker: Industrial Attitudes and Behaviour* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)
- Goodson, I and Hargreaves, A (Eds) (1996) *Teachers' Professional Lives* (London, Falmer Press)
- Grey, C (1997) 'Management as Technical Practice: Professionalisation or Responsibilization?', in *Systems Practice* Vol 10, No 4, pp 703-726.
- Griffin, C (1993) *Representations of Youth: the Study of Youth and Adolescence in Britain and America* (Cambridge, Polity Press)
- GTC (General Teaching Council for England (2004) Informing GTC Policy Strategy – NFER Mapping Work on the Future of Teaching and Learning (Paper Reference 12/03-04 Item 9) presented at GTC Council Meeting 27.01.04
- Guba, E S and Lincoln, Y S (1994) 'Competing paradigms in qualitative research' in Denzin, N K and Lincoln, Y S (Eds) *Handbook of Qualitative Research* (London, Sage)
- Hadow (1931) *Report of the Consultative Committee on the Primary School* (London, HMSO)
- Hall, S and Jefferson, T (Eds) (1975) *Resistance through Rituals: Youth Sub-Cultures in Post War Britain* (London, Hutchinson)
- Hammersley, M (1995) *The Politics of Social Research* (London, Sage)
- Handy, C (1984) *The Future of Work* (Oxford, Blackwell)
- Handy, C (1989) *The Age of Unreason* (London, Hutchison Business)
- Handy, C (1994) *The Empty Raincoat* (London, Hutchison Business)
- Handy, C (1995) *Beyond Certainty* (London, Hutchison Business)
- Handy, C and Aitken, R (1986) *Understanding Schools as Organizations* (Harmondsworth, Penguin)
- Haralambos, M with Heald, R (1990) *Sociology: Themes and Perspectives* (Slough, University Tutorial Press)
- Hargreaves, DH (1997) 'A Road to the Learning Society' in *School Leadership and Management*, Vol 17 No 1, pp 9-21
- Hargreaves, DH (1999) *Creative Professionalism: The Role of Teachers in a Knowledge Society* (London, Demos)
- Heap, J (1985) 'Discourse in the production of classroom knowledge: reading lessons' in *Curriculum Enquiry* Vol 15 no 3 pp 245-279
- van der Heijden, K (1997) *Scenarios: The Art of Strategic Conversation* (Chichester, Wiley)
- Hicks, D and Holden, C (1995) *Visions of the Future* (Stoke-on-Trent, Trentham Books)
- Hursh, D (2004) *Neo-Liberalism, markets and accountability: transforming education and undermining democracy in the United States and England* (Paper presented at the British Educational Research Association conference, Sept 2004)
- Hutchinson, F P (1996) *Educating Beyond Violent Futures* (London, Routledge)

