



Leading education  
and social research  
Institute of Education  
University of London

**act:onaid**

# **Transforming Education for Girls in Nigeria and Tanzania: Cross Country Analysis of Endline Research Studies**

**Elaine Unterhalter and Jo Heslop  
Institute of Education, University of London  
December 2012**



## Contents

|   |    |
|---|----|
| Acknowledgements .....  | 1  |
| 1.0 Introduction .....  | 2  |
| 1.1 Endline and baseline.....                                   | 2  |
| 1.2 Endline study aims.....                                     | 3  |
| 1.3 Endline studies: Methods .....                              | 3  |
| 1.4 Endline study analysis .....                                | 4  |
| 2.0 The TEGINT project in Tanzania & Nigeria .....              | 6  |
| 2.1 Educational change in Tanzania & Nigeria since 2008.....    | 6  |
| 3.0 Findings from the endline studies.....                      | 7  |
| 3.1 Gender equality in schooling.....                           | 7  |
| 3.2 Girls' empowerment.....                                     | 8  |
| 3.3. Teachers and teaching.....                                 | 12 |
| 3.4 School management, funding and community mobilisation ..... | 14 |
| 4.0 Conclusions and recommendations .....                       | 16 |
| References .....  | 18 |
| Appendix: TEGINT Composite Indices.....                         | 19 |

## Acknowledgements

This summary report is the product of collaboration between multiple partners in the Transforming Education for Girls project. We gratefully acknowledge the funding received from Comic Relief and the Tubney Charitable Trust for the project. We would like to thank Professor Ophelia Mascarenhas, Gasper Baltazary and team, who collected the data and authored the full research report for Tanzania, and Dr Funmi Para-Mallam and Placid Ugoagwu of the National Institute for Policy and Strategic Studies in Jos, who collected the data and wrote the report for Nigeria. ActionAid International, ActionAid Nigeria, ActionAid Tanzania, Community Action for Popular Participation and Maarifa ni Ufunguo all contributed significantly to the research design and planning, data collection and analysis. The Institute of Education, University of London, led the conceptualisation, instrument development, training and quality assurance. From the IOE, Professor Elaine Unterhalter, Jo Heslop, Vincenzo Mauro and Rosie Peppin-Vaughn lead and undertook the statistical analysis of the data, including the development of composite indicators, with consultation and inputs from the wider TEGINT team.

## **1.0 Introduction**

The Transforming Education for Girls in Nigeria and Tanzania (TEGINT) project is a special education initiative to transform the education of girls in Northern Tanzania and Northern Nigeria, enabling them to enrol and succeed in school by addressing key challenges and obstacles that hinder their participation in education and increase their vulnerability to gender violence and HIV/AIDS. TEGINT ran between 2007 and 2012 as a partnership between ActionAid, Maarifa ni Ufunguo in Tanzania and Community Action for Popular Participation (CAPP) in Nigeria, funded by Comic Relief and the Tubney Charitable Trust. As well as interventions to enhance girls' education, the project included a substantial research component involving researchers from Nigeria, Tanzania and the Institute of Education, London.

This cross country report on the endline research studies for the project analyses data collected in Tanzania in May to June 2012 and Nigeria in May to September 2012. This discussion develops analysis contained in full research reports led and authored by Professor Ophelia Mascarenhas in Tanzania and Dr. Funmi Para-Mallam in Nigeria (Mascarenhas, 2012; Para-Mallam, 2012). Teams of national and international researchers and enumerators worked in both countries to design the studies, collect the data, analyze findings and review results. This cross-country analysis has emerged from discussion of themes in the two country studies by researchers at the Institute of Education and ActionAid project co-ordinators.

### **1.1 Endline and baseline**

This cross country analysis of findings from the endline study comments on a number of changes associated with the project since the completion of the baseline study. Between 2008 and 2010 baseline studies were carried out in Tanzania and Nigeria (Unterhalter and Heslop, 2011). These studies provided five key findings which will be reviewed in light of the analysis of data from the endline studies. The baseline studies found in both countries:

- 1:** Girls have high aspirations for their education, despite concerns with poverty, gender-based violence, the consequences of early pregnancy and marriage, and lack of school facilities. Girls' views about overcoming obstacles tend to focus on short-term and less sustainable interventions, like sponsorship to pay school fees.
- 2:** Girls identify poverty, lack of school facilities, and distance to school as major obstacles to schooling in places where they can easily see other girls who do not experience such obstacles. They tend to be silent on these obstacles in places where poverty levels are higher and there are greater distances to walk to school. In addition, there is considerable silence on gender-based violence.
- 3:** Where teachers have higher levels of qualifications, girls are more able to articulate a wider range of demands for their schooling. Where there are larger numbers of women teachers there is more gender parity in attendance, progression and attainment. Teacher training colleges have given more attention to HIV/AIDS than gender.
- 4:** Government funding for schooling is insufficient. Many schools where gender parity in attendance, progression and attainment is not a problem are supplementing government funding with very high levies from parents and communities.
- 5:** Better levels of gender parity in attendance, progression and attainment are found in schools where school management committees (SMCs) have more women members and are highly proactive. However, SMCs have limited capacity to respond to gender-based violence.

