EDUCATIONAL VISION: A MARIST PERSPECTIVE

JOHN RICHARD MCMAHON
B.Sc.(Hons.)(Monash) M.Ed.(Monash)
B.Theol.(M.C.D.)

Thesis submitted for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
December 1992
University of London Institute of Education
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I thank foremost my supervisor, Dr. Paddy Walsh, for his challenging and generous guidance. As the ideas emerged and the directions of the research changed, Paddy responded with sensitivity and wisdom. I thank the other members of my Ph.D. committee and the Institute of Education’s Curriculum Studies Department for their ready and warm support. Since commencing the research, I have shared many stimulating conversations with a wide range of people. I thank them for the knowledge they shared and the reference materials they suggested.

Much of the research took place at St. Mungo’s Academy, Glasgow and Archbishop Molloy High School, New York. I thank the members of these two school communities for their tolerance and integrity. I am grateful to the Marcellin College, Melbourne community for selecting and sending important documents. During the research period I have appreciated the opportunity to live at London House, where I have enjoyed the hospitality of the London Goodenough Trust for Overseas Graduates.

Finally, I thank my Marist confreres, particularly those in the Melbourne province who have enabled me to carry out this research, my family and my friends whose companionship, love and support have enabled me to continue to grapple with the task in hand. I dedicate this thesis to my father, George Richard McMahon, who wanted me to nourish my Marist life with a little philosophy.
ABSTRACT

This research seeks to understand the current educational vision of the Marist Brothers' Teaching Congregation, a Catholic religious order founded by Marcellin Champagnat in rural France in 1817 which currently has 5,000 Brothers educating young people in 76 countries. The Congregation is conceptualised as a charismatic social movement. Using case study methodology, it is investigated as a single bounded system comprising many sub-systems, namely its individual school communities, which can be studied both as interesting in themselves and as leading to a significant measure of understanding of the overall system. The work of Marist Brothers in three schools in three continents is studied in detail: Marcellin College, Melbourne, St. Mungo's Academy, Glasgow and Archbishop Molloy High School, New York.

Interviews, document analyses and observations are carried out over a two year period, from 1990 to 1992. Theory contributes to the research, first, through an appropriation and adaptation of Max Weber's sociology of charismatic authority, second, through a study of the self understanding of religious congregations as reflected in and influenced by the current theology of religious life, and third, through brief analyses of some educational social movements with a claim to be charismatic, in particular the United World Colleges and the Society of Jesus. With the data from the three case study schools collected and analysed, initial research findings were sent to Marist educators in eight further schools in seven different countries. These educators affirmed those findings which coincided with their experience of Marist educational vision and added other findings based on their current work.

Some theoretical conclusions are drawn about the fruitfulness of bringing the theological and sociological literatures on charisma into relationship with each other. A series of more practical conclusions relates to the nature of
Marist educational vision, the possibility of pursuing this vision with different levels of contribution in terms of numbers and roles of Brothers in a school, the relationship of Brothers to lay staff in Marist schools, and the process of school self-definition of educational vision.
# LIST OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgements</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Contents</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Scholia</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 1 CHARISMATIC SOCIAL MOVEMENTS: A WEBERIAN PERSPECTIVE

1.1 Choosing a sociologist
1.2 Weber on charisma
1.3 Some post-Weberian commentary
1.4 Religious life as a test case for Weber's framework

## 2 THE SELF-UNDERSTANDING OF CONTEMPORARY RELIGIOUS CONGREGATIONS AS CHARISMATIC SOCIAL MOVEMENTS

2.1 How the evolution of religious life is understood
2.2 The individual congregation: history as life cycle
2.3 The theological understanding of charism
2.4 Charism in the theology of religious life

## 3 CHARISMATIC SOCIAL MOVEMENTS AND EDUCATION

3.1 Social movements originating within the educational community
3.2 Social movements originating beyond the educational community
3.3 The United World Colleges Social Movement
3.4 The Jesuit Social Movement

---

5
4 MARCELLIN CHAMPAGNAT'S MOVEMENT 112
4.1 Nineteenth Century France
4.2 Marcellin Champagnat and the Marist Brothers
4.3 Champagnat's Vision of Education
4.4 Marist Educational Vision

5 METHODOLOGY 151
5.1 Case study methodology
5.2 Methods, data collection, analysis and reporting
5.3 Validity, reliability, reflexivity and ethics

6 DISCERNING A DIRECTION: MARCELLIN COLLEGE, MELBOURNE 179
6.1 Context
6.2 The creative stage
6.3 The testing stage
6.4 The consolidation stage
6.5 In retrospect

7 BUILDING ANEW: ST. MUNGO'S ACADEMY, GLASGOW 225
7.1 Describing the Academy
7.2 The Marist Contribution Today
7.3 Marist Vision at St. Mungo's

8 MOVING STEADILY ON: ARCHBISHOP MOLLOY HIGH SCHOOL, NEW YORK 251
8.1 School Structures
8.2 Marist Vision and Contribution
EIGHT LOOK AT THREE

9.1 The schools

9.2 What the respondents said about the case study schools

9.3 What the respondents said about their own schools

9.4 What the respondents said about a generalisable Marist charism in schools

Conclusions

Bibliography

Appendix

Abbreviations and Acronyms
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Tables</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 THE URSULINE SISTERS AS AN EXAMPLE</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OF THE REVITALISATION OF A RELIGIOUS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONGREGATION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 KEY EVENTS IN THE HISTORY OF THE</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITED WORLD COLLEGES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 RECENT PUBLICATIONS INFLUENTIAL</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF AMERICAN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JESUIT EDUCATIONAL VISION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 DOCUMENTS OUTLINING MARIST</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDUCATIONAL VISION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 ILLITERACY RATES IN FRANCE, 1686–1876</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 OVERVIEW OF THE HISTORY OF THE MARIST</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BROTHERS' CONGREGATION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 FIRST MARIST BROTHERS' SCHOOLS</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 FIRST COUNTRIES WHERE MARIST BROTHERS</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WORKED</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 LIFE CYCLE OF THE MARIST BROTHERS</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 LOCATION AND AGE DISTRIBUTIONS OF</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARIST BROTHERS TODAY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8 THE TEACHERS' GUIDE: SUMMARY OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 ENROLMENTS 1978 – 1981</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 ENROLMENTS 1982 – 1989</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 CALENDAR OF KEY EVENTS</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 ALTERNATIVE VISIONS FOR MARCELLIN</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COLLEGE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.5 TEXTS INFLUENTIAL IN MARCELLIN COLLEGE'S EDUCATIONAL VISION STATEMENT 204
6.6 PARENTS' REASONS FOR CHOOSING MARCELLIN - 1987 REPORT 214
6.7 PARENTS' REASONS FOR CHOOSING CATHOLIC SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN THE AUSTRALIAN CAPITAL TERRITORY - 1985 REPORT 215
6.8 ADVANCES 218
6.9 COSTS 218
6.10 THE SCHOOL EXECUTIVE 220
6.11 MARIST COMMUNITY - BULLEEN 221
6.12 CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT 222

CHAPTER 7
7.1 ST. MUNGO'S ACADEMY'S ENROLMENTS AND KEY EVENTS 229
7.2 INTERVIEWEES REFERRED TO IN THIS STUDY 250

CHAPTER 8
8.1 FINANCIAL REPORT FOR 1990 - 1991 254
8.2 RECENT ENROLMENT TRENDS 262
8.3 ETHNIC COMPOSITION AS PERCENTAGE OF THE STUDENT BODY 263
8.4 OCCUPATIONAL INTENTIONS OF THE CLASS OF 1990 266
8.5 RELATIVE NUMBER OF BROTHERS 277
8.6 INTERVIEWEES REFERRED TO IN THE CHAPTER 282
# LIST OF SCHOLIA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 3</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 IGNATIUS AND HIS FOUNDING EXPERIENCES</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 DEVELOPMENT OF JESUIT EDUCATION</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 6</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1 MS. JULIE RYAN</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 THE DEVELOPMENT GROUP</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 7</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1 MR. TOM BURNETT</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 BR. STEPHEN SMYTH</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 8</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1 BR. JOHN KLEIN</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 MARIST BROTHERS AT MOLLOY</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3 STUDENT ACCEPTANCE TO THE SCHOOL</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

Write the vision; make it plain on tablets.

Habakkuk 1

Marcellin College, Melbourne, a Catholic secondary school for boys, is owned and administered by the Marist Brothers, a Religious Order belonging to the Catholic Church. Soon after I began my term as principal of the school, my colleagues and I decided to research, articulate and implement what we hoped would be an appropriate educational vision for the school for the 1980s. We sensed two options for this well respected, middle class, catholic secondary school - to go with the grain of its evolution towards a grammar school vision of education or to encourage a more comprehensive vision with a deliberate and explicit basis in Christian and Catholic sources and teachings. In moving the school towards the second option, I became aware of the issue of the specific educational vision of the Marist Brothers. I was familiar with the recent work from a range of sources on the goals of catholic education and had a more or less worked-out position on those goals, but found I lacked an understanding of any specifically Marist perspective, whether actual or potential, on them. As a member of the Marist Brothers' Congregation, I felt a responsibility and a keen desire to research the questions 'What is, and what might be, the educational vision of the Marist Brothers' Congregation today'?

Fullan observes that the role of vision appears in every book on educational excellence (1992, p.44). At Marcellin College, we found seeking a vision implied answers to the question Why? 'Why are we here? Why are we committed to our cause? Why do we believe it is important? Why should we have a programme of action at all?' (Avis, 1992, p.113). During those years from 1982 to 1989, our school community began to get involved in justice issues, for example. An annual 'Peace Week', initiated by the Marist

1 Ch.2 Vs.2.
Brother Chaplains on the staff, highlighted issues such as those surrounding the Cold War. Some in the school community felt we should be participating in public demonstrations opposing nuclear proliferation. Others felt we should maintain our efforts on more academic pursuits, and especially on examination results. Such questions continue to emerge in Marist schools as our world experiences revolutionary change. Now that the Berlin wall has crumbled, apartheid been outvoted, war fought in the Persian Gulf, claims made for national status by countries in the Soviet bloc and the former Yugoslavia and women priests welcomed to the Anglican Communion, questions which emerge include (1) What kind of education should students receive for such a relatively unknown future? (2) Will today's skills be beneficial in years to come? (3) How many young people will get jobs when they complete their schooling? (4) Will there be peace? (5) Will the next generation be living in an irretrievably damaged environment? (6) What will be the state of the world economy? (7) What can a religious congregation, such as the Marist Brothers, contribute to this world of the future? (8) What should be the educational vision of such a Congregation?

Vision has been described as 'the product of exercising many skills in a holistic way to create a mental picture of what the future could and should look like' (Patterson, Purkey and Parker, 1986, p.88 quoted in Fullan, 1992, p.45). Flood sees such a vision helping to 'both get the best out of people and align them with the goals of the organisation' (Flood, 1992, p.33). Charismatic people are seized by a vision. Martin Luther King articulated his vision when he proclaimed: 'I have a dream that one day this nation will rise up and live out the true meaning of its creed: We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men [and women] are created equal' (King, quoted in Malone, 1991, p.34). For Christians, Jesus Christ proclaims the vision of the Reign of God (AEC, 1992, p.6). Charismatic people who found religious congregations, like Marcellin Champagnat, see a particular way of co-operating in God's plan. They seek to help people experience the Reign of God and, in many cases, abandon the
status quo and look to the future (Congar, 1986, p.70). Members of religious teaching congregations have traditionally seen a close link between facilitating this Reign of God and the work of education.

Starting the research and seeking out a theoretical framework, I considered two broad strategic options: the theoretically eclectic and the theoretically coherent. The matter was resolved only when, on following a recommendation to acquaint myself with the work of Max Weber, I found in his central concept of charismatic authority an idea of great illuminative power in relation to my subject. The concept of the charismatic social movement became central to my work – as understood first by Weber and then by contemporary members of religious congregations and by educators working in organisations with both secular and religious aims.

1992 heralds the 175th year of the Marist Brothers' Congregation. Since it continues to respond to Marcellin Champagnat's charisma, I describe the Congregation as a charismatic social movement. In seeking to understand the Congregation's educational vision, I adopt Lawton's belief that educational theory is 'essentially generated out of successful practice' (1992, p.141). I adopt case study methodology to study Marist schools, one in each of Australia, Scotland and the United States. I then invite responses to the findings from schools in other countries.

The following research questions prove helpful in entering the research:
(1) What is the nature of the contribution being made by the Marist Brothers' Congregation in Catholic secondary schools today?
(2) Where does the educational vision of the founder of the Marist Brothers, Marcellin Champagnat, fit into this contribution?
(3) What part does the Marist Congregation's history play in its educational vision today?
(4) How do Marist educators resolve the tension between the
need to be historically authentic to the educational vision of 
Marcellin Champagnat, while still being relevant, and even 
'prophetic', for today's educational needs?
As the findings emerged and my thinking developed, these 
questions increasingly fed back into the original and basic 
question: what is the Marist Vision of Education?

1st Sunday of Advent, 1992
CHAPTER 1 - CHARISMATIC SOCIAL MOVEMENTS: A WEBERIAN PERSPECTIVE

History always repeats itself and yet never repeats itself.

Chesterton

The word 'charisma' is now in everyday use. The Concise Oxford Dictionary defines it as 'the ability to inspire followers with devotion and enthusiasm ... an attractive aura; great charm ... a divinely conferred power or talent.'\(^2\) In writings about religious congregations within the Catholic tradition, the word 'charism' is used frequently. Both words are derived from the ancient Greek word 'khariam' meaning 'favour,' 'grace' or 'gift from the gods.' Religious congregations are also described as charismatic social movements. The Cambridge Encyclopedia defines a charismatic movement as a 'movement of spiritual renewal, which ... emphasizes the present reality and work of the Holy Spirit in the life of the Church and the individual.' In this chapter, I consider a sociology of 'charisma' and 'charismatic social movements' as the first element in this work's theoretical framework.

1.1 - CHOOSING A SOCIOLOGIST

While many social theorists believe 'contemporary social theory stands in need of a radical revision,' Marx, Durkheim and Weber are considered to be the sociologists who currently provide 'the principal frames of reference of modern sociology' (Giddens, 1981, p.vii). The work of each has helped to make religious ideas an 'important subject of study, not only as they might affect society, but as they are affected by society' (Hargrove, 1989, p.6). But Weber's contribution is of a different order to that of the other two.

---

While Durkheim and Marx constructed rather mechanistic models to describe the nature of society, Weber made available ways of exploring and explaining its specifically interpersonal nature (King, 1978, p.132). On Weber’s appointment to the chair of economics and sociology at the University of Munich on March 9th. 1920, he wrote to economist Robert Liefmann, who had attacked sociology:

I do understand your battle against sociology. But let me tell you: If I now happen to be a sociologist according to my appointment papers, then I became one in order to put an end to the mischievous enterprise which still operates with collectivist notions (Kollektivbegriffe) (Weber quoted in Roth and Schluchter, 1979, p.120).

Sociology could only be practised 'by proceeding from the action of one or more, few or many, individuals ... by employing a strictly 'individualistic' method (ibid.). It required taking into account the self-interest of these actors and their interest groups rather than social systems per se (Smith, 1979, p.107). Weber believes collectivities, such as religious congregations, 'must be treated as solely the resultants and modes of organization of the particular acts of individual persons' (1978, p.13). Such a Weberian approach is key to the case study methodology which I have chosen for this research.

Even more than methodology, Weber's importance for this study rests with his understanding of religion and of charismatic leadership. 'Weber always insisted that every genuine religious ethic should ... derive from purely religious roots, and not originate in economic or social or psychological considerations' (Mommsen, 1965, p.30). According to Lindholm, he was the first to introduce the term 'charisma' to sociology (1990, p.24). Haley insists it was not Weber, but the legal theorist Rudolph Sohm (1841-1917), while agreeing that Weber appropriated the notion, renamed Sohm's charismatic organisation as charismatic authority and generalised the term (1980, p.185). In any case, Weber saw charisma both as having an important religious dimension and as a key source of social change – more so than Durkheim’s sacre which was oriented more to 'understanding the function of religion in the structure of a social system'.
(Yang, 1963, p.xliii; Hinnells, 1984, p.288; Hargrove, 1989, p.5; Samier, 1992, Int.). His theory of charismatic leadership, in which charisma implies a specific kind of relationship between the leader and his or her followers, enables a more complete understanding of religious congregations as living social movements than any other to be found in current literature. This theory is central to the oeuvre of one of the founding figures of sociology. It lends itself easily to the task in hand and it is high time it was put to that purpose. However, it is not just a matter, we shall see, of applying a ready made framework to a particular case. I will argue that the case of religious orders – a paradigm case, surely – forces some revision of the theory of charismatic authority.

1.2 - WEBER ON CHARISMA

The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism (1976 [1904]) has been acknowledged as Weber's (1864-1920) 'most famous, debated and readable book.' Despite the immediate interest it raised, Weber realised it failed to grapple with the broader, comparative issue: 'the distinctiveness of the Occident'. For this he sought comparisons with Oriental civilisations. In researching China and India, Weber again focused on modern capitalism. The results of this latter work, together with his analysis of ancient Judaism, enabled him to understand how sociological arrangements help form meaning (Kalberg, 1985, pp.894-895). This led to his Economy and Society (1978 [1921]). When his wife, Marianne, saw to the publishing of Economy and Society in 1921, she described it in her preface as 'Weber's posthumous and principal work (Hauptwerk) (Tenbruck, 1989, p.45). Its subsequent influence results from its wealth of concepts based on Weber's wide range of comparative historical materials (Bendix, 1968, p.497). This work contributes significantly to the following discussion.

3 Weber commenced this essay on the sociology of religion in 1903 as a result of his great interest in the question of the origin of modern capitalism – that revolutionising power 'which he had already recognized in agricultural worker studies' (Kasler, 1988, p.13).
In 1904, Weber had introduced explicitly his concept of **ideal type** (Kasler, 1988, p.13). He saw it as a conceptual construct which brings together certain relationships and events of historical life into a complex, which is conceived as an internally consistent system. Substantively, this construct in itself is like a utopia which has been arrived at by the analytical accentuation of certain elements of reality. Its relationship to the empirical data consists solely in the fact that where market-conditioned relationships of the type referred to by the abstract construct are discovered or suspected to exist in reality to some extent, we can make the characteristic features of this relationship pragmatically clear and understandable by reference to an ideal-type ... [It] is no 'hypothesis' but it offers guidance to the construction of hypotheses. It is not a description of reality but it aims to give unambiguous means of expression to such a description (1949 [1904], p.90).

He took for granted that sociology endeavours to develop these ideal types emphasising that the 'great majority of empirical cases represent a combination or a state of transition among several such pure types' (1991 [1921], pp.299–300).

Weber regarded the three forms of authority - traditional, rational and charismatic - as ideal types. Traditional authority was based on 'what actually, allegedly, or presumably has always existed' (1991 [1921], p.296) - the 'sanctity of immemorial traditions and the legitimacy of the status of those exercising authority under them' (1947 [1922], p.328),

Rational authority was 'bound to intellectually analysable rules' (1978 [1921], p.244) and 'the right of those elevated to authority under such rules to issue commands' (1947 [1922], p.328)

Charismatic authority was dependent on the belief by the governed 'in the extraordinary quality of the specific person' (1991 [1921], p.296) and the 'normative patterns or order revealed or ordained' by that person (1947 [1922], p.328). It

---

4 Weber distinguished sociology from history which he saw as explaining the 'causal analysis and explanation of individual actions, structures, and personalities possessing cultural significance' (1978 [1921], p.19).
is this third form of authority - and a host of related concepts - that is to be our primary focus.

In 1883, Weber moved to Strasbourg where he carried out National Service. He was excused from some duties because of his studies at the Strasbourg University where he attended lectures by Rudolf Sohm (1841–1917) (Kasler, 1988, p.4). At that time, Sohm was finding his own interests beginning to move from Roman and Germanic law towards canon law and the history of the church (Haley, 1980, p.187). It was Sohm who highlighted the notion of charisma for Weber. He used the term to analyse how the primitive Christian community became transformed into the 'charismatic institution' called the Roman Catholic Church (Shils, 1975, p.128). Weber later wrote:

For the Christian religious organization Rudolf Sohm, in his Kirchenrecht, was the first to clarify the substance of the concept even though he did not use the same terminology. Others ... have clarified certain important consequences of it. It is thus nothing new (1947 [1922], p.328).

While recognising that Sohm had brought out, with logical consistency, the 'sociological peculiarity of this category of domination-structure' for an 'historically important special case', Weber felt Sohm's restriction of it to Christianity was 'one sided from a purely historical point of view' (1991 [1921], p.246). In any case, the concept of charisma underwent 'its most important extension and formulation in the writings of Max Weber' (Shils, 1975, p.128).

Generalizing Sohm's conception a decade later, Weber reworked many of the same motifs: the calling (Beruf), mission (Aufgabe), talent, the individual character of charisma, the prophet as exemplar of charisma, the role of charisma in forming communities, and the opposition of charisma to organization based on law (Haley, 1980, p.195).

While Sohm had applied the term 'charisma' to the early Christian church, Weber argued that 'the principles of leadership through God–given grace were generalisable'. Hence he applied the term 'charisma' to Napoleon, to Stefan
George\textsuperscript{5}, to Jesus Christ and to the Chinese Emperor (Albrow, 1990, p.172). Marcus supports this idea of the 'dominant charismatic character of Napoleon's hold over most of his followers'. He sees it evidenced in March, 1815, by

the 'Hundred Days' in which rational factors can hardly explain ... [Napoleon's] lightning return to authority after power had already passed to the other side. Indeed, at this juncture there came into play, for the soldiers who had served under him, the vision that the transcendent glory of revolutionary France was still incarnate in their fallen Emperor (1961, p.239).

For Haley such an extension of the notion of charisma breaks away from Sohm's image of the charismatic as a 'commanding, constraining teacher'. Sohm's examples are of holy men and 'the heroes of the Western moral tradition' - indeed he sees charisma as specific to Christianity and 'linked to professing a specific doctrine - Jesus' commands'. Haley continues:

Sohm, a devout Christian, was a man under authority - Jesus' authority. Writing only twenty years after Kirchenrecht, Weber is a post-Christian, a man outside the authority of Jesus' commands. Once outside that authority, a new interpretation of Jesus becomes necessary. Weber's theory of charisma appeals partly because it provides that new interpretation - custom crafted for nonbelievers (1980, pp.196-197).

Weber defined charisma as a certain quality of an individual personality, by which the person 'is considered extraordinary and treated as endowed with supernatural, superhuman, or at least specifically exceptional powers or qualities' (1978 [1921], p.241). These could be 'actual, alleged, or presumed' (1991 [1921], p.295). They were inaccessible to the ordinary person, of divine origin and exemplary, and on their basis the individual is treated as a leader (1978 [1921], p.241). Throughout history

'natural' leaders - in times of psychic, physical, economic, ethical, religious, political distress - have been ... holders of specific gifts of the body and spirit; and these gifts have been

\textsuperscript{5} Stefan George was the cult poet of Weber's time (Albrow, 1990, p.172).
believed to be supernatural, not accessible to everybody (1991 [1921], p.245).

Charisma, therefore, is a property having the character of a gift, which is imputed to the person of the leader by the followers. The leader is personally called from within (ibid., p.79). This call is seen in the most emphatic sense of the word as a mission or a spiritual duty (1978 [1921], p.244). It 'knows only inner determination and inner restraint. The holder of charisma seizes the task that is adequate for him [or her] and demands a following by virtue of his [or her] mission' (1991 [1921], p.246). The recognition by the followers of the genuineness of the charismatic leader's gift or call is decisive for the validity of charisma. Followers see it as their duty to recognize its genuineness and to act accordingly since their leader is now 'charismatically qualified' (1978 [1921], p.242 and 1991 [1921], p.247). 'Psychologically this recognition is a matter of complete personal devotion to the possessor of the quality' (1978 [1921], p.242). Weber sees such charismatic influence as manifesting its revolutionary power on the followers from within causing them to change their attitudes (ibid., p.1117).

Charisma in its strongest form

... reorientation born out of suffering, conflicts, or enthusiasm. It may then result in a radical alteration of the central attitudes and directions of action with a completely new orientation of all attitudes toward the different problems of the "world". In prerationalistic periods, tradition and charisma between them have almost exhausted the whole of the orientation of action (ibid.).

Charisma in its strongest form disrupts rational rule as well as tradition altogether and overturns all notions of sanctity. Instead of reverence for customs that are ancient and hence sacred, it enforces the inner subjection to the unprecedented and absolutely unique and therefore Divine (ibid., p.1117).

6 Weber uses the word metanoia - the Greek New Testament word for 'repentance' (1978 [1921], p.117).
7 Weber views charisma as one of the creative forces of history (ibid., p.1115 & p.1117) - in traditionalist periods a 'great revolutionary force' (ibid., p.245). He compares its revolutionary force with 'the likewise revolutionary force of "reason" which he sees as working from without by altering the situations of life and hence its problems'. Reason either changes a person's attitudes toward these situations and problems or 'intellectualizes the individual' (1978 [1921], p.245).
In addition, charisma in its pure form 'disdains and repudiates economic exploitation of the gifts of grace as a source of income'. It does not always demand a renunciation of owning or acquiring property, but despises 'traditional or rational everyday economizing' and 'the attainment of a regular income by continuous economic activity devoted to this end'. More appropriate to charismatic involvement, Weber believes, is support by gifts or begging (ibid., pp.244-245).

Weber defines the charismatic community (Gemeinde) as an 'organized group subject to charismatic authority' (ibid., p.243). This community is based on an emotional form of communal relationship (Vergemeinschaftung) characterised by an absence of hierarchy, of clearly delineated spheres of authority and, especially, of any form of training or career structure (ibid., p.243; 1991 [1921], p.246). Followers are simply called. They often live with their leader on means which have been provided by voluntary gift.

There are no established administrative organs. In their place are agents who have been provided with charismatic authority by their chief or who possess charisma of their own. There is no system of formal rules, of abstract legal principles, and hence no process of rational judicial decision oriented to them. But equally there is no legal wisdom oriented to judicial precedent. Formally concrete judgements are newly created from case to case and are originally regarded as divine judgements and revelations (1978 [1921], p.243).

However, it is only initially, and while the charismatic leader operates completely beyond normal social structures, possible for the leader's followers to live communistically in a community of faith and enthusiasm, on gifts, booty, or sporadic acquisition. Only the members of the small group of enthusiastic disciples and followers are prepared to devote their lives purely idealistically to their call. The great majority of disciples and followers will in the long run 'make their living' out of their 'calling' in a material sense as well. Indeed, this must be the case if the movement is not to disintegrate (ibid., p.249).
Weber sees charismatic authority in its pure form as having 'a character specifically foreign to everyday routine structures. The social relationships directly involved are strictly personal, based on the validity and practice of charismatic personal qualities' (ibid., p.246). Unlike bureaucratic authority, charismatic authority is 'foreign to all rules'. It is also opposed to traditional authority whether patriarchal or patrimonial which Weber regards as everyday forms of domination. 'Traditional authority is bound to the precedents handed down from the past and to this extent is also oriented to rules'. On the other hand, Weber sees charismatic authority as repudiating the past, thereby making it 'a specifically revolutionary force' (ibid., p.244). The governed submit to this authority because of their belief in the extraordinary quality of the specific person (1991 [1921], p.295). Yet charismatic authority is 'naturally unstable' (1978 [1921], p.114). It is possible for a charismatic person to lose his or her charisma. That person 'may feel "forsaken by ... God," as Jesus did on the cross'. At this point the charismatic leader's mission 'comes to an end' and 'hope expects and searches for a new bearer'. The followers abandon their leader because 'pure charisma does not recognize any legitimacy other than one which flows from personal strength proven time and again' (ibid., p.1114). When people 'cease to recognize the ruler, it is expressly stated that he [or she] becomes a private citizen; and if [that person] then wishes to be more, ... [then he or she] becomes a usurper deserving of punishment' (1991 [1921],

8 Weber sees bureaucratic authority as the purest form of legal authority (1978 [1921], p.299). He describes it, in its pure type, as having a supreme authority where staff are appointed and function according to the following criteria:

(1) They are personally free and subject to authority only with respect to their impersonal official obligations.
(2) They are organized in a clearly defined hierarchy of offices.
(3) Each office has a clearly defined sphere of competence in the legal sense.
(4) The office is filled by a free contractual relationship. Thus in principle there is free selection.
(5) Candidates are selected on the basis of technical qualifications ... (1947 [1922], p.333).

9 Patriarchal authority grows 'out of the master's authority over his household' (1978 [1921], p.1006) whether the 'master' be the 'father, the husband' or 'the senior of the house'. It 'rests upon a belief in the sanctity of everyday routines' (1991 [1921], pp.296-297). Patrimonial authority represents a variety of patriarchal authority where 'group members' are treated as 'subjects' (ibid.; 1978 [1921], p.231).

10 Cf. Ps.22:1, Mat.27:46, Mark 15:34.
recognizes no appropriation of positions of power by virtue of the possession of property, either on the part of a chief or of socially privileged groups. The only basis of legitimacy for it is personal charisma so long as it is proved; that is, as long as it receives recognition and as long as the followers and disciples prove their usefulness charismatically (1978 [1921], p.244).

Weber understands the charismatic leader or prophet as 'a purely individual bearer of charisma', who by virtue of his or her mission 'proclaims a religious doctrine or divine commandment' (ibid., p.439). Such holders of charisma and their disciples, in order to justify their mission, 'must stand outside the ties of this world, outside of routine occupations, as well as outside the routine obligations of family life (1991 [1921], p.248). Interestingly, Weber quotes two religious congregations as examples.

The statutes of the Jesuit order preclude the acceptance of church offices; the members of orders are forbidden to own property or, according to the original rule of St. Francis, the order as such is forbidden to do so (ibid.). He draws a distinction between the priest and the prophet:

For our purposes the personal call is the decisive element distinguishing the prophet from the priest. The latter lays claim to authority by virtue of his [or her] service in a sacred tradition, while the prophet's claim is based on personal revelation and charisma. ... It is no accident that almost no prophets have emerged from the priestly class (1965 [1922], p.46).

He distinguishes between charismatic leaders who are exemplary prophets, like the Buddha, 'who, by his personal example, demonstrates to others the way to religious salvation' and those who are ethical prophets, like Muhammad, who appear as 'an instrument for the proclamation of a god and his will' and demand 'obedience as an ethical duty'. It is to the latter category that Weber believes the Old Testament prophets belong (ibid., p.55 & p.46).

A community or congregation arises as a result of what Weber calls the routinization of charisma (ibid., p.60). If the
practice of charismatic authority is not to remain a purely transitory phenomenon but is to take on the character of a permanent relationship with a 'community' of disciples or followers, it is necessary for its character to become radically changed. In its pure form 'charismatic authority may be said to exist only in statu nascendi. It cannot remain stable, but becomes either traditionalized or rationalized, or a combination of both. Once routinisation has taken place it then becomes possible 'to participate in normal family relationships or at least to enjoy a secure social position in place of the kind of discipleship which is cut off from ordinary worldly connections' (1978 [1921], p.246).

These issues become particularly prominent when a successor for the charismatic leader needs to be found.

The way in which this problem is met ... is of crucial importance for the character of the subsequent social relationships ... For through it occurs the routinization of the charismatic focus of the structure. In it the character of the leader ... and ... [the leader's] claim to legitimacy is altered ... This process involves peculiar and characteristic conceptions which are understandable only in this context and do not apply to the problem of transition to traditional or legal patterns of order and types of administrative organization (ibid., p.253).

Weber offers six ways of selecting a successor:

(1) By a search for a new charismatic leader based on the qualities 'which will fit [the person] for the position of authority' (ibid., p.246). Thus choosing a new Dali Lama consists in 'the search for a child with characteristics which are interpreted to mean that ... [he or she] is a reincarnation of the Buddha'. 'In this case the legitimacy of the new charismatic leader is bound to certain distinguishing characteristics' and therefore to rules from which 'a tradition arises'. Weber sees this resulting in 'a process of traditionalization in favor of which the purely personal character of leadership is reduced' (ibid., p.247).

(2) Selection by revelation 'manifested in oracles, lots, divine judgments or other techniques of selection.' Here the legitimacy of the new leader depends on the legitimacy of
the *techniques* of selection ... Saul is said to have been chosen by the old war oracle.' Weber sees this process as involving 'a form of legalisation' (*ibid.*).

(3) Selection involving designation by the original charismatic leader of his or her own successor and this new person's recognition by the followers. 'This is a very common form. Originally, the Roman magistracies were filled entirely in this way' (*ibid.*).

(4) Designation by the charismatically qualified administrative staff or the original followers of the charismatic leader.

In its typical form this process should quite definitely not be interpreted as 'election' or 'nomination' or anything of the sort. It is not a matter of free selection, but of one which is strictly bound to objective duty. It is not to be determined merely by majority vote, but is a question of arriving at the correct designation, the designation of the right person who is truly endowed with charisma. It is quite possible that the minority and not the majority should be right in such a case (*ibid.*).

Weber realises that unanimity is often required. He insists it is 'obligatory to acknowledge a mistake and persistence in error is a serious offence. Making a wrong choice is a genuine wrong requiring expiation' (*ibid.*).

The most important examples of designation of a successor by the charismatic followers of the leader are to be found in the election of bishops, and particularly of the Pope, by the original system of designation by the clergy and recognition by the lay community (*ibid.*, p.253).

(5) Selection of a successor on the basis of heredity, on the assumption that charisma is thus transmitted.

In the case of hereditary charisma, recognition is no longer paid to the charismatic qualities of the individual, but to the legitimacy of the position ... [the person] has acquired by hereditary succession. This may lead in the direction either of traditionalization or of legalization. The concept of divine right is fundamentally altered and now comes to mean authority by virtue of a personal right which is not dependent on the recognition of those subject to authority. Personal charisma may be totally absent (*ibid.*, p.248).

(6) Succession which takes place using the idea that charisma may be passed on by ritual means from one person to another or may be created in a new person.
The concept was originally magical. It involves a dissociation of charisma from a particular individual, making it an objective, ... [transferable] entity. In particular, it may become the charisma of office. In this case the belief in legitimacy is no longer directed to the individual, but to the acquired qualities and to the effectiveness of the ritual acts. The most important example is the transmission of priestly charisma by anointing, consecration, or the laying on of hands; and of royal authority, by anointing and coronation (ibid., pp.248-249).

Apart from succession, Weber acknowledges other problems associated with the process of routinisation including the fundamental problem 'of making a transition from a charismatic administrative staff, and the corresponding principles of administration, to one which is adapted to every day conditions' (ibid., p.253). He gives two reasons why routinisation is sought. First members of the community seek their own personal security. They want to understand the detailed arrangements concerning both positions of authority and the economic situation as these relate to them (ibid., p.252). Second they need to have a sense of order in the organisation and to ensure the organisation is adapted to everyday economic conditions. ... It is not possible for the costs of permanent, routine administration to be met by booty, contributions, gifts, and hospitality, as is typical of the pure type of military and prophetic charisma (ibid.).

The process of traditionalisation or of (rational) legalisation can be carried out in a variety of ways:
(1) Charismatic norms are transformed into those defining a traditional social status. This results in all powers and advantages becoming traditionalised (ibid., p.250).
(2) Individual positions, with the resulting economic advantages, can be sought and obtained by administrative staff.

In that case, according to whether the tendency is to traditionalization or legalization, there will develop (a) benefices, (b) offices, or (c) fiefs. In the first case a prebendal organization will result; in the second, patrimonialism or bureaucracy; in the third, feudalism (ibid.).
These new sources of money replace the provision made from gifts or booty. In the case of benefices they may obtain 'the proceeds of begging ... payments in kind ... the proceeds of money taxes, or finally ... the proceeds of fees' (ibid.). Weber observes that regularized begging is found in Buddhism and benefices in kind in the Chinese and Japanese 'rice rents'; support by money taxation has been the rule in all the rationalized conquest states. The last case is common everywhere, especially on the part of priests and judges and, in India, even the military authorities' (ibid., pp.250-251).

If charisma is to become an everyday experience, its anti-economic character must be 'adapted to some form of social organization to provide for the needs of the group and hence to the economic conditions necessary for raising taxes and contributions' (ibid., p.251).

When a charismatic movement begins to benefit from stipended provision, the 'laity' become differentiated from the 'clergy' whom Weber describes as 'participating members of the charismatic administrative staff which has now become routinized' (ibid.).

(3) While recognizing that the original basis of recruitment is personal charisma

with routinization, the followers or disciples may set up norms for recruitment, in particular involving training or tests of eligibility. Charisma can only be 'awakened' and 'tested'; it cannot be 'learned' or 'taught'. ... A genuine charismatic leader is in a position to oppose this type of prerequisite for membership; his [or her] successor is not free to do so, at least if ... [that person] is chosen by the administrative staff (ibid., p.249).

Hence, while in the course of routinisation, the charismatically ruled organisation becomes one of the everyday authorities, its 'original peculiarities are apt to be retained in the charismatic status ... acquired by ... office-holding' (ibid., p.251). Conflict can occur during routinisation.
In the early stages personal claims on the charisma of the chief are not easily forgotten and the conflict between the charisma of the office ... with personal charisma is a typical process in many historical situations (ibid., p.252).

Nor are organisations free from revolutions particularly those directed towards 'hereditary charismatic powers or the powers of office' (ibid.).

In summary, Weber sees charisma as

a phenomenon typical of prophetic movements or of expansive political movements in their early stages. As soon as domination is well established, and above all as soon as control over large masses of people exists, charisma gives way to the force of everyday routine (ibid.).

When this happens discipline, which has a rational base, 'inexorably takes over ever larger areas as the satisfaction of political and economic needs is increasingly rationalized'. This universal phenomenon restricts 'the importance of charisma and individually differentiated conduct' (ibid., p.1156). At the end of The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism Weber reflected.

No one knows who will live in this cage in the future, or whether at the end of this tremendous development entirely new prophets will arise, or [whether] there will be a great rebirth of old ideas and ideals, or, if neither, mechanized petrification, embellished with a sort of convulsive self-importance (1976 [1904], p.182).

1.3 - SOME POST-WEBERIAN COMMENTARY

Weber's greatness and uniqueness, Eisenstadt contends, lies in the way he 'combined historical and sociological analysis' (1968, p.xiii). This connects with his recognition that there has been 'no human culture without some spiritual current or supernatural order running through that culture' (Schiffer, 1973, p.35). While Lindholm claims Weber wanted to 'conquer the world for rationality, removing all mystery from existence', Goldman believes Weber saw rationalisation as threatening to 'impose itself totally on self and society, depriving them of the capacity to posit anything but their
To Weber, rationality increasingly provides the limits within which social orders, institutions, and individuals may develop, providing new techniques of control and administration ... weighing on individual actors and undermining other cultural forms that generated practices of self-shaping in the past - tradition, religion, cultivation and charismatic education (ibid.).

Roth (1991) supports Goldman's position noting a 'slightly humourous vein' from one of Weber's letters: 'It is true children are something infamous. I am too much the rationalist to stand their irrational restlessness and yelling' (Weber quoted in Roth, 1991, p.5).

THREE FORMS OF CHARISMA Recent authors see Weber using the term 'charisma' in up to three different ways. While Spencer specified three ways (1973, p.341), Lindholm, writing later and apparently independently, only accepts two of Spencer's ways, and sees these two as being 'quite opposed' to each other (1990, p.24).

The first form Spencer describes as Weber's classic meaning of charisma.

