The ‘Aston-Makunduchi partnership’: South-North School Link – In-depth Case Study

Alison Leonard
Development Education Research Centre
Research Paper No.8

The ‘Aston-Makunduchi partnership’: South- North School Link – In-depth Case Study
Alison Leonard
Contents

Acknowledgements 2
Preface 3
Executive Summary 4
Abbreviations 6
Introduction 7
School Links and global school relationships 10
1. The scale of the linking phenomenon 10
2. The status of school links and a Development Education agenda 11
3. Three persistent issues facing links: Funding, power relations and sustainability issues 13

Part 1: Research methodology 12

Part 2: The Aston-Makunduchi Partnership's aspirations 20
1. Sustainability and community engagement, MDG 3, MDG 8 22
   (i) Spreading professional learning 22
   (ii) Extending a web of links beyond Makunduchi 24
   (iii) Income generating projects. MDG 1, MDG 3, MDG 8 24
   (iv) Avoiding a dependency culture 26
Conclusions 31

2. Appropriate technology and capacity building. MDG 1, MDG 7, MDG 8. 32

3. Critical Global Citizenship Education. MDG 2, MDG 7, MDG 8. 34
Example 1 Challenging the stereotypes 38
Example 2 Students' educational attainment, aspirations and values 38
Example 3 Professional learning related to education 41
Example 4 Accommodating dissent: informed, responsible decision-making 42

Part 3: Conclusion from research findings 44
Future challenges facing this link 46
Five recommendations 47
References 50
Author 60
Acknowledgements

The purpose of this research report is to stimulate debate and discussion and to identify existing research on school links, as well as outline some potential outcomes for global learning and development education.

The evidence covered in this research report is largely based on one example of a Southern school’s experiences of a school link. I would like to thank all those interviewed in the global South for allowing me to use their responses. Another important component of the evidence covered is based on discussions and work conducted by Masters level students: Andy Egan, Kathryn McNicholl, Dominic Regester, Sigrid Schell-Straub, Robert Unwin; I would like to thank them for allowing me to use some of their material.

I would also like to thank Doug Bourn from the Institute of Education; Cathryn MacCallam, Director of Sazani Associates, a Welsh NGO working in Tanzania; Aniko Varpalotai, of the University of Western Ontario and trustee of TEMBO, a Canadian NGO working in rural Tanzania; Ruth Najda, the British Council's Global Education Adviser and her colleague Andrea Mason, their Marketing and Communications Manager, and Hugh Morrison, for comments on various drafts of this report.

Alison Leonard
Preface

This research report produced by the Development Education Research Centre is part of a series produced with support from the Department for International Development Centre (DFID) on development education. This report that looks specifically at an international educational partnership complements earlier research reports, numbers 5 and 6, which were produced in partnership with Link Community Development.

School linking has become an important feature of the educational landscape in the UK. Its value and contribution to building support of development, to improving the quality of teaching and learning and inter-cultural understanding has been the subject of numerous publications in recent years.

This research is distinctive because it looks at one case study to a degree of depth in order to assess some of the issues and questions that have been raised elsewhere. Its conclusions and recommendations raise some major challenges for policy-makers and practitioners and which we hope will stimulate debate in schools, non-governmental organisations and higher education institutions.

Douglas Bourn
Director, Development Education Research Centre, Institute of Education
Executive Summary

This report explores one case of a South/North school link. The research is unique because it focuses on effects in a Southern school, over a twenty-year long relationship. Most of the existing literature on linking does not consider the impact of a partnership to any degree of depth, particularly in terms of the linked school in the Global South. Some teachers may want to engage in linking, but lack a clear idea of outcomes for their partner/s. Initially those in new links lack equitable dialogue with their partners; this report shows what has been achieved in a sustained relationship.

This report examines in detail how one link has evolved in a Southern community; its conclusion identifies ongoing challenges, which teachers should consider. Its analysis is particularly important because the report raises issues likely to recur in other links. It also brings to life the realities of a specific link through how it has evolved, what it means to teachers and pupils and the issues and challenges they raise.

The evidence from this in-depth case study highlights the following themes:

• Intercultural education: looking at topics and issues through different lenses, originating from the majority and the minority world.

Visitor Exchanges: between students, teachers and parents in Zanzibar and Rotherham have promoted this. The learning approaches listed below also allow this to happen.

• Locating learning within ‘real world’ examples, showing the complexity of global issues: a school link provides a personalised ‘real world’ entrée.

The Aston-Makunduchi partnership has encouraged an understanding of different perspectives, addressing tensions of power relations and inequality.

• Learning using approaches that encourage challenging of assumptions about ‘how people live’ and an understanding of the causes of inequality. Critical thinking skills can assist in addressing such challenges.

Makunduchi’s link with Aston is an appropriate context for such pedagogy.

• Exploring how assistance, aid and action may be apposite: a school link can present an appropriate context for such interventions.
Transferring Aid from North to South: in response to needs determined by local people not outsiders. Contributing to progress towards the UN's Millennium Development Goals: the link has supported local capacity building in Makunduchi.

This report challenges some of the current literature on linking:

- It shows how linked schools can engage in development beyond the confines of school premises, highlighting tensions when schools take on development initiatives.

- It emphasises the accrued advantages of exposure to native English speakers. The value attached to this benefit is of paramount importance to individuals. This position conflicts with authors critical of the domination of English as a global language.

- It reviews outcomes that have partially succeeded. It suggests that in future linked schools embarking on projects promoting development outcomes should seek advice and support from the commercial, higher education institution and non-governmental organisations sectors; they should not rely on their own resources.

- It demonstrates how participating schools may adopt educational priorities other than global learning and citizenship outcomes. It notes improvements in student attainment in Science and Mathematics attributable to school linking.

- It recommends affordable means be found to disseminate Southern advice. Southern autonomy for outcomes in this relationship conflicts with aspirations espoused by some postcolonialist authors.

A major implication is that adults in links need reflective space in which to develop relationships with their partner/s.
Abbreviations:

**CPD** Continuing Professional Development

**DE** Development Education, also referred to as Global Education

**DEC** Development Education Centre

**DFID** UK’s Department for International Development

**DGSP** DFID’s Global Schools Partnerships linking programme

**EAL** English as an additional language (non-native speakers)

**ESD** Education for Sustainable Development

**ESRC** Educational and Scientific Research Council, UK funding agency for academic research

**GD** Global Dimension

**MDG** UN Millennium Development Goal

**MSS** Makunduchi Secondary School

**NGO** Non governmental organisation, also referred to as Not for Profit organisation or INGOs, International NGOs

**OECD** Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development

**S/NELP** South/North Educational Linking Process

**STEM** Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics

**UNESCO** United Nations’ Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
Introduction

A South/North school link aspires to: a sustainable, reciprocal relationship between schools in the global South and the global North, which is embedded in the curriculum. When these characteristics are fully demonstrated these relationships can be viewed rather as partnerships (Leonard, 2008). The relationship featured in this report seeks to help a school in Zanzibar and the local people to develop their capacity and to put their own initiatives into action; it aspires to:

1. Long term commitment with full community involvement;
2. Small scale sustainability;
3. Appropriate technology;
4. Empowerment, gender equality and equal opportunities.

The aim in compiling this report is to review in depth one Southern school’s experiences of linking accumulated over a period of more than 20 years. Its purposes are to introduce readers to the context of the South/North Educational Linking Process (S/NELP), before focusing on one Southern school’s engagement, on how it demonstrates (or fails to evidence) aspects of development education (DE).

Following an introduction to school links/partnerships and Development Education, the main body of this report is structured in three parts. Part 1 outlines the methodology of the research; Part 2 examines evidence for how a link has affected one Southern school and its local community. Part 3 identifies challenges facing linking relationships in 2012; it concludes with five recommendations, comparing these to an audit based on a literature review (Leonard, Ibid).

This report is especially important to teachers, since it demonstrates the potentially controversial and complex background, including pitfalls, of a seemingly benign process of Southern schools linking with those in the North. In detail, it shows some effects that the process has had in the global South. It is intended that those new to linking can weigh up the commitment, which they are entering into, and gain access to easily sourced recent literature and advice based on educational research from others who have already studied linked schools. When research has been commissioned by Northern agencies promoting linking, the analysis often demonstrates Western hegemony (Edge et al, 2008, 2009a, 2009b, 2011a and 2011b). If the agency receives some funding from government sources such material is likely to address the political agenda pertaining at the time. If commissioned by a development NGO (Fricke, 2006; Bourn and Bain, 2012; Bourn and Cara, 2012) an emphasis on development is likely. Supporting materials
generally allude to curriculum requirements of the Northern parties. Almost universally, like this report, authorship is dominated by Northern authors.

School Linking in the UK is a fast-changing area of development education (DE). Since 2006, funded research has been commissioned by both Northern government agencies and NGOs (Fricke, 2006; Edge et al, 2011a and 2011b). Large-scale (Edge et al, 2008, 2009b; Sizmur et al, 2011) and smaller-scale surveys conducted at district education levels (Bourn and Bain, 2011; Bourn and Cara, 2012) have presented findings, but without detailed observations of how a Southern school or its local community is affected. Agencies promoting these relationships have published advisory handbooks and guides for schools (Brownlie-Bojang and Najda, 2007; Burr, 2007; British Council, 2012a1; Leeds DEC, 2006, 2012; Oxfam, 2007; Plan UK, 2011a). The most current British Council content is on the ‘Connecting Classrooms’ e-platform2. Its CPD content draws on experiences from teachers in the global South.

Others have also written about linking and carried out research, focusing on how those in the North are influenced by taking part (Brown, 2006; Burr, 2008; Cook, 2010; Disney, 2004, 2005 and 2008b; McNicholl, 2012; Pickering, 2008; Scoffham, 2007; Williams, 2006a and 2006b).

Analysis has only occasionally (Doe, 2007; Disney, 2008a; Martin and Griffiths, 2011) elaborated on how teachers, students and others in the South are affected by a S/N linking process. Responses from African users of the Connecting Classrooms’ e-platform are recent examples. An ‘in-depth’ example of a link in the global South is needed to fill this ‘gap’ in the research and literature. In that respect this current report deliberately sets out to create rich, ‘thick’ (Geertz, 1973) description and analysis, which is context specific to a Southern school, allowing an immersive process, as a researcher, to achieve a teasing out and ‘discovering’ of the data (Coffey et al, 1996).

As “an approach to learning that leads to a greater understanding of (global) inequalities, of why they exist and what can be done about them”3, through development education (DE) learners explore how global issues, such as poverty, affect their lives. Challenging stereotypes, encouraging independent thinking and seeking to “help people develop the practical skills and confidence” to bring about positive change4 are frequently inherent. In English schools there had been a curriculum basis for DE and links (Brown, 2010; Edge et al 2009a; Lambert and Morgan, 2011; QCA, 2009b), through concepts such as Global Citizenship; Social Justice and Human Rights; Sustainable Development; Diversity or Values

2 http://connectingclassrooms-learning.britishcouncil.org Accessed 1 November 2012
3 http://www.gnpasc.org/network/humanities-education-centre-global-footprints
Implementing a global dimension emanated from awards, including:

_The International School Award (ISA), (which) gives recognition to those schools that integrate global issues and international awareness into their curriculum._
_(DfES, 2005, p15)_

While researchers note that it has proved difficult to isolate the impacts and effects of a global dimension in UK schools (Bourn and Hunt, 2011), school links are cited as examples that do provide such evidence (Edge et al, 2009c, p19; Sizmur et al, 2011 and Hurst, 20115), often because the substantiation of impact is required by external funding agencies.

