COPYRIGHT
This is a thesis accepted for a Higher Degree of the University of London. It is an unpublished typescript and the copyright is held by the author. All persons consulting the thesis must read and abide by the Copyright Declaration below.

COPYRIGHT DECLARATION
I recognise that the copyright of the above-described thesis rests with the author and that no quotation from it or information derived from it may be published without the prior written consent of the author.

LOANS
Theses may not be lent to individuals, but the Senate House Library may lend a copy to approved libraries within the United Kingdom, for consultation solely on the premises of those libraries. Application should be made to: Inter-Library Loans, Senate House Library, Senate House, Malet Street, London WC1E 7HU.

REPRODUCTION
University of London theses may not be reproduced without explicit written permission from the Senate House Library. Enquiries should be addressed to the Theses Section of the Library. Regulations concerning reproduction vary according to the date of acceptance of the thesis and are listed below as guidelines.

A. Before 1962. Permission granted only upon the prior written consent of the author. (The Senate House Library will provide addresses where possible).

B. 1962 - 1974. In many cases the author has agreed to permit copying upon completion of a Copyright Declaration.

C. 1975 - 1988. Most theses may be copied upon completion of a Copyright Declaration.

D. 1989 onwards. Most theses may be copied.

This thesis comes within category D.

☐ This copy has been deposited in the Library of UCL.

☐ This copy has been deposited in the Senate House Library, Senate House, Malet Street, London WC1E 7HU.
Patriotic Heterotopias: Architecture, City, and the Nation, Italy (1861-1911)

Sara Godfrey
University College London
Abstract

This thesis is an enquiry into what patriotism means as an experience, which is considered through the historical context of the birth of the Italian nation and the 'making' of the patriotic subject. It seeks to raise questions on how patriotism is produced by the subject's dynamic interaction with Others and how it is through the repetition of patriotic spatial practices that a national psyche is formed.

To undertake this enquiry four of the most significant spaces in Liberal Italy are analysed – the Cimitero Monumentale (Milan), the Vittorio Emanuele Monument (Rome), Lake Fucino (Abruzzo), the Torre Monumentale di San Martino (Lake Garda) – using Michel Foucault's notion of heterotopias as Other spaces where social identity is formed. At each site it is argued that the individual becomes patriotic through falling in love with the Other. The ideological processes by which this infatuation with the patriotic Other occurs is considered through the different ways in which each site appeals to utopian images of fathers and mothers.

This process is developed from Gilles Deleuze's theory that the boy becomes a man through a tragic oscillation between a paternal sadistic symbolic economy and a maternal masochistic one. From studying the patriotic heterotopias it is apparent that sites situated in the city are characterized by a maternal experience, whereas those in the countryside tend to be dominated by a paternal arrangement. Thus, it is suggested that a national psyche develops from an inner motherland, from which it spirals outwards until it reaches the outer limits of patriotic experience that are defended and guarded by a protective fatherland. These inner and outer experiences are united by what is argued is the principal component of patriotism: learning to live for Others more than for oneself.
Contents

List of figures iv
Acknowledgements xvii

1. Introduction. Becoming Patriotic: The De-individualization of Social Identity in Other Spaces
   1.1 Being and Becoming 1
   1.2 Living for Others 7
   1.3 Mothers and Fathers 25
   1.4 The City and its Others 35
   1.5 On Writing the Patriotic Experience 47

2. You Only Live Twice: Escaping to a Dream Life and a Romantic Lover through the Patriotic Kiss of the Cimitero Monumentale, Milan
   2.1 The Stolen Kiss 55
   2.2 A Kiss Is Just a Kiss? 59
   2.3 Cathedral Spaces 59
   2.4 The Cult of Saint Alessandro Manzoni 67
   2.5 The Secular New Healers 80
   2.6 Letter to the Romans 95
3. **Indecent Proposals: Matrimony and Monumentality in the Vittorio Emanuele Monument**

3.1 An Experience of Monumental Spaces 117

3.2 Architecture as Urban Spectacle 121

3.3 The Roman Question? 132

3.4 Bringing the Past to Life: Archaeology and the Nation 135

3.5 Proposals 141

3.6 The Wedding Cake 148

3.7 The Wedding Ceremony 155

3.8 The Wedding Speech 159

4. **The End of the Affair: The Pagan Mistress and the Blessed Virgin in the Bonifica of Rome at Lake Fucino**

4.1 The Fantasy Affair 167

4.2 Rome – Ville Impériale 179

4.3 The Roman Prince 187

4.4 The Fall of Rome 194

4.5 *Civitas Terrena* 204

4.6 *Civitas Dei* 216
5 Endgame: Occluding Objects and Optical Tricks in the Cult of War at the Torre Monumentale di San Martino della Battaglia

5.1 Play 235
5.2 City of War 249
5.3 Captain Torelli 258
5.4 Skull and Cross Bones 266
5.5 Telescopic Pleasures 276
5.6 A Portrait of the Nation as a Young Artist 287

6 Conclusions 305

Bibliography 315
List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figures</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Between pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>The Cimitero Monumentale. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>55/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>The Cimitero Monumentale. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>56/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>The Cimitero Monumentale. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>56/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>The Cimitero Monumentale. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>56/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>The Cimitero Monumentale. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>58/9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Francesco Hayez, <em>Il Bacio: Episodio della giovinezza, costumi del secolo XIV</em> (1859), Pinacoteca di Brera, Milan.</td>
<td>59/60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>The design of the Piazza del Duomo and Galleria by Giuseppe Mengoni 1865, adapted by the author. From Maurizio Grandi and Attilio Pracchi, <em>Milano: guida all’architettura moderna</em> (Bologna: Zanichelli, 1980), p. 25.</td>
<td>73/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figures</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>Carlo Maciacchini, <em>Planimetria generale del nuovo Cimitero Monumentale</em> (Milan: Vallardi, 1863), Plate I.</td>
<td>73/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>Plan of the Duomo. From Gaetano Franchetti, <em>Storia e descrizione del Duomo del Milano</em> (Milan: De Stefanis, 1821), Plate IX.</td>
<td>73/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>'Camera in cui spiro Alessandro Manzoni', <em>L'Emporio Pittresco</em>, 1-7 June 1873, p. 253.</td>
<td>80/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>'Effigie di Alessandro Manzoni, copiata pochi momenti dopo la sua morte', <em>L'Emporio Pittresco</em>, 1-7 June 1873, p. 254.</td>
<td>80/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.14</td>
<td>'Funerali ad Alessandro Manzoni fatti in Milano il 29 maggio', <em>L'Emporio Pittresco</em>, 8-15 June 1873, pp. 458-59.</td>
<td>84/5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>A map of Milan adapted by the author. From Ignazio Cantù, <em>Milano e i suoi corpi santi colle notizie più utili al viaggiatore</em> (Milan: Vallardi, 1870), (pullout).</td>
<td>87/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.16</td>
<td>'La prima cremazione’, <em>L'Illustrazione Italiana</em>, 14-30 January 1876, p. 212.</td>
<td>98/9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.17</td>
<td>'La prima cremazione’, <em>L'Illustrazione Italiana</em>, 14-30 January 1876, p. 212.</td>
<td>98/9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figures

2.18 Plan of the crematorium, adapted by the author to show the cremation urn of Albert Keller. From Gaetano Pini, *La Création en Italie et à l'étranger, de 1774 jusqu'à nos jours* (Milan: Hoepli, 1885), p. 36.


2.21 The Famedio. From Ginex and Selvafolta, *Il Cimitero Monumentale di Milano* (see Fig. 2.20), p. 23.

2.22 The Famedio. From Annoni, *Il Cimitero Monumentale di Milano* (see Fig. 2.19), p. 42.


2.25 Plan of S. Giovanni alle Fonti. From Brivio, *Guida del Duomo di Milano* (see Fig. 2.13), p. 59.

2.26 Side panel of *zona mediana*. Author’s photograph.

Between pages

101/2

104/5

104/5

107/8

107/8

110/11

110/11

110/11

113/4
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figures</th>
<th>Caption</th>
<th>Between pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>Central panel of <em>zona mediana</em>. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>113/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.28</td>
<td><em>Zona superiore</em>. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>113/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>The Vittorio Emanuele Monument. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>117/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>View into the portico. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>118/9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>View across the portico towards the church of S. Maria di Aracoeli.</td>
<td>118/9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>View from the portico towards the Pantheon. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>120/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>View towards Piazza Venezia. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>120/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>‘Roma Libera’, <em>L’Emporio Pittoresco</em>, 13-19 October, 1872, pp. 169.</td>
<td>129/30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>Rodolfo Lanciani, the Capitoline hill. Reproduced in <em>The Roman Capitol in Ancient times and Modern times</em>, trans. by Frederick Lawton (London: Heinemann, 1906), (pullout).</td>
<td>143/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figures</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>Engraving of the Capitoline Hill. From Rodocanachi, <em>The Roman Capitol</em> (see Fig. 3.9), p. 191.</td>
<td>147/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>L. Pogliaghi, sketch of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument for the visit of Wilhelm II to Rome, 1903. Reproduced in Nicoletta Cardano, “Il cavallo sull’altare”: antologia documentaria’, in <em>Il Vittoriano</em> (see Fig. 3.11), II, pp. 53-116, (p. 20).</td>
<td>148/9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>Gesso model of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument for the Milan National Exhibition, 1906. From Pier Luigi Porzio, ‘La forma architettonica del Vittoriano nei disegni e nei modelli della fabbrica’, in <em>Il Vittoriano</em> (see Fig. 3.11), I, 37-90 (p. 83).</td>
<td>148/9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>Gesso model of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument. From Porzio, ‘La forma architettonica del Vittoriano’, (see Fig. 3.14) p. 40.</td>
<td>149/50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>Giuseppe Sacconi and Eugenio Maccagnani, design of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument. From Catherine Brice, ‘L’immaginario della terza Roma’, in <em>Il Vittoriano</em> (see Fig. 3.11), I, 11-24 (p. 21).</td>
<td>149/50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figures</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Between pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>A cross-section of the Capitoline hill, 1885, adapted by the author. From Brancia Di Apricena, <em>Il complesso dell’Aracoeli</em> (see Fig. 3.10), p. 24.</td>
<td>149/50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.18</td>
<td>Luigi Canina, <em>Edifizi di Roma antica</em> (Rome: [n.pub.], 1856), Plate CXIV.</td>
<td>149/50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.20</td>
<td>The ceremony design. From Porzio, ‘La forma architettonica del Vittoriano’ (see Fig. 3.14), p. 43.</td>
<td>156/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.21</td>
<td>The foundation stone ceremony. Photograph from Primo Acciaresi, <em>Giuseppe Sacconi e l’opera sua massima</em> (Rome: [n.pub.], 1911), p. 72.</td>
<td>156/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>The Torre di Paolo III, 1885. From Roberto Di Paola, ‘Il complesso monumentale della mole del Vittoriano’, in <em>Il Vittoriano</em> (see Fig. 3.11), p. 136.</td>
<td>156/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.23</td>
<td>Close-up of Fig. 3.22.</td>
<td>156/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Jean Joseph-Xavier Bidault (1758-1846), A panorama of Lake Fucino, Louvre Museum, Paris.</td>
<td>167/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figures</td>
<td>Between pages</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figures


4.9 *La religiosità di Ferdinando II: per la definizione del dogma dell'Immacolata concezione, l'esercito napoletano viene fatto sfilare sul campo di Marte nel gennaio 1855.* Engraving in Museum of San Martino, Naples.

4.10 A statue of a Madonna. From Agostinoni, *Il Fucino* (see Fig. 4.3), p. 32.

4.11 The statue of the Virgin Mary. Author’s photograph.


4.13 Cunicolo Maggiore. From Agostinoni, *Il Fucino* (see Fig. 4.3), p. 17.

4.14 Brisse and Rotrou, *Atlas* (see Fig. 4.12), detail of Plate V.

4.15 Close-up of Fig. 4.14.

4.16 Brisse and Rotrou, *Atlas* (see Fig. 4.12), Plate VI.


Between pages

193/4
198/9
199/200
199/200
209/10
209/10
211/2
211/2
214/5
223/4
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figures</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>Brisse and Rotrou, <em>Atlas</em> (see Fig. 4.12), Plate XVI.</td>
<td>223/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.19</td>
<td>The Torlonia coat of arms in Avezzano. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>224/5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>Brisse and Rotrou, <em>Atlas</em> (see Fig. 4.12), Plate XVII.</td>
<td>225/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>Brisse and Rotrou, <em>Atlas</em> (see Fig. 4.12), Plate XIII.</td>
<td>229/30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>Portrait of Beatrice Cenci attributed to Guido Reni (1575-1642). National Gallery of Art, Rome.</td>
<td>231/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.23</td>
<td>Brisse and Rotrou, <em>Atlas</em>, (see Fig. 4.12), Plate XXI.</td>
<td>231/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>The Torre Monumentale di San Martino. From <em>L’Illustrazione Italiana</em>, 15 October 1893, p. 211.</td>
<td>235/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>The Italian Republic. From Desmond Gregory, <em>Napoleon’s Italy</em> (London: Associated University Presses, 2001), p. 42.</td>
<td>249/50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>A Roman-style gladiatorial sea games held at the Milan arena on occasion of the baptism of the <em>Roi de Rome</em> (June, 1811), Napoleonic Museum, Rome.</td>
<td>249/50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Coronation of Napoleon in Milan cathedral (25 May 1805).</td>
<td>251/2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figures</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>A collection of newspapers reporting on the <em>Cinque Giornate</em> Revolution, 1848, Museum of the Risorgimento, Milan.</td>
<td>253/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>Illustration of the barricades used in the <em>Cinque Giornate</em> revolution, 1848. From Carlo Cattaneo, <em>L'insurrezione de Milan e Le considerazioni sul 1848</em>, ed. by Cesare Spellanzon, 3rd edn (Turin: Einaudi, 1949), p. 6.</td>
<td>253/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.12</td>
<td>Napoleon I and his son. From Fugier, <em>Napoleone e l'Italia</em> (see Fig. 5.6), II, Plate XXXIX.</td>
<td>259/60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.14</td>
<td>Ossuary of San Martino. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>268/9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figures

5.15 S. Bernardino alle Ossa, Milan. Author’s photograph
Between pages 268/9

5.16 Exhumation of corpses at San Martino and Solferino,
*L'Emporio Pittoresco*, 24-30 April 1870, p. 257.
Between pages 268/9

5.17 M. Gaburo, *Trasporto delle ossa a Solferino*, Museum of the
Risorgimento, Solferino.
Between pages 270/1

5.18 Photograph of the inauguration of the Ossuary of Solferino
(1870), Museum of the Risorgimento, Brescia.
Between pages 270/1

5.19 Interior of the Ossuary of San Martino. From Antonio Breda,
*Guida illustrato di S. Martino e Solferino* (Padua: Sacchetto,
1893), p. 112.
Between pages 273/4

5.20 R. Gemma Frisius, *De radio astronomico et geometrico liber*,
1545. Reproduced in Michael Kubovy, *The Psychology of
Perspective and Renaissance Art* (Cambridge University
Between pages 276/7

5.21 Illustration of Alberti’s perspective using front picture plane.
From Kubovy (see Fig. 5.20), p. 19.
Between pages 276/7

5.22 Carlo Bossoli, *Battaglia di Solferino*, The National Museum
of the Risorgimento, Turin.
Between pages 277/8

5.23 Design of the Torre Monumentale. From Bruno Tobia, *Una
patria per gli italiani: spazi, itinerari, monumenti nell’Italia
unita, 1870-1900* (Rome: Laterza, 1991), p. 188.
Between pages 277/8

5.24 Crystal dome of the Torre Monumentale from below. Author’s
photograph.
Between pages 277/8
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figures</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Between pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.25</td>
<td>Crystal dome of the Torre Monumentale from above. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>277/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.26-7</td>
<td>Spiral staircase of the Torre. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>280/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.28</td>
<td>Staircase of the tower of Solferino. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>280/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.29</td>
<td>Enclosed staircase of the Torre. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>280/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.30</td>
<td>Antonio Dal Zotto, bronze statue of Vittorio Emanuele. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>288/9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.31</td>
<td>Vittorio Bressanin, <em>Incontro di Vittorio Emanuele II con il Maresciallo Radetzky a Vignale (24 Marzo 1849)</em>. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>290/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>Bressanin, <em>Gli Zuavi proclamano Vittorio Emanuele II il loro “Caporale d’Onore” dopo la battaglia di Palestro (31 maggio 1859)</em>. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>290/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.33</td>
<td>Bressanin, <em>Napoleone III e Vittorio Emanuele II entrano trionfalmente in Milano l’8 giugno 1859</em>. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>291/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.34</td>
<td>Bressanin, <em>Vittorio Emanuele II a Roma Capitale d’Italia</em>. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>291/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.35</td>
<td>Close-up of Fig. 5. 23, adapted by the author.</td>
<td>293/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.36</td>
<td>Bressanin, Rome personified as a virgin. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>293/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.37</td>
<td>Bressanin, Italy personified as a warrior woman. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>293/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.38-9</td>
<td>Bressanin, <em>La difesa di Venezia – 1849</em>. Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>296/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figures</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.40</td>
<td>Pontremoli, <em>Quadrato di Villafranca</em> – 24 giugno 1866.</td>
<td>299/300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.41</td>
<td>Statue of Umberto I: Author’s photograph.</td>
<td>299/300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.42-3</td>
<td>Vizzotto Alberti, <em>La Breccia di Porta Pia</em> – 20 settembre 1870.</td>
<td>302/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.44</td>
<td>The view from the summit towards the Spia d’Italia upon the horizon.</td>
<td>304/5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.45</td>
<td>The view from the summit towards Lake Garda and the Italian Alps upon the horizon.</td>
<td>304/5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>The cover of a map of the Cimitero Monumentale from 1911.</td>
<td>307/8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the Arts and Humanities Research Board for awarding me a studentship; the AHRB Centre for African and Asian studies at SOAS for funding my trip to Abruzzo in October 2003; and the Graduate School at University College London for funding my research trip to Lake Garda and several overseas conferences.

Writing this PhD has been an incredible adventure and I wish to acknowledge those who assisted me in making the experience possible. First and foremost I would like to thank my principal supervisor, David Forgacs, for his patience and his thoughtful contribution to the development of my ideas on patriotism. I would also like to acknowledge Tim Mathews (second supervisor); the artist, Sergio Cardone, for his kind assistance in my research on Lake Fucino; my father and mother (Brian and Jean Godfrey) for countless discussions on architectural theory and psychoanalysis; my sisters, Louise, Katherine and Charlotte for their love; Charles Burdett for comments on Chapter Two and Three; Anne Paton, head of the Graduate Writer’s Group; Francesco Manzini for his enthusiasm; Adrian Forty for his enduring encouragement; Michael Worton for his invaluable support throughout the duration of my thesis; and finally I wish to thank Matthew for friendship in sunshine and shade.
Becoming Patriotic: The De-individualization of Social Identity in Other Spaces

Que signifie ‘devenir un homme’? Il apparaît que ce n’est pas du tout faire comme le père, ni prendre sa place. C’est au contraire en supprimer la place et la ressemblance, pour faire l’homme nouveau.1

Gilles Deleuze, *Le Froid et le cruel*

L’homme n’est qu’une invention récente, une figure qui n’a pas deux siècles, un simple pli dans notre savoir, et qu’il disparaîtra dès que celui-ci aura trouvé une forme nouvelle.2

Michel Foucault, *Les Mots et les choses*

1.1 Being and Becoming

In ‘Cultural Identity and Diaspora’ Stuart Hall differentiates between ‘becoming’ and ‘being’, arguing that if our sense of identity is always in process, that it is never fixed, then it is a matter of ‘becoming’ as well as ‘being’.3 Thinking about cultural identity in terms of ‘becoming’ challenges traditional conceptions of identity where it is fixed by notions of ‘being’ in which the subject connects back to a stable essentialized view of the nation – for example I am English because I was born in Devon and my origins are in England. While the notion of ‘being’ a specific cultural identity allows us access into a collective past, into common

---

codes, shared experiences and stable national meanings, Hall asserts that our identity is always 'becoming' in that we each continually position ourselves in a different way to the binary opposites that notions of a 'being' generate – for example 'them' and 'us', English, non-English.4 My own family history illustrates Hall's point very clearly. My father's past is in the journey of Spanish Sephardi Jews to England in the seventeenth century, as my mother's belongs to the migration of Czechs to London in the nineteenth century, seeking a new life outside the Austro-Hungarian Empire. And so I am always positioning myself in relation to what being English is, whether that be the white man's fantasy of Saint George and the dragon, or part of a multi-cultural society. The act of becoming, of positioning myself in relation to fixed notions of 'being', makes me aware that I only have a sense of belonging to an English identity to the extent to which I am conscious that I do not belong, that I am part of a 'them' rather than an 'us'.

In this thesis I am interested in how the subject becomes patriotic as a positioning and a process that is different from notions of 'being' that characterize the social identity of the national subject's daily life. The four different monumental spaces I have chosen for study illustrate how patriotism might be thought of as a series of becomings, positioned around a particular idea of what Italy was as a new nation. The first space is a cemetery, the Cimitero Monumentale di Milano. Its creators sought to arouse civic patriotism by encouraging Milanese and Italians to have a romantic involvement with the city. The second space is the national monument dedicated to the first king of Italy – Vittorio Emanuele II – the Vittorio Emanuele Monument in Rome. It was conceived as the most important site of pilgrimage in

---

4 ibid., pp. 222-24.
Liberal Italy, competing with the Vatican for a patriotic love of the nation akin to religious devotion. The third is the space of Lake Fucino in Abruzzo and its reclamation, an act in which becoming patriotic was thought of as a reinvigoration of the ruralism of Julius Caesar through modern agriculture. The fourth is the Torre di San Martino della Battaglia, near Lake Garda, built on the hill of San Martino where the Piedmontese army of Vittorio Emanuele and the French troops of Napoleon III fought against the Austrians in 1859. At this site patriotism was associated with the pleasure of war and the annihilation of the enemy. In spite of the different ways in which the subject is invited into becoming patriotic at each site, the four spaces had a significant role in the development of a national psyche, since they were places where fantasies of the new nation were visualized. Italians would make pilgrimages to these spaces to pay homage to the patria.

In the essay ‘Le Sujet et le pouvoir’ Michel Foucault describes how human beings are individualized into subjects with social identities, in relation to institutional forms of power, through discursive practices – for example the surveillance of the prison regime, and the isolation of the confessional. In contrast to Foucault’s notion of ‘individualization’, I am interested in the opposite process, which I shall call ‘de-individualization’. I shall use this term to describe the ways in which the subject relinquishes a particular social identity, and the conventions of class, ethnicity, or marital status that individualize them, to ‘become patriotic’ as a collective experience initiated at Other monumental spaces.

Unlike Hall’s notion of ‘becoming’ as a positioning founded upon a sense of non-belonging, the collectivized experience of ‘becoming patriotic’ propels the individual towards increased feelings of belonging, and of being a national subject. Gilles Deleuze’s notion of ‘becoming a man’ and ‘becoming woman’ are two different positionings that will allow us to distinguish between the processes involved in ‘becoming patriotic’ against ‘becoming’ as a recognition of non-belonging. ‘Becoming a man’ is the principal object of his enquiry in *Le Froid et le cruel*, his study on sadism and masochism. In the first epigraph Deleuze asserts that the trajectory towards ‘becoming a man’ is a highly destructive process, in which the subject does not mirror the gestures and the role of the father, but obliterates them from his psyche so that a new man will emerge, free from father. In contrast ‘becoming woman’ emerges in Deleuze’s later studies on schizophrenia and capitalism that he wrote with the psychoanalyst Félix Guattari, where they consider the mental illness of psychosis as a symptom of an intensely individualized society, whose foundation is the gender roles to which children are taught to conform. The girl is taught to comply to specific gender roles and punished if she does not conform to them, while the boy is encouraged to see the girl as his object of desire, and therefore as an opposed organism.6 As the Other to ‘man’, his victim, and his object of desire, ‘becoming woman’ is the path towards transcending the binary opposites of male-female and entrance into the ‘real’, where an infinite number of sexes and positionings are available to the subject in their endless becoming.7

---

7 ibid., pp. 339-40.
Deleuze’s conception of ‘infinite becoming’ is an aspect of his philosophy of transcendental-empiricism in which the term ‘transcendental’ designates an experience that has no ground outside of itself. Instead, as Slavoj Žižek states, it defines the a priori conditions of our experience of constituted reality as that which transcends the binary opposites of subject-object.8 In this context Foucault’s notion of the empirico-transcendental doublet is antithetical to Deleuze’s theory of infinite becoming. Foucault’s conception of the empirico-transcendental doublet is expressed in the second epigraph from Les Mots et les choses by his notion that modern man is an invented subject that is at the same time an object of study. The modern subject is split between an ‘inner worldly entity’, who is the empirical person, and his or her double, the transcendental subject who lives outside as the ‘constitutive agent of the world’ as Žižek puts it.9 This empirico-transcendental doublet is problematic in that the subject believes that the outer world can be rendered knowable by deciphering its codes. In our minds it therefore constitutes a higher truth that we may reach with the assistance of unique individuals – priests, kings, saviours – or through religious practices such as asceticism. In this thesis I combine Foucault’s theory of empirco-transcendentalism – as a way in which human beings are individualized into subjects through investing their power in a higher Other – with Deleuze’s philosophy of becoming, so that I may assert that becoming patriotic is a transcendental experience that offers the subject the possibility of becoming the Other. In occupying the position of the Other, the subject becomes de-individualized since they necessarily transcend the binary opposites of social identity that were originally imposed upon them by the Other in

---

8 Slavoj Žižek, Organs without Bodies: On Deleuze and Consequences (London: Routledge, 2004), pp. 4-5.
9 ibid., p. 44.
the process of social individualization. If patriotism may be thought of as becoming the Other, it may therefore be defined as a process in which the boy becomes a man through learning to live for Others rather than for himself.
1.2 Living for Others

The medical condition of a heterotopia was first described in the early 1900s. The term denotes the 'spatial displacement of normal tissue' whose potentially pathological condition is derived from the tissue's deviation from its normal topos. As heterotopic tissue is essentially healthy tissue in an unusual place it is often treated as a benign variation on the norm rather like a birthmark. When heterotopias appear more likely to mutate than orthotopic tissue, they are diagnosed as pathological and are surgically removed from the body: for example, the female condition of endometriosis is the result of uterine mucosa appearing outside the uterus in the fallopian tubes (Fig. 1.1). It is thought that heterotopic tissue is laid down in the intense period of tissue dispersion in the embryonic phase of human development when the foetus is in the mother's womb, since it occurs in organs that are 'adjacent to each other', or that have a 'close spatial relationship in their evolution'.

Paralleling the medical condition, the term 'heterotopia' first appeared in Foucault's conceptual study of the empirical sciences *Les Mots et les choses* (1966), and subsequently in *Des espaces autres*, a paper given to a group of architects on 14 March 1967 which remained unpublished until it appeared in *Architecture-Mouvement-Continuité* in 1986. Like its medical counterpart, Foucault conceives of heterotopias as Other spaces whose Otherness is derived

---

10 *It is a modern histological term which started to be used regularly in medical texts from the 1920's. See Sigurd Lax, 'Heterotopia from a biological and medical point of view', in Other Spaces: The Affair of the Heterotopia, ed. by Roland Ritter and Bernd Knaller-Vlay (Graz: Haus der Architektur, 1998), pp. 114-23 (p. 116).
11 *ibid.*, p. 115.
Fig. 1.1
Fig. 1.2
from their re-ordering of social space. As heterotopic tissue disrupts the perfect ordering of organs in the human body that are depicted in diagrams, the Foucauldian heterotopia undermines the spatial arrangements of ordinary everyday life (Fig. 1.2). Although Foucault never refers to heterotopias as a medical condition, he would have been familiar with the term through his mentor, Georges Canguilhem, whose work concerned the history of biology and medicine.¹⁴

Foucault viewed Canguilhem’s work *Le Normal et le pathologique* – written originally as a thesis in 1943 – as constituting ‘without any doubt the most important and the most significant’ of his works.¹⁵ What Foucault appreciated about Canguilhem’s work was its concern to understand which concepts of the normal and the pathological in the life sciences really belonged to life. If life evolves through error, through chance mutations, what is deemed pathological may be what generates our evolution, as Foucault states: ‘error is at the root of what makes human thought and its history’.¹⁶

Many of Foucault’s Other spaces isolate ‘heterotopic’ social abnormalities – for example mental hospitals, prisons, army barracks – so that a utopian image of the social body can retain its smoothed, buffed surface. In considering how heterotopias encourage us to live for the Other, as a utopian image of society, or of ourselves, I shall first outline Foucault’s accounts of heterotopias, then I shall consider how academic research has drawn on the concept of heterotopic Other space, and finally I shall explore how heterotopias seduce the subject into living

---

¹⁶ ibid., p. 22.
for the Other through considering the Lacanian notion of the body-image deployed by Foucault.  

In *Les Mots et les choses* heterotopias are grouped together with utopias as examples of ‘hétéroclites’, which Foucault describes as chaotic spaces where the absence of Law and geometry prevents the fragments of different orders from being arranged in such a way that a ‘lieu commun’ can be established. Utopias do not exist. They are, as Foucault insists, untroubled regions of thought, conveyed by imagery of fantasy cities with vast avenues and beautiful gardens. And yet, unlike utopias, heterotopias do exist, and the example that underpins Foucault’s preface is Borges’s Chinese Encyclopaedia, which categorizes animals in an order completely different from that of Western thought. Thus, heterotopias are defined as spaces that secretly undermine language, and prevent our capacity to name and classify, by shattering and confusing the syntax that holds ‘les mots et les choses’ together:

Elles brisent les noms communs ou les enchevêtrent, parce qu’elles ruinent d’avance la “syntaxe”, et pas seulement celle qui construit les phrases, - celle moins manifeste qui fait “tenir ensemble” (à côté et en face les uns des autres) les mots e les choses.  

Foucault compares the anxieties that a spatial experience of a heterotopia would generate to the mental disorder of aphasia, a heterotopic medical condition. Due to a brain lesion aphasiacs lack the capacity to arrange things; even in the simple task

---

17 The Lacanian influence is stressed by Foucault in an interview given in 1966: ‘Lacan’s importance stems from the fact that he has demonstrated how, through the discourse of the patient and the symptoms of his neurosis, it is the structures, the very system of language – and not the subject – which speaks’. The quotation is published in John Forrester, *The Seductions of Psychoanalysis: Freud, Lacan, and Derrida* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), pp. 380-81.


19 ibid., p. 9.
of ordering coloured skeins of wool, they produce a multiplicity of tiny fragmented regions. If, as Foucault concludes, the anxiety is that of the fear of losing what is common to place and name, what he appears to be describing is what I have called 'de-individualization'.

It is important to acknowledge that heterotopias and utopias first make their appearance in *Les Mots et les choses*, a study which seeks to show how there is no smooth evolution between the ordering of one age and another, but discontinuity. Ordering emerges through Foucault's concept of the episteme – an epistemological field – which organizes institutions, disciplines, knowledges and rules around a particular worldview. In *Les Mots et les choses* Foucault seeks to demonstrate the discontinuities between the Classical Age (1650-1900), the Renaissance that preceded it, and the Modern Age that we are now emerging from. The continuities that appear to exist between these ages are illusory.

The Renaissance episteme is visualized by the law of 'resemblance' in which a unity between words and things is constructed by the symmetrical ordering of space: for example *convenientia* is the juxtaposition of things, *aemulatio* is the mirroring of things, so that 'le même reste le même'. In this Renaissance world knowledge is 'divined' by deciphering God's hidden signature which is inscribed on all things. The seventeenth century marks the collapse of the Renaissance episteme, whose knowledge was now corrected by the rational observation of

---

20 ibid., p. 10.
23 ibid., p. 40.
Nature. Things were re-ordered into tables of identities and differences through the law of *mathesis* – a universal science of calculable order – and *taxinomia* – the principle of classification – which arranged identities and differences into ordered tables, replacing infinite resemblance with finite differences through measurement. Finally the nineteenth century episteme replaced Nature with History. Unlike the previous two epistemes that trace order back to Nature or God, in the Modern Age man is the empirico-transcendental doublet, that is both the object of knowledge and the subject who analyses himself as an object, hence the emergence of disciplines such as anthropology, sociology and psychoanalysis.

The architectural theorist John Rajchman argues that Foucault seeks to reveal the ‘positive unconscious of vision’ that a society constructs to control what we see and therefore what we think:

> Foucault’s hypothesis was that there exists a sort of “positive unconscious” of vision which determines not what is seen, but what *can* be seen. [...] To see is always to think, since what is seeable is part of what “structures thought in advance.” And conversely to think is always to see.  

It is this notion of a ‘positive unconscious of vision’ that I would like to focus upon in *Des espaces autres* in relation to how heterotopias, as built spaces, visualize the universal truths and utopian visions of society.

---

24 ibid., pp. 86-91.  
Des espaces autres begins with an outline of the history of space from the medieval period to modern day in a pattern reminiscent of Les Mots et les choses. The medieval age had an hierarchical system of places that visualized Christianity, ordering space into super-celestial places (for example paradise), celestial (for example the church), and terrestrial, the latter being separated between urban and rural space, or between protected and undefended spaces. Foucault describes medieval space as the space of localization. In the seventeenth century Galileo’s scientific discovery that the earth moves around the sun desanctified the space of localization. Space became infinite. Unlike the medieval conception of finite space, an infinity of space invites measurement and so offers an explanation for the emergence of mathesis in the classical age. Contemporary space is one where things are arranged in a neighbourhood of elements – for example series, trees, and networks. Although there still exist traces of a medieval sacred spatial arrangement in how institutions organize space into binary opposites: for example public-private, family-social space, cultural-utilitarian space. It is this concealed sacred quality of space that Foucault wishes to unveil.

For Foucault the phenomenological studies of Gaston Bachelard (author of La Poétique de l’espace) have revealed that the inner space of the home is not a homogeneous empty space but is one saturated by our primary perceptions, dreams, and passions. However, it is external space that interests Foucault. This external space is equally heterogeneous as Bachelard’s inner space, but rather than drawing us into our own individual histories and memories, social space erodes our own life histories – ‘notre vie’, ‘notre temps’, ‘notre histoire’:

L’espace dans lequel nous vivons, par lequel nous sommes attirés hors de nous-mêmes, dans lequel se déroule précisément l’érosion de notre vie, de notre temps et de notre histoire, cet espace qui nous ronge et nous ravine est en lui-même aussi un espace hétérogène.27

From Foucault’s description, the erosion of our subjective positionings might be thought of as the consumption of the body, since social space devours the images that we have of ourselves.

To understand how this experience of social space is constructed Foucault ventures to those Other spaces that occupy a curious position of being in relation to all others – utopias and heterotopias. Utopias present ideal images of society, and yet they are arrangements without any real location. In contrast heterotopias are ‘utopies effectivement réalisées’, and therefore represent a utopian social order, which both represents and contests the imperfections of social space:

Il y a également, et ceci probablement dans toute culture, dans toute civilisation, des lieux réels, des lieux effectifs, des lieux qui sont dessinés dans l’institution même de la société, et qui sont des sortes de contre-emplacements, sortes d’utopies effectivement réalisées dans lesquelles les emplacements réels, tous les autres emplacements réels que l’on peut trouver à l’intérieur de la culture sont à la fois représentés, contestés et inversés.28

As realized utopias their Otherness is derived from their being ideal models of the social body, rather like the anatomical diagram which shows the perfect arrangement of organs in the body as the ideal human specimen. Foucault describes their specular effects as that of reflection, mirroring and inversion – ‘ils

27 ibid., pp. 754-55.
28 ibid., p. 755.
suspendent, neutralisent ou inversent l'ensemble des rapports qui se trouvent, par eux, désignés, reflétés ou réfléchis'.

Foucault defines six characteristics of heterotopias, which he sees as phenomena that exist in all societies. First, heterotopias function as sites of crisis – for example women during their menstrual periods or in labour, the old awaiting death. In modern society the nineteenth-century boarding school and army barracks are Other spaces whose role was to contain the first manifestations of male sexuality, as the honeymoon trip in hotels and trains was the Other space to the home where female virginity was lost. The bridal suite as a heterotopia is explored here in Chapter Three. Contemporary sites of crisis are heterotopias of deviancy such as prisons, and psychiatric clinics, which conceal those performativities that deviate from the current average or standard.

Second, the function and meaning of heterotopias can change over time. Foucault cites the example of the cemetery that moves from its location at the heart of the city in the churchyard to the periphery in the nineteenth century because of debates relating to hygiene. The cemetery as a heterotopic space is examined here in Chapter Two.

Third, heterotopias juxtapose different, incommensurate spaces and arrangements in one real place – for example the space of the theatre and the cinema which is explored here in Chapter Five. They represent the entirety of the world within a rectangular space and this is a function of heterotopias which can be observed in

29 ibid., p. 755.
30 ibid., pp. 756-57.
31 ibid., p. 757.
the ancient Persian garden. Its four sides represented the four parts of the world with an even more sacred space within it, a sacred umbilical region containing a fountain and a basin.\textsuperscript{32}

Fourth, heterotopias have a heterochronic property in that they connect slices of time together – for example museums and libraries accumulate time. This property is most intense when a rupture with traditional time has occurred.\textsuperscript{33} In Chapter Four the heterochronic properties of heterotopias are explored as archival space.

Fifth, heterotopias have a different system of opening and closing that simultaneously isolates them and makes them more freely penetrable than ordinary public space. Often, prior to entrance, the individual must submit to rites of purification.\textsuperscript{34} The urban theorist Edward Soja observes how the spatial regulation of heterotopias likens them to a ‘human territoriality’. In his description heterotopias’ conscious and unconscious surveillance, their control of inside and outside, resembles the sexual dynamics of the human psyche:

Through such forms of spatial regulation the heterotopia takes on the qualities of a human territoriality, with its conscious and subconscious surveillance of presence and absence, entry and exit; its demarcation of behaviours and boundaries; its protective yet selective enabling definition of what is the inside and the outside and who may partake of the inherent pleasures.\textsuperscript{35}

Finally, the utopian qualities of heterotopias are mediated between two oppositional poles. On the one hand they create a space of illusion that enables us

\textsuperscript{32} ibid., p. 758-59. 
\textsuperscript{33} ibid., p. 759. 
\textsuperscript{34} ibid., p. 760. 
to see the mechanisms by which external space is constructed and compartmentalized. On the other hand heterotopias create an Other space, as perfect and meticulous as ours is disordered. The colonies founded by the Jesuits in South America are examples of ‘colonies merveilleuses, absolument réglées, dans lesquelles la perfection humaine était effectivement accomplie’.  

The application of heterotopias to academic research focuses on the interpretation of Foucault’s ambiguous notion of Otherness and how it relates to social identity. Edward Soja describes Foucault’s ‘heterotopologies’ as ‘frustratingly incomplete, inconsistent and incoherent’ and yet, he declares, they are also the marvellous ‘incunabula of another fruitful journey into Thirdspace.’ What Soja calls ‘Thirdspace’, in which he locates heterotopias, is a space between a binary opposition of two spaces and he uses the exhibition *Remembering the Bastille: 1789-1989* as a case study. The Bastille is considered a heterotopic site due to its historical significance reflected in the many ways its symbolic meaning has been reconfigured from the revolutionary storming, to the elephant placed upon it in the Restoration period, to its current transformation into an opera house. Surrounding the exhibits is a video screen where images juxtapose several mutually incompatible sites. Although Soja’s account offers little insight into the spatial effects of heterotopias upon the body, he makes some interesting observations about their location in a ‘Thirdspace’ between the subject-object dialectic.

---

37 Soja, p. 162.
38 ibid., pp. 193-94.
Differing from Soja, the sociologist Kevin Hetherington approaches heterotopias from the study of utopias. The Renaissance writer Thomas More first coined the latter term in his literary satire *Utopia*, bringing together *eutopia* – meaning a good place – and *outopia* – meaning no-place. Hetherington draws upon the research of Louis Marin (author of *Utopics: Spatial Play*) who, in pulling apart the two terms joined by More, opens up an in-between space called the neutral which is both an Other place and the Other of place. Hetherington locates heterotopias in the neutral arguing that neutrality promotes social ambivalence and the Otherness of incongruous ordering. From this theoretical position Hetherington associates heterotopias with the *badlands* of modern society, whose social function is to promote new modes of social ordering.

An example of a *badland* is the Palais Royal at the time of the French Revolution when its arcades were filled with boutiques, coffee houses, bookshops, brothels and even a stock exchange. They mingled the old aristocratic order and courtly codes of Versailles with revolutionary activities – for example that of Camille Desmoulins, whose speech made at the Café de Foy in the Palais Royal was one of the factors that led to the storming of the Bastille. However, in Hetherington’s account it is unclear how heterotopic space functions as a utopia of modernity. On the one hand he claims that the Palais Royal reveals the emerging utopia of bourgeois society; on the other he proceeds to say that it is a heterotopia, rather

---

40 ibid., pp. 11-13, 141.
41 ibid., pp. vii-viii.
42 ibid., p. 5.
than a utopia, since ‘it is not an idealised place, a place of the good life’. And yet one wonders whether the plethora of tastes that the Palais Royal contained did not constitute a sort of utopia of liberal values in which each individual’s pleasures were accommodated.

Finally, the cultural historian of Italy, Charles Burdett, has recently explored heterotopias in relation to Fascist Italy. Underpinning Burdett’s argument is the notion of heterotopias as realized utopias in which their perfect ordering impels the subject to revise his or her behaviour:

Such sites are defined by their absolute perfection, they are spaces which encourage or necessitate a definite revision of how the individual either constitutes himself/herself or is constituted by the regime of which he/she is subject.

From this notion of disciplining subjectivity Burdett looks at three types of heterotopias – a cemetery, a prison, and the reclamation of the Pontine Marshes as part of an internal colonial project – in relation to the construction of a Fascist ‘cult of the nation’ where Italy, as a sacred community, was finally awoken after centuries of decadence. Burdett analyses the spatial effects that the heterotopias have upon prominent writers and journalists who visit the spaces, which for him exemplify the Fascist desire to bring together an ancient past and an imperial present – the cemetery arouses a Roman past in the present, the prison becomes a site of Christian redemption, and the reclamation of the Pontine marshes a new Eden. What is unclear is the paradoxical position that heterotopias occupy, since

43 ibid., p. 17.
44 Charles Burdett, ‘Journeys to the other Spaces of Fascist Italy’, Modern Italy, 1 (2000), 7-23 (p. 8).
45 ibid., p. 9.
they are fundamental to the development of a cult of the nation, but are also Other to it – for example the prison is a utopia of social order, while the inmate’s submergence in a climate of austere abnegation is paradoxically a model to be emulated. This paradox is never quite resolved, although Burdett connects the example of the prison to the display of a model society where individual freedoms are sacrificed for collective security.46

The paradoxical position of heterotopias that Burdett’s argument opens up is a problem that is left unaddressed by all the academic research I have outlined but is crucial to my own research on patriotic heterotopias. How can something that is Other be fundamental to the development of a national psyche?

A resolution to this paradox can be found in Des espaces autres in Foucault’s account of the specular effects of heterotopias, something that only has been tentatively explored so far by academic scholarship. Soja refers to it simply as ‘ontological musings on subjectification, objectification […] presence and absence, the inside and the outside’.47 Burdett suggests that it is through the unreal space that the subject constructs identity, but he seems unwilling to pursue the analysis further.48 However, Foucault’s account of looking at his body in the mirror is his only description of the spatial effects experienced inside a heterotopia.

46 ibid., pp. 15-16.
47 Soja, p. 158.
48 Burdett, p. 13.
First, he states that the mirror is like a utopia since it is ‘un lieu sans lieu’. He then describes the effect of seeing himself in an unreal, virtual space that opens out beyond the glass. In this unreal space his body becomes a shadow of himself, and yet it gives him the illusion that he can possess his own visibility and see himself where he is absent:

Dans le miroir, je me vois là, où je ne suis pas, dans un espace irréel qui s’ouvre virtuellement derrière la surface, je suis là-bas, là où je ne suis pas, une sorte d’ombre qui me donne à moi-même ma propre visibilité, qui me permet de me regarder là où je suis absent: utopie du miroir. 49

The utopian effects of the mirror suggests that the heterotopia lures the subject into identifying with the Other by inviting him or her to occupy the position of the Other in a virtual space. In a psychoanalytical context Jacques Lacan describes how specular identification results in the creation of pairs of Others – for example the slave is identified with the despot, the actor with the spectator, or the seducer with the seduced. 50

Second, the heterotopia has a material existence, which produces a counter-action to the position his physical body occupies. He now finds himself absent from his own physical body as it now exists as an image in the space of the mirror:

Mais c’est également une hétérotopie, dans la mesure où le miroir existe réellement, et où il a, sur la place que j’occupe, une sorte d’effet en retour; c’est à partir du miroir que je me découvre absent à la place où je suis puisque je me vois là-bas. 51

Foucault concludes that the experience of the mirror is that of the heterotopia since it makes the place that he looks at both absolutely real – it is connected to all surrounding spaces – and unreal because for it to be perceived as real it must pass through the virtual plane of the mirror.

The anxieties over the body that the heterotopic mirror evokes parallel Lacan’s *stade du miroir*, his account of how the birth of subjectivity – the ‘I’ – emerges on the imaginary plane through the infant recognizing his/her body-image in a mirror. This moment of recognition is one of jubilation in which the infant can finally point to its image and say ‘I am that’.

The infant’s possession and conception of having a body is therefore contingent upon the recognition of its body-image. In this context the *stade du miroir* is about how our notion of having a body cannot exist without the Other, the body-image in which we see ourselves.

The acquisition of a body becomes the site of trauma, since its foundation is the mutilation of the body, that is to say, we do not have a natural body, only an image of ourselves which is constantly being contested by anti-mimetic forms of representation. Infants, as Lacan observes, become distressed when others in the reflective environment are injured – they cry when they see another child fall – and show anxieties over their body-image in the themes of play with dolls – for example pulling off heads and ripping open bellies. Likewise the trauma of adolescence that the heterotopic boarding school contains, concerns the subject’s

---


53 This interpretation of the Mirror Stage was made by Mark Cousins in his public lecture series *Spatial Effects* at the Architectural Association in 5 March 2004.

anxious waiting to become an adult. And yet by continually waiting for a perfect image of himself or herself to materialize, the subject’s body is transformed into a phantasm of the future.

In a social context Lacan’s argument suggests that our acquisition of a social identity is contingent upon our recognition of an image of ourselves in the external environment, and where there is a lack of contiguity between our inner subjective image – the ‘I’ – and the space outside us, we project feelings of hostility onto the environment. In Jacqueline Rose’s *States of Fantasy* she offers a psychoanalytical reading of the nation as an ‘imagined community’ arguing that the state relies on fantasy to maintain its authority over the its citizens.\(^5\) Using a Freudian reading she tends to view the state as a sort of superego in which ‘you mould your acts and gestures to a persona that deep down you know isn’t really there’.\(^6\) Adding to Rose’s argument, I would like to suggest that if our conception of having a body cannot exist without a body-image, that is to say a fantasy, by the same logic for a nation or a state to exist as a psychical entity, it requires a group of corporeal bodies who will mirror its values and ideologies. The disciplining of the body in the army, or religious asceticism are examples of how ‘imagined communities’ display their existence through the training of the body into a collective deindividualized identity. In this thesis I argue that there is a competition, or game, played between the subject and the nation at the national monument. It is a game in which we compete for our bodies, and yet it is a game that we can never win, since the monument can so easily seduce us into relinquishing our own bodies

\(^6\) ibid., p. 9.
through tempting us with the fantasy of a whole perfect body, and a community of
loving brothers and sisters, that will wait for us like a phantasm in a future time
and place.

In the following chapters I have approached the four spaces as having the
heterotopic property of functioning as a mirror, to the extent that standing in front
of the monument, or viewing the space from a distance, is like being in front of a
large mirror, while entering into the space is like inhabiting its utopian reflection.
Each building or space therefore becomes a prosthesis of the body, whose spatial
arrangements, like the utopian diagram of the human body, train us to imagine that
our bodies can dance to the tune of a perfect Other life, in exchange for losing our
heterotopic aberrations – for example not displaying sufficient love and devotion
to the beloved patria.

However, Lacan’s stade du miroir is a psychoanalytical theory and its transference
into a social context must be applied with caution. This is most immediately
apparent in what I mean when I use the term the Other, which differs from the
meanings attached to it by Lacan and also by Julia Kristeva. Lacanian
psychoanalysis uses two types of ‘other’. First, there is the petit autre which refers
to the specular image. Second, there is Autre (the ‘big other’) which has the
symbolic function of the law, hence Lacan’s formulation of it in the expression

---

57 Kristeva defines the Other as an abject region situated between inside and outside, which is
explored in Chapter 3: ‘Les contenus “inconscients” demeurent ici exclu mais d’une manière
étrange: pas assez radicalement pour permettre la différenciation solide sujet/objet, et néanmoins
avec une netteté suffisante pour qu’une position de défense, de refus mais aussi d’élaboration
sublimatoire puisse avoir lieu. Comme si l’opposition fondamentale était, ici, entre Je et Autre, ou,
plus archaïquement encore, entre Dedans et Dehors. Julia Kristeva, Pouvoirs de l’horreur (Paris:
Nom-du-Père, whose homophonous qualities convey the "non" du père, the paternal prohibition of the father who exercises the incest taboo in the Oedipus complex. Lacan's conception of mothers and fathers as a/Autres are clinical models that convey the ideal passage from child to adult which the patient must painfully undergo in the therapeutic setting.

In contrast to the ideal trajectory to adult life, my idea of the Other is neither as ideal mother or father, but both of them in the conception of the couple. In the sites that I examine one component of the couple dominates—mother or father, wife or husband, queen or king—and the utopian image that it projects is completed, unified, and made whole through the subject inhabiting the image and thereby entering into an incestuous 'marriage' with the parental figure in the process of becoming patriotic.

In The Great Museum Donald Horne describes the role of monuments in the nineteenth century and the tourist's desire to reconstruct history through visiting them as 'simply using the past as therapeutic fantasy'. And yet Horne does not explore or explain the psycho-dynamics of that 'fantasy'. One possible explanation can be found in Kaja Silverman's interpretation of the stade du miroir which she argues is a process of subtraction, that is to say, 'through the understanding that it is what is left when a familiar object (e.g. the mother) has been removed'. Her analysis of cinema as an acoustic mirror shows how cultural forms reconstruct the

---

‘mirror’ so that the viewer may return to a past infantile world through subtracting him or herself from the real world. Her relocation of the *stade du miroir* in a cultural context is the framework for my examination of how the subject subtracts him, or herself, from reality and thereby begins to live for the Other more than the self.

Returning to Foucault’s conception of heterotopias as utopian mirrors of social order, after this digression into the Other, to suggest some ways in which his argument requires some clarification. Soja observed that Foucault’s argument is underdeveloped, and this is most keenly observed in his closing remark that the boat is the ‘heterotopia par excellence’ because it is a place without a place that floats upon the infinity of the sea, as a space of endless imagination. It implies that heterotopias have a transcendental quality, since where these Other spaces are lacking, according to Foucault, dreams dry up, replacing adventure with espionage and the police.61 Foucault does not acknowledge the possibility of dystopian heterotopias, as spaces where the imagination is annihilated. Dante’s *Inferno*, for example, is a dystopian vision of society in which its lowest circle, occupied by Count Ugolino, is an icy wasteland devoid of fantasy, symbolized by its frozen water as opposed to the fluidity of the sea (*Canto XXXIII*).

What part might dystopian heterotopias play in the development of a national psyche? How might they seduce the subject into living for the Other? One way of thinking about this is through the psyche as being both an inner and outer experience. In *The Politics of Experience* R. D. Laing argues that our notion of the

---

61 Foucault, *Des espaces autres*, p. 762.
psyche as merely an internal phenomenon bounded by an external objective environment is a product of a social conditioning which seeks to constrain imagination to an inner experience, and perception to an outer space, which, by implication, is devoid of fantasy and reverie.62 Adding to Foucault's argument, in this thesis I examine how heterotopias, as patriotic spaces, delineate a national psyche into an inner-outer experience: Chapters Two and Three invite the spectator into flights of the imagination, whereas Four and Five encourage the subject to believe that a world of reason is real, rather than the product of another sort of fantasy.

1.3 Mothers and Fathers

If nations are mythologized as being born, or reborn in the case of the Italian Risorgimento, it implies that a national psyche is founded upon a maternal set of emotions. Moreover, if it is a father figure who emerges from an external environment to deliver the nation to its subjects – the Corsican Napoleon I, the French-speaking Padre della Patria Vittorio Emanuele II – it also suggests that, set against an inner community, a national psyche’s outer space – for example the countryside – is the site for the subject’s identification with the father. From a psychoanalytical perspective the notion of the nation as a maternal object rekindled through our imagination is suggested in Kristeva’s study on motherhood, ‘Stabat Mater’. In contrast to her own experience of motherhood – swelling, sweating, amniotic fluids – is its narcissistic idealization where the maternal object becomes the ‘lost territory’ that the adult seeks endlessly to recapture through fantasy.63

In spite of these observations, approaches to patriotism focus upon its etymological origin in patria as love of the fatherland, which excludes any investigation into the arousal of patriotic emotions through a maternal symbolic economy. In Imagined Communities Benedict Anderson argues that patriotism is somehow connected to notions of fraternity and brotherhood.64 And yet, in dismay he concludes that however much one delineates the processes by which the nation is imagined it is doubtful whether these processes can explain ‘the deep

attachment that peoples feel for the inventions of their imaginations – or, to revive

a question raised at the beginning of this text, why people are ready to die for these inventions'.

The *Encyclopaedia of Nationalism* describes patriotism as a ‘reflection of underlying national consciousness’ and connects it to a materialized City of God by stating that it is akin to ‘Christian patriotism in which the *patrie céleste* is the love of the nation’. Finally, the American psychoanalyst Seymour Feshbach defines patriotism as a particular identification with one’s nation, the quality and quantity of which is contingent upon the subject’s early attachment to the father.

In *Beyond Good and Evil* Nietzsche observed that similar philosophical ideas emerge in similar linguistic groups, owing to an ‘unconscious domination and guidance by similar grammatical functions’. And so from a Nietzschean perspective I would like to suggest that approaches to patriotism appear caught under the ‘unconscious domination’ of its linguistic origins in which it is thought of as an exclusive love affair with father.

Moving beyond etymological studies of patriotism, in *Le Froid et le cruel* Deleuze suggests that ‘becoming a man’ occurs through an interaction between maternal and paternal symptomologies. In contrast to traditional views of the sadomasochistic entity, Deleuze asserts that there is a fundamental dissymmetry between the two perversions. Sadism has paternal and patriarchal themes and occurs though a father-daughter dyad, in contrast to the maternal and matriarchal

---

65 ibid., p. 141.
content of masochism produced through a mother-son dyad. Deleuze formulates these distinctions through a close study of the novels of Sade and Sacher-Masoch, who gave their names to the respective perversions of sadism and masochism. To consider Deleuze’s theory in relation to the process of the de-individualization of social identity, I shall outline the process of ‘becoming a man’, and how idealized images of mother and father provide the utopian landscape necessary for the journey towards living for Others.

Born on the boundaries of the Austro-Hungarian Empire and the Russian steppes in Lemberg, Galicia – in what is now Poland – in 1835, Sacher-Masoch was of mixed ethnic origin: Slav, Spanish and Bohemian. His literary works showed a deep concern for the problems of nationality, minority groups and revolutionary forces and he was involved in the Panslavic movement. These interests in nationalism were interwoven with those of eroticism and mysticism through scenes of flagellation. From titles such as The Fisher of Souls, to The Mother of God and Venus in Furs, a domineering maternal object of desire was an integral part of his literary work. Wielding a whip, clad in fur, peasant or princess, she was, for Masoch, both his own artistic creation and the Sarmatian woman:

Qu’elle soit princesse ou paysanne, qu’elle porte l’hermine ou la pelisse de peau d’agneau, toujours cette femme aux fourrures et au fouet, qui rend l’homme son esclave, est à la fois ma créature et la véritable femme sarmate.

---

69 Deleuze, Le Froid, pp. 18-21.
70 ibid., p. 7.
71 ibid., p. 10.
The Sarmatian woman encapsulates what Deleuze describes as the timeless mythology of the maternal object of the masochist’s fantasy, since she is the Amazon warrior of the Hellenistic world – whose right breast was cauterized for battle – who reappears on the Russian Steppes due to Sarmatian migration. By the sixteenth century, according to Simon Schama, the Sarmatian costume of long coats trimmed with fur and thigh-high boots was appropriated by the Polish nobility who claimed these ancient warriors were their ancestors, in the hope that it would make them invincible to foreigners. The domineering Sarmatian woman therefore suffuses Masoch’s own psychology with his desire for an essentialized Polish national identity.

Although Masoch’s women all have in common a ‘forme opulente et musclée’, a ‘volonté imperieuse’, and a ‘certaine cruauté’, beneath this physique Deleuze identifies three different types of mother image that form the maternal symbolic system. First is the primitive uterine, hetaeric mother who is represented as the pagan woman who generates disorder, and in her equalizing of the sexes becomes hermaphrodite. At the beginning of *Venus in Furs* Wanda, the female protagonist, displays the attributes of the primitive mother:

> I admire the serene sensuality of the Greeks – pleasure without pain; it is the ideal I strive to realize. I do not believe in the love preached by Christianity and our modern knights of the spirit.

---

75 Deleuze, *Le Froid*, p. 42.
Second is the punishing Oedipal mother, who may become either the accomplice of the sadistic father, or his victim, and she represents an evolution of the pleasure giving uterine image in the masochist's psyche. This evolution is explored here in Chapter Four on Lake Fucino.

Between these two maternal images is the oral mother – the 'belle mère' – who nourishes us at birth and receives us upon our death as Mother Earth. She is the masochist’s ideal mother figure, whom he educates so that she may assume the role of the other two mothers. As Deleuze observes, although the masochist appears fashioned by the authoritative woman, it is he who actually educates her, prompting her harsh words, so that she shall become the torturer that he is to himself:

Le héros masochiste semble éduqué, formé par la femme autoritaire, mais plus profondément c’est lui qui la forme et la travestit, et lui souffle les dures paroles qu’elle lui adresse. C’est la victime qui parle à travers son bourreau, sans se ménager.

Her education occurs through contracts which the masochist formulates and which stipulate when and how he will be punished. Its pedagogic function is to teach her not only how to become his torturess, but how to occupy the position of the father, since the contract transfers the exercising of the paternal law onto a maternal figure. A maternal symbolic economy is established by excluding the father.

---

78 *ibid.*, p. 22.
79 *ibid.*, p. 54.
The aim of the masochist, according to Deleuze, is to be reborn without a contaminating presence of father through the incestuous union between mother and son and its resultant creation, the sexually self-sufficient hermaphrodite body. From a psychoanalytical perspective Deleuze states that the masochist’s fantasy of his parthenogenetic rebirth is achieved through his idealization of the mother in which he attributes the phallus, instrumental to birth, to her, while disavowing his own. Moreover, the masochist interprets the violence exerted upon his body, in rituals of punishment, as pleasure, since it is experienced as the expiation of ‘father’ from his body, and therefore a step closer towards the fantasy rebirth in a world without a paternal image. As Deleuze asserts, in Masoch’s work the ultimate objective is to purge the body of the father’s sin. Christ was not the son of God but the new Man – ‘le Christ, non pas comme fils de Dieu, mais le nouvel Homme, c’est-à-dire la rassemblance du père aboli’.