- Hutchinson, F P (1999) *Taking Our Children and Future Generations Seriously: Some Australian Views of Education and the Future* (University of York Educational Studies Seminar Series, June 1999)
- Illich, I (1973) *Deschooling Society* (Harmondsworth, Penguin)
- Inayatullah, S (1998) 'Causal Layered Analysis: Poststructuralism as method' in *Futures*, Vol 30, No 8, pp 815-829
- Inayatullah, S (2002) 'Layered methodology: meanings, epistemes and the politics of knowledge' in *Futures*, Vol 34 No 6 pp 479-491
- Jameson, F (1988) *Nationalism, colonialism and literature: modernism and Imperialism* (Derry, Field Day Company)
- Jeffrey, B and Woods, P (1996) 'Feeling Deprofessionalised: the social construction of emotions during an Ofsted inspection' in *Cambridge Journal of Education* Vol 26 No 3
- Jenkins, R (2002) *Foundations of Sociology* (London, Palgrave Macmillan)
- Jipson, J and Paley, N (1997) *Daredevil Research – Recreating Analytic Practice* (New York, Peter Lang)
- Johnson, M and Hallgarten, J (2002) *From Victims of Change to Agents of Change: the future of the teaching profession*. (London, Institute of Public Policy Research)
- Johnson, T (1972) *Professions and Power* (London, Macmillan)
- Kaldour, N (1982) *The Scourge of Monetarism* (Oxford, Oxford University Press)
- Keddie, N (1971) 'Classroom Knowledge' in Young, M F D (Ed): *Knowledge and Control* (London, Collier Macmillan)
- Keep, E (1997) 'There's no such thing as society ...' Some problems with an individual approach to creating a learning society.' In *Journal of Education Policy*, Vol 12, No 6, Nov-Dec 97, pp 457-471
- Kelchtermans, G and Vandenberghe, R (1994) 'Teachers' professional development: a biographical perspective' in *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, Vol 26, No 1, pp 45-62
- Kogan, M (1989) 'Normative models of accountability' in Glatter, R *et al* (Eds) *Understanding School Management* (Milton Keynes, Open University)
- Lacey, C (1977) *The Socialization of Teachers* (London, Methuen)
- Larson, M (1977) *The Rise of Professionalism: A Sociological Analysis* (Berkeley, University of California Press)
- Lawrence, D (1993) 'The Disestablishment of Teacher Careers' in *Oxford Review of Education*, Vol 19 No 3, pp 337-353
- Leaton Gray, S (2004) *Mapping Professional Conceptions of Learning Futures: Teachers and their Professional Identities in the Knowledge Economy* (University of Cambridge, PhD Diss)
- Lee, J (2004) *From English Citizenship Education Policy to the Authentic Democratic School Community* (Paper presented at the British Educational Research Association Conference, September 2004)
- Levin B and Riffell J A (1997) *Schools and the Changing World: Struggling Toward the Future* (London, Falmer Press)
- Lévi-Strauss, C (1966) *The Savage Mind* (London, Weidenfeld and Nicholson)
- Levitas, R (2005) *The Inclusive Society? Social Exclusion and New Labour* (London, Palgrave Macmillan)

REFERENCES

- Loasby, B J (1990) 'The Use of Scenarios in Business Planning' in (ed) Frowen S F *Unknowledge and Choice in Economics* (London, Macmillan)
- Lortie, D C (1969) 'The Balance of Control and Autonomy in Elementary School Teaching' in Etzioni, A (ed) *The Semi-Professions and their Organization* (New York, Free Press)
- Lyotard, J-F (1994) 'The Postmodern Condition' in Seidman, S (Ed) *The Postmodern Turn: New perspectives on social theory*, pp 27-38 (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)
- McBeath, J and Galton, M (2004) *A Life in Secondary Teaching: Finding Time for Learning* (Cambridge, Cambridge University) Report for the National Union of Teachers.
- Macionis, J J and Plummer, K (2002) *Sociology: A Global Introduction* (London, Prentice Hall)
- Maguire, M, Ball, S J and Macrae, S (2001) 'In all our interests': internal marketing at Northwark Park School' in *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, Vol 22, No 1, Mar 2001, pp 35-50
- Mann, M (1986) *The Sources of Social Power*, Vol 1 (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)
- Mannheim, K (1960) *Ideology and Utopia* (London, Routledge and Kegan Paul)
- Maranda, M-F and Comeau, Y (2000) 'Some contributions of sociology to the understanding of career' in Collin, A and Young, R A (eds) *The Future of Career* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)
- Marx, K (1967) *Writings of the Young Marx in Philosophy and Society*, ed and tr by Easton, L D and Guddat, K H (New York, Anchor Books)
- May, G H (1996) *The Future is Ours: Foreseeing, Managing and Creating the Future* (Westport, Praeger)
- Mercer, D (1998) *Future Revolutions: A Comprehensive Guide to Life and Work in the Next Millennium* (London, Orion)
- Mill, J S (1984) *Principles of Political Economy* (Oxford, Oxford University Press)
- Mitchell, C and Webber, S (1999) *Reinventing ourselves as teachers: beyond nostalgia* (London, Falmer Press)
- Moore, R (2000) 'For Knowledge: tradition, progressivism and progress in education – reconstructing the curriculum debate' in *Cambridge Journal of Education* Vol 30, No 1, Mar 2000
- Moore, R (2004) *Education and Society* (Cambridge, Polity)
- Muhlhauser, P and Harre, R (1990) *Pronouns and people: the linguistic construction of social and personal identity* (Oxford, Blackwell)
- Naisbitt, J (1982) *Megatrends: ten new directions transforming our lives* (London, Futura)
- Neill, A S (1968) *Summerhill* (Harmondsworth, Penguin)
- Newton, T (2003) 'Crossing the Great Divide: Time, Nature and the Social' in *Sociology* Vol 37 No 3 Aug 2003 pp 433-457
- Nias, J (1981) 'Commitment' and Motivation in Primary School Teachers' in *Educational Review* Vol. 33, No 3, pp181-190
- Nias, J (1987a) 'Teaching and the Self' in *Cambridge Journal of Education*, Vol 13, October 1997, pp 11-22