The International School Award (ISA) is now a British Council award. It is even more important to school links since the 2012 changes to UK funding awarded via the ‘Connecting Classrooms’ scheme. To qualify for funding UK schools are expected to have already started the process of applying for the first level of the ISA; there is no requirement for Southern partners to do so.

Martin’s research (2011a and 2011b) and Bourn (2012) have shown how DE can be integrated into curricula. Examples examined in the main parts of this report are intended to demonstrate how a link can do the same, equipping those involved to challenge controversial, complex, contradictory global issues that can emerge.

Development Education in schools is important because most young people are likely to encounter its impact on their lives, yet some teachers may lack confidence in how it can be an integral part of the teaching and learning which they plan for their students (Bourn, *ibid*). Taking two aspects of DE, ‘Diversity’ and ‘Values and perceptions’, for example, both are evident when students at Makunduchi Secondary School (MSS) or Aston consider pharmaceutical products. A short step to controversy follows, when the donation of out of date medicines to the South is examined: is this appropriate Aid? Is a ‘use-before date’, applied by a commercial manufacturer intended to be universal, or interpreted differently in the global North and South? Critical thinking here requires an exploration of this and similar outcomes of globalisation. Even in MSS students’ views in a class may diverge, their differing lenses producing different analyses from that of their teachers or parents, all valid. The wider world experience gained through a link can contribute to teachers’ engagement in similar global issues, whilst providing skills and a stimulus to their personal motivation, to tackle the complexity and contradictory nature of development themes.

---

5 Hurst extracted case studies from Sizmur et al’s NFER report. This is available from Connecting Classrooms’ Sustainable Partnerships e-course in sections 4.2, 4.4, 5.2, 5.3 (Najda, 2012)
School links and global school relationships

Three themes for questions to address are now considered: (i) the scale of the South/North Educational Linking Process (S/NELP), (ii) the status of school links and a DE agenda, and (iii) three persistent issues facing links: funding, power relations and sustainability. An overarching theme is why the linking process may be regarded as controversial.

1. The scale of the linking phenomenon

Doe’s UNESCO report (2007) had calculated statistics for the global scale of linking: his “search of public sources revealed that at least 1,667 school links spread across 105 countries have been reported from 1,310 UK schools with schools in 85 non-OECD countries” (p1). 67% of his Southern schools were in Africa, two thirds of these “with just three African countries: South Africa (284 known links), Ghana (186) Uganda (167)”, yet “several of the Commonwealth countries most in need of support to achieve the Education for All and Millennium Development Goals” had few or no links (Ibid p1). He also noted: “There are very few links with the nations from which the majority of UK ethnic minorities originate” (Doe, op cit, p2). UK teachers establishing new links might choose to redress this imbalance if a particular minority dominates the ethnic demographic of their school, linking with schools that have some meaning and connection for their students.

The exact scale of linking is hard to ascertain with certainty. Agencies promoting links can provide an indication. The NGO Link Community Development (LCD), by 2010, had “facilitated nearly 400 school partnerships between schools in the UK and Ireland and schools in Ghana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda” (Bourn and Cara, 2012, p8). Like DGSP, the Global School Partnerships’ linking programme, funded by DfID from 2003, schools in Africa too dominate LCD’s Southern landscape. In January 2012, the DGSP figure was more than 4,130 UK partnerships with 62 Southern countries, of which 2,726 were with African countries (Najda and Thakwalakwa, 2012). The ‘Connecting Classrooms’ programme 6, which brings together DFID’s Global School Partnerships programme and British Council’s Connecting Classrooms programme, seeks to help young people learn about global issues and become responsible global citizens, as well as developing skills to work in a global economy. It offers participating schools professional development for teachers (through e-learning and face to face courses), accreditation and promotes international sharing of best practice (attributed to the British Council’s press release for Connecting Classrooms launch, 2012). There are four e-courses that are directly relevant to this report:

6 http://connectingclassrooms-learning.britishcouncil.org Accessed 1 November 2012
• International learning – get started

• Education for Global Citizenship

• Inter-cultural and global awareness

• Sustainable partnerships.

What is certain is that a growth in the scale of links, especially since 2006, occurred alongside DFID’s doubling of DGSP funding that year. From 2012 ‘Connecting Classrooms’ offered funding of a £1 500 grant per qualifying UK school.

2. The status of school links and a Development Education agenda

Doe’s data (2007, p11 Figure 3 and Appendix 1) stated that the number of Tanzanian DGSP links, of fifty six schools, exceeded the total number of ‘known links’, of only thirty four linked schools. The extent to which these relationships were active and functioning probably varies. In 2010 a similar situation is indicated in these quotations, from Mhando, a Tanzanian GSP’ workshop facilitator.

Maintaining communication within a link is shown to be problematic in both extracts. In the second he describes a meeting with a primary school Headteacher near Dodoma:

_We have challenges because some of the schools they have 15, 20 years ago in partnership and the teachers have changed, so when we contact them and say that you are supposed to link, they don’t have any there, I mean the information… So sometimes we have to revive them… because some of the schools we give them the names they say, “Oh, this teacher has left some time ago and we don’t know if we have a partner”_

_They didn’t know exactly the status of their partnership, and I told them that you have a partner and these are the details, and I have your name here. They said last year there was some UK people came here and they took our school name, went there, and they were a bit surprised._

(FM, 2010)

Relationships within DGSP links and ‘Connecting Classrooms’ promote Development Education principles. This emphasis is shown in extracts from Disney’s ‘interpretations’ of a letter of introduction to prospective Indian schools at the instigation of a primary school cluster-linking programme with Nottinghamshire schools, which she set up. She acknowledged that her capacity as “university lecturer and academic positioned me in a power relationship with

\[7\] Since 2009 the programme has been known as GSP, rather than DGSP.
the schools and teachers involved” (Disney, 2008a, p132), while also recognising other personal characteristics which did the same, her white, Western and ex-colonial status. These are noted here since the same were all true of the researcher’s identity, as research for this report was undertaken, although no potential access to funding or other support was offered to its respondents. The same might be true of UK teachers engaged in links.

Interpretation 1
Your children will benefit from this link by increased knowledge and understanding of the wider world, opportunities to contact native English speakers and develop their ICT skills.

Interpretation 2
You will be able to host UK teachers at your school and you will be able to work together to develop shared project ideas. The project will need to adhere to (this author’s emphasis) the framework based on the key principles of global education as defined by the British Government through the British Council in their guidance documentation and criteria for funding support in order to qualify for further funding but it is hoped that within this framework there will be plenty of opportunity for both schools to develop their own priorities and work together to support each other’s needs and aspirations.

(Disney, 2008a, Figure 19, p133)

In both interpretations Disney clearly demonstrates the potential gains that Indian schools might enjoy, qualified by a requirement to ‘adhere to’ a global education agenda. Supporting documentation to schools, produced by the British Council (Brownlie-Bojang and Najda, 2007; British Council, 2012a and 2012b; ‘Connecting Classrooms’ e-platform advice sheets) alluded to here, emphasises how such links promote activities embracing development education (DfES, 2005; Edge et al, 2009c).

A similar emphasis is shown in this interview with the Tanzanian DGSP workshop facilitator:

They had the partnership but they didn’t know exactly what they’re supposed to do. So we have the workshop about this global education partnership, at least to make them understand what they are supposed to do in the partnership. Because some of them they used to know that the partnership is about travelling, which is a very small part of it, because the bigger part of it is to do some...activities involving students in their school.

(FM, 2010)

In Disney (2008a) and all Mhando’s responses aspects of pressure can be identified, for Southern schools to fit with externally imposed Development Education/global citizenship agenda. Schools may have aspirations to address
these and such developments would ‘fit’ with their national school curricula; but this cannot be assumed. Perhaps “what they are supposed to do in partnership” is better determined by the parties in individual schools. Southern schools might want outcomes different from those of the British government or partially funded linking programmes, such as the ‘Connecting Classrooms’ programme. Southern priority learning needs might relate instead to addressing students’ literacy issues in English, or raising attainment in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics, the STEM subjects. Engagement with Southern teachers has seen the new Connecting Classrooms programme widen its educational agenda beyond global citizenship, to enriching education, “so the new programme could be described as being more led by school-determined priorities” (Najda, 2012).

3. Three persistent issues facing links: Funding, power relations and sustainability

The British Council’s ‘Connecting Classrooms’ programme launched in June 2012, took the place of the GSP programme for new links. ‘SchoolsOnline’ is a “one stop shop for all British Council managed schools, programmes, including Connecting Classrooms” (Mason, 2012). Southern eligibility for Connecting Classrooms funding in the first round of applications covered four Asian and twenty two African countries, with priority given to Bangladesh, India, and Pakistan and Ethiopia, Nigeria, South Sudan and Sudan; different rules applied for those involving trilateral partnerships. This breaks the domination of Ghana, Uganda and South Africa; it addresses Doe’s observations concerning a lack of Southern links with countries of origin of UK ethnic minorities. It also appears to match closely with a redirection of the UK Aid budget. DFID funding means that Connecting Classrooms aims to develop links in DFID priority countries. (Mason, 2012)

In the November 2012 round of applications, countries in the Middle East and Latin America, along with more countries in Asia and Africa, were able to apply (Mason, 2012).

Concern has been voiced about financial implications for the sustainability of links (Disney, 2008a). Advice to UK schools, on how to obtain funds from businesses, trusts, foundations, companies (Bruty, 2010), NGOs and from ‘internal fundraising’ (British Council, 2012a, pp22-23) is in the public domain 8. Advice, intended for all schools, is also given on the ‘Connecting Classrooms’ Sustainable Partnerships e-course (Section 4, p3). Southern schools may rely perhaps on the intervention of government officials. In 2012 the ‘3As’ of Assistance, Aid and Action, (Leonard, 2010) within a S/S school relationship was celebrated in Zanzibar. Science laboratory equipment, given by Indian schools to 46 secondary schools, was in response to:

A request made by then minister of education [sic], Mr Haroun Ali Suleiman and Former Zanzibar President Mr Amani Karume when they visited India in 2004.\(^9\) (Yusuf, 2012)

This example was accompanied by another of the ‘3As’ in S/S linking: ahead of the arrival of ten Nigerian science teachers, who according to Zanzibar’s Principal Secretary at the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training, were:

**Expected to come to Zanzibar by early next month for a two years [sic] contract to teach science subjects. “The Nigerians are volunteers, we are not paying them salary, our responsibility is to care for them by providing accommodation, transport, and improve working environment for them”**

(Yusuf, *Ibid*)

Disney's doctoral thesis on linking (Disney, 2008a) made references to funding on sixty two occasions. If it is acknowledged that any educational initiative will engage teachers in planning and resourcing then there is an implied financial cost; this is true whether the schools are in Tanzania or Wales, Bangladesh or Mile End, in East London. What practitioners on the ground recognise is the inequity in the relative costs incurred; if these relationships also seek to promote Visitor Exchanges the scale of this inequity is multiplied, particularly when considering intercontinental air fares. In response some schools implement fundraising, to ensure their link's sustainability; this may manifest as 'trading' or a rebalancing of the power relations and other inequalities between the parties.

