Measurement of the $D^+$-meson production cross section at low transverse momentum in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV


(CDF Collaboration)

2470-0010/2017/95(9)/092006(8) 092006-1 © 2017 American Physical Society
Institute of Physics, Academia Sinica, Taipei, Taiwan 11529, Republic of China

Argonne National Laboratory, Argonne, Illinois 60439, USA

University of Athens, 157 71 Athens, Greece

Institut de Fisica d’Altes Energies, ICREA, Universitat Autonoma de Barcelona, E-08193 Bellaterra (Barcelona), Spain

Baylor University, Waco, Texas 76798, USA

Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare Bologna, I-40127 Bologna, Italy

University of Bologna, I-40127 Bologna, Italy

University of California, Davis, Davis, California 95616, USA

University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California 90024, USA

Instituto de Fisica de Cantabria, CSIC-University of Cantabria, 39005 Santander, Spain

Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15213, USA

Enrico Fermi Institute, University of Chicago, Chicago, Illinois 60637, USA

Comenius University, 842 48 Bratislava, Slovakia; Institute of Experimental Physics, 040 01 Kosice, Slovakia

Joint Institute for Nuclear Research, RU-141980 Dubna, Russia

Duke University, Durham, North Carolina 27708, USA

Fermi National Accelerator Laboratory, Batavia, Illinois 60510, USA

University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida 32611, USA

Laboratori Nazionali di Frascati, Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare, I-00044 Frascati, Italy

University of Geneva, CH-1211 Geneva 4, Switzerland

Glasgow University, Glasgow G12 8QQ, United Kingdom

Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138, USA

Division of High Energy Physics, Department of Physics, University of Helsinki, FIN-00014, Helsinki, Finland;

Helsinki Institute of Physics, FIN-00014 Helsinki, Finland

University of Illinois, Urbana, Illinois 61801, USA

The Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland 21218, USA

Institut für Experimentelle Kernphysik, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, D-76131 Karlsruhe, Germany

Center for High Energy Physics: Kyungpook National University, Daegu 702-701, Korea;

Seoul National University, Seoul 151-742, Korea;

Sungkyunkwan University, Suwon 440-746, Korea;

Korea Institute of Science and Technology Information, Daejeon 305-806, Korea;

Chonnam National University, Gwangju 500-757, Korea;

Chonbuk National University, Jeonju 561-766, Korea;

Ewha Womans University, Seoul 120-750, Korea

Ernest Orlando Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, California 94720, USA

University of Liverpool, Liverpool L69 7ZE, United Kingdom

University College London, London WC1E 6BT, United Kingdom

Centro de Investigaciones Energéticas Medioambientales y Tecnológicas, E-28040 Madrid, Spain

Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02139, USA

University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109, USA

Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan 48824, USA

Institution for Theoretical and Experimental Physics, ITEP, Moscow 117259, Russia

University of New Mexico, Albuquerque, New Mexico 87131, USA

The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio 43210, USA

Okayama University, Okayama 700-8530, Japan

Osaka City University, Osaka 558-8585, Japan

University of Oxford, Oxford OX1 3RH, United Kingdom

Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare, Sezione di Padova, I-35131 Padova, Italy

University of Padova, I-35131 Padova, Italy

University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104, USA

Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare Pisa, I-56127 Pisa, Italy