## 1.2 Endline study: Aims

The endline study was designed to examine changes in girls' schooling and empowerment since the baseline research was conducted. It aimed to assess the relationship of changes in these areas with key project inputs. The key areas of investigation were:

- (i) **Gender equality in schooling:** whether gender profiles, a summary measure of gender parity in enrolment, attendance and progression in the project schools, have changed;
- (ii) **Girls' empowerment:** whether aspects of girls' empowerment have changed and whether there is a relationship between major project inputs (girls' clubs, teacher training and supporting school management) and girls' views on the obstacles to completing schooling, possible solutions, knowledge of HIV and confidence about addressing gender inequalities and violence;
- (iii) **Teaching and teachers:** girls' experiences of participatory teaching methods and how this relates to teacher conditions - class size, qualifications and training - and levels of girls' attainment and empowerment;
- (iv) **School management:** how the gender management profile, a summary measure of a school community's engagement with girls' rights and gender issues, has changed and whether this is related to project interventions, the gender profile, girls' empowerment, teacher qualifications or teacher engagement;
- (v) **School funding:** Whether levies charged have changed and how these relate to activities of school management committees and girls' attendance and attainment;
- (vi) **Community mobilisation:** views of community members on gender equality in school and girls' vulnerability to HIV/AIDs and gender violence and how these are related to project intervention.

## 1.3 Endline study: Methods

In Nigeria all 72 schools (36 primary and 36 secondary) in which the TEGINT project worked were included in the surveys for the endline study. In Tanzania 30 schools (23 primary schools and seven secondary schools) were selected from the 57 project schools for the study using stratified random sampling. Data was collected using survey instruments to six categories of respondents and collation of school and district administrative data (Table 1). Girls, teachers and community circle members were randomly sampled using registers. In total 1977 respondents participated in the study (1359 Nigeria and 618 Tanzania).

Table 1: Endline research instruments and sampling

| Instrument                       | Target  | Total actual Nigeria (72 schools)   | Total actual Tanzania (30 schools)  | Data to be gathered  |
|----------------------------------|---|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|
| Girls                            | 10 per school (5 in girls' club + 5 not in girls' club) | 629 (382 members + 246 non-members) | 295 (150 members + 145 non-members) | Aspirations, obstacles and solutions to schooling; girls' club activities; knowledge and attitude to HIV/AIDS and gender; confidence dealing with gender violence. |
| Girls' club facilitator (matron) | 1 per school  | 71                                  | 29                                  | Girls' club activities, logistics and management   |

|   |   |     |     |   |
|---|---|-----|-----|---|
| School Management Committee Chair           | 1 per school                              | 70  | 24  | Committee membership and leadership; training and activities                      |
| Head Teacher                                | 1 per school                              | 72  | 30  | Teacher numbers, qualifications and conditions; teacher training; fees and levies |
| Teachers                                    | 5 per school                              | 331 | 149 | In-service training received and utilised   |
| Community Circle members                    | 4 per primary school (2 males; 2 females) | 186 | 91  | Training; knowledge, attitudes & action on gender, HIV/AIDs and gender violence.  |
| School administrative data – school         | 1 per school                              | 72  | 30  | Pupil enrolment, attendance, attainment; teachers' qualifications over time       |
| School administrative data – district /LGEA | 1 per district                            | 31  | 6   | Pupil enrolment, progression and attainment for 2007-2012                         |
| Programme Officer                           | 1 per school                              | 72  | 30  | Details of TEGINT interventions per school  |

Ethical clearance for the study was provided by the Institute of Education, University of London. Pilot studies were carried out in each country to review the research instruments. Research teams were trained on orientation of the project, contested concepts such as gender and violence, using the instruments and addressing ethical issues including communicating with children, addressing power imbalances and child protection procedures. Each research team comprised at least two females, who interviewed girls, girls' club facilitators and female community members. Data was collected using the vernacular language spoken by girls and community members in each locale.

The biggest challenges related to unavailability of some data. This was most severe in Nigeria, where there were gaps and inconsistencies in school administrative data collected from schools and LGEAs. Insecurity and logistical challenges made it impossible to interview the full set of respondents planned. Whilst resources were concentrated into identifying and correcting gaps and inconsistencies in the data this was not sufficient to respond to them all satisfactorily. These have been taken into consideration in the analysis and interpretation of results.

#### 1.4 Endline study analysis

The data analysis for each country report included reviews of a number of composite indices used to bring together information from diverse data in the surveys. All of the indices and how they were developed are described in detail in the Appendix. The composite indices used are:

- the strength of the TEGINT intervention (Intervention index)
- how well girls do relative to boys in school (Gender profile)
- how active the school is on girls' education (Gender Management profile)
- how empowered girls are (Girls' Empowerment index)

- how well qualified the teachers are (Teacher Qualification profile)
- how engaged teachers are with issues of gender equality and participatory teaching (Teacher Engagement index).

In this cross country analysis we review similarities and differences between many of these composite indices in the two countries in which the project worked. The summary reports on each country contain more detail (Wetheridge and Mamedu, 2012; Wetheridge and Kapaya, 2012).



## 2.0 The TEGINT project in Tanzania and Nigeria

TEGINT in Tanzania worked in six districts in three northern regions: Arusha Municipality and Monduli districts in Arusha Region; Hai and Moshi Rural districts in Kilimanjaro Region; and Babati and Mbulu districts in Manyara Region. In Nigeria the project worked in eight states in three Northern zones of the country: Bauchi and Gombe in the North-East; Kaduna and Katsina in the North-West; Nasarawa, Niger, Plateau and FCT in the North-Central. Some schools in which the project worked were located in very rural and remote areas, some in semi-urban areas and some in towns. All schools were state schools, identified by local education officials as serving children from poor households. All locales where the project worked were associated with levels of deprivation, gender discrimination and distance from decision-making centres or capacity to exercise influence on seats of power.