Other models of funding for linking, such as that promoted by Link Community Development (Bourn and Bain, 2012; Bourn and Cara, 2012) impose a fee on the Northern party which is ‘ring-fenced’ to support the Southern party’s engagement. This support includes training for NGO personnel, professional learning for teachers and investment in associated development projects. Such funding can be viewed in a variety of ways. When it is perceived as ‘charitable’ it attracts its critics (Brown, 2006; Burr, 2008; Cook, 2010; Disney, 2008b; Jackson, 2010; Martin, 2009 and 2011b), fearful of the creation of a dependency relationship reminiscent of colonialism. Yet the ‘3As’, are not necessarily pejorative; perhaps these can be viewed as what Quist-Adade and van Wyk, the former a Ghanaian academic working in Canada, referred to as “Reassessmess justice, not charity” (2007, p91). Through such initiatives self-sustainable relationships might develop. Just as the Canadian NGO Project TEMBO in rural Tanzania, engaged in the promotion of education and economic empowerment of Maasai women may perform a role as a catalyst in stimulating the evolution of initiatives (Varpalotai, 2012), the same could be true of investing in a link’s sustainability.

---

For aid to be meaningful and long lasting, it must be responsive to needs determined by African people themselves and not by outsiders.

(Quist-Adade and van Wyk, op cit, p92)

While the postcolonialists Quist-Adade and van Wyk were writing about the Ghanaian diaspora and the potential role of those living in North America to respond to Ghanaian needs, the prerequisite, which they state, is also relevant in school links.

The recognition of the different financial circumstances between South and North generally predicates that at both ends considerable time and resources will be invested to establish, maintain and sustain linking initiatives. The uneven playing field of funding and resource largesse (including intellectual property, in the form of expertise) between North and South asserts a role for the ‘3As’; teachers need to grapple with tensions relating to funding and power relations in school links. Learning about global issues and becoming responsible global citizens challenges teachers and students. A joint curriculum project in schools needing consumables requires a budget; how the bill is met might constitute a funding dilemma for teachers. When agreed projects cannot take place a link may wither and die.

The South can reciprocate in a link and teachers should celebrate this role. Southern teaching colleagues can co-create materials and curriculum ideas for use by Northern teachers\(^\text{10}\), while Northern counterparts may help in ways dominated by resource transfer and funds, as ‘reassessment justice’. Quist-Adade and van Wyk had written this:

\[\text{Large amounts of money, goods and time are donated by ordinary people to help re-make the so-called inferior traditional lifeworlds of Africans in accordance with Western visions (Ibid p66)}\]

condemning such donor-recipient Aid relationships between North and South. In reply to a query about the donation of equipment from Canadian universities to Ghanaian educational institutions, Quist-Adade appears to celebrate the ‘3As’:

\[\text{While I am skeptical [sic] about foreign aid to Africa, since much of it tends to be palliative, merely touching the symptoms rather than root causes of the continent’s problems, donations of books and computers are exceptions. They are worthwhile investments in human development; the appropriate books and relevant technology can empower and pave the road to self-empowerment and self-reliance... twin problems of irrelevance and environmental hazard ha(ve) exercised my mind for a very long time, but until African governments can set their priorities right and invest in appropriate technologies and create and, at least,}\]

\(^{10}\) Northern teachers’ could use the 360° images from the Aston-Makunduchi partnership’s website to challenge unreliable stereotypes held of Zanzibar, promoting a “sense of place”
assemble their own computers, I am afraid, this is where we must go for now. 
(Quist-Adade, 2009)

An inbuilt risk in his response is that the transfer he supports, of books and 
technology, could result in a dependent relationship, over a prolonged time-
period. It could be argued that the largesse of the donors effectively expunges 
African governments’ responsibility to develop homegrown relevant technology or 
source appropriate books. Similar dependency could arise in school links.

In future funding, power relations and sustainability aspects of links, inherently 
controversial issues, are likely to recur. Teachers should be aware of these complex, 
sometimes contradictory tensions. Thinking skills, drawn from critical pedagogical 
discourse, can assist in this (Andreotti, 2006; Asbrand, 2008; Bourn and Leonard, 
2009; British Council, 2012a; Leeds DEC, 2012; Lowe, 2008; Shah and Brown, 

The final part of this introduction has considered questions relating to three 
particularly challenging, controversial aspects of school links: funding, power 
relations and sustainability. It has introduced the notion of restorative or 
reassessment justice, setting the scene for the case study of one Southern school’s 
link.
Research methodology

The case study mixed methods approach adopted for this research was a qualitative, rather than quantitative strategy; see Figure 1. This approach was devised to complement this author’s underpinning theoretical perspectives, drawn from Development Education, postcolonialism, intercultural education and critical pedagogical discourse.

Most data sought only Southern voices, dominated by adults and students in Makunduchi village, Zanzibar. With a population of approximately 12,000 people who principally survive on a largely self-sufficient lifestyle of fishing and seaweed farming, Makunduchi is located in the far south east of the main island. Despite its beautiful setting, with its long white sandy beaches, there is very little tourist activity in this part of Zanzibar. A week in April 2010 was spent immersed in the process of collecting field data, as a guest of the partnership, staying in their house in the village. At other times Zanzigap participants use this facility. ‘Zanzigap’ is an NGO11, which has evolved from the Aston-Makunduchi partnership. It places volunteers in teaching roles in local schools, the organisation works closely with Zanzibar’s Ministry of Education.

Makunduchi Secondary School (MSS) had 417 pupils on roll in 2010, and a staff of eighteen teachers. Students there studied from Form I to Form IV, which takes them up to the equivalent of the old English ‘O level’. Six students, in forms III and IV, took part in a pupil focus group (PFG). Ten adults were interviewed; the average duration of adult interviews was 40 minutes. This research would not have been possible without the assistance of the school’s Headteacher acting as mediator. He assisted selection of local personnel, to create Southern voices with a range of subject expertise and experience of the partnership.

11 http://zanzigap.wordpress.com/2010/11/24/a-few-words-from-the-director/
### Figure 1: Case study mixed method approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Looking</th>
<th>Listening</th>
<th>Asking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geography lesson observation MSS</td>
<td>Audio-recording of semi-structured interviews</td>
<td>In depth-semi-structured interviews with 10 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK gap-year students’ entries on the ‘Zanzigap’ programme’s Facebook site, 2010-2012</td>
<td>Audio-recording of pupil focus group (PFG) interviews</td>
<td>Personal constructs from students’ online MA module: North South Educational Partnerships, 2009-2011 (including teachers, linking practitioners, Southern NGO workers and in-country DGSP personnel)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photography of physical artefacts in situ</td>
<td>Online discussions and Skype conversations with an Oxford Brookes university MA student investigating the same link, 2011-2012</td>
<td>Pupil focus group of six MSS students, four boys and two girls.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photography of murals, signage, evidence of performance and physical infrastructure</td>
<td>Written responses from the Linking coordinator at Makunduchi to a Sheffield university MA student’s questionnaire, September 2011 and former Zanzigap participant, June 2012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of the Aston-Makunduchi partnership’s website content</td>
<td>April 2010, semi-structured interviews in Dar es Salaam with: 1. Tanzanian Deputy Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education and Vocational Training, 2. DGSP workshop facilitator</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Adapted from Pollard (2005, p48) - Figure 3.1 A typology of enquiry methods*  
*Leonard, 2012*
The ‘Aston-Makunduchi partnership’  
Alison Leonard

Figure 2: Roles of MSS adult interview respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role/s (gender: all male, unless specified)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English literature teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deputy Head and Geography teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civics/history teacher and School Linking Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volunteer teacher- Physics and Mathematics and former Linking coordinator and District Education Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Headteacher and Mathematics teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recently retired English teacher and former linking coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islam/RE teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biology teacher (female)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kiswahili teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local District Education officer and former MSS Headteacher</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Leonard (2012)

Additionally having conducted field research in Makunduchi, two interviews were carried out with a DGSP workshop facilitator and the Deputy Permanent Secretary at the Tanzanian national Ministry of Education.
The Aston-Makunduchi Partnership’s aspirations

Part 2 of this report relates research findings to the link’s sustainability and community involvement, transfers of ‘appropriate technology’ - declared aspirations of the Aston-Makunduchi partnership- and its ‘overriding aim’, embracing critical global citizenship. These are shown in Figure 3, which is derived from the partnership’s website (this author’s numbering). Other effects of the link are outlined, not examined fully. Analysis identifies how this link contributes to DE, development and affirms the dignity of those at MSS.

**Figure 3: Aston-Makunduchi Partnership**

The Aston-Makunduchi Partnership was founded in 1989 to promote genuine partnership between students, teachers and parents in both locations, and to put this into practice by facilitating support generated at Aston into initiatives instigated by the school and community in Makunduchi. In all our dealing with Africa, we emphasise:

1. Long term commitment with full community involvement;
2. Small scale sustainability;
3. Appropriate technology;
4. Empowerment, gender equality and equal opportunities

Our overriding aim is to help the local people, community and school to develop their capacity and to put their own initiatives into action.

The Aston-Makunduchi Partnership is of great importance to both schools and is in constant development12

The four numbered criteria in Figure 3 are intimately involved in DE, as espoused in the Global Dimension concepts (DFES, 2005). Overlaps can be identified with the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), as shown in Figure 4. A similar ‘matching’ exercise was carried out in 2005 (Bourn, 2005).