The [charismatic] leader has a divine gift which ... [the leader] demonstrates to his [or her] followers by miracles, signs or proofs. The obedience of the disciples is contingent upon their belief in the powers of the leader and the latter may lose ... [this] 'gift', and with it his [or her] following (ibid.).

Lindholm (1990, p.25) and Gerth and Wright Mills (1991, p.52) agree that this is Weber's primary view of charisma, seeing it as 'opposed to all institutional routines, those of tradition and those subject to rational management'.

In its primal form charisma does not have any fixed lines of authority; those involved make no allowance for orderly provisioning, they despise economic trading and profit, and they aim at the overthrow of all structure, the disintegration of all the chains of custom. Charisma of this type is revolutionary and creative, occurring in times of social crisis, opening the way to a new future (Lindholm, 1990, p.25).

For the charismatic follower, according to this primal form, self-sacrifice is the cardinal virtue and selfishness the
greatest vice (ibid.).

Weber's second form of charisma, Spencer contends, refers to

a sacred or awe-filled property of groups, roles or objects. Thus Weber makes reference to the routinization of charisma and its institutionalization in offices (Amtscharisma); kinship groups (gentilcharisma) and blood lines (erbscharisma) (1973, p.341).

Lindholm sees this institutional charisma as 'relatively rational' and therefore more amenable to Weber's 'type of sociological analysis'. It gives an 'aura of sacred power to any individual who has the right to wear the bishop's robe, or sit on the king's throne, regardless of actual personal characteristics (1990, pp.24-25).

Spencer believes Weber uses charisma in its third sense when he describes charismatic party leaders. In this secular, and popular sense, charisma describes the personal qualities of a leader as a 'charismatic personality' who attracts a following on the basis of his or her personal attributes rather than as a result of a divine gift (Spencer, 1973, p.341).

The meaning of the term 'charisma' and the language surrounding its use, have been extended even further by post-Weberian sociologists. For example, discussion of both 'the charisma of the populace and the charisma of the highest authority is a common phenomenon' (Shils, 1965, p.206). Some new applications of the word 'charisma', however, have ancient echoes. Lindholm, for instance, defines charisma as above all 'a relationship, a mutual mingling of the inner selves' as evidenced by 'the crowd gathered around the leader (or the lover attracted to the beloved)'. Here he focuses on the particular characteristics of 'excitability, selflessness and emotional intensity' which are beyond those of ordinary consciousnesses (1990 p.7). The Septuagint version of the Old Testament also makes reference to this physical attraction and uses 'kharis'

11 The Septuagint was written about 270 BC (Koenig, 1978, p.63).
sometimes to signify the 'good favor of God which makes one person physically or emotionally attractive to another', a nuance that also appears in Acts 2:47 (Koenig, 1978, p.63).

CHARISMATIC INDIVIDUALS AND RELATIONSHIPS Charismatic individuals, in Weber's writings\(^\text{12}\), are people with a 'vocation'. Such people have the qualities of aloneness, inclination to ascetic labor, devoted service to an ultimate value, self-denial and systematic self-control, a unified inner center or core, and capacity to resist their own desires and the desires and pressures of others (Goldman, in press).

Goldman sees such a calling, in Weber's conception, as a 'mode of asceticism for legitimating the self by sacrificing it in its natural form and building a new and higher self devoted to an ultimate value or cause'. Such an empowered self

cannot seek a witness or companion in others. Indeed, it is formed against others. All personal or popular witnesses, all outside acclaim, except as a means to the power of the self, must be excluded as threatening the self and its task (ibid.).

Kasler (1988, p.84) observes how Weber found Catholicism's 'atonement, grace of the sacraments and the certainty of forgiveness' provided a release from the 'tremendous tension to which the Calvinist\(^\text{13}\) was doomed by an inexorable fate, admitting of no mitigation' (Weber, 1976 [1904], p.117).

Eisenstadt notes that Weber's writings do not explicitly deal with questions such as: What do people find appealing in the charismatic person? Why do they give up 'wealth, time, energy, or existing social bonds and commitments' for the implementation of the leader's vision? When are people most willing to follow a leader's appeal? (1968, p.xxxii). Shils believes it is the connection felt with some very central feature of the leader's being and the leader's world. The bond is constituted by its 'formative power in initiating,

\(^{12}\) Especially his 'The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism' (Goldman, in press).

\(^{13}\) Weber understood the God of Calvinism as One who 'demanded of his believers not single good works, but a life of good works combined into a unified system' (1976 [1904], p.117).
creating, governing, transforming, maintaining, or destroying' what is vital or 'serious', in Durkheim's sense, in a person's life (1965, pp.201-202).

Finally, in more recent political discourse, Turner believes charisma has come to mean 'little more than leadership'.

Any leader who is successfully manufactured by the party machine is now dutifully regarded as charismatic. The term has thus been stripped not only of its theological, but also its sociological content (1981, p.147).

Turner stresses Weber's distinction between pure and impure charisma. When the charismatic prophet goes against public and popular demands 'in order to impose' his or her unique charismatic message, charisma requires 'something in addition to popular support and recognition' (ibid.). It requires taking extraordinary risks and working in the most difficult of circumstances (Kanter, 1987, p.179). Unlike tradition and legal-rational authority, Turner concludes, charisma cannot be totally reduced to the conditions which produce it (Turner, 1981, p.147).

CHARISMA, ORDER AND INSTITUTIONAL BUILDING Schon (1983, p.326) describes Weber as 'the prophet of bureaucracy' because of his belief that charismatic leadership does not last. Wittberg points to one source of impermanence: the delicacy of the relationship between the leader and the followers:

Charismatic leaders from Moses to Mao Tse-Tung have bemoaned the straying of their followers from their initial enthusiasm. As the disaster of China's Cultural Revolution shows ... attempts by charismatic leaders to rekindle the original devotion to their leadership often backfire. Leaders can lose their charisma and fall from grace if they disrupt the delicate balance between the active exercise of leadership power by the top and the active granting of leadership by the bottom (1991 p.15).

But is Schon's interpretation of Weber altogether correct? The routinisation of charisma is essential to its having a

14 Weber holds that charisma is inevitably routinised either on the death of the founding person or when the group gets too large to be in effective contact with his or her charisma.
stable change-effect. It is also a threat to the charisma. But which of these contrary results of routinisation is likely to win out in the end? Weber's view of this is a matter of some dispute among scholars - and their discussion of it is complicated by the different views which they themselves take on the matter.

While Lindholm (1990, p.25) believes Weber spent most of his time discussing the routinisation and institutionalisation of charisma, Stills feels he only touched on it finding the genuine charismatic element lacking in institutions, particularly with members' preoccupation with succession and continuing legitimacy (1965, p.202). This, Goldman contends, led Weber to hold that

systematic social and political innovations are only possible by the action of called individuals acting on behalf of a higher cause ... [and hence collectivities] cannot be empowered but only used as the tool of charismatic domination (Goldman, in press).

This link between charisma and institution building Eisenstadt considers 'the most important challenge which Weber's work poses for modern sociology' (1968, p.ix). In considering institutional charisma, Shils believes Weber's preoccupation with the unique features of modern society hindered his perception of the deeper and more permanent features of all societies (1965, p.203). Shils addresses this lack through the notion of order insisting

the generator or author of order arouses the charismatic responsiveness. Whether it be God's law or natural law or scientific law or positive law or the society as a whole, or even a particular corporate body or institution like an army, whatever embodies, expresses or symbolizes the essence of an ordered cosmos or any significant sector thereof awakens the disposition of awe and reverence, the charismatic disposition (ibid.).

Shils sees major religions providing these 'ordering patterns' assisting people to first, locate significant events, like the creation of the world, second, enabling them to evaluate society and, third, from this ordered position, 'assert what it should be' (ibid., p.204).
Lindholm (1990, p.192), on the other hand, describes such an ordering approach as simply 'ratifying and sacralizing the world as it is'. He sees it as being 'the mainstay of tradition and could even, perhaps, be subsumed into tradition ... Charisma in this sense is inextricably linked with the status quo'. But Eisenstadt, writing before Lindholm, had arguably anticipated and countered this argument. He develops Shil's argument maintaining that 'charismatic activities and orientations, because of their close relation to the very sources of social and cultural creativity, contain strong tendencies toward the destruction and decomposition of institutions' (1968, p.xix). Rather than seeing this decomposition or re-ordering coming from outside influences, Eisenstadt believes such desires are part of the 'basic wishes or orientations' of the people within the organisation. They want a 'good society' in which they can participate (ibid., p.xlii). Such an approach demands a rather special response from those able to respond ... [It] tends to be located in specific, distinct parts or aspects of the social structure. The structural focus of this quest is to be found in the charismatic activity, group symbol or institutional focus (ibid., pp.xli-xlii).

This activity, because of the disruptive nature of charisma, does not lend itself to consensus and may lead to 'dissension, conflict, and change' both because of the people's varying interests within the institution as well as a 'differential distribution of the charismatic in the symbolic and organizational aspects' of the institution. Nevertheless, when people realise that such charismatic activities are part of institutional life, social change and transformation proceed more systematically (ibid., pp.xlii-xliii).

Eisenstadt uses Weber's writings\(^\text{15}\) to nominate three values which enable such transformations:

1. relating the transcendent with everyday life
2. emphasising hard work and personal responsibility
3. experiencing unmediated relationships with the sacred and sacred tradition.

\(^{15}\) 'The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism' and later sociological studies.
He observes that while these aspects of the Protestant Ethic 'were conducive to its great transformative capacities and the ability of the Protestant groups to influence the behavior of people and the shape of institutions' (ibid., pp.xlv-xlvii) in so doing, Protestantism, in both its Calvinist and Lutheran versions, 'shifted the locus of grace and redemption from the church to the individual'. (This, Inglis later remarks, has caused some people 'to renounce the contemplative virtues and work pointlessly on' (1985, pp.132-133).)

Many post-Weberian scholars, therefore, see institutional charisma as a reality, and even as providing the charismatic leader with another source of charisma - apart from his or her own personal charisma - by his or her participation in a 'corporate body, conceived of as being under a supreme authority'. The members of the institution respond to both the specific order of the charismatic leader as well as the 'vague and powerful nimbus of the authority of the entire institution' which 'is inherent in the massive organization of authority' (Shils, 1965, p.206). Again, over time corporate bodies 'come to possess charismatic qualities simply by virtue of the tremendous power concentrated in them', thereby making the institution no longer dependant on the charismatic founding person (ibid., p.207).

Eyerman and Jamison (1991, p.16) discuss the effect which Weber and his confidant Michels have had on the study of social movements.

Michels argued that the routinization of charismatic leadership flowed from the establishment of bureaucratic structures. Both were seen as necessary aspects of the maturation of social movements in modern society, by which dynamic social forces were transformed into stagnant, top-heavy institutions, where an oligarchy of pragmatic 'petty bourgeois' leaders concerned themselves more with reproducing their own power than with changing society. This particular outcome of the institutionalization of mass movements has come to be called the 'Weber-Michels model' (ibid.).

It is not entirely clear how much justice this does to Weber. More important, however, is the substantive question itself of
the relationship of charisma to institution. The religious congregation is a particularly interesting case in this connection.

1.4 - RELIGIOUS LIFE AS A TEST-CASE FOR WEBER'S FRAMEWORK

Post-Weberian literature reveals a continuing respect for, and some extension of, Weber's basic theories. Additional to these extensions are other insights which the 'ideal type' of religious life can contribute to the understanding of the more general 'ideal type' of the charismatic social movement, insights which modify and extend the Weberian account, particularly Weber's account of the routinisation of charisma. It is a matter of certain characteristics of religious life which seem not quite to fit that account. These are sociologically recognisable, even if theological in their final definition.

First, when men and women join a religious congregation they make a total commitment for life. Other charismatic social movements allow members to continue living with their families and to pursue their chosen careers, but members of religious congregations hand over all their possessions, leave their families and make their home with the religious community. They live celibate lives and follow the corporate mission of the congregation. They are likely to do these things while gripped by a strong sense of themselves as 'called' to them. Their commitment is no less total, permanent and 'obedient' for them as individuals for coming two or three hundred years after the death of the founding person! It is clearly a charismatic event - and communal religious life remains, among other things, a tissue of such events even when thoroughly settled into its institutionalisation.

Second, people joining religious congregations participate in a thoroughgoing formation programme which initially lasts several years. Through this programme incoming members gain an understanding of what constitutes
the ideal type of religious life and experience it through living in community. Members of religious congregations continue to have the charism of their congregation passed onto them by those with whom they live. Thus those who have lived religious life for many years may readily pass on their learnings to younger members. Both formal training programmes and the experience of community living seek to ensure all members of the Congregation have the opportunity to receive the charism of their particular Institute.

Third, one of the difficulties Weber saw with charismatic social movements was the 'rationalisation' which takes place during routinisation, but over the centuries, however, what Weber would call the 'non-rational' dimension of religious congregations has been emphasised through the on-going prayer lives of individuals and communities.

Fourth, special attention is paid to the congregation's founding person through the prayer offered to that person by congregations as a whole, as well as by individual members. In this way the founding person's charism remains hauntingly present, as well as through the often unique spirituality which the founding person has handed on to his or her followers. This revering of the original charismatic leader in a spiritual sense occurs at a different level to the remembrance of the charismatic leader in a secular social movement. For the religious, the founding person is more of a living presence than an inspirational memory.

Fifth, if the religious congregation's structures have these kinds of inbuilt impulses to remain charismatic, it is also true that its early charismatic beginnings were already caught up in structure in as much as it had its ideal type presented to it by the universal church, through the auspices of Vatican authorities. This was to ensure the new social movement, first, benefited from the long history of religious congregations in the Catholic Church and second, 

16 Since the Catholic Church belongs to Weber's traditional category of authority (Avis, 1992, p.58), the emerging religious congregation ensures it preserves its own prophetic edge while maintaining the Church's ideal type for religious life. Such a practice immediately brings into 'dialogue' Weber's three forms of authority - traditional, rational and charismatic.
met the required standards on ideological and practical levels. Other social movements may have the opportunity to choose their degree of originality. A new religious congregation is not in that position. In Weber's terms, the religious congregation is born into a semi-institutionalised, semi-charismatic form.

Sixth, an important aspect of the required structure is that congregations are expected to obey a set of rules or constitutions approved by the Vatican authorities. Now, often founding people write these rules towards the end of their lives when they can capture clearly the essence of their founding charism and locate this charism within the emerging bureaucratisation that necessarily emerges as congregations, for instance, spread to other countries and make the necessary cultural adaptations. Some founding people refer to rules of other congregations for some guidance in writing their own, but because the new congregation's founding charism is normally felt to be unique, the founding person particularly wants to address the fresh initiatives to which his or her group is charismatically assigned. Mother Teresa's congregation typifies this experience. While many congregations set out initially to work with the poor, once these poor communities have overcome their poverty and become middle class, the religious congregations tended to stay with them. In charismatic reaction to this, Mother Teresa commits her sisters to always seek out the poorest of the poor.

These features of religious congregations suggest a greater potential for maintaining the charism of the charismatic social movement than that suggested by Weber. Nevertheless, some of what Weber says about dispersion, and even loss of charisma through over-bureaucratisation does apply. In the current literature on religious life considerable concern is being expressed about the declining numbers of new members joining congregations.

For many congregations the future looks
increasingly dark, especially in the Western world. The flow of recruits has dwindled to a trickle, while large numbers of professed religious have left their congregations. As a result the median age of those who have remained is now in the late 50s and 60s. Fewer religious are involved in the active apostolate; for some, morale has fallen and among those who remain there is often a debilitating feeling that their principal function is to tend the shop until the moment comes to put up the shutters (McDonagh, 1991, p.648).

Are the problems of this age of a different order to those experienced in the past? Maybe religious life is very stable and can go on for centuries. On the other hand, perhaps the conditions of modern life pose an entirely new level of threat. Weber's theory of charismatic social movements may be more relevant to religious congregations today than it has ever been before. But first we need to consider the theological dimension of charism in the context of the history of religious life in general and of the individual religious congregation.

As we have seen, Weber observed, with some regret, the rationalisation, and to a lesser extent the traditionalisation, of charismatic authority. If he had paid more specific attention to the experiences of religious congregations, he might have had greater faith in the potential longevity of charismatic authority and in the possibility of tolerably happy marriages between charisma and institutions.
CHAPTER 2 - THE SELF-UNDERSTANDING OF CONTEMPORARY

RELIGIOUS CONGREGATIONS AS CHARISMATIC SOCIAL

MOVEMENTS

Fidelity to the spirit of the founder [or foundress]
and responsiveness to critical and unmet human needs
are basic to the ongoing mission of religious
communities.

Religious life can be described as a social movement
which has existed in many different religious traditions and
in a wide variety of forms (Schneiders, 1986, p.26). It
currently understands its own history as a succession of
eras, each marked by distinctive innovation in life-style.
During such transitions, religious life undergoes a 'paradigm
shift', which causes 'revolutionary changes'. This model of
historical development is similar to that advocated by Thomas
Kuhn for understanding the history of science. It differs
from Kuhn's, however, by not claiming a complete break from
one era to the next. New congregations are seen as
maintaining some of the characteristics of the old and, of
course, many of the old congregations obviously continue to
exist, and even to thrive, in the new era.

This model has assisted contemporary theologians and
sociologists to propose and explain the current transition
stage they believe religious congregations are experiencing
worldwide. While only a model, and reality tends to burst
through its boundaries, it currently dominates the literature.
It helps this study, by conceptualising, first, the context
into which the Marist Brothers' social movement was born
and, second, the history and present problems of that Marist

1 This conclusion to a major study on the future of religious life in the
United States published in September 1992 is quoted in Fagan (1992,
p.1299).
2 The books describing these eras have been either read, or the ideas
discussed, by most members of religious congregations today. Information
about such research trickles down into a widespread consciousness among
religious through conferences, retreats, journals and everyday
conversations.
3 Kuhn understood the history of science as going through a period of normal
science (growth phase in the religious life model), then a period of
gathering crisis (decline phase) leading to a period of extraordinary
science (change-over phase) that issues in a new paradigm and a new period
of normal science under new rules (growth phase under a new image).
4 Such as adherence to the distinctive character of each congregation as
exemplified by the Benedictines returning to the spirit of St. Benedict.
2.1 - HOW THE EVOLUTION OF RELIGIOUS LIFE IS UNDERSTOOD

Fleming initially (1971), and Cada et al more recently (1985), have described what they see as a repeated sequence of identifiable phases of change in the history of religious life.

Growth Phase. A relatively long period which starts with the emergence of a new dominant image of religious life and continues with the elaboration and development of that image. The growth phase peaks in a golden age during which the dominant image of religious life successfully unites a large number of religious communities in its area.

Decline Phase. A period of ambiguity in which the dominant image of religious life comes under questioning. Religious communities seem no longer suited to the aspirations of the age. The communities lose their sense of purpose, drift into laxity, and disintegrate.

Change-over Phase. A comparatively short period in which religious life passes through one of its major turning points in history. In the midst of a considerable amount of turmoil, variations of the dominant image of religious life crop up. Certain of these variations are fused into a new dominant image.

Growth Phase under a New Image. A period of elaboration and development under the new dominant image ... which inaugurates the next great age in the history of religious life (Cada et al, 1985, p.12).


(1) The Age of the Desert (200 - 500) Religious life in the Christian tradition began in the deserts of Syria and Egypt where men and women went to do battle with the devil (O'Murchu, 1989, p.68). By the year 315, Pachomius, sometimes referred to as the father of the religious life, had charge of five thousand monks in Egypt (Byrne, 1989, p.18). The desert was seen as a place of austere beauty, where the monk was trained in the ways of perfection. He returned
periodically to heal the sick, cast out demons, comfort the sorrowful, encourage the persecuted, reconcile the estranged and urge everyone to put nothing in the world before the love of Christ (Cada et al., 1985, p.15). During the fourth century the 'allure of the ascetic ideal' came to be felt also in the West with foundations emerging on the Italian peninsula, in Gaul and Spain, and along the northern coast of Africa. By the fifth century, the golden age was beginning to fade. Many monks in the East had become involved in doctrinal controversy. Monasteries in Gaul and other parts of the West became refugee cloisters, where monks gathered together the few treasures of civilization they could find in the aftermath of barbarian pillage. Asceticism began to lose its appeal. Many wondered if religious life would die out along with the Roman empire.

However, as dusk settled on the ruins of imperial Rome, the stage was already being set for the rise of feudal Europe and the next age of the evolution of religious life. Out beyond the frontiers of the crumbling empire Celtic monasticism was quietly taking root in far-off Ireland, unnoticed by the bewildered leaders back in the besieged centers of Christianity and the civilized world.

During this first age, the basic patterns of religious life emerged. Most of these have remained normative to today (Cada et al., 1985, pp.15-20).

(2) The Age of Monasticism (500 - 1200) This Age was dominated by the image of the monk or nun spending a lifetime in a single monastery or abbey observing the rule.

During the sixth and seventh centuries, European convents and monasteries observed a variety of such rules, the most important of which were the various versions of Celtic discipline. At the same time, Benedict's more temperate approach began its gradual expansion ... and emerged as the dominant pattern from the ninth to the twelfth centuries (ibid., p.28).

Benedict knew the wisdom of the desert and carefully extracted from its many traditions those which he thought most applicable to the religious life which would be led amid the unsettled conditions of sixth-century Italy.

This image was not only a correction of the
abuses which had crept in during the decline of the Age of the Desert; it also, and more importantly, turned out to be a successful adaptation of the ascetic ideal to the feudal society which emerged from the Dark Ages and reached its crest in the early medieval period (ibid., p.23).

Benedict's rule combined an 'uncompromising spirituality with physical moderation and flexibility. It emphasized the charity and harmony of a simple life in common under the guidance of a wise and holy abbot'. When the sixth century began, the vision of religious life contained in Benedict's Rule was just one 'among a great variety of regimes, which varied in austerity, thrust, and rigour of observance' (ibid.). Benedict's rule was gradually adopted by other monasteries. Charlemagne's son, Louis, sought to reform monasticism, which was becoming corrupt in some centres, by decreeing that Benedict's rule be observed by all the monasteries of his realms (O'Murchu, 1989, p.71). This unification did not take effect until the monastery at Cluny began its growth in the tenth century.

Cluniac ideals became the model for Christian spirituality, the Cluniac network was used to bolster papal strength, and the Cluniac system of more than a thousand monasteries prefigured the structures of a religious order of later centuries (Cada et al., 1985, p.24).

But by the end of the eleventh century, the Cluniac network had become vast, wealthy, and, to some, a source of scandal, despite various attempts made to restore the primitive fervour of the Benedictine ideal, chief among which were the Carthusian and Cistercian reforms. During the twelfth century European monasteries, which had been so successful in the ways of feudal culture, began to appear inadequate to the Age of the early Crusades, the beginnings of world trade, and the contacts being made with Arab civilisation and, through it, with the classical learning of antiquity. Laxity was once again creeping into religious life. A particular issue was that those monks who were priests began to feel superior to those who were laymen. This dispute gradually led to the almost complete clericalization of the monks and the relegation of the residue of male lay
religious to a subordinate monastic category. This was not to be settled (and then only briefly) until the next century with the rise of the mendicants (ibid., pp.24-25). The Age of Monasticism had successfully provided the commitment methodologies needed for religious congregations to survive after the deaths of their charismatic founding people. But now, religious life was seeking once more to adapt to the new conditions of Church and society (Witberg, 1991, p.29).

(3) The Age of the Mendicant Orders (1200 - 1500) The mendicant ideal of Francis and Dominic pulled together some of the variations that had arisen in the previous century and united them with the main objectives of religious life. Renouncing personal ownership had always been espoused, but the mendicants provided a fresh example of what it could mean to be evangelically poor by divesting themselves of landed wealth and living off alms. This allowed them, in addition, an apostolic mobility which had previously been incompatible with the ideal of monastic stability. The mendicants provided a new and effective way for the Church to teach and preach, which in previous centuries had been seen as the responsibility of the secular clergy (Cada et al, 1985, p.29 and p.31).

At the time of their birth, church life generally was in a state of some disarray. In 1215, the Fourth Lateran Council ruled:

Lest the extreme diversity of Religious Orders lead to confusion ... we firstly prohibit anyone else to found a Religious Order. But whoever wishes to enter the Religious Life, let him [or her] join an Order already established. Similarly with anyone wanting to set up a new Religious house, let ... [that person] choose a rule and form of life from among the approved Religious Orders (quoted in O'Murchu, 1989, p.73).

Dominic acknowledged this directive and adopted the Rule of St. Augustine while giving it an orientation which established a new rule in practice for the Dominicans. Francis, however, continued to insist that the only Rule he wished to adopt was the gospel message of Jesus. His 'new' rule was approved by Pope Honorius III in 1223 (ibid.).
Rapid expansion occurred among the Mendicants. While the majority of religious in the thirteenth century still belonged to monastic orders, their growth was not as great. The new image of religious life gradually became acceptable, and proved to be a better way to serve the emerging urban society than was possible from monasteries in isolated rural settings. Particularly worth mentioning is the fact that, during the course of the thirteenth century, the monastic orders began to establish studia close to the new universities.

As Christendom reached its zenith, the image of a new kind of religious life ... played a key role in the Church's spirituality, the cultivation of the intellectual life of the Church and society, and ... the preaching of the gospel for the Church (Cada et al., 1985, pp.31-32).

In time, however, the mendicants, 'who had been founded in reaction to the decadence of monastic wealth, succumbed with even greater flair to the same evil'. Half way through the fourteenth century large numbers of religious died in the black plague. Those who died were often the 'more pious and devout religious', because it was they who went into the towns and cared for people burdened by the disease.

As the Renaissance brought a new humanism and the secularization of European society, and various other movements hinted at the coming breakup of Christendom, a malaise was clearly descending upon the Church and religious life ... Once again it seemed that the time was ripe for a new regeneration and revitalization of religious life (ibid., pp.32-33).

(4) The Age of the Apostolic Orders (1500 - 1800) By the sixteenth century, European society was being transformed. Rationalism was emerging, the New World had just been discovered and the Church was held in low respect (ibid., pp.33-34). Luther, Calvin and other Protestant reformers rejected the idea of religious life, which by this time, had lost its credibility (McDonough, 1992, p.91). Vatican authorities 'received proposals that all but four orders of men and most orders of women be suppressed' (Sammon,
1992, p.66). As some European countries became Protestant, their catholic religious congregations were almost eliminated (Cada et al., 1985, p.34).

By the first half of the sixteenth century, two new foundations, the Ursulines and the Jesuits, had begun a new trend. From the very start, the Jesuits pursued the ideal of excellence for the sake of God:

- excellence in sanctity and holiness, excellence in the intellectual life, excellence in apostolic zeal, whether it concerned extirpating the heresies of Protestantism to regain the wayward flock, or carrying the message of faith on missionary journeys to the very antipodes' (ibid., pp.33-34).

The intense personal formation of the Jesuits in disciplined pursuit of holiness allowed these new militant servants of the Pope to do without the safeguards of regular monastic observance.

Ignatius broke with the spiritual tradition which measured holiness by the amount of time spent on one's knees. His contemplatives were to prove themselves in action ... Once the will was purified, closeness to God could be measured rather by service of one's brothers and sisters. The goal was 'to find God in all things' and, as a corollary, 'all things in God' (TAB, 1990, p.1183).

Consequently, immersed in the exercise of individual meditation, the Jesuits took up the challenge of the Reformation, 'shoring up the Church's political power in Catholic Europe', preaching the gospel in newly discovered lands, and 'coming to grips with the secularizing trends of the scientific revolution, modern philosophy, and the rise of nationalism in Europe' (ibid., p.35).

Other visionary founding people like Vincent de Paul and Angela Merici of the Ursulines found ways of circumventing the decrees of the Council of Trent which imposed cloister on all nuns and punished violations of cloister with excommunication. Of the early Daughters of Charity, Vincent de Paul famously wrote:

They are to have no monastery but the houses of the sick, who have for cells only a lodging or the poorest room, whose chapel is the parish
church, who have the streets for cloisters. They are enclosed only by obedience; they make the fear of God their 'grille', and they have no veil but their own modesty (quoted in O'Murchu, 1989, p.75).

Such orders saw personal holiness as the only dependable agency of reform (Cada et al., 1985, p.35). During the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries more women found ways of carrying out their ministry without being confined to the cloister (Cada et al., 1985, p.36). These groups gave birth to female apostolic religious life, 'one of the most powerful and creative resources the church has ever known' (O'Murchu, 1989, p.75). But, like earlier eras, this one also came to show signs of decline.

During the eighteenth century, a slow decline began in religious life. Large but nearly empty religious houses could be found almost everywhere in Europe. The Enlightenment undermined the rationale for religious life, and many liberated religious seemed to agree with this new thinking (Cada et al., 1985, p.37).

The Bourbon kings persuaded Rome to suppress the Jesuits in 1773. 'Many orders passed out of existence - some were suppressed by the state, while others simply closed down after the majority of their members had departed' (ibid., p.38). Astonishingly, of the approximately two thousand Benedictine establishments in Europe in 1789, twenty were still functioning in 1815 (Sammon, 1992, pp.66-67). Some predicted the demise of religious life as a whole, but it seems that the way was being cleared once again for its revival in a new form (Cada et al., 1985, p.38).

(5) The Age of the Teaching Congregations (1800 - Present)
The fifth era of religious life began with a century of social change, commercial and industrial expansion and colonialism. Six hundred congregations were founded in the nineteenth century - including the focus of this study, the Marist Brothers. The majority of these congregations were.
dedicated to the ideal of building educational and medical institutions where their members applied themselves to 'attaining the professional standards required for excellence in those institutions'. Humility and simplicity became the hallmark virtues for these religious who dedicated their lives to developing their institutions to an acceptable standard in secular terms and at the same time shape them to suit the needs of the Church.

The most widespread instance of this strategy was the enlistment of religious communities in the movement of educating the masses. For the first time in European history, the idea of educating everyone had the possibility of being realized. The new congregations joined in this movement in ... [the hope] of planting the seeds of a robust faith in the souls of the children they taught (ibid., pp.39-40).

Enthusiasm for the education of children, together with the new spirituality of the seventeenth century, helped inspire the new-style religious. While many now worked in hospitals, most took up teaching.

Even the few pre-Revolution orders which were managing a slow recovery took on many of the trappings of the typical nineteenth-century teaching congregation. For the first time in the history of religious life, recruitment of adult vocations was almost completely displaced by candidates just emerging from childhood (ibid.). Religious life took this new turn because the Church saw it could get in touch with large numbers of people using these institutions (ibid.). 'Development was lateral rather than progressive' (Byrne, 1989, p.71). Whereas the seventeenth-century Jesuit education aimed at the elite, nineteenth-century teaching congregations focused on the masses. Both kinds of education strove to support the Church's ordinary ministry.

Religious still saw themselves as bishops' specialized auxiliaries working at the tasks that the secular clergy could not handle in its ordinary parish ministry. The difference in the nineteenth century lay in the large role played by women and the value ascribed to humble and devoted service by individuals willingly and generously submerging themselves to the ends of apostolic institutions (Cada et al., 1985, p.41).
By now the feudal structures, common in religious life since the dawn of Europe, were finally discarded. Instead of each religious establishment being 'a benefice to which a guaranteed fixed annual income was attached', congregations had to find new means of support. The governments of the nineteenth century avoided state support of religious orders 'because of the success of those ideas of the Age of Reason which dictated that the only legitimate role of religious was secular service to society'. This pattern turned out to be a blessing in disguise, since it meant that the apostolic method which Vincent de Paul and John Baptist de la Salle had experimented with on a limited scale in the seventeenth century was now adopted across the board (ibid., pp.41-42).

Prior to the French Revolution, religious orders were well endowed and well financed. People wondered whether such orders would ever inspire the faithful again by their poor lifestyles. After the Revolution, religious orders had no choice. 'The means of security in the past had been taken away, never to be returned, and the demands of day-to-day living forced a poor lifestyle on the new congregations'. As this era developed, increasingly professional religious were staffing a vast network of Catholic institutions in developed countries and those emerging in new lands. By time of the Second Vatican Council, the number of religious had reached its highest point ever in absolute terms (ibid.).

Today, religious life is seen to be in a period of transition. Pivotal to this transition is the crisis of significance that followed World War II and the Second Vatican Council (1962-1964) (Schneiders, 1986, p.87). The Council's discussion and document on the Religious Life (Perfectae Caritatis (1965)) came at an early stage of the transition period. It saw the appropriate renewal of religious life as involving two simultaneous principles, one

6 Though as early as 1950, for example, the Sacred Congregation of Religious held international convocations of the major superiors of monastic, contemplative and active congregations, in which they were urged to adapt their institutes to the modern world without sacrificing the essentials of their state of life in the Church (Schneiders, 1991, p.157).
conservationist and one contemporary:

(1) a continuous return to the sources of all Christian life and to the original inspiration behind a given community and
(2) an adjustment of the community to the changed conditions of the times7 (PC, 1965, p.468).

The Council asked each religious institute to renew its life in response to the signs of the times8, according to the norms of the Gospel and in harmony with the charism of the particular congregation9 (Schneiders, 1986, p.87).

Yet, since the 1970s, there has been a sharp decline in membership of religious congregations due to increased withdrawals and a decrease in new members (Collins, 1991, p.61). This decline has caused many members to experience alienation and question the relevance of their congregations' basic charisms. A recent study indicated a 'larger relative number of resignees among those already established in church careers than in any other equivalent period of time since the French Revolution' - the decline phase of the last era of religious life (Wittberg, 1991, p.33 and p.48). For example, in the United States, membership in women's religious congregations decreased 33% between 1966 and 1983

7 The Council further elaborated certain principles which it saw as guiding the renewal of religious life 'under the influence of the Holy Spirit and the guidance of the Church':

a) ... a following of Christ as proposed by the gospel ... is to be regarded by all communities as their supreme law.
b) It serves the best interests of the Church for communities to have their own special character and purpose. Therefore loyal recognition and safekeeping should be accorded to the spirit of founders [and foundresses], as also to ... [the] goals and ... traditions which constitute the heritage of each community.
c) All communities should participate in the life of the Church ... [each according] to its individual character ... [in] scriptural, liturgical, doctrinal, pastoral, ecumenical, missionary, and social [fields].
d) Communities should promote among their members a suitable awareness of contemporary human conditions and of the needs of the Church.
e) ... an interior renewal must always be accorded the leading role even in the promotion of exterior works (PC, 1965, pp.468-469).

8 To this programme O'Reilly, speaking from his African context, adds the need for religious congregations to respond to the 'signs of the places' (1991, p.868). Pope John XXIII in his encyclical Pacem in Terris claimed the three main 'signs of the times' to be (1) the end of colonism (2) the emancipation of women and (3) the promotion of the lot of the working class (TAB, 1992k, p.1216).

9 Some would say that Vatican II helped the Church deal not so much with the 20th century, but with centuries of needed reform (Slattery, 1992, p.15).
while men's orders declined 14% with the greatest loss being among brothers (38%) as compared to priests (1%)\textsuperscript{10}. Specific ministries have lost religious at a greater rate. In 1983 there were 68% fewer women religious teaching in Catholic schools than in 1966 (Neal (1984) quoted in Wittberg, 1991, p.34; Schweickert, 1991, p.222).

Following the Council, the Church began to open itself to a world which was undergoing dramatic secularisation. This opening up (aggiornamento) had significant impact on all dimensions of Church life. Parishes and their schools ceased to be alone in shaping the values and beliefs of Catholics. Once-clear norms and social roles within the Church no longer served their original purpose (Cada \textit{et al}, 1985, p.47). One early commentator observed: 'Religious watched the pendulum swing from an overly institutional conception of vowed life during the pre-conciliar period, to an overly individual conception of the vows during the period directly after the Council' (Rosato, 1977, p.282).

The first indications of new life, yet another era of religious life perhaps, may be discernible in twentieth century movements such as those of Taize where pilgrims, having passed the ruins of the Cluny abbey, arrive to pray and live in a less formal setting\textsuperscript{11} (Byrne, 1989, p.8), the Brothers and Sisters of Charles de Foucauld\textsuperscript{12}, the Sisters and Brothers of Mother Teresa, the Basic Christian

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{lcc}
 & 1963 & 1986 \\
Priests & 58,000 & 57,183 \\
Brothers & 12,000 & 7,429 \\
Sisters & 177,000 & 113,658 \\
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{10} Schweickert (1991, p.222) quotes the following statistics:

\textsuperscript{11} The personal charism of Brother Roger, the founder and leader of the Taize community, centres on 'his Gospel simplicity, his depth and his transparency'. Daneels describes the Brothers who live at Taize as 'silent and discreet, undemonstrative, entirely turned toward God and open to every guest' (Daneels, 1992, p.26). Taize celebrations include prayer, songs and long periods of silence. Few words are spoken and there is no preaching.

\textsuperscript{12} The Little Brothers of Jesus, Inspired by the French mystic Charles De Foucauld, were founded in 1933 by Rene Voillaume and four other priests who settled on the edge of the Sahara and adopted a monastic way of life based on Charles de Foucauld's first rule (Livingstone, 1990, p.147). Today they number 250, work in 45 countries and have their world headquarters in a terraced house in Brixton, London (Willey, 1992, p.1097). The Little Brothers seek to combine contemplation with the discipline of earning their living (Livingstone, 1990, p.443). They live in small communities among the poor, 'working in factories and coal mines, on farms and fishing boats, as taxi-drivers and dustmen'. The Little Sisters were founded six years later, and now have 1,200 members (Willey, 1992, p.1097).
Communities of Latin America and the vast array of Christian communities springing up across the world (O'Murchu, 1989, p.79).

New life is also observable, it is suggested, in a number of established religious congregations which have extended their choice of activities and gone from a religious place of work to a secular place, and 'from charitable activities to activities implying solidarity with movements for the liberation and progress of humanity' (Tillard, 1986, p.17).

In summary, therefore, the historical evidence is read – with considerable plausibility – as showing that there have been significant shifts in the dominant image of religious life over the centuries. These shifts have often occurred during major changes in society and Church. Each major shift is heralded by some significantly new foundations which embody a new image, initially not perceived as being 'real' religious life (Wittberg, 1991, p.26).

Many communities go out of existence at each transition. Those which survive, contemporary scholars maintain, either continue in a diminished form or adapt the new dominant image to the charism of their own foundation. The mendicant orders, for example, grew stronger numerically during the Age of Apostolic orders because they adapted their own gifts to the new style of religious life. The evidence suggests another major transition has now begun. If it follows earlier patterns, it will last twenty to twenty five years and significantly change religious communities and their works into a new form of religious life (Cada et al., 1985, pp.45-47; Leddy, 1989, p.47).

2.2 - THE INDIVIDUAL CONGREGATION: HISTORY AS LIFE CYCLE

Just as religious entertain and draw upon a sense of the history of religious life generally along the lines outlined above, so they draw also upon a sense of the history of
their own particular institution or order. And, increasingly in the present time of crisis, they tend to see this particular history in terms of a 'life-cycle' model.

The French Jesuit, Raymond Hostie (1972) initially developed this model to describe the typical religious congregations. I was only able to study the French edition of Hostie's text in the New York City Public library. An English edition is available from the Centre for Applied Research in the Apostolate, Washington D.C. (O'Murchu, 1989, p.267). O'Murchu says of Hostie's framework:

The theory is not without its limitations: it makes many generalisations; it is based on a number of unproven assumptions and is modelled exclusively on male Orders and Congregations. Nonetheless, it carries a ring of truth and makes sense of historical developments that otherwise remain disconcerting and even baffling ... I first began to study the history of Religious life in the early 1970s; I was unaware of Hostie's work ... I myself came to the same conclusions ... The subsequent research of ... Cada and associates (1978) endorsing these historical findings with sociological evidence ... further enhances Hostie's theoretical framework (1989, pp.65-66).