University of Pisa, I-56127 Pisa, Italy

University of Siena, I-56127 Pisa, Italy

Scuola Normale Superiore, I-56127 Pisa, Italy

INFN Pavia, I-27100 Pavia, Italy

University of Pavia, I-27100 Pavia, Italy

University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15260, USA

Purdue University, West Lafayette, Indiana 47907, USA

T. AALTONEN et al. PHYSICAL REVIEW D 95, 092006 (2017)

092006-2
We report on a measurement of the $D^+$-meson production cross section as a function of transverse momentum ($p_T$) in proton-antiproton ($p\bar{p}$) collisions at 1.96 TeV center-of-mass energy, using the full data set collected by the Collider Detector at Fermilab in Tevatron Run II and corresponding to $10^{{fb}^{-1}}$ of integrated luminosity. We use $D^+ \rightarrow K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ decays fully reconstructed in the central rapidity region $|y| < 1$ with transverse momentum down to 1.5 GeV/$c$, a range previously unexplored in $p\bar{p}$ collisions. Inelastic $p\bar{p}$-scattering events are selected online using minimally biasing requirements followed by an optimized offline selection. The $K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ mass distribution is used to identify the $D^+$ signal, and the $D^+$

---

Deceased.

aUniversity of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC V6T 1Z1, Canada.
bIstituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare, Sezione di Cagliari, 09042 Monrepò (Cagliari), Italy.
cUniversity of California Irvine, Irvine, CA 92697, USA.
dInstitute of Physics, Academy of Sciences of the Czech Republic, 182 21, Czech Republic.
eCERN, CH-1211 Geneva, Switzerland.
fCornell University, Ithaca, NY 14853, USA.
gUniversity of Cyprus, Nicosia CY-1678, Cyprus.
hOffice of Science, U.S. Department of Energy, Washington, DC 20585, USA.
iUniversity College Dublin, Dublin 4, Ireland.
jETH, 8092 Zürich, Switzerland.
kUniversity of Fukui, Fukui City, Fukui Prefecture, Japan 910-0017.
lUniversidad Iberoamericana, Lomas de Santa Fe, México, C.P. 01219, Distrito Federal.
mUniversity of Iowa, Iowa City, IA 52242, USA.
nKinki University, Higashi-Osaka City, Japan 577-8502.
oKansas State University, Manhattan, KS 66506, USA.
pBrookhaven National Laboratory, Upton, NY 11973, USA.
qIstituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare, Sezione di Lecce, Via Arnesano, 1-73100 Lecce, Italy.
rQueen Mary, University of London, London, E1 4NS, United Kingdom.
sUniversity of Melbourne, Victoria 3010, Australia.
tMuons, Inc., Batavia, IL 60510, USA.
uNagasaki Institute of Applied Science, Nagasaki 851-0193, Japan.
vNational Research Nuclear University, Moscow 115409, Russia.
wNorthwestern University, Evanston, IL 60208, USA.
xUniversity of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN 46556, USA.
yUniversidad de Oviedo, E-33007 Oviedo, Spain.
zCNRS-IN2P3, Paris, F-75205 France.
baUniversidad Tecnica Federico Santa Maria, 110v Valparaiso, Chile.
bbSejong University, Seoul 143-747, Korea.
cThe University of Jordan, Amman 11942, Jordan.
dUniversité catholique de Louvain, 1348 Louvain-La-Neuve, Belgium.
eUniversity of Zürich, 8006 Zürich, Switzerland.
fMassachusetts General Hospital, Boston, MA 02114 USA.
gHarvard Medical School, Boston, MA 02114 USA.
hHampton University, Hampton, VA 23668, USA.
iLos Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, NM 87544, USA.
jjUniversità degli Studi di Napoli Federico II, I-80138 Napoli, Italy.
transverse impact-parameter distribution is used to separate prompt production, occurring directly in the hard-scattering process, from secondary production from $b$-hadron decays. We obtain a prompt $D^+$ signal of 2950 candidates corresponding to a total cross section $\sigma(D^+, 1.5 < p_T < 14.5 \text{ GeV}/c, |y| < 1) = 71.9 \pm 6.8(\text{stat}) \pm 9.3(\text{syst}) \mu b$. While the measured cross sections are consistent with theoretical estimates in each $p_T$ bin, the shape of the observed $p_T$ spectrum is softer than the expectation from quantum chromodynamics. The results are unique in $p\bar{p}$ collisions and can improve the shape and uncertainties of future predictions.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevD.95.092006

Measurements of cross sections for the production of hadrons containing bottom or charm quarks (heavy flavors) in hadron collisions offer fundamental information to test and refine phenomenological models of the strong interaction at small momentum transfer, a regime in which perturbative expansions are challenging. In addition, in searches for astrophysical neutrinos, knowledge of charm production cross sections has been demonstrated [1] to improve estimates for background rates from neutrino production cross sections. The program continued during Tevatron Run II energy bins of integrated luminosity.