- Nias, J (1987b) *Seeing anew: teachers' theories of action* (Victoria, Deakin University Press)
- Nias, J (1989) *Primary Teachers Talking: A Study of Teaching as Work* (London, Routledge)
- Nias, J (1996) 'Thinking about Feeling: the emotions in teaching' in *Cambridge Journal of Education*, Vol 26 No 3 pp 293-306
- Nias, J (1997) 'Would schools improve if teachers cared less?' in *Education 3-13*, Oct 1997, pp 11-22
- Nowotny, H (1994) *Time: The Modern and Postmodern Experience* (Cambridge, Polity)
- Oduro, G and Macbeath, J (2003) 'Traditions and Tension in Leadership: The Ghanaian experience' in *Cambridge Journal of Education*, Vol 33 No 3, Nov 2003, pp 441-453
- Ofsted (1999) *Inspection Report on Summerhill School*, 1 Mar 1999 (Ofsted Publications)
- Ogilvie, D and Ashmore, R (1991) 'Self-with-other representation as a unit of analysis in self-concept research' in Curtis, R (Ed) *Theoretical convergences in psychoanalysis and social psychology*, pp 282-314 (New York, Guildford Press)
- Ono, R (2003) 'Learning from young people's image of the future: a case study in Taiwan and the US' in *Futures* Vol 35 No 7 Sept 2003 pp737-758
- Ostell, A and Oakland S (1995) *Headteacher Stress, coping and health* (Aldershot, Avebury)
- Peirce, C S (1965) *Collected Papers*, Hartshorne, C and Weiss, P (Eds) (Cambridge, Harvard University Press)
- Pennabaker, J, Francis, M and Booth, R (2001) *Linguistic Enquiry and Word Count (LIWC): LIWC 2001* (New Jersey, Erlbaum)
- Pennabaker, J, Mehle, M and Niederhoffer, K (2003) 'Psychological aspects of natural language use: our words, our selves' in *Annual Review of Psychology* Vol 54 pp 547-577
- Perkin, H (1996) *The Third Revolution: Professional Elites in the Modern World* (London, Routledge)
- Peters, G (1996) *Beyond the Next Wave: Imagining the Next Generation of Customers* (London, Pearson Professional)
- Piaget, J and Inhelder, B (1969) *The Psychology of the Child* (New York, Basic Books)
- Piaget, J and Inhelder, B (1983) 'Piaget's Theory' in Mussen, P (ed) *Handbook of Child Psychology* Vol. 1 (New York, Wiley)
- Price Waterhouse Coopers (2001) *Teacher Workload Study* A report of a review commissioned by the DfES (London, Price Waterhouse Coopers)
- Revell, Phil (2005) *The Professionals* (Stoke on Trent, Trentham)
- Richards, L (2002) 'Qualitative computing – a methods revolution?' in *International Journal of Social Research Methodology* Vol 5 No 3 pp263-276
- Rogers, R (1984) *Crowther to Warnock: How Fourteen Reports Tried to Change Children's Lives* (London, Heinemann Educational)
- Rosaldo, R (1994) 'Subjectivity in social analysis' in Seidman, S (Ed) *The Post-modern Turn* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)