It is beyond the scope of this discussion to offer a critique of the life cycle model. It receives a great deal of support from current authors and it has entered into the self-understanding of many contemporary religious. On that basis, I present the following discussion of this theory. It relies on the work of Marianist Brother Cada and his associates (1985) and Diarmuid O'Murchu (1989), a priest member of the Sacred Heart Missionary Congregation. It is particularly relevant to the Marist Brothers' Congregation. During the last two decades, the Brothers have been moving from a period of confidence where many worked together in schools, and when the Congregation's numbers were increasing, to the current period where many Brothers work in more individual apostolates, where the overall number of Brothers is declining and the average age of the Congregation's membership continues to increase. These

13 Of the 10 to 15 discussions I have studied, none has been substantially critical.
changes affect Brothers' work in both quantitative and qualitative ways. There are now fewer Brothers in schools and each Brother chooses his work more specifically according to his own talents. These changes naturally affect contemporary Marist educational vision. According to the life cycle model of religious congregations, the Marist Brothers' Congregation is in the 'breakdown period'. We now examine this model in some detail.

In his 1972 study, Hostie insisted religious congregations have a hardy life. They need a period of gestation from ten to twenty years. To consolidate, they need almost double that time. Their full development, if not postponed by a period of incubation, takes almost one hundred years. They remain stabilised during an almost equal period of time. Then suddenly they begin a downward curve, which in its turn can last from fifty to one hundred years, after which, according to circumstances, extinction is duly registered ... The completed life-cycle of groupings of Religious Life stretches out over a period varying between 250 and 300 years (Hostie (1972) quoted in O'Murchu, 1989, p.66).

In building on Hostie's model, Cada et al identify five consecutive periods in the typical life cycle of a religious congregation.

(1) The Foundation Period. This period centres around a founding person and his or her vision. This vision results from an unmerited religious experience or series of experiences of depth and intensity in the founding person's life (Roccasalvo, 1992, p.562).

contained in the transforming experience is a new appreciation of the message of Jesus which leads to innovative insight concerning how the condition of the Church or society could be dramatically improved or how a totally new kind of future could be launched (Cada et al., 1985, p.53).

A new impetus to fully live the religious life is felt, and a new theory emerges that is 'a critique of the present, an appropriation of the past, a compelling image of the future,

14 Religious congregations which have lasted longer than 300 years are considered to have been 'refounded'.

55
and a basis for novel strategies'. Then follows a 'fortuitous encounter' between the founding person and some contemporary men or women in which the 'founding experience, innovative insight, emerging theory, and call to holiness are shared'. The founding person guides the group in developing new arrangements for living the gospel together and working toward the realisation of the Reign of God (ibid., pp.53-54).

The foundation period lasts some twenty to thirty years, and frequently coincides with the last part of the founding person's lifetime (O'Murchu, 1989, p.66; Cada et al., 1985, p.54). The community structure begins to appear in seminal form with authority emanating from the wisdom of the founding person who usually displays a 'unique combination of charismatic attractiveness and practical ability' writing the constitutions which codify the founding vision 'only after ten or twenty years' experience' (Wittherg, 1991, p.27).

While the foundation period focuses on the founding charism there are also crises to be faced.

The crisis of direction forces the community to decide which undertakings are important ... The crisis of leadership confronts the community with the problem of finding out how it will live beyond the time of its founding person. The crisis of legitimization involves the nascent community with the questioning of whether the Church will approve it as an authentic form of religious life (Cada et al, p.54).

2) The Expansion Period. Following the foundation period, the congregation undergoes at least a fifty year period of expansion, during which the founding charism is institutionalised. As the congregation's second generation members grow older, they recount stories of the foundation which 'enshrine decisive events' and establish the community's direction and characteristic ways. Gradually, rituals and symbols which commemorate the 'most treasured facets of the foundation' are 'fused with the lore of the older members' into a sacred memory and cult that begins to be passed on from generation to generation as the
Attempts are made at thinking through the founding myth and expressing it in terms of contemporary thought patterns. Eventually these efforts result in theories, interpretations, and social models which coalesce into a belief system and give a rational structure to the more intuitive thrust of the founding myth (ibid., p.55).

Simultaneously, procedures for decision making and communication are established. 'Norms are set down and customs emerge which cover all aspects of the community's life, such as membership criteria, leadership standards and apostolic priorities'.

The members of the young community experience an excitement about the growth and success that characterize the expansion period. Large numbers join the community, and new works are rapidly taken on which enhance the possibility of a still broader recruitment. Major interpreters of the founding vision are recognized. Patterns of spiritual practice are determined, and the community's spirituality is made concrete in manuals of direction or other written documents (ibid., pp.55-56).

With expansion arises the organisational questions as to how authority will be delegated, what means will be used to integrate and link the rapidly expanding membership and network of establishments and how the vigour of the founding vision will be maintained (ibid., p.56).

(3) The Stabilisation Period. This may last for a century or more (O'Murchu, 1989, p.67). While an increase in membership may continue, geographical expansion usually slows down. The congregation continues to enjoy a feeling of success. The prevailing paradigm of religious life is clear giving a foundation for describing 'unambiguous social roles for religious'.

Gradually, as stabilization sets in ... [there] is little need to elaborate the understanding of the founding vision or penetrate into it more deeply. It is simply accepted, and repeated to new members. No one is left in the community who knew the founding person or the first disciples personally. Memory of the founding events takes on the cast of past history that is separate from the present moment. Formation of new members emphasizes their conformity to
standard patterns of external behavior that are seen as the best means of cultivating interior commitment (Cada et al., 1985, pp.56-57).

Activism begins to dominate, work-satisfaction displaces the centrality of Christ, members tend to be carried along by the inertia of the community’s activities rather than by deep personal commitment. Vision and commitment among members become less intense, now that the community has become so highly institutionalised. Basic myths and beliefs are presumed. A feeling of overall well-being rules out the necessity for change, and a hidden type of rigidity begins to set in (ibid., p.57 and p.87). 'This is the phase in which wealth begins to accumulate, poverty becomes problematic and prayer-life recedes into the background' (O'Murchu, 1989, p.67).

(4) The Breakdown Period. Eventually the apparent immutabilities of the stabilisation period begin to give (Cada et al., 1985, p.57). Breakdown may be a gradual process lasting up to fifty years, or may take place quite rapidly in a matter of a few decades.

Institutional structures and belief systems dismantle, giving way to widespread doubt and stress. This phase originates in a minority’s dissatisfaction with the internal life of the group or the relevance of its external commitments. The idea of going back to the time when things were going well is an illusive dream (O'Murchu, 1989, p.67).

Decision making structures become confused, membership decreases and internal abuses spread (ibid.). Members begin to question the importance of belonging to one religious congregation rather than another. The crisis of collapsing institutions sets in as the community is forced to abandon long-established works. The resulting demoralization suggests the community’s impending death (Cada et al., 1985, p.59 and p.87).

(5) The Transition Period. Any one of three outcomes is possible:
(a) Total extinction: Historically this has happened to 76% of all male Religious groups founded before 1500, and to 64% of those founded before 1800. This suggests most of today’s
religious congregations will become extinct (Cada et al., 1985, p.59).

(b) Minimal survival. A religious community that doesn’t die out may go into a period of low-level survival which can last for several centuries. Of all male groups, only 5% of all men's orders founded before 1500, and 11% of the orders founded before 1800 have a current membership larger than 2,000 (ibid.).

(c) Revival. A small percentage of religious congregations survive the transition period. Three characteristics can be attributed to congregations which have been revitalised in this way: first, a transforming response to the signs of the times - 'those various events and movements' in the world that reflect 'God's presence and purpose' (Dwyer, 1992, p.17); second, a reappropriation of the founding charism and third, a profound renewal of the life of prayer, faith and centredness in Christ (Cada et al., 1985, p.60; Sammon, 1992, p.72).

The time in history when revitalization occurs makes a difference to its form. If the revitalization takes place during one of the shifts in the dominant image of religious life, the congregation appropriates many of the characteristics of the emerging paradigm, and a transforming response to the signs of the times becomes central.

Personal transformation ... is central to revitalization. With personal transformation comes innovative insight ... [which] brings with it a focusing of energies through a new positive vision of what the community should be in the future. The vision allows the emergence of a new theory which gives meaning to the experiences of individuals and the shared events lived with the community, and spurs the community to building and creating its future (Cada et al., 1985, p.60).

The Ursulines provide an example of revitalisation which occurred during the shift from the Age of Apostolic Orders (1500 - 1800) to the Age of Teaching Orders (1800 - present) (ibid., p.61).

---

15 Although current authors refer to sociological research to back up such contentions, it seems that they still rely mainly on the work of Raymond Hostie.
TABLE 2.1 - THE URSULINE SISTERS AS AN EXAMPLE OF THE REVITALISATION OF A RELIGIOUS CONGREGATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1535 - 1565</td>
<td>Foundation</td>
<td>30 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1565 - 1690</td>
<td>Expansion</td>
<td>125 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1690 - 1790</td>
<td>Stabilisation</td>
<td>100 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1790 - 1820</td>
<td>Breakdown</td>
<td>30 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1820 - 1840</td>
<td>Revitalisation</td>
<td>20 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1840 - 1900</td>
<td>Expansion</td>
<td>60 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900 - 1960</td>
<td>Stabilisation</td>
<td>60 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960 -</td>
<td>Breakdown</td>
<td>18+ years</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If the revitalisation occurs midway during one of the major eras in the history of religious life, the revitalization takes on the characteristics of a reform, with the reappropriation of the founding charism playing a central role. In either case, this new theory guides the congregation in its search for, or invention of, a new model of serving the world as a community of disciples (ibid.).

PREFACE TO 2.3 AND 2.4

We now consider some of the doubts, debates and exciting new ideas that characterise the culture of religious life in the late 20th century. MacIntyre stresses the importance of such debates:

... when an institution - a university, say, or a farm, or a hospital - is the bearer of a tradition of practice or practices, its common life will be partly, but in a centrally important way, constituted by a continuous argument as to what a university is and ought to be or what good farming is or what good medicine is. Traditions, when vital, embody continuities of conflict. Indeed when a tradition becomes Burkean, it is always dying or dead (1990, p.222).

While many debates on the nature of religious life focus on such questions as to whether congregations can be 'refounded', as suggested by Arbuckle in his book Out of Chaos (1988), or simply 'rewoven', as proposed by Leddy in her text Reweaving Religious Life (1991), the pivotal issue in current discussions is the meaning and role of charism. In

16 Burke equates nature with certain established norms and procedures, including the procedure of relying on prevailing habit rather than on argument (MacIntyre, 1989 p.228).
the next two sections, we consider, first, how members of religious congregations understand the theology of charism and, second, how they apply this theology to contemporary religious life.

2.3 - THE THEOLOGICAL UNDERSTANDING OF CHARISM

Studying the theology of charism as it pertains to religious life emerged after the Second Vatican Council. Like all theology, it is based on a reading of Scripture and tradition. In defining charisma as a certain quality of an individual personality by which the person 'is considered extraordinary and treated as endowed with supernatural, superhuman, or at least specifically exceptional powers or qualities' (1978, p.241), Weber acknowledged a certain conceptual link between charisma and the supernatural. Theology, which relies on revelation, takes this link for real (Hodgson, 1992, p.1229).

The Second Vatican Council described the primary and perpetual foundations of theology as the written Word of God and tradition. It saw the study of Scripture as the soul of theology and a source of nourishment for Christian instruction, and tradition as the handing down of understandings which have resulted from the contemplation and study made by believers since the time of Jesus (DV, 1965, Art.4 and Art.24). Scripture and tradition, together with reason, provide essential resources for considering the theology of charism (Avis, 1992, p.115).

In the Hebrew Scriptures, special people were designated by God's Spirit and anointed to lead the people. In choosing these people, God provided them with the inspiration, or charism, needed for the task. Thus Perkins

---

17 Theology is defined by St. Anselm (1033-1109) as 'faith seeking understanding' (M171, 1988, p.36) and by St. Thomas Aquinas (1226 - 1274) as 'reason led by the hand of faith' (Davies, 1974, p.101).
18 The Vatican Council saw tradition developing with the help of the Holy Spirit (DV, 1965, Art.8).
19 Cada et al. conclude that although 'Karl Rahner, Yves Congar, Hans Kung and other theologians have made substantial contributions to the explication of the theology of charism, a comprehensive study remains to be done' (1985, p.184).
describes the early leaders of the tribes of Israel as charismatic (1990, p.24). The Spirit moved these people to actions beyond their known capacity - such as when delivering Israel from its enemies. Saul was moved by the Spirit to deliver the city of Jabesh-gilead, threatening all those who did not follow him with severe punishment (Hengel, 1981, p.19).

In normal times the loose organization of the tribes of Israel needed no more than the simple government of clan and village elders. When the peace of Israel was threatened by external enemies, this leadership was not enough, and it was supplanted by the leader who demonstrated the possession of the spirit by the deeds of the spirit. During the period of the judges, the spirit of the charismatic leader was a passing phenomenon: the spirit came upon the leaders during the emergency, impelled them to a mission, and departed after the mission was accomplished (McKenzie, 1991, p.1290).

The king, on the other hand, was a permanent charismatic officer, as signified by his anointing when the Spirit was conferred. Hence, at David's anointing the Spirit passed to him from Saul.

Once the idea was established that the spirit reposed permanently upon the king, there was less frequent mention of the spirit in the narratives about the king; and extraordinary actions in the manner of the judges were not attributed to the kings after Saul (ibid.).

The king became regarded as the guardian of the status quo, upholding the power structure (O'Murchu, 1989, p.52). Hengel believes charismatic following and discipleship were found more frequently where traditional order and its standards were repeatedly broken down or rejected outright, than in established Judaic and Greek institutions (1981, p.34).

In the New Testament, we observe that Jesus was charismatic in the sociological sense.

---

20 These leaders were called 'judges'. Saul and David were two examples.
22 1 Sam 11:6,13.
23 Judges 8:8).
24 1 Sam 10:10.
25 1 Sam 16:13.
He was exceptional and set apart; endowed with supernatural or superhuman qualities... He attracted and retained his followers not on the basis of traditional legitimacy or status, but by virtue of his innate qualities and the sense of the divine and numinous that emanated from him. Like a true sociological charismatic, Jesus was detached from the everyday concerns and responsibilities of human life. He forsook family and home, just as he taught his followers to do; he had nowhere to lay his head. He made no provision for the future, teaching his disciples not to worry about what they would eat or what they would wear. He undermined social conventions, especially cultic conventions. Though apparently cautious and reserved about his miraculous signs, he did not deny that they testified to his extraordinary source of authority. It is typical of the charismatic that he is opposed as vehemently as he is supported: to his opponents, Jesus had a devil and was guilty of blasphemy (Avis, 1992, p.71).

Yet, to the believer, Jesus was, of course, also charismatic in the theological sense which dominates the New Testament: He was clothed with the power of the Spirit. He was the Christ, the Anointed One (Avis, 1992, p.74; Suenens, 1992, p.1157). In moving from the sociological to the theological, we change from the purely phenomenological description of charisma to the theological evaluation of it. For Christians, Jesus really was endued with an altogether unique charisma and He was aware of this.

[He] thought of himself as God's son and as anointed by the eschatological Spirit, because in prayer he experienced God as Father and in ministry he experienced a power to heal which he could only understand as the power of the end-time and an inspiration to proclaim a message which he could only understand as the gospel of the end-time (Dunn, 1975, p.67 quoted in Avis, 1992, p.71).

In recounting the baptism of Jesus26, the synoptic writers recall how, when coming out of the water, Jesus 'saw the heavens torn apart and the Spirit descending like a dove on him' after which 'the Spirit immediately drove him out into the wilderness' (Mk.1:10-11). Once he left the desert, Jesus fulfilled his mission as a charismatic teacher standing outside any uniform tradition of Judaism. This caused Him to be described as a 'seducer' in contemporary Jewish circles. The

26 Mt.3:13-17; Mk.1:9-11; Lk.3:21-22.
Old Testament was no longer the central focus of His message and this distinguished him from both the prophets and the scribes of his day. Jesus' messianic charism was to look behind the Law of Moses towards the original will of God (Hengel, 1981, p.46, p.49 and p.70).

Paul, the former Pharisee and scribe and one of Jesus' greatest disciples, first introduced the actual term 'kharis' into theological literature and the tradition of the Church27 (Hengel, 1981, p.51). Considered as a Greek word, it was lifted from 'referring to an earthly benefit to referring to a heavenly one', from signifying the favour, grace and goodness of one person to another, to signifying the favour, grace and goodness of God to each human person28 (Hoerber, 1989, p.182). In his letters, Paul describes charisms as gifts of the Spirit - the Spirit of Christ29, the Spirit of God's Son30 and the Spirit that confesses the lordship of Jesus31 (Avis, 1992, p.73).

To one is given ... the utterance of wisdom, and to another the utterance of knowledge ... to another faith ... to another gifts of healing ... to another the working of miracles, to another prophecy, to another the discernment of spirits, to another various kinds of tongues, to another the interpretation of tongues. All these are activated by one and the same Spirit, who allots to each one individually just as the Spirit chooses (1 Cor. 12:8-11).

This list is not intended to be exhaustive and precise definitions are impossible (Murphy-O'Connor, 1990, p.810). Paul sees these gifts as differentiating believing individuals from each other for the sake of enhancing their mutual service (Koenig, 1978, p.14). Every Christian has been granted at least one of these gifts32 (1 Cor.7:7).

Each person is to realise the social character of his or her contribution and use it for the common good without

---

27 Avis describes Paul's charismatic status as ambiguous (1992, pp.72-73).
28 Kharis, for the first time in the New Testament, refers to 'the grace of the worthy to the unworthy, of the holy to the sinful' (Hoerber, 1989, p.182).
29 Rom.8:9.
30 Gal.4:6.
31 1 Cor.12:3.
envy or jealousy (Fitzmyer, 1990, p.863). Just as the human body needs different members (1 Cor. 12:14–20), so the church needs a diversity of spiritual gifts, with each one making a specific contribution (Murphy–O’Connor, 1990, p.810). Paul, however, sees some ministries as more important than others: 'And God has appointed in the church first apostles, second prophets, third teachers; then deeds of power, then gifts of healing, forms of assistance, forms of leadership, various kinds of tongues' (1 Cor. 12:28). While he distinguishes these spiritual gifts from the greater gifts of faith, hope and love, of which love is the greatest (1 Cor. 12:31; 1 Cor. 13), Paul still advises his listeners to 'strive for the spiritual gifts' and especially the gift of prophecy (1 Cor. 14:1). Prophets had an important role in the early Church. Prophets Judas and Silas 'said much to encourage and strengthen the believers' (Acts 15:32) and prophets generally were expected to interpret Christ's message to the world under the inspiration of the Spirit (Arbuckle, 1988, p.91).

In the early church there were people who sometimes spoke with 'tongues' or 'unintelligible sounds of ecstatic excitement' and were the subject of some controversy (Chadwick, 1990, p.29). Paul found this phenomenon could be deeply divisive and, in reaction, emphasised the routine aspects of the charismatic community. He saw charism leading not only to tongues and prophecy, but to order, edification, and service. Helpers and administrators are also listed among the charismatics (Avis, 1992, p.73). Yet charism retained its place in the region of mere 'enthusiasm' and strange ecstatic phenomena (Rahner et alii, 1968, p.283). In the fourth century, when Jerome was translating the Bible from the original Hebrew and Greek into Latin, he

33 In Ch. 14, Paul contrasts tongues with prophecy.
34 Some scholars claim that with the coming of Christ the prophetic focus shifted from the individual to the community. In this sense, Jesus becomes prophetic not so much in His individual but rather in His trinitarian identity. As a result, the reign of God depends on the prophetic community which Jesus sought to establish - a community which is marked by right and just relationships (O'Murchu, 1989, p.52).
35 cf. 1 Corinthians 14 (Harris, 1992, p.1436).
36 ἐκκόσμεις, oikodome and diakonia.
37 1 Cor.12:28.
38 c340–420.
39 Jerome's work on the Latin version of the Bible, called the Vulgate, was
used the word *dona* rather than *charismata* in all but one case (Wiggins, 1992, p.50). The one exception was in translating 1 Cor.12:31\(^40\) where the word's context conveys the impression that charisms have to do only with the miraculous or extraordinary. This association prevails throughout the Christian church until modern times and has been passed on, via Weber, into the sociology of charisma (Cada et al., 1985, pp.163-165).

We have already noticed Protestant theologian Rudolph Sohm for his influence on Weber. His exegesis of charism in the 19th century focused on the notions of task\(^41\) and calling\(^42\). Charism is a gift of grace which calls a person to an activity, a call which a person cannot choose to accept or reject: 'Such a calling does not liberate, it limits by setting tasks. Here is no apostleship in the morning, fishing in the afternoon: a calling sets forth a service for a lifetime' (Haley, 1980, pp.193-194). Beyond that, Sohm believed the Church was wholly spiritual and law wholly secular. Consequently he saw the development of canon law as an abandonment of the primitive ideal of the Church, which he considered to be a fundamentally 'charismatic' body (Livingstone, 1990, p.480). In contradistinction to that view, in 1943, Pope Pius XII, in *Mystici Corporis*, affirmed the validity of 'the charismatic elements in the Church as balancing the hierarchic elements'. The documents of the Second Vatican Council contain fourteen passages in which the word 'charisma' or 'charismatic', appears but little is said about the interplay of charismatic and institutional elements in the everyday life of the Church' (Cada et al., 1985, p.164). Pope John Paul II, however, is on record as warning that a 'charism cannot provoke rebellion or the rupture of unity' for if it does 'it is not authentic or not being used in the right way' (TAB, 1992f, p.878). In sociological terms, the authority the Church exemplifies is to some extent 'traditional' and traditional authority is currently on the defensive - as evidenced by the British monarchy. The trappings may remain, but 'the

carried out from c.383 to c.405 (North, 1990, p.722).
\(^40\) *[but] earnestly desire the higher gifts*.
\(^41\) Aufgabe.
\(^42\) Beruf.
justification of office has subtly changed its ground from status to role. Authority is acceptable when it is exercised competently.

For the believer, however, that is not the whole story. For him or her the Church today remains a Spirit-bearing body, a messianic community in which the risen Christ dwells in His Spirit. The originating charisma of the New Testament community has become routinised, 'trapped in the channels of the everyday, mundane structures of human sociality'. But the Church's structures, the channels of routinised charisma, only represent the outward life of the Church. Schleiermacher distinguishes this outer life from the inner life of the Church which is constant and unchanging - a life he describes in terms of the consciousness of God through the mediation of Christ (Avis, 1992, p.74). Schleiermacher believed religion to be based on intuition and feeling and independent of all dogma, with its highest experience occurring in a sensation of union with the infinite, a feeling of absolute dependence (Hinnells, 1984, p.287; Livingstone, 1990, p.462). This notion of Christian consciousness of the intimate presence of God enriches our understanding of charism and emphasises its theological sense (Avis, 1992, p.75).

Charism today is seen as signifying the call of God, addressed to an individual, to a particular ministry in the community, which brings with it the ability to fulfil that ministry (Kung, 1976 quoted in Boff, 1990, p.158). It is always subject to the laws of human psychology, a person's character, previous experience and theological knowledge. There are no purely divine experiences of grace; there are only "incarnate" spiritual experiences (Rahner, 1977, p.72). The distinctive charisma of Christianity involves self-emptying, self-sacrifice, suffering in solidarity with all victims of human hurt or natural affliction and doing the will of the Father. This, Christians believe, leads to justice,

43 'Role, but not status, is acceptable, provided that it is a role sanctioned by the prevailing canons of society - and that means the utilitarian criteria of productivity and efficiency' (Avis, 1992, p.59).
44 1768-1834. Schleiermacher was defending religion against the rationalism of the Enlightenment (Hinnells, 1984, p.287).
truth and love, but not without suffering. It was only when the disciples saw Jesus' wounds, that He finally breathed His Spirit on them \(^{45}\) (Avis, 1992, p.83).

2.4 - CHARISM IN THE THEOLOGY OF RELIGIOUS LIFE

We now turn to the different forms of charism relating to vowed religious life. Few contemporary Church leaders realised the importance of language \(^{46}\) more than Pope Paul VI who was painstaking, even scrupulous, in his selection of words. It was he who introduced the vocabulary: 'the charism of religious life' and 'the charisms of the founders [of religious communities] who were raised up by God within his Church' (Lyne, 1983, p.25; Buckley, 1985, pp.60–61). The Second Vatican Council had prepared the ground for this stage of theological development, but it was Paul VI who brought it into articulation and existence (Buckley, 1985, p.61).

Lyne (1983, p.18) describes three levels of meaning of the word 'charism' as it applies to religious life. First, it can apply in the general sense of an ideal type, existing in the church, the charism of the religious life. Second, it can refer to a particular religious family or congregation as it exists in its concrete historical reality, the charism of a congregation or an institutional charism. Third, it can refer to an experience of personal faith and the response given by an individual Christian – a personal charism. If this person is a founding person of a particular religious congregation, then his or her charism may be described as a founding person's charism.

Paul VI describes the charism of the religious life as 'far from being an impulse born of flesh and blood or one derived from a mentality which conforms itself to the modern

\(^{45}\) John 20:20-22.

\(^{46}\) Contemporary philosophy and modern hermeneutics have insisted that 'words have an effect like architecture'. 'With architecture you build the buildings, and then the building you live in builds you. Similarly with language, you introduce terms into a discussion, and the language you admit either expands your perception of the issues or it hopelessly limits it' (Buckley, 1985, p.60).
world', but rather the fruit of the Holy Spirit (1971, p.12). It is 'the Spirit alone who takes the initiative in the experience that leads a Christian to choose this type of life ... such an experience lies beyond the rational'. While over the centuries religious life 'has embodied a definable essence - common life, according to a rule, under a superior, and, in the case of apostolic religious, a corporate apostolate' (Duggan, 1992, p.1128), it does not belong to the hierarchical structure of the Church.47, but springs directly from a Christian and gospel based life lived in the world (Azevedo, 1988, pp.136-137). Nor is it an intermediate lifestyle between the clerical and lay states (PC, 1965, Art.43). It has its own essence. Being under charismatic authority, religious life is inherently unstable, unlike traditional and bureaucratic authority structures which enjoy permanence (Avis, 1992, p.67).48 Men and women who choose to join the religious life publicly consecrate their lives to God binding themselves to live the vows of poverty, celibacy and obedience49. These three evangelical counsels, which are based on the words and example of Jesus Christ, become the law of existence for members of religious congregations (PC, 1965, Art.43; Paul VI, 1971, p.9). Prayer is central to the charism of the religious life. Paul VI insists that if religious are humbly attentive to the needs of people and things, the Spirit of Jesus will enlighten them and enrich them with His wisdom provided they are imbued with the spirit of prayer (ET 1971, para. 44). Religious orders are founded for the purpose of ministry and not for the sake of the members. 'If the ministry is still serving a genuine need, or is still a relevant proclamation of the word of Jesus, then people will join through a natural process. If they do not, it says something about the relevance of the ministry' (Collins, 1991, p.62).

O'Murchu describes religious life as a form of liminality which both 'clarifies the structure of society and can be

47 This is documented in Lumen Gentium. Many members of religious congregations are of course also priests, and as such part of the hierarchy.
48 Today there are 930,000 (93%) women religious and 67,000 (7%) lay men religious in the Catholic Church (Beaulieu et al., 1991, p.9).
49 Today the term 'celibacy' is preferred to the term 'chastity' for this vow because of the relevance of chastity to all married and single life (Bell, 1992, p.1047).
instrumental in changing it'. When society creates its own liminal groups, often unconsciously, it projects onto them its 'deepest hopes, dreams and aspirations' and requests the liminal group 'to embody and articulate, for society at large, the deepest values this society holds dear and sacred' (1989, pp.37-38). Those who founded religious congregations were normally 'breathtakingly radical' and consequently their followers today tend also to breathe a radical spirit and minister in a prophetic way (TAB, 1990, p.1183). The Edict of Constantine was, for the ascetics, a sign that Christianity had given into the world. Ascetics of the time saw the Church beginning to be absorbed by the State which, O'Murchu believes, caused religious life to spring up as a protest movement seeking to articulate and promote 'pure' Christianity (1989, p.20). This protest element has remained an integral part of the religious life experience in all its different cultural expressions (O'Murchu, 1989, p.20). To break new ground is part of the charism of religious life (O'Mahoney, 1990, p.4).

Arbuckle claims it is possible to refound religious congregations. He defines refounding as 'the process whereby a religious community struggles to relate the Gospel message to the most persistent and urgent needs of the times'. This process assumes a congregation has 'a clear and accurate vision of itself and its mission' and 'creative individuals who are willing and able to draw others to live the vision in concrete and relevant ways' (1991c, p.702). The charism of a refounding person is an extraordinary gift of the Spirit (1988, p.89). Such a gift can be accepted or refused both by the individual congregation and the refounding people within those congregations. Arbuckle sees a refounding person as one who 'acutely sees the contemporary chasm between the Gospel and secularizing cultures' as did the founder or foundress of the particular congregation, one who tries to bridge this chasm while at the same time, summoning others to do likewise (ibid.). This refounding person is a prophet 'because he or she has the same ability as the founding figure, shares the same vision.

50 313 AD.
and is driven by the same burning desire to preach the Gospel of the Lord' (ibid., p.91). Reading the signs of the times, however, is a prophetic challenge requiring a critical evaluation of what is oppressive, manipulative, consumerist and unjust. The prophet must then 'enable, empower and energise people to rise above their human and spiritual plight' acting as 'the catalyst who continually questions the underlying assumptions, the strategic values of the status quo and proposes (dreams) new and better ways of serving people'. Such a visionary task involves sensitivity and imagination rather than rational linear thought (O'Murchu, 1989, p.52). McDonough warns that charisms cannot 'be humanly built by "refounding" or personally manufactured by "reweaving"51. They are gifts received, embraced, and lived - with receptive and responsive elements indispensable to their basic reality - or they are not true charisms at all' (1991, p.185).

Leddy, in an incisive and challenging critique of present trends in religious life, claims most religious congregations have adopted a liberal vision of religious life since the Second Vatican Council. This has often resulted in the following outcomes:

1) Vision statements which are sufficiently general to include all the various interests in a congregation (1989, p.41). These 'global, carefully crafted, blandly diluted statements' can hardly be opposed in theory and scarcely assessed in implementation (McDonough, 1991, p.176). Rarely, Leddy contends, do they 'compel passionate generosity and energetic self-sacrifice' (1989, p.44).

2) Difficulty in making choices for long term planning because there is no deeply shared vision (ibid., p.45).

3) Emphasis on the personal growth of individual members. Community is then seen in terms of the needs of the members, work as an individual project and spirituality as a private concern (ibid.).

4) The virtual impossibility of sustaining corporate commitments (ibid.).

Leddy believes liberal communities are currently being held

together by an agreement, stated or unstated, to do the minimum together (ibid., pp.46-47).

In most women's institutes, general chapters have now abandoned legislation in favor of direction-setting ... lower-level superiors are now either nonexistent or nonfunctional, while major superiors have abandoned government in favor of business management and have surrounded themselves with middle-level, appointed, administrative personnel whose numbers have steadily increased ... in bureaucratic disproportion to the continuing decrease in membership (McDonough, 19991, p.172).

O'Murchu (1989, p.55) sees a prophetic vision as a congregation's greatest gift, a 'powerhouse of energy and vitality' which is frequently articulated through prophetic people inside or outside the congregation, men and women who allow the Word of God 'to become so much of themselves' that 'they speak the message and values of Jesus' (Slattery, 1991, p.3). A congregation is fortunate when it can welcome a new orientation, accommodate it in appropriate structures and allow it to call forth its members - often along unwanted paths (O'Murchu, 1989, p.55).

When congregational members work together under the inspiration and motivation of a shared vision, leadership is a quality that they all begin to exercise. 'The vision of what the community is capable of and desirous of striving for draws on and focuses the collective energy and talent of the members of the community' (Starratt, 1990, p.102). Yet a common social vision cannot be imposed. Such a vision, which is 'more than the sum of the private dreams of the individuals who call themselves a community' arises through the creative, rather than the coercive, use of power52 (Leddy, 1989, p.43 and p.49). It comes from 'the deepest level of our lives, from the level where our communion with God coincides with our community with others' (ibid., 1991, p.98).

---

52 'The coercive use of power is a characteristic pattern of an empire in the state of decline' (Leddy, 1989, p.43).
O'Murchu sees the paradigm for the emerging era of religious life as based on the rediscovery of the theology of the Reign of God - 'inaugurated in our world by Jesus, a lifestyle marked by right relationships of justice, love and peace'. In this paradigm the church exists in both the Kingdom and the world, and religious life exists at the points of intersection where the Reign of God and world meet.

We Religious are intended to be Kingdom-spotters; our vocation is to be Kingdom people. We belong to both church and world, to the here and hereafter; and yet, we are invited to transcend all these ... categories as we respond to the supreme prophetic task of advaita: the recreation of life in the depth and unity of the One who holds all things in being (1989, pp.ii-iii).

***************

The juxtaposition in Chapters 1 and 2 of certain sociological and theological literatures has been fruitful enough to suggest they might learn much from each other. Further development of that point must be for others, however. The purpose of this thesis is to identify components of the vision of the Marist Brothers' Congregation - a Congregation of educators who seek to promote the Reign of God. In Chapter 1 we identified sociological concepts and perspectives useful to our task. The burden of this chapter is that in clarifying their vision, Marist Brothers need to take into account the current transition period of the religious life social movement, the present position of the Congregation in its own life cycle and current understandings of the theology of charism. But it is a central part of the specific religious charism of Marists that they are educators - so their religious vision must be at the same time an educational vision. In the next chapter we turn to some social movements whose members are directly involved in schools to see the ways they develop and live their educational visions.
CHAPTER 3 - SOCIAL MOVEMENTS AND EDUCATION

What has Athens to do with Jerusalem? Tertullian

Social movements influencing education come from two sources. First, there are those which originate within the educational community such as the school improvement and the effective schools movements and, second, those which take root beyond the educational community, such as the trade union movement, feminism and liberationism but which develop specific educational dimensions. This chapter considers social movements from both these sources, distinguishes between social movements which are charismatic and those which are not and then analyses two charismatic social movements in more detail: The United World Colleges and the Society of Jesus.

3.1 - SOCIAL MOVEMENTS ORIGINATING WITHIN THE EDUCATIONAL COMMUNITY

Over the last decade, few areas of research and practice have grown more rapidly than those of school effectiveness and school improvement (Creemers and Reynolds, 1990, p.1). Much of this research is now finding its way into educational policy (Hargreaves and Hopkins, 1991, p.109). Growth in these linked fields, the 'what' of school effectiveness and the 'how' of school improvement, has been fuelled by the central place quality in education assumes in most developed and many developing societies today (ibid.; Creemers and Reynolds, 1990, p.1).

Even though the concept of school effectiveness is 'central to much educational discourse about the management of schools and school systems', there still exists no 'uniformly accepted definition'. This 'highly value-laden term' is one which exhibits 'all the characteristic features associated with what W. B. Gallie called "essentially contested concepts"' (Chapman, 1991, p.3). Creemers and Reynolds

1 Quoted in Panikkar, 1992, p.1192.
contend that since it is 'through a proper consideration of practical issues that educational research is most likely to make major theoretical advances in the next few decades', there is no group of persons who are more practical and better qualified to make rapid intellectual progress than 'those in the fields of school effectiveness and school improvement' (1990, p.3).

THE SCHOOL IMPROVEMENT MOVEMENT In 1941, Paul Mort published his American School in Transition, often cited as the 'first systematic study of educational change and the first entry in the American canon of literature on school improvement'. Mort's framework for school improvement has taken root. It emphasises 'diffusion and dissemination as appropriate strategies for school change' and is the earliest exemplar of what House (1979) calls the technological perspective on educational innovation (Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.3). This perspective, which adopts a rational and systematic approach, separates innovation into functions and components, assuming the best strategy for improving educational practice is 'to develop products, which can then be diffused to and adopted by schools' (House, 1979, p.2; Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.3).

The research on school improvement produced from the 'technological perspective' is voluminous, ranging from studies of the fidelity of adoption of curriculum materials and technologies, to analyses of the role of change agents in school improvement projects, and on to testing hypotheses about the nature of school organizational structure and leadership behaviors (Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.3).

The addition of government funds brought a political perspective into school improvement with innovation problems being interpreted as 'primarily political'. Conflicts and compromises occurred among factional groups, such as 'developers, teachers, administrators, parents' and 'governments' (ibid., House, 1979, p.4). The technological approach dominated research into school improvement until the early 1970s when trade-offs, district politics and lack of commitment by leaders to particular improvement projects
came to be studied extensively (Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.3).

Yet, as early as the 1940s, an alternative approach to the study of school improvement was available. Works, such as Miel's (1946) Changing The Curriculum: A Social Process and Sharp and Caswell's (1950) Curriculum Improvement in Public Schools, looked more at process than product when studying curriculum. Such an approach, which 'depended on human insights more than technological expertise', that stressed 'hypothesis-building' rather than 'hypotheses-testing' and which preferred 'gradual adaptation' to 'speedy adoption', found little favour at first. But by the 1970s it had captured the interest of a significant segment of the research community. Benefiting from House's (1979) cultural perspective on innovation, a group of researchers questioned the 'culture of the school' and its relation to the 'process of change'.

Rather than focusing on products and how they are adopted in schools, these researchers looked more at the social/organizational context of institutional change. They focused their attention on how the meanings and understandings that participants attach to a specific setting and to changes in that setting influence, shape, and often determine the effectiveness of the change effort (Miller and Lieberman, 1988, pp.3-4).

This culturist perspective of school improvement, like the technological one, required 'a particular research perspective and an inventory of appropriate measures for collecting and analyzing data'. It found its 'contemporary voice' through Sarason's (1971) The Culture of the School and the Problem of Change. Writing more as 'a reflective social scientist than as a rigorous empiricist', Sarason, by portraying 'the school as a set of structured interacting roles in a tradition-dominated social setting', set the course for qualitative research (ibid.; House, 1979, p.7). He provided a new vocabulary for the study of school change and a workable image of the school as a unique social setting. For Sarason and the 'culturists', attitude surveys, rating scales, pre- and post-tests no longer provided the
knowledge base needed to understand school improvement (Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.4).

Today school improvement studies are embodying 'the long-term goal' of moving towards the vision of the 'problem solving' or 'thinking' school and focusing on what is widely known as 'school structuring' (Hargreaves and Hopkins, 1991, p.117; Murphy, 1992, p.12). The OECD's International School Improvement Project defines school improvement as 'a systematic, sustained effort aimed at change in learning conditions and other related internal conditions in one or more schools, with the ultimate aim of accomplishing educational goals more effectively' (Van Velzen et al., 1985, quoted in Hargreaves and Hopkins, 1991, p.117).

THE EFFECTIVE SCHOOLS MOVEMENT This movement differs from that of school improvement by emanating from a broader domain than one author, one research tradition, or one continent (Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.10). It was launched as a reaction to Coleman's (1966) investigation into equality in education, a study which became famous for its negative conclusions on the influence of school on educational achievement. Coleman and his colleagues found that 'schools accounted for approximately 10% of the variance in pupil achievement, after statistical adjustments had been made for the influence of background characteristics of pupils' (Scheerens, 1990, p.64). They demonstrated that 'home environment variables were the most important in explaining the variance in achievement levels for all racial and regional groups, and school facilities and curriculum were the least important variables' (Coleman et al., quoted in Beare et al., 1989, p.2). Publication of Coleman's report in the USA crystallised disbelief in the effectiveness of schools (Beare et al., 1989, p.2). Other large-scale studies (Jencks et al., 1972, 1979; Thorndike, 1973; Hauser, Sewell & Alwin, 1976) replicated Coleman's findings in their 'pessimistic conclusions on the importance of schooling as such and its possibilities for lowering educational inequality' (Scheerens, 1990, p.65).