### 2.1 Educational change in Tanzania and Nigeria since 2008

In both countries the period from the baseline research (initiated in 2008) was associated with considerable investment in and expansion of provision of schooling. Much focus was on primary levels in both countries, where capitation fees incentivized the enrolment of poor children in school. However, the uneven and sometimes very inadequate quality of teaching in these schools was associated with a mushrooming of private schools, and a reduction of enrolments in state schools in many areas (Eldridge, 2009; John, 2009). In both countries there was also a stress on widening access to junior secondary school. In Tanzania a large programme was set in motion to establish junior secondary schools in areas that had had only primary schools. While in both countries increases in teachers' pay and improvements in conditions were often an issue of contention, large programmes were conducted to upgrade teachers' qualifications. A number of national and local programmes highlighted the importance of expanding access to school for girls. Some of the difficulties schoolgirls encountered – such as expulsion and refusal of re-admission for pregnancy, gender-based violence, and low attainment in public examinations - were given high profile nationally, although policy at national and local levels was still under discussion when the project came to an end.



### 3.0 Findings

The discussion below draws out elements of the cross country comparison in relation to five areas, gender equality in access, progression and attainment at school, girls' empowerment and the impact of the project intervention relating to girls' clubs, teachers and the impact of the project intervention on teacher development, community mobilisation and school management and aspects of the project intervention on working with school committees, the fees charged by schools and engagement with gender based violence.

#### 3.1 Gender equality in schooling

Table 2: Changes in Gender Profile score

|             | Tanzania |         | Nigeria  |         |
|-------------|----------|---------|----------|---------|
|             | Baseline | Endline | Baseline | Endline |
| Primary     |          | 1.04    | 0.91     | 1.02    |
| Secondary   |          | 0.99    | 0.83     | 0.85    |
|             |          |         |          |         |
| Urban       | 0.99     | 1.03    | 0.88     | 1.02    |
| Rural       | 1.12     | 1.04    | 0.87     | 0.89    |
|             |          |         |          |         |
| All schools | 1.07     | 1.03    | 0.88     | 0.93    |

The gender profile, which comprises an assessment of gender parity in enrolment, attendance, progression and attainment, increased between the baseline and the endline in Nigeria but declined in Tanzania. However, there were improvements in both countries in urban areas. In Tanzania, girls' enrolment in TEGINT primary schools decreased by 11% between 2008 and 2012, similar to the 8% decline across all schools in the six districts. The reduction in enrolment at primary level reflected a national trend of net enrolment decline that may be the result of the government's PEDP II's requirement for a strict adherence to the standard age of enrolment into primary one (children aged 6-7 years only) and/or as a result of a rise in the number of private primary schools. Nationally from 2006 to 2010 enrolment in private primary schools rose by 90% compared with 0.4% for government schools (Wetheridge and Kapaya, 2012). Girls' enrolment also declined slightly (by 3%) in the primary schools in which the project worked in Nigeria.

If we look at these overall gender profile trends in more detail, considering district/state patterns and the particular components of the gender profile, it is evident that growth of education provision in urban locations accounts for some of the largest gains. In Tanzania the largest increase in the gender profile was in Arusha, where schools are in or close to the large and prosperous town of Arusha. Here the gender profile increased from 0.92 to 1.03 and a large component of the increase was linked to an improvement in exam pass rates for girls. In Nigeria, the largest increase in the gender profile was in the schools in which the project worked in Katsina state. All these schools were in urban locations (in contrast to other states where the project worked in a mixture of rural, urban and peri-urban schools). In Katsina, between 2008 and 2012, girls' enrolment almost doubled and gender gaps reduced for enrolment, progression and completion. Thus, **the project seems to have worked particularly effectively in supporting poor girls' engagement with schooling**, complementing government initiatives in urban areas.

However, in rural areas the pattern is more mixed. In both Tanzania and Nigeria in the schools in some rural areas there are increases in a particular component of the gender profile, while in others, not. In the FCT in Nigeria, project schools are particularly remote, although located in a state with a generally higher level of GDP per capita than other states.

Here we see a puzzling trend, where gender gaps in some components of the gender profile have increased. These differences associated with location point to the need for closer investigation, through research and projects, of gender, urbanisation and rurality.

### 3.2 Girls' empowerment

To analyse endline data we developed the composite Girls' Empowerment Index, which looked at girls' views on gender equality, knowledge and attitudes to HIV and confidence in challenging gender-based violence.

Table 3: Mean girls' empowerment index by country, location and level of schooling

|             | Tanzania | Nigeria |
|-------------|----------|---------|
| Primary     | 0.695    | 0.482   |
| Secondary   | 0.766**  | 0.532** |
|             |          |         |
| Urban       | 0.668    | 0.561   |
| Rural       | 0.624*   | 0.478** |
|             |          |         |
| All schools | 0.722    | 0.507   |

Significance: \*\*\* p<0.01; \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

In both countries the mean girls' empowerment index is higher for girls at junior secondary level than at primary level, and in both countries the difference is statistically significant at 5%. **This gives strong support to arguments to extend global and national policy demands relating to the period girls remain in formal schooling to at least nine years**, as it indicates that for girls living in poverty those who are in junior secondary school are more knowledgeable about their rights, risks associated with HIV and more confident to challenge gender-based violence than girls from the same contexts who have only primary schooling.

In both countries girls in urban areas have a higher mean empowerment index than girls in rural areas and this is statistically significant at 10% in Tanzania and 5% in Nigeria. This confirms findings from the baseline study that relative, rather than absolute, inequality may contribute to the ways in which children identify the obstacles they face to education and capacity to plan for change (Unterhalter and Heslop, 2011; Unterhalter, 2012). It also suggests that in rural areas there is a need for particularly intensive interventions relating to girls' education to counter the absence of information, support and exposure to alternatives.