Following Deleuze’s argument, I would like to suggest that if the archaic father – God – gave man language as the mirror of his love, his expulsion signals a return to chaos. The foundation of the maternal symbolic economy, the uterine space – a morass of the unconscious, and a space without language – finds a new grammar in the cold cruel landscapes that order and control emotions by desensitizing the body. The neo-classical landscapes of Venus in Furs which symbolize the masochist’s ideal of a second birth in a lost Hellenistic world, illustrate how the coldness of marble surfaces is the basis for controlling the warmth of sensual pleasure. Wanda is often described as a ‘Venus of ice’, her movement is arrested.

---

80 ibid., p. 87.
81 ibid., p. 87.
as a ‘marble body’, her skin has a ‘marble pallor’, and fantasies are conjured up in
a theatre of moonlight, where meadows become ‘smooth as a mirror’, or frozen
like a lake.82

If in the Christian notion of God being synonymous with the Word there is the idea
of an archaic father who thinks and communicates his thoughts to his subjects
through language, the evacuation of the father returns the masochistic subject to a
mute, primitive world where emotions are aroused without thought through the
visual image. The aesthetics of masochism are founded upon the fetish, a frozen
two-dimensional image that defensively neutralizes and suspends the knowledge
that the mother does not possess a phallus.83 The fetish, rather like the heterotopic
mirror image, is the threshold of a new sensory experience, where art objects and
artefacts become fetishized into the props of the masochist’s fantasy – for example
whips, Roman helmets, fur coats, and statues. Works of art are also the chosen
object for the masochist’s initiation rites – Severin embraces a marble statue of
Venus – and women only become sexually exciting when they are
indistinguishable from cold marble statues, or paintings in darkened rooms.84

_Venus in Furs_ ends with Severin’s journey from masochist to sadist, or as he puts
it, from the anvil to the hammer, as upon his father’s death he takes on the latter’s
role and social position.85 However, for Deleuze the journey to manhood oscillates
between a maternal masochistic symbolic economy and a paternal sadistic one.

Sadism is a paternal union governed by an incestuous father-daughter dyad in

---

82 Sacher-Masoch, ‘Venus in furs’, pp. 144, 156
83 ibid., pp. 28-29.
84 Deleuze, _Le Froid_, p. 61.
which the male figure is exalted beyond all laws, whereas the mother is completely negated. The father-daughter alliance produces androgynous forms since their incestuous union is a symptom of the father’s desire to possess the institution of the family and its maternal law. Deleuze therefore describes the sadist as a primary anarchic force who exalts himself like a God, overriding social conventions and dissolving the family.  

Differing from the masochist who educates, the sadist instructs others on how to be like him. As a God his actions embody his knowledge and therefore render his body a diagram which contains the instructions on how to imitate him. The pleasure that his female accomplice receives in becoming like the father is the belief that she is mirroring her God, the male genius who reigns over the sadistic economy:

Les héroïnes sont nombreuses dans les romans de Sade; mais toutes leurs actions, les plaisirs qu’elles prennent ensemble, les entreprises qu’elles conçoivent imitent l’homme, exigent le regard et la présidence de l’homme, et lui sont dédiés.

Unlike the aesthetics of masochism, with its fantasy and disavowal of the Word, the sadistic father utilizes rational thought to destroy fetishized images, so that man as an Idea may erupt onto ‘le monde réel éveillé’:

86 Deleuze, Le Froid, pp. 52-53.
87 ibid., pp. 18-19.
88 ibid., p. 52.
La destruction du fétiche mesure la vitesse de projection la manière dont le rêve se supprime comme rêve, et dont l’Idée fait irruption dans le monde réel éveillé.⁸⁹

Deleuze argues that the sadistic father desires the annihilation of the maternal symbolic system but never gives an explanation to why the destruction of the mother is so crucial in his becoming. In this thesis the exclusion of the mother, for example in Chapter Four, enables the paternal figure to appear as a creator of life, who nourishes the infant and occupies the uterine space. This form of paternal identity can only function by encouraging the citizen to mis-recognize the mother in the father. An exploration of this aspect of the paternal sadistic order would have complemented Deleuze’s treatment of the maternal masochistic woman, whom he suggests encourages the mis-recognition of the father in the mother. However, these mis-recognitions are never fully developed by Deleuze who is primarily concerned with showing the dissymmetry between the two symptoms. In contrast to Deleuze’s approach, this thesis develops his theories of sadism and masochism into a psychodynamic drama of how the subject becomes patriotic through ‘coupling’ with often distorted and mis-recognized utopian images of mothers and fathers.

In Deleuze’s interpretation of Sade and Masoch’s work, what unites the two authors is that ‘becoming a man’ is a transcendental experience. And yet unlike the infinite possibilities of becoming that ‘becoming woman’ opens up, ‘becoming a man’ is the reduction of the possibilities of becoming to one immobile form – the

⁸⁹ ibid., p. 65.
hermaphrodite body of the masochistic coupling, or the androgynous form of the sadistic couple. These incestuous unions take place in very distinct environments. The maternal landscapes of Masoch’s texts are dimly lit boudoirs covered with tapestries, which encourage fantasy, dreaming and ghostly apparitions, as masochism is the art of the phantasm. In contrast the paternal landscapes of Sade’s writings are cold castles where the protagonists are subjected to the extremes of darkness and light. Deleuze states that Sade and Masoch do not describe the world as it is, but define a sort of ‘double du monde’, which contains its violence and excesses:

Avec Sade et avec Masoch, la littérature sert à nommer, non pas le monde puisque c’est déjà fait, mais une sorte de double du monde, capable d’en recueillir la violence et l’excès. 

In the thesis these sadistic and masochistic ‘doubles’ of the world correspond to the Otherness of the utopian and dystopian heterotopic spaces that I concluded upon in the previous section. Chapters Two and Three correspond to a maternal masochistic discourse and their location in the city give them the function of neutralizing masculine violence. Chapters Four and Five concern paternalistic heterotopias and are situated in the countryside where a paternal father liberates the Italian son from the chains of masochism. It is through the city-countryside dialectic that I suggest that a national psyche, as an inner-outer experience, is constructed.

90 ibid., p. 32.
91 ibid., p. 33.
The Other worlds of Sade and Masoch are distinguished by their particular literary style, which Deleuze defines as pornological, rather than pornographic. Unlike pornographic literature, which is characterized by the use of the imperative and obscene erotic description, Sade and Masoch’s ‘pornology’ seeks to demonstrate the meaning of their perversions.\footnote{ibid., pp. 17-18.} Using Deleuze’s distinction between pornology and pornography, rather than studying patriotism as a ‘patriography’, which simply describes the narratives of patriotism – for example it is aroused through national anthems, and flags – this thesis may be thought of as a ‘patriology’.\footnote{ibid., p. 22.} For Deleuze, ‘pornological’ literature is aimed at taking language to its limit, to the boundaries where the ‘non-language’ of violence and eroticism that does not speak resides. In the ‘patriological’ study which I conduct in the following chapters, patriotism is explored at its limits to reveal its hidden dark side.
1.4 The City and its Others

In *Architecture and Utopia* Manfredo Tafuri asserts that the insertion of capitalism across the urban spaces resulted in the displacement of the singular built work's meaning. Architecture was de-individualized to the extent that it became an empty repository for the values of capitalism and the utopian city it would be relocated within. After unification in 1861 the Italian state unquestionably exploited capitalism's capacity to displace the pre-existing structures, since the state explicitly inserted the apparatus of Liberal economics into the peninsula in order that it be modernized, and thereby mirror the values of the new nation. These concerns are reflected in the composition of public expenditure shown below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total Expenditure as % of GDP</th>
<th>% of composition of public expenditure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1866</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1870</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1872</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>15.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1880</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1890</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>12.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900</td>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1906</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>10.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1912</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1913</td>
<td>17.7</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With the exception of high levels of military expenditure in the wars of Independence (1866 figures of 33.9% of public expenditure in the Kingdom of

---


Italy), the Destra’s main commitment was to territorialize the peninsula, laying down 21,000 kilometres of new roads, and extending railway tracks from 1,829 to 7,686 km, a trend which continued under the Sinistra (1876-1887). The Crispi period marks the beginning of Imperialism and a shift in policy towards military expenditure, reflecting Italy’s alliance with Germany and a desire for colonial expansion. In the Giolitti era, the Italian ‘take-off’ period, expenditure on public works increased, so that by the beginning of the First World War there were 17,649 km of railways and 148,380 km of roads.

As a result of these changes to the peninsular, the city and its twin pole, the countryside sought to mirror the new values of Liberal Italy, and yet they were forever being contested by pre-existing ways of life, now considered non-Italian and ‘backward’. It could be argued that these cracks and fissures in the utopian image of capitalism were mere reflections of Italy’s contested national capital, Rome. Following Tafuri, we may say that the function of a national capital is to be the utopian city that mirrors the values of the modern capitalist nation. And yet in Liberal Italy the Church continually contested Rome’s annexation to Italy at both national and international level, threatening the nation’s legitimacy through the debate known as the ‘Roman Question’, which is explored in detail here in Chapter Three. Tafuri argues that the city, like the countryside, must be given a veneer of social morality:

---

97 Zamagni, p. 162.
99 Zamagni, p. 162.
The city, inasmuch as it is a work of man, tends to a natural condition. Thus, like the landscape painted by the artist, through critical selection the city, too, must be given the stamp of social morality.\textsuperscript{100}

If national life was characterized by accusations of immorality from both the Papacy and the state, I shall explore the different ways in which aspects of Liberal economics were used to create utopian Other cities, whose transcendental qualities sought to de-individualize the cracks and divisions in the country.

A unified monetary system was arguably the first utopian model that the Italian state projected across the peninsula. At unification there were over ninety different types of metal coin in circulation and the adoption of a single currency – the Piedmontese lira – occurred soon after unification on 9 June 1862.\textsuperscript{101} In the Pepino bill of 1862 the Italian lira is described as a universal monument representing national unity:

\begin{quote}
La moneta, mentre corre nelle mani di tutti come segno ed equivalente di ogni valore, è pure il monumento più popolare, più costante e più universale che rappresenti l’unità di una nazione.\textsuperscript{102}
\end{quote}

Alongside a unified monetary model, the countryside and the city were individualized so that the former could become a space of modernity and Liberal economics and the latter a repository for traditional values. The countryside represented the area of greatest economic backwardness, but also the nation’s main

\textsuperscript{100} Tafuri, p. 6.

\textsuperscript{101} Valeria Sannucci, ‘The Establishment of a Central Bank: Italy in the 19th century’, in A European Central Bank? Perspectives on Monetary Unification after Ten Years of the EMS, ed. by Marcello de Cecco and Alberto Giovannini (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), pp 244-80 (pp. 260-61).

\textsuperscript{102} Marcello de Cecco ed., L’Italia e il sistema finanziario internazionale, 1861-1914 (Bari: Laterza, 1990), p. 76.
source of income – in 1861 manufacturing industry represented only 16 per cent of GDP.\textsuperscript{103} Engineers and capitalists therefore turned their attention towards the countryside, draining and irrigating the marshes for cultivation. The expropriation of land was the principal way the Destra transformed the peninsula, promulgating legislation in 1865 that permitted compulsory land acquisition for public utilities.\textsuperscript{104} The projects were financed by capitalists and bourgeois landowners who perceived themselves as missionaries for whom the economic productivity of the land was the new light of reason that would cure the darkness of feudalism, brigandage, and pellagra from the countryside. These ideas are explored in detail in Chapter Four on the reclamation of Lake Fucino.

In contrast to the wilderness of the countryside where it was associated with a rational, scientific perception, the city with its layers of history was the site where the new images of power were invented – the monarch, the \textit{patria}, and the ruling classes. Government-funded competitions for designing monuments were one of the principal ways in which power was visualized as a form of tradition – the Vittorio Emanuele Monument celebrates the ideas of the Risorgimento, and, as Amerigo Restucci asserts, visualizes ‘il re che “ha fatto l’Italia”’.\textsuperscript{105} In the city the laws of expropriation enabled the ruling classes to appropriate the historical centres of the city, in particular on the grounds of hygiene and sanitation.\textsuperscript{106}

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{103} Toniolo, p. 6.
\end{footnotesize}
In the wake of the cholera epidemics in Naples of 1884 and 1885, which caused 7000 deaths in the city alone, engineers turned their gaze to the city in a new moral crusade, which involved conferring the name of hygienists upon themselves. The morality of the hygienists' project was reflected in their new terminology in which they replaced *demolizione* and *ricostruzione* with *risanamento* and *sanificazione*. The procedure that dominated their urban project was the term *sventramento*. The architectural historian, Guido Zucconi, has argued that the adoption of the term *sventramento* – meaning disembowelling, or gutting an animal – conferred on the hygienist’s urban interventions the connotations of a surgical operation.\(^{107}\) For Zucconi these shifts in linguistic terminology underlined how the city became an ideological project where Italy's future would be fought over repeatedly through the *sventramento* of its dark past:

Il mutamento del significante, più che del significato, sottintende il senso, tutto ideologico, di una battaglia per il progresso contro le tenebre di un passato sudicio e oscurantista, del puro contro l'impuro.\(^{108}\)

In the rapid urbanization process engineers replaced architects, who were too absorbed in a debate concerning the poetics of a singular architectural work, and an aesthetics too closely connected to the ideas of pre-unification Italy. Architects often complained that prior to unification the peninsula had had the unified style of Beaux Arts Classicism – introduced in the Napoleonic era – while as a nation, architectural style had fragmented into a proliferation of regional styles.\(^{109}\)

---


\(^{108}\) ibid., p. 32.

architectural theorist Camillo Boito described Italian architecture as, with the exception of a few cases, a confusion of the strange and fantastical that lacked coherence: ‘Ora, l’architettura è, salvo rari casi, un trastullo della fantasia, una ingegnosetta combinazione di forme, uno sbizzarrimento di matite, di compassi, di righe e di squadre’.\textsuperscript{110}

In response to the disunity of architectural style, in his highly influential essay ‘Sullo stile futuro dell’architettura italiana’ Boito proposed a way of designing a new architecture that reflected both the aims of Liberal economics and the linguistic and cultural diversity of the peninsula. For Boito the term ‘stile’ meant a collective form of expression and artistic communication, which for Zucconi parallels the linguistic term \textit{koine}. Zucconi argues that there is a similarity between Boito’s work on architectural style and that of the linguist Graziadio Isaia Ascoli on the Italian dialects, in that both were searching for a common matrix of expression that would unite the regional strands together, the former in architecture and the latter in language.\textsuperscript{111} Central to Boito’s notion of Italian architecture is therefore that it can communicate to its citizens through its style referring the subject back to a regional collective past history.

Boito’s theory on design is framed around his awareness that architecture was different from other arts. A painting or a statue, he argues, has the capacity to arouse emotions in the spectator because its subject matter was human life,

\textsuperscript{110} Camillo Boito, \textit{Architettura del Medio Evo in Italia con una introduzione sullo stile futuro dell’architettura italiana} (Milan: Hoepli, 1880), p. xxii.

whereas architecture’s scientific components would leave the beholder cold.\textsuperscript{112}

Painting and statues, he declares, have a ‘paragone della verità reale’, whereas architecture lacks a ‘pietà di paragone’, a touchstone that can create a dialogue between the built environment and the spectator.\textsuperscript{113} To find this touchstone Boito first describes the building as an organism, by which he means that it is not a static object, but a living entity. As an organism it is composed of an ‘ossatura’, or skeleton – for example, the distribution of rooms in a house – and its ‘simbolismo’ – its ornamentation – which is the building’s psychical component that arouses sentiments of belonging in the spectator.\textsuperscript{114}

Using the notion of style as an organic entity, Boito initiates an historical review of architecture to explore how the relationship between the *ossatura* and the *simbolismo* in the organism reflects the morality of a civilization. In pagan Rome architecture often gave a false impression of the internal distribution of the organism. This arrangement mirrored the moral depravity of ancient Rome, since the organism became a slave to the symbolic tyranny of ornamentation.\textsuperscript{115} After the fall of the Roman Empire, due to the influence of the theologian Origen and Saint Jerome, a Christian architecture emerged whose purity was reflected in the organism no longer deceiving the beholder:

L’architettura cristiana è la vera architettura di una religione, che rivelo all’uomo nuovi diritti e nuovi doveri, svincolandolo dall’allettamento dei sensi: non ha niente di bugiardo, niente di artificiale.\textsuperscript{116}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{112} Boito, *Architettura del Medio Evo*, p. v.
\textsuperscript{113} ibid., p. vii.
\textsuperscript{114} ibid., pp. x-xii
\textsuperscript{115} ibid., p. xiv.
\textsuperscript{116} ibid., p. xv.
\end{flushleft}
From the early Latin Christian style, Boito plots the organism’s evolution into the Trecento Lombard municipal style, which, he asserts, is the only ‘one’ true Italian style of architecture for a number of reasons. First, although the Trecento style developed in Milan, it spread across the peninsula where it adapted to the customs of the different regions. Second, the Trecento was a period in Italian history when the peninsula was economically successful, and so it is symbolically associated with economics. Finally its organism does not lie or deceive since ‘ciascuna parte dell’organismo può palesarsi al di fuori, anzi può diventare occasione di singolari bellezze’. The future component of the Italian style reinvigorates the past since the values of Liberal economics and banking are its inspiration. The \textit{ossatura} of the built work will therefore embrace the new typologies of Liberal economics and scientific progress – banks, railway stations, factories and so forth.

Boito’s architectural style seeks to communicate what Italy is to the Italian subject through its future component of a prosperous Italy being founded in the ‘one-ness’ of the Trecento. Moreover, the essentialized origin of the ‘oneness’ of Italian architectural style is found in the purity of early Latin Christianity, which emerged upon the fall of the Roman Empire.

The re-interpretation of early Latin Christianity, and the legacy of pagan Rome, is a thread that runs throughout this thesis. In Liberal Italy these epochs represented a time when Rome was either the seat of a Church yet to be corrupted by temporal power, or the capital of a pagan Empire free from the constraints of the Church.

\begin{itemize}
\item [117] ibid., p. xxx.
\item [118] ibid., p. ix.
\end{itemize}
These two 'either/or' solutions to the Roman Question are the foundation of the transcendental experience of each patriotic heterotopia, since as Other cities, they might be thought of as positionings to what Rome could be – as the national capital, or as the universal capital of Catholicism – and therefore each space constitutes an escapable response to the Roman Question. It also implies that an integral part of the subject’s patriotic entrance into becoming the Other is through an imaginary union with the Other, based upon a particular fantasy of Rome. In the patriotic heterotopias studied in this thesis, the subject forms a couple with the Other through fantasies of Rome as the pagan mistress, the eternal virgin, the warrior, the Emperor, the Pope, or the blessed Roman catechumen.

If for the young Liberal depicted in Emilio Sereni’s *Il capitalismo nelle campagne*, the breaching of Rome in 1870 represented a moment of liberation, symbolizing the collapse of an old model of the world imprisoned within ecclesiastical and feudal oppression,¹¹⁹ this thesis explores how the visualization of the new utopian models of what Italy could be resulted in Italians growing to love the Other more than the discontinuities and differences that constituted the ordinary experiences of Italy’s real life.

1.5 On Writing the Patriotic Experience

The theoretical approach I have taken in this thesis raises a number of methodological problems concerning my use of psychoanalysis and runs a number of risks. First, the use of psychoanalysis may result in an ahistorical reductionist account of patriotism in Liberal Italy since psychoanalytical theories – for example the Oedipus complex of which the symptoms of sadism and masochism are manifestations – tends to suggest a stable view of human nature. Second, because of my own position as a woman, in my exploration of intensely masculine spaces my own voice may be stifled and suffocated by the pull of phallocentric desire. These two risks, the former concerning objectivity, the latter that of subjectivity, are, I believe, intimately connected through the debate surrounding the application of psychoanalysis towards the historical object.

‘Historians’, states Peter Gay, ‘like to reject psychoanalysis as an auxiliary discipline with one sweeping, summary denial: you cannot psychoanalyse the dead’. Jacques Barzun’s *Clio and the Doctors* is an example of this condemnation of the application of psychoanalysis to interpretations of the historical object. In this work Barzun seeks to rescue history, defined as a past ‘written report’ devoid of actuality, from various types of ‘doctor’, one of which is that of psychology who views history as a ‘patient’. Although I intend to use psychoanalytical theories to explore the dynamics of how the subject becomes patriotic, I do not wish to produce a psycho-history of the nation. What I am interested in is how one of the principal tools of psychoanalysis, that of

---

transference, may assist in an understanding of how the subject becomes patriotic as an experience.

Freud stated that 'transference is merely uncovered and isolated by analysis. It is a universal phenomenon of the human mind [...] and in fact dominates the whole of each person's relations to his human environment'. My investigation into how the subject becomes patriotic involves, in a sense, a reconstruction of the transference relationship between the citizen and the monumental space. And yet a collective body of citizens has not entered into an intimate relationship with me, as the patient does with the analyst. My approach therefore risks falling into a subjective narration in which, as the patient's relationship with the analyst might be thought of as a conversation with oneself, the thesis becomes purely an investigation into myself. For these reasons I would like to examine in greater detail some of the potential difficulties in my methodology.

In 'History and Psychoanalysis' Dominick LaCapra explores Freud's notion of transference in relation to the historian and the historical object. 'Transference', he argues, 'offers a better way of understanding a "dialogic" relation to the past than do standard [...] debates about objectivity and subjectivity'. According to LaCapra, Freud believed that the objectivity of the analyst could be achieved in the therapeutic setting through 'evenly suspended' or 'poised attention'. The analyst's poise allowed him or her to be receptive to the patient's dialogue and to observe the effects of transference such as upset expectations upon his or her unconscious.

In this context, as LaCapra asserts, objectivity does not hinder the role of transference, but simply challenges the idea that the past can be recounted on its own terms. Applying the notion of poised attention to the historian's approach to the past, LaCapra suggests that a different type of historiography would be produced, since the historian's desire to find order in chaos and a linear narration would be thwarted. The historian's poise would not only allow him or her to explore the 'interaction' between things in a 'distorted past'; it would also enable the historian's own subjective position to surface:

It would [...] imply the need to investigate the interaction between order and challenges to it in the more or less "distorted" objects of the past as well as in one's own discourse about them. Transference in this sense would highlight the issue of the historian's voice in the narration and analysis.

I have used LaCapra's notion of the historian's 'poise' in my own writing about the patriotic experience. To begin with I have reconstructed each monumental space by focusing upon particular historical events: for example Chapter Two deals with the funeral of Alessandro Manzoni and Albert Keller, Chapter Three a foundation stone ceremony, Chapter Four the reclamation of a lake, and Chapter Five the commemorative rituals of the wars of the Risorgimento. A careful analysis of these events on the basis of contemporary accounts has allowed me to reconstruct the events. However, whether it is a document, a text, a painting or the architectural work itself, I have made interpretations.

\footnote{ibid., pp. 15-16.}
\footnote{ibid., p. 16.}
One of the ways in which I have made interpretations is through an empathy with the building, which corresponds to LaCapra’s notion of transference. Empathy has played an important role in my attempt to reconstruct what experiences occurred at the site. However, to avoid ‘wild analysis’ I have used archival material to direct my empathetic engagement with each site – for example plans, illustrations, the design of interiors, stairs, corridors, the intention behind the play of surfaces, light, dark and colour in the staging of a patriotic experience. This type of empathy has been influenced by Henri Lefebvre, who argues in La Production de l’espace that every space is already in place before the appearance in it of subjects, by which he means that the architect’s arrangement and planning of the space is not neutral for example the exclusive Reform Club in Pall Mall selects who it welcomes and rejects through its design.

In another way I have used empathy to uncover unconscious or hidden meanings behind the buildings or spaces through the relationship between architecture and the human body. Until the beginning of the nineteenth century, in particular in the medieval and Renaissance period, it was common to use the building as a metaphor for the human body. In Building the Text: Architecture as Metaphor in Late Medieval and Early Modern France, David Cowling shows how body metaphors of the building and the city were used in texts to convey the chastity of the female form. Walls would convey psychological resistance to temptation and closed gates could be read allegorically to signify the Virgin and her intact status. Similarly in Body, Diagram, and Geometry in the Renaissance Fortress

Simon Pepper explores how the architect used the human body – the fortress was ‘likened to the “head” of the city […] overlooking and overseeing with its “eyes” the body of the city and like a “doctor” acting quickly to deal with problems’\textsuperscript{128}. His research on Renaissance architects such as Filarete and Alberti suggests that architecture was not conceived as a passive object but as an entity that interacted with the occupant.

Cowling argues that from Origen onwards, devotional texts connected the edification of Christian faith to the process of decoding the allegorical meanings behind castles, towers, enclosed gardens, cities, gates, slitted windows, within the works\textsuperscript{129}. In using empathy I have allowed myself the possibility of experiencing how the presence of these built environments might have impacted upon the subject, encouraging him or her towards a patriotic edification in which feeling devoted to the nation would be built into their daily lives.

Each space that I explore are explicitly interpretations of medieval or Renaissance architecture and so in my own empathy with the sites I have allowed the buildings to draw me into a relationship with them based on the foundation of architectural thought from Vitruvius that the building is in someway a prosthesis of the human body. I have prefaced Chapters Two and Three with subjective narrations which represent my transference with the monuments. It is important to acknowledge that these narrations are not intended to stand for the experience of individuals from another historical period. However, in describing my own empathy with the

\textsuperscript{128} (p. 115).
\textsuperscript{129} Cowling, p. 143.
monument these vignettes, I believe, offer insights into the psycho-dynamics of the space. In Chapter Three, for example, I write about how the monument appeared to seduce me, and how through my posture being forced into an unusual position as I walked up the monumental staircase I felt as if I had ceased to be ‘me’. These vignettes therefore offer an attempt at understanding how the process of de-individualization operates. To ensure that these subjective narrations do not then become an underpinning of ‘wild analysis’ I have separated them from the main body of the chapter, where my interpretations have been moderated through archival research.

LaCapra argues that the historian’s ‘poise’ would produce a non-linear history and the surfacing of the historian’s voice would parallel the experiments of the modern novel.130 This thesis has been influenced by the experimental writings of Deleuze and Guattari, in particular Mille Plateaux which is structured like a rhizome. From the botanical term for a rootstock, a book assembled like a rhizome would, according to Deleuze and Guattari, make associations between dissimilar and even contradictory points in a way reminiscent on LaCapra’s historiography centred upon transference:

À la différence des arbres ou de leurs racines, le rhizome connecte un point quelconque avec un autre point quelconque, et chacun de ses traits ne renvoie pas nécessairement à des traits de même nature, il met en jeu des régimes de signes très différents et même des états de non-signes.131

---

130 LaCapra, p. 16.
131 Deleuze and Guattari, mille plateaux, p. 31.
The principal component of the rhizome-like book is that it is assembled as a series of plateaux, which have no beginning or end, but are situated in the middle, and are therefore without a telos.\textsuperscript{132} I have assembled each chapter as a series of plateaux, each plateau explores the intensity of an experience so that each monumental space is a multi-faceted collection of experiences. Moreover, each plateau intersects with other plateaux not only from the same chapter but from other chapters: for example Freud's \textit{Civilisation and its Discontents} in Chapter Three intersects with Saint Augustine's \textit{City of God} in Chapter Four through their common use of Rome and the myth of the Eternal city. Similarly histories that may contradict each other in a linear history intersect: for example in Chapter Two we have the contemporary theory that the nineteenth century was concerned with the purification of medieval eschatology from the modern city, whereas in Chapter Five we see the resurfacing of these traditions in the construction of the Ossuary of San Martino.

The poised attention opens up a space of transference where the emotions and thoughts of the analyst may surface and be assessed, prior to being transferred back to the patient. As I reconstructed the masculine spaces, and as I read the psychoanalytical theories of Lacan and Deleuze I have allowed my own transference with the material to surface, be considered and then I have transferred them back to the historical subject I am investigating through the explicitly subjective choice of titles – 'You only live twice', 'Indecent Proposals', 'The End of the Affair', 'Endgame' – from contemporary films, plays and novels. History is ultimately a subjective enterprise, which becomes apparent when we try to

\textsuperscript{132} \textit{ibid.}, p. 32.
interpret our own history. In recollecting an event from my childhood – for
example I fell over at the age of five – my interpretation of its meaning when it
happened, and later, at different ages – at ten, twenty, thirty and so forth – will be
different each time, even though I was the active participant in that past. These
titles are interpretations that plot my own subjective investigation into masochism
and sadism that emerged through my transference with the spaces. If transference
literally means the movement from one location to another, the choice of readily
accessible cultural forms that I have chosen as titles represents the process through
which I have sought to transfer psychoanalytical theories into a social context. The
concept of the ‘chapter’ in a book, as opposed to the plateau, for Deleuze and
Guattari conveys the culminations and terminations of teleology.\(^{133}\) The chapter
titles, as my psychoanalytical interpretations of my experience of becoming
patriotic, make explicit the obsessive desires for endings, conclusions, and new
beginnings that characterize masochistic and sadistic games, and whose ultimate
‘termination’ and ‘culmination’ is that of the sexual thrill of war itself: the
endgame of this thesis.

\(^{133}\) ibid., p. 32.
Chapter Two

You Only Live Twice: Escaping to a Dream Life and a Romantic Lover through the Patriotic Kiss of the Cimitero Monumentale, Milan

You only live twice or so it seems
One life for yourself and one for your dreams
You drift through the years and life seems tame
Till one dream appears and love is its name.¹

John Barry and Leslie Bricusse, You Only Live Twice

According to the Homeric view, human beings exist twice over: once as an outward and visible shape, and again as an invisible “image” which only gains its freedom in death. This and nothing else is the Psyche.²

Erwin Rohde, Psyche

2.1 The Stolen Kiss

Isolated in a borderline position between the inner historical city of life and money and the outer suburbs of infinite grey expansion, Milan’s Cimitero Monumentale, the city of the dead, is a suspended place where the real and the unreal collide. Its walled gardens conjure up the melody of bird song and a Romantic dream that is punctuated by the constant heartbeat of trains in movement from the industrial backdrop of the Stazione Centrale.

¹ The song You Only Live Twice was composed by John Barry (music) and Leslie Bricusse (lyrics) for the James Bond film of the same name (1967), directed by Lewis Gilbert, screenplay by Roald Dahl, based on the novel by Ian Fleming.
Fig. 2.1
The Cimitero Monumentale. Author's photograph.
The unkempt grey streets that marked out my approach to the city of the dead nullified the senses to intensify the impact of my first vision of the cemetery. Its public courtyard was scattered with figures dressed in black, cut against the pink marble body of the cemetery (Fig. 2.1). They had chosen to congregate on 9 February 2003 to commemorate the death of those Italian soldiers killed on the Russian front in the Second World War with a service conducted by the Bishop of Milan. The gilded ornamentation around the Famedio doors shimmered, radiating a golden halo of light that blessed their service. The staircase of the Famedio welcomed its guests in a carpet of warm breath, which was lightly traced out upon the steps by a path of primroses.

I, the uninvited guest, silently observed the men smiling in groups together, while the Milanese woman, isolated in her characteristic black fur coat, scurried around like a cat in an enclosed world of grief. From Roman wailers to Romantic medieval maidens with aching hearts, to the heritage of the ever mourning Queen Victoria, “Cemeteries are all woman!”, I said to myself.

Her body – the cemetery’s body – was built from a tinted pink marble which clad her with the soft flesh of a medieval maiden, while the galleries that stretched out from the Famedio became her scallop-edged velvet sleeves. In a hushed voice she ushered me on, whispering to me to quicken my pace and plunge into her subterranean world of catacombs and private chapels that lay beneath her fleshy exterior. As I crossed these underground passageways that marked off the living city from the dead, I could have imagined myself as the fabled heroic Odysseus
Fig. 2.2
The Cimitero Monumentale. Author's photograph.
Fig. 2.3
The Cimitero Monumentale. Author's photograph.

Fig. 2.4
The Cimitero Monumentale. Author's photograph.
crossing the river Styx to Hades, but there were no ferrymen provided to assist me on my voyage, and there were no pennies placed upon my eyes.

To my dismay, when I arrived on the other side, the oneiric city of the dead that was ordinarily so full of psychical disturbances – ghosts, cobwebs and ruined cottages – had been liberated from the ghoulish apparitions of Romanticism (Fig. 2.2). The streets were empty but clean. The perfectly built edifices that lined the streets had names attached, such as ‘Braga’. I assumed that they were the names of the occupants who, while they clearly tended their homes with care, were invisible to the human eye.

At the centre of this meticulously maintained city of the dead was a park where statuesque women contemplated, conversed, and comforted each other in a Sapphic harmony. One woman lay in her Grecian dress; leaning forward in a muscular posture she listened attentively to a voice from far away (Fig. 2.3). Occasionally I saw a man comforted by groups of women who lavished affection upon the male body. In one such group I saw a man whose lithe nakedness was only barely covered by a loincloth lightly wrapped around his hips (Fig. 2.4). His head rested upon his wife’s lap, staring into her eyes, it was his last glimpse of her beauty before he expelled his dying breath. At his side was his daughter who so gracefully tilted her head that she might rest her cheek upon the dying hand he held out to her. These women – a mother and a daughter – displayed a sublime image of devotion to the man – a husband and a father – who was surrounded by photographic images, souvenirs I suspected from his former travels.
Even though these statuesque female forms displayed such emotion they never uttered a word. They used a mute language of animated gestures, of exaggerated Mannerist expressions that impelled the visitor to stop and listen to their silent story cast in stone. In her silence the woman named Giuseppina Morandi implored me to sit beside her (Fig. 2.5). She wore a long silk robe and was seated upon a coffin lid, as if she were waiting for her lover to return. Her cheek rested upon her left arm, her eyelids were closed as she remembered his farewell kiss, and dreamt of his lips once more upon hers. Her curved waist was still poised for her husband’s arms to slide around her in a warm embrace. But that was 1925, when she left her husband, Francesco Fricerio, to wait patiently for him in the land of the dead.

Now in 2003, generations of fathers and sons have walked past her, leaving lilies in her arms, or knelt to place a posy of flowers at her feet, but she always remains still, silently awaiting her lover’s return in the inert eternal role that is assigned to womanhood of evoking passion and remembrance through muted agony. In rituals of remembrance, when strangers rest flowers at her feet, the statuesque kiss she steals from their gestures is a model of romantic love.

---

3 Knoepflmacher argues that the ‘inert female’ is characteristic of English Romantic poets such as Wordsworth, providing the male pilgrim as poet-son and wanderer-father with the starting point for their peregrinations. U. C. Knoepflmacher, ‘Female Spaces and Male Designs’, in The Sense of Sex: Feminist Perspectives on Hardy, ed. by Margaret R. Higonnet (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1993), pp. 107-31 (pp. 108-9).
Fig. 2.5
The Cimitero Monumentale. Author's photograph.
2.2 A Kiss Is Just a Kiss?

If patriotism is a love-relation with a particular place, the famous Risorgimento painting, *Il Bacio, Episodio della giovinezza, Costumi del Secolo XIV* by Francesco Hayez, portrays the emotional intensity of becoming patriotic in the intimacy of the romantic kiss (Fig. 2.6). First shown at the *Esposizione di Brera* in September 1859, a few months after Milan’s liberation from Austrian rule by Vittorio Emanuele II and Napoleon III, *Il Bacio* became a patriotic symbol of the city’s liberation and Italian Unification.4 Within this context the couple’s common destiny – accomplished through a man and a woman falling in love – is an allegory for how Milanese felt about their city and the new nation, where differences and divisions could be overcome by romantic devotion to the beloved patria. Our desire to be loved through the reciprocation of kisses is a common human need and is the subject of poetry, drama, and popular culture. Thus, it is no surprise that a new version of the painting entitled *Il Bacio del Volontario* was exhibited at the Paris Universal Exhibition in 1867 and reached international acclaim through its subject matter of intertwining courtly love with the contemporary romance of dying for the nation (Fig. 2.7). Francesco Dall’Ongaro, writing in 1872, describes the potency of this patriotic kiss in terms of bestowing upon a new generation of Italians the power that being in love gives: the ‘bacio affettuoso’ makes the new generation robust, since they take life as it comes in a carefree manner, but also transforms them into poetic, romantic subjects, who love truth and beauty. In the painting’s imagery these ideas, for Dall’Ongaro, are expressed by the dramatic uncertainty of the couple’s fate, set against the sacred certainty of the medieval ‘bacio affettuoso’ which cleanses ‘nostri arcadi contemporanei’:

---

Fig. 2.6

Fig. 2.7
É una scena toccante, piena di mistero e di affetto; è un dramma ancora da farsi; è un poema più bello di quello dei nostri arcadi contemporanei, ribattezzati nell’acqua santa. Esca da quel bacio affettuoso una generazione robusta, sincera, che pigli la vita come ella viene, e la fecondi con l’amore del bello e del vero.⁵

In Dall’Ongaro’s description of *Il Bacio* he confers on the medieval kiss a sacred religious status through his comparison of the act of kissing with the ‘acqua santa’ used in baptism. It is important to acknowledge that Dall’Ongaro was a priest as well as an art historian. In Yannick Carre’s analysis of the medieval kiss, she argues that its sacred connotations were derived from the egalitarian nature of a kiss upon the mouth. Since God’s breath had created human life the mouth was, as Carre asserts, the divine organ, the receptacle of life which when kissed symbolized divine love. In sacred rites, for example, the pontiff would kiss the newly ordained priest upon the mouth to show the equality of love within the order, as the Eucharist, the sacrament of Christ’s love, symbolized the holy kiss upon the mouth.⁶ Dall’Ongaro’s commentary on Hayez’s *Il Bacio Volontario* suggests that the sacred qualities of the medieval kiss are relocated into a romantic kiss from a maiden, and that it is through the fantasy of this kiss that the male subject, the ‘volontario’, gains access into the earthly ‘spirito comune’ of the nation. In a new preface to *Purity and Danger* Mary Douglas describes her book as ‘a study of impurity [...] that justified the very constraints that society puts on

love'.

In the medieval age constraints were placed upon the sacred kiss through the level of intimate bodily contact, which demarcated hierarchical differences within the order – for example after the priest’s ordination he would only be permitted to kiss the pontiff upon the hand. In contrast, Hayez’s *Il bacio* invites the spectator into a fantasy which is free from corporeal limitations; its only real constraint appears to be that of death itself, which is scripted into the fantasy through the romance of dying for the *patria*.

Paralleling the romance of dying for the city’s liberation that *Il Bacio* encapsulates, Milan began constructing a cult of the dead, by which I mean a practice whereby citizens are encouraged to meditate upon the memory of deceased heroes by visiting their tombs or memorials. First, in 1860 the newly elected *comune* suspended construction of the civic cemetery – a project initiated in 1857 by the Austrian Emperor Franz Joseph – describing Giulio Aluisetti’s Beaux Arts style as leaving ‘gelido il cuore e nuda la fantasia’. When the Lombard-Romanesque design by Carlo Maciacchini (1818-99) was chosen in 1863, Giuseppe Mongeri, who headed the selection panel, described its medieval style as ‘altamente nazionale e religioso’ because it was inspired from a style ‘nato e sviluppatisi nella sua regione istessa in un’epoca di vivissima fede e di ardente amor patrio’. Second, the *comune* specified that the cemetery would be designed to accommodate all faiths. Maciacchini’s project has a central zone for Catholics.

---

with two segregated lateral areas for Jews (right) and non-Catholics (left). To accompany this Liberal project, Maciacchini’s design included a Pantheon of Milanesi ‘illustri’ and ‘benemeriti’. The Pantheon was finally called a Famedio – alluding to the Roman Tempio della Fama – and it was built between 1876 and 1887. Third, the comune introduced a law in 1861 to close the traditional cemeteries, the fopponi – Milanese for fosse comuni – where corpses were buried collectively in large ditches devoid of commemorative marks, although they remained unofficially in use until 1895 when the Cimitero Maggiore di Muscocco opened.¹¹

The construction of a cult of the dead had a special significance in Milan, as the city and the fopponi had been the subject of Ugo Foscolo’s wrath in De’ Sepolcri (1807). Foscolo wrote the poem in response to the Napoleonic St Cloud edict of 1804, extended to Italy in 1806, which decreed that cemeteries should be moved away from cities and that there should be no outward signs to differentiate the tombs of the illustrious citizens from the unknown multitude.¹² De’ Sepolcri may be read as a treatise on the civic importance of a cult of the dead, expressed by Foscolo’s contrast between the atemporal space of poetic memory and the decaying material reality of what it meant to be buried in a foppone – an unmarked common grave. This reality is depicted by Foscolo’s graphic account of wandering through Mojazza cemetery, the foppone at Porta Comasina (now Porta Garibaldi), in the vicinity of the Cimitero Monumentale. Seeking his poetic predecessor, Parini, he is unable to find a plaque, a stone, a word that marks his mortal remains:

The poet condemns Milan to a state of moral depravity because of the city’s lack of a commemoration to Parini. In comparing Milan to a licentious lover of effeminate singers, Foscolo associates this lack of an adequate commemoration to the deceased poet as somehow de-masculinizing. This de-masculinization appears to immobilize Foscolo through the horrifying thought that his hero’s mortal remains may be stained with blood from the guillotined head of a thief:

 [... ] e forse l’ossa
col mozza capo gl’insanguina il ladro
che lasciò sul patibolo i delitti. (lines 75-77)\textsuperscript{14}

Foscolo’s poem implies that a cult of the dead is a gendered act. Moreover it implies that corpses commemorated with plaques and segregated in individualized coffins, as opposed to a \textit{fossa comune}, encourage remembrance as a masculine act where becoming a man occurs through recalling one’s forefathers who are buried below, embraced by a chaste female gendered earth. Following Cowling’s observations on how sacred sites in medieval texts were metaphors of the female body – discussed in Chapter One – in nineteenth-century accounts of the cemetery of Milan – for example the novella of Carlo Variali, \textit{Prima visione al Cimitero Monumentale} – show how the cemetery is a metaphor of a maternal female form.

\textsuperscript{13} ibid., p. 42.
\textsuperscript{14} ibid., p. 42.
In the text Variali makes a pilgrimage to the cemetery where the tombs, not only of the rich and famous, but also of the ‘più umili’, arouse profound feelings of patriotic ‘amore’ and ‘fede’ through the cemetery’s maternal economy that cradles equally all her sons in their eternal sleep: ‘La natura, madre amorosa di tutti, non dimentica mai i suoi figli, che dormono sotterra il sonno eterno’.\(^{15}\) If Hayez’s *Il Bacio del Volontario* is the sacred uncontaminated kiss from the maiden that blesses the soldier on his pilgrimage, the cemetery, described as a ‘terrestre pellegrinaggio’ at its inauguration in 1866,\(^ {16} \) is the built realization of this utopian kiss. In the Promised Land of the cemetery the patriotic citizen shall be embraced eternally by Mother Earth, the Deleuzian oral mother. It is this relationship between *Il Bacio* as the secularization of the holy kiss of the Eucharist and the Cimitero Monumentale as the spatialization of this secular viaticum that I shall examine in this Chapter through the romance of dying for the *patria*.

From the origins of the Italian monumental cemetery in 1801 with the opening of the civic cemetery of Bologna,\(^ {17} \) it is widely acknowledged that the development of the Cimitero Monumentale in Liberal Italy was fundamental in the development of civic patriotism. However, the phenomenon of the monumental cemetery has received little scholarly attention. Michele Petrantoni has tentatively outlined the historical debates surrounding the different phases of Milan’s Cimitero Monumentale from the project’s inception in the Restoration to its realization in Liberal Italy. According to Petrantoni, the Cimitero is a response to *De’ Sepolcri*, particularly the bloody imagery of Parini’s remains, the verses on which concluded

---

\(^{17}\) Selvafolta, p. 179.
Mongeri’s speech at the cemetery’s inauguration. The implication of his argument is therefore that the Cimitero Monumentale was conceived as a built reparation of Milan’s past funereal misdeeds.

The Italian historian Dino Mengozzi has made a recent study of lay funerals in Liberal Italy. According to Mengozzi the ‘spazio della morte’ became a contested space where Catholic notions of the after-life and therefore the Eucharist – the latter term is never mentioned by Mengozzi – were secularized through an ideology of immortality that had its origins in Robespierre’s formulation that death was the beginning of immortality. At one extreme the Church refused religious comfort to soldiers of the ‘Guardia Nazionale’, the ‘garibaldini’ and the ‘malpensati’; at the other extreme socialists excluded the Church from lay funerals under the motto ‘dalla culla alla bara’ – from the cradle to the grave – and thereby promulgated their political programme of social reform outside ecclesiastical ‘carità’. In Mengozzi’s argument the locus for the construction of a civic pedagogy of remembrance is the cemetery, which, as he states, functioned as a lay church, conducting funeral rites and encouraging civic commemorations with its Pantheons. And yet the church is not only a ‘spazio della morte’ but also a ‘spazio della vita’ – for example baptism and marriage – which symbolically binds life and death together into a cycle of renewal. Without a consideration of the ‘spazio della vita’ and its relation to a ‘spazio della morte’, it is left unclear how Mengozzi’s ideology of immortality interpellates the subject.

---

18 Petrantoni, p. 15.
20 ibid., pp. 75, 102.
21 ibid., p. 67.
One resolution to Mengozzi’s conceptualization of the ‘spazio della morte’ is found in Ornella Selvafolta’s paper ‘Il Cimitero Monumentale di Milano’. She argues that the cemetery sought to intermingle sacred and profane spaces in its role as a mirror of the city: for example the cemetery’s exposed façade and external courtyard is a profane space used predominantly for the public administration of the cemetery, whereas the gardened tomb area is a sacred space for contemplation. Inside the cemetery, Selvafolta asserts that the design committee sought to create a ‘spazio sentimentale’ that would arouse a civic patriotism through the Trecento Lombard architectural style – associated with the city’s life – in contrast to the natural verdure which was a haven for the individual’s memories of the deceased – death.22

In architectural history Richard A. Etlin’s The Architecture of Death: The Transformation of the Cemetery in Eighteenth-Century Paris is a study of the most influential nineteenth-century cemetery, the Père Lachaise, opened in 1804. Etlin explores the processes by which the cemetery is ‘dechristianized’ through what he describes as ‘the hygienic argument’ – for example the scientific knowledge that diseases were airborne. These scientific discoveries were accompanied by a new religious outlook that saw death as sullying the purity of the church.23 Tombs and mausoleums were removed from the interior of the church and the role of its external cemetery was relocated to the urban periphery under the Napoleonic municipal governments. From a psychological perspective Etlin argues that dechristianization sought to exorcise the medieval Christian eschatological

22 Selvafolta, pp. 186-87.
tradition of confronting death – which had developed into macabre Baroque
spectacles with huge pyramidal catafalques and grinning skeletons – and replace it
with death as a sweet rest inspired from Greek and Roman funereal inscriptions.24
For Etlin Père Lachaise constructs a sense of immortality through its appearance as
a terrestrial paradise where ‘the sweetness of death’ met ‘the illusion of a
continuing presence’ binding the dead to ‘their attentive survivors’.25

However, in Liberal Italy the dechristianization of an impure Baroque Church and
its rechristianization into a pure rational scientific Church was far more complex
because of the tensions between the state and the Church. Antonio Gramsci’s
thoughts on the problems of Italian Romanticism illustrate the historical
complexities of this argument and shed light on the particularities of civic
patriotism as a romantic dying for the patria. Gramsci defines Romanticism as
‘uno speciale rapporto o legame tra gli intellettuali e il popolo, la nazione’.26 It
also, he notes, both preceded and accompanied the French Revolution. In Italy
Gramsci correlates the lack of a revolution with the lack of an Italian literature.
Without some form of popular revolution the Italian nation could not become ‘un
fatto storico’ and a ‘unità vivente’, which, for Gramsci, is one of the reasons why
there was not a ‘romanticismo italiano’.27

In Il Bacio Hayez does create a bond between the ‘poet’ and the ‘popolo’ in the
invitation to return to the unfallen world of the medieval comune. Critics such as

24 ibid., p. 238.
25 ibid., p. 357.
26 Antonio Gramsci, Quaderni del carcere: edizione critica dell’Istituto Gramsci, ed. by Valentino
27 ibid., p. 1740.
Paolo Biscottini view the painting positively as a ‘felice sintesi fra le sue più intense acquisizioni psicologiche e la loro aderenza alla storia patria’. This interpretation is based upon knowledge of Hayez’s original *L’ultimo bacio dato a Giulietta da Romeo* (1823) and the view that the protagonists, who were once on a Shakespearian theatrical stage, are now in the historical reality of the medieval *comune*. Gramsci argues that the popular classes were not very literary minded, but their familiarity with the libretti of nineteenth-century operas encouraged them to behave ‘operatically’. Similarly, without a common vernacular and a common tradition *Il Bacio* becomes a mute piece of theatrical rhetoric where the Eucharist, that is the body of Christ, is dechristianized in the patriotic communion of a kiss between a soldier and his maiden. The result of the secularization of the body of Christ is that the vertical position of the crucifix, which signifies the hierarchical and necessarily unequal relationship between God the father, Christ his son and mankind below, is replaced by the horizontal equalizing X of a kiss.

In this Chapter the originality of my study of the Cimitero Monumentale will be to explore how the heterotopic space of the cemetery becomes the Other arena of a ‘virtual’ revolution, instigated through the dechristianization of the holy kiss of the Eucharist in the new lay cult of the dead. I examine elements of a ‘virtual’ revolution through two significant events. The first is the death of the Catholic poet Alessandro Manzoni on 22 May 1873. Manzoni’s funeral sought to connect the poet and Milan to the new nation through his transformation into a national religious Saint. The second is the incineration of the Catholic viaticum in the first

---

29 Gramsci, p. 1738.
modem cremation in the Western world held at the cemetery on 22 January 1876. The body’s cremation represented a revolutionary act since it constituted the violent incineration of the Catholic viaticum, the corpse – the Church did not recognize cremation until 1962 – and offered the promise of civic immortality to those who chose this hygienic burial rite.

In *Psyche*, Rohde’s study on the Homeric cult of souls, he argues that the notion of having two lives originates in the phenomenon of dreaming. The process of dreaming was conceptualized in the ancient world as a second psychical life that occurred upon the death of our corporeal existence. Rohde’s observations offer a way of thinking about how a national cult of the dead which fantasizes about dying constitutes not only a dechristianization of the Church, but may also become a mechanism for building a national psyche through the collective daydream of another life. This is observed in the film *You Only Live Twice* where an Other Japanese location becomes the dream world of white bikini-clad women that James Bond is resurrected into after feigning his own death at sea. Distanced from the grey real life of London, in this exotic dream Bond would willingly sacrifice his life in the pursuit of a kiss from an enigmatic female, who embodies the patriotic mission as her secret password, “I Love You”, is the entrance into the fantasy. The Cimitero Monumentale, in its romance of dying for the nation, offers the utopian dream that *You Only Live Twice*, one life for the grey world of the Church and a second life for the patria where, in daring romantic endeavours, you may risk all for the eternity of a kiss. A kiss is never just an X.

---

30 Rohde, pp. 6-7
2.3 Cathedral Spaces

It has been widely asserted that the myth of Milan as the Capitale Morale, founded upon its status as a modern industrial city, was established in the 1881 National Exhibition the city held. As John Foot describes in Milan Since the Miracle, an area of 162,000 square metres was dedicated to displaying the industrial expertise of 8,000 businesses, while comprehensive studies of the city and its industry, the most notable being Mediolanum, spread the myth of Milan as the moral capital.31

The myth of Milan as Italy’s moral capital was, according to Foot, founded upon its industrial, cultural and scientific strength in opposition to the immoral capital of Rome: ‘Milan was the true capital because Rome was not – the myth was a negative assessment of the contribution of Rome and the south to Italy’s industrial progress’.32 Although I do not contest these arguments, what I am interested in is a genealogical assessment of Milan’s ascendancy into a ‘moral’ space against Rome’s descent into an ‘immoral’ state, in spite of its status as the national capital and the universal capital of the Catholic world. If morality is a system of value judgements which, as Tracey Strong argues, is for Nietzsche based upon man’s belief that the world should be meaningful, the soil from which these morals spring is the Roman question and the state’s inability to resolve it, rendering Rome meaningless and therefore immoral, set against Milan’s capacity to supply meaningful answers to what the new Italian nation ideologically aspired towards – industrial and scientific progress.33

32 ibid., p. 168.
The genealogy of Milan’s moral supremacy over Rome can be traced back to the rise of early Latin Christianity when the Roman Empire became divided under Diocletian (284-306) into two halves – the Eastern Empire ruled from Nicomedia and the Western Empire from Milan (Mediolanum). It was from Mediolanum that the Milan edict was issued by Emperors Constantine – the first Christian Emperor – and Licinius in AD 313. Ending the persecution of Christians and restoring Church property, the edict promulgated man’s ‘liberty to follow either the religion of the Christians or any other cult which of his own free choice he has thought to be best adapted for himself’. In Liberal Italy the edict was historically understood as resulting in Milan’s transformation into a great ecclesiastical capital through Constantine’s great legacy that of Saint Ambrose, who was considered ‘fra i più dotti ed eloquenti Padri della Chiesa Latina’. Similarly the architectural moral foundation of the Lombard Trecento style was the Basilica Martyrum consecrated by Ambrose in 386. Situated outside the city walls it housed the relics of St Gervasius and Protasius beneath the altar, where Ambrose’s own sarcophagus was to have stood. Inside the city walls this morality was realized by building the cathedral, which rivalled that of St Peter’s in Rome.

In early Latin Christianity, Peter Brown argues that the cemetery’s location was in the Roman city at the periphery – St Peter’s for example – and functioned as a

---

34 Francesco Cusani, Storia di Milano dall’origine ai nostri giorni, 7 vols (Milan: Libreria Pirotta, 1861-73), 1 (1861), 91-98.
bridge binding Roman citizens and strangers together through their collective pilgrimage to a saint’s relics.\textsuperscript{39} Using Brown’s observations of the cemetery’s location in the Roman period, I shall examine how Milan sought to construct a new civic morality through reinterpreting the pre-existing medieval and early Christian spatial relationships that existed between the cathedral at the urban centre and the sacred cemetery at the periphery.

At the opening of Samuele Ghiron’s guidebook to the Cimitero Monumentale he described the impetus behind the planning of Milan after its liberation in 1859. After years of servitude to foreign domination Milan began a ‘nuova vita’, in which widening roads, demolishing pre-existing structures, and constructing a cult of the dead, were ways that this new life sought expression:

Milano che risorta a nuova vita dopo il 1859, si accinse con febrile attività a rinnovare sè stessa, aprendo nuove vie, allargando le vecchie, ponendo ogni studio per guadagnare il tempo forzatamente perduto negli anni del servaggio; doveva pur volgere un pietoso pensiero ai morti ai morituri.\textsuperscript{40}

Architecturally the new moral life of Milan was designed around the Piazza del Duomo, which established the city’s rigid monocentric structure with the cathedral at its heart.\textsuperscript{41} The Piazza del Duomo project, like that of the cemetery, had been initiated in the 1830s with the intention of giving the city an impressive centre to reflect its economic and political ambitions, but was only realized after

\textsuperscript{40} Samuele Ghiron, \textit{Il Cimitero Monumentale di Milano: guida artistica} (Milan: Lombardi, 1878), p. 3.
\textsuperscript{41} Maurizio Grandi and Attilio Pracchi, \textit{Milano: guida all’architettura moderna} (Bologna: Zanichelli, 1980), pp. 22-23.
The final project, by Giuseppe Mengoni (1865), was criticized for abandoning the Lombard style for that of a local Renaissance style. The project’s centrepiece was the glass-covered Galleria which connected the Piazza del Duomo to Piazza della Scala, where Palazzo Marino, the headquarters of the *comune* of Milan was located (Fig. 2.8). As Grandi and Pracchi assert, the project became ‘uno dei paradigmi della città borghese post-unitaria, l’archetipo non superato dei monumenti e delle piazze della terza Italia’. The Galleria forms the pattern of a Latin cross, which is modernized through a Paxton-influenced prefabricated glass and iron construction to convey the new industrial Milan. The pattern of the Latin cross mirrors that of the Duomo; the medieval streets surrounding the cathedral were demolished to emphasize its form.

As part of the modernization process the city slowly became centralized with the *Corpi Santi* – the equivalent of English parishes – being annexed to the *comune* in 1862 to make a cohesive bureaucratic structure. The *Corpi Santi* had been responsible for the disposal of the dead in each parish and so their annexation meant that the *comune* could begin to centralize cemeteries into one unique locale – the Cimitero Monumentale – and regulate burials. Outside the city there remained five rural *Corpi Santi*, which were not annexed. In Carlo Cattaneo’s influential discourse on urban economics – written in the 1860s – he redefines how the city’s inner and outer spaces are to be conceived in the wake of modernity. For Cattaneo the inner city is the ‘buon mercato’ and therefore the space of Liberal economics. Its economic freedom promotes the ‘libero andirvieni della città’

---

42 ibid., p. 7.
Fig. 2.8
Fig. 2.9
Carlo Maciacchini, *Planimetria generale del nuovo Cimitero Monumentale* (Milan: Vallardi, 1863), Plate I.

Fig. 2.10
Plan of the Duomo. From Gaetano Franchetti, *Storia e descrizione del Duomo del Milano* (Milan: De Stefanis, 1821), Plate IX.
esterna* towards the agrarian economy. In between these two spaces – the inner financial centre and the outer agrarian economy – Cattaneo envisaged a new suburban industrial space, which had its own distinct economy. In Milan this suburban space was characterized with the new industry of the Stazione Centrale, but also the Cimitero Monumentale. These two suburban spaces served as a bridge binding the inner and outer economies together; the former physically in railway connections, and the latter psychologically, since it connected citizens and peasants together through the remembrance of Milan and Lombardy’s civic history. In this study on the Cimitero Monumentale I explore the site as a heterotopia that bridges different histories of Milan by mirroring, inverting, and reflecting the city’s architecture.

The heterotopic experience of the cemetery was orchestrated around its relationship with the cathedral, the Duomo di Milano. The architect of the Cimitero Monumentale, Carlo Maciacchini, was particularly interested in ecclesiastical architecture having restored Santa Maria del Carmine and San Marco in Milan in the 1870s as part of the restoration of religious buildings that was being conducted across the city. Ecclesiastical elements can be seen throughout Maciacchini’s design (Fig. 2.9). The central façade – now the Famedio – was originally designed as a church with a crypt at ground level. Underneath the porticos, catacombs exposed to the light (shown on the top right of plan) were dug out to 1.6 metres below ground. On either side of the main public entrance are two

---

45 ibid., pp. 77-79.
smaller entrances for the ‘accatolici’ and ‘israeliti’ which total approximately 8 per cent of the space of the cemetery.47

A comparison between Maciacchini’s plan and that of the Duomo made by Franchetti in 1821 shows how the space of the cathedral influenced the design of the cemetery (Fig. 2.10). In Ghiron’s guidebook he notes that the rectangular form of the cemetery with two protruding sides resembles that of a cross: ‘Ai due fianchi del rettangolo sorgono due brevi ali sporgenti quasi simulacri di croce’.48 Similarly the central aisle of the cemetery corresponds to that of the cathedral and the dark green centre called the Necropolis that the aisle leads towards is the location of the altar and central dome of the Duomo. The ossuary, at the entrance of the Necropolis, was originally designed as the Famedio, but after the committee’s discussion with Maciacchini in 1869, it was agreed that the church at the cemetery’s front would be more appropriate.49

The arrangement of the Necropolis and ossuary inverts the cathedral space in a number of ways. First, the ossuary is designed as a Catholic chapel whose ceremonial space is raised above ground towards the sky through a series of steps, while it is exposed to air and light on three sides, with a large marble cross on the fourth wall. Its ceremonial space came into function on 2 November, the day of the dead. Below the ceremonial space at ground level, the walls of the chapel contained a crypt housing 30,000 depositories, belonging to the bones and the mortal remains of the buried that were systematically dug up after the tenth or

48 ibid., p. 12.
49 ibid., p. 3.
thirtieth anniversary of their death, depending on how much they had paid.\textsuperscript{50}

Unlike the altar in the cathedral with its crypt contained in the earth below, the cemetery’s arrangement inverts this relationship. Second, the Necropolis, described as the ‘analogon urbis’, is depicted on the plan as a dark green piazza growing from an octagonal centre.\textsuperscript{51} The design commission wanted ‘una vera necropoli con tutte le apparenze d’una città viva’, rather than houses represented ‘dalle tombe, dalle lapidi, dalle croci’ in which ‘gli abitatori stanno invisibili dietro il velame’.\textsuperscript{52} In Catholic numerology ‘eight’ symbolizes the body’s resurrection. Thus the octagonal arrangement at the cemetery’s heart underlines the function of the city of the dead as initiating a civic resurrection. Modern burial, as Foucault describes in ‘Des espaces autres’, replaces the communal cemetery in the churchyard with modern individualized coffins at the suburban city of the dead. In the Other space of the Cimitero Monumentale light and air penetrate the traditionally darkened crypts and catacombs of the Duomo, through the virtual ‘mimetic’ relationship between the cemetery on the periphery and the cathedral at the centre of Milan.