Towards the end of the 1970s, voices of dissent began
to declare that 'schools do matter and that the processes at work in them have an important bearing on students' achievement' (Flynn, 1985, p.269). Influential in this regard were Rutter and his colleagues (1979) who carried out the first major school effectiveness study in the UK when they compared the effectiveness of ten secondary schools in Inner London on a range of student outcome measures. Effective schools, as described by their Fifteen Thousand Hours, were characterized by factors 'as varied as the degree of academic emphasis, teacher actions in lessons, the availability of incentives and rewards, good conditions for pupils, and the extent to which children are able to take responsibility' - factors they saw constituting the school's 'ethos' (Rutter et al., 1979, p.178; Hargreaves and Hopkins, 1991, p.109). Early in the 1980s, the next wave of school effectiveness research was pioneered by works more directly refuting the message of the Coleman report, such as Schools can make a difference (Brookover et al., 1979) and School Matters (Mortimore et al., 1988)². Important to this research has been the opening of 'the black box' of what happens within schools, thereby revealing school variables such as 'school organization, school culture and educational technology' (Gifford, 1990, p.23). The effective schools movement now explicitly rejects the assumptions of previous decades that schools do not make a difference in the achievement of students - especially of the urban poor (Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.10). Its research supports 'certain internal conditions are typical in schools that achieve higher levels of outcomes for their students' (Hargreaves and Hopkins, 1991, p.109). The Mortimore study showed that teaching is an important dimension of school effectiveness. Other researchers went further saying teaching is the 'major contributor' to school effectiveness, claiming 'the more structured and reflective the approach to teaching, the more likely it is that students' academic performance will improve' (ibid., p.116).

Today, no contemporary research rivals the effective schools studies in its impact on schools and school systems.

² This work was published at the time when the Education Reform Bill left the House of Commons and the initial controversy about testing at age seven was at its highest (Gifford, 1990, p.23).
(Miller and Lieberman, 1988, pp.9-10). Its single most important contribution has been to help 'push the dominant behavioral psychological model of learning off center stage in schools throughout the world' (Murphy, 1992, p.8). It sets the tone for, and contributes essential principles to, school improvement by, for example, shifting 'the focus of efforts to deal with poor academic performance among low income minorities from the child to the school' (Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.10; Murphy, 1992, p.3; Cuban, 1989, p.784). It aims to discover school characteristics which are 'positively associated with school output, usually measured as students' achievement' (Scheerens, 1990, p.64). There are, of course, differences within it. In certain countries the movement has become criticised for its identification with a 'back to basics' orientation, though most people in school effectiveness want the academic skills to merely provide the base on which to erect other skills. Unresolved tensions also occur between those who believe effective schools should help disadvantaged populations in particular, and those who see the drive for effectiveness as something extending across all social categories. Meanwhile, the task of defining 'effectiveness' waits 'lurking in the wings to cause dissent and disagreement' (Creemers and Reynolds, 1990, p.2). Dewey's observation seems apposite: that 'all social movements involve conflicts which are reflected intellectually in controversies. It would not be a sign of health if such an important social interest as education were not also an arena of struggles, practical and theoretical' (1963, p.5).

3.2 - SOCIAL MOVEMENTS ORIGINATING BEYOND THE EDUCATIONAL COMMUNITY

Some scholars claim the only way education can change deeply and truly is through the effects of social movements external to education (House, 1979, p.1). For example, when democracy was developed through the influence of social movements, intellectuals and educators were able to implement democratic reforms in education, partly by appealing to these movements (Carnoy, 1983, pp.401-402). Carnoy and Levin believe schools and teachers are necessarily caught up in
these larger movements because the school is 'both a product and a shaper of social discord' (1985, p.4). Analysing social movements requires locating them within the wider historical context since their 'membership, mobilization and strength tend to be cyclical' and they 'mobilise people in response to (mostly against, less for) circumstances which are themselves cyclical' (Frank and Fuentes quoted in Sultana, 1991, p.138). In applying this cyclicality to education, Carnoy and Levin illustrate by observing that:

in historical periods when social movements are weak and business ideology strong, schools tend to strengthen their function of reproducing workers for capitalist workplace relations and the unequal division of labour. When social movements arise to challenge these relations, schools move in the other direction to equalize opportunity and expand human rights (1985, p.41 quoted in Sultana, 1991, p.138).

In this perspective, social movements feed on external processes of agenda-setting, which they reinforce but cannot control (Joppke, 1991, p.46).

Social movements currently influencing schools from outside education include trade unionism, the ethnic rights movement, feminism, liberationism, the New Right and the peace movement (Sultana, 1991, pp.138-139). In researching liberationism in schools, Sultana observes that religious movements are subject, not only to reactionary agendas and inspirations, 'but also to progressive and even radical ones'. One Brothers' school he describes, had an overtly progressive, even radical manifesto which represented its special character. Its educational vision included defusing competition, respecting differences, fostering cultural groups, finding work for unemployed, providing experiences of success for all, educating to change society and not merely to fit into it, highlighting social injustices such as racism, providing media education and teaching change-agent skills. The Brothers in this religious congregation believed they should be working with the powerless and had chosen social justice as the guiding theme for their work in schools (1991, p.146).
Some reforming social movements are described in the literature as charismatic (Tucker, 1968, p.743). While non-charismatic movements are considered to be 'dedicated to the improvement of conditions underlying the dissatisfactions normally experienced by many people', charismatic movements arise when 'prevailing widespread dissatisfaction deepens' to the point of becoming genuine 'distress' - when people are 'in crisis'. Charismatic leaders then help define the crisis and create a way out (ibid.; House, 1988, p.118). They become 'assimilated to the dominant myths of the culture; perform heroic or extraordinary feats; project remarkable or uncanny personal qualities; and command outstanding rhetorical ability' (Willner, 1984 quoted in House, 1988, p.120). Kolvenbach observes: 'Every type of human misery has brought a religious Family to birth within the Church, in answer to that need' (1990, p.144). These Families are often religious congregations whose founding people provide charismatic leadership.

Whether originating from within or without education, social movements influence schools through their internal organisations. Movement issues are discussed by school policy-makers, such as Boards of Governors and school administrators, by the staff as a whole during staff meetings and general discussions about the school, by subject teachers during meetings with heads of the respective subject departments and by individual teachers in the classroom. Social movement members often assist those interested in the transformative potential of education, by organising data, emphasising key themes and explaining the relevance of these themes in the local context (ibid., pp.138-139).

PREFACE TO 3.3 AND 3.4

We now examine two charismatic social movements in more detail and see how these movements currently understand themselves. The first, the United World Colleges,

---

3 The central message of the Christian Gospel is to respond to the pain and suffering of others (Howard, 1992, Lect. p.9).
originates primarily within education though bringing to its task a broader vision than just education. The second, the Society of Jesus, originates beyond the educational community, chooses schools as one of its works and contributes a vision of life to its work. The United World Colleges Organisation is a relatively new school movement with a clear educational vision and no formal religious orientation. Its international headquarters are based in London. The Jesuits belong to the Catholic tradition, are a long established religious congregation, have been suppressed and refounded. They continually clarify and document their educational vision.

I obtained data on the United World Colleges by studying some generally available texts and journals – often written by ‘the committed’ – as well as more official documents I received from the international headquarters in London, including public relations brochures for the constituent Colleges, articles written to celebrate the silver jubilee of the movement and tributes paid to the movement’s founder, Kurt Hahn. I interviewed the United World Colleges International Director, Mr. Richard Taylor and the Director General, Mr. Jeremy Varcoe. Consequently, I view this movement primarily through the eyes of its International Office.

Data on the Jesuit Order originated first from interviews I conducted when I visited the Jesuit Secondary Education Association headquarters in Washington DC, attracted by its reputation as an innovative centre supporting American Jesuit schools and fostering the study of Jesuit education. I interviewed the Association’s President, Fr. Charles Costello and received key documents on Jesuit education produced by the Centre over the past twenty years. On the recommendation of Charles Costello, I visited Georgetown Preparatory School, Rockville, founded in 1789 and the oldest Catholic school in the United States, where I interviewed the school’s president, Fr. Tom Roach.

4 The same could be said of the Marist Brothers.
5 These tributes were normally written by people who knew Kurt Hahn.
and observed some of the life of the school. During my three days in Washington, I stayed with the Jesuit community at one of the city's inner city schools, Gonzaga High and engaged there in many lively debates about Jesuit education (1992, Doc. GPS, p.2). General writings about the Jesuits worldwide provided another source of data, texts and journal articles generally written by members of the Order6. The study, however, focuses primarily on how the American Jesuits associated with the Jesuit Secondary Education Association currently understand their educational vision.

I have not deliberately sought out critical literature in these studies, partly for lack of time, but primarily because my research intention was to see how the movements understood themselves. Nevertheless, I have tried to view them with some detachment using the educational, sociological and theological perspectives already introduced in this thesis. These two mini-studies provided me with an opportunity to try out a conceptual frame based on the previous chapters and some methodological experience and insight for the main study. It is also hoped that their inclusion here gives some extra width to the thesis as a whole.

3.3 - THE UNITED WORLD COLLEGES SOCIAL MOVEMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>EVENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td>KURT HAHN BECOMES HEADMASTER OF SALEM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1933</td>
<td>HE IS ARRESTED AND EXILED TO BRITAIN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1934</td>
<td>HE BECOMES HEADMASTER OF GORDONSTOUN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1953</td>
<td>HE CONCLUDES HIS TERM AT GORDONSTOUN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1958</td>
<td>DESMOND HOARE APPOINTED PRINCIPAL OF ATLANTIC COLLEGE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1962</td>
<td>ATLANTIC COLLEGE OPENS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968</td>
<td>LORD MOUNTBATTEN BECOMES UNITED WORLD COLLEGES' PRESIDENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972</td>
<td>UNITED WORLD COLLEGE OF SOUTH EAST ASIA OPENS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1974</td>
<td>KURT HAHN DIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1974</td>
<td>LESTER PEARSON COLLEGE OF THE PACIFIC OPENS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978</td>
<td>THE PRINCE OF WALES BECOMES UNITED WORLD COLLEGES' PRESIDENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>WATERFORD KAHHLABA COLLEGE OF SOUTHERN AFRICA BECOMES A UNITED WORLD COLLEGE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6 Other data were obtained when I attended the Anniversary Mass, held at Westminster Cathedral, celebrating the 500th anniversary of the birth of the Society's founder, Ignatius Loyola and the 450th anniversary of the founding of the Society. I also viewed a number of television programmes about the Jesuits which were shown on the BBC during the research period.
THE FOUNDER AND FOUNDING EXPERIENCE  The United World Colleges Organisation results from the vision of its charismatic leader, Kurt Hahn (1886-1974), who strove for greater international understanding and co-operation and believed that an international education body could help reduce national and racial prejudices and therefore the causes of war. The Organisation believes that Hahn was led to found the United World Colleges Movement by an experience he had in 1932 while headmaster of Salem - a school he had founded in Germany, modelled on the British Public School where he brought together children of former enemies, Germany and Great Britain (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.). After Hitler’s telegram glorifying the murderers of Potempa who had trampled a young Communist to death in front of his mother, Hahn wrote to all former pupils informing them that if they were members of the SA or the SS, they must either break with Hitler or break with Salem. This led to his arrest and only the intervention of the British Prime Minister, Ramsay Macdonald, gave him exile to Britain (Peterson, 1987, p.2, Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).

THE FOUNDING VISION  Once in Britain, Hahn founded Gordonstoun School in Scotland, the school attended by the Duke of Edinburgh and later the Prince of Wales where he was Headmaster from 1934 to 1953. He was also instrumental in establishing the Outward Bound Movement and the National Lifesaving Association (Peterson, 1987, p.2; Upshall, 1990, p.219; Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.). Hahn felt the need for some force to work positively and energetically for international understanding and co-operation after two world wars, the horrors of Hiroshima and Nagasaki, the growing threat of the 'Cold War', the ongoing tensions of East and West and the countless widespread military and political conflicts.

7 Hahn was German, of Jewish origin and later became a naturalised Englishman (Peterson, 1987, p.1).
throughout the world (INS, 1987-1988, p.10). He was shocked by the catchwords 'Ohne mich'\(^8\) and 'I couldn’t care less' and wanted to see this attitude remedied through education by first, the common involvement of young people of different nations and cultures in active, skilful, challenging service to others - particularly the saving of life; second, in academic work that challenged a person’s memory and imagination; third, in teamwork which involved exercising and accepting leadership and fourth, in each person pursuing his or her 'grand passion' - whether it be 'playing the cello, building boats, entomology, or Renaissance architecture' (Peterson, 1987, p.2)\(^9\). He was convinced that 'if you believe in something, you must not just think or talk or write, but, must act'. Hahn also saw the importance of natural beauty for his kind of soul-building. His graduates would always remember, and be affected by, their school-days if they were spent in a physically and spiritually healthy environment, with, if possible, the addition of historical associations (ibid., p.6). The UWC International Development Director from 1982 to 1992, Richard Taylor, sees a development in Kurt Hahn’s thinking during the course of his life:

He starts off founding a public school in Germany ... then comes to the UK as a refugee ... founds another school ... then founds a number of organisations - Outward Bound Trust, the National Lifesaving Association etc. and then ... [combines them all:] adventurous activity ... schooling ... internationalism ... [and] the refugee element ... [and founds] Atlantic College (1992, Int. LON.).

THE FIRST FOUNDATION: ATLANTIC COLLEGE  Hahn, it is said, had a genius for translating his vision, and inspiring others to translate their visions into action\(^{10}\) (Peterson, 1987, p.3). Impressed by the success of Lawrance Darvall, a top ranking Air Force serviceman and a friend, at welding together former enemies - Germans, French, Belgians, Austrians, Americans and British - in a NATO Staff Training College in

---

\(^8\) Without me.

\(^9\) Kurt Hahn believed everybody has an ability to do one thing particularly well (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).

\(^{10}\) Kurt Hahn was an aphorist. His sayings, such as 'life-saving is the moral equivalent of war' provide a clear encapsulation of his philosophy (INS, 1988-1989, p.10, Taylor; 1992, Int. LON.).
Paris, he decided to embody his hopes in an international school (Peterson, 1987, p.3; Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.). He and Darvall, in the late 1950s, gathered around them an influential group of people drawn from industry, banking, politics and education who were determined to translate Hahn's vision into reality. This promotion committee had three tasks: 'to find a site, to find the money to buy the site and develop it as a college, and to find a principal' (Peterson, 1987, p.3). Thus while entrusting much of the bureaucratic work to his Gemeinde, Hahn had ensured, by his choice of associates, that his founding charisma would be firmly embodied in the emerging bureaucratic structures.

In 1958, Desmond Hoare, an Irish Admiral with, we're told, a 'tremendously keen interest in young people' and a lover of the sea, yet a newcomer to school principalship, was asked to join the group as the foundation principal of a new college (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.). He had been chosen, it might be said, by 'charismatically qualified administrative staff' - Weber's fourth method of appointing successors to a charismatic leader. In September 1962, Atlantic College was opened at St. Donat's Castle, South Glamorgan, Wales and a new social movement was born - with Kurt Hahn its then 76 year old 'founder and spiritual father' (Sutcliffe, 1984, Doc. UWC, p.2). The Movement understands Kurt Hahn particularly through his association with Atlantic College. In establishing this College, Hahn preferred to call himself the movement's 'midwife', rather than the 'founder', thereby acknowledging the two other key people in the founding of the movement: Desmond Hoare and Lawrance Darvall. Taylor contends that Hahn was 'the inspirer ... the motivator ... the philosopher ... the guru ... the educationalist' (1992, Int. LON.). On the other hand, for all Hahn's sense of humour, burning commitment to the project, readiness to listen to experts and engineer's sense of the practical, and for all

---

11 Desmond Hoare used to say: 'the sea was the finest educator that there is ... if you put young people together in a boat in a ... gale in the Bristol Channel ... they will learn a lot about each other' (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).

12 Richard Taylor points out that the UWC Movement, which is 'basically promoting peace', was founded by a refugee assisted by two servicemen (1992, Int. LON.).
that he immediately endeared himself to the staff, the first group of multinational students who came to the College and potential responders to the appeal for funds, it was Desmond Hoare who 'against all odds ... set up Atlantic College and got it on its feet.' (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).

Today, 360 students from 60 countries live and work in Atlantic College's historic castle estate. The school's academic standards are claimed to be high. Students are selected on merit and are virtually all scholarship holders. Although the College inevitably incorporated some of the English public school traditions, Hahn's intention was to have a less rigid structure, a closer and more genuine relationship between staff and students on a more equal basis (Varcoe, 1992, Int. LON.). Mr. Jeremy Varcoe, the UWC Director General, explains:

I think he [Hoare] treated children more like adults, or young adults anyway, as he'd been used to treating students at a staff College ... [so that now] although our Colleges inevitably have to reflect, to some extent, the social mores and norms and law indeed of the societies in which they're placed ... compared to your English public school ... there is none of the concept of class structure by age ... so I ... feel a better comparison today would be to go to a State sixth form college. I think you'd find it was almost as relaxed as the atmosphere is in a UWC College ... the students and staff look identical in the sense they're all wearing jeans and trainers, they're on first name terms and the students are responsible for most of their own discipline. There is an annual meeting at which guidelines, as they're called, rather than rules, are agreed ... on the whole the degree of control and regulation of students is ... laid back, ... [it's] very much for the students to make their own running (Varcoe, 1992, Int. LON.)

13 Desmond Hoare was assisted by a number of old people with very young ideas. Richard Taylor observes: 'that's fairly typical of UWC in the early years ... [being assisted by] rather elderly people, very often with an experience of conflict. And now that's changing as our ex-students become more involved in the organisation ... it was very "top down", it's now becoming more "bottom up" and that's going to have a tremendous impact on the organisation' (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).

14 Jeremy is the senior paid executive of the movement. He answers to the International and Executive Boards (1992, Int. LON.).

15 Jeremy Varcoe sees the United World College in Singapore as having more structured discipline than the Colleges in Canada, Wales or America (1992, Int. LON.).
Hahn believed 'that only through challenge, only through being stretched physically and intellectually will you discover yourself ... and the needs of others' (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.). Since team games would lead to national groupings, they are replaced at Atlantic College by sea and cliff rescue services, beach patrols, camping and mountain walking, and some individual sports (Peterson, 1987, p.9). Situated on the coast, the school has a good setting for rescue work and students maintain the official Lifeboat and Coastguard Stations for a twelve mile stretch of the coast on behalf of the RNLI. For Hahn, lifesaving was important for character development16. Richard Taylor adds:

if you get into difficulties in that part of the Bristol Channel you won't be plucked out of the water by a British lifeboat but you'll have a Zimbabwean and a Chinese and a Swede and an Ecuadorian pick you out ... it's all part of the Hahn philosophy that you work together in small groups ... in humanitarian service (1992, Int. LON.).

The College's educational programme was originally drafted by Alec Peterson17 and later essentially adopted by the International Baccalaureate, of which Peterson became the first Director General in 196718 (INS, 1988-1989, p.13). Atlantic College19 became the first school, along with the International school of Geneva, to teach the International Baccalaureate (Taylor, 12992, Int. LON.; Taylor, 1992, Corr.). Today, the Baccalaureate20 still benefits from the vision of Kurt Hahn with its social service requirements and its emphasis on each student developing his or her 'grand

---

16 In his lectures, Kurt Hahn used to stress 'everybody should have a training in life-saving' (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).
17 Alec Peterson was Chairman of Atlantic College's Education Committee, Chairman of the UWC's International Board from 1978-1980 and Vice-President of the UWC from 1980 until his death in 1988 (INS, 1988-1989, p.13).
18 This Office provided the growing number of international schools with 'a common, internationally oriented course of study' that would enable students 'to live and learn together, rather than in national groups' (Charles, 1987, p.vii).
19 Atlantic College became coeducational in 1968 (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).
20 Today the Baccalaureate is taught in 500 schools in 54 countries (INS, 1988-1989, p.13). Its programme is designed 'to provide students with a balanced education'. The curriculum consists of six subject groups: Language A, Language B, Study of Man in Society, Experimental Sciences, Mathematics and an option from (a) Art/Design, Music, Latin, Classical Greek, Computing Studies or (b) a school-based Syllabus approved by the IBO (TIB, 1990, Doc. UWC).
As the social service dimension of Kurt Hahn’s philosophy is difficult to achieve through the medium of examination regulations, the Baccalaureate ensures that all schools entering Diploma candidates can guarantee that their students have the equivalent of one half-day a week free for engagement in a creative, aesthetic or active social service activity (Peterson, 1987, pp.45-46).

THE MOVEMENT EXPANDS Soon after Atlantic College began, steps were taken to set up further Colleges on the Atlantic College model in other countries. Two countries were of particular interest, Germany and Canada, both having shown strong support for Atlantic College's philosophy by sending students to the College. Canada came first. Representatives were welcomed by the Prime Minister, Lester Pearson - himself an advocate of international co-operation. One sentence from the speech he gave when accepting the Nobel Peace Prize has almost become a movement motto: 'How can there be peace without people understanding each other, and how can this be if they don't know each other?' (Peterson, 1987, p.99). Today, Lester Pearson College of the Pacific, located on the shores of Pedder Bay on Vancouver Island and opened in 1974, has been designated 'the national memorial to the former Canadian Prime Minister and Nobel Peace Prize winner, whose name it proudly bears'. The students and teachers at the College provide services to nearby communities including sea search and rescue, mountain search and rescue as well as assistance to the elderly, handicapped and under-privileged (INS, 1988-1989, p.10).

Kurt Hahn and his followers believed a new College should also be established in Germany. This choice, Peterson contends, was due to three factors: first, the College could be a means for promoting reconciliation and peace; second,
people in Germany were showing enthusiastic support for Atlantic College through donations and scholarships and third, the personal commitment of Kurt Hahn (1987, p.103). Although local authorities offered a 55 acre site for a future College, two factors inhibited further action: Germany had not yet accepted the International Baccalaureate for entry to German universities, and it was felt to be too soon after the Nazi occupation to expect Dutch or Norwegian families to send their children to a College in Germany. The German National Committee reluctantly (and perhaps unnecessarily it seems to this commentator) turned down the project. Hahn was deeply disappointed and felt a great opportunity had been missed, but Peterson believes the plan for a German College was not abandoned but shelved (1987, p.104).

A NEW CHARISMATIC LEADER In 1968, Lord Mountbatten (1900-1979), who had been instrumental in gaining support for Atlantic College from both Conservative and Labour governments, and had been involved in the appointment of Desmond Hoare, was elected chairman of the Atlantic College Council.

The ideals on which the school was founded appealed to him, and his imagination was captured by the vision of a chain of schools where young people from every country would grow up together, rising above narrow nationalism to mutual sympathy and understanding. Unabashedly elitist, he dreamed of a world in which leaders fostered by Atlantic Colleges would come to power in a score of countries, creating an international freemasonry based on trust and good will (Ziegler, 1985, p.663).

Mountbatten also agreed to direct the overall project. As the new leader, Peterson observes he inherited: one College now manifestly successful but still in need of funds; two 'prospects' for which no serious funds were available; an international movement which had neither form, nor funds, nor base and a group of experienced, energetic and influential enthusiasts who were prepared to give a lot of their time, and in some cases a lot of their money, to turning the dream into reality. Mountbatten saw his work for this

---

movement as the best contribution he could make to preventing World War III\(^23\). With this as his main aim, he contributed his organising skills and his ability to mobilise great support. He stipulated two conditions for the movement as a whole: first, it should become more internationalised and second, an international office should be set up which would work for him and be separate from the administration of Atlantic College (Peterson, 1987, p.104). Within a short time, the movement had a new name - the United World Colleges - chosen by Mountbatten after discussion with U Thant\(^24\), a new International Council, of which Mountbatten served as President for nine years and a London based international office which set about implementing what might now be considered Mountbatten's vision for the emerging movement (Peterson, 1987, pp.104-105; Taylor, 1991, p.4).

By 1972, in addition to existing committees in Canada, Denmark, Germany, Norway and the United States, Mountbatten had established national committees in France, Sweden, Netherlands, Italy, Malta, Switzerland, Malaysia, Australia, Belgium, Spain, Luxemburg and the Bahamas\(^25\). He had also completed the movement's structural reorganisation by incorporating it in a company\(^26\), with its own board of directors. He became the first chairman and was entrusted with the task of implementing the policies of the International Council. The governors of Atlantic College (and of subsequent Colleges) were represented on this Board by their chairmen (Peterson, 1987, pp.105-106). In 1972, the United World College of South East Asia commenced in Singapore. In 1978, a year before he was killed, Lord Mountbatten concluded his presidency, handing over to the Prince of Wales\(^27\). Today, Taylor believes, Lord

\(^{23}\) Mountbatten was the last surviving Supreme Allied Commander from World War II (Peterson, 1987, p.104).

\(^{24}\) U Thant was secretary-general of the United Nations from 1962 to 1971.

\(^{25}\) Mountbatten visited 36 countries on behalf of the UWC (Ziegler, 1985, p.663).

\(^{26}\) The company is registered as United World Colleges (International) Ltd. (Peterson, 1987, pp.105-106).

\(^{27}\) Ziegler claims Mountbatten found this handing over his 'greatest renunciation'. Ziegler quotes the Prince of Wales as saying: 'I agreed to take over as President from you on the understanding (as I saw it) that you wished to cut down on your commitments, etc. From the way you have been tackling things recently, it looks as though you are still going to do too
Mountbatten's vision for the United World Colleges' movement has been substantially realised (1991, p.4).

**STEADY GROWTH** In 1981, the Waterford Kamhlaba College of Southern Africa, which had been started in 1963 as a protest to the separate and unequal educational systems in South Africa, became a full United World College (Petit, 1992, p.11; Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.). The first United World College to be established outside the English-speaking world was the United World College of the Adriatic, located a few kilometres north of Trieste in north-eastern Italy — with its 'history of shifting borders and its rich and varied cultural heritage' (Sutcliffe, 1988–1989, p.11). The principal of the school, David Sutcliffe, has a long association with Kurt Hahn and is now his official biographer. The Armand Hammer United World College was also opened in 1982 in Montezuma, New Mexico (INS, 1988–1989, p.10).

With the rapidly increasing size of the population in developing countries, a constantly growing necessity for food and the rising call for economic independence, the UWC movement was encouraged to create a 'bamboo' or 'agricultural' College in Latin America (INS, 1988–1989, p.11). The Prince of Wales strongly supported such an establishment and, in 1978, proposed the idea to the President of Venezuela (INS, 1988–1989, p.11). A formal agreement between Gustavo Cohen Pinto from the Ministry of
Agriculture and Alec Peterson, the Chairman of the International Board of the UWC, was formally signed to establish such a College. The Simon Bolivar Agricultural College of Venezuela opened in 1986. At this College, students from tropical countries, such as Central and Latin America and the Caribbean are taught the practical skills and the theoretical knowledge necessary to be able to cultivate tropical land. The 3 years' course is based on the 'learning by doing' philosophy; thus the students spend more than 50% of their time working on the 750 ha farmland belonging to the College (INS, 1988-1989, p.11).

The eighth and most recently established United World College is Li Po Chun United World College of Hong Kong which opened on September 7th, 1992. In 1997 it will become the first United World College in a Socialist Country (Taylor, 1992, p.6 and Int. LON.).

CURRENT EDUCATIONAL VISION AND POLICY Today, the UWC organisation oversees eight individual Colleges all of which are said to have a very similar atmosphere. Richard Taylor describes this atmosphere as 'lively ... argumentative ... very caring ... very bright ... very intelligent and exhausting' (1992, Int. LON.). Yet, he adds, each College has its own distinct character describing Atlantic College as 'rather British and a little bit traditional,' Pearson College as 'probably the most liberal' and Simon Bolivar, being a technical College, as 'the most strict.' Some United World Colleges provide full secondary education for students aged 11 to 19, others offer two-year upper secondary courses for students aged 16 to 19 while the Venezuela College provides a three-year post-secondary programme in farm management and agriculture for students aged 18-21. When enrolling students for its Colleges, the UWC finds the best people to 'spot the good students' are

30 This College differs from the other United World Colleges in that students do not normally go on to university (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).
31 This College opened with 125 students from all over the globe (Taylor, 1992, p.6).
32 Because cows have to be milked at a certain time of the day! (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).
ex-students (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.). A social class mix continues to be important.

... substantial scholarship funds are raised every year so that as well as having a wide international mix (some 85 nationalities at any one time) the Colleges also have students of different classes. The Crown Prince of the Netherlands recently shared a dormitory at Atlantic College with a Bombay bus-driver's son. Israelis attend with Palestinians, Americans with Russians, British with Argentinians (Taylor, 1991, p.4).

United World Colleges' students are expected to face the challenges and difficulties of serving others. All Colleges work with the socially deprived and with community groups including the elderly and the physically and mentally handicapped. Through these service programmes, students learn about themselves and each other, and develop a concern for other human beings. The organisation insists: 'Nothing binds individuals of different nations together more firmly than the shared experience of giving skilled assistance to others who may be in need or danger' (quoted in Taylor, 1991, p.4). All United World Colleges encourage their students to practise their own religion.

The UWC movement maintains its vision of seeing nations united through the promotion of peace and understanding among people from 'North and South, Rich and Poor, Industrialised and Rural' (Charles, 1987, p.vii). This is captured in the words 'A Pathway to Peace' (UWC, 1988, Doc. UWC). Individual Colleges seek to implement this vision, it is said, through educating their students to their highest intellectual and aesthetic potential, and by developing their moral qualities of courage, compassion, co-operation, perseverance and respect for skill - qualities which the organisation believes are essential to any training in active citizenship and service to the community. The movement is, however, seen to be educational rather than political inasmuch as it promotes no particular ideology or political

33 Atlantic College contributed to the current television series 'Songs of Praise' with a service which involved Buddhist, Muslim, Christian and students of other faiths 'giving praise' (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).
cause. It currently summarises its aims as: 1. 'to promote international understanding through education' and 2. 'to provide a pattern of education adapted to meet the special needs of our time' (INS, 1987-1988, p.10).

The years spent at one of its Colleges are regarded as a period of preparation for students in which they learn how to put into practice the ideals of peace, justice, tolerance and co-operation on which their education is based. Richard Taylor explains: 'the time in the College ... is only the means ... the end is an individual who is involved in ... [say] Amnesty International ... [or] some form of international social service'. He recalls:

I was talking to a doctor recently in Ghana ... and I said 'What do you do in your spare time - when you're not a doctor?' 'Oh,' she said, 'at weekends I take my father's Renault 4 car' ... (and I mean petrol is an absolutely wicked price) ... 'I travel 250 miles up to the north of Ghana to a mission hospital and I perform some operations there ... and then ... on the Sunday evening I come back'. Now to us in UWC, that's what's interesting about her - not the fact that she shows up as doctor, or she took a first degree in Harvard, or wherever, but the fact that she's carrying on her commitment to service of some form or another after her UWC experience (1992, Int. LON.).

The Singapore and Swaziland Colleges do not strictly follow the educational vision of Kurt Hahn by replicating the characteristics of Atlantic College. Students at these two Colleges have not mostly chosen these schools because of their commitment to an ideal of education for international understanding, but are the sons and daughters of families who happen to be working in the area, choose this as the best school available and pay fees to go there. These schools are very different to the tightly-knit communities of sixteen-to-eighteen year olds where students live together, work together and adventure together as Kurt Hahn envisaged. Yet they do provide an opportunity, in its way perhaps just as great as that of the '2 year' Colleges, to

34 UWC graduates believe the words 'international understanding' really mean 'interpersonal understanding across different cultures' (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).
spread the ideals of the UWC movement. Peterson believes the pure or classic type are preaching to the converted, while the other type are actually doing the converting. 'I found, and this was confirmed by the principal and also, I believe, in Mountbatten's experience, that the enthusiasm for the ideals of UWC at Singapore was every bit as great among the ninth and tenth grade as among the eleventh and twelfth' (Peterson, 1987, p.116).

**KURT HAHN'S VISION IN THE LIGHT OF TODAY'S MOVEMENT**

Kurt Hahn, Richard Taylor claims, was always interested in the underachiever, the 'plodder' and consequently he would want to challenge the UWC present practice of enrolling on the basis of academic and personal merit. For example, the Indian national committee which selects students for the UWC, has a quota of 20 places in all the Colleges per year and gets a thousand applications. Consequently the students being enrolled are 'very bright' (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.). So, too, would he be concerned about the 'aristocratic' dimension of the movement in having, for example, the Prince of Wales as its President. Yet, when the Prince is involved, the UWC gets wide publicity.

Changes in the vision of the movement have come about as a result of the organisation being involved in teaching, because 'teaching responds to the society in which it is taking place'. The changes have been facilitated by key individuals during the life of the movement - such as Lord Mountbatten, Alec Peterson and Prince Charles. They are seen to have enabled a continual updating of the philosophy of the movement, particularly through their membership of, and involvement in, the International Board - a Board to which other people, with a claim to being 'charismatic', now contribute. Today the UWC authorities portray their vision by asking whether they should set up a school of ecological studies or a school to study the impact of technology. Yet, at the same time, Richard Taylor adds,

---

35 In 1993, a new United World College will be opened on the west coast of Norway. It will be a Nordic College, supported by the eight administrations of the Nordic Region and have a particular interest in ecology (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).

36 On average, it takes eight years for a new United World College to be
they also ask: 'Is that exactly what Kurt Hahn would be interested in doing?'\(^{37}\) (1992, Int. LON.).

In summary, the United World Colleges Movement exemplifies
(1) the influence of a charismatic founder in the educational sphere (Kurt Hahn),
(2) the role of other charismatic people in the expansion of the movement (Hoare, Peterson, Mountbatten),
(3) the impact a founding experience has in triggering the emergence of a worldwide group of schools,
(4) the power of commitment to a vision and
(5) the adaptation of a founder's vision to school programmes (Hahn's grand passion).

3.4 - THE JESUIT SOCIAL MOVEMENT

The Jesuit Social Movement is well known. I concentrate here on the specific current contribution of the American Jesuits to the rejuvenation of the Society's educational vision after centuries of effective work. I see this contribution through the eyes of the Jesuit Secondary Education Association.

This Association began in 1970\(^{38}\), growing out of a broader organisation made up of all the American Jesuit educational groups: higher, secondary and seminary education (Costello, 1992, Int. WASH.). The idea of establishing such a centre is a modern one, resulting from the call of the Second Vatican Council for Religious Congregations to renew themselves. The association saw as its first task to write a preamble to its own constitution. This preamble, which has recently been updated, is rooted in the spirit of the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius. Called Send

---

\(^{37}\) The UWC authorities endeavour to answer this question by referring to Hahn's speeches and writings. This will be particularly important after those who knew and worked with him have died. It stresses the importance of the organisation having good archives (Taylor, 1992, Int. LON.).

\(^{38}\) The Association now has 46 member schools, 44 in the United States, one in Puerto Rico and one in Belize, British Honduras (Costello, 1992, Int. WASH.).
our Roots Rain\textsuperscript{39}, it has provided the basis for what has developed in the Association over the past twenty two years.

The third and current President of the American Jesuit Secondary Education Association, Fr. Charles Costello, believes Ignatius fell in love with the educational process at the University of Paris\textsuperscript{40}. That experience helped him to shape his *Spiritual Exercises* which he had substantially written by then. The educational principles he observed in Paris are also 'at the root of the methodologies of the *Ratio Studiorum* which was first published in 1599 and which relied on the fourth part of Ignatius' *Constitutions*. For Ignatius, there was 'an interweaving ... between his spirituality and education' (Bartlett, 1984, p.630A; Costello, 1992, Int. WASH.).

The Association has produced publications which result principally from its four commissions\textsuperscript{41}.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>AUTHOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>SEND OUR ROOTS RAIN (1991)</td>
<td>JSEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1973</td>
<td>MEN FOR OTHERS</td>
<td>ARRUPE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>INSTRUMENT FOR SELF-EVALUATION OF JESUIT HIGH SCHOOLS</td>
<td>JSEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977</td>
<td>REFLECTIONS ON THE EDUCATIONAL PRINCIPLES OF THE SPIRITUAL EXERCISES</td>
<td>NEWTON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>GO FORTH AND TEACH THE CHARACTERISTICS OF JESUIT EDUCATION</td>
<td>JSEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>SOWING SEEDS OF FAITH AND JUSTICE</td>
<td>STARRATT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>TEACHING FOR THE KINGDOM</td>
<td>CARRIER ET ALII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>FOUR HALLMARKS OF JESUIT PEDAGOGY\textsuperscript{42}</td>
<td>NETTS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{39} A name chosen from one of Gerard Manly Hopkins' poems (Costello, 1992, Int. WASH.).

\textsuperscript{40} Ignatius realised he would not have any influence unless he had a degree. He obtained the best degree he could at the time (Roach, 1992, Int. WASH.).

\textsuperscript{41} All Ignatius' first companions were graduates of the University of Paris (GFT, 1987, p.61).

\textsuperscript{42} These pedagogical hallmarks are also the hallmarks of the Spiritual Exercises (Costello, 1992, Int. WASH.).
ARRUPE  In 1973, three years after the Association began, the Society of Jesus' Superior General, Pedro Arrupe 'caused a stir' when he 'called with insistence for change', defining the Society's prime educational objective as to form men and women for others (JSEA, 1973, p.i; Campbell-Johnson, 1992, p.638):

... we cannot be satisfied with an education that forms in our students an individualistic ideal of personal achievement, capable of opening the way to a brilliant personal life. This has sometimes been the effect of a competitive education. We must form in modern man [and woman] a new mentality with new dynamic ideals based on the gospel with all its consequences. We have to imbue our students with a profound sense of service to others. This again must not be confined to a service of person to person, but it must also include ... contributing to the change of those structures and actual conditions which are oppressive and unjust. Therefore, we have to form ... the agents of change and liberation of modern society. This means creative education, forming in our students men [and women] able to anticipate the new order of human existence and capable of collaborating in reshaping the new society, which is already emerging from the debris of our times' (Arrupe, quoted in Kennedy, 1991, p.1).

Arrupe saw the goal of the Jesuit apostolate as the liberation of people 'from any form of slavery' and asked that Jesuit schools be open to all in need, whether they could afford the fees or not: 'Why have we so often failed to make any impact? Why do students emerge from Jesuit schools, which are mostly for the prosperous if not the rich, with so little sense of their responsibilities towards the wider society?' (Arrupe, quoted in TAB, 1991, p.303).

43 Although intellectual development has always provided the central aim for Jesuit education, it has traditionally served in a role subordinate to that of moral purpose. This relationship between the intellectual and moral aspects of Jesuit education has also found succinct expression in the writings of Suarez: 'The relation between the two is such that knowledge is, as it were, the proper material of instruction and the proximate effect of the schools. Nevertheless, the principal aim is moral excellence' (quoted in Donohue, 1963, p.134).