Further detail on girls' empowerment is given from girls' responses to a range of question on HIV/AIDS, gender equality and violence. Some of these questions were taken or adapted from Demographic Health Survey (DHS) modules and provide some interesting contrasts with the population in the locales. Larger proportions of girls in Tanzania, compared to Nigeria had accurate knowledge of HIV, and positive attitudes with regard to inclusion of people infected with HIV (Table 4). Larger proportions also were more positive about challenging gender inequalities and gender based violence. This may be partially explained by more conservative norms around gender and sexuality in Northern Nigeria but also suggests that wider social policies with regard to health, women's rights, social inclusion and gender based violence – all of which have been given more concerted attention in Tanzania, compared to Nigeria – are very important accompaniments to interventions like TEGINT.

Table 4: Girls' knowledge of and attitudes to gender equality, HIV/AIDS and violence

|   | % answering correctly, or with positive attitudes that challenge discrimination |          |
|---|---|----------|
|   | Nigeria   | Tanzania |
| <b>Knowledge and attitudes to HIV</b>   |   |          |
| A healthy looking person can have HIV or AIDS   | 68  | 97       |
| HIV or AIDS can be transmitted by mosquito  | 43  | 86       |
| HIV or AIDS can be prevented by using condoms   | 42  | 66       |
| HIV or AIDS can be prevented by limited sexual intercourse to one uninfected partner                                | 72  | 87       |
| Inclusion and tolerance to community members with HIV   | 52  | 87       |
| Inclusion and tolerance to family members with HIV  | 28  | 63       |
| <b>Attitudes on girls and women's rights and bodily integrity</b>   |   |          |
| Girls can lead a school as well as boys   | 48  | 64       |
| Women can engage in politics on equal terms as men  | 66  | 88       |
| Girls should be supported to take any career they wish  | 83  | 91       |
| A woman driving a truck should be respected   | 54  | 77       |
| Girls and boys have an equal right to education   | 85  | 98       |
| Gender inequality should be ended   | 76  | 73       |
| Women's rights to refuse sex if husband infected  | 65  | 78       |
| Women's rights to request condom if husband infected  | 54  | 80       |
| <b>Attitudes to violence</b>  |   |          |
| It is not okay for teachers to whip a girl who comes late to school because she was caring for a sick relative      | 72  | 70       |
| Teachers who have a sexual relationship with a school pupil should be dismissed and never be allowed to teach again | 88  | 87       |
| It is not a girls fault if a man or boy makes unwanted sexual advances towards her                                  | 58  | 78       |
| Girls should be allowed to return to school after giving birth  | 76  | 96       |

Using the girls' empowerment index we investigated the relationship between girls who had participated in one component of the project intervention, joining a girls' club, and those who had not (Table 5).

Table 5: Correlation between girls' club membership and girls' level of empowerment

|                              | Correlation coefficient | Significance |
|------------------------------|-------------------------|--------------|
| <b>Tanzania:</b> all schools | 0.28                    | 0.000***     |
| <b>Nigeria:</b> all schools  | 0.02                    | 0.543        |
| Rural schools                | 0.11                    | 0.031**      |

Significance: \*\*\*  $p < 0.01$ ; \*\*  $p < 0.05$ , \*  $p < 0.1$

In the project area in Tanzania girls who have been members of the girls' clubs are more likely to score highly in our empowerment measure (they had better knowledge about girls' rights, were more challenging of discrimination and violence and had more ideas in how to

overcome obstacles) than girls who were not in clubs. This was statistically significant at a high level of correlation. In Nigeria we also see a positive trend. Although the overall change was not measured to be statistically significant, we found that when we looked at *rural schools* girls in clubs measured higher on empowerment than those who were not in clubs (statistically significant at 5%). This is particularly important because rural girls' empowerment measured lower than girls living in peri-urban or urban areas, and barriers to girls' education are often greater in rural contexts, as evidenced through our gender parity measures in section 3.1. Thus **girls' clubs appear to be particularly effective in relation to girls' empowerment in rural contexts** of isolation, poverty, and distance from sources of information and instances of women challenging discrimination.

Although girls in clubs are more empowered it is difficult to be certain to what extent this is a result of club membership, or whether more empowered girls join the clubs. In Tanzania club members had significantly higher levels of academic performance in class indicating either a possible element of self and/or teacher selection joining clubs or that attainment was improved as a result of belonging to the club. In contrast in Nigeria, club members' educational performance levels were slightly lower than non-club members, suggesting that the most marginalised girls were attracted to the club. Given these contrasting demographics of club members in the two countries, the correlation with empowerment has added cogency.

It is evident that the length of time a girl is a member of a club and how often the club meets also have a bearing on empowerment. Table 6 analyses elements of girls' empowerment with regard to knowledge of HIV/AIDS and girls' rights and how these correlate with their level of participation in a girls' club. It can be seen that those girls who were more heavily involved in the clubs demonstrated more knowledge of HIV and gender and more confidence in challenging gender violence than those not in clubs. This was statistically significant in both countries. Overall the evidence does indicate that **club membership has positive empowering effects on girls in the study communities**, giving further evidence of the efficacy of this form of intervention.