The first studies of heavy-flavor production performed at the Tevatron proton-antiproton ($p\bar{p}$) collider in 1992–1996 [2] yielded cross sections significantly larger than the predicted values [3] and prompted a dedicated effort in refining calculations [4], which resulted in reduced discrepancies. The program continued during Tevatron Run II (2001–2011), including first measurements of charm-meson cross sections using $p\bar{p}$ collisions at center-of-mass energy $\sqrt{s} = 1.96 \text{ TeV}$ [5]. Since 2010, CERN’s LHC $pp$ collider has replaced the Tevatron as the most prolific charm-meson source, allowing the ALICE and LHCb experiments to report measurements of charm cross sections at $\sqrt{s} = 2.76–13.00 \text{ TeV}$ [6].

Measurements based on $p\bar{p}$ collisions, and probing different collision energies, remain essential to extend the understanding of QCD, because differing admixtures of parton-level processes contribute at different energies and initial states. Previous measurements in $p\bar{p}$ collisions [5] were restricted to mesons with transverse momentum $p_T > 6.0 \text{ GeV}/c$ because of the transverse-momentum thresholds used in the online event selection (trigger). The transverse momentum is the momentum component in the plane transverse to the beam. Extending the reach to lower $p_T$, hence further into the nonperturbative regime, provides novel and unique constraints to improve QCD phenomenological models.

In this paper, we report on a measurement of the production cross section for $D^+$ mesons down to 1.5 GeV/$c$ $p_T$, a range unexplored in $p\bar{p}$ collisions, and unlikely to be explored in the foreseeable future with this initial state. The measurement is performed as a function of meson transverse momentum using $D^+ \rightarrow K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ decays reconstructed in the full CDF Run II data set, corresponding to 10 fb$^{-1}$ of integrated luminosity. Throughout this paper, charge-conjugate decays are implied. Candidate $D^+$ signal events are selected from a minimum-bias sample, collected by imposing minimal requirements on the event features in order to minimize biases on the physics properties of charm decays. Events are divided into independent subsamples ($p_T$ bins) according to the $D^+$ candidate $p_T$. In each, we apply a data-driven optimization of the offline selection and perform a two-dimensional simultaneous fit of the resulting distributions of the $K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ mass and $D^+$ impact parameter, defined as the minimum transverse distance between a particle’s trajectory and the beam. The fit determines, for each $p_T$ bin, the prompt $D^+$ yield ($D^+$ mesons directly produced in the $p\bar{p}$ interaction or originating from charm resonances) by statistically subtracting secondary $D^+$ candidates ($D^+$ mesons originating from $b$-hadron decays). Each prompt yield is combined with the corresponding reconstruction and selection efficiencies, derived using simulation, to determine the cross section,

$$
\sigma_i = \frac{N_i}{\int \mathcal{L} dt \cdot \epsilon_i \cdot B}.
$$

where $N_i$ is the observed number of prompt $D^+$ and $D^{-}$ mesons in the $i$th $p_T$ bin. The factor $1/2$ is included because both $D^+$ and $D^-$ mesons contribute to $N_i$, and we report results solely for $D^+$, assuming charge-symmetric production of charm quarks in the strong $p\bar{p}$ interaction. The integrated luminosity $\int \mathcal{L} dt$ is normalized to an inelastic cross section of $\sigma_{pp} = 60.7 \pm 2.4 \text{ mb}$ [7], and $\epsilon_i$ is the global detection, reconstruction, and selection efficiency. The branching fraction used for the $D^+ \rightarrow K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ decay is $B = (9.46 \pm 0.24)\%$ [8].