For teachers the MDGs are important: they are widely understood and progress towards them can be monitored; educational curricula may specify their analysis. MDG designation was agreed upon to spur international initiatives and capacity building, achieved governments could then concentrate on other national priorities. Much international Aid is allocated towards achieving the MDGs. Postcolonialists criticise the deficit position that they represent, yet unmet they are

**Figure 4: How the MDGs relate to DE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MDG and explanation of overlaps with DE</th>
<th>DE and GD concepts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **1 Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger**  
Interconnectedness of the local and the global from globalisation has led to ever-increasing links between places and people; those in the UK have high levels of concern about poverty. However, repeated use of images showing people in desperate need, facing ‘extreme poverty’ may have contributed to public scepticism (Glennie et al, 2012). Over-fishing to promote global trade could deprive coastal communities of income. | Global Citizenship  
Interdependence  
Social Justice  
Human Rights  
Conflict Resolution  
Diversity  
Sustainable Development  
Values and Perceptions |
| **2 Achieve Universal Primary Education (UPE)**  
Opportunities for participation in society can be nurtured through education; the forms of such full involvement will vary between cultures. The capacity to take part in decision-making and resolve conflicts can be enhanced through the development of inter-personal skills taught as part of a primary school curriculum. Boys’ and girls’ access to UPE can promote emancipation and a shared agreed agenda between adults, for how to develop the capacity to put agreed initiatives into action. | Global Citizenship  
Interdependence  
Social Justice  
Human Rights  
Conflict Resolution  
Diversity  
Sustainable Development  
Values and Perceptions |
| **3 Promote Gender Equality & Empower Women**  
An aspiration for equal opportunities between men and women can instil motivation to participate in a community, such that Social justice and Human Rights are promoted. When females are excluded from development and decision-making the resultant community’s initiatives may be partial and human capability will be stunted. Sustainable development considers present and future generations; intra and inter-generational equity is not achievable if women are excluded. | Global Citizenship  
Interdependence  
Social Justice  
Human Rights  
Conflict Resolution  
Diversity  
Sustainable Development  
Values and Perceptions |
| **4 Reduce Child Mortality**  
**5 Improve Maternal Health**  
**6 Combat HIV/Aids, Malaria & other Diseases**  
Achieving these health-related MDGs contributes to the social and economic sustainability of a local community and society more widely. | Global Citizenship  
Interdependence  
Social Justice  
Diversity  
Sustainable Development  
Values and Perceptions |
| **7 Ensure Environmental Sustainability**  
Appreciation of the growing interconnectedness between different communities, often at distant locations from one another, has led to efforts to promote initiatives minimising negative effects on the natural environment and promoting other forms of sustainability. | Global Citizenship  
Interdependence  
Sustainable Development  
Social Justice  
Values and Perceptions |

---

13 Since MDG8, to “Develop a Global Partnership for Development” is virtually synonymous with Global Citizenship it is excluded. For example, Target 8A includes a commitment to good governance, development and poverty reduction; Target 8B addresses the special needs of the least developed nations while Target 8F seeks to make available the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communications (http://www.mdgmonitor.org/goal8.cfm Last accessed 28 October 2012)
Development Education Research Centre
Research Paper No.8

acknowledged to stunt desired Southern aspirations. Without Universal Primary Education for example (MDG2), it is unlikely that Tanzania can grow its domestic technology capability. Threatened environmentally (MDG7) Zanzibar’s mariculture cannot create an income-generating opportunity or alternative to artisanal fishing, or contribute to poverty eradication and wellbeing in coastal communities, such as Makunduchi. Development Education is important because it can promote cooperation and a critical Global Citizenship Education, which avoids simplistic solutions that could frustrate Southern self-sufficiency, resulting in a dependency culture.

Part 2 of this report examines the claim that this link is: “of great importance to both schools and is in constant development”. It assesses the declared overriding aim: “To help the local people, community and school to develop their capacity and to put their own initiatives into action”, an aim synonymous with Quist-Adade and van Wyk’s 2007 criteria for meaningful, long-lasting aid, to be responsive to needs “determined by African people themselves, and not by outsiders” (p92).

1. Sustainability and community engagement. MDG 3, MDG 8

This link is a mature relationship; it celebrated its twentieth anniversary in 2010, the year of Makunduchi Secondary School’s centenary. This alone demonstrates a long-term commitment, often national and local governments are elected for far shorter periods; many schools experience considerable change over even a decade. Intercultural education, promoting an understanding of different cultures has underpinned this relationship since its inception, seeking to gain understanding of each other’s needs, wants, aspirations and problems.

Four findings related to sustainability and community engagement are examined: (i) spreading professional learning beyond MSS; (ii) extending a web of links beyond Makunduchi; (iii) the evolution of income generating projects and, (iv) avoiding a dependency culture. Each raises questions and points for discussion.

(i) Spreading professional learning

In this link, it has been agreed that the parties would work together and seek to ensure their relationship’s sustainability. It is evidenced in an interview response, from a former linking coordinator, describing how as a result of Aston’s initial financial support, in sending a MSS teacher on a fact-finding Visitor Exchange to Rotherham, educational provision in Zanzibar subsequently benefited from a sharing of science expertise. CPD was cascaded through Zanzibar Ministerial support to other schools. His comments could imply that ‘off the shelf’ Northern educational models are superior and transferable. This quotation shows that the wider Zanzibar community beyond MSS was involved. Support from South
Carolina, USA rather than England was ultimately considered most appropriate, by Zanzibar’s Education Ministry:

*It helps the teachers, for example, because experience is the best teacher. You… go to England for example, to see what is going to happen here. Upon return, we normally inform maybe our Inspectors or District Education Officers, and they discuss the matter with maybe Head of the Department or maybe Director of Education, say we probably need this and this and they are available. So, after observing and another thing we found that, oh, we can get such a thing in Kenya, so it has helped, at least the government, because to see at least someone there to say, at least it is possible for the government to afford this one. Fortunately, the other thing is that the Ministry itself took an effort of looking for a support anywhere, so the best example was Carolina in USA. Say, OK, we shall provide you with science texts, from Form I to Form IV, and they are now available, so I will say this problem has been solved. But, I might say, it was through the support of Aston.*

(K 158-170)

In this instance the sharing of expertise relied on the process of observations and discussions between teachers, to identify practical means of improving the quality of science teaching and learning, particularly in terms of access to textbooks and designing affordable demonstrations and experiments (Ash and Severs, 2004). Sharing good practice, particularly through hands-on continuing professional development is a recognised means of improving the quality of teaching and learning (Cordingley et al, 2007; Ofsted, 2006 and 2010; Pedder et al, 2005, 2008 and 2010). Key to successful implementation in Zanzibar is the affordability, relevance and practicality of such developments.

There is a criticism made that some links can increase local inequalities in the South (Egan, 2010) if one school gains through participation, and such benefits are not spread. A feature of this link is that teachers’ professional learning is then disseminated.

The NGO LCD’s linking model avoids similar criticism, through using its linked schools as local ‘hubs’, from which CPD is disseminated (Bourn and Cara, 2012). Plan-ed’s Linking programme did likewise. This is also evident in Sazani Associates’ “Global Professional Learning Communities” 141, linking schools in Wales and Zanzibar. DGSP and ‘Connecting Classrooms’ also provide face-to-face and online CPD courses and professional learning for Southern schools, sometimes working in collaboration with the Higher Education sector (Edge et al, 2008). A feature of the free e-learning courses provided by ‘Connecting Classrooms’ is a feedback loop allowing teachers to share responses to activities; those completing these courses can obtain a self-certified certificate.

14 http://www.sazaniaassociates.org.uk/what-we-do/projects Last accessed 8 June 2012
(ii) Extending a web of links beyond Makunduchi

Other evidence that indicates sustainable commitment and engagement criteria in this link is found in these extracts from interviews with a District Education officer, who explains how the Zanzibar Education Ministry asked the partnership to extend the network of linked schools to other districts, and Pemba island:

You find that now it is not only Aston-Makunduchi partnership, but it is Aston and South District partnership, because most of the schools have now a link with other schools... there are so many schools which have got a link, with other schools in South District, not only Makunduchi. But these links were formed through Aston-Makunduchi.

It was not only that, the Ministry once told us that, why you are just concentrating on the South only? Please try to make sure that, even in the North, I mean in the North region, and then we have Urban, West region and we have tried that one, even extending to the other island, to the next island, Pemba.

(K, 266-271; 280-286)

This section of the report has shown how this link has promoted the sustainability of its relationship. The link has evolved over time to include additional parties at both ends, not restricted to schools. Aston's liaison with Sheffield-Hallam University, for example, has assisted in the equipping of MSS's computer room. Long-term commitment could be true of others engaged in linking, but is not necessarily sought when all schools agree to start working together.

The link is respected on Zanzibar. The British Council, in DGSP workshops promoting school linking more widely in Tanzania, has celebrated this partnership's 'model' of linking evolution. Its achievements in Global Citizenship (MDG 8) were recognised nationally in the UK, by the award of an MBE honour to John Errington, formerly Aston's linking coordinator. He now works collaboratively with local personnel through the Zanzigap organisation, and the Zanzibar Ministry of Education, to encourage young people and adults to take part in gap placements, teaching on the main island, in response to needs determined by local people themselves, and not by outsiders.

(iii) Income generating projects. MDG 1, MDG 3 and MDG 8

The contribution of the link to income generating projects in the local community is shown in this 1991 'landmark' from the partnership's website; not all have endured. Table 1 interrogates the 1991 landmark, matching the website extract against the partnership's Development Education (DE) criteria. (As in Figure 3, this author's numbering identifies the partnership's four DE criteria). Table 1 provides evidence that DE outcomes were met in the Makunduchi community, not just at MSS.
The ‘Aston-Makunduchi partnership’
Alison Leonard

LINK LANDMARK: 1991
We sent Makunduchi £1000, again generated by Aston Aid, for the construction of a chicken farm. We also sent a further 22 tea chests of slightly used textbooks collected from Sheffield schools, along with some calculators.

In a largely self-sufficient village, such as Makunduchi, the raising of poultry could create a cash income, allowing the partnership to generate funds, to then be allocated as thought fit by “the local people, community and school to develop their capacity and to put their own initiatives into action”. The £1000 cash input from Aston Aid acted as the financial stimulus to facilitate an intended self-sufficient village enterprise.

Table 1: Supporting long-term commitment and community engagement in Makunduchi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LINK LANDMARK</th>
<th>Interpretation of extract- matched against DE criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Long term commitment with full community involvement;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Small scale sustainability;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Appropriate technology;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Empowerment, gender equality and equal opportunities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1991 Evidence of DE</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2, 3 &amp; 4: A ‘chicken farm’ appears to be an example of small-scale sustainability and appropriate technology. Similar examples of school links promoting income-generating projects can be found in the literature on small-scale sustainability in Tanzania (Gibbons, 2003). Research in Ugandan schools has isolated others, including rice, poultry and fish farming (Leonard, 2010).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1: The farm enterprise could demonstrate a long-term commitment, which might fully involve the Makunduchi community. The collection in Sheffield schools could help to create a long-term commitment between S Yorkshire and Zanzibar. It suggests that at the N end an aspiration to community involvement beyond this Zanzibar secondary school was in evidence, only two years into this relationship.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 and 4: 22 tea chests of calculators could be ‘appropriate technology’ if solar powered. Slightly used textbooks are often shared between Northern schools, so could contribute to ‘empowerment’ of teachers and students.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Less convincing DE evidence</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4 and 3: At whose instigation was the poultry project initiated? Was chicken an affordable protein source or part of local diets?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4: The claim: “again generated by Aston Aid” could appear to be creating a dependency culture, in which Aston’s beneficence could create a new colonialism.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Leonard, 2012
(iv) Avoiding a dependency culture

Table 1 shows some less convincing evidence for Development Education, questioning equitable power relations within this relationship. Further analysis of the 1991 link landmark suggests that there may have been a risk of dependency emerging, despite a declared desire for Southern autonomy. Perhaps it is partly because the website is presented from a Northern voice? The content of landmark entries is clearly written by Aston, without any obvious input from Makunduchi.