Table 6: Correlation between level of involvement in club and knowledge

|  | Correlation coefficient | Significance |
|--|-------------------------|--------------|
| <b>Tanzania:</b> knowledge of HIV/AIDS         | 0.12                    | 0.052*       |
| Knowledge of gender equality and girls' rights | 0.33                    | 0.000***     |
| <b>Nigeria:</b> knowledge of HIV/AIDS          | 0.19                    | 0.000***     |
| Knowledge of gender equality and girls' rights | 0.39                    | 0.000***     |
| Confidence in challenging violence             | 0.11                    | 0.040**      |

Significance: \*\*\*  $p < 0.01$ ; \*\*  $p < 0.05$ , \*  $p < 0.1$

Girls themselves in both countries talked about numerous benefits of belonging to girls' clubs. Learning about girls' rights and building their confidence were the aspects of the work of clubs most often mentioned by girls.

Table 7: Girls' views on the reasons for joining clubs

|  | Tanzania % who mentioned |       | Nigeria % who mentioned |       |
|--|--------------------------|-------|-------------------------|-------|
|  | Urban                    | Rural | Urban                   | Rural |
| Benefits of being a member (activities, knowledge, help) | 78                       | 92    | 93                      | 80    |
| Joining friends  | 48                       | 52    | 47                      | 13    |
| Instructed by teacher                                    | 32                       | 24    | 43                      | 20    |
| Good relationship with matron                            | 2                        | 2     | 41                      | 6     |
| Other  | 20                       | 25    | 2                       | 2     |

In the baseline study, data was collected from girls relating to their perceptions of the obstacles they would encounter in reaching their desired level of education and what solutions they thought would help them. For the endline study a similar cohort of girls were again surveyed on these issues. It is notable that the obstacles most girls identified in the baseline – poverty, pregnancy, ill health and early marriage – remain the top four at the endline, highlighting how many of the structural constraints on girls' rights have barely changed in five years, despite the economic growth in both countries.

Table 8: Girls' perceptions of obstacles to achieving their desired level of education

|   | Tanzania % who mentioned |                  |                      | Nigeria % who mentioned |                  |                      |
|---|--------------------------|------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|------------------|----------------------|
|   | Baseline                 | Endline In clubs | Endline Not in clubs | Baseline                | Endline In clubs | Endline Not in clubs |
| Poverty                                 | 61                       | 60               | 57                   | 69                      | 26               | 31                   |
| Pregnancy                               | 54                       | 33               | 50                   | 29                      | 17               | 15                   |
| Early marriage                          | 35                       | 26               | 39                   | 41                      | 26               | 32                   |
| Lack of facilities (including teachers) | 31                       | 24               | 11                   | 30                      | 8                | 5                    |
| Ill health                              | 28                       | 20               | 26                   | 40                      | 18               | 12                   |
| Parents withdraw from school            | 20                       | 26               | 21                   | 34                      | 16               | 17                   |
| Too old for secondary school            | 4                        | 1                | 1                    | 8                       | 6                | 4                    |
| Distance from school                    | 7                        | 5                | 3                    | 18                      | 9                | 5                    |

The aspect noted in the baseline (Unterhalter and Heslop, 2011) that girls spoke out more about the obstacles they encountered where teachers were better qualified and there was more relative, rather than absolute poverty, continues for some kinds of obstacles in the endline study. That is, in both countries higher proportions of girls in clubs, compared to girls not in clubs, identified lack of facilities and distance to school as obstacles. In Tanzania in 2012 more girls in clubs, compared to those out of clubs, mentioned poverty and parents' actions in withdrawing them from school as obstacles. In Nigeria more girls in clubs, compared to those out of clubs, mentioned problems of pregnancy and ill health. While we do not have data to explain the reasons for the different proportions citing different reasons in the baseline and the endline, the continuation of the trend that more information, such as that provided by better teachers or membership of a club, appears associated with a larger proportion of girls able to make an assessment of certain obstacles again talks to the importance of clubs and rich resources for girls to identify the obstacles they face and thus claim their rights. For the endline study a large number of girls cited 'other' obstacles that were not included in the baseline survey. In particular 29% of girls surveyed in Tanzania said

failure in the final exam was a barrier to continuing their education. The emergence of awareness of this obstacle since 2008 talks to how the expansion of secondary provision has enhanced aspiration and made this more concrete.

Table 8, which looks at the solutions girls offered to overcome the obstacles they face, shows some interesting developments since the baseline. In the baseline, the most commonly identified solution was sponsorship and this continued to be the case in 2012.

Table 8: Girls' perceptions of solutions

|  | Tanzania % who mentioned |                     |                            | Nigeria % who mentioned |                     |                            |
|--|--------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|
|  | Baseline                 | Endline<br>In clubs | Endline<br>Not in<br>clubs | Baseline                | Endline<br>In clubs | Endline<br>Not in<br>clubs |
| Sponsorship  | 56                       | 48                  | 55                         | 72                      | 31                  | 25                         |
| Provision of facilities                                | 38                       | 24                  | 13                         | 40                      | 15                  | 9                          |
| Enlightenment of parents                               | 42                       | 30                  | 23                         | 53                      | 23                  | 19                         |
| Stop early marriage                                    | 34                       | 22                  | 27                         | 49                      | 22                  | 26                         |
| Abolish fees and levies                                | 20                       | 7                   | 7                          | 47                      | 15                  | 9                          |
| Family Life Education/ Sexual & reproductive health ed | 40                       | 20                  | 11                         | 46                      | 20                  | 10                         |

In both countries girls in clubs are more likely than girls out of clubs to mention particular solutions, with the exception of sponsorship in Tanzania, and the abolition of fees, which equal proportions mention. Further analysis is needed to account for the changing proportion of girls suggesting particular solutions between baseline and endline, but the pattern with regard to the importance of clubs as a forum to develop solutions receives further confirmation from this analysis.