REFERENCES

- Rose, N (1999) *Powers of Freedom* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)
- Roulson, K (2001) 'Data analysis and 'theorizing as ideology'' in *Qualitative Research* Vol 1 No 3 pp279-302
- Schwartz, P (1995) *The Art of the Long View: Planning for the Future in an Uncertain World* (New York, Bantam)
- Seidman, S (Ed) (1994) *The Postmodern Turn* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press)
- Semeonoff, B (1976) *Projective Techniques* (London, Wiley)
- Senge, P M (1993) *The Fifth Discipline: The Art and Practice of the Learning Organisation* (London, Century Business)
- Sherlock Campbell, R and Pennebaker, J (2003) 'The Secret Life of Pronouns' in *Psychological Science* Vol 14 No 1 Jan 2003 pp60-65
- Slaughter, R A (1998) *World Year Book of Education* (Futures Education Edition) (London, Kogan Page)
- Slaughter, R A (2002) 'Beyond the mundane: reconciling breadth and depth in futures enquiry' in *Futures*, Vol 34 No 6, pp 493-507
- Smith, A (2003) *The Wealth of Nations* (London, Bantam Classics)
- Smithers, A and Robinson, P (2003) *Factors Affecting Teachers' Decisions to Leave the Profession* (Research Report 430) (London, DfES)
- Smithers, A and Robinson, P (2004) *Teacher Turnover, Wastage and Destinations* Research brief No RB553, June 2004 (London, DfES)
- Strauss, A and Corbin, J (1990) *Basics of Qualitative Research: grounded Theory Procedures and Techniques* (Newbury Park, CA, Sage)
- Storr, A (1988) *Solitude* (London, Flamingo)
- Swann, W (1997) 'The trouble with change: self-verification and allegiance to the self' in *Psychological Science* Vol 8 pp177-180
- Taylor, F W (1973) *Principles of Scientific Management* (New York, Harper and Row)
- Tight, M (1998) 'Education, education, education! The vision of lifelong learning in the Kennedy, Dearing and Fryer Reports'. In *Oxford Review of Education*, Vol 24, No 4, Dec 98, pp473-485
- Toffler, A (1970) *Future Shock* (London, Bodley Head)
- Toffler, A and H (1994) *Creating a New Civilisation* (Atlanta, Turner Publishing)
- UCET (Universities' Council for the Education of Teachers) (2002) *The School Curriculum Ten Years Hence: Providing Effective Teachers* Occasional Paper No 14, Dec 2002 (An account of the Joint UCET/HMI Symposium held in Belfast, 10/11 Dec 2001) Accessed at <http://www.ucet.ac.uk/op14.html> on 25 Jan 2005.
- UK Parliament (1988) *The Education Reform Act* (London, HMSO)
- UK Parliament (1998) *The Role of Headteachers* Select Committee on Education and Employment, Ninth Report, published 3 Nov 1998 (London, HMSO)
- Vattimo, G (1995) 'The Postmodern: A Transparent Society' in Giddens, A (Ed) *The Polity Reader in Social Theory*, pp 367-372
- Vgotksy, L (1962) *Thought and Language* (Massachusetts, MIT)
- Walford, G (1986) *Life in Public Schools* (London, Methuen)
- Waller, w (1932) *The Sociology of Teaching* (New York, Wiley)