As outlined in the introduction to this report a major controversial aspect of school linking is the risk of a dependency culture, particularly when funds are transferred N to S. Postcolonialist theorists are especially wary of this (Andreotti, 2007; Egan, 2010; Martin, 2007).

As shown in Table 1, there are interpretations of these landmarks, which either are less convincing, in terms of ‘long-term commitment and engagement’, or apparently contradict the espoused empowerment criterion. What the role of Southern partners was in the allocation of resources is unspecified. Was this ‘Aid’, ‘Assistance’ and ‘Action’ demand-led from the South? Such questions cannot be answered from the website, they remain ambiguous in terms of Southern empowerment.

In relation to equity and reciprocity how opportunities were created for the North to receive from the South is not evident from the website. If such outcomes did occur, they are neither reported nor celebrated on the website.

This extract from an interview with a former MSS Linking coordinator confirms that the process of transferring Aid (or the ‘3 As’) was demand-led from the South, in terms of books. An alternative interpretation is that this sharing abdicates local accountability for their supply:

*Because we say that we have got problems, in say in English, therefore they bought books and then they send the books to us and we use those books. This is our problem and therefore that is a very good help. We share; that is how to improve English language from that way; therefore they bought books, many books, which we need here. And then they are expected to be used in examinations: O level, at Advanced level, therefore they have bought those books; that is a very good help. That is how we share.*

(AB, 213–219)

The same is true for MSS’s computer room; its usage was intended as a community resource, like the school’s library. A male student referred to collaboration with a Zanzigap student, which took place outside the schools’ daily routine:
They have learnt from them, out of school time; including me. I have learnt from Mr Andy, how to use a computer. So now, I know, even a little, how to use a computer... So... many people have come here so as to learn computer... out of this school.
(PFG 362-366)

'Mr Andy', a Zanzigap student in 2009, had taught at Mtende School. During his stay on the island, accompanied by another Zanzigapper, he took part in a sponsored walk, raising funds for the provision of additional classrooms at that school. ICT expertise is known to facilitate opportunities for rural income generation in Southern communities, allowing small-scale business enterprises to take part in global trade, something which would have been impossible before the Internet (Binns, 2009a and 2009b). The computer room at MSS, if suitably maintained, is a community resource; its equipment is not reserved for school purposes.

Resourcing of ICT within the link demonstrates that it aspires to durability and sustainability, and its aim of ‘whole community involvement’.

Here the Headteacher discusses medical, rather than computer ‘Aid’, in Makunduchi village:

When Aston comes here... they bring medicines, and they go to help the doctors, teach us at the cottage hospital there, while they put some, like these things, everybody who goes to the hospital may gain from it. There are pieces of medicine, pieces of material, to be used by doctors, in trying to make different physical quantities of, like thermometers, and other medical instruments... they are given there and they are used to the communities, as their working materials. So, they gain, of course.
(MK, 153-160)

This quotation from a male student also refers to collaboration at the local hospital:

People from Aston helped in the hospital in Makunduchi. I think last year, we had so many teachers. Like, Mr Macdonalds and Andy; they went to the hospital of Makunduchi so as to see instruments. Also, so, I think for the whole of the Makunduchi area, I think that whole of the community of Makunduchi will benefit about it.
(PFG 325-329)

Although this is the ‘3As’ in practice it contributes not just to the medical MDGs but also MDG8. It demonstrates medical collaboration at a global scale. Since 2007 the NGO ‘Makunduchi Project’ is enabling the cottage hospital to improve local confidence in its standard of medical provision. As shown here, the Aston-
Makunduchi partnership also supports the upgrading of this aspect of the local community’s service provision. An alternative interpretation is that this help absolves Zanzibar medical authorities’ of their sourcing, supply and maintenance responsibilities.

What is less certain is how future funding will be secured at Makunduchi, to ensure that the computer equipment can be maintained, repaired and achieve commercial viability, or how its Internet service charges will be financed. This was not secure in 2011:

*Lack or absence of communication means in Zanzibar, the current come off most of the time and most school have no internet services; by October our internet services in school will cut off and we have no other money to repaid considered that we are the coordinator for other school at the South region, meanwhile they have no internet… The organisations like British Council should help means of communication. No communication no partnership.*

(HSK, 2011)

The written responses (HSK, 2011) from the current linking coordinator, reiterate this author’s concern that IT provision risks piece-meal gestures, with redundant equipment sitting unused in Southern schools. Burr has warned the same (2008). Tomlinson (2012) confirmed that while Makunduchi’s Internet connection had been installed using a UNESCO grant its future viability is in doubt.

Interviewed in 2010 MSS’s linking coordinator had made this suggestion regarding future IT within the partnership:

*When we take two or three people here, then we get to impact certain knowledge, maybe as we say, computer maintenance... Then, our computer will [have] longer life; because whenever it is broken someone can maintain it instead. But now, that is, whenever it is broke, it is gone… Because whenever it is broken no-one can deal with it; so, I think, the good manner is to take someone, and then to impact certain knowledge, even in the village, not only a teacher*  

(SH 116-123)

*It is still in Makunduchi no one can maintain the computers. Why we have the first school in Zanzibar to begin using a computer, even to convince many people to use it. But it is a time now to sit down, to find out what we are going to do, instead of using a lot of money to go to visit somewhere*  

(SH 141-144)

He advocates that rather than fund Visitor Exchanges, possibly resulting in ‘educational tourism’, the link should fund teachers’ or a villager’s IT professional development in England, promoting long-term capacity building.
Although Aston Aid's funding can be construed as charitable or castigated from a postcolonialist perspective, as evidence of dependency emerging between the partners, this author suggests as does Quist-Adade (2009), that appropriate books and computer equipment are empowering. Makunduchi's library and IT suite are intended for use beyond the school community. Perhaps this presents a lesson transferable from South to North, where the concept of community schools is atypical of schools' relationships with their local communities?

This link's efforts to avoid the emergence of a dependency culture are confirmed in a male student's response and a female teacher's remarks about on-going friendship with those at Aston; friendships are best forged between equals.

The friendship between Aston and Makunduchi instance... that is very important, because: how community benefited from that friendship? I mean ...teachers, when they come here, including teacher Andy; he used to stay with community ...So our society agrees, that this is a childhood, and this is not only friendship, this is childhood between Aston and Makunduchi. So, it is better to improve this friendship.

(PFG 334-337; 341-342)

I think I have benefited from the partnership of Aston and Makunduchi by, maybe by forming, by joining with other teachers or other students from England, like a friend...? Like a friend, I have my friend Hannah... so we contact sometime by using phone; I contact with her. Or sometime, when they come here, I feel, I am very happy. Like my celebration?

(MM 80-85)

The value of such friendships (or childhood) may escape measurement when efforts are made to evaluate links; thus contributing to the thorny issue of ignoring non-quantifiable outcomes. Bourn and Hunt (2011), writing about the Global Dimension remarked, "Perhaps policy-makers are not asking the most appropriate questions or are making assumptions about how easily evidence of impact can be identified" (p37), the same could be true when policy makers review school links.

What the Aston-Makunduchi partnership has demonstrated is that turnover of staff in schools can be accommodated when the parties seek to maintain meaningful communication and the organisation's staffing comprises a committee structure. Research in Ugandan schools in 2009 demonstrated the same (Leonard, 2009). Edge et al 2008, 2009a, Bourn and Cara 2012 and Sizmur et al 2011 also recommend this. In their independent review of the UK end of DGSP programme Sizmur et al (ibid) had noted the importance of a link's coordinator: 'for consistency and development, the school benefits from the same teacher leading the programme' (p68). There is a risk if such individuals control too much within a linking relationship, its sustainability could then be compromised when they leave.
This could explain differences between the numbers of known and active school links noted in this report’s introduction. A healthy, long-lasting link should be able to survive the departure and arrival of staff, including linking coordinators; a committee structure supports such transitions.

Here Makunduchi’s linking coordinator suggests Aston staffing changes challenge this link’s future:

Even our partnership sustain for 21 years now but most of the active members are now away either by promotion or retired so that the rest of staff have no interest mostly in Britain ... As you know teachers paid little all over the world so that in UK where time is money most of teachers see this like something increasing work with no payment.

(HSK, 2011)

A dependency culture is not on this link’s agenda; working together is:

Because yourself working here in Zanzibar, you never go there and say, OK, I go there and this is what I want. And that is why our relationship still remains, because we discuss the issues together and between the two sides.

(K 184-186)

Errington summarised its importance in this way:

English remains the teaching medium in Tanzania. Having native English speakers around helps considerably, because it impacts upon teaching and learning in a most positive way. Enhancing the educational experience is the best way that I can think of how a country like Tanzania can lift itself from extreme poverty, improve the lot of its citizens, and play a fully functional part in the modern world.

(Erington, 201015)

This female student noted something similar. The link’s outreach clearly extends beyond MSS:

For example, the teacher from Aston, helped the children in our village for teaching English. Maybe the student who had no speak English well. Also, the teacher from England: speaking English for studying the, for many children in our community.

(PFG 388-390)

Errington’s assessment was borne out in this October 2010 Tanzanian newspaper editorial, entitled “Quality education, is Tanzania on course?”

Grace Soko of the Tanzania Uwezo Institute indicates that the situation is worse than what is often reported. Conducted in May in 38 out of 133 districts, the

15 http://zanzigap.wordpress.com/2010/11/24/a-few-words-from-the-director/
report suggests that half of the pupils who finish Standard Seven in Tanzania’s public schools can’t read even a Standard Two English book. They also struggle to read Kiswahili. (thecitizen.co.tz 16)

Standard Seven is the top class in primary schools in Tanzania; this extract suggests that considerable challenges of reading and writing in English subsequently face its Secondary school students. Tanzanian students’ barriers to learning could be similar to those facing many EAL learners in Inner-city UK schools. Although Soko’s concern appears to identify literacy in English as a national issue her view can be criticised, for apparently promoting Western hegemony through the domination of the English language, possibly at the expense of Kiswahili literacy. Replacing English as the medium of educational communication in Tanzania might lead to other issues of literacy and educational attainment. Adequate funding for bilingual (or multilingual) provision is necessary, particularly since Standard English has such a preeminent role as a global language of communication (Pennycook, 1999; Regester, 2011).

Conclusions

Part 2 (1) has shown that ‘full community engagement’ remains a partnership aim, which may yet prove unrealistic. The assurance of future community engagement is questionable; many exogenous factors could arise to compromise the sustainability of the complicated web of school links in Zanzibar. In particular it is suggested that securing funding and recruiting UK teachers to give up their time to facilitate Visitor Exchanges may prove increasingly difficult. This was confirmed by McNicholl (2012) who interviewed the present Aston coordinator, for her MA dissertation on UK school links with Tanzania. While UK schools may subsidise the participation of staff to take part in educational exchanges, this is not true when Aston visits MSS.