However, some puzzles remain. In both countries **more girls out of clubs than in clubs identify early marriage as a problem, and call for its end as a solution**. We do not know if girls out of clubs are particularly at risk from early marriage. We also do not know why the numbers identifying this as a problem, and remarking on the need for it to end as a solution have declined from the baseline. The data indicates the need for more research on early marriage and girls' education.

### 3.3. Teachers and teaching

TEGINT's work with teachers complemented large-scale teacher training initiatives by both governments. The pupil: teacher ratio improved considerably in both countries between 2008 and 2012 from 84:1 to 64:1 overall in project schools in Nigeria and from 41:1 to 35:1 in Tanzania. Teacher qualifications also improved: in project schools at the endline data collection point in Nigeria 93% of teachers had at least the minimum OND qualification (up from 85% in 2007) whilst in project schools in Tanzania 100% of teachers held the minimum IIIa qualification (up from 91% in 2007).

A teacher qualification profile for each school was developed – weighing in favour of schools where higher proportions of teachers had the highest qualification (degrees and diplomas). Teacher qualifications were weakly correlated with girls' empowerment in Tanzania and not correlated in Nigeria. We also developed a Teacher Engagement Index in an attempt to

broaden our understanding of teachers' capacity and practice in school, looking at the extent to which teachers had been able to put TEGINT training in participatory methods, HIV and gender into action. **We did not find a clear statistical relationship between teacher qualifications, teacher engagement and girls' empowerment.** In Tanzania, there is a positive correlation between girls' empowerment and teacher qualifications, but not teacher engagement; in Nigeria teacher engagement, but not teacher qualifications, correlate with girls' empowerment (Table 9).

Table 9: Correlation between girls' empowerment, teacher qualification and teacher engagement

|          | Correlation co-efficient between Teacher qualification level and girls' empowerment index | Correlation between teacher engagement & girls empowerment |
|----------|---|--|
| Nigeria  | 0.06  | 0.33**   |
| Tanzania | 0.32*   | -0.02  |

Significance: \*\*\*  $p < 0.01$ ; \*\*  $p < 0.05$ , \*  $p < 0.1$

This data suggests that equitable and adequate deployment of teachers and enhanced levels of training are necessary, but not solely sufficient to support girls' empowerment. More work is needed to investigate how girls' empowerment is linked with teachers' conditions (pay, housing, professional support), and status. The TEGINT baseline research and a number of other studies note the significance of women teachers in enhancing girls' education and empowerment (Plan, 2012). This needs further investigation in relation to results from the TEGINT endline study.



### 3.4 School management, funding and community mobilisation

Between 2008 and 2012 there were increases in the aggregated gender management profile for all the schools working with the project. **Schools were taking more action on gender in 2012:** conducting more outreach in communities, monitoring gendered enrolment, pupil and teacher performance and attendance, undertaking campaigning work and engaging in training activities with teachers and parents. There was some variation between states/districts, often associated with the level of intervention, as the country reports detail, and between rural and urban schools.

Table 10: Gender Management Profile change

|          | Baseline 2008 | Endline 2012 |
|----------|---------------|--------------|
| Tanzania | 0.40          | 0.53         |
| Nigeria  | 0.46          | 0.54         |

A project assumption was that improvements in gender management would support girls in disclosing gender based violence, in addition to contributing to prevention and protection. Table 11 details girls' responses to a question regarding what actions they would take if they experienced a sexual assault.

Table 11: Girls challenging violence: responses to hypothetical sexual assault

|                             | % girls by response to sexual assault |         |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------|
|                             | Tanzania                              | Nigeria |
| Tell a friend               | 14                                    | 28      |
| Tell mother/father/guardian | 53                                    | 41      |
| Tell teacher                | 57                                    | 35      |
| Tell matron of girls' club  | 25                                    | 23      |
| Tell police                 | 33                                    | 16      |
| Tell village chair          | 3                                     | 1       |
| Tell close relatives        | 1                                     | 1       |
| Tell no one                 | 2                                     | 12      |

**The vast majority of girls will tell someone about violence, which signposts a shift during the project.** Although we do not have fully comparable data from the baseline, other studies across Africa suggest very low levels of reporting of violence, even to informal networks such as family and friends (Parkes and Heslop, 2011), whereas this data suggests that nearly all girls would report onwards. The slightly higher proportions of girls in Nigeria who would tell no-one may have some association with the lower levels of confidence in relation to gender equality and bodily integrity as outlined in section 3.2.

In both countries, the surveys of teachers, head teachers and school management committees indicated that community circle members, SMC members and Head teachers who reported incidences of gender-based violence in the last year reported through formal rather than informal structures. This is a positive change since the baseline. In Tanzania, girls' confidence in reporting violence correlated positively with schools' capacity to respond. Whilst we have not collected sufficient evidence to assess to what extent systems are able to respond more effectively to violence this data suggests perception and behaviour shifts towards breaking silences and challenging violence have been taking place during the project.

Primary education in Tanzania and Nigeria are nominally free. However, the baseline research indicated a very wide range of charges being made by the project schools and a wide variation between districts and states. It also established a detrimental effect of school levies on girls' attendance and progression in schools (Unterhalter and Heslop, 2011).

The endline research indicates that **parental contributions to schools via various levies charged have not reduced in the last five years**. 97% of Head teachers, 93% SBMC members and 93% of girls in Nigeria, 87% of Head teachers, 92% of SMC member and 100% of girls in Tanzania said levies have either stayed the same or increased. We can relate this to the large proportions of girls in both countries who still see poverty as the biggest obstacles to reaching their desired level of education.