The ideological efficacy of cathedral space, for Lefebvre, is that it supplies answers to the worshipper by allowing its abundance of symbols to be deciphered. The religious experience encountered at the cathedral occurs through the prayer deciphering the entire sensorial phenomenon of the space – breath, sounds, incense

\textsuperscript{51} The quotation is from Giuseppe Mongeri’s account of the cemetery. Published in Selva\footnote{\textit{La Perseveranza}, 1 April 1863, p.1.}.
\textsuperscript{52} Mongeri, ‘Gli ultimi progetti pel Cimitero Monumentale della città di Milano’, \textit{La Perseveranza}, 1 April 1863, p.1.
through the Christian Word to the extent that the body is experienced as a total being in a total space:

L’usage de cet espace monumental, la cathédrale, implique sa réponse à toutes les questions qui assaillent celui qui franchit le seuil. Il entend ses propres pas, il écoute les bruits, les chants; il respire l’odeur de l’encens; [...] il reçoit une idéologie; il contemple les symboles en les déchiffrant; il expérimente un être total dans un espace total.53

As cathedral spaces might be thought of as psychical guidebooks on how to live a virtuous life according to the scriptures, the Cimitero Monumentale is a complete heterotopic Other city, in which its cult of commemoration becomes a vehicle for reading Milan as a moral capital. The arrangement of spaces inside the cemetery seeks to liberate the sacred spaces of the Duomo so that a new civic theology will emerge in which the city, rather than the cathedral, will be the site where each citizen may have a total experience of his or her body in space.

2.4 The Cult of Saint Alessandro Manzoni

To pry an object from its shell, to destroy its aura, is the mark of a perception whose 'sense of the universal quality of things' has increased to such a degree that it extracts it even from a unique object by means of reproduction.\textsuperscript{54}

\textit{Walter Benjamin, The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction}

For Benjamin, writing in 1936, the aura of a work of art originates from the sacred space it once occupied, where the object and the beholder were distanced from each other by the fact that the artefact – painting, sculpture, or relic – was only viewed on religious occasions. In early Latin Christianity these ritualistic properties, integral to an understanding of the 'aura', positioned the work of art at the horizontal interstices between the dead body buried in the earth below and the resurrected body of the soul in heaven above. On the one hand the art object was only displayed on the commemoration of a Saint's birth which, unlike modernity's conception of a birthday, was not a celebration of the birth from a maternal womb but the celestial birth from earth to heaven occurring on the date of mortal death – in the Duomo, access to San Carlo Borromeo's crypt, and paintings depicting his miracles, occurs on the commemoration of his death, 4 November.\textsuperscript{55} On the other hand the saint’s grave was deliberately filled with candelabra so that its light would catch upon the gilded roofs and thereby bring the divine light of the stars above to within a few feet of the Saint’s grave.\textsuperscript{56} The aura as the meeting point of heaven and earth contained the magical incantations and spells that appeared to hold sway over life and death.

\textsuperscript{55} Brown, pp. 56-58.
\textsuperscript{56} ibid., p. 4.
In contrast to Benjamin’s theory on the destruction of the aura through the art object’s mass reproduction, I intend to focus upon the reconstruction of the aura in a civic space of Milan accomplished by a secular cult of saints. This is exemplified in the case of Alessandro Manzoni and his transformation into a saint of the patria and Milan, as Ambrose was the city’s patron saint. His death, at almost ninety years of age, was interpreted in the national press using the rhetoric of the cult of saints. The date of his death (22 May 1873), for example, was auspicious for L’Emporio Pittoresco because it fell on the same day as previous battles for the liberation of the patria – the Lombard battle of Legnano in 1176 and the Risorgimento battle of Curtatone in 1848. Similarly his funeral date (29 May) was viewed as a ‘mirabile coincidenza’ in the Lombard newspaper La Perseveranza, since in three years’ time its celebration would coincide with the seven hundredth anniversary of the battle of Legnano. These two historical events would condense into one memory that of the reawakening of Lombard and Italian Unity commemorated around the coffin of the sleeping ‘sovrano poeta’. I shall explore how the relationship between this rhetorical language and the iconography of Manzoni’s dead body becomes a means of restoring the sacred aura through a patriotic cult of saints.

Manzoni’s last breath was drawn at precisely 6.15 in his home in Via Morone, and was commemorated in L’Emporio Pittoresco with images which sought to capture these last dying moments. Its front cover carried an illustration of Manzoni’s bedroom and inside a description of the room entitled Camera Mortuaria

(Fig. 2.11). However, unlike the terror of the cold scientific mortuary in Camillo Boito's Gothic novella ‘Un Corpo’, written three years earlier, here the reader was presented with a sentimentalized alternative, the ‘sacro fuoco del poeta’ as a harmonization of religious faith with the ‘cura della famiglia’.⁵⁹ Candelabra placed next to the ‘sacro fuoco’ light the room to transfigure the bed where he sleeps into the new meeting place of heaven and earth, the place where each individual dreams. His iron bed is painted red, contrasting with the body draped in an ordinary white bedcover. A cross rests upon his chest, complementing the crucifix hanging above and the paintings of the holy family. The scene is a mirror of Manzoni’s religious interior which inspires Italians with veneration.⁶⁰ On the other side of the artist’s canvas the descriptive account of the ‘mortuary room’ provides details of his private tastes: a painting positioned high up of his dear friend Luigi Rossari with whom he would walk down Via Morone, a blue and white covered couch and his favourite chair – a traditional upholstered leather chair – out of view. The description of the mortuary room ends with a mirror that sits upon a cabinet to become a perfect reflection of Manzoni’s inner psyche.

And yet the bedroom is simultaneously the ‘sacro fuoco’ and the mortuary room and so is both a modern secular shrine to Saint Manzoni and an anatomical dissection of the religious crypt, democratized by the universal image of a man asleep. The final image of an Effigie di Alessandro Manzoni copiata pochi momenti dopo la sua morte shows his sunken eyes which are described as being composed in a ‘serena requie’ that is preserved by the reproduced image

⁵⁹ 'La camera mortuaria', L'Emporio Pittoresco, 1-7 June 1873, p. 254.
⁶⁰ ibid., p. 254.
Fig. 2.11
‘Camera in cui spiro Alessandro Manzoni’,
Fig. 2.12

Fig. 2.13
This simple illuminated ‘sacro fuoco’ of a bed is the antithesis to the ostentatious crypt of San Carlo Borromeo made in silver and crystal, and upon his chest is a diamond studded cross, a gift from Empress Maria Teresa of Austria (Fig. 2.13). He wears a silver mask modelled on a wax cast of his face taken, like the universally available image of Manzoni’s effigy, only moments after his death. Observing Manzoni’s dying moments are a couple, a servant and an elderly man who is just about to enter, but they are all unnamed. Their being unnamed makes this a truly democratic image where the audience may fantasize that they were present.

The ‘necrologia’ completes the portrait of Saint Manzoni, the Romantic poet-prophet. His life is described as a virtuous poem characterized by continual abnegation, love and sacrifice, and as his soul moves to heaven his death ‘commuove gli animi di tutti che amano la patria e ne desiderano la gloria’.

Beginning with his birth in 1785 to Pietro Manzoni and Giulia Beccaria, Manzoni’s family history is used to construct a genealogy of a secular saint. Consequently the obituary not only omits his conversion to Catholicism in 1810, but the many moral blemishes on his family name: for example the speculation that Alessandro was the love-child of his mother’s affair with Giovanni Verri, the fact that his father legally separated from his mother in 1792, and that she became the lover of Parini’s protégé, Carlo Imbonati. Instead attention is focused upon his

---

61 ibid., p.254.
mother's surname, Beccaria, and her father, Cesare Beccaria (1738-1794), whose
treatise *Dei delitti e delle pene* was seen as a proto-Liberal work, since it argued
that punishment of criminals should be assessed in terms of the degree to which
society was harmed by their acts. In Paris the name 'Beccaria' aids Manzoni in his
acquaintance with the *idéologues* of the French Liberal school, one of whose
founders was Destutt de Tracy (1754-1836):

> Nel 1805, si recò con la madre, figlia del celebre autore de’ *Delitti e delle pene*, a Parigi dove il nome di questo distinto filantropo era salito in si gran fama che il giovane di lui nipote ebbe la migliore accoglienza da quella famosa società d’ideologi, che allora riunivasi ad Auteuil, e che contava fra i suoi membri Volney, Garat, De Tracy e Fauriel.65

If his liberal values are the moral fibre of his character, his creativity is inspired by
romantic love. First, it is only after his marriage in 1808 that his literary output
begins with the mythological poem *Urania*, even though he had already written the
*Sermoni* (1804) and *In morte di Carlo Imbonati* (1805).66 Second the poet’s
inspiration is love of the *patria* and his desire for independence which is expressed
in verses that enflame the soul of every Italian soldier in battle. Finally his poems,
like that of his predecessor Dante, are inspired by the love of God. Moreover, the
sacred qualities of Manzoni’s genius can be measured to the extent that when a
non-believer utters his words, it renders them a hypocrite.67

65 ibid., p. 254.
66 ibid., p. 254.
67 ibid., p. 254.
The notion of Manzoni as the poet-prophet is fundamental to his construction as a saint since it is through the prophetic qualities of his literary work that he both performed his miracles in the past – Italy was unified – and in the future from beyond the grave as the nation’s ‘imaginary companion’. To construct the illusion that Manzoni’s works are prophetic the funeral is performed around his most famous novel *I promessi sposi*. Set in sixteenth-century Lombardy, the novel, as is well known, concerns two ‘umili’, Renzo and Lucia, whose marriage is prevented by the historical reality of despots and ineffectual priests. According to Francesco De Sanctis, their eventual betrothal, which is symbolic of a moral Christian universe, reflects Manzoni’s belief that Providence will ultimately emerge victorious.

The symbolism of the couple united by the holy sacrament of matrimony frames the funeral in two key ways. First, romantic love is inverted into a mourning public united in the unspoken language of *amore* for Manzoni and the *patria* – the city in muted silence, the romantic gesture of throwing flowers from balconies onto the coffin below, men doffing their hats and women weeping. Second, the funeral procession is an image of social cohesion that with the ever present ‘umili e laboriosi contadini’ from Manzoni’s farm in Brusuglio, mirrors *I promessi sposi*. However, in the nascent capitale morale the umili are modernized into the figure of the male worker – half the nave is occupied by various worker’s associations –

---

68 The term ‘imaginary companion’ is coined by Peter Brown in *The Cult of Saints* to encapsulate the belief in the Saint as an imaginary friend and protector from beyond the grave, pp. 50-68.
while the mother is assigned the patriotic role of keeping Manzoni's memory alive to the next generation.71

The poet Prudentius (348-405) observed that in the Latin cult of saints, processions to shrines presented images of 'one body' by binding strangers and locals together: 'the love of their religion masses Latins and strangers together in one body'.72 In a similar way the procession of Manzoni's funeral reflects the way in which the poet's death becomes a way in which the different strata of Italian society could bind together into 'one body' of Italy at the shrine of their new 'saint'. The ceremonial procession the coffin took from the chapel of rest to the cathedral, for example, was led by Prince Umberto and other members of the royal family; behind the hearse Manzoni's family were accompanied by the mayor and councillors of Milan, and followed by representatives from almost every Italian city.73

The different stages of the funeral procession – the formal cortège to the cathedral, the carnivalesque procession to the Cimitero Monumentale – are commemorated in L'Emporio Pittoresco (Fig. 2.14). The poet's 'sacro fuoco' of the bedroom is translated into the public mortuary chapel where the ending of his mortal life is denoted by his dead body dressed in black, laid bare on a white sheet. The walls are covered in black against the flowers on the floor to convey the opposing forces of 'la vita e la morte'.74 An aura is maintained around the body by the dimly lit

71 'I funerali di Alessandro Manzoni', L'Emporio Pittoresco, 8-14 June 1873, p. 269.
73 'Funerali di Alessandro Manzoni', La Perseveranza, p. 1.
74 'I Funerali di Alessandro Manzoni', L'Emporio Pittoresco, p. 269.
Fig. 2.14
room full of candelabra as the crowd file pass in their ‘dovere sacro’, distanced from their object by the Guardia Nazionale and public health officers who maintain a boundary between Manzoni’s corpse and the public body. After the religious ceremony, the order of the formal cortège is relinquished for a collective funeral procession towards the Cimitero Monumentale, which was two kilometres in length. Freed from everyday borders and boundaries the carnival of the procession binds two seemingly incommensurable rituals – Catholic funeral rites and a lay burial – together represented by the cathedral of Christian burial and the lay Cimitero Monumentale being placed in unison on the horizon.

As the iconography of the corpse begins to build the ‘one body’ of the patria, the soul of Saint Manzoni makes its viaticum towards the patria celeste as both an upward movement to heaven symbolized by the cathedral space and a horizontal movement at the Cimitero Monumentale. In the cathedral, the soul’s upward movement is depicted as the ascent of Mount Purgatory by the coffin being placed on a three-tiered pyramidal catafalque, an ensemble which rose to a height of seven metres. In the public space of the cemetery a low platform replaces the towering catafalque as an inclusive horizontal movement. Around the coffin is a theatre of banners, flags, cavalry, and costumes that embody the carnival and national pageantry.

At the centre of the sacred Christian aura is the sacrament of the Eucharist, where the saint’s relics, coupled with their imaginary presence at a shrine, embody

75 ibid., p. 269
Christ’s promise of resurrection. The presence of Manzoni’s corpse secularizes the Christian aura in two ways. First, Paolo Gorini, the internationally acclaimed cremationist, embalms Manzoni’s body. Therefore, unlike the Word of the archaic father, which rests upon the corpse mouldering in the earth, the civic secular body will remain eternally preserved through scientific advancement. Second, the name ‘Alessandro Manzoni’ constitutes a patriotic logos. His canonization as a ‘national saint’ is derived from his being considered the father of the modern Italian novel and reformer of the language of united Italy, who ‘rinsed’ out the residues of Milanese in his Italian and turned it into modern Tuscan.

This restructuring of the aura commences at the Catholic funeral rites at the cathedral. The service is an example of Lefebvre’s conception of the absolute experience of the cathedral: smells of incense, the organ merging with the voices of the chorus who sing the Passio – the Eucharist prayer of Christ’s death and resurrection – echo to the cathedral doors. And yet it is not quite the absolute experience of cathedral space, because the Christian Word is used only as an acoustic instrument to arouse emotions. What Manzoni’s life meant and how the citizen is to interpret it is discovered outside the cathedral doors in the city of Milan itself. Outside the cathedral a long black silk drape with the simple words Ad Alessandro Manzoni written in white is hung from the cathedral’s public façade, while inside the banner carrying the city’s coat of arms hangs from the centre of the Duomo’s cupola, symbolizing Milan’s provenance over the interpretation of Manzoni’s viaticum.77

77 ibid., p. 1
The symbolic ‘one body’, that of the corpse of Saint Manzoni, is then interpreted through its spatial movement across Milan’s urban history followed by the living historical reality of the procession that was over 2 km in length (Fig. 2.15). The route (shown on the map) from the cathedral starts from Corso Vittorio Emanuele and then turns into Corso del Monte Napoleone. The procession then moves down the road marked as Via dei Giardini Pubblici, renamed Via Alessandro Manzoni to commemorate his death. Its green spaces mirror the gardens of rest at the Cimitero Monumentale, giving Manzoni an imaginary presence within the city’s walls while the coffin moves into the streets that denote Milan’s medieval heritage – Via S. Giuseppe, Via dell’Orso – towards the Castello Sforzesco and the edge of the historical city. The procession then veers up towards the new working-class district of Corso di Porta Garibaldi before it arrives at the cemetery. The sight of the coffin evoked diverse emotional reactions which separated the Liberal potenti from the modern umili of the working classes, as it was reported that a sense of melancholy and muted reverence pervaded the wealthy noble historical centre in contrast to the working-class areas around Porta Garibaldi, where an admiration for the coffin was derived from curiosity as much as piety, a view that implied the inhabitants’ ignorance:

Era singolare il notare gli effetti diversi, secondo i diversi quartieri della città che si percorrevano: al senso di un melanconico e muto ossequio, di un profondo e sentito compianto nelle vie più nobili e centrali della città, teneva dietro, in quelle abitate dal popolo, com’è appunto il Corso di Porta Garibaldi, un’ammirazione non meno curiosa, che pia.78

---

78 ibid., p. 1.
Fig. 2.15
A map of Milan adapted by the author. From Ignazio Cantù, *Milano e i suoi corpi santi colle notizie più utili al viaggiatore* (Milan: Vallardi, 1870), (pullout).
From the closed space of the cathedral, the corpse of Alessandro Manzoni travels across the urban spaces to find its ultimate interpretation at the resting place of the Cimitero Monumentale. At this public space a lay speech interprets the name ‘Alessandro Manzoni’, as the site where the absolute experience of life and death in the city may be experienced. Four speeches are made upon the stage around the one body of Alessandro Manzoni and bind the diverse strata of his life into a geography of the patriotic logos. The body of the first speaker, Belinzaghi, the mayor of Milan, symbolizes the civic birth of the logos, Milan. The geographical counterpart of Belinzaghi is embodied in the final speaker, Ignazio Campi, who represents the municipality of Rome. Several months earlier, Manzoni had accepted the citizenship of Rome to add his support to its annexation. Although Manzoni was a devout Catholic he was disillusioned with Vatican politics since Pius IX’s apparent defection from the Liberal cause in 1848. Between these two poles is Giulio Carcano from the Institute who bestows on the logos Manzoni’s literary genius, and Achille Mauro from the Senate, of which Manzoni was a member, who confers the international boundaries upon the logos from the national capital.

Belinzaghi’s speech indicates how Manzoni’s death made a considerable contribution to the birth of the myth of Milan as ‘capitale morale’. The speech opens with the emotional power of the names ‘Alessandro Manzoni’ and ‘Cesare Beccaria’ which arouse envy across Europe and excite religious reverence amongst Italians: ‘Alessandro Manzoni! Dinanzi al suo nome, che dall’Europa ci

---

era invidiato come quello del suo grand’avo Cesare Beccaria, noi ci inchinavamo religiosamente commossi.\textsuperscript{80} Manzoni’s name is held in religious reverence because he is an exemplum of a life which was balanced in perfect harmony between the patria and the family, and between a concern for the poor and the exiled prisoner of Saint Helena (Napoleon) – Manzoni wrote the ode \textit{Il Cinque Maggio} to Napoleon upon his death on 5 May 1821. The mayor concludes that Manzoni’s soul will radiate its light not only upon Italy and the King, but also on his Milan: ‘prega per l’Italia, pel Re, per la tua Milano, per noi tutti irradiati dalla luce del tuo genio, ispirati dalla tua grande anima’\textsuperscript{81}

Carcano connects the Romantic conception of the poet who by his or her nature is exiled on earth to Manzoni’s literary work, so that like the saint as an imaginary companion whose work continues in death he lives twice.\textsuperscript{82} In life the ‘divina luce del genio’ of Manzoni, characterized by \textit{Scienza} and \textit{Verità}, enabled him to develop a ‘culto della patria’ dedicated to cleansing Italian literature from ‘l’età grave e l’antica consuetudine’.\textsuperscript{83} Moreover in death Manzoni continues his work, for Carcano, since his soul breathes through his written words, guiding the nation from beyond the grave like an archaic father: ‘Ma la sua grande anima respira nelle sue pagine, e guiderà, come quella di un padre, la nazione. L’esule immortale sarà la sua gloria più pura’.\textsuperscript{84}

\textsuperscript{81} ibid., p. 1.
\textsuperscript{83} ‘Funerali di Alessandro Manzoni’, \textit{La Perseveranza}, p. 2.
\textsuperscript{84} ibid., p. 2.
Mauro uses the morality that characterizes Manzoni’s literary works to respond to the Roman Question. De Sanctis describes the realism of *Ipromessi sposi* as reflecting the ‘mondo religioso e morale del poeta, sopra l’uomo mondano, quale lo ha fatto la storia’. In Mauro’s speech this ideal moral and religious world is translated into Manzoni’s patriotic ideals, which are opposed by the earthly realm of the Vatican; the audience can therefore infer that the Vatican seeks to pervert Italian patriotism in a similar fashion to the perversion of the matrimonial ideal in *Ipromessi sposi* through the historical reality of ineffectual priests and local despots. Manzoni’s work is viewed by Mauro as a sort of sacred shrine and a place of pilgrimage where the reader is brought into contact with ‘tutti gli atti dell’immacolata sua vita, [...] fecondati dal santo amore degli uomini e di Dio’. In contrast to the sacred body of the text, the temporal power of the Popes in the Vatican has ‘afflitta e deformata la Chiesa di Cristo’. Manzoni’s support for Rome’s annexation — as an Italian and as a Catholic — is used to imply that it is only under the temporal power of Liberal Italy that the Vatican will be restored: in 1862 Manzoni wrote that ‘in the early centuries the Church did not possess lands, and those were the days of its supreme grandeur’. In the concluding speech Ciampi describes the tomb of Manzoni as a sacred space that will sow the seeds of a new pact of civil concord.

Manzoni’s name was finally sealed in civic law by a notice read out by the secretary of the *comune*, which accepted the poet’s body into the cemetery. Prince Umberto then escorted the coffin into the catacombs where Manzoni would rest.

---

85 De Sanctis, I, 92.
87 ibid., p. 2.
88 Quoted in Colquhoun, p. 249.
the location evoking the saintly world of early Latin Christianity. The corpse's complete exposure in the mortuary constitutes the prying open of the sacred space of the dead occupied by the Catholic cult of saints. Similarly the corpse's journey towards its new enclosure in a secular catacomb represents a new civic viaticum as the darkness of this new walled shell is the aura rekindled.
2.5 The Secular New Healers

Il Gulz, che non avevo veduto, s’avanzò allora con passo grave, e, mettendosi a lato del cadavere: “Dove per voi tutto finisce, per noi” disse “tutto principia. La morte è la vita”.

Camillo Boito, ‘Un Corpo’, 1870

The novella ‘Un Corpo’ is from the Scapigliatura school – the Milanese Gothic literary movement – who were vociferous in expressing their anxieties towards the prevailing scientific climate which asserted its supremacy by providing rational explanations of the mysteries of human existence. In ‘Un Corpo’ Boito explores these anxieties through the rivalry between an artist and a pathologist over the beautiful Carlotta who embodies Nature. The neo-classical artist immortalizes her anatomical beauty on white canvas as the nymph Arethusa in her grassy riverbed while the scientist preserves her dead body’s ivory pallor upon the white marble autopsy slab using coloured liquid injected into her flesh. The climax is signalled by Carlotta’s disappearance and the artist’s discovery of her dead body at the laboratory of his rival – Professor Gulz. On seeing her corpse the artist wants to kiss her, but her lifelessness repels him, in contrast to Gulz who now desires her a thousand times more since in dissecting her dead body he may prise open even further the book of Nature.

As the epigraph illustrates above, this is a tale of necrophilia. But it is one that moves beyond the boundaries of a simple Gothic novella to a critique of

90 ibid., pp. 66-69.
contemporary society articulated through its dialectical narrative structure, which renders each character and his discipline a mirror of the other’s. First, the artist rediscovers his subject in the embalmed bodies displayed in the scientist’s laboratory – for example the artist recognizes the preserved head of an elderly man sitting upon a shelf, and he remarks that it equalled a portrait executed of him by a peer.91 Second, the scientist’s mummification of Nature – the embalming of bodies – is viewed as being as misguided in its search for knowledge as the timeless models of classical myths, the artist’s instruments for preserving the fleeting moments of the human psyche.

For Boito society has turned its gaze towards death where the body’s immortalized image upon a canvas and its embalmment in a vase meet at the horizon of un corpo laid out upon a white marble mortuary slab. And upon this new horizon of the dead body, one synthesis would be the cremation of a corpse since its natural decay in the earth would contaminate Nature’s perfect body. The debate over the legislation of human cremation dominated the scientific landscape of Lombardy at the time ‘Un Corpo’ was written. Papers on cremation started appearing in 1866 and its use ‘in the name of public health and of civilization’ was first proposed at the 1869 International Medical Congress in Florence.92 The cremationists described themselves as philanthropists, lovers of man, and in their roles as doctors, pathologists and scientists they possessed a new ‘clean’ power to heal the sick body, set against the ‘unclean’ healing powers of saints like San Borromeo and San Rocco: the latter had a Milanese foppone named after him, associating the

---

91 ibid., p. 67.
Catholic saint with ‘unclean’ burial. The philanthropists’ use of ‘clean power’ rendered them what I will call the ‘new healers’, who differed from the Catholic ‘old healers’ by moving beyond the pestilent individual to the healing of the ‘one body’ of the living city, protecting it from the ‘unclean’ corpse by the promotion of cremation.\(^{93}\) It is the desire of the ‘new healers’ to exorcise the ‘unclean’ power of the Catholic Church that I intend to examine within the context of Albert Keller’s cremation, considered the first civic cremation in the Western world.

It seems rather extraordinary that Italy, a Catholic country, was at the international forefront of the promotion of cremation – Henry Thompson, founder of the Cremation Society of England, stated that ‘the proposal to adopt cremation in recent times proceeded mainly from Italy’.\(^{94}\) Catholic anti-cremationists such as Antonio Rota writing in 1882 describe cremation as arriving ‘dopo la fatale breccia di Porta Pia’, noting that Gorini published *Sulla purificazione dei morti per mezzo del fuoco* on 20 September 1876 to coincide with the ‘infausto’ anniversary of Rome’s annexation.\(^{95}\) However, in the minds of Liberal patriots cremation went hand in hand with displacing the ‘Civiltà Cattolica’ that threatened the Italian state.\(^{96}\) At the core of the ‘Civiltà Cattolica’ was the tradition of the Saint’s relics. One of the principal roles of relics was to address what Brown defines as that ‘once-neglected body’ of our instinctive fears of death and our yearnings for

\(^{93}\) The idea of ‘clean’ and ‘unclean’ power is adapted from Brown’s terminology for the ‘clean’ power of the martyrs in contrast to the ‘unclean’ persecutory power of Roman pagan power. See Brown, *The Cult of the Saints*, pp. 103-5.
These fears of death are expressed most eloquently by Saint Augustine as our ‘deepest human feeling’:

I know you want to keep on living. You do not want to die. And you want to pass from this life to another in such a way that you will not rise again as a dead man, but fully alive and transformed. This is what you desire. This is the deepest human feeling; mysteriously, the soul itself wishes it and instinctively desires it.\(^{98}\)

The positivistic scientific reasoning of the cremationists denied a voice to these instinctive fears and encouraged the public to have a more vigilant attitude towards the dead body, as the locus of a set of degenerate emotions it required incineration. The suppression of these primary instincts is apparent when Paolo Gorini – the world-acclaimed ‘new healer’ who embalmed Manzoni and Mazzini – describes criticisms made at Keller’s cremation as being formulated by those who ‘guardavano le cose cogli occhiali della passione’, which rendered them unable to see things as they were, but able to see them only as they had wished them to be.\(^{99}\)

As the first cremation Keller’s was the model of the tenets of the ‘new healers’. He believed that citizens had a moral obligation to repay the city that had given them life. For Keller, an industrialist in the silk cocoon industry, this civic obligation was exercised by bequeathing the generous sum of 10,000 lire upon his death to pay for his cremation and the construction of a ‘tempietto’ in the Cimitero Monumentale. If he sought to transform cremation into a civic obligation, his

\(^{97}\) ibid., p. 77.
\(^{98}\) The quotation from St Augustine is in Brown, p. 77.
Protestant faith and the odd insistence that he was of Zurich citizenship, even though he was born in Rome in 1800, moved to Milan in 1820 and remained there until his death, distanced the *comune* from public concern surrounding his cremation. According to Gorini, who had met Keller on several occasions to discuss his funeral, the manner in which Keller conducted his business – he always paid his debts punctually – reflected his view of cremation as the repayment of a debt to Nature, since it circumvented the body’s decay in the earth:

Il signore Keller […] fu sempre in tutta la sua vita puntualissimo pagatore, sapendo d’avere un débito verso la natura da soddisfarsi dopo la morte […] e gli pareva indecoroso attendere che la natura ve lo costringesse mediante la pressione dei vermi e della putredine.100

Keller died on 22 January 1874, before the legislation for his cremation was passed. However, in Keller’s meticulous detailing of his funeral he had anticipated this eventuality leaving instructions for his body’s embalmment, carried out by Professor Polli and supervised by Luigi Bono, the minister of health for the *comune*. The embalmment procedure involved injecting the corpse with a solution of phenol acid, arsenic, industrial glycerine and sodium acetate, diluted in water. The chemical composition was so successful that it prevented any putrefaction occurring in the body, but within three months the body was totally deformed and unrecognisable. This deformation of the corpse emphasizes that in Keller’s cremation the body’s visual appearance was irrelevant, what was of prime

---

100 ibid., p. 80.
importance was that the corpse did not slowly dissolve into the earth as with burial.\textsuperscript{101}

Permission for Keller's cremation was finally granted in July 1875 and construction of a crematorium designed by Clericetti and Maciacchini began immediately so that the cremation could coincide with the second anniversary of his death on 22 January 1876. Unlike Manzoni's death and saintly resurrection, symbolized by his embalmed body, the cremation of Keller's body destroys the instinctive wants of resurrection to which Augustine refers, since the locus of that want, the resurrected corpse, is literally incinerated. Moreover, the emergence of a new rational set of scientific and bureaucratic discursive practices – embalmment, hygiene regulations, the technology of incineration – replaced the instinctive fears of dying that the Catholic corpse sought to address, with anxieties over being contaminated by the death and decay emanating from the Catholic burial itself.

Norbert Fischer has described the crematorium as an architectural hybrid which is designed to conceal the ultramodern scientific components utilized to dispose of the dead:

\begin{quote}
Crematorium architecture clearly shows the hybrid position between mourning and technology that had emerged from social conflicts about this new technology for disposing of the dead, which was seen as ultra modern.\textsuperscript{102}
\end{quote}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{101} ibid., pp. 88-90.
\textsuperscript{102} Norbert Fischer, 'The modernist Necropolis: The cultural history of urban cemeteries in modernism', \textit{Werk Bauen + Wohnen}, 10 (2000), 70-72 (p. 71).
\end{flushright}
Fischer notes that hybridity may be manifest in furnaces hidden in the basement and a strict separation between the chapel and technological areas. In the Milanese crematorium its hybridity is expressed in its spatial location, since the comune specified that it should be built on the periphery, but strategically on its central axis – directly opposite the Famedio – with the gas meters and chimneys placed outside the cemetery altogether. Extending Fischer’s observations on architectural hybridity to the notion that it constitutes the concealment of the ‘neglected body’ of our instinctive fears of dying, I am going to examine Keller’s cremation as a hybrid experience in that I shall explore it both from a public perspective and as a scientific occult practice.

The crematorium’s design is depicted in daily use in *L'Illustrazione Italiana* as an isolated ancient Roman temple where the contemporary figures seem rather out of place. In its appearance as an archaeological monument, connoted by its neo-classical style, it is elevated beyond the normal time and place of the cemetery (Fig. 2.16). Replacing the incense of Catholic funeral rites, the wafts of smoke, which drift out of the chimney, naturalize the fantasy of Roman burial rites occurring inside. The archaeological excursion continues in the choice of building material, Veronese sandstone, which unlike marble weathers quickly in an industrial climate. This weathered exterior contrasts with the immaculate interior of highly polished marble floors of warm ochre. Mongeri described its external appearance as a well proportioned ‘avello romano’ and such references transform the inscription on the architrave into an epitaph – TEMPIO CREMATORIO PER VOLONTÀ DEL NOBILE ALBERTO KELLER ERETTO E DONATO ALLA CITTÀ DI

---

Fig. 2.16
'La prima cremazione', *L'illustrazione Italiana*, 14-30 January 1876, p. 212.

Fig. 2.17
'La prima cremazione', *L'illustrazione Italiana*, 14-30 January 1876, p. 212.
MILANO. In the ancient world cremation benefited both the invisible psyche and the visible body. At the end of man’s corporeal existence, the burnt corpse ensured the complete liberation of the psyche from the body, and also guaranteed that the psyche would not wander restlessly amongst the living, haunting the visible world. The crematorium is Keller’s public ‘avello’ and the visible patriotic image of his psyche that lives on in the monument’s function, which was inaugurated with his own cremation. In contrast, Keller’s private Neo-Gothic tomb, in its antipodal position at the entrance of the Protestant cemetery, reveals how his religious faith was of secondary importance to his primary love of civic duty.

At 2 pm on the 22 January the funeral carriage containing Keller’s embalmed remains made its way up the central aisle of the cemetery towards the ‘Tempio Crematorio’ preceded by a Protestant minister, the deceased’s family and friends. At the crematorium several hundred people from ‘tutte le classi della cittadinanza e non mancavano le signore’ watched the coffin being placed into a stone cremation urn that resembled an ancient sarcophagus.

The image of the cremation in L’Illustrazione Italiana is misleading since it gives the impression that crowds of people were gathered in a portico, which in fact only had a circumference of 6 metres (Fig. 2.17). In spite of this poetic licence, it depicts a funeral ceremony devoid of the emotional outbursts that characterized

104 ibid., p. 1.
Manzoni’s: the majority of mourners are men who do not doff their hats to show respect, and the women do not scatter flowers upon the coffin.

The ‘opera del fuoco’, as it was described in La Lombardia, began at 2.20 and finished at 3.50. During this waiting period a Protestant Minister conducted a funeral service in French. The ceremony closed with the announcement that the cremation had been successfully completed. The cost of Keller’s cremation was 84 Lire, but cremations would decrease in price as they became more frequent. The following day Keller’s ashes, weighing 2.919 kilograms, were collected and placed in a funeral urn and taken to the Keller family chapel.

The Italian Liberal Press praised Keller’s cremation as the first in the west, interpreting it as a sign of the nation’s modernity. L’Illustrazione Italiana discounted the two recent cremations – a woman cremated in Dresden in a Siemens furnace and a man in Breslaw in a Reslan furnace – as merely experiments, whereas Keller’s cremation had been performed as a funeral in a public cemetery, in a building whose function was specifically for the cremation of human bodies, and therefore conferred the same funeral rites and moral status as burial:

Ma ad ogni modo vi è gran differenza fra questi tentativi ed esperimenti, e l’aver un edificio di cremazione in un cimitero pubblico; avere cioè alla cremazione gli stessi diritti e la stessa posizione ufficiale del sotterramento.

---

107 ibid.,
108 ibid.,
109 Ghiron, p. 51.
From this public image of cremation, I shall now turn to the application of science in the new burial rite which transfigures cremation into a modern miracle through its adoption of a magician’s act. The illusion begins with the cremation urn itself. The Polli-Clericetti system set a precedent in using the cremation urn as the chamber of the corpse’s incineration. Its exterior appearance as an ancient sarcophagus concealed the internal equipment for the distribution of gas and air and specialist lining to refract the heat, while the external material of limestone was chosen so that it would resist the cold. The arrangement of gas and air pipes was crucial in ensuring that the inorganic matter – the sacred ash of the deceased loved one – would not be contaminated with organic carbonized residues and other unwanted by-products which could be expelled through the chimney. In this composite marriage of an ancient burial rite and scientific advancement a death cycle is set in motion by the act of returning organic matter to dust. The magician’s conjuring trick begins – ‘now you see it’ – and the corpse is placed into an ancient sarcophagus – ‘now you don’t’ – as it returns from the furnace and all that remains are the ashes of human life at the completion of the ‘opera del fuoco’.

On the plan of the crematorium (published in 1882) I have shown the position of Keller’s cremation urn in the portico (A) – the beginning of the trick – from where it is moved to the furnace (F) where the conjuring of scientific spells takes place (Fig. 2.18). To add to the illusion of magic, the urn’s movement to the furnace alludes to a vanishing trick because its positioning in the portico is directly opposite the furnace: this spatial arrangement transforms the external portico into a mirror of the internal furnace, which in the performance is screened from public view. Ideologically the movement of the body from a visible – ‘now you see it’ –
Fig. 2.18

Plan of the crematorium, adapted by the author to show the cremation urn of Albert Keller.
From Gaetano Pini, *La Crémation en Italie et à l'étranger, de 1774 jusqu'à nos jours* (Milan: Hoepli, 1885), p. 36.
to an invisible – ‘now you don’t’ – space in the furnace confers the status of a
creative power at work upon the act of cremation, since the corpse is inverted back
to its original composition, that of the dust of which Adam was composed. The
mystery of cremation is testified by Mongeri, who describes the furnace as holding
the ‘misteri dell’arca crematoria’ that are beyond his comprehension.\footnote{Mongeri, ‘La cremazione d’ieri’, \textit{La Perseveranza}, p. 1.} This
process is naturalized by the corpse lying in a horizontal position in the cremation
urn, which Gorini states had a special significance because it is man’s natural
resting position, unlike a vertical position which would show little reverence and
be considered almost sacrilegious, presumably because it would symbolize the
verticality of Christ’s death upon the cross and his Ascension.\footnote{Gorini, p. 91.}

Keller was incinerated in two stages. The first stage sought to consume Keller’s
flesh – defined as all the parts of the human body that contain moisture – and so
required a sufficient quantity of air to ignite the fire and maintain the spontaneous
combustion of gas around the moist tissue. The second stage promoted the
calcination of the carbonized residues by injecting large quantities of air to
encourage oxidation.\footnote{Gaetano Pini, \textit{La Cremation en Italie et à l’étranger, de 1774 jusqu’à nos jours} (Milan: Hoepli,
1885), p. 138.} During the cremation a total of 285 gas flames were lit in
the incineration chamber: 180 towards the rear of the urn, 100 on the sides of the
urn and 5 large flames of heat on the head, thorax and sides of the body itself.\footnote{Gorini, p. 91.}

During the cremation the trick went wrong. First spectators standing in the
cemetery grounds complained of the smell of animal odours. Polli and Clericetti
had developed their technology through incinerating animals: on 18 July 1874 nine
small dogs were burnt weighing 49.5 kilos, on 18 August a sheep weighing 50 kilos was burnt in three hours producing 2.65 kilos of ash, and several days prior to the cremation an entire horse was successfully burnt. They had based their technology on the scientific assumption that human flesh is of an identical organic structure to other animals, whereas perhaps what was the most disturbing thought was that human flesh smelt and burnt differently from horses, dogs and sheep, as Saint Paul had made clear in his discussion on the resurrected body in the Corinthians: ‘all flesh is not the same: men have one kind of flesh, animals have another, birds have another and fish another’. Second, as if to confirm St Paul, the following day when the oven door opened, the inspectors discovered that in spite of the intensity of the heat the heart had only been superficially carbonized, although the majority of the bones had been incinerated. Finally a neat separation of the pure inorganic matter – the ashes – from the organic carbonized residues had not occurred, organic and inorganic had become mixed up in the grates and even worse, ash had flown out of the chimney and into the atmosphere. The report concluded that these errors lowered the prestige of cremation, whose aim was to collect the inorganic remains of the body and conserve them as a dear memory of the deceased.

After several more attempts using the Polli-Clericetti system it was finally abandoned and in 1878 Gorini’s wood-based Lodigiano system – named after his native city of Lodi – was purchased. To complement the Gorini furnace, Joseph Venini began experimenting with a gas furnace designed for the industrial

---

115 ibid., pp. 91-94.
116 1 Corinthians, 15. 39.
incineration of diseased pestilent bodies or bodies from another city or country. In 1882 it was replaced with another Gorini furnace, but was still ‘destiné à brûler les cadavres provenant de dehors, et les corps de ceux qui succombent à des maladies contagieuses’. \(^{118}\)

The arrangement of the two furnaces — one for cremating the Milanese corpse, the other for diseased or foreign bodies — rather than being an example of Fischer’s architectural hybridity, constitutes a form of psychical hybridity in which anxieties over dying are projected onto the separation between clean and contagious bodies (Fig. 2.18). The location of the furnaces, at the building’s epicentre, renders them the ‘prime mover’ in the crematorium, orchestrating the psychological purification of Brown’s ‘neglected body’ — our instinctive fears of death. On one side of the furnace the ‘chambre de crémation’ (B) masks the furnaces with its two neo-classical marble doors. On the other side the ‘chambre pour les parents’ (C) displays a collection of ancient and modern urns, residues of combustions carried out using different procedures and drawings of cremation equipment. It is designed as a museum of cremation, and is where the family of the deceased remain during the cremation. At the rear of the furnace — the furthest point from the fantasy of the resurrection of ancient burial — is the mortuary room (D) where the corpses are dressed in funeral gowns and placed on Roman-styled chariots and then wheeled into the furnace (Fig. 2.19). In 1882 the comune developed the mortuary room into a pathology laboratory to determine the cause of death prior to cremating the body under the proviso that if any important anthropological or anatomical discoveries were made, the corpse would be displayed at the civic museum or in a hospital.

\(^{118}\) Pini, p. 18.
Fig. 2.19

Fig. 2.20
To coincide with the introduction of pathology the front of the building introduced more fantasy elements. First, two cineraria (E) were added ‘pour démontrer la haute importance que Milan tout entier attachait à la réforme en question’. Second, the portico’s columns were adapted to hold opaque glass, which created an intimate space where fantasies of a Roman temple decorated with urns were bound together with a sacred Christian space for funeral services (Fig. 2.20).

The furnace, the ‘prime mover’ of the crematorium, incinerates the Catholic viaticum – the body’s natural disintegration in the earth – while the mortuary with its embalmed jars and autopsy slabs represents the scientific reality of cremation as an act that evacuates human decay. Thus, one of the roles of the portico is to conceal this reality of cremation by staging a theatrical fantasy that ancient Roman burial rites are being resurrected. Inside the portico this fantasy extends onto the walls, which are covered in inscriptions dedicated to the ‘apostles’ of cremation, such as the one below written for Paolo Gorini by the poet Massarani. The epitaph is the liturgy of the ‘new healer’ where the furnace becomes a purifying altar – ‘ara purificatrice’ –, names and surnames have a virginal status – ‘il nome immacolato’ – and the cremationist is the philosopher of Nature. The ‘new healer’ now occupies the position of a secular Saint, whose religious unavailability confers an immaculate status upon him, enables him to guide the city’s psyche to a state of civic atonement.

---

119 ibid., pp. 26-27.
120 ibid., p. 18.
121 ibid., p. 33.
These immaculate words, which trace down the wall like a skeleton, are mirrored onto the highly polished marble floors. In the ancient world when an individual no longer saw his or her image in a mirror it was a sign of approaching death.\textsuperscript{122} In the crematorium’s illusion of the real, the building holds up a perfect mirror image of man – immaculate, untouched, and sexless – so that we never see ‘ourselves’ within it but an image to which we aspire, set against our physical presence in that real space. In this hybrid experience the individual is always on the verge of discovering what dying means, but never arrives at the blank white canvas of approaching death, preferring to steal reflections from the mirrored surfaces, unaware that in any viaticum back to Adam, who was made from the dust of the earth, all things die.

\textsuperscript{122} Rohde, \textit{Psyche}, pp. 46-47.
2.6 Letter to the Romans

Or don’t you know that all of us who were baptised into Christ Jesus were baptised into his death? We were therefore buried with him through baptism into death in order that just as Christ was raised from the dead through the glory of the father, we too may live a new life.

St Paul, Romans, 6. 3-4

In 1953 the periodical La Martinella di Milano published a series of articles on whether it was morally acceptable for Manzoni’s body to still be displayed in the Famedio. Manzoni’s interment at the Cimitero Monumentale had gone against his dying wishes that he be buried in the family sepulchre at Brusuglia with his mother, his first wife, and his grandfather Cesare Beccaria. The outcome of this debate was to move Manzoni’s body to its current resting position at the centre of the Famedio from its original location on its Northern wall with an exposed ceremonial central area, which in revealing the crypts and catacombs below, and the poet’s original resting place, spatialized his civic resurrection (Fig. 2.21 and Fig. 2.22).

The movement of Manzoni’s body from the catacombs to the Famedio constituted the latter’s inauguration ceremony. It took place on the tenth anniversary of Manzoni’s death – 22 May 1883. The date’s significance was intended to convey to the Milanese that the honours of the Famedio would only be bestowed upon

Fig. 2.21
The Famedio. From Ginex and Selvaolita, *Il Cimitero Monumentale di Milano* (see Fig. 2.20), p. 23.

Fig. 2.22
The Famedio. From Annoni, *Il Cimitero Monumentale di Milano* (see Fig. 2.19), p. 42.
citizens after the tenth anniversary of their death.\textsuperscript{124} The body of the Saint was presented as a myth of civic resurrection, with journalists – the new hagiographers – reporting that they glimpsed Manzoni’s embalmed face through the crystal coffin lid as it was lowered into a sarcophagus,\textsuperscript{125} and noted that his face was a ‘maschera bianca di gesso’ that preserved a soft and sweet expression.\textsuperscript{126} In St Paul’s letter to the Romans, he describes baptism as a journey where the catechumen must follow Christ’s viaticum, from his death, burial, to resurrection, so that he or she may be reborn into a new life. In the display of Manzoni’s sarcophagus surrounded by the names of deceased Milanese patriots, I intend to examine how this arrangement constitutes a patriotic love letter to be read by the Romantic pilgrim in their baptism into a poetic patriotic citizen.

After the decision in 1869 to convert the church into a Famedio, a committee was established to choose which citizens should be honoured in it.\textsuperscript{127} The \textit{comune} agreed a set of criteria to guide the selection of names and constitute the rules for composing the love letter. First, names were selected on whether the individual was born in Milan or had resided in the city for a number of years. Second, there was a preference for names associated with educating the population, either in moral acts, heroic acts fighting against tyranny, or daring acts of adventure.

\begin{flushleft}
Ricordò di preferenza i nomi a suo parere più meritevoli e più atti all’educazione del popolo, ispirandosi per periodo storico in particolare modo alla morale pubblica e alla ragione politica come erano comprese nei
\end{flushleft}

\textsuperscript{124} \textit{Relazione della Commissione Consiliare incaricata di riferire sul regolamento per gli onori del Famedio} (Milan: Pirola, 1883), pp. 4-5.
\textsuperscript{125} ‘La festa Manzoniana’, \textit{L’Illustrazione Italiana}, 27 May 1883, p. 326.
\textsuperscript{127} \textit{Relazione della Commissione Consiliare}, p. 3.
passati secoli, ai provanti oltraggi della tirannide, e alle grandi sventure consacrate da una secolare ammirazione.\textsuperscript{128}

Names were then divided into illustrious individuals who had achieved fame throughout the entire nation, and ‘benemeriti’ whom I shall refer to as ‘honourable citizens’ since they were honoured for their civic deeds:

\begin{quote}
Si considerano cittadini illustri quelli che per opere virtuose abbiano ottenuto alta e meritata fama presso l’intiera nazione. Si considerano cittadini benemeriti quelli che onorandi per virtù proprie, abbiano arrecato alla città cospicuo beneficio e decoro.\textsuperscript{129}
\end{quote}

In total 196 names were selected with the largest category being that of historians (21), rendering historiography the tabula upon which the civic love letter was arranged.\textsuperscript{130} The walls were divided into three areas and the names organized according to a legend. The highest area – zona superiore – contained the names of illustrious citizens from the foundations of the comune of Milan until 1750. The middle area – zona mediana – was allocated to illustrious and honourable citizens living from 1750 until 1850. Illustrious citizens are remembered with bas-relief effigies and honourable citizens with an epigraph. The lower area – zona inferiore – recalled those who died after 1850: busts commemorated illustrious citizens, epigraphs honourable citizens.\textsuperscript{131} In this arrangement the love letter has biblical characteristics where the zona superiore is a secular ‘Old Testament’ – pre-1750 – that prefigures the zona mediana of the awakening of the Risorgimento, and the

\textsuperscript{128} Giunta Municipale di Milano (N. 1836-114), Al R. Istituto Lombardo di scienze e lettere, alla R. Accademia di belle arti, al R. Conservatorio di musica e alle Biblioteche di Brera e Ambrosiana, 5 May 1885.
\textsuperscript{129} Relazione della Commissione Consigliare, p. 7
\textsuperscript{130} Elenco dei cittadini illustri e benemeriti da proporsi per l’onoranza del Famedio (Milan: Pirola, 1885), p. 135.
\textsuperscript{131} Relazione della Commissione Consigliare, p. 4.
zona inferiore of post-1850 as the era that marks Milan’s liberation from servitude.

It therefore implies that the catechumen should read backwards from the zona inferiore to the ‘Old Testament’, and therefore also from right to left, as an essentialized journey back to the Genesis of the letter.

The four arms of the Famedio are called Levante, Ponente, Tramontana, Mezzodi. The terms Levante – east – and Ponente – west – associate the Famedio with the Duomo where they denote the vertical direction of the nave from its public façade – the Ponente – to the apse at the other end – the Levante (Fig. 2.23). This axis is turned 90° to horizontalize it, and in so doing it verticalizes the transept so that it now occupies the position of the main entrance. The rotations also equalize the Latin Cross of the Duomo, thereby symbolizing the civic equality of the Famedio. The terms ‘settentrionale’ and ‘meridionale’, used for the transept in the Duomo, are replaced with Tramontana, evoking the Northern mountains, and Mezzodi, midday and the south. These names can be found on a sixteenth-century map of the Milan of Manzoni’s I promessi sposi which was republished in 1873 in the first volume of the Annali della fabbrica del Duomo di Milano (Fig. 2.24). Levante is the east of the city where the sun rises, Mezzogiorno is the south when the sun is at mid-day, Ponente does not appear as there is a missing fragment, and finally the north is the Astro, the northern sky lit up by stars. On the map, the cathedral is overshadowed by the symbol of temporal power, the star formation of the Castello Sforzesco. It conveys very efficaciously the Romantic notion of the medieval comune governed by the temporal rule of men but guided by the atemporal celestial heaven above. The rebirth of this civic arrangement is communicated in the Famedio by the terrestrial earth below in the catacombs and the celestial
Fig. 2.23

Fig. 2.25
Plan of S. Giovanni alle Fonti. From Brivio, *Guida del Duomo di Milano* (see Fig. 2.13), p. 59.
Fig. 2.24
heavens of the cupola. Heaven and earth and the past and present of Milan are bound together at the Famedio’s horizon, that of Manzoni’s body. Conversely, the body of Carlo Cattaneo, which joined Manzoni’s in 1884, is the sign of the city’s modern secular Liberal values. Before Manzoni’s, Cattaneo’s funeral in 1869 had carved out the modern boundaries of the city, with his body lying in state at the chapel at the Stazione Centrale and his funeral procession taking the direct, fast route to the Cimitero Monumentale along the new urban periphery (Fig. 2.15).132

At the centre of the Famedio is the octagonal cupola. In Lombard ecclesiastical architecture the octagonal cupola was used in the design of baptisteries until the Renaissance period. Its design originated in the baptistery of S. Giovanni alla fonte built by Ambrose in AD 378, where he baptized Augustine (Fig. 2.25). The font was located at the Duomo’s main entrance – the Ponente – where Alessandro Manzoni’s banner was displayed at his funeral. It was excavated in the late 1860s as a result of the Piazza del Duomo project and doubtlessly provoked interest in the cathedral’s origins. Carlo Maciacchini would have been aware of its significance and plan, not only due to his interest in medieval churches but because he had been taught at the Brera by Friedrich von Schmidt who had restored the Basilica of Sant’Ambrogio.133 For Ambrose, as St Paul, baptism meant the dying of the former self and the rebirth of the new individual through the body’s immersion in purified holy water. The layout of the font resembles the mausoleum to the Roman Emperor Maximilian dating from the early fourth century and conveys the dead Latin self. In contrast the rebirth of the new

133 Meeks, p. 207.
Christian body is communicated through the octagonal font and its association with the eighth day of Christ's resurrection.\textsuperscript{134}

In the Famedio the font is inverted up towards the cupola and downwards to the crypt and catacombs in the earth below. However, unlike Ambrose's baptism where the catechumen walks into the centre of the font, and experiences a momentary 'one-ness' with Christ, the Romantic pilgrim is denied this experience by never arriving at its centre, since it is a void onto the catacombs below (Fig. 2.22) On the one hand this arrangement creates a matter-less sacred space in the movement of air between the crypt and catacombs below and the celestial stars above. On the other hand by never arriving at a 'one-ness', the pilgrim is suspended between a terrestrial burial below and a celestial resurrection above, never quite living, never quite dying. And by never experiencing a 'oneness' the pilgrim will never know what it means not to be the 'one', and thereby understand the meaning of difference in a hierarchical context. John the Baptist articulates this point very clearly when he states that the Christian must acknowledge that they are not the chosen 'one', the Christ, through the analogy of the bride and the groom as the Holy sacrament between the son and the Father:

\textit{The bride belongs to the bridegroom. The friend who attends the bridegroom waits and listens for him, and is full of joy when he hears the bridegroom's voice. That joy is mine, and it is now complete. He must become greater; I must become lesser.}\textsuperscript{135}

\textsuperscript{134} Brivio, p. 58.
\textsuperscript{135} John, 3. 29-30.
However, here the pilgrim lacks the experience of a ‘oneness’, perhaps through a civic baptism, which would have enabled them to become lesser so that a monarch or a Manzoni could become greater. Instead, the pilgrim is left with an invitation to fill the void with a patriotic daydream of their own resurrection, their second life, by becoming even greater than their forefathers who are commemorated in the Famedio.

Manzoni’s sarcophagus was placed in the middle of the north-facing Tramontana wall which was reverentially assigned to ‘ospiti’ – ‘per atto di riverente deferenza assegnò agli ospiti il braccio di croce opposto all’ingresso maggiore, e ai cittadini Milanesi gli altri tre’. The arrangement of the names upon this wall constitutes Manzoni’s letter of love from beyond the grave composed of the names of ‘ospiti’ who had contributed to the city, and thereby confers a cosmopolitan status upon Milan that is comparable to Rome. To interpret the letter I shall refer to the *Elenco dei cittadini illustri e benemeriti da proporsi per l’onoranza del Famedio* (1885) which stipulates the individual achievements of each name.

Beginning with the ‘one body’ of Alessandro Manzoni and reading the wall from right to left, in the *zona inferiore* are the busts of Camillo Cavour, Carlo Farini, Giuseppe Garibaldi and Bettino Ricasoli. Moving up to the *zona mediana*, the side panel adjacent to the *Levante*, are scientific names – for example the astronomer and founder of the Brera Observatory Ruggiero Giuseppe Boscovich (Fig 26). These scientific names are juxtaposed with the outer panel adjacent to the *Ponente* which bears artistic names – for example the sculptor Luigi Manfredini.

---

Fig. 2.26
Side panel of zona mediana. Author’s photograph.

Fig. 2.27
Central panel of zona mediana. Author’s photograph.

Fig. 2.28
Zona superiore. Author’s photograph.
Maciacchini’s plan of the Famedio shows how the main wall of the *zona mediana* is divided into a triptych of two smaller side panels and one central panel (Fig. 2.23). Beginning with the side panels, the right panel is composed of architect’s names – for example Melchiorre Gioja – the left of names of historians – for example Antonio Muratori.

The middle panel differs pictorially from the side panels by reversing the patterning so that honourable names now form a cross (Fig. 2.27). On the lowest level are names connoting civic duty: for example the illustrious Giuseppe Prina who is remembered for his position as minister of finance in Milan when it was capital of Napoleon’s Kingdom of Italy. However, Prina’s presence in the Famedio is curious, as he was a figure of popular hatred in Milan, and was finally assassinated by a mob of Milanese nobility in 1814. His selection in the Famedio is perhaps because of his association with Manzoni, who is said to have based his analysis of crowd psychology in *I promessi sposi* on his observations of Prina’s death.\(^{137}\) On the middle level are names associated with poetry and social justice – for example the poet Gian Carlo Passeroni. On the upper level, the triptych’s apex, are the names of poets such as Vincenzo Monti and Ugo Foscolo.

The names of the *zona superiore* form two arches that curve around the rose window to form a half moon that rises upon the setting sun (Fig. 2.28). Upon the horizontal line are names of the pre-enlightenment heritage of science, charity, printing and music. On the smaller arch are the names associated with medieval and Renaissance art – for example Leonardo da Vinci and Bramante. The final

\(^{137}\) Colquhoun, *Manzoni and his times*, pp. 109-11
arch is divided into three blocks of five. From the right on the first block are names of Renaissance architects – for example Pellegrino Pellegrini. The second block contains names connected to Milan’s political development from the medieval period to the Seicento: for example the adventurer Francesco Carmagnola and protagonist of Manzoni’s tragedy Conte di Carmagnola (1819), which he dedicated to French idéologue, Fauriel. The final block on the far left constitutes the names of Milan’s moral foundation from the time of Constantine – for example Ambrose, Augustine, and the poet Ausonius, whose poetry, for the historian Cusani, confirmed that under Constantine Milan was ‘la prima città della penisola dopo di Roma’. Finally, Milan’s genesis is in the Roman Emperor, Maximus Herculeus, who laid the walls and gates of Mediolanum.

In The Liberal Imagination Lionel Trilling argues that Freud viewed the unconscious as a ‘poetry making organ’. I would like to use Trilling’s observation as a way of thinking about the extent to which the Cimitero Monumentale, and in particular the Famedio, might be thought of as a sort of ‘poetry making organ’ where the subject associates falling in love with the patria with access into a second life as a Romantic revolutionary poet. The two principal elements of the Famedio are the body of the Romantic poet and the names of Milanese patriots. When we think of how the deceased poet was represented as being asleep next to the Tramontana wall, where the names of several patriots alluded to his own texts, we can imagine how the contemporary visitor might have

---

138 Cusani, 1, 94.
139 ibid., pp. 93-94.
read the ‘love letter’ as signs, which when decoded, offered access into Manzoni’s unconscious world of patriotic dreams.