44 Padberg believes Jesuit schools have been elitist 'in the sense that they sought to recruit the most intellectually able pupils, and the ones who might best influence society, and then tried to give them an education in the Christian tradition, both academic and spiritual'. He adds: 'except for a few instances of schools set up by royal or princely edict specifically for the nobility, the vast majority of Jesuit schools were open to students of talent whether they were the children of princes or of bankers or of butchers, bakers and candlestick makers. And in the pre-suppression Society those schools were all gratuitous or tuition-free' (1990, p.1190).
A RETURN TO THE SPIRITUALITY OF IGNATIUS In 1975, the Instrument for Self-Evaluation of Jesuit High Schools: Principles and Standards began to put American Jesuit educators 'in touch with the Spiritual Exercises and the pedagogy of St. Ignatius' (Costello, 1992, Int. WASH.). In 1977, Robert Newton, in his text on Jesuit educational principles, expressed the belief that such principles can be derived from a careful reading and personal reflection on the text of the Spiritual Exercises, against the background of current educational practice and theory (Newton, 1977, p.iii). For Newton the Constitutions and Ratio Studiorum are concerned with

practical decisions and procedures rather than statements of values or principles. The Spiritual Exercises can be seen as the spirit which animates and, through the experience it creates, provides the value structure for ... [other] more practical educational documents (ibid., p.3).

Newton deduces a series of norms which can be used both to evaluate current educational practice and to give direction to a faculty seeking to discover how to make the educational process specifically Jesuit in character (ibid. pp.2-3).

CONTEMPORARY JESUIT EDUCATIONAL VISION INTERNATIONALLY In 1980, an International Commission on the Apostolate of Jesuit Education was established. The members of this Commission recognised that the vision of Ignatius had sustained Jesuit schools for four centuries and so sought to apply this spiritual vision to education in ways adapted to the present day (SJ, 1987, p.11). They endeavoured to understand the distinctive nature of Jesuit education, taking into account the Jesuit Congregation held in the mid 1970s, which spelt out the mission of the Jesuits in contemporaneous terms as 'the service of faith and the promotion of justice' (Costello, 1992, Int. WASH.). After four years of discussions and worldwide consultations, the commission produced The Characteristics of Jesuit Education

45 Charles Costello describes the process as 'trying to relate Ignatian spirituality with Ignatian pedagogy' (1992, Int. WASH.).
46 This text was written in association with the Jesuit Secondary Educational Association of Washington.
47 This is seen as a single mission - serving faith in the midst of doing justice - in the way Ignatius spoke of being contemplative in the midst of action (Costello, 1992, Int. WASH.).
in 1987 (Gutierrez, 1987, p.26). In formally presenting this document to the Society, the Superior General, Fr. Peter-Hans Kolvenbach, stressed the document's role in continuing the tradition begun with the Ratio, and the opportunity it provides to 'give us a common vision and a common sense of purpose':

I am presenting *The Characteristics of Jesuit Education* as Father General Claudio Aquaviva presented the first *Ratio* in 1586: 'not as definitive or final, for that would be very difficult and perhaps impossible; rather as an instrument which will help us meet whatever difficulties we may encounter, because it gives the whole Society one single perspective' (Kolvenbach, 1986, p.1 and p.3).

The American publication of the Characteristics is titled *Go forth and Teach*. Charles Costello calls this text 'a modern expression of the *Ratio*' and the Jesuit's key international educational document. He describes it as 'an effort to ... gather up all the thinking we've done over the past twenty or more years, and to express it in 28 characteristics which cover ... [8] major themes'. The book also contains an appendix 'on the life of Ignatius looked at from the educational vantage point' (Costello, 1992, *Int. WASH.; GFT*, 1987, pp.5-9).

**THE IGNATIAN IDENTITY OF A SCHOOL** The major thrust in Jesuit educational vision today, according to the Jesuit Secondary Education Association, focuses on the spirituality of Ignatius. Jesuit education constantly seeks to root itself in this developing interest. This is highlighted in the Association's founding constitution, which states:

*If the faculty at a Jesuit school ... [has] men and women whose lives are inspired by the Ignatian vision, then the question about the*

---

48 The first draft of the *Ratio* resulted from the labours of six experienced Jesuit teachers summoned to Rome in 1584 by Aquaviva, the fifth General of the Order (Donohue, 1985, p.252). Robert Rusk states: 'Availing themselves or all the material regarding methods and administration of education which they could assemble and of the experience which the practice of the Society itself afforded, they were able after a year's collaboration to present in August 1585 to the General of the Society the results of their efforts'. Like the many Protestant and Catholic Renaissance school plans of the time, Rusk believes the *Ratio* was inspired by the ideal of perfect Latin eloquence that Cicero had exemplified and Quintilian had codified (Rusk, 1965, p.68 and pp.75-76).
percentage of Jesuits on the faculty is not an overriding issue (quoted in Donohue, 1985, p.256).

Such a position represents a development in thinking from that of the Jesuit Professor of Philosophy, Fr. Robert Henle who, in 1967, contended that 'Jesuit education is education given by Jesuits' (quoted in Donohue, 1985, p.255). Today, Charles Costello likes to talk about the Ignatian Identity of a School:

'We're dealing with the coming together of two expressions of the charism - one is the Jesuit expression of the charism of Ignatius, the other is the layman's and laywoman's expression of the charism of Ignatius. When Ignatius wrote the Exercises he himself was a layman and a lot of the foundation for what he did and thought came out of his experience as a layman (1992, Int. WASH.).'

Charles believes lay people come to join a Jesuit faculty through attraction to Ignatius' charism. Yet, he adds, they do not want to be turned into 'little Jesuits' - they do not want to have the Jesuit vision handed on to them (ibid.).

Fr. Tom Roach, currently President of Georgetown Preparatory School, agrees that lay members of the faculty want their own lay vision of Ignatius' charism - a vision based on the Spiritual Exercises (1992, Int. WASH.; 1992, Corr.). Since collaboration between lay and religious personnel is critical to apostolic effectiveness today, Charles Costello believes, at this point in Jesuit history, that Jesuit schools need 8 - 10 Jesuits to enable the building up of the Ignatian identity of the school: 'I think after that is established then you don't need any [Jesuits]' (1992, Int. WASH.). He insists that Jesuits have to listen to what lay people are experiencing as they incarnate Ignatius' charism in their own lives as single or married people:

'We keep imposing our way of living ... this charism which is a religious life kind of thing ... and we're not open enough to ... allowing them [the lay faculty] to express what I think is already within them, a spiritual life that has an incarnational dimension of the Ignatian charism.'

---

49 Tom was formerly assistant to the Provincial for Education in the Maryland Province of the Jesuits (1992, Corr.).
50 The Jesuits moved into the president - principal structure in their secondary schools in the late 1960s in an effort to split the external responsibilities, especially fund-raising and public relations, from the internal responsibilities (Roach, 1992, Int. WASH.).
He feels the collaboration process will be enhanced if the 3
or 4 Jesuits in a school are in a classroom rather than in
administration: "if we ourselves lose touch with the classroom,
it won't be long before we're talking "through our hats"
educationally" (1992, Int. WASH.).

For Charles Costello, the Spiritual Exercises provide
the best means of building up this Ignatian identity. He
sees Ignatian pedagogy51 as rooted in their paradigm since
they take place between director and retreatant, just as the
teaching process involves teacher and student. In the
Exercises, the director facilitates the relationship between
the Spirit and the retreatant and the Spirit and truth52.
Teaching is also 'a facilitating process ... it's one of very
personal understanding of the individual ... listening,
prompting ... and that's ... the root of Ignatian education'.
He sees the way to attract the teacher,

particularly the lay teacher, into a deeper
awareness of his or her own spirituality and
perhaps the Ignatian incarnation of the charism
... is more effectively done through ... [his or
her] profession as teacher. [I try to] ... help
teachers see that ... the very way we go about
the educational experience - the teaching
experience and the learning experience in the
classroom - is rooted in ... Ignatius' whole
spirituality53 (ibid.).

Teachers, it is claimed, can find Ignatian pedagogy54 helpful
in trying to develop their teaching. The question 'How does
the charism express itself in the pedagogy of the educational
process?' then becomes central for them (ibid.).

51 Charles Costello sees pedagogy as the substratum under the whole
educational experience defining it as the way teachers accompany students in
their learning. He recalls that the word pedagogue is derived from the
Greek paidagogos (1992, Int. WASH.) - a 'slave who took a boy to and from
school'. With teachers, Charles prefers to focus on pedagogy rather than
education or teaching because this enables him to approach teachers through
their professional standpoint. He can ask them, for example, whether they
think reflection is important for students as they grow up. This doesn't
get them caught up in methodology or technique (Hoad, 1991, p.342).
52 cf So neither the one who plants nor the one who waters is anything, but
only God who gives the growth (1 Cor. 3:7).
53 Charles Costello feels that 'to come in the other way' - through
spirituality, rather than through the professional life of the teacher, - is
what 'puts the back up of a lot of teachers'. It is a matter of bringing to
consciousness the spirituality that is already there in the lay teachers
(1992, Int. WASH.).
54 Charles Costello tries to use the word 'Ignatian' rather than 'Jesuit'
when referring to pedagogy otherwise he believes he is not including all the
audience (1992, Int. WASH.).
EDUCATIONAL VISION IN PRACTICE AT GEORGETOWN

When I visited Georgetown Preparatory School, Fr. Tom Roach informed me that members of the Ignatian Study Group were due to meet in a few days time. He gave me a copy of the minutes of the previous meeting and the agenda for the next. The agenda asked members of the Study Group to read, before the meeting, the documents *Reflections on the Educational Principles of the Spiritual Exercises* by Robert Newton and *Four Hallmarks of Jesuit Pedagogy* by Ralph Metts. It was suggested the study group members keep in mind the following questions as they read these texts:

1. Do you think that Newton's and Metts' basic methodology of deriving principles of pedagogy from the Spiritual Exercises is valid?
2. Do you already incorporate these principles into your own teaching methods?
3. Do these principles distinguish Jesuit education from other educational traditions?
4. Do you think that the pedagogy described by Newton and Metts can form one element of the identity of a Jesuit high school?
5. Do you think that parents considering sending a son to Prep. would accept this pedagogy as an important element of our Jesuit/Ignatian identity? (Roach, 1991, Doc. GPS, pp.1-2).

Tom Roach established this Study Group for the 1991 Ignatian year. He recalls the experience of the group, which has 14 members, 2 of whom are Jesuits and some of whom are not catholics:

I have chaired this group for the past two years ... we started off with the life of Ignatius ... then we talked about the Exercises ... by having different people talk about their experiences of the Exercises, both lay people and Jesuits ... we draw upon common experience ... and we keep asking the question ... what is going to keep this school Jesuit or Ignatian - a better word ... We're struggling to use the word 'Ignatian' - why? I think that says a lot ... we keep coming back to ... what should be different about the teaching that goes on in my classroom because ... I share the charism of Ignatius? So we have gotten down to the point of methodology and

55 Tom Roach observes that the Spiritual Exercises are not only for Catholics, or Christians, but simply believers (1992, Int. WASH.).
Tom Roach describes Georgetown Preparatory School as a catholic school with an Ignatian emphasis. He recalls that 'desires' were very important for Ignatius who would insist: know what you want, make it clear, go for it yourself and take other people with you (1992, Int. WASH.). One valuable way of achieving this working together towards an Ignatian vision for education, Charles Costello believes, is by strengthening the Ignatian system of schools (1992, Int. WASH.)

In this brief study of some recent Jesuit initiatives the reader will have noticed the fairly constant reference backwards to the centuries of Jesuit history in schools, but more particularly to the vision and charism of the founder, Ignatius. The lengthy scholia which follow provide some basic information on these continuing keystones of Jesuit education.

SCHOLIUM 3.1 - IGNATIUS AND HIS FOUNDING EXPERIENCES

Born on July 31st, 1491 into a world of privilege and wealth and originally intended for a career in the church, Ignatius received a rudimentary education which was soon abandoned for a career in the Spanish court as a soldier and courtier. In his autobiography he describes the first 26 years of his life in one sentence: 'he was a man given to the follies of the world; and what he enjoyed most was warlike sport, with a great and foolish desire to win fame' (APT (1983) quoted in GFT, 1987, p.55). In 1521, he was seriously wounded at the siege of Pamplona and taken prisoner when the city fell. During his six months of convalescence, he read many religious books including the Life of Christ by the Carthusian, Ludolph of Saxony and the Flos Sanctorum, a Spanish version of the short lives of the saints by the Dominican, Hacobus de Voragine. After reading these two books, Ignatius decided to give his life wholly to God's service, like his newly discovered heroes, Dominic and Francis (Campbell, 1989a, p.206). When he recovered,

56 Tom Roach feels many people join the study group because they are thirsty for a deeper prayer life (1992, Int. WASH.).
57 This involves, for example, gathering teachers together nationally, establishing conferences where teachers and administrators can dialogue and sending all members of the Boards of Trustees each copy of the Jesuit Secondary Education Association News Bulletin. 'They begin to realise they're part of a much bigger thing than simply their own little school' (Costello, 1992, Int. WASH).
58 Ignatius laughed when his sister-in-law brought him stories of the saints and a life of Christ as 'there were no stories of noble fighters and bold lovers' (Hewett, 1990, p.9).
he left Loyola for Jerusalem feeling within himself 'a powerful urge to be serving the Lord' (O'Callaghan, 1991, p.3). His first stop was the shrine of Montserrat. There he passed the night of 24th March, 1522 in a vigil in the chapel of the Benedictine Abbey, laying his sword on the altar before the statue of the Black Madonna (Longford, 1987, p.84). The morning after this vigil, he made his way to Manresa where he stayed until February of the following year. Living in a cave, as a 'ragged and ridiculed beggar', he suffered attacks of depression and despair, frequently thinking of suicide and spending much time in prayer and penance (Longford, 1987, p.85). His cave overlooked the River Cardoner and faced the lofty, saw-tooth of Monserrat some twenty miles away. 'At this time', Ignatius writes in his autobiography, 'God dealt with him just as a schoolmaster treats a little boy when he teaches him' (O'Callaghan, 1991, p.3). Ignatius received intensive mystical graces which shaped his world view around the vision of the divine plan in creating and redeeming humanity. He recalls:

One time he was going out of his devotion to a church a little more than a mile from Manresa; I believe it was called St Paul's. The road ran next to the river Cardona. As he went along occupied with his devotions, he sat down for a little while with his face toward the river which was running deep. While he was seated there the eyes of his understanding began to be opened; though he did not see any vision, he understood and knew many things, both spiritual things and matters of faith and of learning, and this was with so great an enlightenment that everything seemed new to him. Though there were many, he cannot set forth the details that he understood then except that he experienced a great clarity in his understanding. This was such that in the whole course of his life, through sixty-two years, even if he gathered up all the many helps he had had from God and all the many things he knew and added them together, he does not think they would amount to as much as he had received at that one time (TAB, 1991a, p.924).

After a brief visit to the Holy Land in 1523.

59 The Feast of the Annunciation.
60 Manresa is in Catalonia, Spain.
61 Karl Rahner contends that this direct encounter with God lay at the heart of Ignatius' message (Longford, 1987, pp.85 & 88).
62 Ignatius had intended to stay in the Holy Land but the Franciscan guardian of the holy places commanded him to leave Palestine in case his attempts to convert Muslims caused him to be kidnapped and held to ransom (Longford, 1987, p.85). Ignatius writes in his autobiography: 'After the pilgrim realized that it was not God's will that he remain in Jerusalem, he continually pondered within himself what he ought to do; and eventually he
Ignatius gave himself to study, beginning with the study of Latin grammar among a class of schoolboys in Barcelona. Two years later, he moved to the University of Alcalá where he started giving spiritual exercises to others and teaching Christian doctrine. This caused him to fall under the suspicion of the Inquisitors. He was subsequently forbidden to discuss theological questions until he had completed his formal education (Fanning, 1991, p.5). In 1529, Ignatius moved to the University of Paris where from 1528 to 1535 he studied philosophy and theology, while, at the same time, admiring the orderly curriculum and the personal concern given by the teachers to each student in the classroom (Donohue, 1985, p.256; Costello, 1992, Int. WASH.). During this time Ignatius lived in poverty, existing through begging and the charity of friends (1991, kennedy, p.1). Nevertheless, he persevered with his studies and, in 1534, at the age of 43, graduated as Master of Arts (Dohany, 1980, p.298; Attwater, 1983, p.174; Fanning, 1991, p.5). At this time, his original ambition remained firm: to travel to the Holy Land and spread the Catholic faith there.

Ignatius attracted the friendship and support of six companions - including Peter Favre and the future missionary Francis Xavier, both of whom were his roommates. Four others, who were similarly attracted, soon joined them (GFT, 1987, p.59). On August 15th, 1534 at Montmartre, during a Mass celebrated by the only priest among them, Peter Favre, these seven men consecrated their lives to God through vows of poverty and chastity and committed themselves to carry out missionary work in Jerusalem (Attwater, 1983, p.174; GFT, 1987, pp.59-60;
In 1535 they went to Venice and explored the possibility of travelling to the Holy Land to win it for Christ. There, in Venice in 1537, six of the group were ordained, Ignatius, now aged 47, among them. Recurring warfare between Christian and Islamic armies was making their proposed journey to Jerusalem impossible. While they waited for the tension to ease and pilgrim journeys to be resumed, the group dispersed and carried out mission work in the universities and towns of northern Italy (Delaney, 1980, p.298; Fanning, 1991, pp.6-7). Finally, after a year had passed and Palestine remained inaccessible, they decided to return to Rome and offer their services to the Pope (GFT, 1987, p.60). As this resolve meant they might be sent to different parts of the world, they decided to form a more permanent bond which would keep them united, even when they were physically separated. They decided to add the vow of obedience and become a religious order (GFT, 1987, p.60). On September 27th, 1540, the Pope approved the Constitutions of the new order by the Papal Bull Regimini Militantis Ecclesiae and the Society of Jesus was formally established (Campbell, 1989a, p.207; Fanning, 1991, p.8). The companions, now ten, took their final vows in 1541 and, despite his strenuous objections, Ignatius was unanimously elected Superior General (Delaney, 1980, p.298; Campbell, 1989a, p.207). According to its founding charter, the Society's purpose is 'the spreading of the faith and the progress of souls in Christian life and doctrine' (Endean, 1991, p.III). The charter proposes a variety of ways in which Jesuits will try to bring about this aim:

- 'public preaching, lectures and any other ministration ... of the word of God';
- 'the education of children and unlettered persons in Christianity';
- 'hearing confessions and administering the other sacraments';
- work in prisons, hospitals, and 'in performing any other works of charity' (Endean, 1991, p.III).

In 1546, at the insistence of local parents, Ignatius invited other boys of the city to join those preparing to enter the Society of Jesus at the College of Gandia, Spain (GFT, 1987, p.62; Carmody, 1992, p.9). The first Jesuit school for young lay students was founded in 1548 in Messina, Sicily (Donohue, 1985, p.252). When Ignatius died on July 31st, 1556 he was the superior of 1,000 Jesuits who were organised into twelve provinces and

religious order or, as yet, to form one of their own. They just wanted to gather other companions around them and live together simply and prayerfully (Fanning, 1991, p.6).

71 The Society of Jesus is described as an 'order' rather than a 'congregation' because its members take 'solemn' rather than 'simple' vows (Donohue, 1963, pp.3-4).

72 Ignatius was elected seven months after the Order was approved (Rusk, 1965, p.65). Longford says of Ignatius that he often treated his followers harshly, yet they loved him profoundly and were convinced that God spoke to them through him (1987, p.89). All Ignatius' first companions were graduates of the University of Paris (GFT, 1987, p.61).

73 In the parlance of religious life, a province is an administrative
who maintained 100 establishments (Donohue, 1963, p.3 and 1985, p.253; Fanning, 1991, p.10). Ignatius had approved the foundation of 40 schools. The work of education had become a chief ministry of the Society — a ministry which Ignatius believed should, above all, promote God’s greater glory (Donohue, 1963, p.4; Gutierrez, 1987, p.25; Carmody, 1992, p.10). Hughes describes Ignatius’ prescription for education as follows:

For this moral strengthening of character, no less than for the invigorating of mental energies, the system of Ignatius Loyola prescribes an education which is public — public, as being that of many students together, public as opposed to private tutorism, public, in fine, as requiring a sufficiency of the open, fearless exercise both of practical morality and of religion (quoted in Rusk, 1965, p.68).

While for centuries, religious congregations had contributed to the growth of education in philosophy and theology, the Jesuits extended this work to the humanities (GFT, 1987, p.62). The teaching of children and the poor had no body of men [or women] vowed to its performance, and its neglect was among the abuses which drew down the censure of the Council of Trent; while, in gratuitously undertaking the higher education of youth, the Jesuits were absolutely original (Rusk, 1965, p.68). The Jesuits provided their education with a uniform and universal methodology. They also stressed the importance of long and thorough training for teachers (Rusk, 1965, pp.83-84). Yet, their greatest contribution is summarised by Thompson when speaking of Ignatius, as he could of many other Jesuits:

When he spoke, it was not what he said, it was the suppressed heat of personal feeling, personal conviction which enkindled men. This has ever been the secret of great teachers, were they only schoolmasters; it is the communication of themselves that avails (quoted in Rusk, 1965, p.88).

SCHOLIUM 3.2 - DEVELOPMENT OF JESUIT EDUCATION

After Ignatius’ death, some Jesuits believed work in schools was inappropriate for the Society — a struggle which lasted until the 17th. century. Nevertheless Jesuit involvement in education continued to grow at a division organised along geographical lines.

74 At this time one third of all Jesuit institutions were secondary or middle schools (Donohue, 1963, p.4).
75 One of the most distinguished of the second generation of Jesuits, Pedro Ribadeneira, considered it doubtful that any other work would give as much glory to God as the education of youth (Donohue, 1985, p.253).
76 The 1586 Ratio states: 'Unless a ready and true method be adopted much labour is spent in gathering but little fruit' (quoted in Rusk, 1965, p.83).
rapid rate (GFT, 1987, p.64). It assumed such an important role in their efforts to reconstitute the Church in post-Reformation Europe\(^7\) that by the end of the 16th century there were 245 Jesuit schools\(^8\) (Bangert, 1986, p.105; Carmody, 1992, p.9). By 1710, the Jesuits were running 612 colleges, 15 universities and 100 seminaries (Ganss, 1989, p.225). In 1773, Pope Clement XVI, as a result of what Fanning describes as 'slander, imprisonment, exile ... [and] threats' by 'governments and princes who wished to rule the Church in their own domains', suppressed the Society of Jesus\(^9\) (1991, p.13). At this time there were 845 schools spread throughout Europe, the Americas, Asia and Africa (GFT, 1987, p.65; Gutierrez, 1987, p.25). The majority of these institutions were destroyed, except for a few located in Russian territories where the suppression never took effect (GFT, 1987, p.65). On August 7th, 1814, Pope Pius VII restored the Order, giving as one of his reasons: 'that the Catholic Church could have, once again, the benefit of their educational experience' (quoted in GFT, 1987, p.65). The Society returned with renewed spirituality and vigour (Donohue, 1985, p.252; Gutierrez, 1987, p.25). The 20th century has heralded a significant increase in the size and number of Jesuit schools (Gutierrez, 1987, p.26). By 1987, the Jesuit educational apostolate had extended to more than 2,000 educational institutions with 10,000 Jesuits (38.46% of all Jesuits) working in close collaboration with 100,000 people, providing education for 1.5 million young people and adults in 56 countries (Gutierrez, 1987, p.26). Today there are 25,000 Jesuits working in 100 countries - 9,000 in Europe, 5,000 in the United States and 3,000 in India (Fanning, 1991, pp.12-13).

In summary, the Jesuit Social Movement exemplifies,

1. a movement with a four and a half century history,
2. the influence of the spirituality of its founder (Ignatius Loyola) in its educational vision,
3. the contribution of a refounding type person (Pedro Arrupe),
4. the importance traditionally placed on articulating the movement's educational vision (*Ratio* and *Characteristics*),
5. the contribution that can be made by a study and resource centre (JSEA),
6. a methodology for interweaving the spiritualities of members of the Order with the those of lay staff (Georgetown Prep.) and

---

\(^7\) The Jesuits attempted to arrest disintegrating forces in the religious life of Europe by attacking the evils in the Universities (Rusk, 1965, pp.65-66).

\(^8\) Rusk claims the counter-reformation was prepared in Jesuit schools (1965, p.69).

\(^9\) Hebblethwaite claims the Society's suppression was seen in Europe as a victory for the Enlightenment (1992b, p.1294).
7) the place of spirituality in educational vision.

We now move in the next chapter to consider a movement with an educational vision emanating out of 19th century France.
CHAPTER 4 - MARCELLIN CHAMPAGNAT'S MOVEMENT

The stone that the builders rejected has become the chief cornerstone.

Psalm 118

This chapter provides an historical introduction to the main subject of the thesis, the social movement of the Marist Brothers. It begins with a brief consideration of education in nineteenth century France as setting the context for what follows. It then discusses the contribution Marcellin Champagnat made to French education during this period and studies the influence the social movement he founded has had, not only in France, but also throughout the world. In the third section, it offers an analysis of Marcellin Champagnat's educational vision and concludes with a brief survey of the subsequent development and adaptation of this vision by the Marist Brothers.

Most of the literature pertaining to Marcellin Champagnat and the Marist Brothers is published by, and only available from, the Congregation. Consequently when I visited Marist schools and houses I scoured the archives for any relevant documentation which may not have been widely distributed. I found it necessary to supplement this literature by interviewing Brothers in France, America, Ireland, England and Scotland to fill in historical gaps. These included, first, Marist historians, second, authors of texts on Marist Brothers and their works and third, former superiors of the Congregation.

TABLE 4.1 - DOCUMENTS OUTLINING MARIST EDUCATIONAL VISION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1837</td>
<td>RULE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1852</td>
<td>COMMON RULES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1853</td>
<td>SCHOOL GUIDE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1854</td>
<td>CONSTITUTIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1856</td>
<td>LIFE OF FATHER CHAMPAGNAT BY BR. JOHN-BAPTIST FURET</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1868</td>
<td>BIOGRAPHIES OF SOME BROTHERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1907</td>
<td>SCHOOL GUIDE (REVISED)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1909</td>
<td>BULLETIN OF THE INSTITUTE OF THE LITTLE BROTHERS OF MARY BEGINS²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>CIRCULARS OF THE SUPERIORS GENERAL OF THE LITTLE BROTHERS OF MARY BEGINS³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1931</td>
<td>THE TEACHER'S GUIDE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Vs.22.
2 One circular has normally been published each one or two years since 1909 (Farrell, 1984, p.xiii).
3 The first volume was published in Lyons in 1914 (Farrell, 1984, p.xiii).
The life of Marcellin Champagnat, the founder of the Marist Brothers, is well documented. Little, however, has been written, particularly in English, on the development of the Congregation since Marcellin's death in 1840. Nor has much been documented, and less debated in print, on the current educational philosophy of the Congregation.

4.1 - NINETEENTH CENTURY FRANCE

Nineteenth-century France has often been described as a divided society. The Revolution created 'patterns of opposition between bourgeois and aristocrat, state and church, progress and reaction and even simply new and old'. Nevertheless the drive to school France transcended these 'rival discourses' and resulted in a working consensus constructed among 'a demoralized, factionalized and divided ruling class' that perceived and defined schools with reference to their effects as 'moralizing agents' (Gemie, 1992, p.146). Organisationally thousands of new communes were established throughout the country replacing the parish as the fundamental administrative unit. Each was represented by a civilian mayor who was obliged to keep records of births, deaths and marriages within the commune (Heffernan, 1992, p.152). Gemie describes France, during this period, as a transitional society with a relatively large number of schools but 'without effective bureaucratic mechanisms to oversee them'. Educational networks were largely seasonal, directed by part-time 'amateur' teachers according to the unplanned needs of local markets (Gemie, 1992, p.129).

In 1810 Napoleon established the Imperial University, a self-governing educational corporation independent of Church and state which was an hierarchical pyramid, entirely at the service of the emperor (Piveteau, 1967, p.7; Goubert, 1991,
p.223). The Université was the body of full-time educational officials created to supervise all educational establishments from nursery schools to colleges. It came to represent a set of ideals and hopes standing for 'a mildly optimistic, rationalistic and liberal vision of France's destiny' where its members felt they were not simply colleagues, but also comrades working together within a moral community (Gemie, 1992, pp.130-131). At the bottom of the pyramid was primary education 'which had been almost abandoned, since the empire needed only disciplined bodies' (Goubert, 1991, p.223).

The spread of primary schooling was a gradual and regionally variable process with the elementary schools of the seventeenth, eighteenth and early nineteenth century administered mainly by the Church (Goubert, 1991, p.245; Heffernan, 1992, p.150). Catholic schools run by religious congregations, with their uniforms and unique cultural status, made a distinct group. The religious sector was smaller and better defined than the lay sector, and so encountered fewer problems in controlling its schools4 (Gemie, 1992, p.131).

The Revolution had achieved nothing very definitive in the field of education but it did initiate several steps which were important to Catholic schools and which still influence the French system of education (Piveteau, 1967, p.6).

Decrees of 1790 and 1792 transferred schools from the responsibility of the Church to that of the state, deprived religious of the right to teach, and attempted to suppress all freedom in education. Notwithstanding, as early as 1795 a step toward educational freedom from the ancien régime was taken when the Directoire recognized the rights of 'citizens to establish private institutions of instruction and education, as well as societies for the promotion of science and liberal arts (22 Aout 1795)' (Piveteau, 1967, p.6).

With this new freedom, the number of Catholic schools multiplied (Piveteau, 1967, p.6). The bishops were allowed to open Catholic seminaries independent of the Imperial University, thus affording the opportunity for the Church to

---

develop Catholic secondary schools which could be called 'seminaries' (Piveteau, 1967, p.7). By 1801 calls had come from almost all regions of France for the restoration of the De La Salle Brothers and the various pre-revolutionary congregations of teaching Sisters (Farrell, 1984, p.49; Braniff, 1992, Corr., p.1). In the same year Portalis, the chief architect of Napoleon's 'Civil Code' (Farrell, 1984, p.288), proclaimed to the Legislative body: 'It is time that theories gave place to facts; there is no education without moral teaching and without religion. The teachers have taught in the desert because they were told never to speak of religion in the schools' (quoted in Farrell, 1984, p.49). The De La Salle Brothers and the various groups of Sisters were restored in 1803 and by 1808 any religious order or association could conduct schools provided they had the approval of the university (Farrell, 1984, p.49). By 1811 the government lycees\(^5\) enrolled 35,130 students and the 'seminaries' 32,400 students (Piveteau, 1967, p.7).

The monopoly of Napoleon's Imperial University over all schools was abolished in 1815, and primary schools were put under 17 separate universities (Daniel-Rops, 1965, p.154; Farrell, 1992, Corr.). Public opinion was firmly in favour of the expansion and development of primary schooling. Republican poet and politician Alphonse de Lamartine told the Assembly in 1834: 'The public cries out for the multiplication of schools for the labouring classes. From all points, under all the banners of opposing opinions, there is agreement on one necessity: popular instruction' (quoted in Gemie, 1992, p.132). Governments therefore felt a need to prove their commitment to schooling. Each new regime drew up new laws: the Restoration monarchy produced the 1816 ordinance which made the authorization of male teachers compulsory (Gemie, 1992, p.132). 'The July Monarchy passed the Guizot Law (1833) which established municipally subsidized boys' schools and departmental teacher training colleges for schoolmasters' (Gemie, 1992, p.132). Free primary school education now had to be made available in every commune in

---

5 Goubert describes 'these essential units of secondary education', or 'lycees', as 'quasi-military barracks directed by celibate servants' (1991, p.223).
France (Farrell, 1984, p.159; Goubert, 1991, p.245). The Church was also granted the freedom to open elementary schools (Piveteau, 1967, p.7). In 1850, Loi Falloux, while preserving the privileges of the university to confer degrees, granted freedom to anyone to establish secondary schools, even if such schools were not seminaries in the true sense of the term (Piveteau, 1967, p.7). 'The Second Empire took as its own the Falloux Law (1850) which weakened the Université's powers and encouraged Catholic, congregational schooling' (Gemie, 1992, p.132). In reality, almost all education, including the University of France, was handed over to the clergy (Goubert, 1991, p.150 and p.260).

Naturally, great expansion in Catholic education resulted. In 1863 there were 3000 Catholic elementary schools for boys as compared to 3500 government schools and 14,560 for girls as compared to 6500 such government schools. By 1870, eighteen religious institutes were maintaining Catholic schools. In 1875, 370 Catholic secondary schools for boys had been established. At this time Catholic schools were the main instrument of Catholic pastoral action in France and the primary source of candidates for religious congregations. The Church was also influential in government schools during this period (Piveteau, 1967, pp.7-8).

Although government educational policies oscillated between the 1830s and the 1880s, occasionally bringing Church and State into short-lived harmony, the influence of a secular, anti-clerical republicanism was never entirely absent and it was this ideology which ultimately triumphed with the establishment of the third Republic after 1870. For many republicans, Church control of primary education represented a clear threat to the nationalist order they sought to create (Heffernan, 1992, pp.150-151). 'The republicans of the Third Republic announced their victory over monarchism and clericalism by passing Ferry's 1881, 1882 and 1886 laws which made public schooling compulsory, free and secular'6 (Gemie, 1992, p.132). Jules Ferry, as well

---

6 'Jules Ferry, the educational reformer of the Third Republic, had only to
as the Protestants and Freemasons who surrounded him, understood secularisation to mean 'both absolute respect for freedom of conscience and the exclusion of any religious teaching or influence in the public schools (Goubert, 1991, p.269).

By 1901, when the Law of Associations withdrew the legal status of all Roman Catholic teaching congregations in France, the Church had already lost the almost total control of education it had enjoyed since 1850 (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.8; Goubert, 1991, p.269). In 1903 'strong secularizing and anticlerical elements' brought about the passage of the Combes Law causing the expulsion of all teaching religious from schools and the confiscation of their property (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.8; Piveteau, 1967, p.8; Moraldo, 1991, p.5; Michel, 1992, p.5). Freedom of education, however, was not suppressed. Private elementary and secondary schools could still be run. Consequently many religious became 'secularised' and officially continued their work in Catholic schools.

Throughout the nineteenth century there were other thriving systems of education besides formal schooling. Skilled artisans were given lengthy apprenticeships; unskilled artisans and peasants went through less formal training; mothers educated their children in basic social and linguistic skills and often gave their daughters intensive instruction in domestic crafts; village story-tellers taught the traditional values of folk culture to their audiences; and well-off young men achieved emotional maturity through what Flaubert chose to call their 'sentimental education' (Gemie, 1992, p.131).

While many teachers made use of the old-fashioned complete, democratize, and republicanize the work of the July Monarchy' (Goubert, 1991, p.245).

7 Laws regulating teaching orders continued to raise violent emotions up to 1930 (Goubert, 1991, p.269). By the time of World War II, strong and influential French Catholic opinion was blaming the French military debacle on the type of education given to French youth during the preceding forty years. As a result the 'politically conservative government of MAREchal Pétain abolished the 1901 laws and permitted the religious institutes to teach again in private schools' (Piveteau, 1967, p.8).
'individual' method giving individual tuition to each child in turn, such practices were frowned on by the Université and teachers were encouraged to make use of more collective teaching methods such as the 'mutual' method, which relied on monitors to undertake teaching work, the 'simultaneous' method, made popular by the congregation of the De La Salle Brothers, which made use of a complex system of signs and signals to allow a single teacher to control classes of up to 150 pupils, or the 'mixed' method which contained elements of both the 'mutual' and 'simultaneous' methods (Gemie, 1992, p.142; Hamilton, 1989, p.60).

A document drawn up by the Lyon arrondissement committee, in response to an 1834 Université request, typifies the ideal manner in which teachers were to perform. Twelve rules described the physical setting of the ideal classroom, thirty one outlined disciplinary practices, six governed moral and religious instruction and thirty seven rules came under the heading of "instruction", which included such topics as catechism classes, merit cards and the length of time that the school was to be open.

According to their rules, school rooms were to be large, well lit and airy, with their benches secured to the floor, and a bust of the king and a crucifix prominently displayed above the teacher's desk. Furniture and other fittings were to be arranged in such a way that the pupils would never escape the teacher's eye ... The committee firmly forbade the use of corporal punishment, arguing that a teacher who hit a pupil was clearly a poor teacher (Gemie, 1992, pp.142-143).

The eradication of illiteracy in France took place relatively slowly over a long period from the seventeenth to the twentieth century.

| TABLE 4.2 - ILLITERACY RATES IN FRANCE, 1686-1876 |
|-------------------------------|-------------|
| Males % | Females % |
| 1686-1690  | 71 | 86 |
| 1786-1790  | 53 | 73 |
| 1816-1820  | 46 | 66 |
| 1872-1876  | 23 | 33 |

(Weiffenhan, 1992, p.149).
Geographically, the transition from a predominantly oral to a largely literate culture was characterized by 'persistently higher levels of illiteracy in southern and western France than in northern and eastern parts of the country' (Heffernan, 1992, p.149). By the end of the nineteenth century, 'there can be little doubt that the State or Church primary school had become the dominant institution in the eradication of popular illiteracy' (Heffernan, 1992, p.151).

4.2 - MARCELLIN CHAMPAGNAT AND THE MARIST BROTHERS

This section will 'tell the story' (in summary form) of Marcellin Champagnat and the Marist Brothers. Fairly descriptive on the surface, the account will be structured around the events and the character traits, in the lives of both the man and his movement, which are understood to be crucial in the Marist Brother tradition. In the main, this section seeks simply to articulate the general Marist understanding of its own history.

TABLE 4.3 - OVERVIEW OF THE HISTORY OF THE MARIST BROTHERS' CONGREGATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>EVENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1789</td>
<td>MARCELLIN CHAMPAGNAT BORN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1800</td>
<td>BEGINS SCHOOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1803</td>
<td>STUDIES UNDER HIS BROTHER-IN-LAW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1805</td>
<td>ENTERS THE MINOR SEMINARY AT VERRIERES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1812</td>
<td>JEAN CLAUDE COURVIELLE INSPIRED TO FOUND A SOCIETY OF MARY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1813</td>
<td>MARCELLIN ENTERS THE MAJOR SEMINARY AT LYONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1816</td>
<td>ORDAINED</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1817</td>
<td>FOUNDING EXPERIENCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1818</td>
<td>STARTS CONGREGATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1824</td>
<td>RELIEVED OF PARISH DUTIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1836</td>
<td>BROTHERS SENT TO OCEANIA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1837</td>
<td>JEAN-CLAUDE COLIN ELECTED SUPERIOR GENERAL OF THE MARIST PRIESTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1838</td>
<td>MARCELLIN TAKES VOWS AS A MARIST PRIEST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1839</td>
<td>FIRST RULES PRINTED</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1840</td>
<td>MARCELLIN CHAMPAGNAT DIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1851</td>
<td>LEGAL RECOGNITION OF INSTITUTE BY FRENCH GOVERNMENT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8 The French people's appreciation of schools where members of religious congregations taught is well illustrated in Gibson (1985b, pp.122, 129, 130 and 234 (Farrell, 1992, Corr.).