- Warburton, F and Southgate, V (1969) *i.t.a.: An Independent Evaluation* (London, Murray)
- Weber, M (1993) *The Sociology of Religion* (London, Beacon Press)
- Weber, S and Mitchell, C (1995) *That's funny, you don't look like a teacher: interrogating images and identity in popular culture* (London, Falmer Press)
- Wiener, M and Mehrabian, A (1968) *Language within language: immediacy, a channel in verbal communication* (New York, Appleton-Century-Crofts)
- Wack, P (1985) 'Scenarios: Shooting the Rapids' in *Harvard Business Review*, Nov-Dec 1985, pp 139-150
- Whithead J, Preece, L and Maughan, S (1999) 'Teacher Supply: Is there a disjuncture between policy and practice? The case of mature students' in *Research in Education* No 62 Nov 1999
- Whitty, G (2002) *Making Sense of Education Policy* (London, Paul Chapman)
- Wittgenstein, L (1933) *Tractatus logico-Philosophicus* (London, Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner and Co)
- Wittgenstein, L (1953) *Philosophical Investigations* tr. G E M Anscombe (Oxford, Blackwell)
- Woods, P (1979) *The Divided School* (London, Routledge and Kegan Paul)
- Young, M (1996) 'A Curriculum for the Twenty-First Century? Towards a new basis for overcoming academic/vocational divisions', in Ahier *et al* (eds) *Diversity and Change: Education, Policy and Selection* (Routledge, London)
- Young, M (1998) 'Unifying academic and vocational learning and the idea of a learning society' in *Journal of Education Policy* Vol 12 No 6 Nov-Dec 97 pp 527-537

Internet Resources

Great Britain

Department for Education and Skills (2003) *Access to Education* [online]
Available at <http://www.dfes.gov.uk/sickchildren/Pdfs/AccessstoEducation.pdf>,
accessed 21 Nov 2003

Education Otherwise (2003) *Index to Legal Bits* [online]
Available at <http://www.educationotherwise.co.uk/Legal/IndextoLegalBits.htm>,
accessed 21 Nov 2003

General

Teaching Council (2003) *Ten-point plan to address concerns over teacher shortages* [online]

Available at <http://www.gtce.org.uk/gtcinfo/ten%5Fpoint.asp>, accessed 3 Oct 2003

MacLeod, A K and Conway, C (2001) *Positive expectations about the future and current well-being* [online]

Available at <http://psyserver.pc.rhbnc.ac.uk/staff/AndyM/projsum.htm>, accessed 15 Oct 2003

Prospects (2003) *Careers: Teacher* [online]

Prospects (2003) *Careers: GP* [online]

Prospects (2003) *Careers: Social Worker* [online]

Prospects (2003) *Careers: Chartered accountant* [online]

Prospects (2003) *Careers: Police Inspector* [online]

Available at <http://www.prospects.ac.uk/links/occupations>, accessed 11 Nov 2003

Puttnam, D (2001) *Transcript of the speech delivered by the Chair of the General Teaching Council, Lord David Puttnam, at the Secondary Heads Association conference, March 2001* [online]

Available at <http://www.gtce.org.uk/gtcinfo/features/feat59.asp>, accessed 3 Oct 2003

Wilkinson, S (2003) *Teacher Professionalism* [online]

Available at <http://www.gtce.org.uk/news/featuresDetailasp?ezineld=72>,
accessed 3 Oct 2003