The aim of psychoanalysis, it has been argued, is to make the analysand into a better poet.\textsuperscript{141} However, in my view the Famedio encourages the Romantic citizen into forms of bad poetry. In describing the relationship between psychoanalysis and poetry Trilling, in a sense, differentiates between the production of good and bad poetry. First, he quotes Charles Lamb who defined the poet as someone who ‘dreams being awake. He is not possessed by his subject but he has dominion over it’.\textsuperscript{142} Second, in the comparison between poetry and the unconscious, Trilling notes that Freud forgot that the poem also requires a social intention and the control of a conscious mind.\textsuperscript{143} The dominant image inside the Famedio is that of a sleeping poet, who was placed there against his wishes when he had lost dominion over his conscious mind through death. The journey of Manzoni’s body from the private space of his bedroom, decorated with paintings of his friends and family, to its final resting position in Milan’s civic temple constitutes an ideal Romantic viaticum towards patriotic becoming as a process of deindividualization. To pursue such a viaticum might be thought of as a sort of dying for the patria, since, in my view, it would result in the slow dissolution of the individual’s subjective world of dreams and imagination, which, like a distant land, would only ever be gazed upon again through the poetic veil of civic patriotism with its pageantry, flags, hymns and tears.

\textsuperscript{141} Ronald Britton, President of the British Psycho-Analytical Society, referred to this aim of psychoanalysis in a plenary discussion on ‘Reality and unreality in fact and fiction’, at the conference \textit{Culture and the Unconscious}, organized by the Tavistock Clinic and the University of East London, July 2003.

\textsuperscript{142} Charles Lamb’s comment is quoted in Trilling, p. 50.

\textsuperscript{143} ibid., p. 50.
Chapter Three

Indecent Proposals: Matrimony and Monumentality in the Vittorio Emanuele Monument

Pareillement, chaque époque se fabrique mentalement sa représentation du passé historique. Sa Rome et son Athènes, son Moyen Age et sa Renaissance. Comment? Avec les matériaux dont elle dispose – et par là, un élément de progrès peut se glisser dans le travail d’histoire.¹

Lucien Febvre, *Le Problème de l’incroyance au XVIe siècle*

But what do you intend to do in Rome? This is what makes the rest of us uneasy. One does not remain in Rome without some cosmopolitan purpose. What do you intend to do?²

Theodor Mommsen to Quintino Sella, 1871

3.1 An Experience of Monumental Spaces

One hot summer’s day I visited the Vittorio Emanuele Monument, situated on the slopes of Rome’s ancient Capitoline hill. I approached the monument from Piazza Venezia (Fig.3.1). Dressed in a pristine white marble mantle, the monument stood defiantly against the surrounding ochre-coloured buildings. The unsullied whiteness of the monument made it appear like an apparition of a ghostly woman who haunted the tourist with tales of her precious virginity. The monument’s ageless features threw an icy white gaze to the hot, stifled onlooker that I had

Fig. 3.1
The Vittorio Emanuele Monument. Author's photograph.
become in the heat of the mid-day sun. To experience ‘her’ monumental image, to touch her cold marbled flesh, I had to negotiate Piazza Venezia, which opened up like a space of non-being since it separated me from her. I crossed this bridge of nothingness to re-emerge in the cold, marbled theatre of her inner space. Ceasing to be Sara, I became the double persona of actor and spectator in her monumental game.

The long ceremonial parade of stairs was her device to choreograph monumental movement, obliging my step, my walk, my body to adopt the palatial posture of the monarch, or how I fantasized a monarchical gait to be. I could only judge my performance by reading the eyes of the other visitors who merged into a chorus of other-selves, of other-spectators. Their judgments, their glances, their gestures directed my actions, as I simultaneously became part of the other-chorus, scripting the performance of a ‘him’ or a ‘her’. In this ridiculous monarchical role, for whom was I acting? Was I not seeking to be her suitor, a prospective husband for the bride-to-be?

This theatrical experience climaxed at the monument’s summit, the portico. Her doorways and columns explicitly framed my body into a multiplicity of views and openings as she made me and the collective ‘us’ aware of her game; a game that had lured us up the exhausting ascent, to a place that led to nowhere, except back down (Fig. 3.2 and Fig. 3.3).

"Why am I here?"
Fig. 3.2
View into the portico. Author’s photograph.

Fig. 3.3
View across the portico towards the church of S. Maria di Aracoeli. Author’s photograph.
Here in this interrogative was the art of the professional national monument; like a monumental sphinx it lures us into the illusion that we have answered our own existential enigma in our response to the question ‘Why am I here?’. She, like all monuments, performed this art by having an architectural form that transcended the ordinary, inviting me into her extraordinary spaces by my desire to know what she actually signified as a series of questions – When was I built? Why was I built? What historical event do I commemorate? The answers were supplied by her in the form of clues, which were to be discovered by carefully inspecting her white marbled body and then deciphering these clues, that is her inscriptions, her signs, her gestures. And in answering her enigma – 1885-1911; the death of Vittorio Emanuele, the first king of Italy; the birth of the Italian nation – I had become one of her subjects, one of her citizens, since I had unwittingly located my own existence inside her chronological ordering of time and history, a history and tradition that was Other and alien to me.

In this new position, as a part, a member of her patriotic space of commemoration, I began to reinterpret the surrounding urban spaces, to possess them within my own gaze. The panorama, dominated by the equestrian statue of Vittorio Emanuele, imposed a new rhythm across the horizon, so that the Pantheon and on towards the Vatican appeared as nodes that somehow pre-figured her epiphany and my own re-birth inside her cold monumental landscape. As I descended, I assigned each previously unknown building with a new patriotic meaning rendering the urban spaces completely knowable. The moribund space of Piazza Venezia was now a plane of historical events that had anticipated Italy’s Unification with a medieval precision (Fig. 3.4 and 3.5). In each step my vision sharpened, as each
moment of my descent was marked by the substitution of an enigma with an interpretation, an answer, as I re-ordered the outer space within my mistress’s historical chronology of events. Anxious, exhausted tourists on their ascent occasionally met my gaze. Their untimely gaits, their awkwardness, their unsightly individuality I grouped into the symptom of an Otherness I began to call the disease of the unfamiliar tourist, which I was slowly distancing myself from, the further I descended into an ordered space that she had made intelligible for me alone...
Fig. 3.4
View from the portico towards the Pantheon. Author’s photograph.
Fig. 3.5
View towards Piazza Venezia. Author’s photograph.
3.2 Architecture as Urban Spectacle

Throughout the ages architecture has functioned as urban spectacle, visually representing a political power and providing a ceremonial stage to re-enact and to re-assert its dominance over a territory and its peoples. Architecture as urban spectacle, as John Rajchman argues, is characterized by the built work becoming both an object to be looked at and a dramatic device to occasion emotions in the city experience. Its power to govern how we think and feel about urban spaces therefore derives from a particular relationship between architecture as a visual image and our physical interaction with the actual architectural space. From such premises, Rajchman argues that in contemporary society, through image-making (photographic, cinematic, digital), architecture as urban spectacle has evolved into a global phenomenon, which he illustrates with the example of Frank Gehry’s design of the Guggenheim Museum in Bilbao (Fig. 3.6). Gehry’s architectural work, which for Rajchman is arguably the most mediatized edifice in the history of architecture, produces what he describes as the ‘Bilbao effect’.

Extending Rajchman’s argument, I would like to say that this ‘effect’ is accomplished by the fetishization of Bilbao. First, Gehry’s design privileges the visual experience of ‘seeing’ the building over the museum’s contents – it houses contemporary works of art. Second, the sheer ordinariness of Bilbao’s other identity as a Spanish seaport is disavowed. The design seeks to neutralize the
Fig. 3.6
city's ordinariness by assimilating parts of Bilbao's ship-building industry into its appearance, suspending the city in its architectural body as the central theme of the built work: it looks like a ship at sea and has a steel panel beaten 'look'. The 'effect' therefore aestheticizes Bilbao's industrial ordinariness into the more palatable contexts of 'heritage' or 'tradition'. Moreover, in this state of suspension Bilbao is placed into a paradoxical position where it belongs to an extraordinary and superior global market but is also an ordinary and economically inferior other entity whose presence is lost in the circus of the spectacle.

After Rome's annexation in 1870 the new ruling elite sought to find ways of legitimizing their presence in the Eternal city. The difficulties Liberal Italy encountered in symbolically possessing Rome have been historically problematized as the Roman Question. For Rome to be recognized as the capital of the new Italian state, in both a national and international context, it had to compete with the powerful pre-existing images of Rome, as either the universal capital of the Catholic world or the Imperial foundation stone for nations to build their myths of a beginnings upon. Every epoch, as Lucien Febvre's epigraph illustrates, constructs its own aorist, that is to say, its own past historic, and begins this historiographical path with its own re-invention of Rome.

If we consider that images of an ancient Rome reborn began to be utilized for political purposes, according to Richard Krautheimer, with the medieval guide book the *Mirabilia* – written by Benedict, a canon of St Peter's between 1140 and 1143 – we can appreciate the difficulties awaiting Liberal Italy in its task of

---

asserting its dominance and in a sense its architectural provenance over Rome.\textsuperscript{4}

The interweaving of fantasy – for example Ovid’s \textit{Fasti} – and historical
monuments that characterizes the \textit{Mirabilia} established a schema of representation
for depicting Rome which culminated in the topographical engravings of Giovanni
Battista Piranesi (1748-1778) and Luigi Canina (1811-1854), whose ‘vedute’ of
Rome were distributed across the continent, producing a European-wide collective
visual memory of the city. And yet this memory was initially formed through
fantasy since the spectator was situated in a location ‘elsewhere’ – Goethe’s
memories of Rome, for example, stem from an engraving by Piranesi belonging to
his father which he recalled seeing as a child.\textsuperscript{5} Memories of Rome became
cultivated in the mind of the Grand Tourist so intensely that by the late eighteenth
century, as Tarnya Cooper notes, visitors ‘remarked upon finding it a city that they
already knew, and in which the greatest pleasure lay not in discovery of the new,
but recognition of the familiar’.\textsuperscript{6} Thus, how Liberal Italy intended to possess Rome
symbolically, and appropriate it into a temporal framework of a national capital,
was a cause for international concern. For the new nation to imprint its mark upon
Rome’s urban spaces would require an architectural proposal that permitted
diverse fantasies of Rome to co-exist within a new universal theme.

Located on the slopes of the Capitoline hill (the Campidoglio), the sacred site of
ancient Rome, the Vittorio Emanuele Monument is considered to be the most

\textsuperscript{5} J. W. von Goethe, \textit{The Italian Journey}, trans by R. Heiter (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University
\textsuperscript{6} Tarnya Cooper, ‘Forgetting Rome and the voice of Piranesi’s ‘Speaking Ruins’’, in \textit{The Art of
ambitious architectural project in Liberal Italy, taking over thirty years from its commissioning in 1878 as a memorial to the first king of Italy to its inauguration in 1911, when it now celebrated fifty years of Italian Unification. Using the notion of architecture as urban spectacle I shall argue that this national monument sought to construct a new fetishized image of Rome as the capital of Liberal Italy, which I shall call the 'Capitol effect'. The 'effect' incorporates different 'vedute' of Rome into an archaeological fantasy so that the ruins of Ancient Rome appear to have been restored through the rebirth of the Italian state, which the monument symbolizes.

Italian cultural studies have approached the Vittorio Emanuele Monument (known as the Vittoriano) from the perspective of the fraught problem of Italian nation building. Catherine Brice addresses its international context through the designs submitted for the two international competitions for the monument, and argues that the selection of the French architect, Nénot, in the first was motivated by provincial allegiances emerging in the selection committee. The choice of a non-Italian design was a way of avoiding potential accusations of regional prejudice, for example if an architect from Milan or Palermo were selected. Moreover the choice of a French architect would reassure France that it still had cultural influence in Italy. The selection resulted in public outcry, leading to a second international competition, which was won by the Italian architect Giuseppe Sacconi.7

---

Bruno Tobia considers the Vittorio Emanuele Monument as a built response to the Roman Question. The monument, for Tobia, sought to possess Rome’s urban spaces symbolically in its role as the centrepiece of a new Foucauldian ‘città panottica’. The ruling classes, according to Tobia, hoped to achieve this panoptical effect through a ‘political pedagogy of form’, in which urban forms visually expressed the nationalization of the Italian masses. Tobia argues that the visual images were constructed through a tradition-modernity dialectic. An aorist component confirmed a myth of a national beginning and a contemporary part affirmed national unity and the breach of Porta Pia. Tobia’s interpretation of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument is that its location at the Capitoline hill renders it the cardinal point in this dialectic: the monument looks forward towards the new nineteenth-century planning of Via Nazionale and the Termini train station, and is bisected by the ancient Via del Corso – the via lata of ancient Rome – which leads to the Piazza del Popolo, the traditional Papal entrance to the city from the North.

Tobia’s account lacks an analysis of how a ‘visual pedagogy’ takes place, since it implies an interaction between the building, as a teacher, and the spectator, as a pupil, who apperceives the monument as its master. And it is only by tackling how such encounters occur that we can begin to understand the processes by which we are taught to see the nation and therefore think and fantasize about it through our emotional reactions to urban space. As Henri Lefebvre argues, we do not relate to

---


10 ibid., pp. 176-77.
social space as we might to a picture, a spectacle or a mirror but act within it, situate ourselves within it, as active participants.11

David Atkinson and Denis Cosgrove examine the relation between urban space and patriotic rhetoric in the monument. Their argument is developed through the Vittorio Emanuele's dominant symbol, the human body, which they argue is present from the monument's conception as a highly ritualistic space, functioning as an altar of the patria, a place of sacrifice, and a memorial to the dead king. Under Fascism this symbol is made explicit in the insertion of the tomb of the Unknown Soldier within its vaults. Atkinson and Cosgrove identify the presence of both genders – the equestrian statue of the king and the Dea Roma – in the Vittorio Emanuele Monument.12 However, in their pursuit to connect the monument to the Fascist cult of the male youth they ignore maternal images, which I maintain are central to an understanding of patriotism.

A psychoanalytical interpretation of the monument is offered by John Dickie who explores the emotional investment placed in the monument through the tensions in its representation of national fantasies. Using Erving Goffman's 'dramaturgic' theory that 'embarrassment happens when the acceptability of the self-image projected into an encounter is thrown into doubt', Dickie indicates how national embarrassment surfaces in the Vittorio Emanuele Monument through the disparity between how the nation officially 'sees' itself, and how the amateurish attempts

---

11 Lefebvre, p. 339.
from many of the design entrants ‘see’ Italy.\textsuperscript{13} However, Goffman’s theory of embarrassment is a drama orchestrated by and through our interaction with others, in which our mask collapses to reveal hidden vulnerabilities and it is this denuding of self that is the site of embarrassment. Embarrassment is a piece of social theatre and it therefore requires an appreciation of the monument as a space that stages that experience. However, Dickie explicitly avoids both space and spectator in his analysis, arguing that a reading of ‘the monument or of plans of it as the spectator might have seen them’ would lead to the ‘paths which the builders hoped it would mean’.\textsuperscript{14} Instead, Dickie argues that the jokes made about the Vittorio Emanuele Monument are a cure for the embarrassment and derision that the monument provoked. Moreover, Dickie oversimplifies the psychoanalytical function of jokes, stating that they serve to distance ‘the source of embarrassment by implicitly denying the role of that source, at the same time, redefining the group as “we who get the joke”’.\textsuperscript{15}

The fundamental function of jokes, outlined by Sigmund Freud in \textit{Jokes and their Relation to the Unconscious}, is ‘the ability to bind together into a unity, several ideas which are in fact alien to one another both in internal content and in the nexus to which they belong’.\textsuperscript{16} For Freud, the function of jokes is encapsulated in the metaphor of matrimony: ‘joking is the disguised priest who weds every couple’, or is the act of wedding ‘couples whose union their relatives frown

\textsuperscript{14} ibid., p. 265.
\textsuperscript{15} ibid., p. 272.
upon'. If we think of jokes as a form of matrimony, it implies that by analysing the joke, we may discover what dissimilar emotions are bound together within the object of derision. Thus, I shall use Freud’s notion of the joke to analyse how the Vittorio Emanuele Monument sought to marry the different proposals of Rome together into the ‘Capitol effect’.

As is well known the Vittorio Emanuele Monument is derided in jokes made by both Romans and visitors – the *macchina da scrivere*, *i denti falsi*, and *la torta da nozze* – which transform a solemn national monument into a comic urban form through caricature and parody. These two comic forms, according to Freud, are directed against people or objects that lay claim to authority and have ‘sublime’ connotations. The sublime, for Freud, provokes us to act in an elevated manner: in the presence of the exalted personality of the monarch, for example, we alter our posture and body habits so that they are brought into harmony with the dignity of the idea represented in the sublime object. On the one hand caricatures of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument degrade its sublime imagery by emphasizing a single characteristic and enlarging it into an unrealistic representation of Rome: for example the upper colonnade is enlarged to caricature the monument as a sugary image of a wedding cake. On the other hand parody degrades the sublime by destroying the unity that exists between a person’s character, their speeches and actions, by replacing the exalted figure with an inferior one. In this case, the Risorgimento hero, Vittorio Emanuele, whose alleged innate warrior-like habits and military capacities were elevated to a patriotic cult, is parodied by substituting

---


17 ibid., p. 11.
these images of masculinity with inferior oral mother-images concealed within the jokes, and thereby emasculating the king’s penetration of Rome: our first ‘writing machine’ is the mother’s word; the ‘false teeth’ belong in the mouth of a barren woman; and the white virginal wedding cake is still not penetrated by a knife.

In dreams and myths, Freud tells us, cities and citadels are symbols of women, and so it shall come as no surprise that the female body permeates representations of the Eternal city.¹⁹ The female figure of Dea Roma represented the city in ancient Roman times, Dante imagined Rome bereft of a holy Roman Emperor as a widow,²⁰ and the Renaissance portrayed the city as one associated with maternity.²¹ In Risorgimento mythology images of a Rome reborn drew upon personifications of the Eternal city as an attached or unattached woman. Goffredo Mameli, the Risorgimento poet, depicted Rome (in a poem of the same name) as the commanding Mistress of the Latins, who, entombed for over a thousand years, has arisen from her coffin to stand before us once more, her body adorned with armoury.²² After Unification Rome was depicted as a mother liberated from the bondage of a ‘triste passato’ under the Papacy: this image from the *Esposizione Nazionale di Belle Arti* of 1872 shows Rome, the ‘gran madre’ of Italy, becoming unchained from her servitude to the Pope (Fig. 3.7).²³ Consequently by 1884 at the mass pilgrimage to Vittorio Emanuele’s tomb, the Mayor of Palermo’s remark that

---

¹⁸ ibid., pp. 200-1
²¹ Chabod, *Italian Foreign Policy*, p. 160
Fig. 3.7
Rome, once ‘queen of the world’, was now restored as the ‘worthy capital of Italy’ reveals how the annexation of Rome was ideologically apprehended in terms of a union between a king – Vittorio Emanuele – and a queen – Rome.\(^{24}\)

The jokes directed at the Vittorio Emanuele Monument undermine Liberal Italy’s ideological claim to Rome by unmasking the marriage between the bride (Rome) and the groom (Vittorio Emanuele) as invalid due to its non-consummation. This intention of these jokes is further confirmed by analysing the pleasure that we derive in them through what Freud defines as their ‘pleasure of economy’, for example double meanings, which condense two dissimilar thoughts into one word or image. But to appreciate fully the pleasure of economy we have to recognize that the origin of comic pleasure, according to Freud, is in childhood play, which in adulthood we regain possession of on certain occasions: evidence of this would be in the joke’s ability to falsify reality in caricature for example.\(^{25}\) Moreover, the joke’s ability to give us pleasure is linked to its ability to allow us to rediscover something both familiar and yet untouched by forgetting.\(^{26}\) In these jokes, the condensation plays upon the double image of the mother – the smothering oral-mother and the impenetrable virgin-bride we are cheated into marrying – which transform the monument into a familiar object of derision, and in so doing displace the official representation of Rome that the monument constructs, so that we may rediscover our own familiar view of Rome and our own childhood fantasies of an ideal mother.

\(^{26}\) ibid., pp. 122-24.
If matrimony is the ritualistic act of unifying a man and a woman together, binding fantasies of who we were as children and who we are as lovers into unified wishes of who we would like to become as husbands and wives, I intend to explore how marriage binds conflicting fantasies of Rome together as a response to the Roman question. In ‘Des espaces autres’ Foucault describes the Other location of the honeymoon as a heterotopia where the bride loses her virginity to the groom.27 Thus, I shall consider how the Vittorio Emanuele Monument might allude to the matrimonial space of the bridal suite. Moreover I shall use this allusion to examine the extent to which the monument functioned to wed the tourist to a new secular Rome. Freud argued that the sanctified union of marriage rendered the husband’s wife a forbidden love-object to other admirers in everyday life.28 Through analysing the foundation stone ceremony, overlooked by academic research, which was held on 22 March 1885, in this chapter I shall explore how the monument might invite the subject into a series of ‘indecent proposals’ scented with the promise of his or her own repossessing of the Eternal city.

28 Freud, Introductory Lectures on Psychoanalysis, 142-43.
3.3 The Roman question?

Before and after 20 September 1870 when Italian troops breached Porta Pia, the Roman Question was, in Chabod’s assessment, ‘the centre of Italian policy […] it was the porro unum [the most important thing] in the life of the nation’. Foreign policy would be directed by the Roman question for many years – for example Italy’s signing of the Triple Alliance – and it would be the basis for testing alliances and enmities. In domestic politics the Roman Question ranked second to the critical status of the Italian economy and was governed by the state defending its legitimacy against Papal encyclicals - for example the non expedit of 1874. For these reasons the Roman Question has been the subject of numerous historical enquiries that focus on the Catholic Church’s bid to maintain temporal power by opposing the new state. Describing the Church-state relationship as an ‘uneasy cohabitation’, rather than two ‘irreconcilable Italys’, Martin Clark represents the Roman Question, on a national level at least, as a marriage of convenience between these two partners. Pursuing the analogy of matrimony, on an international level Mommsen’s questioning of Sella in the second epigraph to this chapter resembles a scene from a nineteenth-century novel where the patriarchal father (Mommsen) interrogates a suitor’s (Sella) intentions over his precious daughter (Rome), to ascertain whether his proposal is honourable or not.

The unease in Mommsen, reflected in his repetition of ‘intend’, is not an isolated anxious voice, but he informs Sella that he is speaking on behalf of an ‘uneasy’ ‘us’, the international community. In 1864 the Swiss writer Rodolphe Rey, an

29 Chabod, p. 147.
opponent of Rome’s annexation to Italy, describes Rome’s difference and
separateness from other cities in terms of a type of ‘toujours-ness’ that implies a
traditional time of ‘always’: ‘Rome est une ville à part; elle a été toujours une ville
cosmopolite, la métropole des catholiques, leur capitale religieuse’.31 Similarly the
German historian Ferdinand Gregorovius, sympathetic to Italian Liberalism,
declares in his journal on 30 October 1870:

Rome will forfeit the cosmopolitan, republican atmosphere, which I have
breathed here for eighteen years. She will sink into becoming the capital of
the Italians, who are too weak for the great position in which our victories
have placed them.32

For the international community, the anxiety surrounding Rome’s annexation to
Italy is the loss of the city’s timeless, universal status as it is transformed into a
secular national capital.

Mommsen advises Sella that if Italy wishes to secure its ideological footing in
Rome it must have a cosmopolitan purpose. In response, Sella develops a secular
cosmopolitan mission for Rome founded on a cult of Science.33 Before starting his
political career, Sella had been a renowned scientist and professor of mineralogy at
what is now Turin Polytechnic. A remark of his to Luzzatti in 1875 shows how a
scientific ideology united around Rome as a capital was perceived as a patriotic
mission: ‘you simply must assist the scientific movement in the capital of the

31 Rodolphe Rey, Turin, Florence ou Rome: étude sur la Capitale de l’Italie et sur la Question
32 Ferdinand Gregorovius, The Roman Journals of Ferdinand Gregorovius 1852-1874, ed. by
33 Chabod, p. 166.
kingdom. The interests of science and the country demand it'.\textsuperscript{34} In a speech of 1878 to a group of engineers at the inauguration of a monument to the Fréjus tunnel, he asserts that science will combat Italy’s ‘decadenza’ through a ‘svecchiamento’ of the country.\textsuperscript{35}

One of the principal ways in which Sella sought to promote a new ‘scientific’ myth of a beginning for Rome was the promotion of the Accademia dei Lincei, which had been quickly renamed from the Pontificia dei Nuovi Lincei in 1870. The Accademia dei Lincei was founded in 1603 for the pursuit of science and it had a cosmopolitan agenda, which is reflected in one of their founders being Dutch, Frederick Heck. At its inception several of the founders suffered persecution from the Catholic Church, including its later member Galileo. Writing in 1879 Carlo Giambelli’s views on the Accademia dei Lincei reveal how scientific truth had a cosmopolitan status:

\begin{quote}
Come la scienza e la verità, l’Accademia non aveva indole di nazione o popolo singolare, ma carattere universale; gli Accademici elegevansi tra i dotti di tutta l’Italia e dell’Europa.\textsuperscript{36}
\end{quote}

Through Sella’s promotion of the Accademia dei Lincei a timeless image of Rome appeared, one that had been buried beneath the medieval theocracy of the Vatican, that of free experimental enquiry in the quest for scientific truth. And yet this new cosmopolitan image of Rome was built upon a particular scientific discipline that Italy was a world leader in – archaeology.

\textsuperscript{34} Sella to Luzzatti, 29 July 1875. The quotation is in Chabod, p. 167.
\textsuperscript{35} The inauguration of a commemorative monument to the Fréjus tunnel, 28 October 1879. The quotation is in Morachiello, Ingegneri e territorio, p. 51.
3.4 Bringing the Past to Life: Archaeology and the Nation

Now let us, by a flight of imagination, suppose that Rome is not a human habitation but a psychical entity with a similarly long and copious past—an entity, that is to say, in which nothing that has once come into existence will have passed away and all the earlier phases of development continue to exist alongside the latest one.37

Sigmund Freud, *Civilization and its Discontents*

Freud was fascinated by the analogy between archaeology and psychoanalysis where long-forgotten artefacts buried beneath the soil parallel the repression in the unconscious of those emotions and memories that we wish to forget. Similarly the task of the archaeologist and the psychoanalyst is carefully to excavate the layers of history concealed beneath the surface of their subject, in an attempt to map a topology of a place that will only ever exist through the recovery of memory. In *Civilization and its Discontents*, Freud takes us on a ‘flight of the imagination’ using the topology of the Eternal city, where we are asked to imagine its architecture, not as inhabitable spaces, but as a ‘psychical entity’, where ‘nothing that has once come into existence will have passed away’. And so rather than descriptions of Roman ruins, on each archaeological site we imagine a series of restored buildings co-existing in the same space, so that all historical periods are represented contemporaneously: on the Capitoline hill, for example, on the place occupied by the Palazzo Caffarelli would also once more stand the Temple of Jupiter Capitolinus in its different architectural forms, from the Etruscan to the Roman epoch. Thus Freud is pursuing the fantasy, shared by the psychoanalyst

---

and the archaeologist, to bring their subject to life by giving it a topos, since in reality, as Freud concludes, the unconscious is unimaginable. It has no precise topology.

It has been well argued that anthems, flags, and so forth invent a national ‘tradition’ that, I would like to suggest, encourage the fantasy of a national psyche since they elude collectivized responses. Within the context of nationalism the role of archaeology would be to fabricate a collective memory and an origin for the nation. Moreover archaeology can be deployed in the nation-building process to legitimize a ruling class as the rightful occupants of a geographical space through the fantasy that their ancestors occupied the same earth in the past. In Liberal Italy the scientifically weak ‘teoria pigorianiana’ legitimized the Piedmontese political dominance, by evincing the notion that a prehistoric Italy developed in the Bronze age from the Alps, later spreading south to civilize the entire peninsula and initiate the Latin civilization.

From a psychoanalytical perspective the power of these archaeological illusions to seduce us, is that, like Freud’s ‘flight of the imagination’ in the Eternal city, nothing appears to be forgotten. The memory of our civilization will not decay into a dust, but will be endlessly recovered, remembered and retold, as we can so readily retrace our past to an origin through the imaginary topology of the nation.

---

Thus I shall explore how Rome’s cosmopolitan role was to concretize national essentialized fantasies of a Latin past through archaeological discourse.

Prior to 1870 the majority of European nations possessed territory in Rome where they conducted archaeological excavations, so that national ownership over archaeological finds would be guaranteed, and inadvertently provide a concrete topos for a nation’s past. Until 1851 the Palatine hill was owned by the Crown of Russia, who eventually exchanged it for some works of art with Pius IX. In 1860 Napoleon III purchased the Farnese Gardens from the House of Naples – they were redeemed to the Italian state after the Franco-Prussian war. Furthermore, foreign scholars had initiated the scientific discipline of archaeology in Italy around the beginning of the nineteenth century: for example, the Istituto di Corrispondenza Archeologica was originally established as the Istituto Archeologico Germanico. After 1870 archaeology became polarized into those in favour of the new secular state – Fiorelli, Lanciani – and those who sided with the old Papal regime – Boni and Ceci. Liberal archaeologists promoted the new state as the moral guardians of Italy’s universal heritage, condemning the Church’s record on protecting Rome’s monuments. Lanciani describes the brutality of Papal excavators, who demolished ancient monuments, using the marble they were built from in the construction of St Peter’s:

The supreme object of the cinquecento excavations was to obtain materials for building St Peter’s. In August 1546, the Temple of Julius Caesar was

---

41 Guidi, p. 109.
discovered in such a striking state of preservation that the marble slabs containing the ‘fasti consulares et triumphales’ were still attached. […] And what remains now of this admirable set of monuments? Nothing except the rubblework nucleus of their foundation and platforms. (27 October 1883).42

Against the Papal destruction of Rome’s rich past, the city’s redevelopment in Liberal Italy has, for Lanciani, provided archaeologists with an abundance of new sites – ‘never has the Roman soil yielded such a magnificent harvest as within the last few years’. 43

There was considerable national and international fascination with the archaeological discoveries that were made almost daily in Rome in this period. From 1872 the Municipal Archaeological Commission published a regular bulletin to keep the public informed, while from 1876, Lanciani, who had achieved international notoriety for identifying the location of the Jupiter Capitolinus Temple under the Palazzo Caffarelli (the Russian Embassy), wrote a diary of eyewitness accounts of the excavations for the English periodical, The Athenaeum.

Lanciani’s diary provides an insight into the relationship between patriotism and archaeology in Liberal Italy, which centres upon the fantasy that beneath the sediments of Rome is a forgotten past that silently awaits its excavation, and re-acquaintance with the present. The first entrance in the diary describes how ‘two Romes’, one modern, the other ancient, are being built side by side:

It may be said that not one, but two Romes are being constructed at this moment – the modern, with its boulevards, squares, and churches; the

43 ibid., p. 195.
ancient, with its temple, thermae, aqueducts and theatres. The topography of the Esquiline, the fifth Region of Augustus, is as well known as that of the new quarter just built on the same site. (15 January 1876).44

The archaeological fantasy being established is that a past topography – the ancient site of the Esquiline – co-exists on the same site as the modern urban area under construction. Italy’s ancient history has not decayed into a dust, but in Rome’s redevelopment into a modern capital, its ancient past is being resurrected. Moreover, Italian possession of Rome is legitimized by the rediscovery of ancient Rome paralleling the construction of the new capital.

From the illusion that forgotten memories have resurfaced in the present through archaeological investigation, comes the fantasy that an Italian archaeological body can be pieced back together as one and brought back to life through science. First, there is the metaphor of the decaying body which is attributed to the burial practices in Christian Rome. Under the Roman Empire cemeteries were placed outside the cities, but after its decline the burial laws were neglected, resulting in Rome’s transformation into a cemetery, that is to say, a city of the dead:

The ground on which the Eternal city stands is such as a geologist would find it very hard to describe; it is a mass of ashes, of vegetable and animal detritus, corrupted by contact with the filth of sewers, constructed at different periods, without any regular plan or any regard to public health. Immediately after the fall of the Empire, the law forbidding burials within the walls was neglected, and the city became a vast cemetery, where the living dwelt in perpetual contact with the dead. (7 October 1876).45

The contamination between life and death produced a city whose foundations are the abject wastes of animal and vegetable detritus mixed with the filth of sewers.

44 ibid., p. 1.
The papacy is therefore implicitly blamed for the decaying state of Rome and the disregard for public health in the city’s planning.

Second, there is the healthy Roman body of pagan Rome and its counterpart in the modern Italian state. Lanciani recounts that new archaeological evidence has indicated that the Romans had occupied the surrounding countryside in the summer months, an area uncultivated in this season in Liberal Italy due to malaria infestations. Distinguished from the decaying body of the papacy, the Roman’s knowledge of science produces the healthy utopian body. The lost scientific knowledge of the Romans may be recovered by modern scientific expertise and will therefore guarantee the emulation of the past in the present:

We may fairly assume that the hygienic state of Latium was, if not normal, certainly better under the empire than it is now. [...] We may state that our fathers had done something which actually prevented the annual outbreak of malaria, or at least diminished its violence. Let us find out what that something was; let us do the same taking advantage of our skill in chemistry and mechanics; the results cannot fail. (27 November 1880).

For Lanciani the ancient Romans are ‘fathers’ of the present Italians, who as their sons and daughters re-enact the past through an archaeological flight of the imagination.

45 ibid., p. 17.
46 ibid., p. 90.
3.5 Proposals

Historically Rome had always supplied the models and templates for architects to weave their Roman fantasies into the urban planning of the capitals of Western Europe.\(^4\)\(^7\) The complexity of these templates, which were predominantly the legacy of the last great town planner, Pope Sixtus V, lay in intermeshing both Rome as the spiritual capital of Catholicism and Rome as the temporal power of the Pope-king (Papa-Re) across the urban spaces. According to Tobia, the Pope's strong panoptic urban plan was designed to express universal Catholicism and theocratic power by linking the two cardinal points of Papal power (St Peter's and the Lateran) and the principal basilicas into a celebratory route marked by extraordinary monumental obelisks.\(^4\)\(^8\) Over almost three centuries these Baroque elements were inserted into capital cities across Europe while being perfected and refined in Rome itself, which became a working model of this common topos. In 1870 the breaching of Porta Pia eclipsed Rome as the model city to which European capitals referred.

The decision to redevelop the Capitoline hill has been widely recognized as demarcating Liberal Italy's decision to assert its ascendancy across these urban spaces.\(^4\)\(^9\) Marianna Brancia Di Apricena argues that the proposed development was an attempt by the new state to sever the memory of a political cohabitation between the Comune di Roma and the Papacy.\(^5\)\(^0\) However, the municipal tradition at the Campidoglio had been so overwhelmed by the Vatican that the Italian state

\(^{47}\) Atkinson and Cosgrove, p. 30.
\(^{48}\) Tobia, 'Urban Space, pp. 175-78.
could not redevelop it into a counter-history of the new Italian capital. Moving from the inner space of the Capitoline hill to the outer spaces of Rome, Tobia asserts that Sixtus’ urban structure was far too potent for Liberal Italy to ever effectively conquer. When new urban interventions were made, they produced splits, divisions and conflicts between commemoration (past) and modernity (future) which were only partially resolved through the development of a cult of the deceased king as a symbol of Unity, which on a national scale was diffused through the Vittorio Emanuele Monument. \(^5\) With these urban difficulties, which rendered the new state’s symbolic possession of Rome unachievable, on an imaginary plane the Capitoline hill proposal sought to replace the common *topos* of the Eternal city with the ‘Capitol effect’ where Rome, at least at the level of fantasy, was the legitimate capital of Italy.

Today, as we can see from the aerial photograph, the Campidoglio appears a meticulously ordered model of Febvre’s epigram: our eyes move from a secular origin of ancient Rome, represented by the ruins of the forum, to the Medieval Aracoeli complex and the Renaissance of Michelangelo’s Campidoglio, ending our visual tour with the present resurrection of Ancient Rome in the complete Vittorio Emanuele Monument (Fig. 3.8). In this optical illusion the spectator’s eyes move back and forth between the ruins and the Vittorio Emanuele Monument, so that it appears that the latter is a restoration of the former. This spatial arrangement between the ruins and the monument seduces the spectator into


\(^51\) Tobia, ‘Urban Space’, p. 177.
Fig. 3.8
believing that if they enter the monument and experience the new Rome, they will possess a complete image of their own body.

In contrast to this perfect ordering of space is Lanciani’s study of the Capitoline hill. It is an incredibly fragmented, haphazard arrangement of buildings, with the site having no singular focal point (Fig. 3.9). The black denotes Roman structures and red, post-Roman. These fragments are only grouped together into a collection by the black geographical boundaries of the hill, which creates the fiction of an enclosed city that is slowly expanding beyond its natural borders. The enclosed citadel is accessed from monumental staircases – the Campidoglio, the Aracoeli, the ancient Salita di Monte Caprino. In antiquity the hill was split into two halves, the Capitolium – the location of the Jupiter Capitoline temple – and the Arx – the site of the Juno Moneta temples and the Roman mint.

Due to the richness of archaeology upon the hill, the proposed redevelopment of the site was highly controversial. Formal opposition was made on the grounds of the site’s archaeological significance, and the importance of the Tower of Paul III and the convent of Aracoeli to the city’s history. Prince Leopoldo Torlonia, the mayor of Rome, opposed the plans on the basis that it would destroy the most important ancient topographical site of Ancient Rome:

Il Comune è responsabile innanzi alla città, alla Nazione ed al mondo civile della gelosa conservazione delle memorie storiche e dei monumenti d’arte che Roma racchiude e che specialmente sul Colle Capitolino segnano le pagine gloriose di due civiltà […] il Campidoglio […] essendo esso il
Fig. 3.9
Rodolfo Lanciani, the Capitoline hill. Reproduced in Emmanuel Rodocanachi, The Roman Capitol in Ancient times and Modern times, trans. by Frederick Lawton (London: Heinemann, 1906), (pullout).
punto più importante della topografia e della storia romana e il costante oggetto di studio degli scienziati d’ogni Nazione.52

Torlonia’s remarks reveal how the Capitoline hill, with its symbolic importance for ‘ogni Nazione’, could potentially contest the Vatican’s timeless image of Rome. Ruggiero Bonghi was far more acute in his objections, accusing the government of cynically trying to connect a past former civilization to the present for political advantage:

Mettete li, se vi pare, il monumento al primo Re d’Italia sebbene io non vi consigli di farlo; ma non confondete glorie nuove con glorie antiche che non sono più nostre; non sostituite la coltura nostra a quella dei tempi antichi.53

The government defended its proposal in a series of reports, many of which have been republished in Di Apricena’s II complesso dell’Aracoeli sul Colle Capitolino (IX-XIX secolo). Alongside the controversial demolition of the convent of Aracoeli, the principal building that opponents to the scheme were seeking to preserve was the Tower of Paul III and its historical connection to the ‘palazzetto’ Venezia by way of a viaduct, which had characterized the area for over three centuries (Fig. 3.10). The tower and the palazzetto constituted the private residence of Pope Paul III and this was a potent symbol of Papal history upon the hill. Under the new scheme the memory of this occupation is evacuated by removing any visual evidence of Papal occupation – the tower, the viaduct and the quarter of San Marco are all to be demolished, the latter to allow for the expansion

52 Leopoldo Torlonia, ‘L’opposizione del Comune, 14 April 1883’. The quotation is in Alberto M. Racheli, ‘Un monumento nella città’, in II Vittoriano (see Brice, above), i, 25-36 (p. 28).
53 Ruggiero Bonghi, Parliamentary speech, 10 May 1883. The quotation is in Racheli, p. 29.
Fig. 3.10
Fig. 3.11
of Piazza Venezia. To complete this destruction of memory, the palazetto is to be carefully taken down brick-by-brick and rebuilt on the other side of Piazza Venezia to complement the urban planning of Via Nazionale, leading to Termini train station (Fig. 3.11). The gaze of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument – which follows the direction of the Corso renamed Corso Umberto I to the Northern Papal entrance of the city in Piazza del Popolo – replaces the previous focal point, the material structure of the viaduct. The proposal therefore severs memories of the Papacy at the Campidoglio, by supplanting the Tower of Paul III with the gaze of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument.

The government’s report justified demolishing the tower on the grounds that it was the principal symbol and perpetrator of the site’s decadence. The area around the tower is described as a disordered array of poorly constructed tenements with ‘oscuri ed umidi cortili’ where the sunlight cannot penetrate, producing an air that suffocates the inhabitants, while the Tower of Paul III has ‘gravi lesioni’ and is ‘deturpata di aperture irregolari’. Its architectural disfigurements are complemented with the side of the tower exposed to the Corso having unsightly latrines, thereby connecting it with bodily obscenities.

In addition to the tower and the surrounding buildings being associated with contamination, the report counters claims of the site’s archaeological significance, stating that what was once an ‘antica grandezza’ is now a ‘decadenza attuale’. The memories of the ‘Campidoglio Romano’ with its two famous peaks are hidden

54 ‘Notizie ed osservazioni sulla località prescelta pel Monumento a V.E. liberatore della patria, fondatore della unità, 1883’. Published in Brancia Di Apricena, pp. 393-97 (p. 397).
from the ‘occhi di tutti’ by these ‘costruzioni volgari’. The proposal intends to unveil sublime images of ancient Rome buried beneath. The expansion of Piazza Venezia, for example, is justified on the grounds that it will allow for the famous hill to rise in isolation, almost as if it is framed for a ‘veduta’. The justification for the monument is that like a restored excavated artefact it will unveil a past image of Roman history, buried beneath the earth, engraving its imposing staircase and equestrian statue upon the spectator’s eyes:

In fondo al Corso e dalla Piazza di Venezia raddoppiata di larghezza, si vede sorgere isolato il Colle famoso; imponenti costruzioni ne sorreggono i fianchi intorno ai quali si avvolgono ampie scalee. Su questo imponente e grandissimo piedistallo posa la statua equestre del Re in bronzo dorato a cui fa cornice un nobile e grande edilizio decorato di portici e loggie.

The proposal for the Capitoline hill was not unique in using the architectural device of the monumental staircase in which stairs and steps become vehicles for rediscovering the past through the adoption of a strange gait. The monumental stairs of Santa Maria in Aracoeli, built in 1347, were one of the great monuments of Rome, and reflected the fantastic dream of Cola di Rienzo – a central figure of mythology in nineteenth-century Liberalism – to establish a Roman republic superior to the Emperor and Pope, with its seat on the Capitol from which the world was once ruled. This image of the Capitol and its accompanying monumental gait was re-tied to the Vatican through the palatial stairs of the Campidoglio, which directed the pilgrim’s feet and gaze towards the Vatican. Until the construction of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument, the monumental steps

---

55 ibid., p. 397.
56 ibid., p. 397.
of the Campidoglio and the Aracoeli church were an integral element in the image of the Capitoline hill (Fig. 3.12). Within this context I would like to suggest that the vast staircase of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument offered the visitor what I would describe as a 'bridal fantasy' in which he or she became 'married' to a vision of a new Rome through retracing the steps that led to the Risorgimento of Italy.

37 Krautheimer, p. 228.
Fig. 3.12
Engraving of the Capitoline Hill. From Rodocanachi, *The Roman Capitol* (see Fig. 3.9), p. 191.
3.6 The Wedding Cake

Images of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument were in circulation throughout the period of its construction and serve to establish a new collective memory of Rome as the capital of Liberal Italy. On the one hand the production of new images informed the public of Sacconi's alterations to his original design, which had not anticipated the honeycomb of Roman tunnels concealed beneath the Capitoline hill. On the other hand the images were a response to public anxiety concerning the delay in the monument's completion and the permanence of the nation's Risorgimento that it symbolized. Furthermore, in the imaginary realm the monument has polymorphous properties, that allow it to adapt to an international or national audience, properties which as a solid object existing in material reality it would obviously be unable to accomplish. The design shown to Wilhelm II in 1903 on a state visit to Rome depicts the monument as a utopia of martial spirit, which resurrects Vittorio Emanuele. He is seated on a black stallion ready to charge once more into battle and command the throng of soldiers congregated below him (Fig. 3.13). In the foreground valiant soldiers emphasize the excitation of eminent battle. Their raised swords and shields of antiquity connect a former heroic golden age to the present heroism of Vittorio Emanuele and Italian patriotism. In contrast to these masculine images of violence is the male fantasy of the virgin, which the monument embodies at the Milan Exhibition of 1906. The large gesso model transforms the Vittorio Emanuele Monument into a utopia of matrimony by its resemblance to a wedding cake (Fig. 3.14). White, virginal and forever intact, as much as we desire to slice her open with a knife she defies penetration. In this symbol of the Italian nation, she is the perfect virginal bride, the potential wife and the mother of the Italian son, who lures the citizen towards
Fig. 3.13
L. Pogliaghi, sketch of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument for the visit of Wilhelm II to Rome, 1903. Reproduced in Nicoletta Cardano, "Il cavallo sull'altare": antologia documentaria', in *Il Vittoriano* (see Fig. 3.11), II, pp. 53-116, (p. 20).

Fig. 3.14
Gesso model of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument for the Milan National Exhibition, 1906. From Pier Luigi Porzio, 'La forma architettonica del Vittoriano nei disegni e nei modelli della fabbrica', in *Il Vittoriano* (see Fig. 3.11), I, 37-90 (p. 83).
her by her seeming availability – she is a virgin – and her unavailability – she is an invincible image. Her patriotic role is to inspire the male warrior to protect her virginal status from foreign intruders, and at the same time inside the nation she immobilizes his martial spirit, as the king is now subordinate to her power frozen on his horse. I shall therefore trace the myth of the wedding cake to its source in Sacconi’s original designs and comments for the competition.

In Sacconi’s design comments he states that his intention is to construct a patriotic monument that will connote the modernity of the Italian nation by referring to the ancient site of the Campidoglio: ‘deve essere situato e rispondente all’idea nazionale che vuole nel Campidoglio stampare accanto alle antiche, l’orma della moderna epopea italiana’. The verb ‘stampare’ illustrates Sacconi’s view that ancient and modern Italy can be bridged by an architecture that is analogous to the printed word. To mark his printed work with depth Sacconi is inspired by the form and materials of Etruscan and Roman monuments, which now even as ruins have a sense of majesty and permanence. Mirroring these great works on the external surface Sacconi ‘ha cercato di imprimere un carattere severo ed eminentemente solido’, in part achieved by the ‘grandi massi di travertino’. The Travertine marble Sacconi stipulated was the building material of antiquity for high status monuments and would confer connotations of majesty and permanence upon the design (Fig. 3.15). Unfortunately, due to financial constraints he was finally obliged to utilize white Brescian Botticino marble, which in the Roman climate never weathered, and this left it with the appearance of a white gesso model.

58 Giuseppe Sacconi, ‘Relazione del progetto per il Monumento a Vittorio Emanuele II: 2° Concorso Internazionale, Roma 1883’, in Il Vittoriano (see Brice, above), II, 55-56 (p.55).
59 ibid., p. 55.
Fig. 3.15
Gesso model of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument. From Porzio, 'La forma architettonica del Vittoriano' (see Fig. 3.14), p. 40.

Fig. 3.16
Giuseppe Sacconi and Eugenio Maccagnani, design of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument. From Catherine Brice, 'L’immaginario della terza Roma', in Il Vittoriano (see Fig. 3.11), i, 11-24 (p. 21).
Fig. 3.17
A cross-section of the Capitoline hill, 1885, adapted by the author. From Brancia Di Apricena, *Il complesso dell'Aracoeli* (see Fig. 3.10), p. 24.

Fig. 3.18
Luigi Canina, *Edifizi di Roma antica* (Rome: [n.pub.], 1856), Plate CXIV.
The second form of imprint Sacconi describes is the equestrian statue of the king at the monument's apex, his corporeal presence humanizing the cold marble landscape (Fig. 3.16): ‘Il Re è rappresentato nell’atto di salutare dalla vetta del Campidoglio, il popolo italiano che applaude l’opera secolare compita da lui’. His saluting gesture elicits applause from the Italian population, as if they had just watched a performance of his patriotic deeds and are now demanding an encore.

The visual impact of the isolated equestrian statue is exaggerated by its verticality, accomplished by it being placed at the same height as the portico to attract what Sacconi describes as ‘l’occhio dello spettatore’. The cross-section shows how the equestrian statue was positioned at the geographical epicentre of the monument and therefore of the virtual experience. The statue therefore is the centre of gravity that binds the visitor’s conception of near and far as they journey around the monument (Fig. 3.17).

The monument’s inner space is divided into three distinct levels as an allegory of the formation of the patria: the first level is its ancient Roman origin, the second represents the struggles of the Risorgimento, and the final level is the birth of the modern Italian nation (Fig. 3.15). Sacconi’s comments on the design give an insight into how he intended the pilgrimage around the monument to be experienced. The visitor enters the large staircase, on either side of which are two bronze statues of Pensiero and Azione, which situated at the monument’s threshold imply that the journey retraces how Vittorio Emanuele translated his thoughts, that is to say his dream of Italy’s Risorgimento, into action. Ascending to the first level at a height of twelve metres the visitor encounters the bronze statue of Dea Roma,

---

60 ibid., p. 55.
the Goddess of Rome. Alongside her are bas-reliefs depicting 'la breccia di Porta Pia – l'entrata delle reggie truppe nell'eterna città'. This level therefore has a double significance as both ancient Rome (modern Italy's past), and the Rome of the Popes that Vittorio Emanuele breached and whose image the monument is inadvertently seeking to destroy. Thus, in transgressing this first level the visitor violates the pre-existing universal image of Rome to re-enact Vittorio Emanuele's symbolic breaching of Porta Pia as a virtual experience.

From this point Sacconi states that the staircase splits into two ramps, which allegorically celebrate aspects of the Risorgimento: for example the defence of Rome in 1849 and its annexation in 1870. On the second level bas-reliefs depict Italy as a geographical territory – 'le figure delle regioni d'Italia' – as the Italian constitution which Vittorio Emanuele must honour – 'V. E che giura lo statuto' – and as being unified through the will of the people – 'V. E che riceve il plebiscito di Roma'. Italy is therefore a distinct object from the king, who, like an archaic father, has created it and now honours his creation from a position beyond its confines.

On this level the equestrian statue is also present. It is the closest point of contact that the visitor has with the king's corporeal presence as an integral component of the visitor's pilgrimage. Vertically the statue is located directly above the Dea Roma, visually conveying his domination over her. The intensity of the male visitor's patriotic identification with the king will be measured in his ability to master his fantasies of domination, using the monarch as a model, as the female

61 ibid., p. 56.
visitor’s will be in her ability to immobilize male desire through the white marble pagan surfaces. The sexualized forms of patriotism that the Vittorio Emanuele Monument arouse are tentatively acknowledged by Dickie in his remarks on Ugo Ojetti’s account of the inauguration of the monument in 1911, where the monument arouses intense emotions, panting and screaming.  

The final ascent to the third level is the moral outcome of the annexation of Rome, the Unification of Italy. In the original design Sacconi envisaged a portico divided by sixteen columns and upon each one ‘l’effige di una delle principali città italiane’. And so the visitor’s crossing to this level is characterized by a new stage of intimacy with Italy, since they are introduced to Italy’s cities from the national monument situated in the heart of ancient Rome on the Capitoline hill. Geographically located in the centre of Italy, Rome was conceived as the master signifier, which would connect all the regions and their capitals into a network so that municipalism could be projected in a national dimension through the capital.

This intimate experience is maintained by bas-reliefs on the portico walls, depicting the king’s funeral and images of famous Italians, past and present, which the visitor is invited to look at as the lineage of Italy’s father, Vittorio Emanuele.

The archaeological references deployed by Sacconi in his design create a genealogy for the monument so that Italian architecture can be purified and thereby return to an origin in a Latin past. The first layer of this genealogy is constructed by the monument inviting the visitor to identify its style with

---

62 ibid., p. 55.
63 ibid., p. 55.
64 Dickie, p. 262.
65 Sacconi, p. 55.
international neo-classical buildings that dominated Europe some fifty years previously in the early stages of Romanticism. Fifty years previously Italy had been under occupation and the neo-classical style introduced by Napoleon was associated with Italy’s pre-existing state of colonial subordination – hence Camillo Boito’s objections to the design. Federica Galloni argues that Sacconi took inspiration from Percier and Fontaine’s design for the Arc de Triomphe de la Place du Carrousel in Paris to celebrate Napoleon’s Ulm-Austerlitz campaign of 1805. However, in their design the French architects explicitly referred to the Arco di Settimio Severo in the Foro Romano in Rome, and so in a sense Sacconi’s design seeks to restore the architectural word to its rightful origin and place of birth: the slopes of the Capitoline hill. From these contemporary monuments with their genesis in a Latin word, at the summit of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument Sacconi places a replica of the colonnaded porticos at the Temple of Fortune at Praenestre (now known as Palestrina) restored by Canina (Fig. 3.18). The image of Praenestre was widely in circulation at the time and its visual impact upon the eye would have invited the spectator to see the present Italian nation as a pure rebirth of a former Roman civilization. The temple dedicated to Fortuna Primigenia, the daughter of Jupiter Capitolinus, was located 25 km from Rome and therefore is an image free from Papal contamination. The identification between the modern monument and the Roman temple at Praenestre is made explicit in Francesco Coltellacci’s illustration of the two architectural works, which were executed for the inauguration of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument in 1911 (Fig. 3.19).

68 ibid., p. 128.
LE GLORIE DELL’ARTE LATINA
Ad oltre venti secoli d’intervalllo il GENIO DELLA STIRPE ispira a SOMMI ARTEFICI sublimi concepimenti d’identico stile

(Autore: Francesco Coltellacci - Palestina)

Fig. 3.19
Fig. 3.20
The ceremony design. From Porzio, 'La forma architettonica del Vittoriano' (see Fig. 3.14), p. 43.
Fig. 3.21
The foundation stone ceremony. Photograph from Primo Acciaresi,
*Giuseppe Sacconi e l'opera sua massima* (Rome: [n.pub.], 1911), p. 72
Fig. 3.22
The Torre di Paolo III, 1885. From Roberto Di Paola, 'Il complesso monumentale della mole del Vittoriano', in Il Vittoriano (see Fig. 3.11), p. 136.

Fig. 3.23
Close-up of Fig. 3.22.
accompanying inscription conveys the notion that the visual presence of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument is evidence that the glories of the Latin age have returned after twenty centuries.

3.7 The Wedding Ceremony

The foundation stone ceremony took place on 22 March 1885, signalled by the bell tolling from the Campidoglio and the sound of majestic music coinciding with the entrance of the monarch and the cortège. King Umberto I and Depretis performed the ceremony in front on an international audience. Ambassadors from all the European empires – France, Britain, Germany, Austria (Habsburg), Turkey (Ottoman) and Russia – were present, and emphasized the symbolic importance the Italian government placed upon the ceremony. The political function of the ceremony in legitimizing Rome as the Italian capital is reflected in Il Diritto’s (and therefore the government’s) view of the ceremony the following day:

Cosi il collocamento della prima pietra alla fondazione di un monumento decretato dalla gratitudine nazionale, ebbe a testimoni i rappresentanti di ogni ceto sociale, e di tutte le regioni d'Italia. E testimoni furono altresì i ministri esteri, i quali potranno riferire ai loro Governi quanto affetto stringa i cittadini italiani alla dinastia che li regge, e come sia comune proposito il mantenere salde le tradizioni e le opere del Grande oggi onorato.70

Crucial to this legitimization is that the foundation stone ceremony is witnessed by every Italian social class, from every Italian city, and that this ‘seeing’ event is witnessed by other European nations, since the ceremony is empirical evidence of the unity of Italy. Thus, I shall explore how the ceremony’s ritualistic elements seek to construct an ocular form of matrimony, where each subject is visually married to the ‘Capitol effect’, as the new relationship between Italy and a Church devoid of temporal power.

70 Il Diritto, 23 March 1885, p. 1.
The ceremony was designed by Sacconi and is a theatrical interpretation of the monument (Fig. 3.20). It is modelled on a Roman amphitheatre capable of containing the 3,000 invitees, but is modernized in cast iron. At the centre of the ceremonial stage is the throne where Umberto I and the dignitaries who testify to the ceremony’s occurrence by signing the parchment are seated (Fig. 3.21). Above a bronze cupola depicts the Savoy coat of arms, the Italian crown with the stars of Italy and the words ‘Vittorio Emanuele Padre della Patria’. In front two columns with winged Victories in bronze are placed on either side of the throne, above the seated area is surrounded by cloth with the coat of arms of all the Italian cities, alternating with the Savoy emblem.

The Commissione Reale specified that the location of the ceremony was to be at a height of 27 metres from a zero point, defined as Piazza Venezia; this point would be used in the ceremony to represent ‘l’altezza della futura piattaforma del monumento, e da cui l’occhio spaziava largamente su Roma’.71 Outside the inner arena of the amphitheatre the façade of the tower is painted to show the height of the equestrian statue in the ceremony (Fig. 3.22 and Fig. 3.23). This spatial arrangement constructs two clearly delineated spaces – an inner arena of bodily purity, against an outer impure contaminated area of decadence. The focal point of the inner arena is the prima pietra, no longer an isolated block of marble it is transfigured into a sacred artefact.

From this sacred inner arena, whose centre-piece is the prima pietra, the audience admires the cupola of St Peter’s, made available as part of the initial demolition of

---

71 Primo Acciaresi, Giuseppe Sacconi e l’opera sua massima (Rome: [n.pub.], 1911), p. 70
the area for the ceremony. In this spatial arrangement there is an ocular
relationship established between the *prima pietra* and St Peter who laid the
foundation stone for the Christian world. The *prima pietra* becomes a Romantic
instrument that dismantles the contemporary Vatican’s moral position by drawing
attention to its real moral foundations laid by St Peter, from which many believed
the Church had strayed. As the *Padre della patria* Vittorio Emanuele has cleansed
Rome of its impurities by returning the Church to its sacred origins in early Latin
Christianity when it was without temporal power.

Central to the ‘Capitol effect’ is the acceptance of a Church without temporal
power. The white marble *prima pietra* is a romantic image that symbolizes the
Church’s return to a state of purity, which has been accomplished by Vittorio
Emanuele. At the closure of the ceremony, and the ending of the ‘marriage
service’, a parchment is read out by De Renzis, the secretary of the Commissione
Reale, which is then signed by the foreign dignitaries rather like the civic marriage
service that had been introduced in Liberal Italy. The text of the parchment
confirms that the historical event took place because a global cross-section of
people – foreign, national and Roman – were present: ‘Qui sul colle Capitolino,
questo giorno 22 marzo 1885, fu posta la prima pietra del monumento a VE,
presenti: ministri, i rappresentanti esteri, i rappresentanti della Nazione, e la
popolazione romana’.

Following the signing of the parchment, Umbertine gold
and silver coinage and the parchment are inserted into a cavity inside the *prima
pietra*, which is then lowered down a shaft designed for the occasion by Sacconi.
On the one hand the insertion of money and parchment transforms the white

---

72 ibid., pp. 72-73.
marble stone into an enigmatic object where the audience speculate upon its fate and when it will be opened and exposed to the light of day again: for example, *L’Illustrazione Italiana* narrativalized the gesture as an archaeological fantasy of buried treasure which would be excavated in AD 3000 by a future civilization. On the other hand the depositing of coinage in the earth restores an imaginary unbroken cord with the past, since in antiquity the Roman mint occupied the site. Freud observed that in dreams, as a result of dream censorship, hollow shafts, cavities and caves were censored erotic wishes towards the female genitals. Using these observations I would like to suggest that between these past and future narratives is perhaps a censored moment, that of the immaculate consummation of the marriage between Vittorio Emanuele and Rome. This moment is visualized by the symbolic lowering of a ‘paternal’ stone down a hollowed out ‘feminine’ shaft.