9 This coincided with the granting of legal recognition of the Marist Fathers by Church authorities in Rome (Forissier, 1992, p.116).
1852 BROTHERS SENT TO LONDON
1856 PUBLICATION OF THE LIFE OF MARCELLIN CHAMPAGNAT
1863 LEGAL RECOGNITION OF INSTITUTE BY CHURCH
  AUTHORITIES
1903 BROTHERS EXPELLED FROM SCHOOLS IN FRANCE BY THE
  COMBES LAW AND MOVE
  TO OTHER COUNTRIES
1914 BROTHERS LIVING OUTSIDE FRANCE DRAFTED INTO
  FRENCH ARMY
1936 BROTHERS KILLED IN SPANISH CIVIL WAR
1939 ADMINISTRATION RETURNS TO FRANCE
1947 GOVERNMENT OF BRAZIL PRODUCES A POSTAGE STAMP
  IN HONOUR OF THE
  50TH ANNIVERSARY OF THE ARRIVAL OF THE MARIST
  BROTHERS
1949 BROTHERS EXPELLED FROM CHINA
1955 CHURCH BEATIFIES MARCELLIN CHAMPAGNAT
1961 BROTHERS EXPELLED FROM CUBA
1967 BROTHERS BEGIN TO ADAPT TO VATICAN II
1976 BROTHERS WELCOME BLACKS INTO THEIR SCHOOLS IN
  SOUTH AFRICA
1985 OFFICIAL LAUNCHING OF THE CHAMPAGNAT MOVEMENT
1986 AUTHORITIES IN ROME APPROVE NEW CONSTITUTIONS
1991 BROTHER ASSASSINATED IN GUATEMALA

(Farrell, 1984, p.173; McMahon, 1988, p.22; Furet, 1989, p.557; MB, 1990,
  p.34; Coste, 1990, p.7; Michel, 1992, p.3; Voegtle, 1992, Int. BAY.).

FOUNDER'S GROWING PAINS  Marcellin Champagnat was born
the ninth of ten children at Rosey, a hamlet of the parish of
Marlhes10 in the Department of the Loire, in south-east
France in 1789.

Marcellin's parents had their own farm which
they worked, with help; whilst they were also
licensed to sell cloth and lace. As their family
grew ... the farm assumed greater importance
and they milled grain in a small shed built near
their other house on a running creek whose
water provided the power for turning the mill
(Farrell, 1984, p.9).

His father, Jean Baptiste, had a good command of the French
language. Described as a man of some education, he was
officially known as a cultivateur11. Such people exerted the
strongest revolutionary influence in rural France, welcoming
its ideals and the success it could give them (Farrell, 1984,
p.9). In June 1791, he was appointed Town Clerk of Marlhes
and, a month later, was commissioned as Colonel of the
National Guard. He was regarded as an associate of the

10 Marlhes then had a population of 2,700. It was situated in mountainous
  country, 75 km south west of Lyons and 545 km from Paris (Farrell, 1984,
p.6).
11 This term was applied to the better-off peasant proprietors (Farrell,
  1984, p.8).
Jacquelin Club, declaring on 14th July, 1791¹² 'Our rights were unknown, we have discovered them; the new Constitution is written, now we must support it'. Yet, as McMahon explains, 'later, we can discern a diminution of this fervour when the national government took those extreme social measures which gave pause to moderates who had been early supporters' (1988, p.1). Marcellin's mother, Marie Therese, is described as an excellent housewife and mother, content to devote her energies to the care of her family and her home. She was not so affected by revolutionary ideas as was her husband, who was ten years younger than she, and her deep sense of religion became the more and more intensified as the practice of her faith became the more difficult (Gibson, 1971, p.52).

Two religious sisters lived in the Champagnat household - one an aunt of Jean-Baptiste, the other his sister (Dorrian, 1975, p.17; Farrell, 1992, Corr.). Marcellin was caught between two complementary influences - that of his mother and the religious sisters, from whom his faith received great nourishment and from whom he learnt to read and write,¹³ and that of his father from whose political activities he got a certain sympathy for the new ideas which prompted his interest in poor children and his reactions to the clergy of his time. His father was also an example of determined yet prudent daring, fearlessness and uncomplicated authority, slight remoteness and a striking sense of reality in the fluctuations of public affairs (Forissier, 1992, p.48).

Marcellin was manually inclined, learning from his father how to farm, build, work a mill and transact business (ibid., pp.48-49). He was not gifted with his studies nor enamoured of school. When on first attending school he witnessed his teacher unjustly strike a blow to the ear of another student, Marcellin, still only eleven years of age, was so incensed by the incident as to decide his first day at this school would be his last. And it was (MB, 1990, p.10; Farrell, 1984, p.25). He also disapproved of the curate's catechism classes 'because he used to laugh at certain children and

¹² The second anniversary of the Fall of the Bastille (Farrell, 1984, p.12).
¹³ Marcellin learnt to read and write mainly from his aunt Tante Marie-Rose who had been turned out of her convent of the Sisters of St. Joseph when the law of 1793 closed the religious houses of France (Gibson, 1971, p.53).
give them nicknames' (Forissier, 1992, p.49). Again when at the age of 14, Marcellin felt called to become a priest and went to St. Sauveur to study under Benoit Arnaud, his brother-in-law, for whom teaching was an occasional profession, he found himself making little progress. After two years, Arnaud told Marcellin: 'Sooner or later, and the sooner the better, you will give it up, and you will regret having caused so much expense, for having wasted your time and perhaps ruined your health'. He brought Marcellin home and told his mother: 'Your boy is obstinate in his desire to study, but you would be wrong in allowing him to do so; he has too few talents to succeed'. When Marcellin, nevertheless, entered the junior seminary at Verrieres in 1805, he was told at the end of his first academic year that he was not fitted for the priesthood and must not return to the seminary. After the parish priest of Marlières, Fr. Allirot, responding to a request of Marcellin's mother, interceded with the Seminary authorities, Marcellin was readmitted (Farrell, 1984, pp.25-27; MB, 1990, p.12; Forissier, 1992, p.51 and p.53).

'Obstinacy' it transpired had won through in the end because from that point Marcellin made steady progress. In 1813, at the age of twenty-four and after eight years at Verrieres, Marcellin entered the major seminary of St. Irenaeus in Lyons where he stayed for three years (McMahon, 1988, p.19). He did not, however, forget his sustained experience of disadvantage and difficulty nor the friends of his youth who worked on farms and had received no formal education and no religious instruction. He wanted to rectify this situation (MB, 1990, p.10). Farrell contends Marcellin bitterly regretted not having a school education in his early youth, suggesting he 'contrasted his academic shortcomings with the outstanding intellectual talents of his father' (1984, p.48). In any case, Marcellin began to feel God was assigning him a task — to found a group of teaching brothers.

14 This was the year the Pope reaffirmed the cult of Our Lady at the basilica of Fourviere (Dorrian, 1975, p.17).
15 July/August 1806 (Farrell, 1984, p.27).
Naturally, his eleven years of seminary life guided the development of his spirituality in decisive ways. Key to this influence was the strong current of Sulpician spirituality, involving especially great devotion to the Eucharist which characterised the two seminaries and, very particularly, the Marist group that formed within the latter (Gibson, 1971, p.54 and p.57).

Like many of the seminarians, Marcellin had great devotion to Mary, the Mother of Jesus. He saw her as exemplifying the way to respond to the call of God in her 'yes' to God's invitation to become the mother of Jesus. He saw her as a quiet, but significant influence in the life of Jesus, as well as prayerful and decisive in the lives of the apostles and in the early Church (MB, 1990, p.13). This understanding grew during his time at the seminary where he came in contact with the French School of Marian spirituality that stemmed from 'Berulle, Gibieuf, Olier, Eudes, Condren, Francis de Sales and Grignon de Montfort'. The thinking of these mainly seventeenth century theologians focused on two key insights: first, 'Mary is never to be considered in isolation but in a trinitarian and Christological setting', and second, Mary's 'fiat' to becoming the Mother of Jesus, profoundly influenced her spiritual life (Gibson, 1971, pp.93-96).

On August 15th, 1812, fellow-seminarian Jean-Claude Courveille, while praying in the cathedral at Le Puy in central France, was inspired to found a Society of Mary to combat the unbelief of the period. He gathered together a group of seminarians, including Marcelin, who subsequently met periodically, reflecting, praying and dreaming of the future. Eventually this group decided they wanted to found a 'Society of Mary' just as Ignatius of Loyola had founded a 'Society of Jesus' (Gibson, 1989a, pp.163-164; Forissier, 1992, p.19 and p.91).

The general scheme was that they would endeavour to form an all-embracing Society of Mary in which the priests would be joined by auxiliary brothers, cloistered sisters and lay tertiaries. The assumption was that the Society
of Mary had to begin with and primarily be, at all times, a society of priests. These ideas were common to all except the 'stormy petrel'\(^{16}\) of the group, Marcellin Champagnat. Champagnat, at the first meeting he attended, proposed the idea of his founding a branch of teaching brothers. 'I shall be happy to help procure for others', said the earthily direct Champagnat, 'the advantages I was deprived of myself'. Champagnat conceived the Society of Mary as being an organisation of associated congregations loosely linked under a Superior-General-priest. Champagnat's ideas were not welcome to the other members, but his stubborn persistence eventually led them to agree that teaching brothers would be a branch of the Society of Mary and their foundation would be the personal responsibility of Champagnat (Farrell, 1984, p.48).

On July 22nd. 1816 Marcellin Champagnat was ordained a priest. On the following day, twelve young priests and seminarians from this group formalised their commitment to establishing the Marist project, pledging their lives with an act of foundation at a special Mass in the chapel of Fourviere, Lyons (MB, 1990, p.13). With this solemn promise, the Society of Mary was born. A few days later, Marcellin returned to Notre Dame de Fourvieres to consecrate his own life and ministry to Mary, the Mother of God (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.2).

Marcellin's first appointment was as assistant priest in the parish of La Valla-en-Gier, a small rural village perched on the hillside of Mt. Pilat, south west of Lyons (MB, 1990, p.8; Moraldo, 1991, p.4). La Valla's population of two thousand 'was mostly scattered amongst deep valleys or on steep heights' (Furet, 1989, p.34). The number of illiterates was high and half the funerals were of children less than ten years of age. The population was virtually all Catholic, but during the Revolution their church was open only on the 'decade' days for the worship of the goddess of reason (Farrell, 1984, p.57). Nevertheless these local people were among the most resistant to the new religious ways - both to the cult of the goddess of reason and of the 'Supreme Being'.\(^{17}\) They protected their parish priest, Gaumond, as

---

17 Robespierre, since he was a sincere deist, advocated the cult of the Supreme Being (Michel, 1992, Corr. p.1).
much as possible until he was captured shortly after Robespierre's death and became the last in the area to be guillotined (Michel, 1992, Corr., p.1). The new curate visited the sick, spoke with farmers and helped teach the children in their homes.

Family life [of the people of La Valla] was solidly established by tradition, by religion, by respect for authority ... When several generations lived under one roof, respect for grandparents was sacred; the authority of father and mother was not questioned; children spoken to as "thou" did not answer their parents in that way; it was the father who sat first at table, shared the bread and asked the blessing; examples of disrespect seem to have been rare; the education of children, imparted orally and tenderly, was based on the inflexible laws of work and respect (Galley, 1904, quoted in Farrell, 1984, pp.57-58).

From the beginning, Marcellin gave priority to the children's education, particularly their faith education. He experienced the immense spiritual poverty of many young people left to their own devices. The intense national interest in education encouraged him in his plans to found a society of teaching Brothers (Farrell, 1984, p.63). Such an order could show young people the meaning of human and Christian life (MB, 1990, p.15). La Valla was located in the St. Etienne district, Departement of Loire, 'in which Departement primary schools virtually disappeared during the Revolution' (Farrell, 1984, p.62). In 1816 it had a boys' school but because the teacher was a 'drunkard' it was soon to lose pupils to the school Marcellin was about to establish (Farrell, 1984, pp.63-64).

FOUNDING EXPERIENCE On October 28th, 1816, 'an event took place that convinced Marcellin he must immediately set about the founding of a teaching congregation' (Farrell, 1984, p.64; McMahon, 1992, Corr.). He had been called to a carpenter's home in Les Palais, a hamlet near La Valla, where a seventeen year old boy, Jean-Baptiste Montagne, lay seriously ill. Asked about God he replied 'God? Who is that?' (quoted in Farrell, 1984, p.64). Marcellin spent two hours instructing him in the basic Christian beliefs, heard his confession and prepared him to die in good dispositions.
Returning a few hours later he found the boy had died. For Marcellin this was an experience of the Spirit, and is seen as crucial in his life by his followers. A typical reflection:

... he was overtaken, totally grasped by the love that Jesus and Mary had for him and for others. That personal religious experience lay at the centre, shaping his consciousness of reality, informing his values and attitudes, fashioning the way he read the Gospels and was captured by particular emphases, creating the frame of the window through which he looked at God, himself and others, influencing his preferences and choices and actions, his style of relating, his manner of praying and living, and his imparting of all this to his [future] Brothers (Crowe, 1990, Corr.).

Deciding he could wait no longer, Marcellin went immediately to a young acquaintance, Jean-Marie Granjon, whom he had invited to live near the church so he could teach him to read and write and asked him to become the first member of a community of teaching Brothers (Farrell, 1984, pp.64-65; Forissier, 1992, p.57).

FOUNDING EVENTS On January 2nd, 1817, Marcellin, now 28, brought Jean-Marie Granjon, aged 22, and Jean-Baptiste Audras, a boy of 14 whom Marcellin had met in La Valla and who had previously agreed to join him in his project, to a small and simple house he had bought in La Valla, now described as the 'cradle of the Institute'. There the two began living in community and the Marist Brothers' Congregation had begun (Farrell, 1984, pp.64-66; Wade, 1989, p.5). The two commenced a time of formation devoted to prayer, study and manual work (MB, 1990, p.26). During the next few years the steadily expanding community gathered around Marcellin as their 'father figure', living a frugal fraternal and 'family' life. Marcellin would insist: 'to be happy in community, you are not to think of yourself as a servant, but as a member of the family'.

18 Jean-Baptiste knew how to read and write. A spiritual book had led him to apply to join the De La Salle Brothers but he was told he was too young and should speak to his confessor about his religious vocation. He did so to Fr. Champagnat who invited him to join his first recruits (Forissier, 1992, p.57).

19 This attitude is seen to result from Marcellin's experience in his own family (Gibson, 1971, p.48). For a discussion of servanthood in contemporary theology see Moran (1992).
destined to become Marcellin Champagnat's first successor - joined the Congregation at the age of 10\textsuperscript{20} (Farrell, 1984, p.253; Forissier, 1992, p.58). The number of young men joining Champagnat's group began to grow rapidly. To supplement what income he could spare from his salary as a curate, Marcellin helped the Brothers make nails which they sold (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.4). (Such paid manual work was also to enable the Brothers to welcome the very poor into their schools). In his dealings with them, Marcellin was profoundly conscious of his responsibility to the founding vision he believed to be God's gift to him.

Hence he did not fail to return to the topic again and again, illuminating the subject from different angles, straining with words to open to his Brothers, the inner vision that he had of what it is to be a Marist Brother (Gibson, 1971, p.119).

He told them:

All we do now shall be published one day and shall serve as a rule of conduct for those who will come after us\textsuperscript{21} (quoted in MB, 1936, p.19).

As if anticipating Max Weber he added:

the first Brothers must be perfect religious, so as to serve as models for those who will follow them in the future. It is rare that later generations surpass the first Brothers in fervour and virtue. Our future Brothers, then, will be what we are, and the example we set will mark a limit that will rarely be crossed (quoted in Prieur, 1991, p.9).

He experienced the strengths and weaknesses of his newborn community, the departure of the very first member, the arrival of others and the way the members drew energy from community life marked by humility and simplicity (MB, 1990, p.15). Marcellin shared every facet of his own life with the

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{20} Gabriel Rivat was born in 1808 in a hamlet which was part of the town of La Valla. Soon after joining the Congregation in which he was given the name Br. Francois, he was sent to teach in the primary school at Marlhes and at the age of 17 was named principal of another school. At 19, Br. Francois was appointed superior of the Mother House and was described as the Founder's 'right-hand man' (Michel, 1992, p.3). At 31, his Brothers elected him Director General of the Congregation.
\textsuperscript{21} Accounts of the lives of seventeen Brothers were published soon after Marcellin's death. In introducing the 1936 edition of this text the authors declare:

Those early pioneers were not perhaps men of great talent, or remarkable for their learning, but they form the glory of the Institute by the fact that they were the living models of the Rule and of all the virtues that should adorn a true Marist Brother (MB, 1936, p.5).
\end{flushleft}
Brothers.

Despite - or because of - his own difficulties at school - for Marcellin the school provided 'the most suitable means for training the young in their faith' (MBS, 1969, p.13). To tend to the vocational training of his recruits, he acquired the services of a teacher from a nearby hamlet, Claude Maisonneuve, a former De La Salle Brother. As well as training the Brothers in the theory and practice of teaching, Claude started the first Brothers' school in the Brothers' house. In May 1818, first the young recruits observed him teach, helping at times with the classes. By the end of the summer, when Claude returned to his own school, the Brothers were able to continue the new school. Among their students were orphans and abandoned children (McMahon, 1988, pp.50-52). On Thursdays and Sundays the Brothers used, in addition, to travel to outlying hamlets 'to catechise and give elementary instruction to children unable to attend school'22 (Forissier, 1992, p.59). In 1818, after repeated requests from the parish priest of Marlies, his native village, Marcellin sent two Brothers to open a school. Br. Jean-Baptiste Audras, then 16, was Headmaster of the school and Br. Antoine Couturier, 18, his assistant (Forissier, 1992, p.59).

During the eighteenth century, the De La Salle Brothers had established 'the model on which to base a Brothers' Congregation' (Flood, 1991, Int. AMHS; Duffy, 1991, Int. DUB.). One of their rules, which required they must never go to an establishment with fewer than three Brothers, meant they were too expensive for many rural areas. They also 'opposed the collection of school fees, demanding their upkeep come from the parish priest and/or the town council' and expected payment of 600 francs per Brother (Farrell, 1984, p.196). Marcellin was later to explain his own more flexible (and cheaper) position in a letter to Archbishop de Pins of Lyons23:

22 Fr Champagnat felt it was important for his Brothers not only to be understand their students but also their families (Forissier, 1992, p.63).
23 The letter was written on 3rd February, 1838 (Voegtle, 1992, Int. BAY.).
I believed I must make statutes in favour of country people: firstly, that the Institute of the Little Brothers of Mary [Marist Brothers] could form establishments with only two Brothers, and, where there was the need, one could establish a central house from whence single Brothers could go to nearby communes; secondly that this Institute would give Brothers to those communes which would assure us of 1,600 francs for four Brothers, 1,200 francs for three, 1,000 francs for two; thirdly, that those communes less able to pay the required money be aided by a monthly payment from the better-off parents to cover the cost of the establishment.

When this is understood, it is easy to see that the teaching of the Little Brothers of Mary, far from being a hindrance to the work of the excellent De La Salle Brothers, would only perfect it and make it more complete, allowing country people to gain a similar result for their society and religion that the De La Salle Brothers are able to give to those in the towns (Champagnat (1838) quoted in Farrell, 1984, p.207).

The first Marist Schools came under the jurisdiction of the University of Lyons and were initially run only during winter so that the children could work with their parents on the farms during the warmer weather - such family labour was simply a requirement for survival (Farrell, 1992, Corr.). By 1821, with less than ten Brothers, there were five schools. Everything was done with enthusiasm. There was no hesitation 'about appointing Directors and teachers who were no more than sixteen years of age' (Forissier, 1992, p.60). By 1822, Marcellin had introduced boarding into some of these schools (Wade, 1989, pp.5-6).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>LOCATION</th>
<th>TEACHERS</th>
<th>STUDENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1818</td>
<td>Lavalla</td>
<td>2 Brothers</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1819</td>
<td>Le Bessat</td>
<td>1 Catechist</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1819</td>
<td>Marlies</td>
<td>2 Brothers</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1820</td>
<td>St. Sauveur</td>
<td>2 Brothers</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1822</td>
<td>Bourg-Argental</td>
<td>3 Brothers</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1822</td>
<td>Tarentaise</td>
<td>2 Brothers</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1823</td>
<td>Vanosc</td>
<td>2 Brothers</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1823</td>
<td>St. Symphorien</td>
<td>3 Brothers</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

24 The first Marist Brothers' Schools are recorded in the French National Archives (Farrell, 1984, p.106 and p.254; Michel, 1992, Corr., p.1).
25 There were carefully prescribed regulations for the conduct of these schools to make sure the children in them remained healthy and well cared for (Wade, 1989, pp.5-6).
After visiting the four Marist Brothers' schools in his area, the Prefect of Rhone observed:

The teaching Brothers (of this Institute) are somewhat weaker as teachers than those who teach in departmental schools and even those who teach in the schools of the De La Salle Brothers. However, it must be understood that this Institute is in its beginning stage and, perhaps, has been too readily obliged to accept demands for its services.

He added:

As for the clergy of the diocese, they are not in favour of primary education, but if it is given they very much want it given by religious teachers. Without the Marists, there would be no teachers at all in the small communes (quoted in Farrell, 1984, pp.208-209).

In 1824, Archbishop de Pins invited Marcellin to become parish priest of La Valla, but then acceded to Marcellin's counter request to be relieved of his duties as curate in order to devote all his time to his Brothers, and presented him with Frs. 8,000 towards the construction of a bigger house for his work (Farrell, 1984, pp.93-94; Forissier, 1992, p.65). Marcellin selected a spot for a new building on the banks of the Gier River, where he would have plenty of water both for domestic use, as well as to provide power for his workshops (Sheils, 1991a, Int. SMA). Twenty young Brothers from La Valla got to work, one became a mason, another a stonecutter and together with some local tradespeople they constructed the 5 storey building out of local materials on a difficult site in a steep valley (Forissier, 1992, p.66). Marcellin was not only the leader and architect but also the most determined worker as one of his teenage Brothers remarked:

When there were some large stones to carry, it was always he himself who carried them. It took two of us to load them on his back. Never did he get angry with our awkwardness ... When he came in the evening, it often happened that he was in tatters, all covered with sweat and dust.

26 This was in accordance with the belief that no one should be educated above his or her state of life (Farrell, 1984, p.338).
He was never more content than when he had worked hard and suffered much (quoted in Wade, 1989, p.6).

Such involvement in manual work was not characteristic of French cures of that time - or any other.

Passing through La Valla, a churchman who found Fr Champagnat on a scaffolding - 'soutane white with dust, hands covered in mortar' - could not but exclaim, 'that type of occupation is hardly suited to a priest.' 'This work,' Fr Champagnat replied, 'is in no way disrespectful to my ministry. Many churchmen spend time at less useful occupations' (Forissier, 1992, p.62).

In 1825 the Brothers moved into their new home which they named 'The Hermitage'. There Marcellin lived and worked among the Brothers, continuing to help and form them. When the Brothers were sufficiently prepared he offered their services to the authorities who were seeking teachers (MBS, 1969, p.33). At the end of each school year Marcellin expected the Brothers to return from their local Marist communities to the Hermitage, not only for manual work, but also for instruction (Alexius, 1991, Int. AMHS; Flood, 1991, Int. AMHS). In 1829 Marcellin wrote his first circular letter, addressing the Brothers on religious and pedagogical topics (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.5).

During the last fifteen years of his life (1825-1840) Marcellin's work became widely appreciated. He was renowned for his prudence and courage in training young men to become 'zealous and effective teachers' (Thomas, 1961, AMHS Doc., p.5; Voegtle, 1992, Int. BAY.).

Not satisfied with familiarizing his disciples with pedagogic theory, he frequently visited the schools to see how the Brothers put it into actual practice. He questioned the pupils less to test their knowledge than to discover if the lessons had been understood and taking the teacher's place he gave the latter a practical demonstration of what he considered an ideal lesson (Albert, 1940, quoted in Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, pp.5-6).

In 1830, each Brother was given a handwritten copy of Marcellin's proposed Rules for the Institute. The Brothers had plenty of time to test the proposals. In 1837, after each
Brother had let Marcellin know his thoughts on each proposed article, he and the elder Brothers published the first Rule for the Congregation27 (Farrell, 1984, p.151).

Meantime, in 1836, the first Brothers went to work in the Pacific area, thus fulfilling a dream that Marcellin shared with many other founding people of religious congregations. He insisted: 'every diocese in the world figures in our plans' (quoted in Moraldo, 1991, p.5). He selected three Brothers initially to accompany Bishop Pompallier and four other Marist priests and during the next four years released a further twelve Brothers for this work. (By 1858 thirty more had followed). Marcellin would have gone himself if it wasn't for his responsibilities at home and the state of his health. These Brothers were employed in Australia (Sydney), New Zealand and New Caledonia, as 'catechists, cooks, bakers, gardeners, tailors, shoe-makers, builders of churches, presbyteries, and even boats for the service of the missionaries' (Doyle, 1972, p.4; Farrell, 1984, p.172). (Marcellin did not send Brothers to work with the Marist Fathers in other contexts because of differing perceptions the two founders held concerning the role of the Brothers. Jean Claude Colin wanted the Marist Brothers to act as lay Brothers to the Marist Fathers, whereas Marcellin Champagnat saw his Brothers as teachers (Voegtle, 1992, Int. BAY.)).

By the late 1830s Marcellin's health had begun to fail. After seeking advice from Fr. Colin, the Superior General of the Marist Fathers, Marcellin decided his successor should be appointed (Farrell, 1992, Corr.). In 1839, Br. Francois was elected the Congregation's first Superior General and given two Assistants. Until then, Marcellin had remained the immediate major superior of all the houses. Early in 1840, the city of St. Etienne had asked for Brothers to establish a place there for deaf and dumb children. Marcellin sought admission for two of his Brothers to the Demonstration School in Paris for the deaf and dumb, so that they could prepare themselves for this work (Farrell, 1984, p.230). This was one

of his last acts. Shortly before he died on June 6th, 1840, Marcellin ‘entrusted his spiritual testament and apostolic mandate’ to his followers to educate the youth of the world (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.6).

At the time of his death there were 280 Brothers, including 180 teaching in 48 schools in France and Oceania with a total enrolment of 7,000 students, and 85 requests for the establishment of further schools. 92 Brothers had left the Congregation and 49 had died (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.6; MB, 1990, p.8; Wade, 1989, p.9; Forissier, 1992, p.86).

Who then was this Marcellin Champagnat? He was a man who had difficulty with learning but established a congregation of teachers; a man who revelled in manual work; a man of exceptional determination; a man of action compared to some of the other Marist founding people and a man of prayer28 who found it as easy to be recollected in the streets of Paris as in the countryside of La Valla. The Church for him was a family, the family of God and of Mary, Mother and prophetic witness to the goodness of God. In 1896, Pope Leo XIII decreed Marcellin 'Venerable' and in 1955 Pope Pius XII presided at the ceremony which proclaimed him 'Blessed'. His cause for canonisation as a saint is under study (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.7).

EXPANSION OF THE MOVEMENT After Marcellin's death Br. Francois oversaw steady growth in the congregation.

- In 1842, the Provinces of St Paul Trois Chateaux and the North (Beaucamps) were separated from the home Province. Francois' two Assistants initially undertook the supervision of the 'outside' Provinces but in time and in view of the difficulties of travel, local 'Visitors' came to be appointed for the purpose of visiting a house or group of houses and reporting back.

- On June 20th, 1851, by a decree of Louis Napoleon, the

28 One of Marcellin’s favourite prayers comes from Psalm 127: ‘Unless the Lord builds the house, those who build it labor in vain’ (Forissier, 1992, p.81).
government had legally recognised the Congregation throughout all French-controlled territory, thus dispensing Brothers from military service (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.6; 1991, MPBRC, p.121).

- In England in 1850 Pope Pius IX had restored the hierarchy which had been suppressed for nearly three hundred years and on December 31st, 1852 the first Marist Brothers' foundation outside France was made in London at St. Anne's, Whitechapel (Bethnal Green) in the East End (MPBRC, 1991, p.216; Mannion, 1992b, Int. LON.) where the Brothers established a free secondary school for boys. It is said that the Brothers became known as 'ministers to those most in need' (Ventham, 1991, p.6).

- The 53 Brothers who participated in the 1852-1854 General Chapter, most of whom had received their training from Marcellin Champagnat, strove 'to preserve the customs established by him and to perpetuate his spirit amongst the Brothers'. They wrote:

Very dear Brothers, we believe it worthwhile to point out to you that the Rules and Constitutions are not ours: they are our beloved Father's. They may not all have been written by his hand, but they are still his, for we have gleaned them from his writings or from customs that he set going amongst us. They are the faithful expression of his will, and enshrine his spirit, that is, his way of practising virtue, of training and directing the Brothers and of doing good amongst the children (Furet, 1989, pp.260-261).

At the 1852 session the 'Regles Communes' were approved, in 1853 the 'Guide des Ecoles' and in the final session in 1854 the 'Constitutions' (Delorme, 1990, MB Arc. Rome).

- In 1863, the Congregation was officially approved by church authorities in Rome as the 'Marist Brothers of the Schools'29 thereby making them independent of the Marist priests. In that year there were 2,000 Brothers teaching in 374 schools (Moraldo, 1991, p.5; Michel, 1992, p.3). 1863 was also the year that Br. Francois resigned as Superior General.

29 The Brothers were originally called 'The Little Brothers of Mary'. In 1863, the authorities in Rome gave the Brothers the additional and official name of: 'Marist Brothers of the Schools' (Michel, 1992, p.5).
He had guided the Congregation through a period of great expansion, obtained legal recognition for the Institute from the French Government in 1851 and Church authorities in Rome in 1863. These legalisations enabled the Congregation to extend its work both in its country of origin and throughout the world. It is for these reasons that Michel describes Br. François as the 'co-founder' of the Marist Brothers (1992, p.3) - Max Weber would prefer to see these events as illustrative of the effective handing on of the Founder's charism.

Voegtle, a recognised scholar and historian of the Order, in referring to Weber's theory of routinisation, believes the Marist Brothers became 'very routinised, formalised and structured' after the General Chapter of 1852 to 1854 (1991, Corr.). He sees the documentation produced by the Chapter providing the Congregation's 'theoretical framework'. However, he believes, it was the second General, Br. Louis Marie, the Congregation's first qualified teacher and 'a very different type from François', who applied the theory in a new way during his term of office from 1860 to 1879. He made 'a lot of changes which François would never have made ... because he [Louis Marie] wanted to do exactly what Fr. Champagnat did' (Voegtle, 1992, Int. BAY.). Br. Pat Sheils, another Marist historian, contends it was during this period that the original Marist educational vision was first 'restricted down to the schools' - and that during the time of the fourth Superior General 30, Br. Theophane, 1883 to 1907, it was narrowed further. This, he insists, provided a sharp contrast to Champagnat who 'had a much broader vision' running old mens' homes, orphanages and workshops (1991a, Int. SMA).

Cada et al. recommend exploring the interrelationship between the founding person and each of the original members as well as between the founding person and the

---

30 The Superiors General of the Congregation are:

A certain hermeneutical approach in studying this interrelationship might reveal, for example, that certain elements considered essential or basic by the founder may not have been implemented because of certain limitations in the original group … Viewed from a certain historical distance, however, these basic elements can be rediscovered and now implemented, the previous limitations no longer binding (Cada et al., 1985, p.177)

By 1886, members of the Congregation were working in 16 countries (Michel, 1976, p.259).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>COUNTRY</th>
<th>FIRST HOUSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1817</td>
<td>FRANCE</td>
<td>LA VALLA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1836</td>
<td>OCEANIA</td>
<td>WITH MARIST PRIESTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1852</td>
<td>ENGLAND</td>
<td>LONDON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1856</td>
<td>BELGIUM</td>
<td>FLEURUS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>SCOTLAND</td>
<td>GLASGOW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1862</td>
<td>IRELAND</td>
<td>SLIGO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867</td>
<td>SOUTH AFRICA</td>
<td>CAPE TOWN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1868</td>
<td>LEBANON</td>
<td>GHAZIR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1872</td>
<td>AUSTRALIA</td>
<td>SYDNEY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1873</td>
<td>NEW CALEDONIA</td>
<td>NOUHEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1876</td>
<td>NEW ZEALAND</td>
<td>WELLINGTON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1884</td>
<td>SEYCHELLES</td>
<td>MAHE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1885</td>
<td>CANADA</td>
<td>IBERVILLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>SPAIN</td>
<td>GERONA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ITALY</td>
<td>ROME</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNITED STATES</td>
<td>LEWISTON</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Meanwhile, between 1881 and 1885, the secularisation laws of Jules Ferry had begun to force the Brothers out of public schools (MB, 1990, p.9). By 1891, 83 of the 87 Marist schools in France had been laicised (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.8; Michel, 1976, p.171). After the passage of the Combes Law in 1903, all Marist schools were secularised. Since the Brothers were told 'join the army or get out' (Flood, 1991, Int. AMHS) 645 French Brothers (534 in 1903 and 110 in 1904) went into exile founding 76 new establishments in countries outside Europe, particularly in South America (Michel, 1976, pp.183–185; Sheils, 1991a, Int. SMA; Duffy, 1991, Int. DUB.). For Br. Gabriel Michel and others 'C'était un désastre sans précédent dans notre histoire' (Michel, 1976, p.194; Sheils, 1991a, Int. SMA).
The French Sectarian Laws of 1903 struck a heavy blow to the Marist family, as the major portion of the 700 and more schools that the congregation had in that country were forcibly closed. However, a number of brothers ardently devoted to the cause of religious instruction, remained in the country and strove to carry on the work of Christian education. These Brothers were forced to adopt the mode of life of the people among whom they labored (Hamel, 1940 quoted in Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.8).

While many Brothers were condemned for reconstituting communities, 'these stupidities lasted only a few years' because nobody could impede 2 or 3 people from living together. The 'true rage', Michel observes, was against 'the idea of vows' (1992, Corr., pp.1-2).

For the next 40 years Brothers remained in France as an 'underground group' (MB, 1990, p.9; Moraldo, 1991, p.5). From 1903 till 1920, the remains of Marcellin Champagnat were hidden in a niche in 'Maisonettes', the house where Gabriel Rivat (Br. Francois) was born (FMSEC, 1988a, p.3). The College at Beaucamps, which had always welcomed a considerable number of English boarders, was transferred to Grove Ferry, England, and a house was bought at Battle, near Hastings to accommodate those Brothers who were learning English prior to going to work in other countries (Clare, 1968, Doc. SMA, p.86; Sheils, 1989, Doc. SMA, p.18).

The period after 1903 became regarded as 'a great diaspora' with new Marist foundations emerging far more numerously than would have happened if it were not for the Sectarian Laws (Sheils, 1991a, Int. SMA). In addition, at the Congregation's tenth General Chapter in France in 1903, the superiors were ordered by Church authorities in Rome31 'to promulgate a new constitution for the Institute and to canonically erect autonomous provinces wherever possible32

31 In 1901, Church authorities in Rome issued a set of norms, like draft constitutions, telling all religious congregations to 'include these points' in their constitutions. Since the Marist Superiors 'were not willing to make those changes ... Rome simply rewrote our Constitutions and officially proposed them as such' (Voegtle, 1992, Int. BAY.).
32 These provinces were to function under the authority of a provincial, who also had 'canonical status' (Sheils, 1989, Doc. SMA, p.8.). The Province of North America was created in 1903. Canada and the United States became separate provinces in 1911 (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.15; Voegtle, 1992, Int. BAY.).

137
20TH CENTURY: STABILISATION

One feature of 20th Century Marist history has been the periodic loss of life in some of the century's great upheavals. Eight Brothers and one postulant were martyred during the Boxer rebellion in China in 1900 (Thomas, 1961, Doc. AMHS, p.134; Voegtle, 1992, Int. BAY). 118, out of 1037 Brothers involved, were killed in the First World War. The ravages of the Spanish Civil War caused 176 Brothers to lose their lives. While the Sino-Japanese War and World War II not only took the lives of many Brothers they also 'destroyed millions of dollars of property'. By 1938 the number of German Brothers was reduced from 340 to 240 due to Nazi persecutions (Michel, 1976, p.36 and p.198). In 1949 Mao Tse-Tung imprisoned or expelled all the Brothers in China. They spread out to Hong Kong, Taiwan, Singapore and Malaysia, opening new schools in all these countries (MB, 1990, p.9). In 1961, the Brothers were expelled from Cuba. They spread throughout Central America and into Ecuador. Recent foundations include Ghana, Haiti, Honduras, Kenya, Liberia and Tanzania (MB, 1990, p.9; Voegtle, 1992, Int. BAY.). The most recent killing occurred in 1991, when Br. Moises Cisneros was 'gunned down in his office at the Collegio Marista' in Guatemala by, it is claimed, ultraright paramilitary groups (Paul, 1991, p.18; MN, 1992, p.18).

In 1967, Mexican Br. Basilio Rueda was elected the Order's 9th. Superior General (1991, MPBRC, p.165). While all the Congregations' Superiors General have contributed significantly to the growth of the Congregation, each emphasising a different aspect of Marcellin Champagnat's founding charism (Ambrose, 1991, Int. PGH), Br. Declan Duffy, believes Br. Basilio to be 'the most significant' of the last six Superior Generals. A Mexican, a sociologist, and the first non-European to be elected to this position, he governed the Congregation from 1967 to 1985 when it was

---

33 The 120 Brothers travelled on two planes landing in Miami (Voegtle, 1992, Int. BAY.).
34 Br. Declan Duffy is a former Provincial and General Chapter representative.
responding to the initiatives of the Second Vatican Council. Declan describes Basilio as 'charismatic'. He visited all parts of the congregation and was able to talk the Brothers 'in their own language' (1991, Int. DUB.). Basilio had a sociologist's understanding of what was happening in society and was able to address problem areas within the Congregation saying, for example 'I think we should be in schools, but I don't think we should be just in any kind of school' (Duffy, 1991, Int. DUB.). Basilio's successor and the current Superior General, Australian Br. Charles Howard, came to prominence in the Congregation through his presidency of the Order's Poverty and Justice Commission. Justice issues loomed large for the Congregation in South Africa in 1976 when the Brothers first welcomed black students into their school in Johannesburg - a policy which has subsequently spread to the other Marist schools (Mannion, 1992b, Int. LON.).

BREAKDOWN - TRANSITION? Today there are over 5492 Marist Brothers, working in 76 countries, educating 0.5 million young people in widely diverse circumstances and settings from large cities to the forests of Africa and Amazonia (Moraldo, 1991, p.5; MB, 1992, pp.8-13). The Province of Nigeria is the most recent province to be established in the Congregation (Okeke, 1992, Corr. quoted in Mannion, 1992, Corr.p.2).

One way to analyse the development of Marcellin Champagnat's social movement is to adopt the life cycle model discussed in Chapter 2 of this thesis.

---

35 Very few of the earlier Superior Generals moved out of France (Duffy, 1991, Int. DUB.).
36 Basilio, after surveying all Brothers in the Congregation, nominated the areas of prayer and sexuality as the ones requiring most developmental work by the Brothers (Duffy, 1991, Int. DUB.).
38 This practice has now spread to the other Marist schools in South Africa (Mannion, 1992b, Int. LON.).
39 cf. Cada et al., 1985, p.52.
TABLE 4.6 - LIFE CYCLE OF THE MARIST BROTHERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>NUMBER OF BROTHERS</th>
<th>BEGINNING PERIOD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1820</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>FOUNDATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1830</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1840</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>EXPANSION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1850</td>
<td>800</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1860</td>
<td>1823</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1870</td>
<td>2227</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1880</td>
<td>3113</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1890</td>
<td>3729</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900</td>
<td>5464</td>
<td>STABILISATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>4470</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td>4500</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930</td>
<td>5900</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1940</td>
<td>6717</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1950</td>
<td>7722</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>9227</td>
<td>BREAKDOWN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>8552</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>6681</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>5643</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010 (?)</td>
<td></td>
<td>TRANSITION</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 4.7 - LOCATION AND AGE DISTRIBUTIONS OF MARIST BROTHERS TODAY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LOCATION</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th>AV. AGE</th>
<th>UNDER 30</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NORTH AMERICA</td>
<td>526</td>
<td>61.6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LATIN AMERICA</td>
<td>1,653</td>
<td>54.1</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIA</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>50.7</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCEANIA</td>
<td>615</td>
<td>55.1</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUROPE</td>
<td>2,068</td>
<td>57.9</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFRICA</td>
<td>443</td>
<td>47.6</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The reduction in numbers over the past 30 years from 9227 to 5643 is a serious reduction but less significant than the average age and the small numbers under 30 which indicate substantial further reductions over the next 30 years.