Index

- Black Papers 7, 37
- business and industry 4, 69, 95, 96, 109, 113, 133, 156
- Callaghan, James 7
- Causal Layered Analysis 4, 75, 113, 115, 165
 - challenge to dominance of Western worldview 149
 - discourse 151
 - hidden meanings 146
 - inductive theory 147
 - links with poststructuralism 146
 - litany 150, 152
 - metaphor 151, 156
 - theorising social situations 150
 - social causes 150, 153
 - classroom assistants 113
- Dearing Report 39, 49, 54, 57, 58, 167
- economy
 - agricultural 43
 - industrial 43
 - knowledge 43
- education
 - 11+16
 - age cohorts 98
 - agricultural timetable 155, 170
 - child-centred 80
 - City Technology Colleges 32, 134
 - class sizes 99
 - classroom conditions 98
 - classroom management 112
 - coaching 89
 - comprehensive education 1 6, 35
 - creativity 88
 - distance learning 103
 - examinations 82
 - finance 109, 115
 - Further Education 53, 54
 - funding 4, 69, 94, 95, 112
 - future 68
 - gender 16
 - Grant Maintained Schools 8, 17, 84, 87
 - holistic 88, 90, 96, 130, 154
 - home-school relationships 7, 71, 80, 105
 - home schooling 104, 117
 - hospital schools 105, 117
 - independent 1 8, 36, 37, 83
 - inspection 88, 104, 133, 163
 - Ofsted 8, 13, 17, 20, 21, 22, 25, 28, 30, 32, 59, 68, 81, 82, 84, 87, 90, 91, 92, 94, 155
 - instrumental 96
 - league tables 81, 82
 - middle-class parents 89
 - National Curriculum 13, 17, 25, 30, 32, 52, 60, 68, 69, 83, 104, 133, 155
 - open enrolment 32, 37
 - parents 106
 - politicisation 8
 - pregnant pupils 105
 - primary 103
 - progressive 7, 18
 - public examinations 17, 20, 21
 - pupil identity 97
 - Raising of the School Leaving Age (ROSLA) 16
 - Rupture 20
 - selective 18
 - school exclusions 14, 105
 - target setting 81, 89, 163
 - technology 71

- testing and assessment 68, 81, 82, 83, 88, 163
 Standard Assessment Tests (SATS) 8, 17, 20, 32, 36, 154, 52, 82, 133
 traditionalism 18
 uniformity 81, 107
 Education Act 1944 16, 31
 Education Reform Act 1988 3, 8, 15, 16, 20, 23, 24, 28, 30, 31, 33, 35, 37, 40, 52, 59, 70, 87, 88, 153, 155, 166, 167
 escatology 45
 epistemology 45
 European Union 93

 Fordism 36
 Fryer Report 39, 45, 49, 55, 57, 58, 167
 Futures research 77, 139
 hard/medium/soft 143
 inexact science 141
 interpretivism 141
 postpositivism 141
 scenario planning 140, 142
 transformative intellectual 142

 Girls' Schools Association 37
 Girls' Public Day School Trust 37
 General Teaching Council of England 4, 154, 168
Goodbye Mr Chips 9, 18, 24
 government 3, 79
 audit culture 11, 15, 59, 84, 94
 centralisation 2, 8, 14, 16, 20, 31, 153, 167
 Civil Service 8, 39, 46
 competition 11, 120
 Conservative party 8, 25, 31, 79, 155
 continuous improvement 37
 control 15, 17
 cost reduction 11
 Department for Education (DfEE/DfES) 20
 economic restructuring 11
 educational policy 3
 free market economy 37, 40, 157
 internal markets 11, 16
 Labour party 8, 37, 39, 47, 48, 49, 52
 Labour market 50, 51, 57
 Local Education Authorities (LEAs) 8, 16, 32, 54, 65, 66, 86, 87, 91, 167
 Local Management of Schools 32
 managerialism 8, 22, 23, 59, 79, 81, 89, 111
 neoconservatism 37, 39, 140
 neoliberalism 16, 17, 37, 46, 140
 outsourcing 11
 pathologising citizens 14, 46, 52, 53, 57
 silencing citizens 144
 Private Finance Initiatives 81, 84, 95
 reform 3
 surveillance 12
 workforce casualisation 11
 Head Masters' and Head Mistresses' Conference (HMC) 18, 37