In Chapter One I stated that my interest in Foucault’s heterotopias would be framed around the process of seeing and its transformation into thinking, and what Rajchman described as a “positive unconscious” of vision. If the foundation stone ceremony makes visible the immaculate consummation of Rome, we might impute that the function of the completed monument will be that of a matrimonial suite, where the visitor becomes wedded to a secular fantasy of Rome through the panoramic views of Rome, experienced as a sequence of ocular proposals.

---

75 See p. 11.
6. The Wedding Speech

The wedding speech made by the best man often narrates the groom’s life history as a series of seemingly haphazard events whose providential ending in matrimony renders the groom’s choice of bride-to-be foreseen from birth. The groom’s journey towards matrimony is a transition from boyhood to manhood coloured by misadventures – infidelity, drunkenness and gambling – as the crossing of the marital threshold signifies his re-entry into society. In this context Depretis’s ceremonial speech takes the form of a best man’s speech in which he depicts the life of the unwedded bachelor to that of the Italian people without a nation, while this ‘ending’, a unified Italy, is embodied in the ideal marital couple of Umberto I and Queen Margherita. In the speech Vittorio Emanuele is constructed as an enigmatic figure whose double existence as an immortal *Padre della patria* and a mortal king who founded the modern Italian nation allows him to be given a number of different and often conflicting roles – a national Saint, an archaic father, a military hero, a dream-interpreter and an apostle preaching to the unconverted.

The speech begins this fantasy by being framed around the interpretation of signs in dreams. The audience immediately enters into a daydream by Depretis inviting them to fantasize about the site’s ancient history, which conjures up images of primitive temples, where their ancestors studied the ‘auspici’ – an Ancient Roman augury where natural phenomena, such as the movement of birds in flight, were interpreted to reveal a hidden future event:

Siami concesso incominciare venerando, a modo dei nostri antichi, il genio di questo luogo, che ci rende viva l’immagine di quei templi primevi, dai
quali si studiavano gli auspici, e dove, sotto il libero cielo, si sentiva presente la divinità.  

The ancient auguries, the basis of Roman paganism, evolve into the contemporary Imperial prophecies made by ‘L’esule di Sant’Elena’, Napoleon, who by exile is transformed into a Romantic poet-prophet whose words predict that if Italy were to be unified, the memories of antiquity would compel Italians to choose Rome as its capital.  

The source of this prophecy is most likely his memoirs, written by the Count de Las Cases in his exile. In these memoirs Napoleon describes the peninsula as a set of countries divided by geographical, historical and cultural differences, which like Britain, Spain or France would inevitably at some point unify. Rome is Napoleon’s first choice for an Italian capital due to ‘the remembrances connected’ with its past. However, his overriding reason for Rome as the natural capital of Italy is its geographical centrality, which places it in the best strategic position to defend the Italian borders in the event of an invasion.  

Napoleon also makes ‘great objections’ to Rome as the capital – ‘the insalubrity of the air, the sterility of the environs, the want of a large port and of a harbour at a convenient distance’ – which are obviously elided so that the Italian capital may be legitimized through the prophetic words of the former French emperor. Using Napoleon’s words as ammunition, Depretis asserts that a monument commemorating the national rebirth upon the sacred Capitoline hill will complete the Emperor’s prophecy.

77 ibid.,  
79 ibid., p. 196.
The sacred qualities of the Capitoline hill are drawn from the spectacle of the Eternal city it looks onto, described as the first Italy, whose laws and armed forces are the seal for this national rebirth. The speech therefore uses the surrounding landscape to construct the notion that hidden meanings can be deciphered from natural phenomena through the power of divination. Moreover, patriotism, as a secular theism, has such properties of divination, which when mastered enables the enigmas that surround the subject to be interpreted and therefore give life a patriotic meaning. At the fulcrum of this theism is the Capitoline hill, whose urban location bridges the fault line between the Eternal city and the new Rome of Via Nazionale. It is the seal of this theism as the monument is the sign – the ‘ara della concordia salvatrice’ – that signifies the patriotic life given to Rome by Vittorio Emanuele, the dream-interpreter:

Qui soltanto, davanti allo spettacolo della città etema, che colle armi e colle leggi costitui la prima Italia, e che ora è suggello e fondamento all’Italia nuova, qui soltanto può degnamente consacrarsi l’ara della concordia salvatrice, di cui fu auspice e creatore Re Vittorio Emanuele.80

Italy’s miraculous resurrection is therefore conveyed by a Latin proverb from an unnamed Roman historian and so requires a scholarly patriotic key to unlock its hidden meaning: *concordia res parvae crescunt, discordia maxime dilabuntur* *(Through unity the small things grow, through disunity the largest things crumble).* The proverb implies Italy’s strong sense of unity since it is a nation, rather than a crumbled array of fragments, which the external pre-existing ceremonial environment symbolizes. The presentation of the proverb renders it a type of Freudian parapraxis, since the name of the historian is concealed. Allegedly a
favourite quotation of M. Agrippa, the proverb is from Sallust’s treatise on the Jugurthine War — *Bellum Jugurthinum* (10.6). Sallust would have been very familiar to the international audience because of the recent archaeological discovery of his villa in Rome by the English Ambassador, Sir John Savile Lumley, a keen archaeologist. Written between 41 and 40 BC, at the collapse of the Republican system, the Triumviral period, the treatise is a critique of the corruption of the senatorial governing class, narrated through the history of Jugurtha, king of Numidia (113-104 BC), a client kingdom of Rome, now part of Algeria. After the death of king Micipsa the kingdom was divided between his heirs, one being Jugurth, whose downfall is accomplished by bribery and corruption and prompts Roman military intervention. The overriding theme in Sallust’s work is the fear of the foreign enemy, which should constrain Romans to practise virtue, discipline and concord. A month prior to the ceremony Italy had established its first colony in Massaua, albeit with the help of the British. These references to Sallust therefore conceal Italian ambitions that with *concordia*, the ‘small thing that may grow’ will be a new Italian colonial empire, guaranteed by the power of divination.

In the transfiguration of Vittorio Emanuele to his status as an archaic father of the patria, the heroes of the Risorgimento are described using a religious lexicon as ‘i precursori, i confessori e i martiri della religione nazionale’. The derivation of the lexicon in the persecution of Christians in early Latin Christianity transforms Papal protestations against the state into an immoral crusade against the Italian Christian.

---

80 ‘Verbale della solenne funzione pel collocamento della prima pietra’.
patriot. Moreover, if Vittorio Emanuele’s Christian soldiers are martyrs, his own parabolic mortal life is akin to that of an apostle, since as Padre della patria he is elevated beyond the position of a martyr. His mortal life was an exemplum of patriotic values: he is both the ideal warrior – the ‘alteta delle Alpi’ – and a man of religiosity willing to sacrifice his crown, his birth right, his sword, and his notoriety for the ‘altare della patria’. Guided by his patriotic faith, Vittorio Emanuele teaches an Italy that lacks faith to believe in the religion of the patria through the ‘santità della parola giurata’. Upon his death, the love Vittorio Emanuele gave to the patria is reciprocated in a ‘plebiscito d’amore’ by the Italian people, who change his popular mortal name ‘Re Galantuomo’, to an immortal one, ‘Padre della Patria’. To commemorate his mortal life the monument is sculpted with marbled inscriptions narrating his Risorgimento teachings to future generations to render the building a lay New Testament.

It is now to filial obligations that the speech turns, as Depretis addresses Vittorio Emanuele’s son Umberto 1 – ‘Ma, Voi o Sire, primo e degno suo figlio’ – and depicts the monument as a memory to his father’s image in its ‘augusta immagine paterna’ which will rise above the city to sit beneath the sky. For this dream of the monument as a ‘City of God’, the analogy to which Depretis is alluding, the audience are invited to imagine that the Tower of Paul III – the symbol of Papal occupation – no longer exists. Instead, using the signs painted upon its façades, the audience project the image of the equestrian statue upon it:

---

83 ‘Verbale della solenne funzione pel collocamento della prima pietra’.
84 Ibid.
La, su un’eccelsa base, e a quell’altezza che è segnata nell’edificio, il quale ci toglie da destra di veder tutto il giro dell’orizzonte, si eleverà, campata sul cielo, la statua equestre dell’Eroe, veduta da tutte quasi le parti della città e dai colli che si levano di fronte.85

To accompany this memory of Umberto’s father is a beautiful staircase that contrasts to the squalid Papal tower and the surrounding dilapidated area, whose stairs confuse the feet – ‘i quali s’addossano confusamente ai piedi’ – and convey the notion that the Papal gait of the pilgrim is corrupt.86 The monument’s sacred staircase not only symbolizes the filial obligation to follow in the footsteps of the father but, like the Pass of Pardon described by Dante in *Purgatorio* where the penitent’s feet move more lightly as his sins are purged (Canto xii), each time the patriotic pilgrim journeys to the monument s/he will perform the monarchical gait, and each time s/he will move with a lighter foot as their former Papal infidelities are washed away.

Umberto I is the living model of how to follow in the father’s footsteps, which is echoed in the title that the ‘popolo’ have conferred upon him – ‘Eroe della carità, consolatore degli afflitti’.87 It is an effeminate model where charity, kindness and consolation of the afflicted are virtues associated with becoming patriotic,88 while the masculine violence of the Risorgimento is immobilized by such kindness, thereby guaranteeing that the memory of the first king of Italy will not be usurped – it shall forever remain intact. Next to Umberto his wife, the ‘graziosa Regina’, is

85 ibid.,
86 ibid.,
87 ibid.,
88 Catherine Brice draws attention to the charistic role in the image making of Umberto I, where he adopts feminine characteristics of fainting and turning pale. Brice, ‘‘The King was pale’: Italy’s National-Popular Monarchy and the Construction of Disasters (1882-85)’, in John Dickie, John
an ideal of the ‘sposa’ and ‘madre’ to Italian women. Seated side by side, this model couple – a husband and wife – embodies Italian Unification. The conclusion to Depretis’s speech is the matrimonial image of the royal couple, who will often visit the Vittorio Emanuele Monument from where they will view their Rome. The fantasy image of matrimony stood at odds with the reality of Umberto’s marriage to Margherita, which was, according to Denis Mack Smith, a ‘cold and distant relationship’, the King preferring the company of his many mistresses.89

In spite of Umberto I’s notorious infidelities, in the nineteenth century Rome was considered one of the European capitals of romance, and it was arguably the most popular destination for honeymooners. For example, in Freud’s analysis of Wilhelm Jensen’s novel Gradiva, he notes that the protagonist (Norbert Hanold) flees Rome to escape the proximity of honeymooners whom he calls ‘Edwins’ and ‘Angelinas’.90 The protagonist is an archaeologist who falls in love with a marble relief depicting a barefooted-Roman woman to whom he gives the name Gradiva. On a trip to Pompeii he believes that Gradiva has come back to life in a young woman he sees crossing some stepping-stones. In reality the woman is a forgotten childhood friend (Zoe Bertgang) whose graceful gait he had seen as a child.91

Freud’s interest in Gradiva concerns its unintentional representation of repressed love and erotic hysteria, narrated through the archaeologist’s delusions. From a clinical perspective Freud perceives Zoë Bertgang’s role as paralleling that of a physician in that she cures Hanold of his neurosis by conspiring with his delusions,

---

91 ibid., pp. 50-51.
and on occasions she pretends to be the *Gradiva* of the relief. Horne, as I stated in Chapter One, describes one of the roles of the nineteenth century monument as that of providing a therapeutic space for the visitor, where he or she could indulge in their fantasies of the past. In concluding I would like to suggest that the foundation stone ceremony was the mise-en-scène of a Roman fantasy. Similar to Zoé Bertgang, or the analyst, the rituals of the ceremony sought to conspire with the tourist’s own fantasies of the Eternal city, so that like the patient, he or she would be cured of the Roman Question.

---

92 ibid., p. 87.
Chapter Four

The End of the Affair: The Pagan Mistress and the Blessed Virgin in the Bonifica of Rome at Lake Fucino

We see then that the two cities were created by two kinds of love: the earthly city was created by self-love reaching the point of contempt of God, the Heavenly City by the love of God carried as far as contempt of self.\(^1\)

St Augustine, *Concerning the City of God against the Pagans*

I woke during the night, a curtain would rise and the play would begin: always the same play, Sarah making love, Sarah with X, doing the same things that we had done together, Sarah kissing in her own particular way, arching herself in the act of sex and uttering that cry like pain, Sarah in abandonment.\(^2\)

Graham Greene, *The End of the Affair*

4.1 The Fantasy Affair

With a surface extension of 140 square kilometres and a depth of 20 metres Lake Fucino was the third largest lake in Italy and was formed by the surrounding chain of mountains acting as a natural barrier to surplus water draining into the river Liri 6 km away. Lacking a natural outlet the lake was notorious for dramatic rises in water levels of up to 16 metres, producing an increased surface extension of 75 square km, and causing the emigration of entire villages, whose population would

\(^1\) St Augustine, *Concerning the City of God against the Pagans*, ed. by G. R. Evans, trans. by Henry Bettenson, 3rd edn (London: Penguin, 2003), Book XIV, Chapter 28, p. 593.

Fig. 4.1

Fig. 4.2
resettle once the waters had receded owing to the fertility of the soil. In the ancient Roman world the lake had been partially drained under Emperor Claudius (AD 41-54) who excavated an emissary (outlet) under the mountains so that rising water could flow into the river Liri. The Claudian emissary was considered one of the great wonders of the world, and prior to Sommelier's Fréjus tunnel, it was the world's longest tunnel at over 5 km.

In spite of its remote geographical location, in the age of the Grand Tour European artists such as Fragonard, Piranesi and Bidault visited the lake and its ancient emissary (Fig. 4.1 and Fig. 4.2). The lake's ability to mirror the surrounding landscape provided a reflective surface for tourists to construct their fantasies of a Roman past recovered in the present through a visit to the emissary. Accompanying the visual experience of seeing the ancient ruins the tourist read accounts of the Claudian emissary by Pliny, Suetonius and Tacitus, which added an historical depth to their fantasies. Richard Hoare's guidebook to the region from 1819, for example, is more of a guide on how to build a Roman fantasy than an account of Lake Fucino. On visiting the emissary he first uses Suetonius's account of Claudius from The Lives of the Caesars to describe the visual experience as 'stupendous, when we consider it as the work of thirty thousand men for eleven years'. For Hoare, without these historical sources the lake is merely a transparent sheet of water:

---

4 ibid., pp. 195-98.
5 Richard Colt Hoare, A Classical Tour Through Italy and Sicily; tending to illustrate some Districts which have not been described by Mr Eustace in his classical tour, 2nd edn, 2 vols (London: Mawman, 1819), I, 256.
Without the aids which may be drawn from history and antiquities, what sensations would the Lake [...] inspire beyond those excited by the sight of a transparent sheet of water, surrounded by mountains?⁶

And he then declares that ‘throughout all Italy every scene bears a classic character, and every district acquires double interest, from the recollections it calls forth’.⁷

Hoare’s fantasy was prefaced with an acknowledgment of the Rome that the tourist was constructing, which was described in Eustace’s Tour, the precursor of Hoare’s work. For Eustace Rome is a Mistress whom the male tourist was taught to revere from infancy, her presence returning him to the boy he once was, whose ‘lisping tongue’ would be aroused upon hearing her name, her language, and her culture:

Without doubt, the name of Rome echoes in our ears from our infancy; our lisping tongues are tuned to her language; and our first and most delightful years are passed among her orators, poets, and historians. We are taught to take a deep interest in her fortunes, and to adopt her cause, as that of our own country, with spirit and passion. [...] The Mistress of the World claims our respect and affection, on grounds which the Christian and the philosopher must admit with grateful acknowledgment.⁸

These fantasies remove Rome from its geographical location and transform the city into a psychical space reawoken in the tourist’s imagination upon the sight of ancient ruins. This privileged ‘affair’ between the tourist and the Italian landscape came to an end when Prince Torlonia drained Lake Fucino between 1854 and 1876 (Fig. 4.3). Torlonia presented a new modern image of Italy in which the scientific

---

⁶ ibid., pp. 262-63.
⁷ ibid., p. 263.
Fig. 4.3
achievement of draining the lake was testimony to the rebirth of ancient Roman engineering expertise:

Prince Torlonia, a most industrious man, wished to raise a lasting monument in honour of industry, and to show at the same time that Italy had not lost her traditions of great enterprise, and that her citizens could still astonish the world with the boldness and the grandeur of their works.9

As the largest land reclamation project in the world, the drainage of Lake Fucino was compared to Lesseps’ Suez Canal and won awards at the Paris Universal Exhibition of 1867 and the Philadelphia Centennial Exhibition of 1876. In Man and Nature George Perkins Marsh – the first American ambassador to Italy – praised the Torlonia project. Surpassing the Roman emissaries in the Alban hills and the Marsica the modern tunnel was ‘probably the grandest work of physical improvement ever effected by the means, the energy, and the munificence of a single individual’.10 In Italy Cavour deemed the reclamation of Lake Fucino a great patriotic work during its completion, and Torlonia, who had financed the project, was honoured by the Italian monarchy with the title of Prince of Fucino, the only case of its kind.

The Danish hydraulic engineer, Mathias Döring has conducted a study on the construction of the Claudian and Torlonia emissaries (Fig. 4.4). The upper part of Döring’s diagram shows the terrain the two tunnels crossed – Lake Fucino, Mount Salviano, the Campi Palentini and the river Liri. The Claudian emissary was designed to drain the lake only partially and so its entrance is closer to the

9 Alexandre Brisse and Léon de Rotrou, Dessèchement du lac Fucino, exécuté par S. E. le Prince Alexandre Torlonia, text in English and French, English trans. by V. de Tivoli (Rome: Propagande, 1876), p. 73.
Fig. 4.4
mountains, whereas the Torlonia tunnel is just over 6 km in length. To excavate the tunnel the Romans used what was called the Quanat system where they simultaneously tunnelled from both ends and from above using shafts, which carried excavated material to the surface. A total of 38 shafts and 8 galleries called *cunicoli* were sunk and constituted an additional 10.9 km of tunnelling. The Roman method of constructing the emissary remained essentially the same in the modern construction and a number of the original shafts and *cunicoli* were reopened. The modernity of the Torlonia emissary resided in the scientific expertise necessary for calculating with accuracy the velocity of water in relation to the tunnel’s gradient; without such calculations the entire area might be flooded due to overflows from the tunnel.\(^\text{11}\)

The lower part of Döring’s diagram is a longitudinal section that shows the different geological strata the emissaries traversed, from limestone to different types of clay – sandy clay, mixed with rock, and clay saturated with water. The clay presented hazardous conditions in the construction of the emissaries due to the pressure of water within it. In the construction of the Roman tunnel the problems encountered in tunnelling through clay were reflected in the shifting dimensions of the tunnel and alterations in its lining as it traversed different strata – sand and clay soils required vaulting using Roman concrete (*opus caementitium*), whereas sections excavated in limestone were not vaulted. Unlike the Torlonia tunnel, the Roman emissary deviated and collapsed as it approached the lake due to influxes of water. In this final section the Romans sank the *Cunicolo di Ferraro* (shown on the diagram), which enabled floodwater to be carried to the surface,

\(^{11}\) Döring, pp. 199-202.
while a diversion tunnel – 152 metres in length – was excavated to circumvent the collapsed section.\(^1\) The Torlonia emissary distinguished itself from the Roman work by its far larger dimensions. The modern tunnel sought to drain the entire lake, leaving a polder (an area of partially reclaimed land) at the centre of the ancient lake basin.\(^2\) It is apparent from Döring’s diagram that the modern emissary followed the same course as the Claudian work and therefore destroyed it.

In spite of the importance in Liberal Italy of the figure of Torlonia and the construction of the emissary, neither has attracted much academic interest. For example, Emilio Sereni’s *Storia del paesaggio agrario italiano* never considers the Torlonia project, even though it includes similar projects in Liberal Italy such as the irrigation of the Po valley.

The architectural historian Paolo Morachiello has read the Torlonia *bonifica* within the ruling Destra’s Liberal project of colonizing the peninsula through creating infrastructures – roads, railways, canals – that would stimulate economic growth and meet the needs of the ‘libero mercato europeo’\(^3\). Morachiello argues that the Torlonia *bonifica* created a dualistic landscape consisting of a technologically advanced island of capitalism surrounded by an agriculturally backward region.\(^4\) Its appearance as a self-sufficient ‘island’ distinguished it from the typical activity of the Italian agrarian ruling classes who sought continually to extend their commercial interests by grafting undrained land onto their own estates through

---

\(^1\) ibid., pp. 202-3.
\(^2\) ibid., p. 212.
\(^3\) Morachiello, *Ingegneri e territorio*, p. 7.
\(^4\) ibid., p. 168.
irrigation and as a discursive set of practices extended bourgeois hegemony across the peninsula. From the outset, according to Morachiello, the Torlonia administration intended to construct a dualistic landscape, knowing in advance that the soil’s fertility would dictate high rents, the cultivation of sugar beet would coincide with a sugar refinery, and the energy generated from the constant fall of water from the emissary into the Liri could supply electricity to a Torlonia factory at nearby Capistrello which produced calcium carbide. By the first decade of the twentieth century Morachiello observes that great efforts went into maintaining the uncontaminated status of the island, with the Torlonia administration employing over one hundred military guards to control access onto the reclaimed land.16

In contrast to Morachiello’s study on Lake Fucino as an aspect of the state’s programme of internal colonisation, Roberto Parisi and Adriana Pica read the Torlonia project as a French ‘operazione di colonizzazione’.17 Although they do not acknowledge Torlonia’s own French descent, or his father’s financial relationship with Napoleon Bonaparte, they compare Torlonia’s importation of French engineers and labourers to a colonial project, and therefore imply that Torlonia’s project parallels the colonial activity of a foreign country – France – in Italian national space. Tensions arose between the French plans to drain the entire lake and Italian ambitions of colonizing its own terrain, which were reflected in criticisms of the project by Italian engineers. The renowned hydraulic engineer Elio Lombardini, who raised doubts over whether a complete drainage was feasible, made the most famous criticism. Lombardini advocated a partial drainage

16 ibid., pp. 166-69.
of the lake based upon Afan de Rivera’s design from the 1830s, which sought to control the lake’s dramatic rises by repairing the Claudian emissary. However, Lombardini’s argument is presented in an almost chauvinistic manner by Parisi and Pica who are more concerned to prove the validity of Lombardini’s proposal in Torlonia’s final plans for the reclaimed land, which introduces a polder, rather than assess how these arguments might be read in terms of a colonial project.\textsuperscript{18}

Diverging from these studies, I shall explore the reclamation of Lake Fucino as a colonial project in which the Dogma of the Immaculate Conception, to which Torlonia dedicated the project, is the colonial tool through which he chose to present a new scientific image of Rome in the Other space of the countryside. In \textit{Des Espaces autres} Foucault argues that heterotopias have a heterochronic function that allows them to bind together different pieces of time – for example the museum or the library.\textsuperscript{19} At Lake Fucino, I am interested in how the reclamation project has heterochronic properties, which enable different histories of Christian and Pagan Rome to be bound together into an archive of the Italian landscape as an Immaculate virginal Roman space.

In a recent essay ‘Roma o morte: Garibaldi, Nationalism and the Problem of Psycho-biography’ Daniel Pick has identified a relationship between land reclamation projects and the desire to restore Rome to its past glories through studying Garibaldi’s ambitions for the Tiber. Garibaldi proposed diverting the Tiber from Rome and building Parisian-style boulevards over its drained course,

\textsuperscript{18} ibid., p. 131.
\textsuperscript{19} Foucault, \textit{Des espaces autres}, p. 759.
believing that it would restore Rome to its past glories and would therefore become a symbol of the future of Italy and civilization as a whole. According to Torlonia, Garibaldi met him in Rome in 1875 where they discussed their mutual interests in ‘la questione della bonifica’. Being a Prince of the Papal Court Torlonia was sharply criticized by the Catholic Press for meeting Garibaldi. In contrast Garibaldi despised the Pope, although as Pick asserts ‘to a large degree, Garibaldi and the Risorgimento, even at its most fervently anti-clerical, drew upon the language and rituals of the very Catholicism it excoriated’.

If Garibaldi sought to cleanse Rome of its decadence and decay through land reclamation projects, Torlonia identified this decadence with fantasies of pagan Rome and the Claudian emissary that had embodied the Grand Tour. At the Centennial Exhibition in Philadelphia (1876) Torlonia presented the modern emissary alongside the Claudian work in an historical excursus on the various failed attempts to drain the lake from ancient to modern times. Written in French by his two principal engineers, Alexandre Brisse and Léon de Rotrou, and translated into English by V. de Tivoli, the presentation will be the main source of my study on the Torlonia reclamation project. In the presentation the Claudian emissary was viewed harshly since it had never fully functioned. Its poor construction was deemed to be a product of the decadence and immorality of pagan Rome in contrast to the virtuous Catholic Rome that the Torlonia tunnel embodied.

---

The first epigraph to this chapter is from Concerning the City of God against the Pagans in which Augustine identifies Rome with two cities ruled by two types of love. Pagan Rome or civitas terrena is characterized by a 'perversity of [...] heart' and an 'eternal darkness'.\(^{23}\) It is not driven by love but by a 'lust for power' won by a few, who crush 'the rest [...] beneath the yoke of slavery'.\(^{24}\) In contrast the heavenly city or civitas dei is an invisible city of sacred love where the beloved object is liberated from the tyranny of desire to be cherished for its difference.\(^{25}\) In Risorgimento Italy, according to Luigi Salvatorelli, who cites examples from Mazzini, Balbo, and Cattaneo, metaphors of an idealized Rome as the City of God, and the notion that Italians were living in an era similar to that of Augustine's when Rome fell to the Goths, were widespread.\(^{26}\) If the Italian for land reclamation is bonifica from the verb bonificare, which has religious connotations of the soul's purification, I shall examine the extent to which the Torlonia presentation appeals to Augustinian fantasies; the undrained lake equalling the political rule of the civitas terrena, in contrast to the pure Christian love of the Blessed Virgin that builds the civitas dei produced by the Torlonia emissary.

What is particularly interesting is that one of the ways in which Augustine chose to differentiate between the loves that built the political rule of the two cities, is that of the uterine space and the Immaculate Conception. He cites the example of the Old Testament story of Sarah. Wanting to fulfil her obligations to her husband, Abraham, Sarah offers her servant Hagar to him. Hagar’s act of giving birth to

\(^{23}\) Augustine, The City of God, Book 1, Chapter 2, p. 7.
\(^{24}\) ibid., Book 1, Chapter 30, p. 42.
\(^{26}\) Luigi Salvatorelli, Il pensiero politico italiano dal 1700 al 1870 (Turin: Einaudi, 1935), pp. 211, 254, 337.
Ishmael according to the flesh and natural laws is, for Augustine, an example of the *civitas terrena* since the mother was enslaved, whereas Sarah’s final ability to give birth to Isaac from her dead womb is a symbol of God’s grace and the free city of the *civitas dei*.\(^2\)\(^7\) In *Le Froid et le cruel* Deleuze notes that in myth the primitive uterine mother is represented as the ‘mère des cloaques et des marais’.\(^2\)\(^8\) Her love of sexual pleasure renders her in a sense the perfect Other of the Virgin Mary whose uterus remains forever intact. On a theoretical level my analysis of the Torlonia project is therefore underpinned by Deleuze’s theory that the masochist’s idealization of the pagan primitive uterine mother may result in her transformation into the sadistic father’s accomplice.\(^2\)\(^9\)

If the tourist had a fantasy affair with pagan Rome, it is one in which they dreamt, like the adulterer, that they had sole possession over their love object, whereas the reality is that they had a very limited access. Graham Greene’s *The End of the Affair* is a psychological study into what emotions are aroused when the love object is removed from the space of adultery, when, that is, the barren Sarah Miles, married to a civil servant, ends her affair with Maurice Bendrix. As the second epigraph illustrates, Maurice falls into an obsessive desire to know the name of his rival, the “X” of her desire. Upon the discovery that it is God, the text becomes a study into man’s hatred of the father as a figure of unknowability as Maurice’s love-object is removed forever from his grasp by Sarah’s physical death. In this chapter I suggest that the Torlonia *bonifica* of Lake Fucino ended a fantasy affair between the tourist and Rome in the Other space of the countryside. However,

\(^2\)\(^8\) Deleuze, *Le Froid*, p. 49.
\(^2\)\(^9\) ibid., p. 79.
rather than in Greene’s novel where the end of the affair reveals the unknowability of God, the virginal reclaimed land of the Fucino basin replaces the uncertainties of the natural world with the light of scientific truth, which is built upon the certainty of the Immaculate Conception’s purity.
imperiale et libre'. To coincide with the liberal declaration in the decree
Napoleon abolished the Inquisition and Jews were conceded civil rights, products
of the French revolution. Moreover, Napoleon planned to transfer the Vatican to
Paris, which would have transformed the French capital into a new Christian
Rome, leaving his son and heir – the Roi de Rome – to rule Rome unhindered. In
‘A Sense of Place: Rome, history and empire revisited’, Duncan F. Kennedy
argues that in the nineteenth century Rome represents the notion of an empire –
sacred or secular – to the extent that what it is ‘thought to represent historically is
felt to be more authentically experienced elsewhere, whether it be Napoleon’s
Paris or London [...] of the British Empire’. If the possession of Rome
concretized fantasies of the rebirth of a Roman Empire for the Napoleonic Empire,
it implies that being ‘Roman’ is no longer fixed to a specific geographical location
– Rome – but to a manner of doing things associated with French patriotism. It
therefore exposes a paradox in that a citizen will experience feeling French only to
the extent that they become Roman, that is to say by becoming an Other identity. It
is this paradox of Otherness that I intend to explore through what Rome meant as
the ville imperiale and how in Liberal Italy this ville, as an Other space to colonize,
became relocated to the countryside.

From their arrival in Rome the Virgilian epic, the Aeneid, seduced the French.
Virgilian enthusiasts such as General Miollis saw the Alban hills, vividly

33 Driault, p. 549.
34 Desmond Gregory, Napoleon’s Italy (London: Associated University Presses, 2001), p. 90.
35 Tulard, p. 176.
36 Duncan F. Kennedy, ‘A Sense of Place: Rome, History and Empire Revisited’, in Roman
Presences: Receptions of Rome in European Culture, 1789-1945, ed. by Catharine Edwards
(Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), pp. 19-34 (p. 27).
described in the last six books of the *Aeneid*, as a living theatre of the epic.\(^{37}\) The repairs carried out to the Via Appia were claimed as restoring Nero’s work, and inside the city, Roman symbols such as the S.P.Q.R, not seen for centuries, were resurrected.\(^{38}\) The ultimate motive for these actions, as Carla Nardi asserts, was that it made excellent imperial propaganda — ‘ma ancora più forte sarà, per la propaganda imperiale, la lusinga del vaticinio su Roma culla dei Cesari’.\(^{39}\)

Camille de Tournon – the Prefect of Rome – directed the planning of the *ville impériale* aiming to reclaim the city’s former glories. Tournon described how he wanted the ‘reine des nations’ to be viewed by the French tourist. From their first glance from the Corso to the Capitoline hill, or across to the Tiber, or the Vatican, they would be visually seduced, captivated by both her glorious past and present grandeur:

> Par ce moyen, ajoutait le préfet, dès l’entrée de Rome, le voyageur qui arrive de Florence, apercevant au loin, à l’extrémité du Corso, le Capitole, et, à sa droite, au-delà du Tibre, le Vatican (alors caché par les greniers), embrasserait, dans son premier regard jeté sur la reine des nations, sa gloire passée et sa grandeur présente, le siège de son empire temporel, et celui de sa domination spirituelle.\(^{40}\)

Consequently Tournon organized a Commission of Monuments in 1811 to conserve archaeological sites. In its four years vast quantities of earth were removed from the major monuments – the Coliseum, the Pantheon, the Roman

---


\(^{38}\) Driault, p. 537.

\(^{39}\) Nardi, p. 13.

Forum – and properties that encroached upon the ancient buildings were expropriated. Terraces and gardens stretching from Villa Medici to Villa Borghese were also built for promenades. The 1809 decree stated that the Papal lands would be extended until they yielded a revenue of 2 million francs per annum. Within the sphere of agriculture Tournon’s great achievements, asserts Tulard, were the transformation of the Agro Romano into an immense cotton field and the draining of the Pontine Marshes. The inspiration for the Pontine Marshes had been Furius Camillus who had conquered the territory in the Roman age transforming the area into the granary of Rome. Moreover, since this was a French work carried out by Gaspard Riche, France could claim to be the rightful heir of the Romans on the grounds of their engineering accomplishments (Fig. 4.5). Tournon established the ‘Amministrazione delle Paludi Pontine’, which was responsible for approving drainage works, paying salaries, and assigning engineers specifically to the marshes and policing the area. Wheat, sweet corn and beans were planted. Stendhal, writing in 1817, viewed the project as a success, stating that Riche drained the area to the level it had occupied under the Romans, but that the region had been neglected after the French departure.

The French annexation of Rome and its agricultural interventions set a precedent for how Liberal Italy might justify its own presence in the new national capital after 1870. As early as 1871 Hans von Schweinitz, the German ambassador in Venice, asked Minghetti, ‘What have you done to reclaim the Roman campagna?’

41 Gregory, p. 203.
42 Driault, p. 549.
43 ibid., p. 176.
44 Moulard, II, 384.
45 Nardi, p. 133.
The Pontine Marshes

Fig. 4.5

[...] I will be waiting for you there to see what you can do'. Similarly in 1875 Wilhelm I of Germany suggested to Vittorio Emanuele that the best way to 'justify the presence of your government in Rome' was a land reclamation project in the Agro Romano.

The illustration of the Agro Romano from 1870 is a stereotype of the Grand Tour showing two clergymen admiring the ancient ruins along the Via Appia. In the foreground is a peasant who perhaps makes a living as a guide, rather than farming the land (Fig. 4.6). The accompanying article undermines their pleasure in the landscape by emphasizing the agricultural reality of the Agro Romano: it is wasteland – with no irrigated water, no habitation – and renders Rome an oasis in a desert. The romantic language of a tourist’s description of the Via Appia is also inverted into the dangers of the landscape since ‘chi governa quella morta natura è la malaria’. On the one hand the article returns the reader to the glorious Roman age when the territory was farmed and described by Pliny as a ‘viridis simus agris’. On the other hand the decline of the Agro Romano is viewed as a symptom of Italy’s colonial legacy since after the fall of the Roman Empire and the numerous invasions from foreigners it became neglected. Its decline in the modern age is attributed to the Papacy who managed the land poorly and used backward farming methods.

---

47 Chabod, p. 156.
48 ibid., p. 156.
49 ‘L’Agro Romano’, L’Emporio Pittoresco, 9-15 October 1870, pp. 149-51 (p. 149).
50 ibid., p. 149.
51 ibid., p. 150.
Fig. 4.6
Fig. 4.7
The article advocated transforming the Agro Romano into an agriculturally fertile land by encouraging the 'immigration' of labourers. However, the article acknowledges that even the most robust of workers could not endure the 'miasmi della malaria'. An 'immigration' into the Agro Romano occurred when the area was transformed into a penal colony. In 1879 Martino Beltrani-Scalia – chief inspector of the Minister of the Interior – proposed transforming underdeveloped areas into penal colonies, stating that unlike France and England Italy did not have any colonial territories where it could send prisoners. In these internal penal colonies Beltrani-Scalia argued that industrialization could be encouraged through the 'costruzione di strade, della rete ferroviaria, nelle opere di fortificazione del litorale e di escavazione dei porti'. Beltrani-Scali's proposal was based upon the first penal project that had been initiated the previous year in the Agro Romano in an area known as the 'Tre Fontane', owned by Trappist monks. The engineer Filippo Bucci designed portable prisons for the project. These prisons were large huts that could be mounted and dismounted allowing prisoners to be moved in to excavate canals, build rural houses and lay roads (Fig. 4.7). After nine years the drainage was complete and prisoners were replaced with a colony of farmers. For Dubbini the practice of moving prisons and the criminal into the countryside from the urban spaces constituted a form of exorcizing the city from anti-social Other elements: ‘Ci sembra di vedere dunque il tentativo di operare un supremo esorcismo: dissociare il criminale dalla città’.

52 ibid., p. 150.
54 ibid., p. 227.
By the 1890s the countryside as a colonial Other space was directly compared to the colonisation of new territories by imperial nations. One such study in *L’Agricoltura Illustrata* examined German colonies in Brazil where what was of interest in the colonial project was not merely the farming techniques but church architecture, as the aim of the article was to show the relationship between religion and agriculture in the colonisation of a different culture. The article concluded upon the relevance of such projects to Italy where ‘nel nostro paese il problema della colonizzazione interna comincia ed emerge’.

Although the Torlonia project was initiated in Risorgimento Italy, upon completion in the 1870s its reception took place against the developing backdrop of the countryside as a colonial space. After Unification the ruling Northern elite viewed many parts of the Italian countryside as economically unproductive and ‘backward’, associating them with pre-existing political structures and feudal practices. However, the validity of this view has been called into question. Recent studies by Vera Zamagni have enabled her to contest the myth of agrarian ‘backwardness’, arguing that at Unification Italian agriculture was heavily commercialized throughout Italy and could be measured at a level similar to the more industrially advanced nations of France and Switzerland.

The myth of the ‘backward’ countryside may therefore be interpreted as part of the construction of an internal Italian colonial space. Anne Godlewska describes Napoleon’s geographers as ‘soldiers of modernity’ whose mapping of terrain was a

---

56 Zamagni, pp. 56-57.
form of 'intellectual imperialism' used to colonize both Italy and Egypt through their respective ancient civilizations being rescued from the past to be continued in the present through the activities of the modern Empire itself. Godlewska notes that Napoleonic geographers, engineers, and administrators saw themselves as 'missionaries of human progress' and 'high priests of science' who civilized backward cultures. As French 'intellectual imperialism' was used to colonize the Italian peninsula, myths of the 'backward' countryside in Liberal Italy would enable the new ruling classes to continue the work of their Napoleonic predecessors in the countryside, where in this Other colonial space they were also provided with the opportunity to become Roman as a form of Italian patriotism.

4.3 The Roman Prince

Le Prince romain du XIXème siècle n’a pas craint de revendiquer le legs onéreux que le plus grand des Romains de l’antiquité avait laissé à ses successeurs; mais il a su donner à ce legs un caractère bien autrement élevé qu’il ne l’avait dans l’esprit du testateur; c’était une grande, mais égoïste pensée politique qui avait inspiré J. César.58

Alexandre Brisse and Léon de Rotrou, Dessèchement du lac Fucino

After being awarded a contract to provide food provisions for the French army Jean Raymond Torlony arrived in Rome in 1792 following the regiment of General Miollis. By 1801 Jean Torlony – pronounced Torlonia by the Romans – was the wealthiest banker in Rome. The French Jean Torlony was the confidant of Hugues Basseville – the French Ambassador to Rome – and gave financial assistance to Napoleon, while in 1809 the Italian Giovanni Torlonia was admitted to the Roman Patriciate when Pope Pius VII made him a Prince.59 Paralleling his father’s double identity, Alessandro Torlonia, by executing a French land reclamation project, accepted in 1875 the title Prince of Fucino given to him by Vittorio Emanuele at the Quirinale – the Pope’s former residence – amid protests from the Papacy. To mark the occasion Torlonia was presented with a gold medal. On one side was an effigy of the king and the inscription ‘VICTORIUS EMANUEL II ITALIAE REX’.60 On the other side was an image of a crown, with the name

58 Quotations from Brisse and Rotrou have hitherto been given in English as it is a bilingual text; however, this quotation resonates better in French. Brisse and Rotrou, Dessèchement du lac Fucino, p. 220.

59 Torlonia, pp. 8-9.

60 The inscription on the medal read: ‘ALEXANDRO TORLONIAE ROMANO P V/ QUOD FUCINI LACUR/ EMISSIS AQUIS DERIVATISQUE/ ITALIE AGRUM AUXERIT/ OPUS IMPERATORIBUS AC REGIBUS/ FRUSTRA TENTATUM/ AERE SUO EXPLEVERIT/ AB ANNO/ MDCCCLV/ AD ANNUM MDCCCLXXV.’ The quotation is in Giovanni Pini, Il prosciugamento del Lago Fucino, narrazione storica – tecnica dai tempi di Giulio Cesare fino ai giorni nostri (Florence: Carnesecchi, 1878), p. 76.
'ALEXANDRO TORLONIAE' and a dedication to the Prince who had accomplished what had eluded the Roman Emperors, the drainage of Lake Fucino.

In bestowing the title of Prince of Fucino upon Torlonia not only was a French engineering achievement appropriated as Italian, but the myth of the Roman Prince that Torlonia had carefully constructed became incorporated into Liberal Italy's vocabulary as an exemplum of patriotism. In spite of the significance of Torlonia in Liberal Italy, Italian cultural history has neglected this influential figure and his *bonifica* of the Italian countryside, arguably because his French identity presents a more complex picture of Italian patriotism, in which it is constructed as a paradoxical set of emotions where the colonisation of the individual's subjectivity by a foreign Other body becomes an integral part. Torlonia's identity is itself paradoxical since he never claimed to be French or Italian, but the cosmopolitan Roman Prince who rose above national status. His construction of a cosmopolitan Roman identity therefore constitutes a model of how to master and domnate the colonial Other space left vacant after Napoleon's downfall.

Published upon his death, Alessandro Torlonia's autobiography reveals the importance he placed upon fabricating a cosmopolitan identity, since, as we shall see, it is largely based upon fiction. Echoing the mythic beginnings of Rome with Romulus and Remus his origins are in two orphaned brothers, Marin and Jean Torlony, who lived in the Puy-de-Dôme. The elder Marin is a poor herdsman who is inspired by the medieval 'Jacques Bonhomme', who led a revolt against his feudal lords, resulting in peasants abandoning the homeland 'per cercare in terra
straniera asilo e vita’. Thus Marin persuades Jean to likewise leave home and travel to Paris to find a new life. Against the storming of the Bastille, where ‘il popolo grida alla libertà, fa proclamare i diritti dell’uomo, inneggia a Rousseau, a Robespierre, alla Rivoluzione’, the two brothers reflect this liberty financially by becoming shopkeepers and making a small fortune. They then travel with the French army to Italy, where Marin dies upon arrival in Rome. The reality is rather different. Jean was the elder brother of Joseph, who, omitted from the Torlonia history, is rediscovered in a letter of Tournon’s. Described as a slightly ridiculous figure, he is identified as belonging to the ‘dernière classe’, and is poorly educated like his brother, since he had spent his childhood at the back of a shop:

M. Joseph Torlonia appartient à une famille de la dernière classe du peuple [...] Il a peu d’esprit et une tournure ridicule que l’éducation n’a pas corrigée, ayant, ainsi que son frère, passé sa première jeunesse dans le fond d’une boutique.

The Marin of the myth was Jean’s father, who was born in the Puy-de-Dôme in 1725, and worked as a pedlar on the routes to Italy selling an assortment of items – hairpins, garters and religious imagery. He was Jewish and presumably converted to Catholicism when he married an Italian, Maria Angela Lancia, in Siena where Jean was born in 1755. Maria Lancia’s elision from Torlonia’s autobiography is curious – he states that Marin was unmarried – and adds weight to the notion that Torlonia was trying to construct a myth for himself based around the orphaned exiled Other seeking refuge in the cosmopolitan Roman capital, since the

---

61 Torlonia, p. 5.
62 ibid., p. 6.
63 Extract of a letter from Tournon to the Minister of the Interior 5 March 1812. The quotation is in Aimé Dupuy, ‘Un personnage de Stendhal: le banquier romain Torlonia’, Stendhal Club, 15 October 1968, pp. 43-70 (p. 50).
64 ibid., p. 44.
divulging of the mother’s presence in his autobiography would have sabotaged the myth.

If, as Hannah Arendt argues, that societies are founded upon murder – Cain slays Abel, Romulus slaying Remus – the violent beginnings of the Torlonia mythology is the assassination of Basseville in 1793. According to Torlonia the source of their family’s wealth is derived from a sack of gold that Basseville gave to Giovanni Torlonia just days before his murder. However, the Stendhalian, Dupuy, has suggested that Basseville never actually had any gold. Upon Basseville’s death, according to Torlonia, his father, Giovanni, lent the gold back to Napoleon, who reciprocated this act of generosity by opening an account with the Torlonia bank, prompting the European elite – for example Charles IV of Spain, Eliza Bonaparte – to place their money in the bank and General Miollis to deposit the jewels from the sanctuary of Loreto there under the instructions of the French Emperor. The historical event of Basseville’s assassination is described as shaking Italy, and inspiring in ‘nistro Vincenzo Monti, una cantica degna dell’Alighieri’, and thereby situates Torlonia and the source of his family’s ascendancy with the beginning of Italian Romanticism.

Torlonia’s father married into a wealthy Roman patriciate family, and had two sons, Marino (1796-1865) and Alessandro (1800-86). In his autobiography Torlonia describes his brother as the overtly feminine aristocrat: ‘era un bel

---

66 Dupuy, pp. 46-47.
67 Vincenzo Monti’s epic poem, concerning the assassination of Basseville is called the Bassvilliana (1793).
68 Torlonia, pp. 8-9.
giovane, di fattezze regolari, aristocratiche, quasi femminee’. In contrast, he himself is the typical austere patriarchal father, who is uncommunicative – ‘amava poco parlare’ – and forthright in his decisions. However, the narrative of these two brothers is another myth, since Torlonia also had two sisters – Maria Teresa and Maria Luisa – and another brother, Carlo, who, according to historical accounts, Torlonia ‘amava come un altro sé stesso’. These omissions stress the importance Torlonia placed upon structuring an identification between father and son through the mimesis of two brothers and the elision of the third.

For Torlonia his father appears as a role model in what becoming a man means, namely accumulating vast amounts of capital. In Torlonia’s autobiography he recounts a conversation his father had with Stendhal – also recorded in Stendhal’s *Promenades dans Rome* – in which Giovanni prophesies that his son will become richer than all the other Roman Princes put together, and that his sons will become popes:

>A Don Alessandro, che è un vero uomo e conosce il valore del denaro, lascerò la banca: egli n’aumenterà le ricchezze, le estenderà, e un giorno sarà ricco non come un principe, ma come i principi romani tutti insieme; poi, se avrà fortuna, sono sicuro che riuscirà a fare di suo figlio un papa.

As if to ensure that his father’s prophecy would become true, in 1840 Torlonia married into the prestigious Roman patriciate family, the Colonna, whose ancestry included Pope Martin V and could also be traced back to ancient Rome. The matrimony was celebrated as binding together ‘due famiglie per antica e recente

---

69 ibid., p. 10.  
70 ibid., p. 11.  
72 Torlonia, pp. 11-12.
potenza’ where the Colonna family’s ancient glories would be re-invigorated by the prosperity of the Torlonia:

E di tale patrimonio splendidissimo n’è divenuta oggi partecipe la Famiglia Torlonia che secondo la condizione de’ tempi per virtù private, e nella generosità dell’operare e nella splendidezza del vivere emula e rinnova quelle antiche glorie.\(^{73}\)

Although his marriage did not produce any sons that could potentially become popes, Torlonia fulfilled his father’s fantasy of becoming so rich that he could perform the role of a ‘Padre Romano’, whose principal virtue was that nothing prevented him from attaining what he willed:

Il Principe avea questa virtù massima dei padri romani: quanto voleva, ad ogni costo voleva, e nulla gli avrebbe mai impedito, nulla mai gli impedi l’attuazione di un suo volere.\(^{74}\)

On the one hand Torlonia models the Padre Romano on the myth of a saviour. In 1831 he apparently rescued the comune of Rome from bankruptcy through financing their debt and was heralded by the Roman people as the ‘nuovo salvatore di Roma’.\(^{75}\) Aspects of his status as a saviour are modelled upon Napoleon, since he states that even though he lent financial support to the Roman government for three consecutive years he had sufficient surplus wealth to host parties comparable to the Emperor’s lavish affairs in Paris.\(^{76}\) At Villa Nomentana he commissioned an

---

74 Torlonia, p. 20.
75 ibid., p. 13.
76 ibid., p. 13.
immense Roman garden open to the public where no expense was spared in accurately reproducing monuments that testified to the greatness of Rome. The garden was crowned with two obelisks dedicated to his parents, which were sculpted from a pink marble brought from Bavena in Northern Italy. The monumental size of the obelisks is shown in the Napoleonic styled ceremony where they are unveiled to the Roman public to display the power of Torlonia, the Padre Romano (Fig. 4.8).

On the other hand Torlonia’s notion of the Padre Romano is modelled upon a Renaissance-style pope who is patron of the arts, stating that as Rome’s most important patron of the arts he spent one and half a million lire on decorating his lavish villas with works from the finest artists in Europe, and renovating theatres and monuments in Rome. Furthermore as Rome’s wealthiest ‘benefattore dei poveri’ he founded the Conservatorio Torlonia for orphans and ‘tutti i poveri trovavano da lui una buona parola ed un buon aiuto’. 77

Costing over 35 million lire the bonifica of Lake Fucino incorporates both facets of the Padre Romano. 78 Torlonia invents as image of himself in which, as we shall see, he comes both the saviour of the Marsi, who collectively constitute a synecdoche of the Italian people, and its ‘Papal’ ruler in an Other utopian Roman space.

---

77 ibid., p. 22.
78 The approximate equivalent of almost 2 thousand billion lire using ISTAT values from Le regioni in cifre (ISTAT: Rome, 1994), p. 132.
Fig. 4.8
4.4 The Fall of Rome

On 17 June 1846 the Conclave at the Quirinal elected the Bishop of Imola, Mastai-Ferretti, to become the next pope, Pius IX. Pius had replaced Gregory XVI whose reign was considered repressive and who had openly opposed the values of the French Revolution – in his early career as an abbot he had been expelled from Rome by Napoleon I. After election a new pope was expected to mark the beginning of his reign with acts of generosity – for example giving a dowry to a thousand girls and an amnesty to prisoners. However, owing to continual unrest Rome’s prisons were full of political prisoners and so the amnesty that Pius authorized was interpreted across the peninsula as the acts of a liberal Pope. Consequently Pius was heralded as the first liberal Pope and the freed prisoners were treated like heroes with banquets and processions held in their honour. The streets were filled with *evvivas* when he passed and flowers showered from balconies above. Processions were made to the Quirinal Palace where crowds shouted until he came onto the balcony to bless them. As Owen Chadwick puts it, the ‘Pope was embarrassingly popular’.

From the beginning of Pius’s pontificate the neo-Guelph dream of the Pope as the head of a federal Italy, appeared as if it might become a reality, although the Pope expressed no such views himself. Unlike his predecessor, who even prevented the introduction of railways into the Papal States for fear of the new ideas they might bring, Pius was open to modern thinking. He travelled by train, and under his first Secretary of State, the liberal Cardinal Gizzi, reforming censorship laws in the

---

80 ibid., p. 65.
Papal States to make them the ‘freest in Western Europe apart from Britain’. The Austrian occupation of Ferrara in July 1847 was the principal event that labelled Pius a liberal Pope who would lead a federal Italy. Austria had occupied Ferrara in 1831 to quell civil disobedience under the instructions of Pope Gregory. On this occasion Pius protested at the Austrian occupation until the troops finally left the city in December of that year. Pius’s actions were interpreted as those of the defender of Italy and this interpretation was reflected in Garibaldi’s gesture of offering his sword to a representative of the Pope upon hearing the news in South America. And yet within two years Papal Rome fell and Pius, now deemed a traitor, fled the city only to return in 1850 under the protectorate of Napoleon III, where he dedicated his religious life to the Dogma of the Immaculate Conception, which he promulgated in 1854. Just as Augustine wrote *The City of God* upon the sacking of Rome in 410 by Alaric the Goth, Torlonia’s re-ordering of Lake Fucino may be read as a response to the events that led to the Risorgimento fall of Rome.

Chadwick argues that although Pius wanted an Italy free from foreign occupation, he recognized that these aspirations were incompatible with the temporal sovereignty of the Pope. The belief that the Pope was liberal was a product of neo-Guelph fantasies – for example when in February 1848 Pius asked for God’s blessing on Italy, the people imagined that he was blessing their liberal ideals, while in the *Cinque Giornate* revolution in March 1848 (considered in the next chapter) the Milanese supposed that Pius was endorsing violence against another Catholic country, that of Austria. The

---

81 ibid., pp. 66-67.
82 ibid., p. 71.
83 ibid., p. 72.
fantasy love affair that the Italian people had with the Pope, believing that he
could be more than a Pope – the vicar of Christ and the ruler of a federal
Italy – ended when Pius made an allocution to the cardinals on 29 April 1848
stating that as the vicar of Christ he could not declare war on the occupying
Austrian force:

I am the vicar of Christ, the author of peace and lover of charity, and my
office is to bestow an equal affection on all nations. I repudiate all the
newspaper articles that want the pope to be president of a new republic of
all the Italians.\textsuperscript{84}

Across the peninsula Italian patriots interpreted his allocution as the condemnation
of the Risorgimento’s aspirations. Pius was now viewed as a traitor and Rome
became increasingly agitated as crowds began protesting against him. As a result
of the \textit{Cinque Giornate} revolution Austrian troops led by General Radetzky had
encroached onto the Papal States in their battles against Carlo Alberto, the king of
Piedmont who led an army of predominantly Italian volunteers. The Roman
government wanted to declare war against Austria, but the Pope refused, causing
Prime Minister Mamiani to resign.\textsuperscript{85} Moreover, scenes of Papal soldiers wounded
by the Austrian army returning home intensified the unrest in Rome and
culminated in a revolution.

As often is the case, the revolution began with a violent murder, the assassination
of the new Prime Minister, the Swiss Pellegrino Rossi, on the opening day of

\textsuperscript{84} ibid., p. 77.
\textsuperscript{85} ibid., p. 79
parliament (15 November 1848). As Rossi walked into the Senate crowds shouted ‘Abbasso Rossi’ and ‘Morte a Rossi!’, and as he ascended the staircase three men attacked him, one driving a hunting knife into his throat. The murderer was protected by the Reduci (Roman guards) who escorted him out of the building covered with one of their cloaks. Descriptions of Rossi’s death at the hands of a mob, of crowds applauding Rossi’s murderer with shouts of ‘Viva Bruto Secondo’ and ‘Benedetta quella mano, che il Rossi pugnalò’, or showing contempt for Rossi’s widow by singing the psalm Miserere outside her house, or wanting to deny Rossi a Catholic burial by disposing of his body at Porta Leone where the carcasses of animals were buried, horrified Europe. To the world these scenes of violence evoked the fear that Rome, the universal capital of Catholicism, had fallen at the hands of the barbarians once more.

Upon his return to Rome in 1850 Pius formulated the Dogma of the Immaculate Conception of the Virgin Mary. In the nineteenth century the cult of the Immaculate Conception was widespread in France, Spain and in some parts of Italy, constituting a popular form of Catholic devotion. The Church had resisted promulgating the Dogma for many centuries due to the question of original sin; in spite of Mary’s purity, she could not be exonerated from sin as she was born of human flesh. The Dogma stated that to question the purity of the virgin is the foundation for excommunication, since Pius states that those who believe that the Virgin was tainted with original sin ‘are to know that they have wrecked the faith

---

87 ibid., pp. 440-44.
and separated themselves from the unity of the Church'. Thus, the faith of each individual worshipper will now be measured by the extent to which they believe in an ideal of female virginity.

The Dogma was greatly welcomed across Europe – Queen Isabella of Spain sent a tiara, in Vienna a court procession was held around a statue of the Virgin erected in 1647 and in Naples it was put in army orders. Chadwick argues that the Dogma transformed the European image of the pope and the Catholic Church into an ‘otherworldly’ place and an ‘enclosure of piety’. Extending Chadwick’s observations I would like to suggest that the Dogma created an image of a free liberal Rome, but one that was only available through spiritual communion. Moreover, the processions and military exercises displaying devotion to the Dogma of the Immaculate Conception illustrate how through such ritualistic performativities Rome was no longer fixed to a singular geographical location, but became a psychical space experienced at any location through devotion to an ideal of female virginity (Fig. 4.9). The conceptualization of Rome as an Immaculate uterine space, relocated onto a transcendental plane, ensured that it could never fall at the hands of the barbarians again.

In the bonifica of Lake Fucino I would like to suggest that statues of the Virgin Mary are placed across the Torlonia estate to create an ‘otherworldly’ place. And yet rather than an Immaculate Roman space existing in the psyche of the faithful through prayer, Torlonia is realizing this utopian psychical space. Prior to the

---

88 Chadwick, p. 121.
89 Ibid., p. 123.
La religiosità di Ferdinando II: per la definizione del dogma dell’Immacolata concezione, l’esercito napoletano viene fatto sfilare sul campo di Marte nel gennaio 1855. Engraving in Museum of San Martino, Naples.
lake’s drainage Torlonia placed cast iron statues of the Blessed Virgin along the lake’s shoreline to demarcate the boundaries of what would be the reclaimed land. Each statue carried an inscription expressing Torlonia’s devotion to the Virgin –

A DIVOZIONE DI ALESSANDRO TORLONIA POSTA SULLE SPONDE DEL FUCINO ANNO MDCCCLXII (Fig. 4.10). Upon the completion of the project Torlonia re-expressed his devotion to the Virgin Mary by placing a six metre high monumental statue of her on the emissary head (Fig. 4.11). The inscription on the central panel of the pedestal not only intertwines the Dogma with Torlonia’s execution of the project, but boasts that Torlonia has accomplished that which the Caesars only aspired:

MARIA
SINE LABE CONCEPTA
AVSPICE
OPUS AB IMPERATORIBVS
REGIBVSQVE
FRVSTRA TENTATVM
ALEXANDER TORLONIA
ROMANVS V.P
INGENTI ANIMI
ET AERIS VI
COEPIT A.D. MDCCCLIV
PERFECTIT A.D. MDCCCLXXVI

In contrast to the purity of the statue of the Virgin Mary, the moral decay of the Claudian emissary is indicated by its lack of a commemorative statue. Brisse and Rotrou write that when Emperor Hadrian attempted to repair the Claudian emissary he did not place a statue upon it, since it was so defective a structure that it would have been ‘like a head of Apollo or Venus on the body of a monster’.90

Thus in placing a statue of the virgin Mary upon the emissary head Torlonia is claiming that the *bonifica* of Lake Fucino has been accomplished due to its

---

90 Brisse and Rotrou, *Dessèchement du lac Fucino*, p. 46.
Fig. 4.10
A statue of a Madonna. From Agostinoni, *Il Fucino* (see Fig. 4.3), p. 32.
Fig. 4.11
The statue of the Virgin Mary. Author’s photograph.
execution by a righteous ruler, whose love is founded upon the grace of the Immaculate Conception.

The moral decay of pagan Rome is intended to be read as a metaphor for contemporary decadence, as that which does not fit into Torlonia's image of modern Holy Roman Italy. For example although Brisse and Rotrou describe the surrounding landscape as beautiful, they argue that the aesthetic pleasure in this beauty is founded upon a pagan history; they state that the mountains surrounding the lake are covered by woods sacred to the goddess Angitia, the name of Avezzano (the capital of the region) is derived from Janus the god of the Sabines, the Campi Palentini, which the tunnels traverse, were consecrated to Pales.\textsuperscript{91} This adoration of the pagan pleasure of the landscape is seen by Brisse and Rotrou as responsible for the contemporary 'evils' of a lake that engulfs man's ambitions:

\begin{quote}
This beauty was no compensation to the inhabitants of the shores for the evils which the lake produced; when we remember that all these villages were constantly threatened with being swallowed up by the lake, we can easily understand that the population of the district has, in all times, most ardently desired to see the lake disappear, preferring a sense of safety to the enjoyment of the picturesque.\textsuperscript{92}
\end{quote}

If inauguration ceremonies may be thought of as rituals that convey the symbolic meanings that the work will rest upon, Brisse and Rotrou's descriptions of the ancient and modern inauguration ceremonies reveal the extent to which the Torlonia project constructs itself as a realized Italian \textit{civitas dei}, and thus a neo-

\textsuperscript{91} ibid., pp. 224-26.
\textsuperscript{92} Ibid., p. 227.
Guelph fantasy. The Claudian ceremony consisted of gladiatorial sea games in which two fleets manned with 19,000 convicts fought in what was considered the ‘greatest sham sea fight ever witnessed’. Historians, such as Ramsay, question Suetonius and Tacitus’s descriptions of the event, asserting that they ‘must surely be an exaggeration’. The Torlonia presentation exploited Suetonius’s exaggerated characterizations and Tacitus’s epic style as empirical evidence, seeking to intensify the distorted reality of pagan Rome.