Perhaps ‘full community involvement’ may be an unattainable aspiration? For a variety of reasons it should not be assumed that all would seek involvement. What is not clear is if this aspiration originated from the Makunduchi side. Anecdotally even in Stone Town, Zanzibar’s main town, when seeking out dala-dala transport 17 to Makunduchi village 70km away, this author found that fellow passengers knew about the village’s partnership with Aston. Engagement in the link appeared to have boosted the community’s prestige on the island. It is unlikely that this could have occurred if the parties had only entered into a short-term commitment.

16 http://ngonewsafrica.org/archives/3967
17 A dala dala is a local form of public transport. Their name is from the Kiswahili slang, ‘dala,’ meaning five. When the system first began the fare was usually five Tanzanian shillings. (http://isteptanzania.wordpress.com/2009/05/29/thoughts-on-dala-dala-buses Last accessed 28 October 2012)
2. Appropriate technology and capacity building. MDG1, MDG7, MDG8.

The transfer of technology and the potential enhancement of human capacity are often features of S/N relations. This is true in many school links and both are important aspects of this relationship. Inappropriate examples of technology transfer have occurred in some school links (Burr, 2008) and have been observed by this author, such as donations of outmoded computer equipment or outdated textbooks (Leonard, 2010). How appropriate technology and capacity building relate to development and DE are explored in this section.

This report uses this author's definition of ‘Appropriate technology’. It is defined as technology that “will equal or improve upon an existing solution and is deemed:

• To be easily serviced and/or repairable locally;

• Affordably maintained;

• Supportable by consumables, whose supplies can be sourced locally and are affordable within budgetary constraints”.

This definition is based on this author’s research in schools in Ghana, Uganda, Zanzibar and mainland Tanzania, a review of literature relating to development and the NGO Practical Action’s concept of technology justice (Practical Action, website).

The range of technology which has been shared in this link includes income generating equipment, to support business opportunities in the local community; books, physical models to aid teaching, technical equipment (DVD players, video players, video and digital cameras, radios, CD and MP3 players, calculators, laboratory and sports equipment) for educational use; computer equipment and other technology for use locally. Table 2 demonstrates how this link has led to development and Development Education (DE) outcomes.
Table 2: Contributions to Development Goals and Development Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development goals</th>
<th>Development Education (DE)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Physical infrastructure: examination hall and teachers’ room and administrative block in new buildings. ‘School house’ in Makunduchi village, to accommodate visitors from the partnership and others, including Zanzigap placements.</td>
<td>Social Justice &amp; Human rights issues explored—such as gender equality in education. Clubs and assemblies promote this understanding at MSS.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resourcing in school: Enhanced provision of schools’ resources: text books, technical equipment (e.g. ICT equipment), New teaching materials created by teachers from MSS and Aston, including maths manipulatives microchemistry method (Ash and Severs, 2004; Henderson and Severs, 2001) and laboratory equipment.</td>
<td>Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) promoted—initiatives such as the school building developments and grounds at MSS.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity building: 1. Trading in local craft products from Makunduchi and other local villages, to finance the partnership. 2. Educational aspirations of students boosted. 3. Spoken English fluency improved. 4. ICT skills amongst students, teachers and locals using the MSS ICT suite. 5. CPD for teachers, especially those engaged in Visitor Exchanges or on placements and academic studies in UK.</td>
<td>Global Citizenship and Interdependence: 3As in evidence: ‘Active participation’, ‘Aid’ and ‘Assistance’ – MSS teachers assist teachers at local Zanzibar schools, as part of civil society/civic engagement. Promotion of school linking and sharing of subject expertise in Zanzibar. Curricular projects explore Zanzibar tourist developments; used in geography at S and N ends of the International Partnership.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversity: Face-to-face contact between parties during Visitor Exchanges, both as hosts in Zanzibar and as participants in visits to Rotherham.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Leonard, 2012

While it can be argued that it is not the remit of schools to engage in the process of development (Martin, 2010), Table 2 demonstrates that in this link, schools have provided a ‘launch-pad’ for initiatives. Some NGO-led linking models explicitly set out to achieve development outcomes. What is required is relevant appropriate expertise to underpin linking projects, so that efforts, resources and time are
effective in achieving the intended outcomes and wastage is minimised (Cook, 2010). Links should draw on expertise from educational institutions, not just schools, and the NGO and commercial sectors (perhaps as part of their Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) remit), to meet this requirement.

If the ‘3As’ are exercised as part of critical Global Citizenship Education (GCE) in action, a link’s aspirations of equality and reciprocity will be in tension with such efforts, unless they are construed as ‘responsibility towards the other’ (see Table 3) or ‘restorative justice’.


Global Citizenship is not only implicit in MDG 8, which seeks to ‘develop a Global Partnership for Development’, but is a key characteristic of Development Education. This author suggests that in a link such education is most effective when it is ‘critical’, since this avoids oversimplistic ‘soft’ approaches. The differences are illustrated in Table 3.

As just shown in 2(2) there is an evident contradiction between some of the actions within this link and its aspiration of equal opportunities; this is a tension or ‘minefield’ which linking participants frequently encounter. 2(3) elaborates upon empowerment by: introducing a ‘critical’ approach to GCE, valuing local Southern knowledge while acknowledging material differences; elaborating upon ‘lenses’ which can unwittingly sometimes reinforce inequality and finally, identifying four examples of empowerment from this link. Empowerment is gauged through responses relating to educational aspiration and attainment and participation in decision-making.

When grappled with, particularly using ideas from critical pedagogical discourse, what Andreotti has identified as ‘soft’ GCE can be avoided (Andreotti, 2006; Andreotti and Warwick, 2007). Table 3 distinguishes how ‘critical’ GCE differs from a ‘soft’ approach. Andreotti’s work, derived from the writings of postcolonialism, has challenged assumptions that Western knowledge and ‘ways of knowing’ are assumed to be superior to indigenous Southern norms. Empowerment can relate to challenging this assumption. Through a school link those in the South can share their cultural values and perspectives with their Northern partners, ‘giving’ to those in the North in terms of new knowledge (and associated resources). Knowledge transfer in a link can be empowering for participants, but unpacking an ‘un-voiced’ pervasive Western, often Eurocentric hegemony requires a level of understanding which may not be grasped by teachers at the outset of a link. Agencies promoting linking have sought to address this through a range of publications and training materials.
Table 3: A comparison of Soft and Critical approaches to Global Citizenship Education (GCE)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Soft GCE</th>
<th>Critical GCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Issue</strong></td>
<td>Poverty, helplessness</td>
<td>Inequality, injustice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nature of the issue</strong></td>
<td>Lack of ‘development’, education, resources, skills, culture, technology, etc.</td>
<td>Complex structures, systems, assumptions, power relations and attitudes that create and maintain exploitation and enforced disempowerment and tend to eliminate difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Justification of Northern privilege</strong></td>
<td>‘Development’, ‘history’, education, harder work, better organisation, better use of resources, technology</td>
<td>Benefit from and control over unjust and violent systems and structures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Basis for caring</strong></td>
<td>Common humanity/being good/sharing and caring Responsibility FOR the other (or to teach the other)</td>
<td>Justice/complicity in harm Responsibility TOWARDS the other (or to learn with the other) – accountability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grounds for action and intervention</strong></td>
<td>Humanitarian/moral (based on normative principles for thought and action)</td>
<td>Political/ethical (based on normative principles for relationships)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Understanding of ‘interdependence’</strong></td>
<td>We are all equally interconnected, we all want the same thing, we can all do the same thing</td>
<td>Asymmetrical globalisation, unequal power relations, Northern and Southern elites imposing own assumptions as universal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>What needs to change</strong></td>
<td>Structures, institutions and individuals that are a barrier to development</td>
<td>Structures, (belief) systems, institutions, assumptions, cultures, individuals, relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose</strong></td>
<td>So that everyone achieves development, harmony, tolerance and equality</td>
<td>So that injustices are addressed, more equal grounds for dialogue are created, and people can have more autonomy to define their own development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role of individuals</td>
<td>Soft GCE</td>
<td>Critical GCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some individuals are part of the problem, but ordinary people are part of the solution as they can create pressure to change structures</td>
<td>We are all part of problem and part of the solution</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| What individuals can do | Support campaigns to change structures, donate time, expertise and resources | Analyse own position/context and participate in changing structures, assumptions, identities, attitudes and power relations in their contexts |

| Goal of GCE | Empower individuals to act (or become active citizens) according to what has been defined for them as a good life/ideal world | Empower individuals: to reflect critically on the legacies and processes of their cultures and contexts, to imagine different futures and to take responsibility for their decisions and actions |

| Strategies for GCE | Raising awareness of global issues and promoting campaigns | Promoting engagement with global issues and perspectives and an ethical relationship to difference, addressing complexity and power relations |

| Potential benefits of GCE | Greater awareness of some of the problems, support for campaigns, greater motivation to help/do something, feel good factor | Independent/critical thinking and more informed, responsible and ethical action |

| Potential problems of GCE | Feeling of self-importance or self-righteousness and/or cultural supremacy, reinforcement of colonial assumptions and relations, reinforcement of privilege, partial alienation, uncritical action | Guilt, internal conflict and paralysis, critical disengagement, feeling of helplessness |

Leonard, 2012 (Adapted from Andreotti, 2006)
The reality is that the Southern and Northern parties in a link are not equal in material terms; this truism lies at the heart of most South-North links. This partnership largely adopts responses from the ‘Critical GCE’ column of Table 3. Material differences (and hence inequalities and injustices) may exist between other schools that work collaboratively; this is not unique to S/N links. As a result of collaborative educational initiatives all can gain, the goals of equality and autonomy to define one’s own development can be brought a little closer. This was shown in this research report’s introduction, in the context of South-South linking, between Zanzibar and Nigerian science colleagues. Empowerment through collaboration is true within other educational initiatives. It can flourish in UK Training consortia and National Teaching schools, in which opportunities arise for students, trainee teachers, university lecturers, teachers, pupils and school leaders to work with others, sometimes linking schools in quite different material circumstances (as indicated by UK pupil data such as the percentage of Free School Meals (FSM) 18).

Andreotti and de Souza (2008), describing lessons from the ‘Through Other Eyes’ (TOE) project, refer to metaphors illustrating the connections between theory and pedagogical practice. Their fourth metaphor refers to “four possible lenses to frame otherness that reinforce unequal relations of power: of the missionary, the teacher, the tourist and the anthropologist” (Ibid, p27). Within a school link a ‘teacher lens’ could frame “engagement with otherness around the motif of ‘enlightenment’ and increased privilege for the holder of knowledge” (Andreotti and de Souza, 2008, p27). This report cannot explore the TOE project at length. Readers keen to investigate the romanticisation of indigenous cultures and complexities inherent if we do nothing to address inequalities of power or the distribution of resources (Ibid, p32), should explore how:

Some of the ways that issues of theory, knowledge construction and representation can produce complex and controversial readings that may be difficult to negotiate once you start engaging with issues in more depth (Andreotti and de Souza, 2008, p33)

Four detailed examples now demonstrate critical GCE in this link, they relate to challenging stereotypes; students’ educational attainment, aspirations and values; professional learning related to education, accommodating dissent and decision making.