Education remains the primary apostolate of the Marist Brothers (MB, 1990, p.18). Brothers work in schools, universities and parishes, many in poor areas. Marist Brothers in the United States for example see their role in the following terms:

It is comforting the young couple with their unwanted pregnancy, counseling a student whose best friend keeps offering him drugs, teaching a class about the role of the church in the modern world, tutoring a ghetto youngster in the basics of computers, cooking the evening meal for the
Brothers in his community (MB, 1990, p.20)

Today the Marist Society, known more widely now as the 'Marist Family', in addition to the Marist Brothers, includes 1,600 Priests and Brothers following Jean-Claude Colin's charism, 700 Marist Sisters working in the spirit of Jeanne Marie Chavoin, 800 Missionary Sisters of the Society of Mary following Francoise Perroton and her companions, and numerous groups of people working in Marist Associations (ibid.). Marist Associations linked with the Marist Brothers involve past students, parents of students and friends of the school communities with the Associations of each country forming a Federation. The Marist Federation in France, for example, was founded in 1954 and now includes 25 Associations. Each Federation encourages its members to live according to the gospel, to take Mary as their guide and to base their lives on the spirituality of Marcellin Champagnat (MB, 1990, p.28).

In 1985, during the last General Chapter of the Congregation, the launching of The Champagnat Movement of the Marist Family began a new development in Marcellin Champagnat's Social Movement.

This Movement is 'an extension of the Marist Brothers' Institute. It is a movement for people attracted to the spirituality of Father Marcellin Champagnat. In this Movement, affiliated members, young people, parents, helpers, former students, and friends, deepen within themselves the spirit of our founder; so that they can live it and let it shine forth. The Institute animates and co-ordinates the activities of this Movement by setting up appropriate structures' (Howard, 1991, p.406).

In 1992, four young women have decided to take the first steps to start a congregation of women based on the spirituality of Marcellin Champagnat40. They live in Chile and are being assisted by one of the Brothers41 who resides nearby (FMSEC, 1992, p.6). Today the Superior General of the Congregation believes Marist Brothers need to be 'men of vision' who have a 'strong sense of Institute solidarity'. He

40 These sisters are referred to as 'Champagnat Sisters' (Mannion, 1992b, Int. LON.).
41 Br. Rafael Arteage of the Province of Betica (FMSEC, 1992, p.6).
sees the Congregation 'being called to a greater degree of solidarity at all levels ... international, continental, national, and local' (Howard, 1992, Lect. p.9).

4.4 - CHAMPAGNAT'S VISION OF EDUCATION

Throughout the history of religious life, religious orders have developed their educational philosophies from both the accumulated educational wisdom of the Church and the accepted contemporary secular practice of the time42 (Fogarty, 1959, p.302). The very close connection between the educational philosophies of the De La Salle Brothers43 and the Marist Brothers is revealed first, in the Prospectus of 1824 which states 'They [the Marist Brothers] follow in their teaching the method of the De La Salle Brothers' (Farrell, 1984, p.99) and second, from a comparison of the Rules and Constitutions of the two orders (Fogarty, 1959, p.302). De la Salle44 paid great attention to detail. A life 'ruled by constant attention to minutiae was held to be a better demonstration of faith than a life punctuated by occasional acts of heroism' (Hamilton, 1989, p.68). Towards the end of the seventeenth century De la Salle began to codify his social, theological and educational views for dissemination among the members of his growing Congregation. Included among his writings is the Conduct of Christian Schools, a 220 page school manual begun in 1695, initially circulated in manuscript form and finally published in the year after his death, 1720 (Hamilton, 1989, p.59; York, 1986, p.1).

42 The Benedictines, for example, absorbed most of what was worth salvaging from the Middle Ages; the Dominicans and Franciscans retained what was best from the age of the Scholastics. The finest contributions of the Renaissance and Reformation periods were assimilated by the Jesuits. These educational theories were then passed on to later generations both by oral tradition as well as through the various systems or manuals of educational practice such as the Jesuit's Ratio Studiorum (Fogarty, 1959, p.302).

43 Founded in 1680.

44 Entering the local College des Bons Enfants in his ninth year, John Baptist de la Salle completed the full programme of studies, receiving a Master of Arts degree in 1669. He then spent two years in Paris, taking classes at the Sorbonne and extending his theological training at the Seminary of St Sulpice (Hamilton, 1989, p. 58). Yet, Hamilton (Hamilton, 1989, p.67) observes, that while Cartesianism and its derivatives were beginning to shape the mainstream of French intellectual life, they appear to have had little effect on De la Salle. Instead the theological training of St Sulpice and the Sorbonne (1670-1672) left him with a lasting preference for the 'assurances of faith' over the 'arguments of reason' (ibid., p.68).
Marcellin chose to combine teaching and evangelisation (Duffy, 1991, Int. DUB.). Consequently when training his young Brothers to teach, he focused first on religion.

As we send you the subject matter of our first conference, it is a duty for us to remind you that the history of our religion, the study of its morality and of its divine dogmas, in a word the sacred science of the catechism should be its first and principal aim. True Brothers of Mary, dedicated to the salvation of the children who are entrusted to us, we have no other aim but to inspire our pupils with love and fear of God, a taste for and the practice of our holy religion. We therefore need first of all, this holy knowledge, which is sanctified by the charity which builds up and nourishes piety (Champagnat quoted in MBS, 1991, p.209).

Marcellin taught his Brothers the contemporary devotional practices of religious people of France, many of which centred on Mary (Duffy, 1991, Int. DUB.).

He also taught his Brothers other subjects he deemed necessary for the Marist Brother of his day: writing, grammar, arithmetic, history, geography, and even, if needed, drawing, geometry and bookkeeping (ibid., p.210). He taught 'the trades as well as the academics' and, as we have seen, arranged for some of his Brothers to go to Paris to learn how to teach the deaf and dumb (Flood, 1991, AMHS Int.). A hard worker himself, he believed his Brothers should be prepared professionally before going out to teach (ibid.). He would adopt what he saw as the best methods of teaching, even if it meant changes had to be made (Farrell, 1992, Corr.). His successor, Br. Francois, states the following teaching methods as the specific contribution of Marcellin Champagnat (MB, 1931, pp.6-7):

(1) The method of teaching reading according to the sounds then new in its application to the consonants. In this he showed his

---

45 Duffy believes it is difficult to trace Marcellin's educational vision because he concentrated on the practical side of teaching: 'sometimes you'd almost think he was a lecturer in methodology in a training college because he was dealing with people who didn't know the basics' (1991, Int. DUB.).

46 'One spelt each letter in a manner more in conformity to its actual pronunciation' (McMahon, 1992, Corr.). Marcellin wrote a small book on the principles of teaching reading (Wade, 1989, p.9). He also encouraged the Brothers to publish (Ambrose, 1991, Int. PGH).
discernment, and his decision in breaking with routine.
(2) The qualities of sound discipline, which he definitely based on moral authority and kindness, at a time when corporal punishment was in general use.
(3) The importance he assigned to the Catechism, and the pains he took to train good catechists.
(4) The teaching of Singing, a subject then neglected in Primary Schools.
(5) The rules concerning the training of the Junior Brothers. To this we owe the uniformity and consistency in our methods of teaching and training our pupils (MB, 1931, pp.6-7).

Marcellin also adhered strongly to his belief in the 'simultaneous', rather than the 'mutual', method of teaching. This did not always please the education authorities. The anti-clerical Mayor of Feurs, Mr. Mandon, for example, 'strongly advocated that the Mutual teaching method be used in all local schools'. Since Marcellin refused to adopt this method, the Mayor informed him that his Brothers had to leave Feurs (Farrell, 1984, pp.152-154; McMahon, 1988, p.157). In closing the school and withdrawing his Brothers, Marcellin wrote to the Mayor:

I note with resignation ... the destruction of the establishment of the Brothers, since I have made all the efforts I ought to have made to save a school ... I am instructing them (the Brothers) to give back the furniture that is the property of the town (quoted in McMahon, 1988, p.101).

In the 1837 set of Rules for his Brothers, two of the rules Marcellin stipulated were first that the Brothers were never to set up an establishment in any commune which did not provide a playground for the students where they can be supervised during recreation (Farrell, 1984, p.141; Furet, 1989, p.536) and second that no student was to be called by a nick-name - a rule based on an experience in Marcellin's youth when he saw a student tormented by such an occurrence (Furet, 1989, p.7).

Marcellin explicitly stated in the 1837 Rule that corporal punishment was not to be given (Farrell, 1992, Corr.). He insisted: 'It is not by corporal punishment that children should be led, but by assuming moral authority over them.' To replace corporal punishment, Marcellin recommended emulation - a practice favoured and largely employed by the De La Salle Brothers. This involved giving marks, students going up to a higher place in the class and assigning various classroom duties as rewards (Wade, 1989, p.7).
Marcellin saw the role of the Brothers as neither to only teach secular subjects, for then the Brothers would not be necessary because others could do that, nor to only give religious instruction, for catechists could do that by 'bringing the children together for an hour each day and letting them ... recite their christian doctrine'. He wanted his Brothers to educate the children, that is, to instruct them in their duty, to teach them to practise it, to give them a christian spirit and christian attitudes and to form them to religious habits and the virtues possessed by a good christian and a good citizen (Champagnat quoted in Furet, 1989, p.535).

Having chosen not to found an order of priests, he did not want his Brothers to be sacristans or 'helpers of priests' – he wanted them 'to give all their time to the children' (quoted in MB, 1990, p.32). Marcellin insisted that when the Brothers teach and instruct children they should 'follow the example of the Blessed Virgin as she was bringing up the Child Jesus and serving him' (quoted in MB, 1990, p.32). Marcellin saw Mary as having learnt the art of remaining in her place and accomplishing more by her presence than her word\textsuperscript{48} (MB, 1990, p.32).

He was seen as a true friend of the children. 'To bring children up properly, you must love them, and love them all equally'\textsuperscript{49} (Champagnat quoted in MB, 1990, p.32; Furet, 1989, p.538). His intuitive model for education was neither the army nor the monastery, but the family as his first biographer explains:

The spirit in schools should be the family spirit. Now in a good home it is a feeling of respect, love and confidence which prevails. The important point is to obtain the free and hearty

\textsuperscript{48} Presence, for Westley is a mystery at 'the heart and essence of Christianity' (1988, p.10). He describes it as 'charisma', 'charm', 'magnetism', 'ambience' and 'attraction' (ibid.) claiming it to be the nature and vocation of 'spirit' (ibid., p.118). Freeman believes the guru or spiritual leader, like the saint or sage, 'teaches by presence and example rather than by dogma and ritual' (1992, p.370). Yet our capacity for genuine presence needs to be attached to specific people, places, and insights, not to abstract principles' (Monroe, 1992, p.439).

\textsuperscript{49} Today a 'distortion' has been 'imposed on the word "love" by the capitalist world' (Freire, 1990, p.62).
co-operation of the pupils. The child does nothing except in the expansion of the soul. Keenness and joy are elements of his [or her] best work (quoted in Wade, 1989, p.7).

This was in some contrast to the ethos of 'military precision' which Napoleon had aimed at in schools under his control, claiming to know what every elementary student in France was studying at a particular time of day so as to prevent any danger to the State\(^5^0\) (Hornsby, 1977, p.34; Goubert, 1992, p.223). Marcellin saw the primary aim of his Congregation to impart christian instruction to the children of small country parishes and especially 'the slow and incapacitated' (Furet, 1989, p.89; Wade, 1989, p.7). He explains:

Take every possible care of the poorest, the most ignorant, and the dullest children, show them every kindness, speak to them often and be careful to show on all occasions that you esteem them, and love them all the more, because they are less favoured with the gifts of fortune and of nature. Destitute children are in school, what the sick are in a house - subject of blessing and prosperity when they are looked upon with the eyes of faith, and treated as the suffering members of Jesus Christ (Champagnat quoted in Wade, 1989, p.7).

When people in larger towns began asking for Marist Brothers Marcellin insisted 'we certainly ought not to refuse them' (ibid.). He believed

religious instruction in large parishes and in the towns, needs to be at greater depth because of their greater spiritual needs and their more advanced primary education. In those centres more than anywhere else, pride of place must be given to catechism and religious practice. It is the Brothers' duty to bestow all the greater care on the christian education of children, the more neglected they are and the less their parents bother about them (Champagnat quoted in Furet, 1989, p.89).

Champagnat's Brothers were widely appreciated by all classes of society. The Protestant Minister of Public Instruction, M. Guizot, in paying tribute to the Brothers, praised those in whom:

\[\text{the spirit of faith and Christian charity bring to}\]

\[^{50}\text{Napoleon saw the goal of the lycees as the formation of 'cadres who could follow orders' (Goubert, 1991, p.223).}\]
such a task that total lack of self-interest, that
taste for the practice of sacrifice, that humble
perseverance which guarantee its success and
keep it unsullied (quoted in McMahon, 1988,
p.134).

Poste Ribeiro summarises Marcellin Champagnat's educational
vision as striving to form 'good Christians and good citizens'

4.5 - MARIST EDUCATIONAL VISION

Since the death of Marcellin Champagnat, both the
practice and the spirit of Marist educational vision has been
documented. The School Guide was first adopted and
approved by the 1852 General Chapter. In his introductory
letter, Br. Francois states: 'in compiling this work we
faithfully followed the rules and instructions of our saintly
Founder on the subject of the Education of Youth' (1853,
p.5). In 1907 the General Chapter decided to revise the 1852
edition of the School Guide to take into account the spread
of the Institute throughout the world. The revised document
remarked:

This revision necessitates the omission of some
sections of the previous editions, namely, those
dealing with such points as: the admission of pupils, school hours, time-tables, attendance
registers, holidays, etc. In these and similar
points there can no longer be the uniformity
that characterised the Institute in its early
days, when all the pupils were drawn from a
circumscribed region of France (MB, 1931, p.8).
The General Chapter of 1920 approved the new edition of the
School Guide, in which 'the spirit' of Marcellin Champagnat's
approach to education was preserved (ibid.). The first
English edition of the School Guide, called The Teacher's
Guide, was produced in 1931.

TABLE 4.8 - THE TEACHER’S GUIDE: SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PART 1</th>
<th>EDUCATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education in general, physical education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moral Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Religious Education, Formation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PART 2</th>
<th>DISCIPLINE - TEACHING - ORGANISATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discipline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Methods and Modes of teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Material Organisation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

147
PART 3  THE RELIGIOUS EDUCATOR
Functions, qualities and reward of the educator
The young Brother taking charge of a class
The Guardian Angel, the ideal Educator
Uniformity in methods of teaching

PART 4  METHODS OF TEACHING CERTAIN SUBJECTS
Reading, writing, the Mother Tongue
Arithmetic, Geography, Nature Study
Sacred History and National History
Gymnastics, Singing, Drawing.

Bro. Alfano, who was highly regarded by his confreres and was recently recognised by the Church as 'Venerable Br. Alfano', when teaching in 1891 in the first Marist school in Italy used, what Moraldo describes as, 'a rich theoretical baggage of Marist pedagogy, which advises helping the student to avoid mistakes by helping and loving him as an older brother would' (1991, p.18). Alfano resolved:

Speak little in class, as little as possible. Never touch the students. Do not punish out of resentment. Supervise the students scrupulously. Punish little, encourage a great deal. Correct assignments punctually. Always come to class well prepared. Give greater attention to the least successful. Pray for them often. Think often of God. (quoted in Moraldo, 1991, p.18)

The 1968 General Chapter produced a 152 page document titled *Our Marist Apostolate*. This document reflected the discussions of the first Chapter of the post Vatican II world. The most recent edition of the *Constitutions and Statutes of the Marist Brothers*, issued after the 1986 General Chapter, speaks more concisely about education:

The Church sends forth our Institute, which draws its life from the Holy Spirit. Faithful to Father Champagnat, it works to evangelise people, especially by educating the young, particularly those most neglected (MB, 1986, Art.80).

The Constitutions describe Marist work as 'a community apostolate' and see Marist education as:

(1) offering families 'an approach to education which draws faith, culture, and life into harmony',

51 Some Brothers wanted a more comprehensive treatment of Marist involvement in education in the Constitutions but it seems the 1986 Chapter wanted to leave open a lot of options.
(2) stressing 'the values of self-forgetfulness and openness to others',
(3) giving 'pride of place to catechesis',
(4) giving 'priority to pastoral care' which is 'adapted to the needs of young people',
(5) involving their students in charitable works which 'bring them into contact with situations of poverty',
(6) giving 'special attention to pupils who are in difficulty' and
(7) encouraging dialogue between people of different cultures and different beliefs (MB, 1986, Art.82 and Art.87).

Marist educational vision is also passed on to Brothers by their common training (Alexius, 1991, Int. AMHS; Flood, 1991, Int. AMHS). Flood, for example, recalls 'the anecdotal history of the Brothers' and 'the hints on teaching' which he received in the Scholasticate. The Brothers had a 'certain attitude towards teaching, a certain methodology, a certain philosophy of teaching' - a methodology which expects students to 'sit down' and 'get to work' and which insists on 'homework and preparation' (1991, Int. AMHS). Presence and good example are other 'important elements of Marist pedagogy' (MBS, 1986, Art., 81; Howard, 1992, Lect. p.6) as is 'gentleness and patience with children, even at the expense of Brothers enduring a lot'52 (Duffy, 1991, Int. DUB.). Wade summarises the characteristics of Marist Education as (1) meeting needs (2) flexible (3) catering particularly for those who find school difficult (4) non-punitive (5) based on a family spirit (6) emphasising education in faith and (7) fostering discipline and hard work (1989, pp.5-9).

Marist Brothers today are expected to share their 'spirituality and educational approach' with parents, teachers and other members of the educating community (MBS, 1986, Art.88). This spirituality emphasises three aspect of Mary's life:
(1) Mary was receptive to the Spirit at the time of the Annunciation and through this openness brought Christ into

---

52 The qualities of gentleness and patience are also referred to in the writings of Marcellin Champagnat (Duffy, 1991, Int. DUB.).
the world

(2) Mary did good quietly; she loved Jesus yet didn't possess Him and left Him free to do His Father's work and

(3) As exemplified at Cana, Mary worked behind the scenes, not because she was afraid to act, but because of the centrality of Christ's action adopting her own words: 'Do whatever he tells you' (Braniff, 1990, p.12; John 2:5).

Consequently, it is claimed, Marist Brothers show their students that they 'are not only their teachers but also their brothers' (MB, 1986, Art.60). Brotherhood, they believe, is exemplified in the family at Nazareth where Jesus was nurtured by Mary and Joseph. To the Marist Brother, 'brotherhood' symbolises first the family spirit existing among the Brothers and those who work, or have contact, with them, second, the way the Brothers live together in community and third the spirit in which the Brothers make an option for the poor. By trying to establish in the school this spirit of brotherhood, Marist Brothers strive to help young people 'become responsible for their own formation' (MB, 1986, Art.88). They are encouraged to 'keep in close contact with former students' by friendship and prayer, willingly accepting their co-operation in the progress of the school (MB, 1986, Art.88). Finally Marist educators are expected to promote associations of parents of their students and 'seek their participation in apostolic activities' (MB, 1986, Stat.88.1).

53 Prieur understands the 'charismatic aspect of being a Marist Brother' as summed up in the word 'brotherhood' (1991, p.7)
54 The Marist Constitutions state: 'Our vocation as BROTHER is a special call to live the brotherhood of Christ with everyone, especially with young people, loving them with a selfless love and 'In calling ourselves BROTHERS, we proclaim that we belong to a family united in love (MBS, 1986, Art.3 and Art.6).
CHAPTER 5 - METHODOLOGY

All cases are unique, and very similar to others

T.S.Eliot

In this research I adopt the interpretative paradigm thereby entering 'a process of exploration' (Hammersley and Atkinson, 1983, p.12). In studying the constructs Marist Brothers, their colleagues and their students use to make sense of the events and phenomena in their worlds, 'the researcher comes face-to-face with the social situations that reveal such constructs and the taken-for-granted components of such worlds'. I endeavour to understand these phenomena through active mental work, interactions with the external context and transactions between my mental work and the external context (McCutcheon and Jung, 1990, pp.146-147).

This paradigm looks back to Weber's distinction between understanding which involves direct observation of the meaning of given acts including 'verbal utterances' and understanding which analyses the motive behind an action. 'This ... consists in placing the act in an intelligible and more inclusive context of meaning' (1978 [1921], p.8). Habermas believes these two types of understanding Erklärung (explanation) and Verstehen (understanding) involve different rules in methodological usage (1990, p.10). Weber saw the notion of Verstehen\(^2\), as centring on the interpretative grasp of meaning

(a) as in the historical approach the actually intended meaning for concrete individual action; or (b) as in cases of sociological mass phenomena, the average of, or an approximation to the actually intended meaning; or (c) the meaning appropriate to a scientifically formulated pure type (an ideal type) of a common phenomenon (1978 [1921], p.9).

This sounds more rationalistic than in fact it is. Its purpose is methodological convenience. Weber does not believe in an

---

1 Quoted in Moran, 1992, p.4.
2 Verstehen became central to Weber's methodology (Kasler, 1988, p.151). It is now closely associated with qualitative methodology (Platt, 1985, p.448).
'actual predominance of rational elements in human life'. In fact he sees 'a danger of rationalistic interpretations where they are out of place' (ibid., pp.6-7).

Since people's meanings cannot be predicted, interpretivists allow their research design to develop as the research unfolds (McCutcheon and Jung, 1990, p.149). Meaning questions can't be solved and 'done away with', they can only be better or more deeply understood (van Manen, 1990, p.155). The interpretivist researcher seeks to dialogue with the researchee so that a 'rich description of action and intentions' emerges (McCutcheon and Jung, 1990, p.150). This causes research questions to take on greater or less significance as the process develops.

Great emphasis has been given to the split between the qualitative and quantitative research traditions (Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.5). I identify with Guba's (1978) position that these two research approaches 'are incompatible because they are based on paradigms that make different assumptions about the world and what constitutes valid research' (quoted in Firestone, 1987, p.16). I choose the qualitative approach for this research so as to concentrate on interpretation and meaning. Soltis believes the purpose of qualitative research in education is to 'inform our deep understanding of educational institutions and processes through interpretation and narrative description' (1989, p.125). Of the qualitative methods, Arbuckle sees case study methodology suit the study of religious congregations and their schools, because it illustrates theoretical principles in a 'flesh-and-blood' way, and discusses particular individuals, rather than abstract roles such as 'agents of change' or 'refounding persons' (1988, p.168).

In this research I aim to move from subjectivity to objectivity. At the beginning of Economy and Society (1978 [1921], p.4) Weber defines sociology as 'a science concerning itself with the interpretive understanding of social action and thereby with a causal explanation of its course and consequences'. In this definition Weber conceptualises 'the
new social sciences as cultural sciences with a systematic intent'. He combines 'methodological principles that philosophers had found in opposing types of sciences: the social sciences have the task of bringing the heterogeneous methods, aims, and presuppositions of the natural and cultural sciences into balance' (Habermas, 1990, p.10). Since Weber made his postulate on subjective interpretation it has been observed consistently in the 'theory-formation of all social sciences'. Hence 'all scientific explanations of the social world can, and for certain purposes must, refer to the subjective meaning of the actions of human beings from which the social reality originates (Schutz, 1954, pp.269-270), for, as Freire insists, 'no one can say a true word ... for another' (1990, p. 61). Weber speaks of 'action' in so far as the 'acting individual attaches a subjective meaning' to his or her behaviour - 'be it overt or covert, omission or acquiescence'. Action is 'social' when its 'subjective meaning takes account of the behavior of others and is thereby oriented in its course' (1978 [1921], p.4).

Schutz believes that social sciences, 'like all empirical sciences, have to be objective in the sense that their propositions are subjected to controlled verification and must not refer to private uncontrollable experience'. He claims 'an objectively verifiable theory of subjective meaning-structures' can be formed by establishing constructs of those constructs which have been formed 'in common sense thinking' by the people involved in the social scene. He sees these second level constructs as being of 'a different kind from those developed on the first level of common-sense thinking'. This device for arriving at objectivity, Schutz contends, has been used long before the concept of subjective interpretation was formulated by Weber and developed by his school (1954, p.270).

5.1 - CASE STUDY METHODOLOGY

Case study is 'an umbrella term for a family of research methods'. Its eclectic methodology chooses methods on the basis of their appropriateness to 'the purpose of the
study and the nature of the case' (Adelman et al., 1980, pp.48-49; MacDonald and Walker, 1977, p.183; Simons, 1989, p.116). It involves 'an intensive, holistic description and analysis' of a single case or a bounded system whether simple and specific or abstract and complex in a naturalistic way (Merriam, 1988, p.xiv; Stake 1985, p.278). It is an 'examination of an instance in action' which acknowledges that the instance is embedded in historical, social, political, cultural, biographical and other contexts (MacDonald and Walker 1977, p.181; Adelman et al., 1980, p.48; Stake, 1985, p.279; Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.14). MacDonald and Walker describe it as 'the way of the artist', who, in portraying a single instance locked in time and circumstance, reveals properties of the class to which the instance belongs and in so doing 'communicates enduring truths about the human condition'. It is also likely, particularly in education, to take the researcher into 'a complex set of politically sensitive relationships' (1977, p.182 and p.185).

Stake describes a bounded system as an 'institution, a program, a responsibility, a collection, or a population' (1978, p.7). The Marist Brothers' Congregation constitutes the bounded system for this research. Here a 'tolerably full understanding of the case is possible' and the boundaries of the system have a common sense obviousness (Adelman et al., 1980, p.49). In studying the Congregation, other bounded systems, namely three schools within its aegis, are chosen for detailed study.

Qualitative case study is located within naturalistic research which interprets 'higher-order interrelations within the observed data' by studying objects in their own environment with 'a design relatively free of intervention or control' (Stake, 1985, pp.277-278). Naturalistic research involves 'free exploration in the area, getting close to the people involved in it, seeing a variety of situations they meet, noting their conversations, and watching their life as it flows along' (Blumer, 1969, quoted in Hammersley, 1990, p.34). It focuses on meaning in context and consequently requires data collection instruments which are sensitive to these
meanings. Merriam claims 'humans' are best-suited to this task 'using methods that make use of human sensibilities such as interviewing, observing, and analyzing' (1988, p.3). Naturalistic research requires dialogue in order to locate the participants' intentions and meanings 'in causal and temporal order with reference to their role in the history of the setting or settings to which they belong' (MacIntyre, 1985, p.208). Such research must be carried out with an attitude of respect and is reported 'in ordinary (rather than technical) language' (Hammersley and Atkinson, 1983, p.6; Stake, 1985, p.278).

Theories supporting this research include the sociology of charismatic social movements, the theology of religious congregations and the role of charismatic social movements in education. Such broad theoretical bases prevent any 'theoretical absolutism' where the study is constrained to 'one preferred approach' (Johnson, 1980, p.5). As Merriam recommends, these theories will permeate the entire research process and will provide a context for personal and shared reflection, the choice of experiences observed, the selection of documents to be analysed and an orientation for interview questions and discussions (1988, p.61). Theory is also important to this research because I aim to assist in the deepening and broadening of existing theoretical understandings of Marist educational vision as expressed in Congregational literature. Qualitative case study methodology assists the building of theory particularly when it employs 'one's imagination, personal experience, the experiences of others, and existing theory' (Merriam, 1988, p.57 and p.60). It provides flexibility, allows promising ideas to be tried and developed and the direction of the research to be changed if necessary.

I'm reminded of Hume's classic dilemma as to how 'unobservable connections among events' can be postulated'. Huberman and Miles respond to this challenge by recommending the combination of three methodological traditions: 'analytic induction, clinical and expert judgement and qualitative methods in the ethnographic and interpretive
These methodologies, they contend, involve the analyst in progressively scanning the data 'for clusters of similarly appearing or similarly-functioning variables and for the relations between these phenomena'. These are then tested during the next stage of data collection (1989, pp.55-56). In such analyses, however, comparisons are rather implicit than explicit and emerging themes and hypotheses remain subordinate to the understanding of the case as a whole. Indeed, Stake believes case study methodology is expansionist rather than reductionist, requiring attention to the 'idiosyncratic more than to the pervasive,' with the intention, ultimately, of adding to 'existing experience and humanistic understanding' (1978, p.7).

Weber, in his ten methodological foundations for sociology, insists it is customary to designate sociological generalisations (1978 [1921], p.18). He sees such generalisations as typical probabilities confirmed by observation to the effect that under certain given conditions an expected course of social action will occur which is understandable in terms of the typical motives and typical subjective intentions of the actors [and actresses].

Weber believes the 'more sharply and precisely the ideal type has been constructed, ... the more abstract and unrealistic in this sense it is, the better it is able to perform its functions in formulating terminology, classifications, and hypotheses'. As well as providing objective assistance, Weber sees these sociological theoretical concepts as having subjective relevance. 'In the great majority of cases actual action goes on in a state of inarticulate half-consciousness or actual unconsciousness of its subjective meaning'.

Every sociological ... investigation, in applying its analysis to the empirical facts, must take this fact into account ... But the difficulty need not prevent the sociologist from systematizing his [or her] concepts by the classification of possible types of subjective meaning (ibid., p.21).

Case study methodology enables the researcher to
reach the general by studying the particular and move continually between the two\(^3\) (Aldeman, Jenkins and Kemmis, 1980, p.47; Eisner, 1981, p.7). Cronbach, however, believes such generalisations decay over time: 'At one time a conclusion describes the existing situation well, at a later time it accounts for rather little variance, and ultimately it is valid only as history' (1975, pp.122-123). While other styles of research, such as survey analysis, aim to elicit general relationships, case study methodology concentrates on 'the context of individual instances'. Stake sees the results of case study research as being generalisable 'in that the information given allows readers to decide whether the case is similar to theirs' (Stake, 1985, p.277). Generalisation can be rationalistic, propositional and lawlike (scientific discourse) or naturalistic, the last form being more intuitive, empirical and based on personal direct and vicarious experience (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p.120).

Naturalistic generalisations develop within a person as a product of experience. They derive from the tacit knowledge of how things are, why they are, how people feel about them, and how these things are likely to be later or in other places with which this person is familiar. They seldom take the form of predictions but lead regularly to expectation (Stake, 1978, p.6).

Within the limits of the study, I attempt to gain as general an understanding as possible of current Marist Educational Vision.

---

\(^3\) Lincoln and Guba (1985, p.125) demonstrate, within the limits of a metaphor, the means by which they believe the whole of a bounded system can be studied:
- that full information about a whole is stored in its parts ...;
- that samples need not be representative in the usual statistical sense to render generalizations warrantable; any part or component is a 'perfect' sample in the sense that it contains all of the information about the whole that one might ever hope to obtain;
- that imperfect (blurred) information from any source can be improved (clarified), if one has the appropriate filters for so doing; and
- that both the substantive information about an object and the information needed to clarify it are contained in the unclarified versions.
The qualitative case study researcher relies primarily on interviews, document analysis and observation (Miller and Lieberman, 1988, p.4). These methods are often employed in combination as is normal for naturalistic inquiry (Smith, 1987 and Schatzman and Strauss, 1973 quoted in Simons, 1987, p.95). Such a variety of methods can be employed if the researcher builds a rapport, and therefore a trust, with the people being researched. Trust results first when, 'researchers appear good, honest and decent' (Peshkin, 1984, p.257), second, when they are predictable and third when they establish agreement over the research aims (Nias, 1981 quoted in Simons, 1989, p.123).

In this research I interviewed, observed, collected documents, tape recorded, photographed and took field notes. In most cases observations were 'background rather than foreground' (Cotter, 1991, p.76). There was flexibility in the design and carrying through of the research, with changes of tack resulting particularly from the suggestions of participants (Adelman et al., 1980, p.49; Simons, 1987, p.72; Huberman, 1992, Lect.). This flexibility enabled me to 'change direction, probe relevant issues, investigate unanticipated effects and undertake additional studies' (Simons, 1987, p.72). The data were collected mainly as open-ended narrative without attempting to fit people's experiences into pre-determined or standardized categories. Each school was treated as 'a unique entity' with its own particular sets of meanings and relationships (Patton, 1980, p.20 and p.40).

**INTERVIEWS** Interviews provided the prime source of data. Patton believes the 'purpose of interviewing is to find out what is in and on someone else's mind' - 'not to put things in someone's mind ... but rather to access the perspective of the person being interviewed'.

We interview people to find out from them those things we cannot directly observe ... feelings, thoughts and intentions ... behaviours that took place at some previous point in time ... how
people have organized the world and the meanings they attach to what goes on in the world – we have to ask people questions about those things (1980, p.196).

I endeavoured to listen also to the non-rational being 'spoken' by observing how people sat, the way they appeared to relate to me and how relaxed they seemed to be. I sometimes found the times of silence most poignant because it was then that another, perhaps mystical, dimension of communication was experienced. As a 'non-positivist' researcher, I afforded these silences 'a special and prestigious place' (Sultana, 1992, p.19). Throughout the research I adopted Measor's principle that the quality of the data is dependent on the quality of the relationships built with the people being interviewed. I found it important, for example, to dress in keeping with the kind of professional dress normally worn by the interviewees (1988, pp.57-58).

Patton (1980, pp.197-205) describes three ideal types of qualitative interviewing.

(1) The Informal Conversational Interview. In this 'phenomenological' interview, typical of the 'unstructured kind advocated in case study research', questions flow from the immediate context and the interviewer goes with the flow (Simons, 1981, p.27).

(2) The General Interview Guide Approach. This type of interview involves preparing a list of issues whose coverage is broadly the aim of the interview.

(3) The Standardised Open-ended Interview. This form of interview, which involves framing questions before the interview and then using them consistently in a set of interviews, constituted the main interview format. This strategy allows comparisons to be made without diminishing the special contribution made by each interviewee.

I employed all these interview types, however. Some conversational interviews were conducted with individuals, others with groups. These group interviews gave the interviewees some extra control over the discussion and questions asked (Burgess, 1984, p.118). Most general interviews took place away from the interview room.
environment. In these discussions I sought to deepen my understanding of emerging themes and issues. The standardised open-ended interviews were held in the interview room assigned to me. Each interviewee was asked the following four research questions:

1. What is the nature of the contribution being made by the Marist Brothers' Congregation in Catholic secondary schools today?

2. Where does the educational vision of the founder of the Marist Brothers, Marcellin Champagnat, fit into this contribution?

3. What part does the Marist Congregation's history play in its educational vision today?

4. How do Marist educators resolve the tension between the need to be historically authentic to the educational vision of Marcellin Champagnat, while still being relevant, and even 'prophetic', for today's educational needs?

Interviews normally lasted forty five minutes with some going considerably longer and others requiring two sessions. They were all characterised by free-ranging discussions where feelings, values and common understandings were shared (Stake, 1978, p.5). Where possible, I tried to encourage the interviewee to be 'proactive' (MacDonald and Sanger, 1982, p.179). I asked supplementary questions of a personal nature if I felt such questions were not intrusive as I found people wanted to talk about themselves and their feelings about the school, faculty or programme they were leading or in which they were involved. I tape recorded each interview. When I reread the interviews I was able to 'hear' what I hadn't 'heard' at the time of the interview and to check my understanding of what I thought people had said.

Rarely did I know the people I interviewed and hence I found the initial few minutes required different responses. Some interviewees wanted to talk immediately about where they had just been, others asked who I was and why I was doing this research. Some laboured over the answers to my questions with a few being apologetic for what they felt were
inadequate answers. Two or three people seemed 'on edge' wanting to say more than they felt they could for 'political' reasons. The interviewees talked amongst themselves outside the interviews with some providing me with feedback afterwards. A few changed the time of the interviews and one chose to decline the offer of an interview due to overwork, though in his case I was able to interview him on my second visit to the school. In both schools I had ready access to interviewees. At St. Mungo's the one Marist Brother on the staff, Br. Stephen Smyth selected the interviewees, while at Archbishop Molloy, Br. John Klein, the school principal, carried out this task. I relied on these two Brothers to provide the variety of interviewees I required after explaining to them the purpose of my research. I chose this approach because both men seemed to have a good understanding of the goals of my study and, as I knew little about both schools, and had limited amounts of time at both places, that seemed the most practical course of action. Stephen acknowledged the possibility of selecting only 'favourable interviewees' and believed he avoided this, while John informed me he deliberately included members of staff who were periodically negative about the school acknowledging, as a doctoral graduate himself: 'you want to get an honest study' (Smyth, 1991b, SMA Int.; Klein, 1991, AMHS Int.).

OBSERVATION AND DOCUMENT ANALYSIS Burgess (1984, pp.80ff.) adopts Gold's (1958) typology when classifying observational styles. They are:

(1) the complete participant 'where the researcher merges into the action' so that his or her role is hidden from the researched;

(2) where the researcher moves about 'without a pre-ordained schedule';

(3) where the observer is participant but involving a more formal and less naturalistic approach to observation;

(4) where the researcher is the complete observer, eliminating interaction with the researched.

I adopted all these observational approaches. I experienced the 'complete participant' role when, for example, I joined the
audience at Archbishop Molloy High School's Christmas musical; the 'no pre-ordained schedule' role when I walked around the St. Mungo's Academy's Archbishop Molloy playgrounds and corridors during the various breaks; the 'observer as participant' role when I was invited to join a group of parents who had helped run an orientation evening for parents of new students at St. Mungo's Academy and the 'complete observer' role when I travelled on the New York subway at the end of the school day with Molloy students who didn't know who I was. While I aimed to adopt the first three observational roles, I found total anonymity to be unavoidable on some occasions. I preferred to observe in natural settings finding these reflected 'the reality of the life experiences of participants more accurately' than 'more contrived settings' (Goetz and LeCompte quoted in Merriam, 1988, pp.168-169).

Documents also provided a valuable resource for this research. Merriam defines a document as 'an assortment of written records, physical traces and artifacts' (Merriam, 1988, p.xv). As well as contributing new data, documents confirmed insights I had gained through interviews and observations. They revealed, to some extent, the degree to which the spirit of the overall Marist social movement had been incarnated at the local level. They generally provided basic information which was often assumed knowledge during interviews, but they also reminded me later of details I had forgotten.

**SELECTION OF CASES** During the research I could identify with MacDonald and Walker's observation that case-studies are always 'partial accounts, involving selection at every stage' (1977, p.187).

For my preliminary 'mini-studies' I had sought one secular and one religious based international social movement committed to education where a founding person could be identified and was regarded as charismatic. I selected the United World Colleges as the secular social movement because it is a relatively new and dynamic school movement with its
international headquarters in London. For the religious social movement, I chose the Society of Jesus as a long established religious congregation that had been through a refounding process and that continually clarifies and documents its educational vision. In approaching the main Marist study I decided to study schools in three countries and then to broaden the study to other schools towards the end of the research. In selecting the three schools, I explained the aims of my research to Brothers working in the administration of the Congregation, particularly Brs. Richard Dunleavy (Rome), Rick Shea (New York) and Chris Mannion (Glasgow) and then relied on their advice. For practical reasons I chose English medium schools, where the school's age, the number of Brothers working in the school and the school's tradition varied. As the research developed it became clear that the Melbourne school, where I had been principal prior to coming to London, provided the major source of my research questions and could also, through an autobiographical and reflexive analysis, generate relevant data for the study. Adding Glasgow's St. Mungo's Academy, with its long history and changed status to a government Catholic school, and New York's Archbishop Molloy High School, with its large number of teaching Brothers, provided the research with a good variety of schools.