The CDF II detector is a multipurpose magnetic spectrometer surrounded by calorimeters and muon detectors [9]. It is roughly cylindrically symmetric around the beams and is described in a cylindrical coordinate system with the $z$ axis along the incident proton beam direction. The detector components relevant for this analysis are as follows. A silicon microstrip vertex detector and a cylindrical open-cell drift chamber immersed in a nearly uniform 1.4 T axial magnetic field allow the reconstruction of charged-particle trajectories (tracks) in the pseudorapidity...
range $|\eta| < 1$. The vertex detector contains seven concentric layers of single- and double-sided silicon sensors at radii between 1.5 and 22 cm, each providing a position measurement with up to 15 (70) $\mu$m resolution in the azimuthal (longitudinal) direction [10]. The drift chamber has 96 measurement layers, located between 40 and 137 cm in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11]. The transverse momentum is determined in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11]. The transverse momentum is determined in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11].

The transverse momentum is determined in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11]. The transverse momentum is determined in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11]. The transverse momentum is determined in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11]. The transverse momentum is determined in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11]. The transverse momentum is determined in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11].

The vertex detector contains seven concentric layers of single- and double-sided silicon sensors at radii between 1.5 and 22 cm, each providing a position measurement with up to 15 (70) $\mu$m resolution in the azimuthal (longitudinal) direction [10]. The drift chamber has 96 measurement layers, located between 40 and 137 cm in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11]. The transverse momentum is determined in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11]. The transverse momentum is determined in radius, organized into alternating axial and $\pm 2^\circ$ stereo superlayers [11].

The minimum-bias trigger accepts a 3 (1) Hz maximum rates. The large level, the minimum-bias trigger applies no requirements yielding inelastic interactions. At the second (third) trigger level, the minimum-bias trigger detects hard-scatter interactions and measures luminosity [12]. CDF has a three-level trigger system. We use events collected by the zero- and minimum-bias triggers, which are designed to collect events while introducing minimal bias in the properties of the particles produced in the collision. The zero-bias trigger applies no selection requirements and accepts a $10^{-6}$ fraction (prescale factor) of $p\bar{p}$ crossings, randomly chosen. At the first trigger level, the minimum-bias trigger accepts a $10^{-5}$ prescale fraction of the events in which a time coincidence between signals in the CLC at opposite sides of the interaction region is detected, which enriches the sample in $p\bar{p}$ crossings that yield inelastic interactions. At the second (third) trigger level, the minimum-bias trigger applies no requirements and accepts events with 3 (1) Hz maximum rates. The large prescale factors and accept-rate reductions avoid saturation of the data-writing rate. The resulting samples contain 183 million zero-bias and 133 million minimum-bias events. Of these, 409 events are common to both samples and used only once in the analysis.