18 UK pupils’ entitlement to Free School Meals is used as an indicator of economic and social deprivation and is widely reported when official comparisons are made between schools (in Ofsted Inspection reports, for example)
Example 1: Challenging stereotypes

Maybe when our friends come to Makunduchi maybe they have their stories, maybe something that maybe people are sleeping on the trees and something like that. But when they come here they found that it is quite different; people are very amicable, living happily at the time, saying something like “Karibou”*, something like that.
(K 20-23)

* Meaning: Welcome, in Kiswahili

When some of the students came to Zanzibar, Makunduchi…most of the students were sitting on the floor, because there were no chairs or tables, something of the sort. So, when they arrived, they bent on the floor and write, it was, students were very surprised to see that and it was, we won’t accept such a thing, and it was… ours were very patient, cool, calm and collected, because they know this is the situation. So, we felt that, maybe, your students, when they in turn come to a country, they have a slight change of habit, or mind… There was one student said that, when I go back there, now I will understand that my parent is looking after me very much more than I expected.
(K 30-44)

This MSS teacher (and former linking coordinator) is referring to challenging UK students’ values and attitudes. His second response shows how the experiences of visiting MSS could have created (or consolidated) a negative Northern perception, that the South lacks in terms of school furniture. The ‘change of habit’ was one of a UK student reassessing the generosity of their parents. To pretend that the facilities of the schools were equivalent would have been misleading. Critical GCE encourages critical reflection on the legacies and processes of the cultures and contexts of the two schools, through staff and students learning together, in debriefings at both schools. The link has enabled MSS to improve its ‘fixed assets’, helping to reduce this ‘gap’- as the teacher explained ‘by that time, not now’ this legacy of injustice has been altered. The parties arrive at a position of responsibility towards one another in the relationship, through learning together.

Example 2: Students’ educational attainment, aspirations and values

In the first quotation below MSS’s Headteacher explains improved attainment in science. The second, from a male student elaborates on the benefits of teacher collaboration to devise appropriate science practicals (See also Table 2). Without the contribution of ‘restorative justice’ science teaching and learning at MSS would have been largely theoretical:

When they see that we miss something in these materials they give us freely…I have an experience of the microchemistry materials, which they gave us in 1995.
We used these materials, and we found the improvement in chemistry; people could answer their examinations well. And, at that time, we took the number two position in the national results, due to the effect of these materials… they enjoy it and they improve their learning power.
(MK 21-28)

I am a scientist, and my favourite subjects included biology and chemistry… So, they teach us maybe theory, but we need practical… Sodium reacts with, maybe magnesium; sodium reacts with water, so that: what happened? So, that fact you are supposed to have seen… So, you see, to a lot of schools, within Africa, including Makunduchi, there is less laboratory apparatus. So, this is a very, very difficult problem for our schools. So, it is better to gain more apparatus within the laboratory in order to improve our education and our teachers. Because, if there is good apparatus within the laboratory it is better for teachers: to teach well the students.
(PFG S 218-227)

In this longer quotation, the Headteacher refers to the benefits in Mathematics teaching from the use of models, devised in collaboration with Aston teachers, in terms of students’ improved engagement and attainment. Similar benefits for their understanding of concepts are attributed to the use of ‘props’ or models, co-created with Aston teachers, using low-cost locally available materials:

Instead of me just thinking of things, they see it really. So, we use the models and so on; so, they change the power. They of course improve their power of learning in mathematics. As you know that mathematics is very hard, the hardest subject and many people do not like it. So, but when they have something to play with they change their attitudes and they like it, because they learn by doing, instead of learning by thinking.

In the beginning time, before this link… people didn’t pass; no one, not anyone passed mathematics, but now we get some of them getting passes and credits… I think they gradually change into the positive; instead of being at negative attitude. So, they enjoy playing with the materials… they enjoying seeing the truth and reality. So, they change their attitudes.
(MK 55-64; 72-76)

These quotations are included at length, since through addressing priority needs in science and mathematics, two of the STEM subjects, students’ empowerment as learners has increased, benefiting their career choices. The Headteacher also elaborated on how students’ values and perceptions of female emancipation are affected by Visitor Exchanges:

When they go there, when they do their exchanges they see how people in Britain live with their husbands, live in their families and they compare when they come
back at their homes. The differences are of course a lot; so they learn from these differences. So I think we have already changed, pupils who are now here in the local environment, but have got the chance to visit from there, their lives are different from the people who have not yet gone anywhere from here.

(MK 231-237)

This should be qualified by stating that only a small number of students can visit the UK; but he suggested that similar advantages accrued through his students’ accessing alternative views of women’s roles, contrasting with previously held cultural values in Makunduchi.

Poor student behaviour encountered during observations in UK classrooms is detailed below, challenging assumptions that English schools automatically provide role models. It appears that teachers in Rotherham tolerated low-level student disruption and inattentiveness. The extracts contrast with respect shown towards adults by MSS students, although it should be questioned how appropriate students’ ‘remaining quiet’ might be. The teacher also debates Children’s Rights and the range of sanctions in teachers’ behaviour management strategies in Zanzibar:

But there is one thing, maybe they have experienced from us, children in our country are ready to accept any idea that they are given by their parents, something which is different from your country… When we were observing a lesson in the class, we felt the students are very rude there, but to you it was something normal.

They find the students, it is difficult to say that, but they feel that the students are rude really, in comparison with them. Because in Zanzibar, students are, they remain quiet there, they are listening to the teacher, but in England they say, look the students may not even care about what is going on… They observe, in England, students are not punished… But here, however old you are, if you are a student you may be punished by the teacher. So, maybe that is the good thing they find that it is not available in Zanzibar, because even the students, have no need of, especially of corporal punishment.

(K 26-29; 86-92)

The Tanzanian Education Ministry spokesperson notes similar issues in other UK classrooms:

I have been in the UK, yeah? Where it is very hard to handle the class... And sometimes when you teach, students they operate their mobile phones? So, it is very hard to have the class in the UK. Here in Tanzania, OK, we are saying students can operate their mobile phone, but when they are in class they have to switch them off... It’s a bit different from… what the students here in Tanzania behaves. So, I look at it, well, as a bad, as a bad example.

(SG 73-84)
Example 3: Professional learning related to education

Writing about professional capacity building for the 21st century, Andreotti and de Souza (2008) wrote that continuing professional development “Should be done in a way that prepares educators to respond to complex contexts and to think in ethical, critical and accountable ways” (p33).

I would suggest that the Aston-Makunduchi partnership has enabled those at MSS to meet Andreotti and de Souza’s aspirational brief (Ibid). Field data collected for this report demonstrates that working collaboratively with their Northern counterparts some MSS teachers have engaged in ‘critical’ CPD.

This English literature teacher explains how his spoken English has improved from working with Aston colleagues and his access to English literature texts has been affected:

I’ve benefited from these interactions. I’ve improved: practice, how to speak English. In terms of the interactions, I tend to speak with those people form Aston school. So, I understand how do they pronounce the words, the pronunciations. Also, I’ve benefited from their books they bring us here. I’ve benefited, because that is my, that is my hobby: to read the books, as a literature teacher. (S 84-90)

The same teacher, a former MSS student in the 1990s, elaborates upon how as a student the link had affected him. His spoken English improved through imitation of native English speakers. English books, including those he refers to as ‘vocabularies’, also helped:

I benefited, from the teachers from Aston school, in terms of the English, the way on how they pronounce the words. So that’s why, we just try to imitate, how do they pronounce the words. Even though we could not achieve them, but we try … One philosopher said that: “If you try, there is no guarantee; to pass or to achieve the goal. But, if you don’t try there is a guarantee that you will fail.” (Laughter) So we have to try… So, I have benefited to them in terms of pronunciations, vocabularies. They were giving us the vocabularies; so we used them till now, we are just using them. (S 231-238)

Here the Civics teacher reiterates that other teachers gain the similar benefits, related to English speaking and listening skills, from associating with Aston colleagues. He then elaborates on how it is the time spent sharing ideas together that he particularly values; this was found by Pedder et al (2008 and 2010) in their analysis of professional learning in the UK. Through innovation and collaboration, particularly in science and mathematics lesson planning and curriculum making, MSS teachers developed new materials, using affordable resources from the...
local environment. By replacing a need for expensive bought materials teachers challenged a perception that such commercial products were superior to those of their own invention. He implies that the impetus is driven from MSS: ‘we find the topic’; it is the Southern school setting its curriculum agenda. He also notes the positive teacher morale that arises as a result:

*The benefit for teachers, we are not differing very much from the students, sometimes in the same environment. But, more important is the time that we share our knowledge, then we innovate and good things that we are going to do in a cheap way. Maybe we use our environment to teach in some subjects, like biology, or sometimes physics, which we see in the real situation, and we use cheap materials, which are found in our environment. Just when they come here, they use our environment, we find the topic and we discuss, what we can teach that topic, by using our environment instead of depending on the materials which are so difficult to reach. So, it is good, because we share our ideas and we have knowledge, new knowledge, and we become positive.*

(Sh 46-55)

**Example 4: Accommodating dissent: informed, responsible decision-making**

Bourn (2005 and 2008b) argues that if development education is to stimulate ideas, new thinking and creativity, to reduce global inequalities, recognising dissenting voices is necessary.

Unwin (2010) quoting from Aston’s linking coordinator wrote that: “We talk. We can criticise each other because our relationship has reached that level” (p3), evidence that an equitable dialogue exists. A healthy link, such as the Aston-Makunduchi partnership, shows that airing dissent is crucial to the link’s sustainability. A short-term link between schools is unlikely to have developed to such an extent that a safe environment exists, in which such dissent can be readily accommodated. What was found in this research was a willingness to work through problems, such as communication difficulties, unsuccessful projects (Tomlinson, 2012), changes in school personnel and ‘resolve conflicts’. As Sizmur et al (2011) note:

*Whilst the culture of the partner school obviously had a significant effect, perhaps an even greater factor affecting the success of GL was the relationship that the UK teachers have with individual teachers at the partner school.*

(Sizmur et al, 2011, p64)

As Bourn (2008b) advocates, the same can inform a school link:

---

19 GL is an abbreviation for Global Learning. Hunt (2012) commenting on a questionnaire used in another piece of DERC research in schools commented: “We use the term Global Learning—you might use a different term, for example, development education, global citizenship, global dimension etc. All are appropriate and relevant”. 

Debates and discussions should be contested. There should be critical dialogue and debate and space for a range of voices, views and perspectives. It needs to recognise that education must move from uncritical to critical understanding, from personal to global being, from inaction to action and from static to development in its broadest sense.