 Inner London Education Authority (ILEA) 85

 Kennedy Report 39, 49, 53, 54, 57, 58, 167

 Leys School 9
 linguistic analysis 4, 115, 141
 absence of a sense of professional partnership 137
 classroom talk 121
 disempowerment 132
 distance from ICT use 132
 fissure within UK education system 135
 hierarchical view of education 131
 identification with controlling group 129
 identifying with educational process 132
 indicators of autonomy 133
 indicators of mental models 136
 indicators of psychological distancing 121, 128
 indicators of social identity 124
 lack of external agency
 collaboration 135
 links to key concepts 124
 linking with wider professional community 130
 multiple identities 132
 nationalistic view of society 129
 ownership of professional issues 129
 philosophy of language 120
 possible levels of analysis 122
 pronouns 4, 26, 74, 120, 123, 164
 provider/consumer/regulator
 tension 135
 psychological distance 131, 137

- qualitative analysis software packages 122
- shifting pronouns 132
- shift in locus of control 130
- sociolinguistics 121
- teachers keeping social order 134
- undermining of teachers' authority 133
- unions 133
- Mapping Professional Conceptions of Learning Futures* 4, 63, 77
- data analysis 73, 75, 125
- influence of grounded theory approach 123
- key drivers for change 80-81
- linguistic analysis 119
- PEST analysis 79
- research design 65, 75
- sample 75
- SWOT analysis 79
- Montessori schools 169, 170
- music 44
- Neill, A.S. 37
- Parsons, Talcott 9
- Plowden report 70, 80, 83, 89, 92, 105, 106
- professions
 - accountability 10, 13, 14, 15, 20, 25
 - accountancy 10, 50
 - autonomy 14, 17, 169
 - clergy 10
 - controlling expertise 10
 - controlling fees 169
 - controlling working environment 10
 - external regulation 23
 - law 10, 162
 - managerialism 10, 28
 - medicine 10, 13, 15, 162
 - models of professionalism 27, 28, 89
 - monopoly 10, 169
 - neutrality 9
 - nursing 10, 13, 29, 50
 - original professions 10
 - prestige 10
 - power relations 19
 - public sector professions 3, 8, 9
 - restructuring 10
 - self-interest 9
 - self-regulation 169
 - semi-professions 29
 - senior managers 10
 - social work 10, 29
 - teaching 50
 - town planning 10
 - transparency 14
 - university teaching 10
- Ruskin College 7
- Secondary Heads Association 37
- society
 - class system 10, 52
 - conceptions of time 42
 - decentred identity 47
 - decline 105, 112
 - democracy 21
 - divisions 99
 - equality 16
 - future 65, 78
 - gender 52
 - globalisation 4, 29, 48, 52, 92, 93, 112, 115
 - 'ideal type' of citizen 52
 - identity 49, 60
 - individualisation 112
 - informationalism 48
 - information overload 109
 - information technology 109
 - job insecurity 11
 - knowledge economy 23, 46, 48, 60, 98
 - learning society 31, 52
 - one-parent families 106
 - prospective identity 45, 46, 48, 52, 54, 57, 144, 160, 163
 - retrospective identity 45, 46, 54, 57, 144, 156, 160, 163
 - risk-sensitised 157
 - social capital 53
 - social change 2
 - social inclusion 54, 57, 99
 - social order 166
 - social reform 99
 - technology 11, 13
 - space 110
 - time 83, 98, 110, 160, 166
 - Utopian/Dystopian divide 48
 - workforce casualisation 11
- Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge 38
- Steiner schools 169, 170
- Summerhill School 21, 22, 24, 37, 38
- symbolic interactionism 146
- Taylorism 82
- teachers
 - accountability 107
 - ageing 34