The offline reconstruction of $D^+ \rightarrow K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ candidates is based solely on tracking information without using particle identification. The same-charge particles are identified on one subsample to the other half of the sample. The optimized criteria vary in the ranges $p_{T,\text{min}} > 0.6$–1.1 GeV/c, $L_{xy} > 600$–700 $\mu$m, and $\chi^2 < 2$–7, depending on the subsample and $p_T$ bin. The $K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ mass distribution of the resulting sample, summed over the full $p_T$ range, is shown in Fig. 1. A prominent narrow peak of approximately 3400 $D^+ \rightarrow K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ decays, comprising both prompt signal and secondary charm candidates, overlaps a smooth background dominated by combinatorics. In each $p_T$ bin, we determine the yield of prompt $D^+$ decays using a simultaneous maximum-likelihood fit to the unbinned distributions of $K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ mass, to separate $D^+$ decays from combinatorics, and $D^+$ impact parameter, to separate prompt from secondary $D^+$ decays. The fit model is a linear combination of probability density functions
(PDFs) for a prompt $D^+$ signal, secondary $D^+$, and combinatorial background, each consisting of the product of mass and impact-parameter PDFs. In the mass PDF, prompt and secondary components are modeled jointly with a Gaussian function determined from simulation; the background PDF is a second-order polynomial function derived empirically from regions with $D^+$ mass in $1.7–1.8$ or $1.9–2.0$ GeV/c$^2$ (sidebands). In the impact-parameter PDF, the prompt (secondary) component is modeled with the sum of three narrow (broad) Gaussian distributions determined using simulation, whereas the background is modeled with a combination of Gaussian shapes that empirically reproduce the impact-parameter distribution of sideband events. The only free parameters in the fit are the numbers of prompt $D^+$ (signal) decays and secondary $D^+$ decays. Tests on simplified simulated experiments show that the fit estimates are unbiased and have proper Gaussian uncertainties. Figure 2 shows examples of fits in two $p_T$ bins, $2.5 < p_T < 3.5$ GeV/c and $6.5 < p_T < 14.5$ GeV/c. A total signal of approximately 2950 prompt $D^+$ decays is obtained. The observed fraction of secondary decays is typically 15% of the total $D^+$ yield but ranges between 0% and 40% with large uncertainties, depending on $p_T$. We vary the signal and background models, and their parameters, and attribute systematic uncertainties on prompt-signal yields accordingly. The uncertainties associated with the impact-parameter model, resulting from individual variations of primary, secondary, and background shapes, are in the range 0.9%–1.5%, depending on the candidate $p_T$. These dominate over the 0.10%–0.3% variations associated with the mass resolution-shape model.

We factorize the reconstruction efficiency $\epsilon_i$, relative to the $i$th $p_T$ bin, into the product of the trigger efficiency, the offline efficiency for reconstructing three tracks that meet the quality and fiducial requirements in the drift chamber, the offline efficiency for assigning the information from the silicon detector to these tracks, and the efficiency of the offline selection requirements. The zero-bias trigger efficiency is 100% by construction. The minimum-bias trigger efficiency is determined to be $(98.8^{+0.2}_{-0.4})\%$ from the ratio of $D^+$ signal yields observed in zero-bias events that meet, or fail, the minimum-bias requirements. All offline efficiencies are known to be reproduced accurately by the simulation [13] except for the term associated with the silicon detector. We therefore use efficiencies derived from simulation as inputs for the measurement and use control samples of data to obtain systematic uncertainties that cover potential data-simulation discrepancies in the silicon-related efficiency. Offline efficiencies ranging from 0.27% to 7.5% are determined from simulated events containing $D^+ \rightarrow K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ decays, in which distributions are weighted so that the multiplicity of prompt vertices reproduces the distribution observed in data. Control
samples of muons from $J/\psi \to \mu^+\mu^-$ decays and low-momentum pions from $D^{+}\to D^{0}(\to K^-\pi^+\pi^+)\pi^+$ decays, in which only drift-chamber information is used to select and reconstruct the charged particle, are used to determine silicon efficiencies as functions of charged-particle $p_T$ and data-taking time from the fraction of charged particles that also meet the silicon requirements. The results are compared with silicon efficiencies determined in simulation, and the maximum observed deviation, 3.7%, is used as the systematic uncertainty on the per-track efficiency, resulting in an 11.5% uncertainty common to all $D^+$ transverse-momentum bins. This is the largest systematic uncertainty. Additional systematic uncertainties associated with imperfect descriptions of multitrack efficiency correlations, ionization energy loss, and hadronic interactions in the inner tracker material are negligible. Repeating the measurement on independent subsamples of data split according to data-taking time and the $D$ candidate charge shows no evidence of residual biases.

The measured differential cross sections, averaged over each $p_T$ bin and integrated over the rapidity range $|y| < 1$, are shown in Table I and displayed in Fig. 3. The observed cross sections are compatible with those predicted in recent calculations [14] and with those determined in early Run II using an independent data set [5].