At the core of this distorted reality is the impotence of the Emperor Claudius, dominated by his wife, Agrippina, who eventually murders him so that her son Nero will become Emperor. Claudius is depicted with his imperial purples, his wife in golden chlamys with young Nero at his side. Poised to start battle the convicts await the Emperor’s command. In spite of the signals for action to begin, the convicts remain still because they misunderstand Claudius’s command, believing that he had spared their lives. Claudius becomes enraged at their disobedience and battle only commences when the Praetorian soldiers attack the convicts. The festival concludes with the emissary opening and Claudius nearly drowning due to the emissary flooding as the water entered the tunnel at too fast a rate. The Claudian tunnel’s defects are a result of a lust for power, which the gladiatorial sea games symbolize. This lust will always make Rome fall.

Juxtaposed with the Claudian sea games is the Torlonia inauguration ceremony on 9 August 1862, which had ‘none of that theatrical and fantastical pomp, but it was

---

93 ibid., p. 38
in reality by far more grand and really touching'. Unlike the ancient Roman crowds, those 'who lined the shores of the lake were not composed of people eager for pleasure and for sanguinary exhibitions; but of thousands of families filled with admiration for the work of Prince Torlonia, which to them seemed almost miraculous'. The crowd patiently waited for the benediction of the works by the Bishop of Marsica, and as they waited they prayed, their prayers mingling thanks to the 'Almighty' with those to their 'spiritual chief' – Prince Torlonia – for finally having their 'vows' realized, that of draining Lake Fucino. The sound of the roaring water 'mingled' with cries of evviva to the Madonna and to Torlonia and this created the impression that it was a 'supernatural' event accomplished through superhuman forces, Torlonia being one of them:

The roar of the water as it rushed violently into the tunnel, sounded like the awful rolling of subterranean thunder, and formed, so to say, a fantastic and supernatural accompaniment to the rejoicing of the multitude who, in their emotion, mingled evvivas to the Madonna with those to Prince Torlonia!

Vincenzo Gioberti's Del primato morale e civile degli italiani (1843), which advocated that the Pope should be the head of the Italian nation and that Rome should be its capital, initiated the neo-Guelph fantasy. Gioberti stated that Italian primacy in the world was founded upon its possession of the Holy See, which had been bound to Italy for eighteen centuries. If the neo-Guelph fantasy affair ended when Pius made his allocution, the subsequent anger against him might be considered as a collective inability to accept that the Pope can only occupy one

96 ibid., pp. 131-32.
97 ibid., pp. 132.
98 ibid., p. 132.
99 ibid., p. 132.
role, that of the Vicar of Christ. The modern bonifica of Lake Fucino might be read as a way in which he seeks to circumvent the limitedness of this reality by Torlonia's adoption of the role of the Padre Romano, who can be both the ruler and spiritual chief of the Marsi, a synecdoche for Italy itself. One of the ways in which these neo-Guelph tendencies are made apparent is in the chosen initiation and completion dates of the project. The initiation date, 1854, coincides with the date of the promulgation of the Dogma, and the completion date, 1876, constructs the time frame of 22 years. The project could have equally been deemed complete in 1872 when the drainage had finished, but by choosing 1876, Torlonia also located his project within Liberal Italy's patriotic obsession with commemorating the revolutionary number 22, the duration of the 22 years of the Risorgimento Wars of Independence from 1848 to 1870 (discussed in Chapter Five). In assessing the Torlonia emissary through its presentation at the Philadelphia Centennial Exhibition, I intend to explore how it might be thought of as an archive of what Rome and Italy could be. By thinking of the *bonifica* as a heterotopic archive it will enable us to explore how Torlonia assembles a new Catholic myth of Rome by shifting back and forth in time, between an ancient Roman world and a future modern Italy. I shall use Augustine's conception of Rome as a model of two cities—*civitas terrena* and *civitas dei*—as the analytical instrument to examine how the archive is assembled.
4.5 *Civitas Terrena*

And it was not because Troy lost Minerva that Troy perished. What loss did Minerva herself first incur that led to her own disappearance? Was it, perhaps, the loss of her guards? There can be no doubt that their death made her removal possible – the image did not preserve the men; the men were preserving the image. Why then did they worship her, to secure her protection for their country and its citizens? She could not guard her own keepers.\(^{100}\)

St Augustine, *Concerning the City of God against the Pagans*

Virgil’s *Aeneid* is a story of migration where after the fall of Troy the Trojans begin a journey which ends in Latium. Their leader, Aeneas, becomes a king of Alba Longa and an ancestor of the mother of Romulus, the founder of Rome. The epic depicts the fall of Troy and the final resting place in the Alban hills as being governed by a divine command and it is a significant component in the myth of an eternal mission for Rome.\(^{101}\) This myth is the foundation stone of *civitas terrena* or Pagan Rome in *The City of God*, where Augustine demonstrates that belief in such myths and the accompanying worshipping of false idols builds a city that sees the world not as it is, but as it is imagined. The destruction of Troy, he argues, may be interpreted in two ways that centre upon the potency of Minerva, the virgin female goddess whose statue was the Palladium that protected the city. Troy’s fall is explained as either the loss of Minerva, or that of her guardians who were slain. However, if Minerva could not protect even her keepers then why did the Trojans continue believing in the potency of the statue? For Augustine the inference to draw is that her image did not preserve man but rather it was man who preserved...
her image, nourishing a belief in Minerva's maternal powers even if in reality the statue was an inanimate object.

At the Centennial Exhibition in Philadelphia, Torlonia's engineers emphasize the defects in the execution of the Claudian emissary to show how those that look towards a past glorious Rome from the ruins of the present in a sense worship false idols. To reconstruct an immoral pagan Roman space Brisse and Rotrou utilize the same Roman sources presented in Grand tourist guides of the emissary – Suetonius, Pliny and Tacitus. If Augustine's \textit{City of God} is a political excursus upon what the right relations are for governing a kingdom, in the Torlonia presentation the Claudian pagan space is ruled, as we shall see, by a maternal symbolic economy in contrast to the modern Fucino estate governed by the \textit{Padre Romano}.

Brisse and Rotrou build the psychological motivations of Claudius by referring to Suetonius's \textit{Lives of the Caesars}, which sought to explain the Caesars's political actions by character alone.\footnote{Andrew Wallace-Hadrill, \textit{Suetonius: The Scholar and his Caesars} (London: Duckworth, 1983), p. 160.} Suetonius's presentation of Claudius as a man dominated by self-interest with a sadistic streak goes unchallenged by Brisse and Rotrou, who portray Claudius as having a 'vain love of glory, and of gain', which governs his choice of Narcissus (his freedman) to execute the project.\footnote{Brisse and Rotrou, \textit{Dessèchement du lac Fucino}, pp. 13-14.}

Tacitus's \textit{Annals} provide the Virgilian elements of Torlonia's \textit{civitas terrena}. They have an epic style that is often compared to Virgil's, while the sense of doom that falls over the house of Caesar in the first six books – Books \textit{vii} to \textit{x} are missing –
parallel that of the house of Atreus. The reign of Claudius – Books XI and XII – is an account of a maternal masochistic symbolic economy, where Book XI is the story of the dominance of Messsalina, Claudius’s first wife, and Book XII is that of the second wife, Agrippina, who is the dominant figure in Brisse and Rotrou’s civitas terrena. Ramsay has described Tacitus’s Agrippina as a mixture of ‘savage maternal instinct and insatiate personal ambition unexampled in history’. Agrippina’s plan to murder her husband in Tacitus’s account is part of her ambition to seize power for her own son Nero, before Claudius’s natural heir, Britannicus, has reached manhood. In Brisse and Rotrou’s description, her maternal instinct and the incumbent dynastic rule is the sin that prompts the abandonment of the Claudian emissary:

Knowing the enmity which existed between Agrippina and Narcissus, we can easily imagine what happened when the Empress took the reins of government during the first years of Nero’s reign; the favourite of Claudius fell into disgrace, and the hatred which the son of Agrippina bore to the memory of his predecessor, caused him to abandon the enterprise.

In contrast Brisse and Rotrou utilize Pliny’s account of the Claudian emissary in his Natural History to rescue the accomplishments of Roman engineering from this immoral former civilization. Pliny wrote of the aqueducts and emissaries which stretched from the Alban hills into Rome supplying it with water, that there was ‘nothing to be found more worthy of our admiration throughout the whole

---

105 ibid., p. xxii.
106 Brisse and Rotrou, Dessèchement du lac Fucino, p. 41.
Their ineffable quality is borne out in Pliny’s description of the Claudian emissary, which leaves him speechless for its cost and the multitude of workmen employed. The labourers’ heroic effort of chiselling through solid rock ‘in the midst of darkness’ is an experience that ‘no human language can possibly describe’. Brisse and Rotrou appropriate Pliny’s account into the concept of Roman engineering as a ‘superhuman’ endeavour:

> For those who have been enabled to study in all their parts the works then executed at Lake Fucino, can understand the admiration with which they must have inspired Pliny who saw them in active operation; It was an enterprise which for those times seemed really superhuman.109

Brisse and Rotrou admire the Roman works – ‘the precision [...] is truly astonishing’ – and reconstruct the Roman engineer’s idea for the project.110 The engineer had been able to calculate the level of the two extreme points of the emissary – at one end its lowest part in the lake basin and at the other end the point of the water’s emission into the river Liri below. They argue that the Roman engineer’s calculations were so accurate that he had designed the tunnel so that it would have a gradient of 1.5 metres per km and this testifies to his brilliance ‘whose name, history, with great injustice, has not preserved’.111

And yet, after inspecting the ruined emissary Brisse and Rotrou state that it was apparent that the tunnel’s cross-section had deviated in its execution. They

---

108 ibid., p. 354.
109 Brisse and Rotrou, *Dessèchement du lac Fucino*, p. 15.
110 ibid., p. 16.
111 ibid., p. 24.
conclude that the Roman engineer as a ‘man of genius’ would not have permitted such variations in the tunnel’s dimensions, and after determining the tunnel’s gradient would not have inserted counter slopes, whose summits were often higher than the emissary entrance:

It was evident to those who studied this work after its eighteen centuries of existence, that the man of genius who had conceived such a design would never have lent his aid to destroy his own work; that he who had been at the trouble of calculating the proportions which the tunnel was to have had, would never have committed the enormous fault of changing it so much in the execution.\textsuperscript{112}

The faults in the emissary, they conclude, must have occurred during the execution of the project and so the corrupt world of Claudius and Narcissus is blamed for the errors in the emissary’s construction. Corresponding to this theory, Brisse and Rotrou produce a series of carefully measured cross-sections of Mount Salviano and the Claudian emissary that illustrate that the tunnel’s deviancy occurred in its execution and not in its design. I would like to consider how these cross-sections might be considered as one of the ways in which Brisse and Retrou assemble what I have described as an archive of a maternal pagan Rome. This archive, I would like to suggest, allows Brisse and Rotrou to prise the genius of the Roman engineer from \textit{civitas terrena}, and in so doing re-archive him into \textit{civitas dei} through identifying their engineering expertise with this former engineer.

\textsuperscript{112} ibid., p. 25.
The longitudinal section of the ‘tunnels of Claudius’ shows the ‘ancient work with the principal imperfections and irregularities of its invert and arch’ (Fig. 4.12). These imperfections are framed within the dramatic image of Mount Salviano whose slopes, which in reality can be ‘ascended without excessive difficulty’, have been transformed into an inaccessible ‘needle’. If the illustration encourages a Romantic fantasy of a mountain with a Roman ruin on the edge of a lake, these sentiments are punctured by the scientific explanation that accompanies the plate, which states that the dramatic image is the result of standard scaling used by engineers. The illustration therefore constitutes a sort of anatomical dissection of a Romantic fantasy.

Hoare’s account of the Claudian emissary – discussed in the introduction – with its sense of admiration for the Roman works, was a typical remark induced upon the sight of the emissary’s impressive cunicoli or subterranean passageways – the Cunicolo Maggiore had a depth of 75 metres and rose to 500 metres above the banks of the lake (Fig. 4.13). In their longitudinal section Brisse and Rotrou only depict the cunicoli they reopened in the construction of the Torlonia tunnel to permit the workmen to circulate freely, and thereby banish any residual psychical elements of Romanticism – picturesque ruins and ghosts – by re-invigorating their original function. The quantity of cunicoli and shafts are described as making the Claudian emissary the most ‘extraordinary construction’ of ancient Rome, alluding to the typical Grand tourist’s fantasies of Roman engineering excellence:

---

113 ibid., p. 234.
114 ibid., p. 234.
Fig. 4.12
Fig. 4.13
Cunicolo Maggiore. From Agostinoni, *Il Fucino* (see Fig. 4.3), p. 17.
If the tunnel of Claudius was far from being a masterpiece, as regards its execution, it was nevertheless the most extraordinary construction of ancient Rome, both for its boldness and for the number of subterranean works it had required.\textsuperscript{115}

And yet such praise is misplaced, since as Brisse and Rotrou point out, the \textit{cunicoli} and shafts represent an extraordinary amount of accessory works needed to construct the emissary, which ‘they did very badly’.\textsuperscript{116}

\textit{Cunicoli} were usually dug to attack cities. It is this function that appears to be reinvigorated in Brisse and Rotrou’s representation of the \textit{cunicoli} and shafts, which are labelled and numbered along the mountain ridge like an army poised to attack the Roman city below using the weapons of mathematical verity (Fig. 4.12). The ordering of numbers corresponds to those of the Neapolitan engineer Afan de Rivera, who cleared the tunnel in the 1830s for the King of Naples. His work was viewed highly by Brisse and Rotrou and the adoption of his numbering system connects their work to an immediate Italian predecessor. The tunnel is vertically segmented from underneath by a series of measurements which calculate the distance between the Claudian emissary and the plateau above, and therefore render the entire space numerically knowable.

The numbering and labelling gives the earth, a female gendered space, the appearance of a body undergoing surgery. At the centre of this image of a ‘female body’ is an area of clay saturated with water, which is depicted as an aquatic blue chamber (G) covered with a thin skin of earth. It is possible to see the aqueous

\textsuperscript{115} ibid., p. 23.  
\textsuperscript{116} ibid., p. 235.
region as resembling an expanding womb which presses against the organs situated in the earth’s belly (ventre) – that of the other tissue types such as sand, compact rock, and limestone. This claim may not seem so far fetched when we remember that the foundation of the Torlonia bonifica is the Immaculate Conception and the belief that her womb is pure. The region itself was, according to Brisse and Retrou, hazardous to tunnel through owing to its high water content, and caused the Roman tunnel to deviate. The Roman shafts 18 and 19 sought to control this ‘uterine space’, whereas Torlonia’s engineers sunk shaft 18a ‘in order to facilitate the construction of the Torlonia tunnel, which in this part was exceptionally difficult’. The longitudinal section and its ‘uterine space’ might be read as a metaphor of pagan Rome and its maternal symbolic economy.

Distinct from the corruption of pagan Rome is the Roman engineer whom Brisse and Rotrou praise for his expertise. The aim of this praise is to identify the Torlonia emissary with the expertise of the Roman engineer so that paradoxically the larger modern tunnel will be viewed as a model of the Roman engineer’s idea set against the smaller Claudian emissary, which will be deemed an inferior copy.

The paradox between the model and the copy is most apparent in the plate which compares the cross-sections of the Roman tunnel with those of the Torlonia (Fig. 4.14). The cross-sections invite the viewer to make a ‘just’ comparison between the two tunnels, and therefore to identify one as a superior model to the other. Brisse and Rotrou state that from this comparison the plate will enable the viewer to comprehend the extent to which the Torlonia emissary is a ‘work of’

117 ibid., p. 100
Fig. 4.14
Brisse and Rotrou, *Atlas* (see Fig. 4.12), detail of Plate V.
Fig. 4.15
Close-up of Fig. 4.14.
reconstruction’, implying that they have reconstructed the Roman engineer’s idea. The model status of the Torlonia tunnel, compared to the poor copy that is the Claudian emissary, is founded upon the ability to follow the direction of the emissary that the Roman engineer advocated, and not deviate when penetrating the ‘womb’ of the earth. I shall therefore call this direction of the emissary the ‘line of desire’, which the Torlonia tunnel mathematically pursues in three ways to demonstrate its worthiness as a model.

First is size: the Torlonia tunnel has a sectional area on average three times those of the Roman. Size enables the Torlonia tunnel to demolish its ‘imperfect’ adversary and become the model of the Roman engineer’s idea:

This Roman emissary, in spite of its celebrity, and of the numerous descriptions and discussions to which it has given rise in the course of eighteen centuries, was very imperfectly known, till quite recently, when it was found necessary to demolish it entirely in order to replace it by the tunnel of Prince Torlonia, a much greater work and which has at last accomplished its object.

Second is hardness and strength, which is essential for negotiating the pressing clay of high water content in the aqueous region. The Claudian emissary is lined with coarse concrete – *opus caementitium* – whose hydraulic properties were not as good as the traditional *pozzolana*, and is further evidence of poor execution. It is depicted as a twisted and crippled organ that requires wooden beams and struts so that it can maintain its shape and withstand the pressure of water from

---

118 ibid., p. 239.
119 ibid., pp. 15-16.
120 ibid., p. 28.
above (Fig. 4.15). In contrast, the Torlonia tunnel is lined in ‘dressed stone of the finest quality’, and its soft pink coloration and consistent dimensions liken it to a healthy organ.121

Finally is performance: the act of following the ‘line of desire’ is adequated to a smooth and successful penetration of the ‘womb’ of the earth. Each profile is numbered according to its distance from the benchmark of zero, the outlet of the river Liri – for example number 240 is taken 2.4 km from the outlet. The numbering allows the viewer to compare the performance of both tunnels as they approach the hazardous conditions around the aqueous tissue – corresponding to shafts 18 and 19 – which begins at profile 283 and ends at 334. Unlike the smooth trajectory of the Torlonia tunnel, the Claudian emissary begins to recoil from the ‘line of desire’, deviating so much from ‘the general direction’ that it is abandoned:

The profile 334 is taken in part of the tunnel, in which the Roman Emissary deviated so much from the general direction of the modern one, that it had to be wholly abandoned for a new and more direct course.122

Due to the unequal pressure of the earth, which would have forced the Torlonia emissary towards it, this section of the Claudian emissary is lined with solid masonry and sealed up. The remaining profiles that lead towards the mouth of the Claudian emissary serve to illustrate how ineffective the emissary was as it was flooded with water. The last profile, 563 – twelve metres from the entrance – points to the complete destruction of the emissary as its shape can be barely

121 ibid., p. 242.
122 ibid., p. 241.
discerned from the 'detached rocks, clay and sand' while 'the water cut itself a passage so violently as to carry stones and fragments of walls along with it'.

Just as the Claudian emissary was poorly executed, so its weir, which controlled the flow of water into the tunnel, is shown to be faulty. The Roman weir is comprised of a double basin (Fig. 4.16). The two basins are located on an axis E F, which indicates the direction of water into the tunnel. The larger basin (on the left) had a trapezium structure and was located at the head of the emissary and covered in an 18 metre high façade (P). The second smaller basin (on the right) was originally thought to have a hexagonal structure and was situated 5.5 metres higher than the trapezium basin and therefore 5.5m higher that the entrance to the emissary. The water passed into the hexagonal basin and then along a canal towards a vaulted square chamber (Q) at the same height. When the water arrived at Q it would then cascade into the lower larger trapezium basin. For Brisse and Rotrou the overall design of the weir is that of a good hydraulic engineer but the design is flawed by the 5.5 metres height difference between the hexagonal basin and the mouth of the emissary, which caused the emissary to flood. Evidence that Narcissus corrupted the engineer’s intention of having both basins excavated to the same depth is found in Tacitus, whose *Annals* testify to the 'carelessness of its construction':

The spectacle over, the waterway was opened, when the carelessness of its construction was at once apparent; for it had not been carried down to the bottom or even to the average depth of the lake. The channel therefore had to be deepened.

---

123 ibid., p. 241.
Fig. 4.16
Brisse and Rotrou, *Atlas* (see Fig. 4.12), Plate VI.
In their recounting of these events Brisse and Rotrou confer the masculine role of the expert hydraulic engineer upon Agrippina, who explains to an ineffectual Claudius how the work was poorly executed. She draws attention to the height difference of the hexagonal basin, recognizing that it was 5.48 metres higher than the tunnel entrance, and that the lake would not sink more than 6.67 metres. For Brisse and Rotrou her utterance is ‘nothing else than the numerical demonstration of the words of Tacitus.’ In transforming Agrippina into a ‘maternal ruler’ Brisse and Rotrou elide Tacitus’s ensuing statement: ‘Nor did Narcissus fail to retort charging her with extravagant ambition and all the evil passions of her sex.’ Deleuze notes that masochistic descriptions display ‘frappées de décence’ towards the sexualized domineering mother. Brisse and Rotrou’s display of decency towards Agrippina permits her position as the ruler, in place of the rightful ruler, Emperor Claudius. However, by disavowing avenues into Agrippina’s sexual presence, I would like to suggest that she becomes an image of the castrated pagan uterine woman whose rule is unable to give life to new ideas. Within this context it is apparent that Brisse and Retrou’s representation of the construction of the Claudian emissary conveys how the wrong relations for political rule create an infertile world, that is unable to give birth to the Roman engineer’s idea.

---

126 ibid., p. 248.
6. **Civitas Dei**

The city which begat us according to the flesh still remains; thanks be to God! If only it would also be spiritually reborn, and go over into eternity!\(^{129}\)

St Augustine, *Sermo 105.9*

Thus the angels, illuminated by that light by which they were created, themselves became light, and are called ‘day’, by participating in the changeless light and day, which is the Word of God, through whom they themselves and all other things were made.\(^ {130}\)

St Augustine, *Concerning the City of God against the Pagans*

For Augustine, dreams of a City of God transmuted into flesh are fantasies that ultimately prevent man from seeing the world as it is, barring his transcendence from image to reality and therefore his earthly pilgrimage towards becoming a citizen of the heavenly Christian *patria*.\(^ {131}\) The foundation of these dreams is in myths of a divine mission for Rome that the *Aeneid* presented and which were Christianized by theologians such as Origen and Eusebius, who viewed the unification of *orbis Romanus* under pagan emperors as paralleling the Old Testament while the Holy Roman Empire paralleled the New.\(^ {132}\) Consequently after the sack of Rome in 410 many Romans began returning to the dark spaces of *civitas terrena* and pagan worship, believing that the neglect of these gods had somehow prompted this uninvited event, as the loss of Minerva had resulted in the fall of Troy. In contrast, as Markus asserts, Augustine wanted to show that Rome

\(^{129}\) The quotation from the sermon of Augustine is in Markus, p. 39.

\(^{130}\) Augustine, *The City of God*, Book XI, Chapter 9, p. 441.

\(^{131}\) Markus, pp. 38-39, interprets Augustine’s ‘operative sigh’ in the first epigraph as the recognition that a City of God as an institution, born through the Christianization of the Empire, is a myth.

\(^{132}\) ibid., pp. 47-48.
was a theologically neutral space subject to traumatic events, which could be correlated not to a divine intervention from either a pagan or Christian God but to the historical reality in which the city was situated. Cities were, as Augustine argued, ‘nothing but a multitude of men linked by a social bond’, and so what would define Rome’s future would not be the result of divine intervention but the manner in which its citizens responded to uninvited events.

If one of the City of God’s objectives is to break the spell of a divine mission cast over Rome, it is also in Augustine’s descriptions of the civitas dei that he accomplishes this aim, since it is an aerial invisible city of light, a psychical space of God’s love that has an other worldly quality which defies its transmutation into a material edifice. In contrast, Torlonia transmutes civitas dei into flesh by creating the Immaculate Conception as a built monumental space. As a result of transmuting into material substance an aspect of religious faith, which hinges upon the purity of the Virgin’s sexual organs, I see a process of territorialization of a pagan uterine space by a paternal figure. I shall therefore explore the degree to which a new ‘archival’ Roman space of the Immaculate Virgin is constructed through the bonifica of the Fucino basin symbolically representing a cleansing of a uterine space.

Torlonia as the executor of the bonifica is the model for what the father means as a higher principle than Italy, that of Rome. On the one hand his image of masculinity has naturally evolved from Julius Caesar. Thus the Caesar’s idea of

133 ibid., p. 55.
134 The quotation is in Markus, p. 62.
draining Lake Fucino is presented as a test of masculinity, since it was ‘so bold’
that when Claudius finally dared attempt to realize it, the result was nothing but a
‘caricature’.\textsuperscript{135} In contrast Torlonia’s perfect execution of Caesar’s idea means that
he has passed the test, and this renders him the greatest modern Roman, as his
natural predecessor is ‘the greatest man of ancient Rome’.

On the other hand Torlonia is a Christian whose motto \textit{pertransit beneficiendo} –
‘he went about doing good’ – is from Acts (10.38), where Luke describes Christ’s
power to heal people possessed with demons and thereby purify their flesh.\textsuperscript{136} The
image of Christ is central to Torlonia’s own mythology as Italy’s saviour, curing
the nation of its demonic flesh by the miraculous \textit{bonifica} of Lake Fucino. Situated
outside the nation, Torlonia’s ‘acts’ are inspired by a ‘Christian sentiment of love
towards humanity’, where his ‘vivifying’ breath, like Christ’s kiss, ushers in the
promised resurrection of the Italian body after nineteen centuries of dreams, which
a female gendered Italy praises by conferring ‘the purest halo of glory’ upon ‘her illustrious son’:

Prince Torlonia, on the contrary, was inspired by the Christian sentiment of
love towards humanity, and under this vivifying breath, the dream of
nineteen centuries has become a gigantic reality. All nations, uniting in the
sentiment, which dictated to Italy the words of gratitude that she has
engraved on a golden page, in honour of her illustrious son, will surround
with the purest halo of glory the name of Alexander Torlonia.\textsuperscript{137}

\textsuperscript{135} Brisse and Rotrou, \textit{Dessèchement du lac Fucino}, p. 73.
\textsuperscript{136} Torlonia, p. i.
\textsuperscript{137} Brisse and Rotrou, \textit{Dessèchement du lac Fucino}, p. 220.
Accompanying the Padre Romano are his angels of modernity, the French engineers, who are illuminated by Christian love and scientific truth. Brisse and Rotrou state that Torlonia thought it necessary to entrust the execution of the project to men of as elevated character as himself. Torlonia chose as his chief engineer Frantz Mayor de Montricher, a man inspired by ‘the purest and most elevated Christian sentiments’. He had designed the internationally acclaimed Marseilles canal in the 1840s. Carrying water from the river Durance over 80 km into Marseille it is described by Brisse and Rotrou as ‘a masterpiece of hydraulic construction’ with its famous Roquefavour aqueduct leaving ‘the Roman aqueducts far in the background’. In the presentation a parallel is implicitly made between the aesthetics of ancient Rome and modern France, since as Pliny deemed the Roman aqueducts as objects of beauty because they served the common good. France considers the canal as one of its ‘most admirable monuments’. And yet what differentiates Montricher from the Roman engineer is his angelic ability to purify the temptations of the flesh. His evangelical spirit is illustrated in an anecdote that recounts some advice he gave to his tenant farmer on the eve of his marriage. He told the farmer to ‘read assiduously the Holy Scriptures’, ‘oppose a steady resistance to the evil tendencies which we all find in our hearts’, and ‘tend always towards perfection’.

In contrast to the elevated Christian sentiments of Torlonia and his French angels, the pre-unification peninsula is represented as a modern civitas terrena, which is

---

138 ibid., p. 74.
140 Brisse and Rotrou, Dessèchement du lac Fucino, p. 73.
141 ibid., p. 75.
made apparent in Brisse and Rotrou's description of the restrictions placed on the modern project by the King of Naples. In 1852 the Neapolitan government granted a consortium of French capitalists permission to drain Lake Fucino, with the concession that if they solely funded the enterprise, they would be granted ownership of the reclaimed land. However, the concession would only be upheld upon the restoration of the Claudian emissary, the project's completion in eight years, and adequate transport links being laid in the surrounding area. According to Brisse and Rotrou, King Ferdinand's concession granted the French capitalists 'similar conditions' to those which Roman capitalists had offered Claudius. However, the King's openness to being manipulated by his 'evil councillors' is compared to Narcissus's influence over Claudius and its subversion of the master-servant dialectic:

Similar conditions had been offered to Claudius by the Roman capitalists but refused at the instigation of Narcissus, but while the King of Naples avoided repeating the mistake of the Roman Emperor, he did not, owing to his evil councillors, escape falling into an error which was very nearly proving fatal to the whole scheme.

Morachiello observes that the Torlonia administration distanced itself from any form of state intervention in either Risorgimento or Liberal Italy. If, as Deleuze argues, the sadist is driven by a desire to destroy the maternal symbolic economy and its institutional laws, this implies that a paternal economy can only exist by being outside the law. Thus, Torlonia's behaviour towards the 'contract', a

---

142 Morachiello, *Ingegneri e territorio*, p. 156.
143 Brisse and Rotrou, *Dessechement du lac Fucino*, p. 67.
product of states and institutions, may be read as part of a sadistic urge in which
the ‘man of genius’, be he engineer or capitalist, exists outside the law refusing to
be tied to the limitations of the inner motherland. Brisse and Rotrou state that
Montricher felt that the project should not be executed quickly, but with the
‘utmost solidity’, implying that the state’s time restriction of completion in less
than eight years would result in another Claudian caricature if the man of genius
ceded to this contractual obligation.146 Similarly Torlonia, the modern Roman
capitalist, is described as requiring a ‘superhuman strength’ to defeat the
‘contract’, which is apparently one of the ‘obstacles’ that prevented Julius Caesar’s
idea from becoming reality.147 Having started with a 25 per cent share in 1852,
Torlonia justifies becoming sole owner of the enterprise by 1854, stating that he
could only defeat alone the evils of the contract of concession.148 The reality,
elided from Brisse and Rotrou’s account, is that Torlonia was an expert in
Neapolitan contractual law, which is reflected in his financial activities, having the
monopoly on duties received on salt and tobacco imports into Naples since the
1830s, as well as the ‘macinato’ (grist) tax in Sicily.149

The ‘evil’ contract halted the lake’s first drainage — it was drained in three stages —
until 18 May 1862 when the Destra government lifted the contract by Royal
decree, as, according to Brisse and Rotrou, the Italian government did not want a
work ‘so glorious to Italy’ to be crushed ‘under the weight of a contract as unjust
as it was unreasonable’.150 If the Torlonia presentation seeks to construct a

146 Brisse and Rotrou, Dessèchement du lac Fucino, p. 88.
147 ibid., p. 102.
148 ibid., pp. 70–71.
149 Parisi and Pica, p. 105.
150 Brisse and Rotrou, Dessèchement du lac Fucino, p. 130.
genealogy for the despotic elements of pre-unification Italy in the *civitas terrena* of ancient Rome, it also intends to associate modern Italy with the *civitas dei* of the reclaimed lake so that it will be interpreted as a foundation stone for the building of a future Italy.

In Tracy Ehrlich’s recent work *Landscape and Identity in Early Modern Rome* she states that ‘the history of Rome is a history of its countryside’ where the architecture and landscape of the Alban hills ‘not only articulated but also helped shape the Roman social and political order’. The Alban hills, as previously mentioned, were for Augustine the foundation stone of the *civitas terrena*. There are many parallels between the landscape of the Marsica and the Alban hills, which have lakes that were formed, like Fucino, from volcanic craters. Moreover the lakes of the Alban hills – Lake Albano, Nemi and Riccia – had Roman emissaries which were the prototypes for the later Claudian emissary. In the Torlonia presentation the Marsica and the Alban hills are associated with the *civitas terrena* in the minds of the spectator through Virgilian references:

> Almost every day some of those old classical ploughs similar to those sung by Virgil, are consigned to the flames, and replaced by the more ingenious and efficient machines of modern agriculture.

The Torlonia *bonifica* is therefore a colonial project that seeks to purge the landscape of backward farming methods and Virgilian ploughs through the purifying flames of modern agricultural production.

---

152 Brisse and Rotrou, *Dessèchement du lac Fucino*, p. 214.
The Alban hills look onto the flat ‘bacino’ of Rome and so I would like to suggest that the heterotopia of Lake Fucino creates a mimetic relationship between the Eternal city and the civitas dei of the Fucino basin. According to Ehrlich early-modern Romans understood the geography of Rome and the Agro Romano as a series of concentric rings defined by their function, topography and distance from the urban centre. Extending from the Aurelian walls for five miles the first ring contained vineyards, pleasure gardens and villa parks of up to 250 acres. The scorched earth of the Roman campagna was the second ring, the grass of which had been cropped short by grazing sheep and cattle. Rising at the perimeter of the campagna, was the third ring of verdant hills, the higher altitudes of which had attracted villas in cities like Albano and Frascati since antiquity, comparable to the sites of St Peter’s and the Pantheon in Rome.\textsuperscript{153} The map from 1692 shows the first ring of vines which surrounded Rome on the left, with Via Appia traversing the Agro Romano into the Alban hills and Lake Albano on the right (Fig. 4.17).

The Torlonia estate is organized into three concentric rings and at its centre is the polder of the ancient lake basin (Fig. 4.18). Demarcated by statues of the Blessed Virgin on the shoreline of each comune, the outer blue ring of the lake’s water level in 1862 is what I shall call the ‘line of devotion’ which delimits the inner sacred arena from the outer profanity of the pagan hills. The second red ring is made from the boundary road of the Torlonia estate. Between the red and blue ring was an area described as a ‘blank space’ of 1600 hectares.\textsuperscript{154} It comprises of property belonging to different landowners and land ceded by Torlonia to

\textsuperscript{153} Ehrlich, pp. 2-3.
\textsuperscript{154} Brisse and Rotrou, \textit{Dessèchement du lac Fucino}, p. 274.
Fig. 4.17
Fig. 4.18
Brisse and Rotrou, *Atlas* (see Fig. 4.12), Plate XVI.
fishermen as compensation for the loss of the lake. As a 'blank' space it symbolizes a type of limbo that reminds those inside what disobedience of Torlonia’s Word means: excommunication, as exclusion from the irrigated land of the Torlonia estate. It corresponds to the scorched earth of the Roman campagna where inadequate irrigation systems and malaria made farming virtually impossible. Between the green line and the inner ring of the polder is land that has been ordered into productive agricultural parcels. It purifies the Baroque pursuit of cultivating nature for aesthetic pleasure in parks adorned with theatrical water fountains and is therefore a space of Purgatory. The inner ring of the estate corresponds to Rome’s Christian centre, the Vatican, that is to say the City of God. On the one hand it is the retained ancient lake basin which reminds the inhabitants of their former lives as fishermen subject to feudal fishing laws that stipulated that a third of all fish caught in the lake should be delivered to the feudal barons – the Colonna family – at a designated place. It is upon this site in Avezzano that Torlonia built a square with a fountain decorated with the Prince of Fucino’s coat of arms, which rests upon two fish (Fig. 4.19). In I miei ricordi Massimo D’Azeglio describes how when a Pope dies the annulus piscatoris, the fisherman’s ring, is broken and the Roman Senate declares ‘I take command of Rome’. And so in this closure of the cycle of fishing we can perhaps discern that Torlonia is symbolically taking command of Rome as a secular pope.

155 The location of the Torlonia villa and piazza over the feudal site was pointed out to me by Sergio Cardone, author of the exhibition Avezzano Scomparsa (2003), on a visit I made to the Marsica in October 2003.
Fig. 4.19
The Torlonia coat of arms in Avezzano. Author’s photograph.
On a horizontal line along the estate is the central canal, which in carrying water into the emissary represents an externalization of the inner ‘line of desire’. The canal stretches from what I have suggested is the paternal space of the polder to the emissary head, where the statue of the Virgin Mary is located. Between these two spaces is the space of agricultural production and purgation, where the man learns to live for the Other, the Padre Romano through expressing devotion to the Virgin Mary.

The paternal region of the ancient lake basin is designed as a storage basin to control inundations of rainwater, to which the lowest part of the plain was liable, and it also stores surplus water when the outflow into the Liri is suspended due to the emissary requiring inspection (Fig. 4.20). Surrounding the basin is an alternating series of canals and roads which feed into it. A series of dykes enclose the basin. Within the context of the bonifica of Lake Fucino being dedicated to the Immaculate Conception we can speculate how the illustration might have been interpreted as having the appearance of a uterus, which mirrored the aqueous terrain under Mount Salviano. The dykes collect at K into a placenta-like knot where a complex series of locks control water-flow into the enclosure though a slender canal that arrives at the centre at E. The reservoir at E swells when the emissary is closed. The line LN is 250 metres from the E point, and indicates the position from which the drawings of the locks – neatly arranged inside the ‘womb’ – were made. The hydraulic function of locks is to control water-flows and their detailed imagery inside the aqueous space may perhaps be read at symbolizing the

---

157 Brisse and Rotrou, Dessèchement du lac Fucino, p. 275.
Fig. 4.20

Brisse and Rotrou, Atlas (see Fig. 4.12), Plate XVII.
extent to which Torlonia, the Padre Romano, sought to convey his mastery over nature in contrast to the pagan Roman past of the Claudius.

According to Brisse and Rotrou the basin’s function as a reservoir slowly recedes, since it will gradually be converted into pastureland, favouring an increase in cattle in the Marsica, a country once famous for its good breeds. In pagan times, as Brisse and Rotrou explain, the Marsi attributed the evils of the lake to a god of Fucino and built temples to the god in the belief that the flooding would cease. At the Claudian sea games the local inhabitants’ superstitions of a god of Fucino were exploited through a silver Triton being placed in the centre of the lake, which moved by a hidden mechanism to announce the beginning of the games.

Torlonia utilizes scientific knowledge to present himself as a superhuman individual. His God-like ability to control the flow of water allows him to usurp the position of the real archaic father of alterity, who is concealed from view through the measured control of water.

The second space is the agricultural area which has been designed for the cultivation of the ancient basin. Brisse and Rotrou construct a genealogical origin of this agricultural activity in Julius Caesar’s references in De Bello Civile (The Civil War) to the Marsi, who, like the Sabines, did not dwell in the cities but thrived in rural settings:

The state of anarchy and barbarism which came over Italy at the fall of the Roman Empire and became, so to say, the normal condition of society

---

158 ibid., pp. 282-83.
159 ibid., p. 11-12.
160 ibid., p. 38.
during the greater part of the middle ages, caused the Marsi to lose the customs of their ancestors, who, according to Caesar (*De Bello Civile*) did not dwell in the cites or in common centres but were scattered over the country living by agriculture or by the breeding of cattle.\(^{161}\)

Crucial to Brisse and Rotrou's genealogy of ruralism is that the Roman instincts of Italians have been emasculated in the domesticated city spaces, since these qualities were lost after the fall of the Roman Empire and the advent of feudal warfare when the Marsi were forced to take refuge in the fortified cities of feudal barons. The planning of the estate seeks to intertwine morality with agriculture through the restoration of Marsica traditions in a number of ways.

First the Fucino estate is ruled through what I shall call the 'law of uniformity', since it is the foundation of civil rule across the estate. Brisse and Rotrou state that 'uniformity' is considered the most effective way to maintain social order amongst the husbandmen and in their relations with Torlonia:

> It will therefore be readily understood that this uniformity in the holdings of each of these farmers will easily lead to very beneficial and important results not only of a material, but also of a social order.\(^{162}\)

This law is visualized in the sameness of each husbandman's 'rural habitation' where each house will be of the 'same type', have an equal quantity of land – 25 hectares – cultivate the same variety of crops and rear the same breeds of cattle because the same agricultural conditions exist across the estate.\(^{163}\) The rural habitations are grouped in twos along the inner roads of the estate, and the distance

\(^{161}\) *ibid.*, pp. 281-82.
\(^{162}\) *ibid.*, p. 282.
\(^{163}\) *ibid.*, pp. 281-82.
between the two houses contributes to the morality of the Fucino project since it is ‘a return to the ancient habits of the Marsi’:

The distance between the two houses of the cultivators is not so great as to debar the latter from assisting each other in case of need; they are separated but not isolated, which from more than one point of view is of an uncontested importance to their morality. Moreover this arrangement is a return to the ancient habits of the Marsi; habits which have certainly contributed to give the national character of the majority of the Sabine tribes those solid qualities which the Romans so much admired in them.164

Second the law of uniformity facilitates surveillance across the estate and therefore disciplines the actions of each farmer. Brisse and Rotrou state that each husbandman’s plot of land is ideal for policing his crops, cattle and labourers who are ‘always under his eyes’.165 In exerting ‘an active vigilance upon every part of the farm entrusted to him’, the husbandman mirrors the rules of surveillance that the Padre Romano has established for Fucino, since ‘the same advantage exists for the watching of the whole estate’.166

The third area is the androgynous space of the Virgin Mary’s Immaculate Conception. The story of Mary’s Immaculate Conception defined Christ’s ability to descend into the sea of humankind, since he shares the same flesh as man – he was born from the womb – and yet in being conceived through the presence of the

164 ibid., p. 281.
165 ibid., p. 281.
166 ibid., p. 281.
Holy Spirit he is a new creation. The question that then arises is the extent to which Torlonia’s deployment of the Dogma of the Immaculate Conception as a colonial tool produces a new creation, a Roman man born without sin, the male virgin.

Crucial to an understanding of the dynamics of this space is how, in Brisse and Rotrou’s illustration, the male spectator is placed in a position of confession in front of the six metre high statue of the Virgin Mary, whose elevated position conveys her sexual unavailability (Fig. 4.21). In ‘Stabat Mater’ Kristeva argues that the power of the Virgin is formed by the construction of a third person with whom she conceives, God, which results in an Immaculate Conception occurring ‘with neither man nor sex’. In the image the power of her virginity appears to split the male viewer’s vision into two psychical spaces, into two cities. The upper space of civitas dei is one in which her immaculate, inviolate status visualizes Torlonia’s devotion to her and his paternal power that protects her virginity. Thus on either side of the inscription to the Immaculate Conception is the Torlonia coat of arms. The region submerged beneath the water might therefore be thought of as is a civitas terrena, and shows the entrance to the tunnel and the weir. These structures resemble ‘organs’ as opposed to the whole body of the civitas dei that the statue of the Virgin Mary promises. Within the logic of Brisse and Rotrou’s discourse these ‘organs’ represent a corrupt Rome of deflowered virgins that the emissary continually drains away.

167 Kristeva, ‘Stabat’, p. 180
Fig. 4.21
Brisse and Rotrou, *Atlas* (see Fig. 4.12), Plate XIII.
If the Immaculate Conception is a colonial tool to cleanse a pagan Rome, part of the colonial project is the purification of relationships that may contaminate the city and its purity as the Virgin Mary. Father-daughter relationships are the model for Deleuze’s incestuous paternal couplings. And it is a particular incestuous relationship that haunted Rome in the nineteenth century which I wish to explore in relation to Torlonia’s cleansing of Rome in the Other space of Lake Fucino.

Throughout Europe in the nineteenth century Rome was associated with the tragic story of Beatrice Cenci (1577-99) who was raped by her father and then incarcerated in his castle at Petrella in the Kingdom of Naples. Assisted by her mother and her brother Beatrice subsequently committed parricide. In spite of being subjected to the most atrocious forms of torture by the Inquisition, her refusal to confess either the rape or murder – confessing the rape would have exonerated the murder – resulted in Pope Clement VIII sentencing her to death.\footnote{\textit{John Simeon, Preface to 'Contemporaneous Narrative of the Trial and Execution of the Cenci', in Miscellanies of The Philobiblon Society, vol. IV (London: Whittingham, 1858), pp. 3-26 (p. 22).}}\footnote{\textit{Belinda Jack, \textit{Beatrice's Spell: The Enduring Legend of Beatrice Cenci} (London: Chatto & Windus, 2004), pp. 2, 12.} At the time of her death Romans compared her to the first Christians and proclaimed her a martyr and from the time of her execution a mass was held for her on the anniversary of her death (11 September), which is still held to this day.\footnote{\textit{Belinda Jack, \textit{Beatrice's Spell: The Enduring Legend of Beatrice Cenci} (London: Chatto & Windus, 2004), pp. 2, 12.}}

Her portrait, attributed to Guido Reni, was displayed at the Palazzo Barberini, and according to Stendhal, it was the first painting the tourist sought out in Rome (Fig.
Shelley, who viewed the painting at its previous location at the Palazzo Colonna, was inspired to write his play *The Cenci* (1819). Later works that took inspiration from Beatrice Cenci, such as Nathaniel Hawthorne's *The Marble Faun* (1860), testify to the international fascination with her story. Similarly John Simeon writing in 1857, after a visit to Rome, reveals how her story captured the imagination of Romans:

> The name of Beatrice Cenci is still associated with wild traditions in the mind of the Roman populace. I remember being told by a peasant at the Ponte Rotto, that La Cenci, when pleading for her life, offered to rebuild the bridge, and to ensure its permanence by using white of egg for cement instead of mortar, but that the Pope was inexorable.

If the story of Beatrice Cenci took on a particular meaning in the nineteenth century, that of the corruption of the Papacy and its abhorrent forms of torture, Torlonia’s display of devotion to the Virgin Mary conveys the notion that his Other Rome, founded upon the right relationships between father and daughter, is a prototype of a new Eternal city.

The aerial illustration showing the plan of the park, surrounding the Virgin Mary, might be thought of as a visualization of the right relations between father and daughter (Fig. 4.23). According to Brisse and Rotrou the park was built around the Immaculate Conception to give the project a sense of completeness:

---


171 Simeon, p. 6.
Fig. 4.22
Portrait of Beatrice Cenci attributed to Guido Reni (1575-1642).
National Gallery of Art, Rome.
Fig. 4.23
Brisse and Rotrou, *Atlas* (see Fig. 4.12), Plate XXI.
The whole work would have appeared incomplete if such large and fine buildings had been left in the midst of a plain, without giving them a fitting back-ground upon which their majestic simplicity could show to the best advantage.  

The ground was levelled and terraces built so that an ‘harmonious symmetry’ could replace the ‘disagreeable aspect of the locality’. In front of the statue was a wide avenue planted with trees that bifurcated. A tree-lined esplanade outlined the canal head and regulatory basin – at the lower part of the plate. The bridge of the weir was designed as a viewing platform from where the spectator’s eye could capture the entire estate in a glance:

From the summit of these stairs the whole of the structure can be taken in at one glance, and as far as the eye reaches, the course of the central canal can be traced as it stretches in a straight line towards the centre of the new plain formed by the drained bed of Lake Fucino.

In Building the Text, Cowling argues that until the end of the Renaissance the female body, in particular that of the virgin and her immaculate womb, were symbolized in devotional texts through architectural forms:

The woman’s body, and especially the womb, was commonly figured in Antiquity by an architectural space. The metaphor was developed in the Christian exegetical tradition of the Middle Ages with special reference to the Virgin in her role as physically intact mother of the incarnate Christ.

---

172 Brisse and Rotrou, Dessèchement du lac Fucino, p. 144.
173 ibid., p. 144.
174 ibid., p. 144.
175 Cowling, p. 58.
Amongst the architectural works that represented the immaculate womb, such as the castle, the cloister and the temple, was the closed garden. I would finally like to draw upon Cowling’s readings of devotional texts to explore the extent to which Torlonia’s garden and its monumental statue of the Immaculate Conception might be read as a devotional landscape.

According to Cowling, in devotional texts an enclosed space symbolized virginity and the resistance to the temptations of the external world of sin. In Saint Bernard’s doctrine *Salve Regina*, for example, the walls of the ‘uterine’ enclosure remained unbreached, even after Christ’s miraculous entry:

> You are the holy one, you are the castle which Jesus entered, yours are the tower of humility [...] and the wall of virginity, a strong wall indeed, since it remained unbreached before, during, and after his birth.  

Within this context, Brisse and Retrou’s illustration emphasizes that the Fucino garden is protected, since it is clearly separated from the surrounding farmland of economic production (Fig. 4.23). Inside the enclosure the monumental statue dominates the skyline against the verdant landscape. Accompanying the sight of the statue is the sound of water flowing beneath the emissary head in the weir, which might be thought of as an acoustic wall (Fig. 4.11). This arrangement, which if we recall is accompanied by an inscription, expresses the miracle of Torlonia’s *bonifica* of Lake Fucino: the Virgin still remains unbreached, in spite of water continually flowing beneath her. Similar to a devotional text, the garden may

---

176 ibid., p. 58.
177 The sermon of St Bernard is quoted in Cowling, p. 58.
178 See p. 199.
perhaps be read as a model of how the subject can build patriotism into their daily lives through living for the Other, in this case the Virgin, more than for oneself.

In ‘Stabat Mater’ Kristeva remarks that the Virgin’s ability to reconcile the residues of a maternal symbolic system into her frozen form is a stepping-stone towards the intensification of capitalist development and the symbolic paternal agency it requires.179 On the one hand Torlonia’s utilization of the Immaculate Conception can be read through Kristeva’s observations, in that I have argued in this chapter that one of the roles that Torlonia assigns to the Virgin at Fucino is that of purifying Rome of a maternal symbolic system, represented by the domineering figure of Agrippina. Moreover, I have shown how Torlonia wished to connect devotion to the Immaculate Conception with the emergence of capitalism in Italy. On the other hand, Torlonia chose to transmute an aspect of religious faith into ‘flesh’ so that it could be used as a model for his version of Italian patriotism. However, unlike many traditional Catholic notions of the Virgin Mary as the benevolent ideal mother who touches the faithful through prayer, at Lake Fucino her transmutation into flesh produces a sexless, cold female object. In my view, the Virgin is reduced to an object created by a male gaze intent on eliding sexual difference, while devotion to her sexless status becomes the vehicle through which a paternal symbolic economy builds the notion of living for the Other into daily life.

Chapter Five

Endgame: Occluding Objects and Optical Tricks in the Cult of War at the Torre Monumentale di San Martino della Battaglia

Clov Ce n’est pas bientôt la fin?
Hamm J’en ai peur.
Clov Bah tu en feras une autre.
Hamm Je ne sais pas. (Un temps) Je me sens un peu vidé.¹

Samuel Beckett, Fin de partie

Che cosa si debba intendere per Risorgimento italiano, e innanzi tutto che cosa sia che ‘ri-sorga’; in quale relazione esso si trovi con la storia europea moderna, di cui rappresenta l’equivalente nella storia d’Italia; se e in quale misura esso sia di carattere politico o etico o culturale; se esso sia una formazione puramente indigena, o presenti apporti stranieri, e di che natura e misura; quando abbia inizio e quando termini: sono tutte questioni, di cui talune sono state trattate con insistenza e risolte […] ma non altretanto esaminate nell’insieme, sistematicamente.²

Luigi Salvatorelli, Pensiero e azione del Risorgimento

5.1 Play

On Friday 24 June 1859, 300,000 men stood facing each other along a battle-line some 30 km in length, to commence a battle that was recalled in poetry as a bloody holocaust: the Battle of Solferino and San Martino.³ In the battle the divisions of the combined armies of Vittorio Emanuele and his ally, the French Emperor

Fig. 5.1
Map of the Battle of San Martino and Solferino (adapted by the author).
From Denkmalführer, von San Martino und Solferino (Pavia: Società Solferino e San Martino, 2000), (pullout).

Fig. 5.2
The Torre Monumentale di San Martino. From L’Illustrazione Italiana, 15 October 1893, p. 211.
Napoleon III, fought against the Austrian army of Emperor Franz Joseph, Austria having re-occupied Northern Italy since the fall of Napoleon I’s Kingdom of Italy. In spite of over 12,000 soldiers being slaughtered in one day, it became arguably the most commemorated Risorgimento battle, in which the bloody sacrifice made by Italian soldiers in the holocaust of war became the foundation for educating the citizen on how to die heroically for the nation.

The silhouette of the Alps and the mirror of Lake Garda painted a picturesque backdrop for the theatre of war. The battle map shows the strategic geographical line of the River Mincio, behind which the Austrians had regrouped after their defeat in the Battle of Magenta – 5 June 1859 – near Milan (Fig. 5.1). Although the map creates the illusion that war is an art that can be plotted and planned in advance, as the Swiss Henry Dunant wrote in his celebrated eyewitness account of the battle – *Un souvenir de Solferino* (1862) – in spite of reconnaissance, scouts and balloon ascensions made on 23 June, each side was oblivious to the other’s position:

> So, although both sides were fully expecting that a great battle would come shortly, the encounter between the Austrians and the Franco-Sardinians on Friday, June 24, was really unlooked-for, since both adversaries were mistaken as to each other’s movements.  

Dunant describes himself as a ‘mere tourist’, who gives personal impressions and warns his readers that they should look elsewhere for specific details on strategic matters’. If military conflict in the nineteenth century was often theorized as

---

5 ibid., p. 16.
producing ‘virtue and art’, as Pick asserts in *War Machine*, Dunant’s graphic descriptions of the battle, as we shall see, may be read as a series of impressions that seek to penetrate beneath the surface of the canvas of war to reveal the horrors hidden below.

According to Dunant the Austrians began re-crossing the River Mincio on the 23 June so that by nightfall they occupied the heights of Solferino and San Martino. Unaware of the Austrians’ manoeuvres, Napoleon, based at Montechiaro – on the left of the map (Fig 1) – began moving divisions towards Solferino in the early hours of 24 June, while the Piedmontese were gathered on the edge of Lake Garda at Desenzano. At dawn, like the beginning of a well-rehearsed play, battle commenced to the sound of bugles and the rolling of drums. In these opening moves, Dunant, viewing the battle at a distance, describes the colours and pageantry of war in terms of a pleasurable optical experience. The Austrians, Dunant notes, advanced in ‘perfect formation, along the beaten paths, with their yellow and black battle flags, blazoned with the German Imperial Eagle, floating above the compact masses of white coats’. Similarly ‘the shining armour’ of French Dragoons glistened in the brilliant Italian sunlight. And yet as the battle progressed, spilling out onto ‘every fold of ground […] carried at the point of the bayonet’, Dunant’s descriptions dissolved the objective gaze of the battle map by his physical proximity to the real object of war – the annihilation of the other by any means. In the villages he states that ‘every door, window, and courtyard’ was a

---

7 Dunant, p. 17.
8 ibid., p. 17.
9 ibid., p. 20.
‘ghastly scene of butchery’.\footnote{ibid., p. 20.} The skills of warfare were replaced by a blind struggle between ‘savage beasts’:

Here is hand-to-hand struggle in all its horror and frightfulness; Austrians and Allies trampling each other under foot, killing one another on piles of bleeding corpses, felling their enemies with their rifle butts, crushing skulls, ripping bellies open with sabre and bayonet. [...] It is a sheer butchery; a struggle between savage beasts, maddened with blood and fury.\footnote{ibid., p. 19.}

By late afternoon the French declared victory at Solferino, and after dislodging the Austrians from Pozzolengo, the Piedmontese secured the hill of San Martino by the evening. After the battle the Austrian Emperor had apparently wept when he saw the devastation on the battlefield,\footnote{ibid, p. 36.} while Dunant, in his close-up position, reminds the reader of the trauma experienced by the dying and wounded, who were so thirsty that they drank ‘from muddy pools whose water was foul and filled with curdled blood’.\footnote{ibid, p. 40.} The following morning, after victory, Dunant describes how the sun lit up ‘the most dreadful sights imaginable’: ‘Bodies of men and horses covered the battlefield; corpses were strewn over ditches, ravines, thickets and fields; the approaches of Solferino were literally thick with the dead’.\footnote{Ibid., p. 41.} The battle had two historic outcomes. First, Dunant founded the International Red Cross in 1863 in Geneva directly as a result of the traumatic events he witnessed at Solferino, and was awarded the first Nobel Prize for Peace in 1901. Second, in spite of initial celebrations, the battle did not promise the conclusion to Italian
independence with the alliance pursuing Austria across the Veneto. Instead
Napoleon III, shaken by the heavy losses and the unpopularity of the war in
France, in particular with Catholics, signed an armistice with Franz Joseph at
Villafranca on July 11. The armistice allowed Lombardy to remain annexed to
Piedmont, but re-instated the Restoration governments in Tuscany and Modena
with Austria retaining possession of the Veneto.\footnote{Bolton King, \textit{A history o f Italian Unity: Being a Political History o f Italy fro m 1814 to 1871}, 2nd edn, 2 vols (London: Nisbet, 1910-12), II (1912), 76-82.}

While these two events illustrate the degree to which Italy’s struggle towards
independence was contingent upon the wider currents of European politics, after
Unification the repetition of the annual commemoration of the battle became
increasingly nationalistic. In each annual repetitive turn of the celebration another
contaminating foreign element was elided from the history of the Risorgimento.\footnote{Salvatorelli argues that Italian nationalism falsifies the pre-unification history, eliding its foreign elements; \textit{Pensiero}, pp. 23-24.}

Commemoration occurred at the battle site from 1870 with the inauguration of the
ossuaries of San Martino and Solferino on 24 June. Between 1870 and 1877 the
twelfth-century Tower of Solferino was restored and a museum dedicated to the
battle housed inside whose layout continued the battle in a virtual arena for the
pilgrim to sample. On the lower floors Austrian, French and Italian armour was
displayed, and the last floor, called the \textit{Sala di Sovrani}, was dedicated to the
victors, with portraits of Vittorio Emanuele and Napoleon III exhibited side by
side, with their autographs preserved in a precious ornate box.\footnote{Cesira Siciliani, \textit{Una visita agli Ossari di San Martino e Solferino} (Bologna: Zanichelli, 1881), pp. 101-4.} Finally, in 1893

\footnote{The \textit{Torre Monumentale di San Martino della Battaglia} was inaugurated, being}
vaunted as ‘il primo monumento militare del mondo’ (Fig. 5.2). The tower was built directly on top of the battlefield of San Martino, the contested site that the Italian army took and retook at least five times during the day of battle against the Austrians. For this reason the hill was considered to be the sacred birthplace of Italy’s independence, accomplished through the violence and blood of the human sacrifice that war entails. The decision to build the tower had been prompted by the death of Vittorio Emanuele in 1878. As the Padre della Patria who had laid the foundation of Italy’s independence in the battle, his name was built into the tower’s exterior wall – A VITTORIO EMANUELE – to denote that as the king who unified Italy, it was his military acts of creation that were both spatially and pictorially recounted inside. On the curved interior surfaces were brightly coloured frescoes depicting episodes from his life and the twenty-two years of Risorgimento wars from 1848 to 1870 which were displayed as large 180° panoramas with the final panorama, that of the 360° view from the summit, as the completion of the Risorgimento ‘masterpiece’.