The most frequently mentioned reason for levies going up is increases in school running costs because school development plans are more ambitious. However, inflation, reduction in government development grants to schools and reduction in the subventions to schools all contribute to increased charges to parents. Among the minority who said that levies had declined, 50% of SBMC members said it was because they had made demands associated with the right to free education.



## 4.0 Conclusions and recommendations

This cross country summary of the findings from the endline study conducted for the TEGINT project highlights a number of issues of particular pertinence to the community of policy makers, practitioners, and researchers concerned with gender equality, rights and girls' education.

Firstly, the considerable expansion of education provision at primary and junior secondary levels enhances girls' enrolment, attendance, progression, attainment and empowerment. However, there are regional and locational differences, and the effects of the emergence of private schools on gender equality and girls' empowerment merit careful scrutiny. It is a matter of concern, that despite the introduction of free primary education, schools continue to charge levies and that the costs of improving education are being passed down to the poorest.

Secondly, there are clear indications that girls' clubs provide an important space for girls to learn about their rights and develop confidence to articulate solutions to their problems. This is the case both when girls in clubs are higher performing girls in terms of class position and for more marginalised girls. Thus girls' clubs which focus on girls' rights and gender equality, widely used in many projects throughout Africa but not till now well evaluated, appear an important strategy to continue to support.

Thirdly, rurality appears as a particular condition of marginalisation, associated with higher levels of gender inequality. This is evident from the lower levels of girls' empowerment in rural schools, and persistent gender gaps in progression and educational outcomes at school. Thus particularly engaged interventions are needed with girls in remote areas to support empowerment.

Fourthly, while improving teacher qualifications and engagement with gender equality is a necessary condition for enhancing education rights for all children, this is not a stand-alone intervention, and needs to be supported by other initiatives, associated with teachers' pay, work conditions and status.

Fifthly, an intervention like TEGINT seems to be particularly useful in helping to break the silence around gender based violence. However, such an intervention cannot be seen in isolation from work on other aspects of gender inequalities, poverty, and limited social provision. In a country like Tanzania, where there is more legislation and political action around gender equality than in Nigeria, girls, even the poorest, appear more knowledgeable about rights. Gender equality and girls' education cannot thus be separated from other initiatives on rights, social development and addressing injustice.

The cross country analysis has generated six major recommendations:

1. The project interventions on girls' clubs, work with teachers, community circles and school management structures is very promising for enhancing girls' capacity to understand and claim rights;
2. More research and analysis is needed on how to address challenges of early marriage by girls, parents, school communities, and policy makers at local and national levels;
3. More research is needed on how teachers support girls' education and gender equality, particularly looking at whether features of teachers conditions, for example pay, status, and management are salient.
4. The persistence of levies, despite the abolition of fees is a matter of considerable concern. The ways in which these levies might be associated with the stigmatisation and exclusion of children who cannot pay, and acts of gender-based violence, merits investigation;

5. The conduct of comparative cross country studies for TEGINT was somewhat hindered by the paucity of school administrative data, particularly in Nigeria. There is an important need to enhance schools' and Local government education authorities' capacity to collect, store and analyse administrative data;
6. The analysis of the wealth of data collected was supported by the use of the composite indices. Many of these rely on data that is already routinely collected or information that could be collected using household surveys. International comparative indices of girls' empowerment, gender profiles, and teacher qualification would help build the informational base for further development co-operation in relation to gender equality and girls' education.

## References

- Eldridge, G. (2009) Low-cost private education: impacts on achieving universal primary education *Compare* Vol. 40, 1: 129-130.
- John, J.C. (2009) 'What is the difference between quality of education provided by government and private primary schools in Tanzania?' MPhil thesis, University of Oslo.
- Parkes, J & Heslop, J (2011) *Stop Violence Against Girls in School: A cross country analysis of baseline research from Ghana, Kenya and Mozambique*. ActionAid, Johannesburg.
- Plan (2012) *Learning for Life. The State of the World's Girls 2012* London: Plan
- Unterhalter, E. (2012) 'Inequality, capabilities and poverty in four African countries: Girls' voice, schooling, and strategies for institutional change' *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 42, 3, 307-325.
- Unterhalter, E & Heslop, J (2011) *Transforming education for girls in Nigeria and Tanzania (TEGINT): A cross country analysis of baseline research*. ActionAid, Johannesburg.
- Wetheridge, L. and Kapaya, O. (2012) *Transforming education for girls in Nigeria: Endline research summary report*. London: ActionAid.
- Wetheridge, L. and Mamedu, A. (2012) *Transforming education for girls in Tanzania: Endline research summary report*. London: ActionAid.

## Appendix: TEGINT Composite Indices

### A. Intervention Index (school level)

A composite index that looks at how 3 main project interventions worked together. The intervention index was calculated from:

Sub-index: Girls' clubs

- how long girls' club has been running (Matron instrument)
- how often it meets (Matron instrument)
- how long exchange programme running and the number of visits arranged (PO instrument)
- number of girls attending last 2 meetings (Matron)
- range of activities covered in girls' club (Matron)

Sub-index: Teacher training

- how long, and how much training in HIV (PO, Head teacher & Teacher instruments)
- how long, and how much training in gender (PO, Head teacher & Teacher instruments),
- how long and how much training in participatory teaching (PO, Head teacher & Teacher instruments)

Sub-index: SMC support

- how long and how much training for SMC (PO, SMC, HT instruments)
- how much training given to community circle (Community circle instrument)

### B. Gender Profile

This was used to calculate girls' enrolment, progression & attainment relative to boys comparing the baseline, endline, by district, and in terms of what girls say and other variables. In **Tanzania** it was calculated as a composite of:

- Gender parity in girls to boys enrolled in Classes 1-7 in 2012.
- Gender parity in the proportions of girls to boys enrolled in Classes 1-7 in 2012 who were attending on February 15th 2012.
- Gender parity in proportions of girls compared with proportions of boys who progressed from junior primary (Class 1) to senior primary (Class 5) between 2008 and 2012.
- Gender parity in the proportion of Class 7 girls compared with Class 7 boys who were entered for end of primary school exams in 2011.
- Gender parity in the proportions of girls compared with boys entered for Class 7 exams who then passed Class 7 exams in 2011.
- Gender parity in proportions of girls compared with proportions of boys who were retained between Class 1 in 2005 and Class 7 in 2011.
- Gender parity in proportions of girls compared with proportions of boys who progressed from Class 2 (in 2005) and went on to pass Class 7 exams (in 2011).