(Bourn, Ibid, p19)

Part 2 (1) earlier showed other examples in which empowerment is promoted through activities within the link.
Conclusions from research findings

“What does a linked school in Africa get from a link that affirms their dignity?” (Gaines, 2006, p13) In response to Gaines’ question (Ibid), for MSS its dignity is affirmed in ways that other Southern schools could replicate. Makunduchi Secondary School’s dignity is shown in several ways:

1. Self-respect: the link is accorded prestige locally in Zanzibar; the Ministry of Education there supports its evolving developments, such as Zanzigap.

2. Praiseworthiness: MSS’s link is regarded as a ‘model’ of good practice, known and celebrated beyond Zanzibar.

3. Due respect: locally designed initiatives have been implemented at Makunduchi, when these have encountered problems local solutions have been sought. Respect is evident in a willingness to be critical, in a desire to improve the quality of the link’s outcomes.

4. Innate right to respect and ethical treatment: Aston supports initiatives in Zanzibar; ‘instigation’ lies with those at Makunduchi. Luis Hernandez’s criticism shared in IrishAid’s (2006) publication, that: “There is little effort made to portray the people as active participants and subjects in their society, despite their poor conditions” (p6) is actively challenged in this link.

5. The link’s aspiration is for ‘genuine partnership’. While the phrase “help the local people, community and school to develop their capacity and to put their own initiatives into action” infers that help was needed, to facilitate capacity building at the outset, decision-making lies in the hands of those at Makunduchi. As Cook commented, (2010, p22) “spending money on changing the hearts and minds of civil society through mutually beneficial school partnerships that develop global learning is fundamental in promoting a more cohesive world”.

6. Participants have created enduring friendships; inter-generational equity is in evidence as the link enters its third decade.

This report has shown how the Aston-Makunduchi partnership “presents a strong evidence-base to substantiate successful outcomes” (Cook, Ibid, p21). It addressed Gaines’ 2006 criticism that school links represent “an enthusiastic victory narrative without a robust evidence base” (p11). This partnership contrasts with Cook’s 2010 assessment (op cit.), of linking relationships which “are not successful that result in damaged relationships, reinforced stereotypes and wasted resources including time and money on all sides” (p21). It has demonstrated how unreliable stereotypes are challenged and that relationships have been consolidated and
constantly evolved, ensuring that resources, including time and money have generally been used in Makunduchi to good effect. Complexities persist.

Part 2 of this report has aired criticisms and challenges. It explored capacity building and Southern initiatives; it identified a range of not always successful or sustainable developments, over the link’s 20-year evolution. It demonstrated evidence for Andreotti’s critical Global Citizenship Education (2006). The final section of Part 3 identifies ongoing challenges facing this link, and possibly others. It concludes with five recommendations and pointers for debate, discussion and future research; these are compared to a 2008 audit.
Future challenges facing this link

Ongoing issues facing this link relate to the possibility of ‘linking fatigue’ emerging, accommodating transitions of personnel at both ends, and the availability of support to maintain IT equipment at Makunduchi. Other challenges relate to future funding of activities and potential conflicts of interest between the partnership, Zanzigap and local education authorities as Zanzibar and UK educational agenda evolve. If a higher profile in future is sought for S/S links other ‘models’ might replace this long-standing educational partnership’s ‘S/N’ formula, as a preferred linking model.

Perhaps the greatest threats to the sustainability of this relationship are related to competing claims on teachers’ time? While MSS personnel interviewed by this author made time to support their students’ education beyond their normal teaching commitments (McNicholl’s 2012 research notes contrasting criticism from Aston of MSS colleagues’ professionalism), what is not known is how many similar demands confront those in Rotherham. As English Teachers’ Standards change (DfE, 2012), curricula and public examination specifications are revised or created and educational policy documents are introduced what rarely happens is that those in school gain time for planning, reflection and creativity, especially for initiatives whose outcomes are difficult to assess or ‘measure’ in the short-term. As Bourn and Cara, (2012), Cook (2010), Edge et. al. (2008), Sizmur et al (2011) and this author (2008, 2010, 2012) have intimated, the outcomes of a link may emerge only slowly and be missed by evaluative exercises. Such outcomes could be demonstrably effective in addressing critical Global Citizenship Education that this link has sought to instigate, and make profound differences to individuals. As Unwin writes (2010): “There is also evidence of former Aston students remaining committed to development work in Zanzibar many years after leaving the school” (p3), confirmed by Tomlinson (2012). Gibbons remarked upon others’ similar long-term commitments to critical Global Citizenship Education (quoted in Leonard, 2004).

Avoiding the risk of simplistic, counter-productive outcomes has been vital in this link’s evolution; intercultural and global knowledge and experiences gained have been of paramount importance. As Egan et al (2009, p2) commented, linking is a process which recognises that:

*We as ‘linkers’ or organisations, which initiate or advise these partnerships, cannot determine their aims and objectives, we need to respect their perspectives by supporting and coaching them to find their own way of defining the values and aims of their individual partnership.*

20 http://education.exeter.ac.uk/projects.php?id=450 accessed 20/04/12
This is why Makunduchi’s relationship with Aston is celebrated in Zanzibar, Tanzania and the UK. Teachers should take note, in some links:

_How pupils are supported in their responses to difference and to poverty is causing concern. A contributing factor is that many teachers lack the knowledge and experience required to adequately address issues of an intercultural and global nature that are integral to partnership learning._

Five recommendations:

The following recommendations are suggested as the basis for discussion by all stakeholders involved in South-North partnerships and links. Specific themes and pointers for discussion follow each recommendation.

1. **There is a continuing requirement for evaluation. Discussion and airing of views, with all concerned acting as ‘critical friends’, should be encouraged.** When linking initiatives are assessed views should be exchanged within an agreed time-period. Ideally this should be an equitable dialogue, taking students’ views into account. Without open dialogue links die, even apparently sustainable relationships of long-standing (Gibbons, 2010; McNicholl, 2012).

   **POINTERS FOR DISCUSSION:**
   An ethos of trust and transparency should be encouraged, so that constructive criticism can be aired. Power relations within links should demonstrate Andreotti’s basis for caring, of responsibility towards one another. When a project is not succeeding the reasons should be explored.

   To ensure that such discussions take place regular, affordable means of communication should be used, including SMS messaging. Effective maintenance of Makunduchi’s IT suite could secure e-mail communication.

2. **There is an ongoing need to identify characteristics promoting effective linking. Linkers should promote dissemination of lessons learnt (This report’s 4th recommendation should therefore be prioritised).**

   **POINTERS FOR DISCUSSION:**
   Collaborative learning outcomes need to be disseminated widely, at minimum cost. Researchers should share their findings in suitable educational and development fora, including conferences and peer-reviewed digitally accessible journals or subject specific publications (ideally adopting affordable copyleft licensing). Lessons learnt should be shared using modern media, including blogs and Nings.
Recognising that the relative costs of personal participation in such fora are unequal for S and the N participants, linkers should seek means of promoting evaluation and research by those in the South. The UKOWLA organisation should aid such dissemination. UKAid, through the Connecting Classrooms programme and NGOs and the DEC network can do likewise. Southern participants could seek funding to report their linking experiences first-hand at the Geographical Association’s annual conferences.

3. The adoption of a preferred methodology or pedagogy may be appropriate.

POINTERS FOR DISCUSSION:
When considering embarking on linking ideally background theoretical reading on postcolonialism and critical thinking should be undertaken, fostering a depth of understanding of the complex issues which can emerge. Organisations partnering schools should explore the risk of a dependency culture at the outset of relationships.

To this end, approaches such as Through Other Eyes and OSDE methodologies, or Philosophy for Children (P4C) can support the emergence of critical thinking for teachers and students.

4. Practical resourcing of Southern IT should be explored.

POINTERS FOR DISCUSSION:
Using reliable sources of funding and maintenance, expertise could be sought from suitable higher education institution, NGO and commercial organisations. Without the securing of this support, in future S/N links may lose favour as educational initiatives.

Technical research efforts should be directed to the creation of suitable, ideally solar-powered, IT equipment affordable in the South. Without this ‘guarantee’ schools will lose out on e-learning opportunities.

The Aston-Makunduchi partnership’s website should be regularly updated and include attributable Southern inputs, ideally from students.

5. Widened participation in global school relationships should be facilitated.

POINTERS FOR DISCUSSION:
Suitable participants could include NGOs, Higher Education Institutions, Initial Teacher Education providers, schools from established educational consortia (such as Teaching Schools, in England) and commercial organisations.
As appropriate, schools, NGOs and commercial organisations should work together when links engage in development projects.

Competitions could be devised to encourage student participation in shared projects; prizes should include appropriate educational resources for schools and teachers’ resource centres.

Initial teacher education courses should include opportunities for new teachers to consider how their curriculum development can integrate a global dimension; how school links might facilitate this should feature. Initial teacher education institutions could include overseas study visits, promoting critical engagement in links.

In Zanzibar relationships with Sheffield-Hallam and Sheffield universities, the South Yorkshire Development Education Centre (DECSY) the Sheffield-based Centre, and schools currently working collaboratively with Aston should be developed further.

In Zanzibar, South-South linking should be explored, especially with Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics establishments in India and Nigeria, commercial organisations and those supporting nascent collaborative S/S educational initiatives.

Matching these recommendations to this author’s audit in 2008 (Leonard, pp86-88), it is evident that the last two proposals are new. The first three recommendations remain broadly similar.

The Aston-Makunduchi partnership has sought to promote critical engagement, as inevitable tensions have emerged some have been voiced. Najda and Thakwalakwa (2012) suggest that in links “by creating space for equitable dialogue between educators in the North and the South tangible benefits for development (especially related to the MDGs for schools) also result”. This report shows what has been achieved in Makunduchi. This relationship will need to continue to evolve if it is to thrive, adjusting to competing educational and political agenda, whilst supporting new generations of students and teachers to derive innovative activities.
References


Websites: in addition to footnotes in the main text (accessed 30 October 2012)

NGO News Africa:
http://ngonewsafrica.org/archives/3967

Practical Action
http://practicalaction.org/technology-justice

Tanzania Development Trust
http://www.tanzdevtrust.org/home

Through Other Eyes (TOE)
www.throughothereyes.org.uk
Author

Alison Leonard teaches geography at Westminster School, London and is a Senior Lecturer at Canterbury Christ Church University (CCCU). For five years she combined her teaching with the role of Geography Subject Tutor on the Teach First Initial Teacher Education (ITE) programme. Her interest in school linking began with her involvement in a link established under the auspices of the “On the Line” programme, in 1999. Her writing and research for her doctoral studies are now primarily concerned with how schools in the global South are affected by the school linking process. For two years she was a tutor at the Institute of Education, on the “North/South Education Partnerships” module of the MA in Development Education.
The Institute of Education is the UK’s leading centre for studies in education and related disciplines. Its staff of pre-eminent scholars and talented students make up an intellectually-rich learning community. A member of the 1994 Group of 19 leading research intensive UK universities, the Institute is the only college of the University of London dedicated entirely to education and related areas of social science.

Development Education Research Centre
Institute of Education
36 Gordon Square
London WC1 H 0PD