In Tobia’s account of the Torre Monumentale, the only research hitherto published on the space, he argues that the tower was conceived of as the definitive national monument, because of its location on ‘il luogo in cui si affollavano memorie patriottiche e a cui dovevano ispirarsi propositi generosi’. Moreover, he notes that the founder of the Società di San Martino e Solferino, Luigi Torelli, had repeatedly emphasized that the site was where Italian independence had been

---

19 Tobia, Una patria, p. 189.
2.0 From this premise Tobia equates the tower’s monumental scale and panoramic paintings with a desire to commemorate the greatness of the heroic king of the Risorgimento. However, Tobia, in my opinion, ignores the foundations upon which the site was constructed, the body of the dead soldier. Luigi Torelli – Prefect of Venice – founded the Società di Solferino e S. Martino in Milan in 1869 to raise money so that the corpses of Italian, French and Austrian soldiers could be exhumed from the battlefield – Italian law prevented the exhumation of corpses for ten years after burial.21 The Society stated that its origins were rooted in ‘un sentimento di religiosa pietà verso le vittime, che caddero per la redenzione d’Italia nella memorabile giornata del 24 giugno 1859’.22 And it is this notion of an ‘Italy’ in the act of becoming redeemed that the society wished to preserve through the exhumation of the corpse. An appreciation of significance of the soldier’s corpse would have enabled Tobia to explore how a cult of war was constructed at the site. Commemoration at the battlefield sought to keep the collective body of human sacrifice that led to Italy’s redemption forever young through the pilgrimage of future generations to the site where they would experience what it meant to die patriotically.

Similarly, Tobia appears to be unwilling to explore the relationship between the soldier’s ‘dead’ body sacrificed in 1859 and an Italian unified ‘body’ completed 11 years later with the annexation of Rome. Moreover he fails to recognize that if architecture is a prosthesis of the body, a smooth inpenetrable tower may constitute anxieties over a fragmented body, which in this context would

---

20 ibid., p. 193.
21 Statuto della Società di Solferino e S. Martino, 4th edn (Padua: Crescini, 1893), pp. 36-37.
22 ibid., p. 35.
correspond to fears of Italian disunity. What does it mean to express the national body through an isolated tower whose hard impregnable exterior created an inner space that was impenetrable to the external environment? And what desire is being expressed in the need to re-invent the experience of hope and optimism in 1859, at the onset of Unification, and the compressed inner space of a tower which denies the pilgrim the space for the sort of reflection that would permit a distance between the past of 1859 and the present of 1893 so that they might develop a memory of the Risorgimento?

Adam Phillips, in a recent essay, ‘Close-Ups’, most eloquently distinguishes between memory and repetition. From Freud’s notion that where there is repetition there is repression, presented in ‘Remembering, Repeating and Working Through’ (1914), Phillips argues that what we repeat is what we do not remember because we are too close-up to the traumatic event. According to Phillips, Freud noted that ‘the patient like an actor with a script, or a figure in a dream – unwittingly performs something from his past’ because what makes something a memory has not yet happened. Similarly Phillips argues that war victims are too close-up to the event to write a history of it, they lack the distance from the event that would allow their experience to become a history. Philips’s argument offers a way of thinking about what is behind the urge to repeat the Risorgimento inside the Torre Monumentale and how it might paradoxically prevent the formation of memory, as a distance between past and present. Moreover, it suggests that what is being

---

23 The notion of architecture as a prosthesis of the body that reveals anxieties over the lack of a ‘unified’ body was suggested by Mark Cousins’s observations on Hellenistic architecture and the concept of eurhythmy in his public lecture series Spatial Effects at the Architectural Association on 5 March 2004.

repeated is a traumatic aspect of the Risorgimento that Italians are too close-up to see.

Luigi Salvatorelli’s historical study *Pensiero e azione del Risorgimento*, written on the eve of the fall of the Fascist regime in 1943, correlates Italian nationalism with the myth of the Risorgimento, in which the historical reality of Italy prior to its Unification is disavowed:

Ri-sorgimento significa qualche cosa che c’è stata già, che ha cessato temporaneamente di esserci e che ritorna ad esserci. Ora, uno stato italiano, prima del regno d’Italia proclamato nel 1861, la storia non lo conosce.\(^{25}\)

Throughout his study Salvatorelli seeks to undermine nationalistic mythologies of Italy as a ‘resurgent’ object rooted in an Italian past by introducing historical reality into its domain, arguing that the Risorgimento was connected to the rest of Europe and the wider currents of liberalism, nationalism and democracy.\(^{26}\) His excursus implies that the trauma of the Risorgimento concerns not so much its possession, but anxieties over its loss, which is reflected in the desire to invent Italy as a purely Italian resurgent entity.

In this chapter I shall explore the ways in which the Torre Monumentale offers answers to the principal question that Salvatorelli’s study poses: ‘what is it that resurges?’ Moreover, I shall examine how this myth of resurgence produces a patriotism that generates the destructive impulses of Thanatos inherent in a cult of war. Theoretically this chapter is underpinned by Freud’s study in *Beyond the*

---

\(^{25}\) Salvatorelli, *Pensiero*, p. 16.

Pleasure Principle of the death instinct and the compulsion to repeat unpleasurable events. One of the ways that Freud connects repetition of the past with Thanatos is in the fort-da game that his grandson played to master anxieties of abandonment aroused when his mother disappeared from his sight. The game, like the name fort - meaning gone - and da - there -, has two stages: first the child attaches an object to a reel and then throws it out of sight, which corresponds to the mother's departure; second, the object is reeled back into sight, corresponding to her joyful return and the child's pleasurable cry of da.27

Freud interprets the fort-da game in its entirety as the 'child's great cultural achievement', that of the renunciation of instinctual satisfaction, since the game allows his mother to disappear from view without the son's protestations.28 However, Freud notes that the fort component of the game - a distressing experience for the child - was staged far more frequently as a game in itself, without the pleasurable ending. Freud claims that the reason for repeating the unpleasurable fort component was that in real life the child was in a passive position concerning the mother's reappearance. For Freud the game allowed the child to play an active role in her disappearance, while its repetition drew the child into a greater position of control against his mother. Although these aspects of the fort component may be read as part of the child's development towards independence, Freud also acknowledges a more sinister side to the game, that of revenge. The boy's desire to take revenge against his mother may be read through...

28 ibid., p. 15
his action of discarding the unwanted object. Similarly in group play Freud suggests that revenge is the pleasure that the child attains in repeating unpleasurable events by inflicting the 'disagreeable experience' onto a playmate who is a substitute for a discarded object:

As the child passes over from the passivity of the experience to the activity of the game, he hands on the disagreeable experience to one of his playmates and in this way revenges himself on a substitute.

J. B. Pontalis has interpreted the *fort-da* game as a way of thinking about how the subject connects to the other in him or herself. The reel is a fragile thread, a life-line, which, when broken becomes a sort of death:

Si, tout au long de notre vie, nous ne faisions que lancer la bobine, *là-bas*, pour la faire revenir *ici!* [...] Et ce fil, c'est, si fragile qu'il soit, ce qui nous relie à l'autre, à la vie. Qu'il se casse – l'existence ne tient qu'à un fil – et c'est la mort.

Pontalis's account is centred upon the game's completion, that is to say, that the mother will reappear. It is for this reason when she does ultimately disappear that it feels like death.

In contrast to Freud and Pontalis's observations, I would like to consider how the game might be used as a vehicle for colonising real life and ordinary experience.

One of the ways this may occur is through society controlling what can be seen by

---

29 ibid., pp. 15-17.
30 ibid., p. 17.
what Rajchman describes in Chapter One as a 'positive unconscious vision'.

The 

fort-da is an ocular game and it creates the illusion in the player that he or she can control what can be seen through making objects appear and disappear. Similarly I would like to suggest that the Torre Monumentale encourages the subject to believe that he or she can retrieve Risorgimento events hidden beneath the layers of history, bringing them to a new close-up position. In this way, I shall argue that the Torre Monumentale constructs a Risorgimento gaze. The origins of the gaze are located at the Tower of Solferino, which was familiarly known as the Spia d'Italia since it was claimed that with the aid of a telescope the central spire of the Cathedral of Milan could be seen. In this chapter I shall explore how the Torre Monumentale, as an observation point for viewing the battle-sites and as an internal space for viewing panoramic paintings, sought to develop a Risorgimento gaze through its allusion to the scientific instrument of the telescope.

In Techniques of the Observer Jonathan Crary states that an observer is 'one who sees within a prescribed set of possibilities, one who is embedded in a system of conventions and limitations'. Crary considers various optical devices in the nineteenth century – telescopes, zootrope, stereoscopes and so forth – to argue that they were sites of knowledge and power that operated upon the subject’s body. Using Crary’s account I shall argue in this chapter that through an experience at the Torre Monumentale the subject learns how to observe what the Risorgimento is and likewise, what it is not. In following Crary’s suggestion that the observer is constructed through a set of conventions and limitations, I shall explore the extent

32 See p. 11.
33 Siciliani, p. 111.
to which the repetition of ocular games at the tower limits and restricts the subject’s sight, focusing it towards the historic culmination of the Risorgimento, Italy’s magical repossession of Rome.

In addition to these aspects of the Risorgimento gaze, I shall also investigate its potentially destructive component, since, as we shall see, in this chapter it encourages the destruction of objects that occlude the repossession of Italy as a resurgent object. For these reasons and also because I am interested in how an Italian cult of war was developed from the military valour of the Padre della Patria, I shall concentrate upon the paternal sadistic economy of patriotism which contributes to the arousal of the instinct to annihilate the enemy other. In his observations on the fort-da game Freud states that in children ‘all their play is influenced by a wish that dominates them the whole time – the wish to be grown-up and to be able to do what grown-up people do’. Implicit in the myth of Vittorio Emanuele, as the Padre della Patria, is the notion that the king is a paternal father figure whom the subject must emulate if he wishes to become a man. In this chapter I attempt to show that it is through the repetition of various ocular games, built around the statue of the king, that the subject learns what becoming a man is: living for the Other, as both Rome and Italy, more than himself.

In its repetition of a game played between father (Hamm) and son (Clov), set upon a grey and lifeless stage, Beckett’s theatrical masterpiece, Fin de partie might be thought of as a theatrical staging of the fort-da game. The title of the play refers to

35 Freud, Beyond the Pleasure Principle, p. 17.
the third and final part of the game of chess, the endgame. In the endgame the kings are free to come to the centre of the board and confront each other, and yet their moves are so limited that they are powerless to alter the outcome, as likewise the chess-player is playing a game whose rules are not of his or her making. As the game is endlessly repeated in Beckett’s play the protagonist Hamm, is the actor whose belief that his actions can control the other, played by his son Clov, is a delusional fantasy since he is physically blind and immobile, ordering his son to wheel him across the bare stage emptied of life (Fig. 5.3). Hamm is both the passive child of the fort-da game and the object, the chess-piece at the end of the player’s reel. In a similar way I would like to suggest that it is upon the architectural stage of the Torre Monumentale that the boy is urged into playing the Risorgimento game, without realizing that in any game where the rules are set by the Other, he will always be an object at the end of the Other’s reel.

---

Fig. 5.3

5.2 City of War

It is the soldier who founds republics, it is the soldier who maintains them.\textsuperscript{37}

Napoleon to the Cisalpine National Guards, 29 June 1797

Without a citizen army there is no motherland, there is no nation [...] an army must defend [the republic], make it respected abroad, and secure its internal tranquillity.\textsuperscript{38}

Francesco Melzi d’Eril, 20 April, 1803

The proclamation of the Cisalpine Republic on 29 June 1797 and its subsequent evolution into the Kingdom of Italy (1805) under Napoleon has been widely recognized as an important impetus towards Italian Unification.\textsuperscript{39} Prior to Bonaparte’s arrival the peninsula was politically fragmented – divided into eleven different states with different currencies, systems of weights, legal systems, custom barriers, language, and poor infrastructure and communication between the regions was extremely difficult.\textsuperscript{40} The Kingdom lasted until 1814 and comprised the regions previously occupied by the Austrian Empire – Tuscany, Lombardy, and Modena – the Venetian Republic and the Papal states (Fig. 5.4). These regions were divided into twenty-four departments ruled from the Italian capital Milan by the Grand Chancellor and leader of the Milanese Liberals, Francesco Melzi d’Eril with Eugène de Beauharnais, Napoleon’s stepson, as Viceroy.\textsuperscript{41} At the Kingdom’s

\textsuperscript{37} The quotation is in Gregory, p. 36.
\textsuperscript{40} Gregory, pp. 17-18.
\textsuperscript{41} The departments were as follows in 1810 (their respective capitals are in parentheses): Adda (Sondrio), Adige (Verona), Adriatico (Venezia), Agogna (Novara), Alto Adige (Trento), Alto Po
Territorial Formation of the ITALIAN REPUBLIC

Fig. 5.4

Fig. 5.5
A Roman-style gladiatorial sea games held at the Milan arena on occasion of the baptism of the *Roi de Rome* (June, 1811), Napoleonic Museum, Rome.
height, Italy covered 84,000 km² and had a population of seven million inhabitants.42

The epigraphs from Napoleon and Melzi above illustrate what Simon Schama describes in his study of the French Revolution, *Citizens*, as militarized nationalism, in which the citizen’s hypothetical freedoms are held hostage to the warrior state.43 The French state used national conscription to assert its dominance across the peninsula, conducting an annual draft of men aged 20-25 from 1802. Although conscription was unpopular and desertion high—a third of all conscripts abandoned their unit soon after arrival—the French encouraged patriotism by giving conscripts an Italian uniform and the Italian tricolour, which they fought under and was adopted as their national flag after Unification.44 The relationship between the citizen’s liberty and war is expressed in a letter written by a Venetian Lieutenant in 1804 to a friend: ‘il grande oggetto è quello d’imparare la guerra che deve essere il solo mestiere che possa renderci liberi […] Siamo ancora troppo giovani per pensare alla libertà’.45 Thus I intend to examine Milan’s development into the capital of the militarized Kingdom of Italy, from which it might evolve into a model for a city of war.

To construct a city as a military capital implies building spaces which allude to a theatre of war in that they construct the illusion that military performances

---

42 Grab, p. 29.
44 Grab, p. 37.
occurred there in the past, are being repeated there in the present, and their repetition will continue there unimpeded in the future. Thus, with Milan as the capital of Italy, Napoleon wanted everything done there to recall Imperial Rome.\textsuperscript{46}

Its classical heritage destroyed, Napoleon ordered a Roman arena to be built in the city, and chariot races regularly took place there so that the glories of ancient Rome could be imitated in the present.\textsuperscript{47} To celebrate the baptism of his son, the Roi de Rome in 1811, and the new title Napoleon conferred upon himself, ‘Padre dei Popoli’,\textsuperscript{48} the arena was filled with water so that it could be transformed into a lake for gladiatorial sea games (Fig. 5.5). Alongside the new Roman architecture, the completion of the Duomo was initiated, and the area around the Basilica di Sant’Ambrogio cleared for ceremonial occasions, since it was believed to be the place where Ambrose baptized Augustine.\textsuperscript{49} In contrast architectural elements that testified to former colonial occupations were demolished – for example Milan’s famous star fortification built under the Spanish Count Velasca in the sixteenth century (see Fig. 2.24) – and replaced by neo-classical works such as Antollini’s Foro Bonaparte.

Napoleon’s coronation as King of Italy in 1805 was the event that allowed these spaces of military performance to be translated into dramatic actions since the function of such ceremonies is to make power visible by distributing it into the corporeal movements of a living, breathing body (Fig. 5.6). The coronation was mediated through the Napoleonic myth of the saviour, in which, according to the

\textsuperscript{47} Cusani, VI (1867), 135.
\textsuperscript{48} ibid., p. 331.
\textsuperscript{49} Oman, p. 174.
Fig. 5.6

Fig. 5.7
historian Carlo Botta writing in 1829, when Napoleon announced to Melzi his intention to be crowned it was framed around his apparent yearning ‘to make the Italian nation free and independent’ after hearing of Italy’s misfortunes on the banks of the Nile, and that blessed with soldiers of invincible courage, ‘he had appeared at Milan when his Italian people believed him yet on the shores of the Red Sea’. The coronation took place at the Duomo. Napoleon wore the French Imperial Crown throughout, while, as the Lombard Corona di Ferro – a thin jewelled golden band – was placed upon his head, according to Cusani, he pronounced the much repeated words, ‘Dio me l’ha data, guai a chi la tocca!’ Napoleon then climbed twenty-five steps – presumably representing the twenty-four departments of the Kingdom of Italy with the final step symbolic of its Unification under French rule – and then sat on his throne at the summit. After the coronation, Napoleon conducted a procession around Palazzo Reale to applauding crowds. It made a strong impression on the Milanese citizens, since at Prince Ferdinand of Austria’s coronation in 1838 ‘i vecchi, ammirandola, ripetevano unanimi, essere riuscita inferiore per magnificenza, e più pel prestigio di Napoleone all’apice del potere e della gloria’. The coronation was the foundation for militarized patriotism since, on becoming king of Italy, Napoleon created the order of the Iron Crown of Lombardy, reserved for those distinguished in battle and awarded to both French and Italians soldiers. The awarding of medals, as the illustration of the ceremony of the French Legion

50 Carlo Giuseppe Guglielmo Botta, History of Italy during the Consulate and Empire of Napoleon Buonaparte, trans. by Frances Moore (Philadelphia: Towar & Hogan, 1829), p. 134.
51 Cusani, VI, p. 160.
52 ibid., p. 159.
53 ibid., p. 161.
54 Gregory, p. 77.
of Honour shows, occurred in the city’s counter-space, the countryside (Fig. 5.7). In this other space, the valiant soldiers are shown awaiting their honour, their bodies forming both the urban amphitheatre and the patriotic crowd of citizens who inhabit it, while their Caesar is seated upon the throne at the ‘human’ epicentre.

Although Italians never demonstrated patriotic sentiments towards the Kingdom – for example Beauharnais’s plea for Italians to defend their nation against the Austrians in 1814 was ignored – their attachment to a new Italian identity is reflected in Cattaneo’s comment that upon the return of the Austrians in 1815 ‘le coup le plus cruel avait été la suppression de l’uniforme national et l’obligation de subir l’uniforme autrichien’. The effect of Napoleonic conscription was that it produced, as Pick asserts, a convergence between birth and military affiliation.

On 18 March 1848 this convergence transformed Milan, now the capital of the Kingdom of Lombardy-Venetia and the headquarters of the Austrian army, into a city of war through what became known as the Cinque Giornate revolution concluding on 22 March – the date of its commemoration (Fig. 5.8). Motivated by news of revolution in Paris and Vienna and resentment towards the Austrian government, which had become widespread, on 18 March Milanese posted placards around Milan making revolutionary demands – for example for a

---


Provisional Government, a free press, an elected National Assembly, and a Civic Guard.\textsuperscript{57}

As agitation spread across the urban spaces, the city was transformed into a theatre of war. Under the commander of the Austrian army Marshal Radetzky, 10,500 soldiers of infantry, cavalry and field artillery were deployed, mainly from the garrison at Castello Sforzesco, along the city walls and to re-enforce the smaller urban garrisons at key buildings such as Palazzo Reale, Palazzo di Giustizia and Palazzo Marino.\textsuperscript{58}

Although the citizens lacked weapons, ammunition and military coordination, it was a moment when, according to Cesare Cantù, all classes and political persuasions were united: 'everything bore witness to the universal zeal of every class and condition'.\textsuperscript{59} The aristocracy handed in their priceless gun collections and chemists made gunpowder so that soon 'bodies of citizens armed with rifles, swords, pistols and old halberds were marching across the city streets, carrying the Italian tricolour, and shouting 'Viva Pio Nono! Viva l'Italia! Viva la Repubblica'.'\textsuperscript{60} Within this revolutionary chaos the function of urban architecture to shelter was deterritorialized and inverted into a series of vehicles for aggression. The roof that protects the occupant from the elements became the invisible lookout from where citizens could shower stones, boiling oil and water upon the Austrian soldiers below. Similarly the components that make the interior of the built work habitable were inverted onto the streets to make defensive barricades – \textsuperscript{57} Berkeley, iii, 78-83. \textsuperscript{58} ibid., p. 79. \textsuperscript{59} The quotation from Cesare Cantù is in Berkeley, iii, 90. \textsuperscript{60} Berkeley, iii, 88.
in rich areas from carriages, harpsichords and beds, in business quarters from palliasses, anvils and benches, and near churches from pews, pulpits and confessionals (Fig. 5.9).  

At the centre of this deterritorialization was the Duomo. It played an important role in the revolution due to its height, location, and ideological importance both to the citizens, as a symbol of liberty, and to the Austrians, as a symbol of their dominance over the layer of history left by Napoleon, and now sealed by Prince Ferdinand being crowned with the *Corona di Ferro*. In Luigi Torelli's account of the *Cinque Giornate* he describes how the Austrians transformed the Duomo into a 'vera fortezza'. A subterranean passageway, which connected the Duomo to the Bishop's residence on Via Larga, afforded the Austrians the opportunity to bolt all public entrances into the cathedral and simultaneously send in soldiers from below. Austrian Jägers, positioned on the roof of the Duomo, from where visitors like Torelli would ordinarily observe the beautiful panorama of Lombardy, transformed the cathedral into a perfect sniper position for firing upon citizens.

By 20 March Radetzky had evacuated the city to surround Milan with a ring of soldiers in the hope of starving the citizens into surrender. The Duomo was therefore left available for its reterritorialization into a symbol of Lombard liberty. Alfonsi, a commander of the revolution, ordered Luigi Torelli to the Duomo to scout for the presence of Austrians. On discovering that the enemy had departed, Torelli, accompanied by Scipione Baraggi, ascended the Duomo and placed an
Italian tricolour on the central spire to ‘far noto anche ai lontani come i cittadini fossero padroni del Duomo’. 64

Torelli’s actions would be recollected well beyond 22 March 1848, the date that marked the siege’s ending when citizens, using movable barricades, finally breached Porta Tosa – renamed Porta Vittoria afterwards – to discover that Radetzky’s army had departed to quash the uprising in Venice. The Duomo would subsequently be lit up with the colours of the Italian tricolour for commemorations of Italian independence, with a flag flying on the central spire recalling Torelli’s act (Fig. 5.10). The war hero, General Romolo Griffini, in 1860 wanted his gold medal to be engraved in Milanese dialect with an inscription testifying that he had witnessed Torelli’s act – ‘Me figuri de ves sotto la cupola del Domm de Milan’. 65 And the minister, Stefano Jacini, writing to Torelli in 1876 after having read his autobiographical account of the Cinque Giornate, describes ‘l’immenso effetto che produsse sopra noi tutti la vista della Bandiera Nazionale sventolante sulla Guglia del Duomo per merito del bravo Torelli’. 66 The Torelli mythology, as the visual centrepiece of a city of war, resurged in Fascist Italy when Mussolini recounted Torelli’s act in his celebrated speech of 18 March 1932 – ‘Conte Luigi Torelli, il quale fu il primo che il 18 marzo 1848 fissò la bandiera tricolore sul Duomo di Milano’. 67 And yet Mussolini moves Torelli’s act back to 18 March so that the actions of this Risorgimento hero coincide with the contents of his speech, that of the urban planning of Rome. Consequently it was under Fascism that Torelli’s

64 ibid., p. 97.
Fig. 5.10
patriotic act found its ultimate mode of commemoration in its compression into the Luigi Torelli U Boat inaugurated in 1939, serving in Asia. In this war machine, the cylindrical form of the tapered cathedral spire had evolved into a metallic tube designed to encase the militarized citizen, who now viewed the world through a periscope as Italy was propelled deeper and deeper into a subterranean world by this heterotopia of the Italian City of War.

5.3 Captain Torelli

Venne il regno di Napoleone, il regno della gloria militare, che ripristinò l'onore del valore italiano e mostrò come l'Italia possegga ogni elemento per bastare a sé ed essere grande.69

Luigi Torelli, *Pensieri sull'Italia di un anonimo Lombardo*

On 19 February 1870 at the Palazzo Reale in Milan, Luigi Torelli with Senator Cavriani founded the *Società di Solferino e San Martino*, Torelli becoming President of the Society. Donations from the three military leaders of the battle – Vittorio Emanuele (10,000 lire), Napoleon III (10,000 lire) and Franz Joseph (5,000 lire) – had ensured that the ossuaries of San Martino and Solferino could be inaugurated for the tenth commemoration of the battle. At the meeting Torelli underlined that there would be no distinction between friends and enemies in the arrangement of bones at the ossuaries, even when their nationality was apparent:

> Quegli avanzi mortali riposeranno sul rispettivo campo di battaglia. – Inutile si è il dire che non si fece distinzione di sorta fra amici e nemici, anche laddove era certa la nazionalità cui appartenevano. Tutti furono raccolti con eguale cura, ebbero ed avranno eguale trattamento.70

And yet, even if death made war a great equalizer, eliding national boundaries, this elision only occurred by Torelli’s choosing to have two ossuaries erected, thereby dividing the theatre of war into two distinct battles where Italy and France separately fought a common enemy, Austria.

---

The importance Torelli assigned to Napoleon III is recognized by Tobia who cites the example of the Society sending blankets and clothing to French prisoners in the Franco-Prussian war of 1870. And yet Tobia offers no further explanation for the symbolic importance of Napoleon III at the pilgrimage site, other than that he had fought in the battle. Torelli, as the above epigraph illustrates, perceived Napoleon I’s Kingdom of Italy as a demonstration of how Italy could become glorious through military prestige. Torelli’s conception of the Napoleonic Kingdom of Italy as an example of making an Italian patria is understandable once we realize that Torelli (1810-88) was born in the Swiss canton of Valtellina, a region only recognized as Italian after its annexation to Lombardy under Napoleon’s Cisalpine Republic in October 1797 (Fig. 5.11). Being born on the borders between two nations, as the anthropologist Stokes argues, creates ‘problems for those whose lives they frame’ with the population often being coerced into adopting a ‘unitary national culture’ in exchange for the ‘dubious benefits of military protection’. For Torelli, whose sense of national identity must have always appeared under threat, a Napoleonic genealogy for how to master the resurgence of Italy provided a fixed historical anchor that was crucial in the patriotic geography he constructed at San Martino and Solferino. Tobia states that Torelli was driven by a desire to construct a ‘perenne atmosfera di venerazione, di religiosità patria, per farne un sito di pellegrinaggio elegiaco e di meditazione’. I intend to explore the currents that influenced how Torelli, in his role as a Captain of Italian patriotism, sought to

---

71 Tobia, Una patria, p. 184.
72 Gregory, p. 38.
74 Tobia, Una patria, p. 184.
Fig. 5.11

Fig. 5.12
Napoleon I and his son. From Fugier, *Napoleone e l'Italia* (see Fig. 5.6), II, Plate XXXIX.
navigate Italy from its own vulnerable geographical borderline position into an anchored fixed identity.

Torelli’s post-Unification political career was unquestionably devoted to the geographical ‘making’ of Italy. His service as a Prefect covered the length of the peninsula – Bergamo (1861-62), Palermo (1862 and 1866), Pisa (1862-64), and Venice from 1866. As a senator and minister (1864-65) he was involved in the nation’s internal colonial project – the Tre Fontane bonifica in the Agro Romano (discussed in Chapter Four) – and Italy’s foreign economic interests, serving on the Italian commission of the Suez Canal. Visiting Egypt in 1867 he scouted along the Red Sea for potential Italian colonies. As a result of his work in Egypt he became friends with Lesseps, who invited him to Paris in 1864 to attend a celebration of the Suez Canal hosted by Napoleon III.

The arousal of Torelli’s consciousness as an Italian patriot paradoxically did not happen in Milan, but the imperial ‘Other’ capital of the Austro-Hungarian Empire, Vienna, where he was sent in 1826 to attend the Military Academy. His interest in Italian nationalism developed through engaging with Polish and Hungarian cadets who spoke passionately about fighting for the independence of their respective countries from Austria. In Liberal Italy this formative experience was recounted in the press which highlighted how patriotism was a cosmopolitan crusade through Torelli with his international ‘condiscopoli’ responding to a national calling:

75 Monti, Il Conte, p. 158
Egli è di quelli che l'affetto alla patria lo sentono più vivamente; egli ebbe eroismi, da quando giovanetto studente a Vienna nel 1831 vagheggiava con pochi condiscendenti ungheresi e polacchi l'idea della indipendenza nazionale. 77

In his youth, the former Roi de Rome – Francis Joseph Charles Bonaparte – upon whom the Austrians had conferred the title of Duke of Reichstadt after Waterloo, embodied the Italian patriotic crusade. Torelli believed that Italian independence was contingent upon the liberation of Napoleon II, held as a virtual prisoner in Vienna. Once free the Duke would become an instrument to ‘solvare Italia’ and make it independent, thereby completing what his father, the great Emperor, had been unable to finish. 78 Torelli was not unique in admiring Napoleon II; from his birth he was portrayed as a Messiah. 79 Moreover his relationship with his father, Napoleon I, was perceived as a model of paternal love (Fig. 5.12).

Torelli was virtually the same age as the Duke and his romantic adoration of him, according to the Fascist historian Antonio Monti, appears to have been on the verge of sexual love, since Napoleon II’s soft dark eyes would bring Manzoni’s Il Cinque Maggio – an ode to Napoleon I – upon his lips. 80 In conjunction with romantic feelings for Napoleon II, Torelli hatched a plan to rescue him. The plan involved Torelli studying how to become a Prince so that he could enter the Duke’s sphere of influence. 81 Unfortunately the Duke’s untimely death on 22 July

78 Monti, Il Conte, pp. 7-10.
80 Monti, Il Conte, p. 9.
81 ibid., pp. 7-9.
1832 quashed Torelli’s plan. Upon visiting the former Roi de Rome’s body lying in state, dressed in a Hungarian colonel’s uniform, Torelli wrote that he now realized that his dream was over: ‘Io lo contemplai un istante pensando come ad un sogno al mio piano, e poi col cuore gonfio uscii dalla camera ardente’.\(^2\) It was over thirty years later on the bank of the Nile that Torelli, sitting on the top of the pyramid of Gizar, recalled Napoleon I and the dream he had had for the Roi de Rome.\(^3\)

Torelli’s founding of the *Società di Solferino e San Martino* and his development of the battlefields into a site of national pilgrimage may be read as a response to the Roman Question, which he articulated in *Pensieri sull’Italia di un anonimo Lombardo*. Influenced by Gioberti’s *Primato* and Balbo’s *Speranza d’Italia*, Torelli’s views constituted a form of neo-Guelphism, in that he believed that the Pope should relinquish temporal power of the Papal States for the higher principle of Italy. However, what is apparent from Torelli’s excursus is that the Pope, as ruler of the Papal States, after 1848, became an occluding object that stood between Italy and access to patriotic sentiments since they were under the domain of a temporal Christian *patria*.

In the opening lines Torelli connects the origins of the sublime desire to liberate Italy with Pope Julius II:

> Dacchè Papa Giulio II espresse il sublime concetto di liberare l’Italia dai barbari, ritengo non passasse mai anno, e forse giorno, nel quale qualche nobil mente, italiana, ripetendo la grande idea, non sentisse vivissimo il desiderio di vederla mandata ad effetto.\(^4\)

---

\(^2\) ibid., p. 9.  
\(^3\) Monti, *Storia del Canale di Suez*, p. 184.  
\(^4\) Torelli, *Pensieri sull’Italia*, p. 11.
Julius II was, as Christine Shaw argues, ‘the epitome of a Renaissance pope’.  

Parallel to Vittorio Emanuele’s later commemoration as the Re Soldato, Julius was known as the Warrior Pope, and through diplomacy and warfare he extended the Papal States south to the kingdom of Naples, and north to the borders of Lombardy and Tuscany. In contrast to the situation under the Renaissance Papacy, Rome was currently poorly managed and due to civil unrest the Papacy relied upon foreign intervention from Swiss mercenary soldiers and Austria. Rome, he argues, has become a lifeless body – ‘Questo gran corpo morale, che noi conosciamo sotto il nome di stato pontificio, è privo di forza, di attività, di vita propria’ – and if Austria were to depart it would fall into a state of anarchy, resorting to foreign mercenaries to defend itself rather than ‘sudditi fedeli’. In Augustinian fashion, Torelli pleads with Italians to abandon the illusions that they have in the Eternal city to contemplate the cruel reality that Rome has become:

Oh! Uomini di mente e di cuore che ragionate sulle condizioni d’Italia e fate voti pel suo ben essere, deh! abbandonate le illusioni e contemplate questa crudele e terribile realtà. Prodotta non da circostanze eventuali, ma dalla natura intrinseca ed invariabile di quel governo.

In 1853, following the return of Pope Pius to Rome, Torelli grew concerned that the Roman question would promote religious indifference and a general indifference towards Italy amongst Italians: ‘Dall’indifferentismo religioso si passa all’indifferentismo politico, e la società allora perde la sua vita, e va nel

---

86 Luigi Torelli, La Questione del potere temporale del Papa considerata nel 1845, nel 1853 e nel 1870 (Venice: Gazzetta, 1870), p. 9.
87 ibid., pp. 13-14.
Consequently, after Rome’s annexation, Torelli wrote that the re-ordering of religion in relation to the *patria* could begin in earnest. At one point he compares this process to the construction of a picture frame in which the inner painting will be an interpretation of the journey to Rome:

‘Si farà la cornice a quel quadro, le glosse intorno al modo che si andò a Roma.’

At the Torre Monumentale, a work that celebrates the march towards the annexation of Rome, the ‘cornice’, that is to say the frame within which Torelli composes his picture of a patriotic religion, is the period between 1846 and 1849. Torelli calls this time frame the *Guerra Santa*, conveying the notion of a saintly crusade, since it was characterized by an upsurge in Italians volunteering to fight against Austrian occupation – especially after the *Cinque Giornate* – combined with the assumed support of Pius IX. First, inside the first-floor gallery dedicated to the Battle of Goito (1848) is a display of the books comprising the names of the Italian soldiers who fought for Italian independence from 1848 to 1870, organized into province and *comune*. It is described by Antonio Breda in his official guide book as ‘il libro d’oro della patria’. The Battle of Goito was the direct result of the *Cinque Giornate* revolution in which the Piedmontese army and volunteers from across northern Italy, led by Vittorio Emanuele’s father, Carlo Alberto, fought against the Austrians. The connection between 1848 and the book of names recreates the golden period of the *Guerra Santa* when the population were prepared to make sacrifices: ‘Infine non eravi sacrifcio che la popolazione in que’

---

88 ibid., p. 45.
89 ibid., p. 50.
primi tempi di slancio e di speranza non fosse pronta a fare, e questo è da dire di tutta la Lombardia'.

Second, in Torelli's memoirs of the Cinque Giornate, he describes his patriotic journey up the Duomo, where he crossed dimly lit corridors, before ascending the spiral staircase towards the central spire. It is this model ascent that is mirrored and repeated at the Torre Monumentale by the visitor. From the Spia d'Italia the Italian flag flying upon the Torre Monumentale brings the Risorgimento City of War to its new close-up position.

---

92 Torelli, Cinque giornate, p. 217.
93 ibid., p. 95.
5.4 Skull and Cross Bones

On 24 June 1860 Milan commemorated the first anniversary of the Battle of San Martino and Solferino in a military display led by the Commander of the Italian army, Alfonso La Marmora, and General Massimo d'Azeglio. The military parade of infantry, artillery batteries, rifle and cavalry regiments congregated at the Napoleonic Piazza d'Armi setting off towards the Arch of Peace as crowds burst into enthusiastic applause—‘Viva l’Italia, viva il Re, viva il generale La Marmora’ with a ‘viva la Toscana – l’Italia – l’Unione’ when Tuscan battalions marched past. The arch, a modern rendition of the Arch of Septimius Severus in Rome, had been designed by Luigi Cagnola in 1806 to honour Beauharnais’s marriage to Princess Augusta-Amelia of Bavaria, but was not completed until 1838 to coincide with Ferdinand I’s coronation at the Duomo as King of Lombardy-Venetia (Fig. 5.13). In 1859, on the arrival of Napoleon III and Vittorio Emanuele in Milan after victory in the Battle of Magenta, inscriptions were added to commemorate the Napoleonic alliance that had once made Milan capital of the Kingdom of Italy and had now liberated the city from the tyranny of Austrian occupation under Napoleon III—‘Alle speranze del Regno Italico/Auspice Napoleone I/ I Milanesi dedicarono l’anno MDCCCVII/ E francati da servitù/ Felicemente restituirono/ l’anno MDCCCLIX’. The arch was now officially named Sempione, since it connected Avenue Sempione, which ran north from Castello Sforza under the arch, to the Simplon Pass that led to Paris.95

Fig. 5.13
In La Marmora’s speech the Napoleonic arch is called the altar, at whose feet Italy thanks God – l’Altissimo – for victory: ‘Un giorno così solenne meritava che vi radunassi qui appiè dell’altare per ringraziare anzi tutto l’Altissimo d’averci accordata la vittoria’. The appropriation of religious liturgy and the spatial practices encoded in an altar permitted the event to be reported in the Gazzetta di Milano as a celebration of citizenship rather than military victory, in which citizens would collectively pray for liberty and independence with the emotions of the heart:

Fu qual esser doveva, festa non della milizia, ma della cittadinanza tutta quanta: avvegnaché dinanzi a quell’altare, concorde fosse il concetto della preghiera, concorde l’aspirazione di tutti i cuori – indipendenza e libertà – Italia e Vittorio Emanuele!

From the tenth commemoration the national celebrations of the battle occurred at the ossuaries of San Martino and Solferino, inaugurated for the occasion by General Govone, the Minister of War, and attended by Prince Umberto, Colonel de La Haie, representing Napoleone III, and Admiral de Polak, representing Emperor Franz Joseph. After Govone’s influential speech (to be discussed) made at the altar of the ossuary of San Martino, Prince Umberto symbolically placed the standard of the National Guard of Milan at the altar, thereby connecting the capital of Lombardy with the new altar of the patria. And yet in contrast to the urban Napoleonic altar whose Beaux-arts style conveyed the eternity of the nation, the ossuary adopted an explicitly macabre Baroque-style architecture, which sought to

---

97 ibid., p. 1.
98 Breda, p. 23.
punctuate the senses in its role as the ‘altare più santo della patria’ (Fig. 5.14). 99

The arrangement of skulls in the ossuary took inspiration from Baroque ossuaries such as the famous San Bernadino in Milan whose walls were covered with the skulls and bones of the plague victims of 1630 (Fig. 5.15). According to Etlin the Baroque depiction of death originated in the Medieval tradition of the *memento mori*, where images of dancing skeletons were intended to shock the viewer into an appreciation of a Christian eschatology through a recognition of his or her mortality. 100 I intend to examine how the skulls and bones of the Baroque *memento mori*, which have been removed from the increasingly secularized urban spaces, are reterritorialized into the ossuaries at San Martino and Solferino, where a patriotic death is used as the foundation for the promise of immortality within a Christian eschatology.

After the Battle of San Martino and Solferino the vast majority of the dead were buried rapidly in communal ditches dug in the battlefields, as the air grew heavy with the smell of death. 101 According to Dunant, the Lombard peasants, whom the French paid as gravediggers, occasionally buried the living, and the graves were only half-dug so that within weeks the hands and feet would protrude through the earth. 102 As a result of farmers complaining that their ploughs turned up skeletons of the war dead, articles began appearing in the press that lamented the lack of any commemoration for ‘martiri nostri’, whose burial in ‘grandi fossi di morti’ was not even marked with a cross to remind a passer-by to show reverence. 103

---

99 Siciliani, p. 124.
100 Etlin, pp. 3-7
101 Breda, p. 9.
102 Dunant, pp. 48-49.
Fig. 5.14
Ossuary of San Martino. Author's photograph.

Fig. 5.15
S. Bernardino alle Ossa, Milan. Author’s photograph
The exhumation of the bodies began in December 1869 and was organized like a military campaign. Each *comune* where the battle had occurred formed a committee of volunteers who received orders from a central command office (Fig. 5.16). According to *L'Emporio Pittoresco*, 751 ‘fosse’ were opened and 8,177 skeletons were exhumed.104 The sacred bones, as they were repeatedly called, were then washed so that they would ‘subire una nuova e perfetta pulitura’ that would allow them to be touched.105 A medical team led by Doctor Giuseppe Marchi and the craniologist Amedei di Cavriana supervised the exhumation;106 its role was to reassemble skeletons in their entirety where possible and identify bones.107 Where the deceased could be identified they were repatriated, and the entire procedure was applauded as a reverential national duty – ‘La nazione adempiò in tal modo ad un dovere pietoso che é da tutti commendato’.108

In April 1870 the sacred bones were ready for collection from each *comune* to be moved to one of the ossuaries. The transportation was conducted in a ceremonial procession in which the bones were carried inside Baroque-style tiered catafalques pulled by horses dressed with funereal black harnesses. The catafalques were covered in black cloth with inscriptions in Latin and Italian written upon each one, and golden crowns and war trophies placed on top. Behind the catafalques was a cortège comprised of brass bands, clergy, local councillors and townspeople, while the National Guard, situated at a suitable distance, protected the saintly catafalques

105 Breda, p. 17.  
106 ibid., p. 115.  
108 ibid., p. 258.
with their rifles. The occasion was so moving that, according to Breda, there
was not a dry eyelash; the tearful emotional outburst amongst the cortège was
provoked by an awareness that the roads traversed had been bathed in blood eleven
years previously:

Percorrevano mesti e solenni quelle strade, dove ogni svolta, ogni bivio,
ogni crocicchio era stato undici anni prima bagnato dal sangue di quei
prodi che ora vi passavano inanimati sotto trofei di bandiere abbrunate al
suono di tutte la campagne accompagnati dalla riverenza universale.\textsuperscript{110}

Gaburo's painting \textit{Trasporto delle ossa a Solferino} (1870) depicts the cortège and
catafalques as a collective body curving up a path towards the white ossuary upon
the horizon (Fig. 5.17). Etlin has observed that the cortège was an integral part of
the cemetery design in Napoleonic France where architects would even specify
that the cortège occurred at dusk and be accompanied by sepulchral music so that a
touching scene of social harmony amongst the ‘families who found themselves
together on this final voyage’ was created.\textsuperscript{111} Similarly Gaburo chose the emotive
atmosphere of dusk with shadows falling upon the landscape cut against the
brilliant white ossuary. The symbolism Gaburo assigns to the cortège is evident
when it is compared to the ossuary’s appearance in a photograph from 1870 (Fig.
5.18). Gaburo has quite clearly increased the gradient of the hill so that the cortège
has the dramatic atmosphere of the spiritual ascent of the Risorgimento struggle
towards a state of patriotic Grace. The artist has also demolished the surrounding

\textsuperscript{109} Siciliani, pp. 71-72; see also Breda, pp. 16-18.
\textsuperscript{110} Breda, p. 17.
\textsuperscript{111} Etlin, p. 291.
Fig. 5.17
M. Gaburo, *Trasporto delle ossa a Solferino*,
Museum of the Risorgimento, Solferino.

Fig. 5.18
Photograph of the inauguration of the Ossuary of Solferino (1870),
Museum of the Risorgimento, Brescia.
buildings so that the cortège becomes an uninterrupted flow of citizens towards the ossuary as a myth of the nation’s Ascension.

The Ossuary of Solferino was constructed inside the fifteenth-century church of San Pietro. In the painting the white church of San Pietro contrasts with the black catafalques, which have the flags of the Austrian and French armies attached to them, which are replaced by the Italian tricolour at the ossuary entrance. The Church of San Pietro, through the intervention of the ossuary, had become, according to Breda, sacred to three nations, and so like that of Rome, it had the status of a cosmopolitan church.112 As the immaculate white church absorbs the black catafalques of mortal sacrifice into its architectural body, the never-ending cortège becomes the journey of a chosen people who, after having crossed a wilderness have reached the end at San Pietro, whose potent image conveys the notion of Italy’s Ascension as the outcome of cosmopolitan sacrifice.

General Govone’s inauguration speech, which was so popular that it was even recited by a pilgrim on Siciliani’s journey, echoes Gaburo’s biblical imagery.113 Govone thanks God three times in the speech. First, he thanks him for giving humanity a man amongst men – we assume Christ – who guided mankind onto the road of humanity where Italy’s ultimate destiny as a nation is one of its ends.114 Second, he thanks him for providing Italy with a king who has fought with ‘la bandiera della libertà della patria’ and in so doing has guided his soldiers in the

---

112 Breda, p. 88.
113 Siciliani, pp. 55-56.
saintly battles like the column of fire that guided ‘il Popolo di Mosè’ out of Egypt through the wilderness:

Ringraziamo Iddio che una forte stirpe di Re, valicando 10 secoli, con varia fortuna, giunse insino a noi per impugnare la bandiera della libertà della patria e guidarci sui campi delle sante battaglie, come la colonna rovente guidò il Popolo di Mosè.\footnote{ibid.}

Finally, he thanks God for providing brave soldiers, while the speech’s conclusion offers no comfort for those who lost (the Austrians), since they must accept that ‘la mano di Dio e lo spirito dei tempi nuovi erano contro di voi’.\footnote{ibid.}

These religious sentiments were expressed through the theme of redemption at the ossuaries. Both ossuaries had been severely damaged in the battle and their reconstruction and transformation into national ‘shrines’ constituted the first layer of a redeemed Italy. Redemption was also the theme expressed on the public façades of both buildings. At San Martino, a mosaic of the ‘Redentore’ dominated the façade, which was accompanied by two smaller mosaics, one of an angel armed with a spade signifying war, the other an angel with a golden crown, that of victory.\footnote{ibid.} Similarly, the ossuary of Solferino carried a mosaic of the ‘Redentore’ with a figure of Christ below. Above the ‘Redentore’ was a four-metre high effigy of St Peter who held in each hand the symbolic keys of the Church and at the top of the twenty-two-metre high façade rose a statue of the Virgin Mary in an act of interceding grace. The façade’s ornamentation, conveyed ‘in quel luogo desolato

\footnote{Siciliani, p. 44}
dalla morte, l’idea della vita, della vita eterna, e la maestà consolatrice della religione’.  

Both ossuaries’ interiors were identical, with a black cloth fringed in gold that shielded the pilgrim from the sight of the skulls during the Catholic service where they knelt staring at the altar lit by six black candles and visually dominated by a large black cross that symbolized death and resurrection (Fig. 5.19). It is when kneeling that Siciliani hallucinates images of bereaved women and children – the inconsolable mother, the tearful widow – whose tragic plight is the permissible vehicle through which he becomes emotionally aroused by the soldier’s sacrifice and the noble holocaust that created the patria:

Mi pareva di vedere morti e feriti, vedove in lagrime, figliuioletti orfani, madri inconsolabili […] benedivo dal fondo dell’anima all’eroismo di que’ valorosi che della vita facendo nobile e generoso olocausto, ci diedero una patria.

When the service ends, Siciliani, along with other pilgrims, crosses the threshold of black and white curtains – symbolic of the passage from death to eternal life – where the horrific spectacle of rows of neatly arranged skulls is revealed to his eyes:

Oh Dio, quanti teschi! … Dio, che spettacolo! Che stretta al cuore! Te lo aspettavi, già v’eri preparato, t’aveano prevenuto; ma la realtà vince qualunque immaginazione.

---

118 ibid., p. 82
119 ibid., p. 44
120 ibid., p. 46.
121 ibid., pp. 46-47.
Fig. 5.19
Arranged 'con religiosa cura', the jawbones of some, Siciliani notices, have been
made secure using iron thread and from the shape of several skulls he can often
discern those which are Austrian from those of valiant Italian soldiers.\textsuperscript{122} And yet
the precision of both the arrangement of the skulls and Siciliani's scientific
observations elides the disfigured face of the soldier's death-struggle that war
dispenses and is summed up by Dunant as a 'sinister convulsive grin'.\textsuperscript{123}
Replacing the cruel realities of death, depicted over and over again by Dunant, is
the romantic sacrifice that Italy offers the dying soldier, which is condensed into
the imagery in the ossuary's crypt, that of a ceremonial urn containing the
conserved heart of Captain Tebaldi who fought in the battle.\textsuperscript{124}

In Siciliani's preface to his account he states his intention to convey the experience
of his 'devoto pellegrinaggio' to the 'pietosa commemorazione' in the 'luogo
sacro' where the destiny of the 'patria nostra' was fought. Alphonse Dupront has
aptly described pilgrimage as 'une thérapie par l'espace' where, situated in a
foreign landscape, the pilgrim realizes that the external environment cannot fulfil
his or her desires.\textsuperscript{125} Pilgrimage is an 'act of leaving' where the pilgrim
experiences a desire for closeness with the holy body made present at a shrine –
Christ, a Saint – because the soul (or psyche) becomes disembodied from an
ordinary set of spatial relationships.\textsuperscript{126} For Siciliani his psyche, disembodied
through pilgrimage, finds a oneness with the dead soldier's body whose romantic
apex is Tebaldi's heart.

\textsuperscript{122} ibid., p. 47.
\textsuperscript{123} Dunant, p. 48.
\textsuperscript{124} Breda, pp. 37-38.
\textsuperscript{125} The quotation from Alphonse Dupront is in Brown, p. 87.
\textsuperscript{126} Brown, pp. 86-87.
Siciliani compares the presentation of death at San Martino to that of Pompeii through the degree to which his soul was moved. At Pompeii it was the force of Nature that had destroyed man which perplexes Siciliani, since he finds no explanation as to why Nature chose this course. In contrast, at the Ossuary his soul is aroused patriotically because the destruction of life and the bloody sacrifice made had a telos in the birth of Italy.\textsuperscript{127} Freud observes how it is far easier for us to accept death as a sublime act than as a chance event. He notes that in primitive tribes death is never conceptualized as natural, but is attributed to the influence of an enemy or an evil spirit.\textsuperscript{128} At San Martino, it appears that a patriotic war provides an explanation for the death of so many, as the sublimation of patriotic death into a pleasurable act allows the enemy who killed them to be avenged from beyond the grave.

\textsuperscript{127} Siciliani, pp. 50-51.
\textsuperscript{128} Freud, \textit{Beyond the Pleasure Principle}, p. 45.
5.5 Telescopic Pleasures

The darkened chamber of the camera obscura illustrates the desire to move beyond the body’s physical limitations, since it was devised to observe what could not be seen without blinding the human eye – the solar eclipse. Rays of light passing through a circular aperture pierced in the shutters of a window produced an inverted image of the sun on the opposite wall, called the picture plane (Fig. 5.20). The physical limitations of the human body, in a sense, constitute an occluding object since they stand between our mortal body and our dreams of overstepping its limitations. One might also add that art enables us to experience these dreams virtually through the removal of occluding objects from the aesthetic experience. Alberti invented perspective from the camera obscura. He replaced the aperture with a centre of projection and the optical processes of seeing with a geometrical transformation called central projection (Fig. 5.21). Similar to the camera obscura, the invention of perspective appealed to a desire to see beyond what was available to the ordinary experience of seeing. We look, as Gombrich asserts, ‘with one stationary eye, we see objects only from side to side, and have to guess or imagine what lies behind’. Thus, he concludes, perspective rests on the assumption that we cannot look around a corner. It offers the viewer not only the illusion that an occluding object (a corner) may be removed from the line of sight, but also the wish to imagine what might be hidden behind the object.

---

Fig. 5.20

Illustration of Alberti’s perspective using front picture plane. From Kubovy (see Fig. 5.20), p. 19.
Architecture is both a work of art and a habitable space. As a work of art it has the capacity to create the illusion that occluding objects can be removed from the line of sight and as a lived space it can produce the illusion that the real world is a space of endless pleasure. The familiar name for the Tower of Solferino, the *Spia d'Italia*, implies that the architectural work has the capacity to remove the occluding object of distance. Its height allows the occupant to occupy the in-between position of the camera obscura’s aperture, enabling them to spy onto an outer hostile world and alert an inner world, behind the tower, to potential attack. I shall examine how architecture as shelter and the telescope as an optical pleasure converge at the Torre Monumentale, so that the built work may occupy an in-between position, filtering out the harmful elements of the external world so that the retrieval of Italy in the inner heterotopic space of the theatre may be artificially re-experienced.

The characteristic position of the *Spia d’Italia* looming over the landscape was used in pictorial representations as the distinguishing feature that would give the painting its authenticity as a realistic depiction of the Battle of Solferino seen by the artist, rather than a fantasy imagined in the studio at a later date. The famous military artist Carlo Bossoli immortalized the tower in his painting of the battle – *Battaglia di Solferino* (Fig. 5.22). Reminiscent in style of Delacroix’s influential paintings of the French Revolution of 1848, the picture replaces the citizens’ uprising with a disciplined French army that sweeps through Solferino, their French flag changing into the Italian tricolour as they enter the arched city gates. In the distance, upon a hilltop, is the silhouetted tower, its outline silently observing from above the battle being fought below like the hidden eye of an
Fig. 5.22
Fig. 5.23
Fig. 5.24
Crystal dome of the Torre Monumentale from below.
Author's photograph.

Fig. 5.25
Crystal dome of the Torre Monumentale from above.
Author's photograph.
omniscient narrator. Bossoli, the architect of the Torre Monumentale di San Martino, apparently gained inspiration for the design from wandering across the surrounding hills of San Martino for a month.\textsuperscript{132}

His design of the Torre Monumentale uses the morphological features and applications of the telescope to create an inner Risorgimento universe circumscribed by the walls of the tower (Fig. 5.23). First, its cylindrical form is composed of a drum – 20.6 metres in diameter and 24 meters high – and a slender mast – tapering to 13 metres in diameter and 50 metres high – which visually resemble the salient features of a telescope, that of the eyepiece and wider object lens. Similarly the spiral staircase above the drum, which leads to the summit, mirrors the corkscrew thread of the telescope that allows the viewer to adjust the length of the eyepiece when focusing on an object. Second, the drum’s circular interior, called the rotunda, is separated from the mast by a crystal dome. From above the crystal dome rises to resemble the form of a concave lens, whereas the space below becomes a convex void, thereby duplicating the lenses of a telescope. Finally the crystal dome is shaped into the form of a sun, which is illuminated so that the sun may be observed without blinding the eye of the pilgrim prior to their ascent (Fig. 5.24). To complement this view from the upper galleries the pilgrim may look through the aperture of the dome into the darkened room of the rotunda where the king’s statue appears at the epicentre of an inverted image on the picture plane, that of the solar floor-design (Fig. 5.25). By pointing the telescope towards the skies and observing mountains and seas upon the lunar surface, Galileo

\textsuperscript{132} L. Massuero, A San Martino della battaglia: ricordi dell’inaugurazione della Torre Storica avvenuta il 15 ottobre 1893 (Como: Tipografia Cooperativa Comensi, 1894), p. 93.
demolished not only Aristotle’s theory that the moon was a polished marble sphere, but also the corner stone of Catholic dogma, the earth-centred universe.\(^{133}\)

The king’s statue at the epicentre of the solar design conveys the notion that Vittorio Emanuele is at the centre of Galileo’s heliocentric universe and therefore in harmony with an enlightened God free of Catholic dogma, and as *Padre della Patria* he has filtered out the harmful intensity of natural light.

Surrounding the sun-king in the rotunda are eight bronze busts of generals who fought in the wars of Independence and therefore constitute the Risorgimento solar system – La Marmora, Ansaldi, Guidotti, Passalacqua, Perrone di San Martino, Arnaldi, Gabrielli, and Rey di Villarey.\(^{134}\) The solar cycle has a duration of twenty-two years, delineated by the eight upper galleries, which depict the Risorgimento wars from 1848 to 1870. If we measure the life span of organisms through the solar cycle, the positioning of Vittorio Emanuele at the centre of the Risorgimento cycle transforms him into a God-like being who controls the measurement of Italy’s age, portioning each birthday into a twenty-two year cycle.

The revolutionary duration of twenty-two years becomes an event through the materials that structure the tower’s optical effects: iron and crystal, associated with the revolutionary architectural design of 1848, Paxton’s Crystal Palace. Sheets of glass held in an iron lattice gave Paxton’s design its crystal appearance, which the tower reinterprets as a network of iron beams that support both a series of semi-circular iron viewing platforms and the wrought iron spiral staircase of 490 metres

---


\(^{134}\) *Guida popolare della Torre e dell’Ossario di S. Martino* (Padova: Pizzati, 1912), p. 7.
in length (Fig. 5.26 and Fig. 5.27). The artificial light that the pilgrim sees in the rotunda, emanating from the dome, creates the illusion on the ascent that the colourful geometric Liberty-style ornamentation that decorates the edges of windows, railings and stairs, is a kaleidoscopic play of light refracted through crystal.

At the centre of the crystal experience is the open spiral staircase, whose invisible axis emanates from the king's statue as its lower centre and the iron mast of the flag on the summit – exactly 22 metres in length. Clues to how we should interpret the Torre Monumentale's spiral staircase can be found through its relationship with the Spia d'Italia, whose original function was to alert Solferino to attacks from invaders and so is associated with an Italy under colonial occupation. The Spia d'Italia is a square-shaped tower, and after its restoration the sixteen wooden ramps used to ascend to the summit followed the building's four corners, as Siciliani noted (Fig. 5.28 and Fig. 5.29). In the Torre Monumentale a pre-unified Italy as an experience associated with corners is built into the staircase from the ground floor to the first floor – the drum – where the visitor experiences a zigzag movement that duplicates that of the Spia d'Italia. Moreover, it is an unpleasurable, disorientating experience since it occurs in darkness and therefore constitutes a type of chaos in contrast to the cosmos of the upper galleries flooded with light. Spiral staircases, as Theodore Andrea Cook argues in The Curves of Life, were informed by natural growth which tended towards right-handed spirals – particularly in shells, horns, flowers – and left-handed spirals that followed the

135 Breda, pp. 66-67.
136 ibid., p. 107.
137 Siciliani, p. 101.
138 Breda, p. 71.
Fig. 5.26
Spiral staircase of the Torre. Author’s photograph.

Fig. 5.27
Spiral staircase of the Torre. Author’s photograph.
Fig. 5.28
Staircase of the tower of Solferino.
Author’s photograph.

Fig. 5.29
Enclosed staircase of the Torre.
Author’s photograph.
sun's natural movement and is observed in symbols such as the swastika, which symbolizes the life-giving sun.\textsuperscript{139} The Torre Monumentale is a right-handed spiral staircase and therefore creates the notion of the Risorgimento as a natural growth, protected by the defensive military structure of a medieval-style tower. The spiral staircase was deployed in the medieval tower because its structure allowed doors to open into it at any height up the spiral and that the tower would be 'held by a few men against a hundred foe'.\textsuperscript{140}

On a psychical level the spiral staircase conveys the notion that Italy's natural growth is founded though the violence of war. The corner-free spiral staircase may be interpreted as the experience of a resurgent Italy; as the pilgrim ascends they see an uninterrupted flow of painted battle-scenes, which produces the illusion that war is a pleasurable act since it seeks to remove the occluding object.

The staircase may be thought of as the heterotopic device, that is to say the stage upon which the patriotic game is played. Its spiral movement creates an uninterrupted line of sight between the statue of Vittorio Emanuele – at the base of the tower – and the retrieved object of Italy, viewed at the summit. One could say that Vittorio Emanuele is the master of his own \textit{fort-da} game, who makes becoming patriotic a form of play in which the rules are set by the King. For children play often involves metamorphosis in which the child changes into another being – a tiger, a dragon, a horse –using toys as transitional objects.

\textsuperscript{140} ibid., p. 307.
Elements of this metamorphosis can be observed in the Freudian *fort-da* game where the reel becomes a magical device that transforms stationary objects into flying beings as objects appear to fly in or out of view. Similarly, at the Torre Monumentale these playful aspects of the reel are transformed into the potential space of play of the spiral staircase. Upon the ascent up the staircase the pilgrim is offered a 360° degree vision which creates the illusion that one may swoop and swerve in and out, never losing sight of those above or below that appear like birds in flight (Fig. 5.27). Thus, contrary to the real world where one is bound by the natural forces of gravity, the upper galleries are where the pilgrim becomes patriotic through the fantasy of flight in the Risorgimento dream world. And yet as Daedalus invented wings so that he might master the sky, those who disobey the sun-king by flying too close to his centre of power, will, like Daedalus’s son, Icarus, plummet to a certain death.