In **Nigeria** the index was calculated differently because of the large amount of missing data for some variables. It included:

Primary schools:

- GPI enrolment.
- GPI attendance.

- GPI progression proxy (the proportion of all girls enrolled in a school who are enrolled in P6 compared with the proportion of all boys enrolled in a school who are enrolled in P6).
- GPI exam entry (proportion of girls enrolled in P6 who are entered for the P6 exam compared with proportion of boys enrolled in P6 who are entered for the P6 exam).

JSS schools:

- GPI enrolment.
- GPI progression proxy (the proportion of all girls enrolled in JSS1 who are enrolled in JSS 3 compared with the proportion of all boys enrolled in JSS1 who are enrolled in JSS 3).
- GPI Completion proxy (the proportion of all girls enrolled in JSS1 who are entered for the exam in JSS 3 compared with the proportion of all boys enrolled in JSS1 who are entered for the exam in JSS 3).

GPI Performance (the proportion of girls entered for the JSS3 exam who pass in all subjects compared with the proportion of boys entered for the JSS3 exam who pass in all subjects).

Weighting: Enrolment indicators were weighted x 1; attendance, progression and exam entry indicators weighted x 2; indicators related to the *passing* of exams weighted x 3.

### **C. Gender Management Profile**

This enables calculation of activities of SMC, Head Teacher in outreach, training, responses to violence, presence of women in key committees; how these have changed relative to baseline, by district, and in terms of what girls say, and other composite variables. This was calculated from:

(i) Interviews with Head teachers

- Work with the following disadvantaged groups in the community on girls' education in 2011:
  - Pastoralists/ nomads
  - Families who have children living with a disability
  - Families who cannot pay school fees
  - Girls involved in hawking or household chores
  - Orphans or vulnerable children
  - Children infected with or affected by HIV/ AIDS
  - Children of internally displaced persons or refugees
- Provision of workshops for teachers, parents and SMC members on school funding, employing teachers, improving girls' enrolment and attendance and HIV/ AIDS.

(ii) Interviews with teachers

- Averages calculated for all teachers interviewed within each school on the extent to which they had received training on HIV/AIDS and gender and education/ girls' schooling *in the last 3 years*. Data on the extent to which training received had been put into practice was included.

(ii) Interviews with SMC members

- Attendance at workshops on: HIV/AIDS, gender, school management, the Millennium Development Goals/ Education for All, reproductive health, budget tracking and resource mobilisation *in the last 3 years*.
- Work on girls' education with key disadvantaged groups in the community (as listed above for head teachers)

- Action in 2011 in the following areas:
  - Monitoring school enrolments
  - Checking on attendance
  - Monitoring numbers passing exams
  - Checking on gender balance in exam passes
  - Contacting families where children do not attend
  - Ensuring teachers both teach lessons and mark homework
  - Encouraging action on HIV/AIDS and gender equality
  - *Other – e.g. providing school lunches*

(iii) Interviews with girls

As with data for teachers, averages were calculated for all (usually 10) girls interviewed in each school on the extent to which:

- detailed information on HIV/AIDS had been given (e.g. information on HIV transmission and prevention, use of condoms, where to get help, and stigma and discrimination);
- detailed information on girls' and women's rights had been given (e.g. the right to stay at school, not to be married before 18, to participate in school governing bodies and to hold senior positions within government).

#### **D. Girls' Empowerment Index**

A new indicator to bring together information on girls' confidence and allows us to see whether project interventions align with particular levels of girls' empowerment, how gender profiles and teacher qualifications align with girls' empowerment. This was calculated from:

- the range of obstacles and solutions girls identify – weighted;
- knowledge of HIV, attitudes towards HIV (non-discrimination, negotiating safer sex);
- knowledge of and attitudes towards gender equity and violence;
- level of confidence dealing with gender-based violence.

#### **E. Teachers' Qualification profile**

Schools were grouped in terms of the proportion of teachers (women and men) with particular levels of qualification. This allowed us to see changes from baseline and relationship with other composite variables. In **Tanzania** it was calculated from:

- % of teachers in the school with III B x 1
- % of teachers in the school with III A x 2
- % of teachers in the school with Diploma x 3
- % of teachers in the school with Degree x 4

In Nigeria it was calculated from:

- % of teachers in the school with TSC 2/ SSCE GCE x 1
- % of teachers in the school with OND x 2
- % of teachers in the school with HND/degree x 3

#### **F. Teacher Engagement profile**

This is a new profile that allows us to see at school level whether teachers have been able to use their training. This was calculated as follows:

- whether and how (i.e. range of activities) teachers report putting HIV, gender and participatory teaching training into practice (Teachers instrument)
- Girls' experience of participatory teaching (Girls instrument)
- Girls' reports that they have received information on HIV and gender and the range of topics covered (Girls instrument).