The total cross section for the production of $D^+$ mesons in the kinematic range $1.5 < p_T < 14.5$ GeV/c and $|y| < 1$, obtained by summing over all $p_T$ bins, is $71.9 \pm 6.8 \pm 9.3 \mu$b, where the first contribution to the uncertainty is statistical and the second is systematic.

In summary, we report on a measurement of the prompt $D^+$-meson production cross section, as a function of transverse momentum, in proton-antiproton collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV, using the full data set collected by the CDF experiment in Tevatron Run II, and corresponding to 10 fb$^{-1}$ of integrated luminosity. We use prompt $D^+ \to K^-\pi^+\pi^+$ decays with transverse momenta down to 1.5 GeV/c fully reconstructed in the central rapidity region $|y| < 1$. The differential cross section is averaged in each $p_T$ bin and integrated over the $D^+$ rapidity interval $|y| < 1$. The total cross section is $\sigma(D^+, 1.5 < p_T < 14.5$ GeV/c,$|y| < 1) = 71.9 \pm 6.8 (\text{stat}) \pm 9.3 (\text{syst}) \mu$b. The results are unique in that they probe strong-interaction dynamics in a low-$p_T$ regime unexplored in charm-meson production from proton-antiproton collisions. At higher transverse momentum, where previous measurement are available, the current measurements agree with earlier results [5]. While the individual measurement points lie within the band of theoretical uncertainty, the experimental spectrum is systematically shifted to high $p_T$ values as compared with theory. This motivates the calculation of theoretical cross sections that include next-to-next-to-leading-order corrections, which are missing in current predictions thus contributing a large fraction of their uncertainty. Comparison of our results with higher-order predictions will further refine the shape of the theoretical cross section as a function of transverse momentum and reduce its uncertainty. The results are also helpful for understanding backgrounds in astrophysical ultra-high energy neutrino experiments, where the contributions from charm hadrons produced in the interaction of cosmic rays and atmospheric nuclei are the dominant background.

We thank the Fermilab staff and the technical staffs of the participating institutions for their vital contributions. This work was supported by the U.S. Department of Energy and National Science Foundation; the Italian Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare; the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology of Japan; the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada; the National Science Council of the Republic of China; the Swiss National Science Foundation; the A. P. Sloan

### Table I

| $p_T$ range (GeV/c) | Eff. $p_T$ (GeV/c) | $d\sigma(D^+, |y| < 1)/dp_T$ ($\mu$b/GeV/c) | $\sigma(D^+, |y| < 1)$ ($\mu$b) |
|---------------------|-------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------|
| 1.5–2.5             | 2.04              | 32.7 ± 6.5 ± 4.2               | 32.7 ± 6.5 ± 4.2             |
| 2.5–3.5             | 2.98              | 20.6 ± 1.8 ± 2.7               | 20.6 ± 1.8 ± 2.7             |
| 3.5–4.5             | 3.97              | 9.5 ± 0.8 ± 1.2                | 9.5 ± 0.8 ± 1.2              |
| 4.5–6.5             | 5.38              | 3.2 ± 0.3 ± 0.4                | 6.5 ± 0.5 ± 0.8              |
| 6.5–14.5            | 9.19              | 0.34 ± 0.03 ± 0.04             | 2.69 ± 0.22 ± 0.35           |
Foundation; the Bundesministerium für Bildung und Forschung, Germany; the Korean World Class University Program, the National Research Foundation of Korea; the Science and Technology Facilities Council and the Royal Society, United Kingdom; the Russian Foundation for Basic Research; the Ministerio de Ciencia e Innovación, and Programa Consolider-Ingenio 2010, Spain; the Slovak R&D Agency; the Academy of Finland; the Australian Research Council (ARC); and the EU community Marie Curie Fellowship Contract No. 302103.