So far I have discussed the architectural relationship between the two towers, and would now like to examine the development of the telescopic gaze which unquestionably came from the early pilgrimages in the 1870s and 1880s that aimed to keep the Risorgimento alive through the panorama from the *Spia d’Italia*, which demarcated the ending of the pilgrimage. Siciliani’s pleasure on the view from the *Spia d’Italia* is derived from his mastering of a telescopic vision, which like the optical device that brings a distant object close-up to the viewer, allows him to retrieve Risorgimento events that have disappeared beneath the historical distance of the passage of time. Siciliani observes that from the River Chiese (on the left) and the Mincio (on the right) is 336 km, and this area is where the great campaigns of 1848, 1859 and 1866 occurred. Landmarks are picked out such as Castle
Cavriana, which was the headquarters of Emperor Franz Joseph and from where Napoleon III telegraphed Paris with news of his splendid victory.\textsuperscript{141} And in each retrieval of the past, Siciliani's pleasure stems from an illusory mastery over death in which he fantasizes that he has the power to keep the retrieved object eternally present, and eternally close to him. The inscription upon the summit orders the patriotic subject to remember how precious Italy is, by never forgetting the number of sacrifices required for its resurgence:

La battaglia di Solferino e San Martino costò all'Italia un generale, 3 colonelli, 76 ufficiali, 2200 soldati. Alla Francia costò 2 generali, 7 colonnelli, 200 ufficiali e 6500 soldati! Italiano che qui venisti, rammenta queste cifre.\textsuperscript{142}

The significance of this telescopic vision in the conceptualization of the Torre Monumentale is apparent in the optical presentation of the two towers at the National Exhibition in Turin in 1884 by the \textit{Società di San Martino e Solferino}. The presentation used a camera ottica designed by a Swiss – Gotzinger of Basel – who had presented panoramas of the most prestigious hotels in Switzerland for the national exhibition at Zurich in 1883.\textsuperscript{143} Gotzinger produced the panorama using miniaturized models of the buildings (hotels) made to scale, which were placed in a cabinet, covered with a painted cloth of the sky. The spectator viewed the panorama through a large crystal that created the illusion that the buildings and landscape were growing in front of their eyes:

\textsuperscript{141} Siciliani, pp. 108-14.
\textsuperscript{142} ibid., p. 116.
\textsuperscript{143} 'Esposizione della Società di Solferino e San Martino', \textit{La Sentinella Bresciana}, 12 June 1884, p. 1.
Mediante un giuoco di luce, e guardato a traverso di un grande cristallo, quei fabbricati e il paessaggio sembravano crescere sotto gli occhi: l'illusione ottica non poteva essere piu completa; ed una folla piu o meno compatta stava sempre contemplando quel panorama.144

At Turin the Society presented two similar panoramas; one of San Martino with the ossuary and tower, which appeared as ‘il piu gigantesco de’ monumenti’, the other of Solferino showing the larger ossuary against the smaller dimensions of the *Spia d'Italia*.145 In Turin spectators were drawn towards the optical effect, determined to solve the enigma of how the refraction of light through crystal produced the illusion.

The ‘telescopic’ vision, as described by Siciliani, involves a form of projection where an imaginary image of the past is projected onto the surface of the landscape. Siciliani notes that the ossuary of San Martino could not be seen from the *Spia d'Italia*; instead his view extended to the Alps. In his fantasy of the Battle of San Martino, his position at the *Spia d'Italia* corresponds to the artist’s eye in Alberti’s scheme, while the location of the Torre Monumentale corresponds to the imaginary picture plane, as the horizon of the Alps constitutes the vanishing point. The Torre Monumentale’s location therefore stands between the *Spia d'Italia* and the Italian borders, psychically shielding Italy from an attack from outside. If the tower is a prosthesis of the national body, as a phallic object its morphological features may be interpreted allegorically as the myth of how the *Padre della Patria* retrieved Italy by building a protective wall that shielded the Italian subject from the external world. This allegory is not only built but experienced through the

144 ibid., p. 1.  
145 ibid., p. 1.
metaphor of light, in which the intensity of natural light is filtered out of the tower to be replaced by an artificial sun that the pilgrim may observe without being blinded.

In *Beyond the Pleasure Principle* Freud outlines how the subject constructs a series of virtual shields to filter out the psychical intensities of the external world so that only a fragment of the original moment is felt. Feelings of pleasure and unpleasure experienced in the psyche, that is to say, inside the body, are actually experienced over all external stimuli of the body on the borders between the inner and outer world. In the tower, its walls structure an experience of the external body of the king – his name written on its outer walls – and an inner world that is projected upwards from the rotunda. Shields, however, become a way of managing internal excitations which cause too much unpleasure, and so are used internally to create the illusion that an unpleasurable experience is coming from an outer hostile environment rather than the reality, that it is an inner projection on an outer object:

There is a tendency to treat them as though they were acting, not from the inside, but from the outside, so that it may be possible to bring the shield against stimuli into operation as a means of defence against them. This is the origin of projection.

The focus of the telescopic lens is the panoramic painting, and arrangement of the painting at a controlled distance from the viewer corresponds to the schema of Alberti’s perspective (Fig. 5.21). However, it is now the viewer who occupies the

---

146 Freud, *Beyond the Pleasure Principle*, p. 27.
147 ibid., p. 29.
position of the artist, as the painted battle-scenes are projections from the collective Risorgimento imagination and ultimately conceal an outer hidden external world. Thus, the panoramic painting functions as a shield, protecting the pilgrim from the historical realities of the Risorgimento wars where losses as well as victories were incurred. As an ensemble the paintings are stage settings for the Risorgimento experience at the tower, in which the artificiality of the theatre is equated to the King’s capacity to protect his citizens from the intensities of the natural world.
5.6 A Portrait of the Nation as a Young Artist

The biography of the artist, in particular that of the Renaissance artist, seeks to solve the enigma of their genius so that society may gain some access into the world of the gifted individual. A characteristic of this type of biography is the recounting of an anecdote from the artist’s youth when he painted an object so realistic that the spectator was deceived into thinking it was real.148 The artist’s anecdote originates in Pliny’s account of the competition between two famous Hellenistic painters, Parrhasios and Zeuxis.149 In the competition Zeuxis exhibits a picture of some grapes that were ‘so true to nature that the birds flew up to the wall of the stage’.150 Parrhasios, on the other hand, revealed a picture of a linen cloth, which was so realistic that it fooled Zeuxis into thinking that his rival had still not drawn back the curtain. On discovering the deception Zeuxis relinquished the prize to Parrhasios, stating that he had only deceived the birds whereas Parrhasios had deluded the artist.151 The canvas, like the curtain of a window, plays upon the illusion that art can magically remove the occluding object to reveal a hidden world beneath. Thus, Parrhasios deludes Zeuxis by showing him the realism that their art is founded upon: a projection onto a linen cloth. Pliny’s anecdote illustrates not only that the artist recognizes that his pictorial illusions are founded upon the desire to see behind the object, but that the belief that the gifted individual – the artist, the saviour, the genius – can perform such magic is based upon a human urge to be guided beyond the occluding object to a new, better world residing on the other side of a blank canvas. In its illusion of the lost world

149 ibid., p. 10.
151 ibid., p. 111.
world residing on the other side of a blank canvas. In its illusion of the lost object’s repossession, the painting becomes what Freud would describe as an aspect of the death instinct, since it appeals to our urge to restore a former state of things. 

If the realism of the Torre Monumentale is constructed upon Alberti’s invention of perspective, the experience of entering the tower is comparable to the fantasy of inhabiting a Renaissance painting as a three-dimensional space. Moreover, if the arrangement of frescoes, statues, and busts constitutes the different chapters of king’s life, the painting that the pilgrim is inhabiting is the genre of the portrait, being the image of the king as a national space. In thinking about the monument as a portrait of the nation as an artist-king, I shall examine how the frescoes convey the king’s God-like ability to retrieve Italy through the removal of occluding objects in war, and how these warrior skills are transformed into a game whose mastery becomes the foundation for pleasure in modern Italy as a city of war.

Situated in the middle of the rotunda, the statue is, as Breda states, ‘il soggetto principale di tutto il monumento’ (Fig. 5.30). The bronze statue of the king together with its marble pedestal is over 5 metres high. The Venetian artist Dal Zotto took care to represent the king at the age and appearance, that of thirty-nine, of when he fought at San Martino with his Italian opus still incomplete. Writing in L’Illustrazione Italiana, Ugo Pesci interprets the right hand of the statue firmly gripping the sword, rather than showing the king in the physical act of returning

---

152 Freud, Beyond the Pleasure Principle, p. 36.
153 Breda, p. 61.
Fig. 5.30
Antonio Dal Zotto, bronze statue of Vittorio Emanuele. Author's photograph.
his sword to its sheath, as conveying that his consecrated mission to unify Italy could not be deemed complete for another eleven years: 'La impugna, si vede bene, non per riporla nel fodero, ma per continuare l’opera cui ha consacrato la vita e che dopo undici anni egli poteva dire compiuta'.

Pesci observes that ‘il sentimento popolare’ prefers images of the king as the ‘re soldato’ to any other. For Pesci the statue of the warrior king allows him to imagine that it represents the moment when Vittorio Emanuele sent Captain Cocconito di Montiglio to inform General Mollard that as the French had won at Solferino, he wished his soldiers to secure victory at San Martino – ‘Sua Maestà le fa sapere che i Francesi stanno vincendo a Solferino e vuole che i suoi soldati vincano a San Martino’.

The statue of the Re Soldato is silhouetted against four arches that punctuate the rotunda to allow light to flood in through exterior windows. Between each arch is a fresco whose lower border corresponds to the eye level of the spectator where the busts of eight generals are positioned so that what the pilgrim views above their eye line is associated with sublime acts. The frescoes painted by the artist Bressanin depict anecdotes from the king’s life – ‘vari episodi della vita di Vittorio Emanuele’ – so that against the fixed soma of his statue, his psyche is projected onto the walls to demarcate the boundaries of his opus.

---

155 ibid., p. 212.
156 ibid., p. 212.
157 ibid., p. 212.
158 Massuero, p. 88.
Corresponding to the right-handed spiral staircase, the paintings are to be read from right to left, while the natural growth of Italy is expressed in the anecdotes depicting Vittorio Emanuele’s progressive removal of the occluding object – Austria – as a mastery of Alberti’s laws of perspective, since it is conveyed by the elision of the corner.

The first anecdote shows Vittorio Emanuele as a young twenty-nine-year-old man standing defiantly in front of the aged Austrian General Radetzky, determined to preserve the Statute signed by his father, Carlo Alberto, who has just abdicated after the Sardinian defeat at Novara in 1849 (Fig. 5.31). According to a 1912 guide book the king is uttering the following words: ‘Maresciallo, la mia Casa conosce la via dell’esilio, non quella del disonore!’ The atmosphere of Austrian occupation is expressed as the suffocating space of a cramped room that is too small for either character as the furniture almost spills out of the natural frame of the exterior pillars, and is compositionally organized around the corner. First, the corner of the room divides the fresco into two incommensurate spaces, stopping at Radestzky’s gloveless hand, then travels to the corner of the diagonally positioned green table, which almost juts out to where the spectator’s eye line is situated. Vittorio Emanuele’s defiance at this occluding object that Radestzky embodies is to interrupt the symmetry through his twisted torso and his hand grasping the chair, tilted 45°. Although both men have lost the glove of their left hand, dissymmetry is expressed by the one solitary glove on the floor, which appears as

160 Guida popolare, p. 7.
Fig. 5.31  
Vittorio Bressanin, *Incontro di Vittorio Emanuele II con il Maresciallo Radetzky a Vignale (24 Marzo 1849).*  
Author’s photograph.

Fig. 5.32  
Bressanin, Gli Zuavi proclamano Vittorio Emanuele II il loro “Caporale d’Onore” dopo la battaglia di Palestro (31 maggio 1859).  
Author’s photograph.
an immaculately white gauntlet that the future king of Italy has defiantly thrown down in his refusal to sign away his father's Statute.

The second anecdote ten years later in 1859 shows Vittorio Emanuele now with a pair of white gloves, holding the reigns of his horse in front of the French Zuaves at Palestro (Fig. 5.32). Pesci notes that representations of the king when he 'conquise gli animi generosi ed indisciplinati degli suavi a Palestro' is a very popular image of the *Re Soldato*.

In contrast to his display of perfect bodily coordination is the lack of discipline in the Zuaves as the spectator's line of sight to the king is interrupted by a Zuave's arm stretching out to make a 120° angle, while the appropriate military gesture of a salute is replaced with hats and guns flying through the air.

The third anecdote depicts the romantic entrance of Vittorio Emanuele and Napoleon III into Milan after the Battle of Magenta, which was the entrance that inspired Hayez's *Il Bacio* discussed in Chapter Two (Fig. 5.33). The painting stresses a striking similarity of appearance between the two leaders, both in the unison of their horses' trot and in their physical appearance, commented upon by Siciliani in their portraits at the *Spia d'Italia*: 'le sembianze di quel Re e di quell'Imperatore collegati nei propositi nobilissimi di rendere a quest'antica madre l'indipendenza e la nazionalità!'. On the one hand the mimesis between the two leaders conveys the notion that military capabilities of Italy's *Re Soldato* are comparable to those of Napoleon III and therefore to his predecessor, Napoleon I,

---

161 Pesci, p. 212.
Fig. 5.33
Bressanin, *Napoleone III e Vittorio Emanuele II entrano trionfalmente in Milano l'8 giugno 1859.*
Author's photograph.

Fig. 5.34
Bressanin, *Vittorio Emanuele II a Roma Capitale d'Italia.*
Author’s photograph.
who retrieved the 'antica madre' under the Kingdom of Italy. On the other hand the French and Italian flags symbolically intertwine the ideals of the French revolution – equality, fraternity and equality – with those of the Risorgimento. These ideals are expressed pictorially in the flattened perspective, which in reducing the Milanese streets to the theatrical stage set of the Scala allows the observer to view the painting from any position in the rotunda without being distorted.

The final anecdote depicts Vittorio Emanuele’s mythical deification upon the annexation of Rome eleven years later in 1870 in which his opus is finally complete (Fig. 5.34). Led like a God into the Campidoglio by Dea Roma in her flowing green robe, the king has his eye line level with the horizon of the sacred Capitoline hill, the birthplace of ancient Rome, the caput mundis. The fresco unites the birthplace of ancient Rome – the Capitoline hill – to that of modern Italy – San Martino – through the king’s body both upon his horse in the painting and upright in battle as an ever present statue in the tower, therefore also binding together the two national monuments of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument and the Torre Monumentale. Moreover, if we recall that at the foundation stone ceremony of the Vittorio Emanuele Monument Depretis stated that Napoleon would have chosen the Campidoglio as the site for a monument to the rebirth of the Italian nation, the fresco persuades the pilgrim that the Re Soldato, Vittorio Emanuele, is Napoleon’s rightful heir in the mastery of retrieving Italy as a lost object through military victory. And so with the opus’s completion there is a depth of perspective in which

---

163 Massuero, p. 88.
the only occluding object between the spectator and the Capitoline hill is Vittorio Emanuele, the Padre della Patria.

If we place Alberti’s schema of perspective onto the rotunda, we see that the statue of Vittorio Emanuele occupies the position at the centre of projection with the principal ray corresponding to the horizon of Rome’s Caput mundis, and his projecting ray focuses downwards to his generals, whose battles are depicted in the panoramic paintings in the upper galleries (Fig. 5.35). If the artist’s object of inspiration is hidden behind the canvas, the Italian object that inspired the King’s creation resides in an untouchable position above his head, that of the seven former capital cities of Risorgimento Italy, depicted mythically as seated women who gaze down from their celestial abode around the crystal cupola, positioned above the anecdotes. The goddess positioned above Vittorio Emanuele’s entrance into Rome is clad in virginal white robes holding a winged green nymph in one hand and the laurels of victory in the other (Fig. 5.36). From below the dimensions of the statue symbolically bar the pilgrim’s access to these virginal cities; as Vittorio Emanuele’s predecessor, Napoleon declared: ‘Italy is a mistress I share with nobody’.

Opposite the white virginal city is the eighth creation that represents Italy – ‘l’ottava rappresenta l’Italia’. She is an object available to all citizens, as symbolized by her position above the pilgrim’s entrance to the upper galleries (Fig. 5.37). Italy is an androgynous creation formed from a paternal union between

---

164 Tobia, Una patria, p. 187
165 Massuero, p. 88.
166 The quotation is from Gregory, p. 5
167 Massuero, p. 88.
Fig. 5.35
Close-up of Fig. 5.23, adapted by the author.
Fig. 5.36
Bressanin, Rome personified as a virgin. Author’s photograph.

Fig. 5.37
Bressanin, Italy personified as a warrior woman. Author’s photograph.
the Padre della Patria and the unification of the cities, who, in their virginity, correspond to daughters. Unlike the hermaphrodite unions formed from a maternal symptomology, the paternal union produces an androgynous ‘Italy’. Clad in a metal chest plate, she is a warrior-like, masculinized being who would gladly die to defend the nation’s inner immaculate status. Holding the Italian Tricolour, the androgynous ‘Italy’ extends up the seven floors as a spatialized experience to rematerialize on the eighth gallery – the summit – where the Italian flag flies.

Each of the eight upper galleries displays a large 180° painted panoramic battle-scene from the twenty-two years of the Risorgimento wars. From the first floor, which depicts the Battle of Goito (30 May 1848), the subsequent floors present a chronological virtual tour of the Risorgimento: the second floor is the defence of Venice (1849), the third is the Sardinian victory over the Russians at the Battle of Cernaia in Crimea (16 August 1855), the fourth is the closing stages of the Battle of San Martino (24 June 1859), the fifth is the Battle of Volturno (2 October 1860) where the Garibaldian red shirt volunteers defeated the Bourbons, the sixth is the Battle of Villafranca – a part of the Battle of Custozza (24 June 1866) – the seventh is the Breccia di Porta Pia (20 September 1870), and finally the eighth floor – whose number in Catholic numerology connotes the resurrection – is secularized into the resurgence of Italy in the 360° panoramic view from the summit.168

The panoramic battle-scene emerged as a genre in the nineteenth century as a central component in the development of militarized patriotism that characterized

168 ibid., pp. 90-91.
the French revolution and the Napoleonic Empire, reaching its peak in the 1880s when the public wanted military performances to be preserved for posterity. Large panoramic canvases were, according to Alfred Vagts, viewed in the new public spaces of national exhibitions, their scenes of war replacing the viewing of religious imagery in the pre-existing spaces of the cathedral. If the work of art was liberated from the sacred space of a religious cult in the industrial age, as Walter Benjamin theorizes, in usurping the space occupied by religious iconography, the panoramic battle-scene is fundamental for the development of a patriotic cult of war. In the upper androgynous spaces I see a relationship between the panoramic painting as a portrait of Italy as a resurgent object, and a cult of war in which the sensual experience of viewing the painting corresponds to the eroticized sadistic pleasures of destroying the other from the line of sight.

Maurice Blanchot, whose observations Deleuze utilizes in the development of his theory of sadism, describes the sadistic experience as a ‘rêve érotique’ in which the unreal elements are projected onto other characters, who are not dreaming but acting, so that the more the erotic dream continues, the more a fiction is required that excludes dreams and actualises debauchery:

Parce que son propre rêve érotique consiste à projeter, sur des personnages qui ne rêvent pas, mais qui agissent réellement, le mouvement irréel de ses jouissances [...] plus cet érotisme est rêvé, plus il exige une fiction d’où le rêvé soit banni, où la débauche soit réalisée et vécue.

170 Alfred Vagts, ‘Battle-Scenes and Picture-Politics’, Military Affairs, 2 (1941), 87-103 (pp. 87-88).
171 ibid. p. 92.
The pleasure of war constructed in the galleries might be thought of as an erotic dream through the viewing of the battle-scenes being identified with the aesthetic moment of creativity. First, the position of the artist-king, who created the nation with his sword in front of the Albertian window is replaced in the upper galleries by the spectator who looks at the painting as if they were looking on to the window of a real world. As Vagts argues, the panoramic painting ‘gave the public the grand illusion of a ‘look-in’, of being present where it could not have been’. However, in the Torre Monumentale the grand illusion of the panorama is exploited to the full by the adequation of the real with the telescopic Risorgimento gaze. This telescopic pleasure eroticizes the viewing of the painting as the spectator zooms in and out of the image, or peers at it from above and below upon the spiral staircase, while needing to believe that it is an historically objective gaze. Second, the erotic dream of war becomes a total sensual experience as visual perceptions are accompanied by the tower’s acoustics, as the drum and mast amplify the sound of the crowd into a deafening bellicose roar up the galleries.

The second panorama — *Un pietoso episodio della eroica difesa di Venezia* — illustrates these elements of the erotic dream (Fig. 5.38). The painting depicts the defence of Venice against the Austrians at San Antonio fort, constructed in the middle of the lagoon. Due to the panoramic painting’s dimensions it cannot be viewed in one glance, and so it forces the spectator to move his or her eyes continually from left to right, up and down. In this movement the spectator becomes conscious that there are no occluding objects between his or her eyes in

173 Vagts, p. 94.
174 Massuero, p. 90.
175 Breda, p. 72.
Fig. 5.38

Fig. 5.39
motion and the resurgent object of Italy projected onto the screen of the canvas.

This sensation of visual freedom is intensified by the corner-free curvature of the surface which allows the eyes to slide smoothly along the fresco picking out details – a man injured upon a wall, a woman running towards him from the distance. In each scan the pleasure in experiencing the moment is extended as the eye identifies new objects upon the canvas.

Following Blanchot’s observations Deleuze states that the sadist needs to believe that he is not dreaming even though he is, and projects his paranoid fantasy onto the objective world:

Sade a besoin de croire qu’il ne rêve pas, même quand il rêve. Ce qui caractérise l’usage sadique du phantasme, c’est une puissance violente de projection, de type paranoïaque, par laquelle le phantasme devient l’instrument d’un changement essentiel et subit introduit dans le monde objectif.176

I would like to consider how Deleuze’s observations might be applied to the panorama of the defence of Venice. The realism of the painting relies upon its depiction of a real event and its inclusion of real characters, such as Colonel Cesare Rossarol. Moreover, the scale of the panorama and the characters in the foreground being approximately one metre in height, creates the illusion that the spectator is literally looking through a window onto a real world, which has resurged from the past. Breda, our official spectator, treats the painting as if it were almost real. His pleasure in the painting is derived from his belief that the characters are acting in accordance with his reality of how they should have acted,

176 Deleuze, Le Froid, p. 79.
rather than in a fantasy or dream, their gestures performed, as he states, ‘senza
teatralità’. Adding to this, I would like to suggest that from this panorama on the
second floor we can begin to plot the development of a sadistic Risorgimento gaze
in the spectator, in that she or he is encouraged to view the fantasy upon the canvas
as ‘real’ and as something recovered from the past, rather than as a ‘projection’.
The development of this type of gaze is also suggested in the way in which the real
battlefields are shielded from the spectator’s view by the architecture of the tower.
Views onto the historical reality of the battlefields are restricted to fragmented
strips observed through medieval styled windows and arrow slits. Cowling
remarks that in poems such as Le Roman de la Rose (1237-77), the arrow-slit of
the medieval castle symbolized the entrance of the vagina since it was the most
vulnerable part of the building, while the fortification as a whole symbolized
female chastity. One may impute a sexual significance in this, even in the
contemporary viewer. In my own experience the restricted sight onto the external
battlefields from the narrow windows had a tendency to eroticize the external
environment, transforming it into a peep-show against the ‘real’ and chaste
patriotic world of military virtue inside the tower (Fig. 5.39).

Vagts perceives the origins of the modern war film in the panoramic battle-scene
stating that the ‘modern […] battle picture cannot deny this panorama in its
genealogy: in a way, it is nothing but the indefinite prolongation of this canvas’. Similarly Susan Locke Siegfried utilizes the language of film to describe the
rhetoric of the battle-painting with scenes tilting, cropped, or spilling out of the

177 Breda, p. 72.
178 Cowling, p. 31.
179 ibid., pp. 92-93.
frame while the spectator is positioned as a ‘voyeur [who] sees more than any actor in the drama’ upon the canvas.\textsuperscript{180} There are quite clearly a multitude of comparisons between film and the panoramic painting, but I would like to focus upon one aspect, the representation of the moment, since the sadist, like the masochist, is always trying to retrieve a moment that never actually existed, as equally the moment of Italy’s Risorgimento is a product of national fantasy. Leo Charney, in his essay, ‘In a Moment: Film and the Philosophy of Modernity’, relates Simmel’s notion of the fleeting moments of the modern city, the perceptual climate of over-stimulation, distraction and sensation to the aesthetics of the film which he argues sought to ‘rescue the possibility of sensual experience in the face of modernity’s ephemerality’.\textsuperscript{181} One of the early twentieth-century theorists Charney focuses upon is Jean Epstein, who theorized that film’s essence arose from the evanescent sensual moments that he called \textit{photogénie}. Within the collage of fragments that made the film, the \textit{photogénie} moment occurred by an extraordinary image defamiliarizing the distracted apperception of the film, which would return the spectator to an awareness of sensation in a fragmentary moment.\textsuperscript{182}

After the preceding floors where the familiar pleasures of war are illustrated – glory, comradeship, and foreign prestige – the sixth-floor painting constitutes a type of \textit{photogénie} experience (Fig. 5.40). Unlike the other paintings it depicts the most fleeting moment – cavalrymen being thrown from their horses – which

\begin{footnotes}
\item[180] Siegfried, p. 236.
\item[182] ibid., pp. 286-88.
\end{footnotes}
Fig. 5.40
Pontremoli, Quadrato di Villafranca – 24 giugno 1866. Author's photograph.

Fig. 5.41
Statue of Umberto I: Author's photograph.
appears frozen like a film still. In guide books the painting is referred to as *Il quadrato di Villafranca*, thereby eliding references to the larger Battle of Custoza it was part of.\(^{183}\) The Battle of Custoza was a military disaster. In spite of having a numerically much stronger army of 220,000 soldiers against only 100,000 Austrians, due to an amazing series of military blunders the Italian army was forced into a humiliating retreat, only possessing the Veneto through Austria ceding it to Napoleon III, who offered it to the Italians, threatening to return it to Austria if they refused.\(^{184}\)

In the panorama the Austrian cavalry are on the left, on the right the Italians are led by Vittorio Emanuele’s son and heir Prince Umberto – his bust placed on the wall opposite was inaugurated on 24 June 1901 after his assassination in 1900 (Fig. 5.41). The *photogénie* of the battle-scene returns the spectator to a ‘what if’ moment of Italians losing the object, reflected in Breda’s reaction to the painting. Breda describes how if the brave Italian soldiers had allowed the world-class Austrian cavalry to surpass them for a moment, Prince Umberto would have been a prisoner:

> Guai se l’impeto di quella valorosa cavalleria ch’è stimata fra le prime d’Europa, avesse per un momento prevalso! Avremmo avuto nientemento che il Principe ereditario prigioniero.\(^{185}\)

Charney compares Epstein’s notion of the *photogénie* to Fredric Jameson’s conception of art as ‘restoring conscious experience’ by ‘breaking through deadening and mechanical habits of conduct […] and allowing us to be reborn to

---

\(^{183}\) Massuero, p. 91.

\(^{184}\) King, II, 290-96.

\(^{185}\) Breda, p. 77.
the world in its existential freshness and horror'.

The painting represents the horror of losing the Italian object, by the notion that Prince Umberto – the son of the Padre della Patria – could have become a prisoner of the Austrians in the same way that the son of Napoleon – the Padre dei Popoli – was held in Vienna resulting in the loss of Italy.

The painting brings the spectator to the potential horrific moment of the loss of the object, which arouses the annihilation of the other as an anti-mimetic form of representation – cavalry as opposed to soldiers. This moment of the other’s obliteration is experienced in the striking image of Austrians being thrown from their horses, almost spilling out of the canvas like a jutting corner that might violently strike the eye. The immediacy of the moment threatens to engulf the spectator impelling him or her to become an active participant in the battle, flirting with death through the voyeuristic thrills of violence and destruction that the painting’s composition affords. While in each fresh repetition of the destructive experience, pleasure is derived from the sensation that the spectator is re-inhabiting the fleeting moment, extending its shock and violence from the past of 1866 to the close-up position of 1893.

Thus a cult of war is orchestrated around the worshipping of the object, in which war re-ignites the magical moment of its birth through the sacrificial holocaust of 1859. The final panoramic painting, depicting Italian troops led by Cadorna breaching the Northern gate of Porta Pia to enter Rome, combines the possession

---

of Italy in Rome’s annexation with the only depiction of death, that of Major Pagliari (Fig. 5.42 and Fig. 5.43). His death, as Breda explains to his reader, occurred through the prior event of the Papacy raising a white flag above the cupola of San Pietro to signal to Italian troops that they could freely enter the city, but unknown to the army the Pope had mercenaries hidden along the city walls.\(^{187}\)

The painting shows the ‘frame’ of the dying moments of Pagliari (1822-70) shot by mercenaries who fall ‘proprio nel mezzo del quadro, talché pare quasi il quadro fatto per lui’.\(^{188}\)

On the one hand the soldier’s name binds the fantasy of the painting to an empirical fact of Major Pagliari’s death, since rather than the intense battle depicted there was a ‘hopeless disparity between the two forces’ taking only a few hours of cannonade before the Italians entered.\(^{189}\) On the other hand the name of the soldier creates a distance between the spectator and the soldier at war, since he is not everyman, but a known man who died in battle. In Benedict Anderson’s discussion of the tomb of the Unknown Soldier in *Imagined Communities*, he asserts that the unknowability of the soldier’s name is crucial to the concept of the modern nation: ‘to feel the force of this modernity one has only to imagine the general reaction to the busy-body who “discovered” the Unknown Soldier’s name’.\(^{190}\) Anderson argues that such tombs have no precedents, yet their emotional affects find a similitude with the iconography of Christ’s Crucifixion, watched by Mother Mary, the *madre dolorosa*, whose lament for her son’s agony is a maternal masochistic model for every mother-son dyad.

\(^{187}\) Breda, pp. 77-78.
\(^{188}\) ibid., p. 78.
\(^{189}\) King, II, 376.
\(^{190}\) Anderson, p. 9.
Fig. 5.42

Fig. 5.43
In contrast the presence of Major Pagliari’s name prevents a masochistic identification with his pain, as he is not ‘me’ but someone else, a ‘you’, whose death is displayed upon the distancing dream of the canvas. If the coldness and cruelty of the sadist is in the distancing theories s/her produces, the representation of Major Pagliari’s death is a ‘theory’ of dying: death is both a necessity upon the path to Italy’s retrieval, and ensures that it will be retained for future generations.

Breda’s reaction to the painting is that he wishes that Pagliari had died at a different point in the canvas as compositionally it disrupts the pleasure of the painting:

Solo avremmo voluto che quel bravo maggiore non cadesse proprio in mezzo a quel bianchiccio della strade e delle macerie, perché pare sospeso nell’aria e non è elegante la composizione della figura.191

From this painting of the breach of Porta Pia the pilgrim arrived at the summit and the eighth panorama, an empty ‘canvas’ that the subject was left to ‘paint’ with his or her own observations. Markings on the edges of the summit pointed to various Risorgimento battles which guided the pilgrim in identifying sites to be recovered from the past. The descent up the tower had commenced with the optical device of the camera obscura and its monocular aperture, which, as Crary argues, ‘was a metaphor for the most rational possibilities of a perceiver within the increasingly dynamic disorder of the world’.192 The crystal roof of the rotunda, as I argued, constituted the monocular aperture of the tower. It also served to separate the inner psychological world of the Padre della Patria from the upper realm of his military

---

191 Breda, p. 79.
192 Crary, p. 53.
victories. However, the numerous allusions to the optical devices of the telescope and the camera obscura that the Torre Monumentale deploys, in my view ultimately construct a patriotic gaze as one founded upon the illusion that a human eye can possess the rational technique of observation associated with scientific instruments. Within this context aspects of the Risorgimento gaze correspond to Deleuze's characterization of the sadistic position as being one of a cold rational thought in contrast to the icy imagination of masochism — 'à la froide pensée du sadique s'oppose l'imaginaire glacial du masochiste'.

From my own observations from the summit it seemed as if I was confronted with the reality of what the fantasy of the Risorgimento gaze meant, as the illusion that we can control what can be seen in the present by continually removing objects that block our pathway back to an eternal past: the view from the tower is of a people-less space where the removal of all occluding objects has scattered the remnants of subjectivity across the void of an endless horizon (Fig. 5.44 and Fig. 5.45).

Fig. 5.44
The view from the summit towards the Spia d'Italia upon the horizon. Author's photograph.
Fig. 5.45
The view from the summit towards Lake Garda and the Italian Alps upon the horizon. Author’s photograph.
Chapter Six

Conclusions

In this thesis I have developed a theory that becoming patriotic occurs as a series of positionings towards a utopian Other, which in Liberal Italy was founded upon myths of Rome as the Eternal city. In contrast to notions of a fixed social identity which have grown out of Foucault’s conception of individualization, I have argued that patriotism involves an opposite process, that of deindividualization. Moreover I have asserted that social identity is dynamic and is an effect of acts of becoming on the part of the subject. Differing from Foucault, who recognizes that Other spaces produce social identity but does not acknowledge the paradox in this proposition, I have proposed that patriotism is an extraordinary Other experience set against the ordinary of daily life. At the four monumental spaces examined, I have mapped the processes by which the subject is deindividualized and I have suggested that patriotic becoming involves the subject transcending fixed social identities by entering into the fantasy that he or she can occupy a position with the Other – as a visualization of either an ideal mother or father. Building upon Deleuze’s theories on masochism and sadism I have suggested that the subject’s urge to occupy a position with the Other is to some degree founded upon the infantile desire to be grown up and occupy an adult position of authority as part of a maternal or paternal coupling. Moreover, I claim that it is from the experience of these couplings that patriotism is developed as a process by which the subject learns to live for the Other more than him or herself. As a result of my analysis of these different spaces, I have attempted to show that from intense feelings of civic
love for the new nation, which were expressed through the aestheticization of the urban spaces, Italians progressively grew to love the Other utopian Rome of their dreams and imagination more than the historical reality of Italy with its characteristic divisions and differences.

In the first site I examined, the Cimitero Monumentale, patriotic becoming was produced by two versions of ancient Rome. First, there was the fantasy of Milan as Mediolanum, the capital of a Holy Roman Empire which permitted Christian burial. The corpse of Manzoni, which was placed in a sarcophagus in the Famedio, transformed the poet into the modern counterpart of Saint Ambrose whose remains stood beneath the altar of his famous basilica. Similarly the design of the Famedio, based on the octagonal font where Ambrose baptized Saint Augustine, rendered the modern patriot a catechumen. Second, there was the first civic cremation in the Western world, that of Albert Keller. Through rituals of cremation, civic patriotism offered the subject the fantasy that the hygienic world of pagan Rome could be restored.

Thus, within the singular location of the cemetery there existed at least two fantasies of a utopian Rome, one alluding to the Holy Roman Empire, the other to the Roman state. In Il culto del littorio Emilio Gentile argues that Fascism utilized the notion of ‘Roma dello Stato’ and that of ‘Roma della Chiesa’ to construct a history of romanità founded upon the Eternal city, of which Fascism would be seen as a progression:

La mitologia fascista evocava l’eternità di Roma a garanzia spirituale per l’Italia fascista, collocando la romanità all’inizio della sua rappresentazione
In Liberal Italy there is a continual shuttle between a patriotic experience founded upon a return to the origins of the Church and one founded upon a secular Roman state. At the Cimitero Monumentale the gladiator on the front cover of the official guidebook from 1911 would indicate that in this case it is a pagan romanità that appears to have won the competition between these two Roman fantasies (Fig. 6.1).

Implicit in Gentile’s account of Fascist romanità is that there was a great anxiety over the future existence of the nation. The anxieties were channelled into ritualistic performativities that restated the certainty of the nation’s future through recourse to an ancient past. More than any other site I have explored, the Vittorio Emanuele Monument, located on the slopes of the Capitoline hill, the sacred site of pagan Rome, encapsulates how Liberal Italy sought to create its own cult of romanità as a way of legitimizing its presence in Rome. Using contemporary jokes that the monument was a wedding cake, I have suggested that the monument functioned as a ‘bridal suite’ where becoming patriotic involved the fantasy of a marriage with Rome, personified as the domineering mistress of the Latins. In 1921 the tomb of the unknown soldier was inserted into the still unfinished monument, known as the altar of the patria. On a psychical level the soldier’s interment constitutes the completion of the maternal masochistic symbolic economy since the son is now buried in the maternal ‘womb’ of the monument: a union that is only accomplished upon his sacrifice to her national cause.

---

Fig. 6.1
The cover of a map of the Cimitero Monumentale from 1911.
From the secular spaces of a pagan Eternal city the *bonifica* of Lake Fucino moves towards a utopian vision of Italy founded upon the Dogma of the Immaculate Conception and the Holy See. In contrast to the ‘indecent proposal’ of the Vittorio Emanuele monument, at Lake Fucino the patriotic experience is formed through the male subject resisting temptations of the flesh. The virtuous status of the male subject is displayed through his relentless devotion to the Virgin, the relationship becoming a patriotic allegory of Rome’s eternal intact, virginal status. However, perhaps because Lake Fucino is situated away from Rome, at this site I would like to suggest that there is the beginning of a cult of *romanità* that parallels Gentile’s account of how Fascism fused the Eternal city of the Church and Roman state into one entity. A reason for claiming this is that, juxtaposed to the Immaculate Conception, the drained land gave ‘birth’ to a new male subject, the rustic Marsian farm worker who was conceived as the reinvigoration of the ruralism of Julius Caesar. These two notions of Rome, one pagan and one Christian, were coupled together through the presence of their creator, Torlonia, who was both the *Padre Romano* and Italy’s Christ-like saviour. In this context there are a number of similarities between the myth of Torlonia and that of Mussolini as a living God. First, Gentile describes how the mixture of myth and leader embodied in the singular figure of Mussolini produced a form of ‘cesarismo totalitario’. As the leader he was glorified as a Messiah and compared to Napoleon, Caesar and Augustus, to name but a few.\(^2\) Second, we could also speculate upon how influential the *bonifica* of Lake Fucino, deemed the largest land reclamation project in the world, was on the Fascist regime, particularly when we consider that

\(^2\) Gentile, pp. 269-71.
Mussolini created the province of Littorio from his *bonifica* of the Pontine Marshes.

It is interesting to note that in Fascist Italy Lake Fucino was the location for Ignazio Silone’s novel *Fontamara* (1933). Meaning ‘bitter spring’, *Fontamara* was set in a fictitious town of the same name where the peasants’ lives were dominated by the privatised landholdings in and around the Fucino basin and by a Fascist politics that sanctioned and legalized the pre-existing economic and social abuses. Moreover, the Torlonia family were political allies of the Fascist regime, and from 1929 Mussolini rented Villa Nomentana (now known as Villa Torlonia) paying a symbolic rent of one lira a month, while Alessandro Torlonia’s descendants assisted the regime in converting the catacombs beneath the villa into an air-raid shelter.3

In the final site, the Torre Monumentale, I have explored the commemoration of the wars of the Risorgimento to show how the patriotic experience referred the subject back to 1870 and the mythical moment when Rome was breached: the moment of Italy’s resurgence. The fantasy was produced by the relationship between the large panoramic frescos of the Risorgimento battles and the numerous allusions to the optical devices of the telescope and the camera obscura to which the Torre Monumentale referred. This relationship created the illusion that the inner eye of the imagination could focus back and forth in time like the rational techniques of observation associated with scientific instruments. In this chapter I have argued that these allusions to optical instruments created the Risorgimento gaze, a patriotic vision that created the illusion that the subject could control the

---

Viewed 24/09/03.
present through the continual repetition of the past. Such a gaze, I have suggested, would imply that in each commemorative repetition of the past, foreign elements that occluded access to that past moment of Rome’s repossession would be destroyed. Although these claims are speculative, from 1936 Mussolini only permitted commemorations to take place at the site under the condition that ‘ogni ingerenza straniera fosse eliminata’.

For Gentile what differentiated the rituals and civic religion of Liberal Italy from that of Fascist Italy was that the latter sacralized life and Italy as an eternal force to be lived for, rather than the sorrowful commemorations of death, such as those at the Torre Monumentale. However, in my opinion Gentile’s argument overlooks how patriotism and the process of de-individualization in Liberal Italy allowed the subject to live twice, an ordinary everyday life and a fantasy life of pageantry reminiscent of Bakhtin’s conception of the boundless spaces of the carnival. In Siciliani’s account of the journey to the festival of the Torre Monumentale (see Chapter Five) he describes the celebrations of the battle of San Martino that were held in Verona. In contrast to the ancient quarters of the city such as the Roman amphitheatre which appeared dead, was the vibrancy of the modern area where the national festival of Italy’s Independence was being celebrated. If, as I argue in this thesis, patriotism led Italians to live for the Other more than themselves and the ordinary lives in which they were situated, Gentile’s notion of the sacralization of life in Fascist Italy might be re-read as the final curtain in a slow progression

5 Gentile, pp. 21-22.
6 Bakhtin describes the carnival as ‘a boundless world of humorous forms’ and it is ‘the people’s second life, organized on the basis of laughter’. Mikhail Bakhtin, *Rabelais and his world*, trans by Hélène Iswolsky (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984), pp. 4, 8.
7 Siciliani, p. 23.
towards the Other's total colonisation of the ordinary. In this scenario the Other would obliterate objects that alluded to the ordinary, which would ultimately render life a sacred experience.

Throughout this thesis I have used psychoanalysis and my transference with the spaces to uncover what the psychical pathways towards becoming patriotic might have been. The framework for the empathy was that on a psychical level the breaching of Rome, the sacred capital of the Catholic world, was immensely traumatic at both a national and international level. Using Cowling's study of the metaphors of architecture deployed in medieval and Renaissance texts to convey Christian edification, I sought to map the trauma of this event. I began the mapping process with the notion that since antiquity cities have been conceived as women. In the medieval world the defended city was a metaphor for virginity and chastity, while when invaded it conveyed defloration.8 Foscolo's description of Milan as a city of effeminate lovers to express his disgust at its inadequate commemoration of Parini (see Chapter Two) reveals how these gendered metaphors of the city were still in common currency in the nineteenth century. Similarly Rome is depicted as a liberated woman holding a torch in the fresco showing Vittorio Emanuele's entrance into the city (see Chapter Five), or a white virgin painted on the surface of the cupola which the Italian king has exclusive access to is. As the powerful female 'Marianne' personified the new French Republic, Rome in its many different female forms constituted an Italian version of the Marianne, embodying the dream of what the Risorgimento was intended to produce, a third Italy. In this thesis I have hoped to have shown how different

8 Cowling, p. 51.
versions of a ‘Rome’ as the domineering mistress of the Latins in a mother-son dyad, or as the Virgin in need of paternal protection of a father-daughter relationship, initiate different positions towards the Other. It is through these different positionings, associated with maternal and paternal symbolic economies, that a national psyche is experienced as an interplay between an inner motherland and an outer protective fatherland.

Finally, this thesis is underpinned by my reading of Laing’s *The Politics of Experience* and his view that if theories are produced from experience, what society needs are ways which allow the subject to experience the theory of his or her symptom so that they are no longer bound to it. Laing argues that one of the aims of transference is to try to ascertain what experiences the patient has had and lacked. And yet the problem, as Laing rightly recognizes, is that we can never know the other even when he or she is sitting opposite us. We are, as he declares, invisible to the other.9 In this thesis I have drawn upon theories of nationalism and the role of the nineteenth century monument in Europe: Anderson’s notion of the nation as an ‘imagined community’, Hobsbawn’s theory that traditions were invented in the development of nationalism,10 and Horne’s view of the national monument as a therapeutic space. Following Laing, I have sought to reconstruct some of the experiences that produced the theories of what becoming patriotic ultimately meant: visibility and therefore certainty in the other’s thoughts. In this way I have attempted to show how the nineteenth century monument in Liberal Italy functioned as a sort of lens for controlling and mastering what could be seen

---

9 Laing, pp. 15-16
in the urban spaces, creating rationalized forms of patriotic perception and visibility which led to the justification for waging war against the unknown invisible other.

The writing of the patriotic experience has involved delineating between different sorts of allusions. The choice of chapter titles alludes to contemporary cultural forms, the Torre Monumentale’s allusion to a telescope, the use of heterotopic allusions to offer insights into the dynamics of a space – for example, comparing the Vittorio Emanuele Monument to a bridal suite – and playing with the architectural allusions to the human body from the medieval and Renaissance period. The different ways in which I have played and analysed allusions, illustrates how in this thesis my aim has not been simply to deconstruct the allusions of each monument, but also to celebrate the efficacy of allusions in expanding human imagination by engaging with the complexity of signs and symbols from which each space was assembled. If the art of the allusion existed as a subject of study, it would perhaps draw the attention of the student towards the awareness that the ‘I’ that produces our own unique imaginative insights, is in reality created through recourse to allusions, which have been created, modified, and reinterpreted by countless others before. In this thesis, paralleling my analysis of patriotic spaces in Liberal Italy, I have also sought to assemble an alternative form of patriotic monument, where the Other, as the text that I, as an author, write, is contaminated through explicitly interleaving subjective narratives and contemporary allusions with historical research. I therefore have attempted to demonstrate through the experience of reading this thesis that there are other possibilities to what becoming patriotic might mean, since a patriotic monument
built upon the art of the allusion is one that will always be in gratitude to others, wherever and whoever they may be.
Bibliography

Archival sources

‘Verbale della solenne funzione pel collocamento della prima pietra del Monumento Nazionale al Re Vittorio Emanuele’, in Archivio Centrale dello Stato, Min, LL. PP. Direzione Generale Edilizia, Div. V, Busta 45, fasciolo 122, 22 March 1885 (a photocopy of this document was kindly given to me by Dr John Dickie)

Giunta Municipale di Milano (N. 1836-114), Al R. Istituto Lombardo di scienze e lettere, alla R. Accademia di belle arti, al R. Conservatorio di musica e alle Biblioteche di Brera e Ambrosiana, 5 May 1885

Unsigned newspaper and magazine articles

‘Ultime Notizie’, Gazzetta di Milano, 24 June 1860, p. 1

‘Inaugurazione del nuovo Cimitero Monumentale’, La Lombardia, 2 November 1866, p. 1

‘Una gita ai campi di San Martino e di Custoza’, La Perseveranza, 4 November 1866, p. 1

‘Trasporto della salma di Carlo Cattaneo’, La Perseveranza, 26 May 1869, p. 2

‘Corrispondenza’, La Sentinella Bresciana, 25 Feb 1870, p. 1

‘L’Ossario di Solferino’, L’Emporio Pittoresco, 24-30 April 1870, p. 258

‘Inaugurazione degli Ossari di Solferino e S. Martino’, La Perseveranza, 26 June 1870, p. 1

‘L’Agro Romano’, L’Emporio Pittoresco, 9-15 October 1870, pp. 149-51

‘Roma Libera’, *L’Emporio Pittresco*, 13-19 October 1872, p. 169

‘Funerali di Alessandro Manzoni’, *La Perseveranza*, 30 May 1873, p. 1

‘La camera mortuaria’, *L’Emporio Pittresco*, 1-7 June 1873, p. 254


‘La prima cremazione’, *L’Illustrazione Italiana*, 14-30 January 1876, p. 215

‘Onoranze a Manzoni’, *La Perseveranza*, 23 May 1883, p. 1

‘La festa Manzoniana’, *L’Illustrazione Italiana*, 27 May 1883, p. 326

‘Esposizione della Società di Solferino e San Martino’, *La Sentinella Bresciana*, 12 June 1884, p. 1

‘Il XXV anniversario della battaglia di Solferino e S. Martino’, *La Sentinella Bresciana*, 24 June 1884, p. 1

*Il Diritto*, 23 March 1885, p. 1

‘La prima pietra al monumento di Vittorio Emanuele’, *L’Illustrazione Italiana*, 5 April 1885, pp. 215-18

‘Brasile, la colonia Blumenau’, *L’Agricoltura Illustrata*, January 1890, p. 21

‘Il monumento’, *La Sentinella Bresciana*, 15 October 1893, p. 2

‘La parola di Mussolini’, *Il Corriere della Sera*, 19 March 1932, p. 1
Websites

http://uboot.net/allies/aircraft/raaf.htm (visited 10 June 2004)

www.reiki.nu/treatment/humanbody/organs/organs.html visited 12 December 2004

Films

You Only Live Twice (1967), directed by Lewis Gilbert, screenplay by Roald Dahl, based on the novel by Ian Fleming

Books and articles

Acciaresi, Primo, Giuseppe Sacconi e l'opera sua massima (Rome: [n.pub.], 1911)

Agostinoni, Emidio, Il Fucino (Bergamo: Italia Artistica, 1908)


Annali della fabbrica del Duomo di Milano, 9 vols (Milan: Brigola, 1877-85), I (1877)

Arendt, Hannah, On Revolution (London: Faber and Faber, 1963)


Bairati, Eleonara and Riva, Daniele eds., *Guide all’architettura moderna: il Liberty in Italia*, 3edn (Bari: Laterza, 1997)

Bakhtin, Mikhail, *Rabelais and his world*, trans by Hélène Iswolsky (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984)


Boggio, Gian Domenico, *Per la nascita felicissima di Napoleone II, Re di Roma, sonetti e cantata* (Ivrea: Dora, 1811)
Bognetti, Gian Piero, ‘Togliere il Manzoni del Famedio?’, La Martinella di Milano, 5 (1953), 304-10

Boito, Camillo, ‘Un Corpo’, in Racconti neri della Scapigliatura, ed. by Gilberto Finzi (Milan: Mondadori, 1999), pp. 36-69

Boito, Camillo, Architettura del Medio Evo in Italia con una introduzione sullo stile futuro dell’architettura italiana (Milan: Hoepli, 1880)

Borsi, Franco, L’architettura dell’unità d’Italia (Florence: Le Monnier, 1966)

Botta, Carlo Giuseppe Guglielmo, History of Italy during the Consulate and Empire of Napoleon Buonaparte, trans. by Frances Moore (Philadelphia: Towar & Hogan, 1829)

Brambilla, Vincenzo, Storia di Milano, in compendio dalla sua origine fino ai nostri giorni, 3rd edn, 2 vols (Milan: Giuseppe Bernardoni, 1861)


Breda, Antonio, Guida illustrata di S. Martino e Solferino (Padua: Sacchetto, 1893)

Brice, Catherine, “‘The King was pale’: Italy’s National-Popular Monarchy and the Construction of Disasters (1882-85)’, in John Dickie, John Foot and Frank Snowden eds., Disastro! Disasters in Italy since 1860 (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2002), pp. 85-108


Brisse, Alexandre and Rotrou, Léon de, *Dessèchement du lac Fucino, exécuté par S. E. le Prince Alexandre Torlonia*, text in English and French, English trans. by V. de Tivoli (Rome: Propagande, 1876)


Burdett, Charles, 'Journeys to the other Spaces of Fascist Italy', *Modern Italy*, 1 (2000), 7-23


Cantù, Ignazio, *Milano e i suoi corpi santi colle notizie più utili al viaggiatore* (Milan: Vallardi, 1870)


De Cecco, Marcello, ed., *L’Italia e il sistema finanziario internazionale, 1861-1914* (Bari: Laterza, 1990)


Charney, Leo, ‘In a Moment: Film and the Philosophy of Modernity’, in *Cinema and the Invention of Modern Life*, ed. by Leo Charney and Vanessa R.


Dall’Ongaro, Francesco, *Scritti d’arte* (Milan: Hoepli, 1873)


De Sanctis, Francesco, *La letteratura italiana nel secolo decimonono*, 4 vols
(Naples: Alberto Morano, 1931-33), 1 (1931)


Dupuy, Aimé, ‘Un personnage de Stendhal: le banquier romain Torlonia’, *Stendhal Club*, 15 October 1968, pp. 43-70


*Elenco dei cittadini illustri e benemeriti da proporsi per l'onoranza del Famedio* (Milan: Pirola, 1885)


Foot, John, *Milan Since the Miracle: City, Culture and Identity* (Oxford: Berg, 2001)


Forty, Adrian, ‘Forward’ to *Strangely Familiar: Narratives of Architecture in the City*, ed. by Iain Borden, Joe Kerr, Alicia Pivaro and Jane Rendell (London: Routledge, 1996)

Foscolo, Ugo, *I sepolcri: In Italian and English with an essay by Ernesto Grillo* (London: Blackie & Son, 1928)


Franchetti, Gaetano, *Storia e descrizione del Duomo del Milano* (Milan: De Stefanis, 1821)


Freud, Sigmund, *Jensen’s Gradiva and other works: Standard Edition*, ix


Giacomoletti, Giuseppe, *Vita del commendatore D. Carlo Torlonia* (Rome: Salviucci, 1849)


Gigli, Ottavio, *Nel giorno delle augurate nozze del Duca A. Torlonia con Donna T. Colonna questi disegni originali di valentissimi artisti rappresentanti alcune glorie dei Colonesi con dichiarazione storiche O. G. devotamente offre* (Rome: Salviucci, 1840)


Gorini, Paolo, Sulla purificazione dei morti per mezzo del fuoco (Lodi: Presso Natale Battezzati, 1876)


Gramsci, Antonio, Quaderni del carcere: edizione critica dell’Istituto Gramsci, ed. by Valentino Gerratana, 4 vols (Turin: Einaudi, 1975)

Grandi, Maurizio and Pracchi, Attilio, Milano: guida all’architettura moderna (Bologna: Zanichelli, 1980)


Gregorovius, Ferdinand, The Roman Journals of Ferdinand Gregorovius 1852-1874, ed. by Friedrich Althaus, trans. by Gustavus W. Hamilton (London: Bell, 1907)

Gregory, Desmond, Napoleon’s Italy (London: Associated University Presses, 2001)

Grosz, Elizabeth, Volatile Bodies: Toward a Corporeal Feminism (Bloomington: Indiana Press, 1994)

Guida popolare della Torre e dell’Ossario di S. Martino (Padova: Pizzati, 1912)


Hinzen-Bohlen, Brigitte, Arte e architettura: Roma, trans. by Andrea Barbaranelli (Cologne: Koenemann, 2001)

Hoare, Richard Colt, A Classical Tour Through Italy and Sicily; tending to illustrate some districts which have not been described by Mr Eustace in his classical tour, 2nd edn, 2 vols (London: Mawman, 1819)

Hobsbawn, Eric and Ranger, Terence eds., The Invention of Tradition (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983)


Isager, Jacob, Pliny on Art and Society: The Elder Pliny’s Chapters on the History of Art, trans by Henrik Rosenmeier (London: Routledge, 1991)


King, Bolton, *A History of Italian Unity: Being a Political History of Italy from 1814 to 1871*, 2nd edn, 2 vols (London: Nisbet, 1910-12)


Marocchi, Massimo, *Storia di Solferino* (Solferino: Litograph Castiglione, 1993)


Massuero, L., *A San Martino della battaglia: ricordi dell’inaugurazione della Torre Storica avvenuta il 15 ottobre 1893* (Como: Tipografia Cooperativa Comensi, 1894)

Mauri, Carlo, *Storia e descrizione delle chiese distrutte ed esistenti in Milano e dintorni* (Milan: [n.pub.], 1857)


Mongeri, Giuseppe, ‘La cremazione d’ieri’, *La Perseveranza*, 23 January 1876, p. 1

Mongeri, Giuseppe, *L’arte in Milano: note per servire di guida nella città* (Milan: Società Cooperativa, 1872)

Mongeri, Giuseppe, *Descrizione del nuovo Cimitero di Milano* (Milan: Lombardi, 1870)

Mongeri, Giuseppe, ‘Gli ultimi progetti pel Cimitero Monumentale della città di Milano’, *La Perseveranza*, 1 April 1863, p. 1


Pini, Gaetano, *La Crémation en Italie et à l’étranger, de 1774 jusqu’à nos jours* (Milan: Hoepli, 1885)


Ragni, Elena Lucchesi, Stradiotti, Renata and Zani, Carlo, *Napoleone Bonaparte: Brescia e la Repubblica Cisalpina, 1797-1799* (Milan: Skira, 1997)

Relazione della Commissione Consigliare incaricata di riferire sul regolamento per gli onori del Famedio (Milan: Pirola, 1883)


Rodocanachi, Emmanuel, *The Roman Capitol in Ancient times and Modern times*, trans. by Frederick Lawton (London: Heinemann, 1906)


Sacher-Masoch, Leopold von, ‘Choses vécues’ (see Deleuze, *Le Froid*, above), pp. 251-54

Salvatorelli, Luigi, *Pensiero e azione del Risorgimento* (Turin: Einaudi, 1950)


Sereni, Emilio, *Storia del paesaggio agrario italiano* (Bari: Laterza, 1972)


Sica, Paolo, *Storia dell’urbanistica*, 3 vols (Bari: Laterza, 1977)

Siciliani, Cesira *Una visita agli Ossari di San Martino e Solferino* (Bologna: Zanichelli, 1881)


Simeon, John, Preface to 'Contemporaneous Narrative of the Trial and Execution of the Cenci', in *Miscellanies of The Philobiblon Society*, vol. IV (London: Whittingham, 1858), pp. 3-26


*Statuto della Società di Solferino e S. Martino*, 4th edn (Padua: Crescini, 1893)


Tattara, Giuseppe and Volpe, Mario, ‘Italy, the fiscal-dominance model, and the
Gold-Standard age’, in Monetary Standards and Exchange Rates, ed. by
Maria Cristina Marcuzzo, Lawrence H. Officer and Annalisa Rosselli
(London: Routledge, 1997), pp. 229-63

*The Annals of Tacitus*, trans. by George Gilbert Ramsay, 2 vols (London: Murray,
1904-09)

*The Life of Cola di Rienzo*, trans. by John Wright (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of
Mediaeval Studies, 1975)

Thompson, Henry, *Modern Cremation: Its History and Practice* (London: Kegan
Paul, Trench & co, 1889)

Tobia, Bruno, ‘Urban Space and Monuments in the Nationalization of the Masses:
The Italian Case’, in Nationalism in Europe 1815 to the present, ed. by

Tobia, Bruno, *Una patria per gli italiani: spazi, itinerari, monumenti nell’Italia
unita, 1870-1900* (Rome: Laterza, 1991)

Toniolo, Gianni, *An Economic History of Italy* (London: Routledge, 1990)

Torelli, Luigi, *La Questione del potere temporale del Papa considerata nel 1845,
nel 1853 e nel 1870* (Venice: Gazzetta, 1870)

Torelli, Luigi, *Ricordi intorno alle cinque giornate di Milano, 18-22 Marzo 1848*
(Milan: Hoepli, 1876)


Torlonia, Alessandro, *Il Principe Don Alessandro Torlonia* (Rome: Perino, 1886)

Trilling, Lionel, *The Liberal Imagination: Essays on Literature and Society*
   (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1984)

Vagts, Alfred, 'Battle-Scenes and Picture-Politics', *Military Affairs*, 2 (1941), 87-103

Variali, Carlo, *Prima visione al Cimitero Monumentale* (Milan: Vallardi, 1890)


Zanoli, Alessandro *Sulla milizia Cisalpino-Italiano: cenni storico-statistici dal 1796 al 1814*, 2 vols (Milan: [n.pub.], 1845), II