- alienation 37
- altruism 9, 52, 101, 103, 132
- ambivalence 157, 166
- anomie 34, 35, 36
- autonomy 8, 13, 22, 46, 83, 85, 92, 99, 101, 113, 115, 153, 159, 165, 168, 170
- career 9, 17, 19, 27, 28, 33,
- collective bargaining power 4, 11
- Continuing Professional Development 24, 71, 93, 170
- dehumanisation 22, 36
- deprofessionalisation 2, 23
- de-skilling 21, 60
- discipline 153
- discourse 161
- disempowerment 39, 154
- disenfranchisement 167
- external regulation 59, 60
- fatigue 29
- fear 91
- Graduate Teacher Programme 13, 15
- head teachers 34
- habitus 17, 23, 24, 27, 60, 154, 165, 167
- holistic 83, 111, 112
- increased workload 13, 15
- increasing class sizes 113
- Initial Teacher Training 13, 33, 100
- inspection 85
- isolation 29
- locus of control 77
- low self esteem 15
- mental health 34
- marketisation 13, 35
- models of professionalism 84, 86, 88, 91, 92, 93, 99, 100, 102, 107, 108, 109, 111, 129, 132, 133, 161, 162, 163, 169
- motivation 3
- National Grid for Learning 110
- negativity 3
- National Professional Qualification for Head teachers 13
- neuroscience 113, 114
- pay 61, 65, 70, 100, 101, 113, 153
 - Performance Related Pay 13
- performance anxiety 84
- philosophy 20
- professional discourse 123
- professional identity 2, 17, 18, 19, 26, 30, 31, 33, 40, 46, 47, 60, 74, 77, 80, 94, 114, 115
- prohibited from using personal touch 130
- psychological distancing 120
- public good 9
- Qualified Teacher Status 24
- recruitment and retention 3, 20, 60, 113
- reflective practice 18, 29, 59
- remodelling 4
- role model 20
- secularisation 25
- self-efficacy 2
- self-regulation 86
- shared technical culture 86
- status 4, 25, 28, 40, 70, 86, 100, 101, 113, 165
- stress 34, 35, 92
- studying for higher degrees 29
- teacher talk 119
- teaching assistants 13, 14
- technicisation 3, 5, 17, 23, 32, 36, 41
 - technology 108, 110, 113
 - tension with Government 7
 - trust in teachers 111
 - unions 7, 8, 14, 15, 38, 99, 168
 - utilitarianism 166
 - values 5, 24, 28
 - vocation 5, 9, 15, 17, 18, 23, 24, 25, 28, 30, 36, 37, 59, 80, 111, 113, 153, 155, 163, 165, 166
 - workload 64, 71, 113, 153
- Toffler, A 143, 144
- United States of America 6, 37
- Waller, Willard 4
- William Tynedale School, Islington 7
- youth
 - ambivalence towards 139
 - as future 48, 64, 82, 112
 - changing nature of 168
 - financial independence 53
 - hard to control 98, 157
 - status 4

TEACHERS under siege

Sandra Leaton Gray



Teachers under Siege examines the current and future role of teachers in the knowledge-based economy. It argues that they are being presented with an impossible task: they are expected to educate 'youth' as the future of society within organisational structures that are outdated and frustrating. Why are teachers voting with their feet? Using the very latest research techniques to probe deeply into her interviews and focus group discussions with serving teachers and other education professionals, the author throws new and often surprising light on the problem.

Already acclaimed by leading educators, this book is a clarion call for teachers to galvanise their energies, and remodel the teaching profession on their own terms. They must acquire greater professional autonomy and a new respect for the role of vocation within teaching. Only then can education once more value its human face over its organisational one.

Teachers under Siege will be essential reading for all students of education and teachers concerned with their professional survival. It will also interest researchers and policy makers, especially those engaged in futures research.

A former teacher and education journalist, Dr Sandra Leaton Gray is an educational researcher at the University of Cambridge and Director of Studies in Educational Sociology at Homerton College.

ISBN 10: 1-85856-363-1

ISBN 13: 978-1-85856-363-3



tb Trentham Books

www.trentham-books.co.uk