I then chose ten other schools from all continents, selecting some boarding and day schools, some day schools, some where I knew Brothers, others I had visited prior to, or could visit during, the research period. The chosen responding schools were: Marist College, Ashgrove, Australia; Marist High School, Bayonne, U.S.A.; St. Gregory's College, Campbelltown, Australia; Marist High School, Chicago, U.S.A.; Moyle Park College, Clondalkin, Ireland; St. John's High School, Dundee, Scotland; St. Paul's Secondary School, Kabwe, Zambia; St. Francis High School, Pleebo, Liberia; Sargodha Catholic School, Pakistan and Maris Stella High School, Singapore. Of these ten, eight eventually provided data in sufficient quantity to justify inclusion, the two exceptions

4 cf. the earlier reference in this chapter to testing initial data during a second stage of data collection (Huberman and Miles, 1989, p.56).
being Marist High School, Chicago and Moyle Park College, Clondalkin.

**DATA COLLECTION** Marcellin College differed from the other two study schools in being both retrospective and - to some extent - autobiographical. My own memory was therefore a necessary 'data source' - averagely fallible, selective and inclined to self-deception though that memory is. Fortunately, however, it did not have to stand alone but could interact with other sources and stimuli. These included, for example, two hundred pages of documentation which were sent to London after having been carefully selected either by senior College staff who had themselves been involved in the leadership team during the years being studied or by the archivist and the supervisor of schools of the Marist Brothers who both work at the Marist headquarters of the Melbourne Province at Templestowe - on the basis of criteria I had sent them. I found it helpful to have selection from each of these sources, representing complementary 'insider' and (relatively speaking) 'outsider' perspectives. Further data on Marcellin College were obtained through interviews carried out in England with former staff and colleagues of the period. In addition to these independent voices which functioned as both a stimulus and a check on memory, there was the further stimulus - particularly important in this case - provided by my supervisor's interrogations of several successive drafts of the Marcellin story.

Data from St. Mungo's Academy were obtained through interview and observation at the school and the Brothers' residence during June 1991 and September 1992, further interviews carried out in England, Ireland, France and America at other times during the research period, correspondence with present and past members of the school community, and the analysis of documents. Data from Archbishop Molloy High School came in similar ways: from interview and observation at the school in December 1991 -
January 1992, and again in June and July 1992, further interviews held in England, Scotland, Ireland and France at other times during the research period, correspondence with people who know the school, and the analysis of documents. The periods of time spent at these schools were determined principally by the differing numbers of Brothers on the staff.

Collecting data at St. Mungo's Academy and Archbishop Molloy High School involved:
- interviewing administrators, teachers, parents and students on a one-to-one basis in an office in the school building or in a small room in the Brothers' house.
- interviewing groups of staff, parents, students and past students in staff rooms, large offices, classrooms, Brothers' dining rooms and lounges.
- attending meetings involving staff, parents and students both as an observer and a participant such as the 'United Nations' meeting run by the students at Archbishop Molloy.
- teaching and sitting in on class activities, such as religious education classes at St. Mungo's and a basketball lesson at Archbishop Molloy and engaging in open discussion with students and teachers.
- spending time in staff rooms having meals and informally chatting with staff and parents and reading the available literature.
- discussing informally with administrators, teachers, parents, students and friends of the school in offices, corridors, libraries, around photocopy machines, in playgrounds, while travelling together and when shopping at the local stores. Some of these discussions were confidential, emotionally charged and therefore not able to be reported. They did, however, contribute to the overall orientation of the findings and conclusions of the research.
- living with Brothers who worked in the schools and visiting other communities of Brothers associated with the school.
- joining in school Masses and other prayer experiences and having lengthy informal discussions with participants after these services.
- participating in social and sporting occasions such as concerts, dances, interschool basketball competitions, track training and the end of year Christmas dinner at Archbishop Molloy - much of the data received on these occasions came more freely, because at these times, my being a Brother and a researcher seemed less apparent and
- collecting documents from reception desks, staff rooms and, on two occasions, from rubbish bins.

In all, I tape recorded and analysed 60 hours of interviews and collected and studied 600 pages of relevant documents, field-notes and journal entries. I kept a daily journal on all but nine days of the research period, using my portable computer which I took with me during the majority of my research journeys. This journal documented places I visited, key people with whom I spoke, feelings I experienced, emerging themes and other important data I wanted to record. I kept additional field notes giving details about particular interviews and changes in my thinking as I analysed the data. When I didn't have my computer with me, I handwrote the journal and fieldnotes adding the journal notes to the computer files on my return to London. All incoming and outgoing telephone calls were recorded, the time of the call being noted and copies of incoming and outgoing correspondence filed alphabetically by surname.

Throughout the research period I also received considerable methodological and theoretical input from:
- the Institute of Education M.A. courses on research methodology and curriculum design during the Autumn term of the 1990-1991 academic year,
- discussions with academics in France, Ireland, the United States and Canada on research methodology, educational theory, Marist culture and Max Weber's thinking,
- participating in the European Taize Congress in Prague during December 1990 and January 1991,
- participating in the International Congresses on School Effectiveness and Improvement in Cardiff during January 1991 and Victoria, British Columbia in January 1992,
- visiting the provincial centres of the Franciscan
Missionaries of the Divine Motherhood in Godalming, the Sisters of Christ in St. Pancras and the Sisters of the Society of the Sacred Heart in Roehampton and discussing aspects of their educational vision
- studying the archives of the Marist Fathers in London,
- interviewing Marist historians at L'Hermitage in St. Chamond during March and April 1991 and

DATA ANALYSIS The analytical framework for this research can be represented as below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE 5.1 - ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RESEARCH QUESTIONS:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARIST CONTRIBUTION TO SCHOOLS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROLE OF MARCELLIN CHAMPAGNAT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLACE OF THE CONGREGATION'S HISTORY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROPHETIC RELEVANCE YET HISTORICAL AUTHENTICITY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THEORIES:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEBER'S THEORY OF CHARISMATIC SOCIAL MOVEMENTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THEOLOGY OF RELIGIOUS CONGREGATIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFFECTIVE SCHOOLS AND SCHOOL IMPROVEMENT THEORIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPECIFIC CONTRIBUTIONS:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITED WORLD COLLEGES SOCIAL MOVEMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOCIETY OF JESUS SOCIAL MOVEMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THREE CASE STUDY SCHOOLS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIGHT RESPONDING SCHOOLS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESEARCHER’S REFLEXIVITY</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During the research, the theory developed in parallel with the fieldwork. The notion of the charismatic social movement brought the two together initially and acted as a broad foundation for data collection and analysis. Other theoretical perspectives, such as the distinction made by Avis between the sociological and the theological senses of charisma in Weberian terms, and new findings emerged together over time (1992, pp.67-75). These broadened my understanding of the cases, thereby highlighting the need to be both 'theoretically sensitive' and open to unexpected 'detours' during the gathering of data (Glaser, 1978, p.1). Valuable theoretical suggestions were sometimes made by research participants. My personal experience in Marist schools helped me to understand the context of the schools I
was studying and put me fairly immediately 'in dialogue' with the data I was collecting (Huberman, 1992, Lect.). As I analysed data and developed research categories, the bases for tentative theories about Marist educational vision began to emerge. These were later tested for authenticity by trying them out on participants both in the case study schools themselves and in the responding schools.

Yin (1989, p.106) believes the aim of data analysis is 'to treat the evidence fairly, to produce compelling analytic conclusions, and to rule out alternative interpretations'. Miles and Huberman see this occurring through three interrelated processes (1984, quoted in Miles, 1990, p.42):

1. data reduction or 'selection and compression of anticipated and available information',
2. data display or 'arrangement of reduced data in an ordered, compressed format' to allow
3. conclusion drawing and verification involving processes such as 'raw comparisons, making metaphors, triangulation' and 'testing rival hypotheses'.

Of these tasks, Miles and Huberman believe data display to be the most important at a time when 'researcher isolation and reliance on idiosyncratic analysis methods' are 'giving way to documentation, explicitness, and collegial sharing' (Miles, 1990, p.43). Data displays 'reduce batches of data in ways that enhance their comparability, and allow hypothesis generation for further analysis'. The chosen display modes inevitably condition the analysis and conclusions (Huberman and Miles, 1983, p.286 and p.331) and consequently Huberman warns against 'over-rationalisation' because 'research has an inbuilt tendency to assume a rational, logical, plausible structure'\(^5\) (1992, Lect.).

The data collected for each of the case study schools were ordered, analysed and then used to generate tentative themes or scenarios for that school. These were categorised and 'clustered' and then causal networks - 'the visual rendering of the most important independent and dependent

\(^5\) This warning could be levelled at those who developed the theories concerning the eras of religious life and the life cycle of the typical religious congregation as discussed in Chapter 2 (Duffy, 1991, Int. DUB.).
variables ... and the relationships between them' - were developed, enabling the formation of initial hypotheses (Huberman and Miles, 1989, p.57). After gathering more data from both the case study schools and responding schools, some of these hypotheses were disproved, others confirmed and new ones proposed.

The hypotheses from each of the three case study schools were brought together and 'pattern matching' was carried out for each site by the respondents in the eight schools (ibid.). Smith and Robbins suggest 'there is no simple way to determine the significance of patterns found across sites in qualitative analyses' (1982, p.57). Nevertheless, overall hypotheses for the bounded system were established with, once again, some hypotheses as proposed in individual case studies being disproved and others added (Merriam, 1988, p.60). Throughout this analysis the variables underlying the theoretical framework and the research questions provided the 'building blocks' for the 'causal networks' thereby helping to extend the theory of Marist educational vision (Huberman and Miles, 1989, p.57).

During the research period I tape recorded the tutorials with my supervisor, Dr. Paddy Walsh, and listened afterwards to the recording. In addition to gaining a better understanding of the issues discussed and the suggestions made, this proved particularly helpful when analysing data. Hypotheses sometimes emerged through my having 'bounced off' my thoughts and feelings about particular experiences on Paddy - as indeed on other interested colleagues and friends.

REPORTING In writing this thesis, I adopted a number of recommendations which I culled from current literature about case study writing. They were that case study
- endeavours to see the 'world of the site' through the eyes of the respondents (Lincoln and Guba 1985, p.365),
- distinguishes between the sections on 'reconstructing the site' and the writer's own interpretations (ibid.),
- is informal, includes narrative and illustrations where
helpful (Stake 1980, p.71) and uses 'thick description' (Geertz, 1973b) 'so essential to an understanding of context and situation' (Lincoln and Guba, 1990, p.54),
- acknowledges the researcher's 'conscious reflexivity', since a case study researcher has 'an obligation to be self-examining, self-questioning, self-challenging, self-critical, and self-correcting' (ibid.),
- endeavours to convey the 'body of knowledge' obtained from the research (Huberman, 1992, Lect.),
- includes data displays which can represent 'substantial data selection and reduction' (Miles, 1982, p.127),
- includes verbatim quotations from interviews giving those being researched their 'distinctive voices' (Webster, 1991, p.1347). In selecting these I adopted Opie's (1992, pp.59–63) selection principles which are based on a) the intensity of the speaking voice, b) the contradictory moment, c) emotional content or tone, d) the extent to which the participant uses whole sentences rather than the more usual recursive speech patterns and e) the control of the interpretation.

In the case study of Marcellin College, I 'reflected on action' which I 'reframed' in an autobiographical account (Schon, 1983, p.276, Russell, 1989, p.275). This differed from the reflection on action which is carried out 'by observers rather than by participants' (Hargreaves and Fullan, 1992, p.178). As an act of writing, I experienced the truth of the remark that autobiography 'perches in the present, gazing backwards into the past while poised ready for flight into the future' (Abbs, 1974, pp.6–7). Since autobiographical work involves 'a struggle against the loss of memory', as already mentioned, I relied for the factual information principally on documents produced during the years being studied (Mundhenk, 1986, p.82). Although all autobiography contains 'a cone of darkness at the centre' (Pascal, 1960, p.184) I found it 'can be instructive in the quest for contradictions in both individual and social spheres' (Edgerton, 1991, p.86). As it 'ends in the figure of the writer', it remains in conflict with the writing of history which

does indeed come to conclusions and reach ends, but actually moves forward through the implicit
understanding that things are not over, that the story isn't finished, can't ever be completed, for some new item of information may alter the account as it has been given (Steedman, 1990, p.246).

Autobiography differs too from memoir and reminiscence by the 'status and function of experience within it' (ibid, p.247). This particular exercise in interpretive autobiography focused more on meaning than on the narration as reflected in stories, metaphors and folk knowledge (Clandinin and Connelly, 1990, p.245). It expressed 'the particular peace I had made between the individuality of my subjectivity and the 'intersubjective and public character of meaning'. Grumet contends it is this struggle and resolve 'to develop ourselves in ways that transcend the identities that others have constructed for us that bonds the projects of autobiography and education' (1990, p.324).

5.3 - VALIDITY, RELIABILITY, REFLEXIVITY AND ETHICS

VALIDITY In this research I make a 'commitment to truth' representing as 'faithfully and honestly' as possible the dialogue which occurred, the observations I made and the documents I studied (Elliott 1990, p.56). I aim to produce 'valid and reliable knowledge in an ethical manner'. Merriam distinguishes between internal validity - 'the extent to which one's findings are congruent with reality' and external validity which 'is concerned with the extent to which the findings of one study can be applied to other situations' (Merriam, 1988, p.163, p.173 and p.183). For Ratcliffe, there is no universal way of guaranteeing validity and limiting oneself to a particular notion of validity can narrow the range of methods 'that can be applied to pressing problems' (quoted in ibid., p.167). Any judgements about validity 'not only include assessments of the accuracy of descriptions, but also assessments of their relevance in capturing what is important in the situation' (ibid., p.50).

Partlett (1980, p.244) offers four methods for checking the accuracy of findings:
(1) triangulation - the use of multiple sources of data impinging on a single phenomenon,
the noting down of negative incidences immediately and deliberately before they are glossed over and forgotten,
(3) the use of consultants, 'devil's advocates' and independent collaborators to provide alternative perspectives, and
(4) distributing drafts widely and checking for the achievement of a recognisable reality.
I employed all these methods in this research. Triangulation was carried out first, by using interviews, observation and documents as sources of data, second, by interviewing as many people as possible and third, by analysing documents from at least three different sources. Draft chapters were sent to research participants to enable them to read what they had said, check for accuracy and assess the context in which I had referred to them. I found I had made mistakes in these draft chapters. I had spelt some names incorrectly and had drawn incorrect conclusions from some of the data. The research participants generally appreciated the descriptions I sent them and could 'relate them to their own experience' (Simons, 1987, p.73). I also, on my return visit to St. Mungo's Academy and Archbishop Molloy High School, re-interviewed key people about my overall reporting of the case in which they were involved. On these second visits, I found the school principals and senior administrators very helpful in assessing the chapters as a whole, telling me what I had left out and giving me some key data I had not thought to seek.

Determination of relevance in this research involved first, accepting that 'the internal judgements made by those being studied are often more significant than the judgements of outsiders' (Walker, 1980, quoted in Merriam, 1988, p.167; Partlett, 1980, p.244), second, continually recalling the sociology and theology of charismatic social movements and their application to education, third, welcoming 'ambiguity' in discussions as this broadened the range of views (Simons, 1987, p.73) and fourth, participating in lengthy dialogue.

6 One research participant remarked: 'We all like being quoted' (Maher, 1992, Int. AMHS.).
7 A researcher's view of 'what is relevant' is determined by his or her 'theory of knowledge' (Elliott, 1990, p.56).
which teased out intended meanings (Elliott, 1990, p.56). Habermas emphasises dialogue or argumentation for purposes of validation claiming participants must have equal opportunities to adopt dialogue roles, and in particular, equal freedom 'to put forward, call into question, and give reasons for and against statements, explanations, interpretations and justifications' (quoted in ibid.). Elliott believes researchers working from within an experiential perspective need to draw on this dialectical approach and 'move beyond the rather sloppy subjectivism' which can emerge 'as a reaction against the "objectivist" tradition of educational research' (ibid.).

RELIABILITY Throughout the research, I adopted Merriam's approach to reliability (1988, pp.172-173). This involves (1) explaining the 'assumptions and theory behind the study', my own position vis-a-vis the Marist Brothers' Congregation, the basis for choosing the participants and offering descriptions of them and of the social context from which data has been collected, (2) using 'intersite triangulation' particularly when one site 'seems to be behaving differently' (Louis, 1982, p.15), (3) describing in detail how data are collected, categories derived and decisions made throughout the inquiry so that other researchers can 'replicate' the study should they wish to do so.

There are, of course, theoretical issues regarding the relationship of reliability with validity. Merriam believes the validity and reliability of a study depend on the study's components (1988, p.164) such as 'the instrumentation, the appropriateness of the data analysis techniques' and 'the degree of relationship between the conclusions drawn and the data upon which they presumably rest' (Guba and Lincoln, 1982, p.378). Guba and Lincoln (1981) see 'a demonstration of internal validity' amounting to a 'simultaneous demonstration of reliability' (quoted in Merriam, 1988, p.171) while Delamont claims that as long as 'qualitative researchers are reflexive, making all their processes explicit,

8 Smith and Robbins describe validity and reliability as the 'quality' and 'believability' of the data collected (1982, p.55).
then issues of reliability and validity are served' (1992, p.9).

**REFLEXIVITY** Reflexivity is important in this research both because I'm carrying out naturalistic investigations (Hammersley and Atkinson, 1983, p.14) and because I'm studying Marcellin College, Melbourne during my time there as principal. When researchers reflect on their participation in the social world of case study research, they find their personal qualities have the capacity 'to filter, skew, shape, block, transform, construe, and misconstrue what transpires from the outset of a research project to its culmination in a written statement' (Peshkin, 1988, p.17). Rather than engage in futile attempts to eliminate these effects, Hammersley and Atkinson recommend acknowledging them by, for example, trying to understand how people 'respond to the presence of the researcher', as this may be as informative as to how they react to other situations (1983, p.15). Peshkin insists that once researchers recognise the personal qualities influencing their research, 'they can at least disclose to their readers where self and subject become joined' - otherwise, he believes, during the research process subjectivities must be tamed (1988, p.17 and p.20). Interpretive researchers, unlike critical theorists, endeavour to resist the temptation to use their subjective sensitivities to participate 'in shaping the context' of particular situations (Hammersley and Atkinson, 1983, p.18). Yet, I believe, they are not well described somewhat dismissively as 'relatively passive', as critical theorists Carr and Kemmis suggest, particularly when reflexivity is acknowledged in the research process - 'passive' is the last thing I felt myself to be during this research (Carr and Kemmis, 1989, p.183; Carson, 1990, p.168).

Reflexivity can assist researchers in criticising both their research strategies and the theories they develop to explain the behaviour of the people they are studying (Hammersley and Atkinson, 1983, p.19). It can also provide researchers with the basis for making a distinctive contribution - 'one that results from the unique configuration of their personal qualities joined to the data
they have collected'. Peshkin identifies the engagement of his subjectivity when his feelings are aroused, when there are experiences he wants to extend and others he wants to avoid and when he feels moved to act in roles beyond those necessary to fulfil his research needs. He finds feelings of distress help him to focus his inquiry and yet cause him to be defensive in his analysis (Peshkin, 1988, pp.18–19). Distress' close association with charismatic action made it an important experience for me to identify in this research (Tucker, 1968, p.743).

I found writing reflexively reminded me of my accountability for, and my responsibility to the intelligibility of, the process involved. It also provided 'a forum for concrete social critique' (Phillipson, 1975, p.165; Mundhenk, 1986, p.82). Ultimately, Carr and Kemmis claim, reflexivity changes the knowledge base of the situation being studied, causing participants to judge similar situations differently (1989, p.33 and p.43). I found reflecting on the experience, reappropriated that experience 'in a new embodied form' (van Manen, 1990, p.156).

ETHICS Bassey contends that educational researchers should carry out 'systematic and critical enquiry on educational topics, within a twin ethic of respect for truth and respect for others' (1992, p.4). Soltis (1989, p.125) divides ethical considerations into personal, professional and public categories.

Throughout the research interviews were conducted 'on the principle of confidentiality' with interview data remaining the property of the interviewees for the term of the study and then made accessible to others with their agreement (MacDonald and Walker, 1977, p.188; Simons, 1981, p.29). Students were interviewed in both New York and Glasgow. The New York students were selected by the principal and interviewed as a group. The Glasgow students were those involved in a scheduled class. Documents, files and correspondence were studied, and in some cases photocopied, after obtaining appropriate permission (Simons, 1989, pp.123-
Since case-studies are 'public documents about individuals and events' (MacDonald and Walker, 1977, p.187) often involving close-up portrayals of people who are generators or implementers of a school's educational vision, I endeavoured to ensure that all participants had control over the information they gave me and how they were represented in the report (Simons, 1989, p.117). MacDonald and Walker recommend that wherever appropriate, the case-study report 'should contain the expressed reactions (unedited and unglossed) of the principal characters portrayed' (1977, p.188). For ethical reasons, I could not include all the data I received, especially data obtained when the interviewee asked me to turn off the tape recorder. I gained permission from participants before including direct quotations (Simons, 1989, p.124). Throughout the thesis I use the first person believing, with Minor (1970, p.196), that to maintain 'the fiction of the reporter' as 'an eye' without 'an I' is not in the best interests of case study reporting (quoted in Peshkin, 1988, p.21).

In conclusion, on the personal level Weber stresses the importance of freedom from value-judgement (Werturteilsfreiheit) and this can come to seem a further ethical requirement.

What is really at issue is the intrinsically simple demand that the investigator and teacher should keep unconditionally separate the establishment of empirical facts and his [or her] own practical evaluations, i.e. ... evaluation of these facts as satisfactory or unsatisfactory .... These two things are logically different and to deal with them as though they were the same represents a confusion of entirely heterogeneous problems (1949 [1904], p.11).

Weber expects the researcher to 'recognize facts, even those which may be personally uncomfortable', and to distinguish them from his or her own evaluations. In this way the researcher should subordinate himself or herself to the task and 'repress the impulse' to exhibit 'personal tastes or other sentiments unnecessarily'.
Weber acknowledges the difficulty in distinguishing between 'empirical statements of fact' and 'value-judgements' (ibid., p.5 and p.9). Currently many researchers approach this dilemma, as already indicated, by addressing the role their 'subjectivities' play in the research process (Peshkin, 1988, p.17). Once the researcher's subjectivity has been located in the research process, either in a reflexive case study or in the research process as a whole, Weber's discussion of relevance to values (Wertbeziehung) takes on added significance. The researcher encounters this question when considering the 'relevance' and relation of research results to his or her own personal values. Weber asks 'in what sense can the evaluation, which the individual asserts, be treated, not as a fact but as the object of scientific criticism'? He recommends an 'understanding explanation' (verstehendes Erklären) which he deems important

(1) for purposes of an empirical causal analysis which attempts to establish the really decisive motives of human actions, and (2) for the communication of really divergent evaluations when one is discussing with a person who really or apparently has different evaluations from one's self (1949 [1904], pp.12-14).

The significance of discussing evaluations lies in their contribution to the understanding of what one's opponent - or one's self - really means - i.e., in understanding the evaluations which really and not merely allegedly separate the discussants and consequently in enabling one to take up a position with reference to this value.

'Understanding all' does not lead, in principle, to its approval. For Weber discussion of value judgements can only serve:

a) The elaboration and explication of the ultimate, internally 'consistent' value-axioms, from which the divergent attitudes are derived ...

b) The deduction of 'implications' (for those accepting certain value-judgements) which follow from certain irreducible value-axioms, when the practical evaluation of factual situations is based on these axioms alone ...

c) The determination of the factual consequences which the realization of a certain practical evaluation must have ... Finally:

d) the uncovering of new axioms (and the postulates to be drawn from them) which the
proponent of a practical postulate did not take into consideration (ibid., pp.20-21).

These value discussions, he contends, can be of 'the greatest utility as long as their potentialities are correctly understood'. Referring to the works of Heinrich Rickert, Weber sees the notion of 'relevance to values' as 'the philosophical interpretation of that specifically scientific "interest" which determines the selection of a given subject-matter and the problems of an empirical analysis' (ibid., pp.21-22). For Weber, therefore, all social science phenomena are value laden. The researcher's own questions are value relevant to his of her own values for it is these values which shape the questions being asked as he or she 'feels through' a certain 'symbolic system', a 'pre-ontology', a 'bias' (Rolheiser, 1991, p.10; Hornsby-Smith, 1978, p.x). Elliott similarly believes bringing 'biases to bear on a practical situation is a necessary element in the movement to understanding' (1988, p.164). For 'understanding involves not freedom from bias but the reconstruction of bias' (Gadamer, 1975 quoted in Elliott, 1988, p.164).
CHAPTER 6 – DISCERNING A DIRECTION: MARCELLIN COLLEGE, MELBOURNE

Who will teach me what I must shun?  
Or must I go where the impulse drives? 

Goethe

From 1982 to 1989, I was principal of Marcellin College, Melbourne – a school owned and administered by the Marist Brothers, Melbourne Province. During this period I strove with colleagues to articulate and implement what we believed to be an appropriate educational vision for such a school – a vision in keeping with the philosophy of the Marist Brothers and one relevant for the 1980s. The chapter covers many of the decisions taken by the school's leadership team during that period. Naturally I have had to be selective because of the impossibility of covering in one chapter everything relevant from an eight year period. The account is only one person's account – for all that it was checked in draft by many colleagues of that time – and very much a Principal's account. Sitting in the principal's chair gives one the opportunity of observing, speaking with and receiving feedback from many groups within the educational and wider communities. During this period the issue of Marist educational vision came close to my heart and has provided the impetus and rationale for undertaking this research. Since the description and analysis are autobiographical and refer to particular men and women working at, or associated with, Marcellin College during that time, I make Collingwood's sentiments my own:

Because an autobiography has no right to exist unless it is un livre de bonne foi, I have written candidly, at times disapprovingly, about men whom I admire and love. If any of these should resent what I have written, I wish him to know that my rule in writing books is never to name a man except honoris causa, and that naming any one personally known to me is my way of thanking him for what I owe to his friendship, or his teaching, or his example, or all three (1964, Pref.).

1 Quoted on a bookmark from Barnard Bookforum, 2955 Broadway, New York City.
6.1 - CONTEXT

In Melbourne, by the 1950s, there were insufficient Catholic schools for the numbers of Catholics seeking places due to the post-war baby boom and the large numbers of immigrants coming from overseas (Anderson, 1992, p.19). The Marist Brothers\(^2\) accepted the invitation of the legendary Archbishop Mannix, to open a primary and secondary school for boys in Camberwell, an eastern suburb, six miles from the city-centre. Marcellin College opened in 1950,\(^3\) with six Brothers and two lay staff teaching 107 boys from Grade 3 to Year 9 (Fitzpatrick, 1988, p.11). In 1953 my parents decided to send me to this school, among other things because they knew the Marist Brothers would ensure my Catholic education included an emphasis on devotion to Mary which they did not see me getting in other nearby religious order schools. By 1962, enrolment had grown to over 500 boys, with further places being sought by Catholic parents in suburbs north of Camberwell, and in 1963 the Brothers opened a second campus at Bulleen 15 kilometres north east of the city on a forty acre dairy farm adjacent to the Yarra river. In 1964 Marcellin College joined the Associated Grammar Schools - an association of seven Anglican and one other Marist school which provided its students with a high quality sporting competition with schools generally serving a middle to upper class clientele. In 1979, a decision was taken not to establish another Catholic secondary school in the area, and the Marist Brothers agreed to increase Marcellin College's enrolment to cover the predicted growth in the local population. By 1981, the last year the school taught primary classes, 441 students were enrolled at the Camberwell campus and 639 at the Bulleen campus. These figures reflect the closing of primary Grades 5 and 6 at the end of 1981, the increase in students at the Year 7 level and the relatively constant retention rate over the four year period (Casey, 180).

\(^2\) The Marist Brothers first come to settle in Australia from London in 1872.
\(^3\) In 1946 the Brothers had purchased a property called 'Ardmara' containing a two-storeyed house and large garden area (Doyle, 1972, p.556). Initially the house was used as a scholasticate for trainee Brothers. Later the interior of the house and the stables at the rear of the house were converted to classrooms and the garden turned into a school playground. The property was ready to house the first students of Marcellin College, Camberwell.
By the period to which this study relates, then, Marcellin College had grown from a small, one campus primary and secondary school for lower to middle income families, to a large two campus secondary college for students from middle to upper class homes - in its own terms a very successful and prestigious school. The main income earner in Marcellin families was self employed in 36% of cases, and held a professional or managerial position in 54% of cases (MC, 1987, Doc. MC, p.22). The same 1987 survey would show that, while the majority of parents were born in Australia, no less than a quarter had grown up in Italy reflecting the switch in immigration to Australia since 1947 from those of British to those of other European origin (Foster and Stockley, 1984, p.37; MC, 1987, Doc. MC, p.25; Hughes, 1987, p.596). In over half the Marcellin families, both parents worked (MC, 1987, Doc. MC, p.22). Nevertheless parents still worked enthusiastically for the Parents' and Friends' Association, the Ladies' Auxiliary and various ad hoc committees.5

### TABLE 6.1 - ENROLMENTS 1978 - 1981

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C'WELL</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(480)</td>
<td>(480)</td>
<td>(463)</td>
<td>(441)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BULLEEN</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(619)</td>
<td>(618)</td>
<td>(624)</td>
<td>(639)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>1099</td>
<td>1098</td>
<td>1087</td>
<td>1080</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4 The year 12 figures include a small number of girls from the local Catholic girls' secondary school who wanted to study science subjects.

5 Br. Allen Sherry observes these parents represented 'a very small percentage of the overall parent body and predominantly the professional Anglo Saxon middle class' (1992, Corr., p.1)

6 Australia has two Marist provinces, the Melbourne province and the Sydney province. In the Melbourne province there are 138 Brothers (MBS, 1991b, p.60). Every three years, following local elections, one Brother from each
me as the incoming principal of Marcellin College's senior school at Bulleen. He told me of his recent visit to Marcellin College to speak with the staff about the importance of the school's Catholicity and gave me a copy of the notes he used on that occasion. He informed me he was appointing Br. Allen Sherry to the staff as the Marist Province's first school chaplain to assist us in our work of developing further the school's Catholicity. We also discussed my belief that the Marcellin teaching staff should be on the same salary scale as teachers in other Catholic secondary schools in Victoria, rather than being paid according to a specially designed scale containing higher salary levels as was common among non-Catholic private schools. Walter supported me in this and left me with the clear general impression he wanted me to focus very specifically on the Catholic commitment of the school. A decision taken at that time to abolish the entrance test for students wishing to enrol at Marcellin College, Camberwell was also significant in this context. To my mind, and no doubt to the minds of those Brothers who took this decision, this was more in keeping with Catholic, as opposed to private, school philosophy.

A couple of weeks later I dined with Fr. Michael Elligate, the assistant priest of the Bulleen parish and one of the chaplains on the staff. There I heard his views of the school, views he had recently conveyed to the priests of the Melbourne Archdiocese in the newspaper for priests from which I quote:

At the moment, the school I work at is situated in the new-rich suburbs of Melbourne where a success-oriented culture holds status, property and possessions as its great gods.

Maybe a little under half of our students come from homes where Catholic life is not important but a solid private school education is considered more than desirable. As it has been
said before, religion is a small price to pay for an opportunity to acquire an apparently superior education.

There was even some suggestion that the school itself sometimes lent itself to this 'lip-service' approach:

A certain form in the school did not have a religious education class for four months because their former R.E. teacher was on long-service leave. One did simply ask "Would the under-15s be left without a footy coach for the best part of a season" (Elligate, 1981, Doc. MC, pp.1-2)?

I had now received a brief similar to Walter's from a Melbourne priest, whose views, I felt, had credibility with other Melbourne priests. But, of course, I had impressions and views of my own. Over the previous eleven years, when I had been working in Marist schools in rural Victoria, I had periodically visited Marcellin College for principals' meetings. During these visits, and from discussions with Brothers and old boys of the school, I had observed changes in the school since my student days. I suspected these resulted mainly from the nature of the clientele being served by the school. I was also aware that within the Marist Brothers' Melbourne province, a number of Brothers spoke affectionately of Marcellin College as 'Bulleen Grammar'. I felt uncomfortable when I heard that term because it seemed to me contrary to an alternative term like 'Bulleen Catholic'.

And so I embarked on my new task, armed with the brief given me by my Marist Provincial - a brief to which I personally subscribed. I did not stop to consider any resistance that might come my way and, adopting my usual style of 'shooting from the hip', began to strive for the specified goal. I thought I had a clear vision for the school and, while I could not anticipate what the future would hold, I felt confident that, with God's help, the task ahead was achievable.

7 Mr. Peter Devine responds to this statement as follows: 'My contacts with the parents of Marcellin at that time did and do not lead me to believe that "religion is a small price to pay for an opportunity to acquire an apparently superior education" attitude that typified most parents' (1992, Corr., p.1).

8 Long Service leave is of 13 weeks, not 4 months duration (Devine, 1992, Corr., p.1).
The life of Marcellin College during the eight years that followed was characterised by a rhythm of rapid changes, steadying the pace, further changes. The student enrolments reveal a peak in the enrolment level in 1985 and an increase in the retention rate across the eight year period, offset by the substantial enrolment drop in the last four years - a drop which enabled Whitefriars College nearby to increase its intake by a stream.

**TABLE 6.2 - ENROLMENTS 1982 - 1989**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>1105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>212</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>1193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>1239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>212</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>244</td>
<td>222</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>1275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>227</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>1255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>204</td>
<td>212</td>
<td>212</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>1168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>1104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>1055</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


School fees remained relatively constant throughout the period, being at the higher end of Catholic school fee levels and the lower end of private school levels.

**TABLE 6.3 - CALENDAR OF KEY EVENTS**

**OUTSIDE THE SCHOOL**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>NEW PRINCIPAL COMMENCES (JANUARY)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>CHANGE OF MARIST PROVINCIAL (SEPTEMBER)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>MARIST PROVINCIAL COUNCIL PERSONNEL CHANGED (SEPTEMBER)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>CHANGE OF MARIST PROVINCIAL (JULY)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>NEW PRINCIPAL COMMENCES (JANUARY)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**INSIDE THE SCHOOL**

**THE CREATIVE STAGE (2.6 YEARS)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>SCHOOL EXECUTIVE FORMED (MARCH)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MARIST VISIT (MAY)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TEACHERS' SALARIES ALIGNED WITH CATHOLIC AWARD (AUGUST)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ADVISORY COUNCIL ESTABLISHED (SEPTEMBER)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNION LEADER AND SPORTSMASTER RESIGN (DECEMBER)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>12% INCREASE IN BULLEEN ENROLMENT (FEBRUARY)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SCHOOL EXECUTIVE EXPANDED TO INCLUDE DEVELOPMENT OFFICER (OCTOBER)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PROVINCIAL VISITS MARIST COMMUNITY (NOVEMBER)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SCHOOL ENDS YEAR WITH RECURRENT DEFICIT (DECEMBER)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PRINCIPAL'S TERM ON COMMONWEALTH SCHOOLS' COMMISSION CONCLUDES (DECEMBER)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1984 CHANGE OF MARIST COMMUNITY SUPERIOR (JANUARY)
FUTURE ORIENTED INSERVICE DAYS (FEBRUARY)
CATHOLIC SCHOOL LEADERS’ GROUP COMMENCES (MARCH)
DEVELOPMENT GROUP ESTABLISHED (AUGUST)

THE TESTING STAGE (2.4 YEARS)

1984 BEHAVIOUR INCIDENT (SEPTEMBER 14TH)
MARIST VISIT (SEPTEMBER 25TH)
PHILOSOPHY SUB-GROUP BEGINS ITS WORK (NOVEMBER)
SCHOOL EXECUTIVE EXPANDED TO INCLUDE DEVELOPMENT OFFICER (OCTOBER)
DEPUTY PRINCIPAL RESIGNS TO TAKE UP ANOTHER PRINCIPALSHIP (DECEMBER)

1985 SCHOOL COORDINATOR JOINS EXECUTIVE TO REPLACE DEPUTY PRINCIPAL
(FEBRUARY)
SCHOOL EXECUTIVE EXPANDED TO INCLUDE RELIGIOUS EDUCATION CO-ORDINATOR
(FEBRUARY)
OPENING OF THE NEW CREATIVE ARTS BUILDING (FEBRUARY)
PHILOSOPHY SUB-GROUP SEEKS AN EXTENSION (MAY)
EDUCATIONAL VISION PAPER PRESENTED (SEPTEMBER)
PRINCIPAL AND CHAPLAIN TRAVEL TO THE PHILIPPINES ON A POVERTY
EXPOSURE TOUR (DECEMBER)

1986 MARIST BROTHERS APPROVE EDUCATIONAL VISION (AUGUST)
PHILOSOPHY SUB-GROUP CONTINUES ITS WORK
ADMINISTRATION CENTRE RENOVATED

THE CONSOLIDATION STAGE (3 YEARS)

1987 27% DECREASE IN YEAR 7 ENROLMENT
SCHOOL EXECUTIVE FORMALISED WITH APPOINTMENT OF 3 VICE-PRINCIPALS -
INCLUDING VICE-PRINCIPAL MINISTRY (FEBRUARY)
PARENTS SURVEYED (JULY)
MARIST VISIT (AUGUST)
EXPLANATION OF MARCELLIN’S ENROLMENT TRENDS TO THE ADVISORY COUNCIL
BY MARIST SUPERVISOR OF SCHOOLS (OCTOBER)

1988 INSERVICE OPPORTUNITIES FOR STAFF HOLDING MIDDLE MANAGEMENT
POSITIONS (FEBRUARY)
YEAR 7 ENROLMENT MAINTAINS NEW LEVEL (FEBRUARY)
DEVELOPMENT GROUP BECOMES CURRICULUM COMMITTEE (FEBRUARY)
DECISION ANNOUNCED TO AMALGAMATE CAMBERWELL AND BULLEEN CAMPUSES IN
1990 (OCTOBER)

1989 LAY PRINCIPAL APPOINTED FOR 1990 (APRIL)
MARIST VISIT (NOVEMBER)

It will be observed that this calendar suggests a view of the
period as falling into three main stages of creation, testing
and consolidation. These are discussed in turn in the
following sections.

6.2 - THE CREATIVE STAGE

During my first week at Marcellin College, I was
invited by our ex-Olympian athlete sportsmaster to
accompany him to the school’s ovals. On the way, he drove
me out the school’s front gate and across the road to the
ovals of a high fee private school. Getting out of the car he
picked a few blades of grass from this school’s main oval
and asked me to consider the quality of these blades.
Getting back into the car, we proceeded back inside our front gate to our own ovals where once again he chose some blades of grass for me to examine. He informed me of his disappointment with the quality of the grass on our ovals compared to our wealthy neighbour, insisting that if we were going to be a 'force to be contended with' in future school sporting events, we needed to allocate considerable funds to upgrading the school's ovals.9

Some months later, I decided, primarily for philosophical rather than financial reasons, that Marcellin College would be adopting Catholic school salary levels. I had discussed my proposal with the school's Deputy Principal, Mr. Peter Devine to whom I had delegated the responsibility for the day to day running of the school.10 Peter advised me of likely staff reaction and through our discussions I developed a proposal that Peter thought would be acceptable to, but not welcomed by, the staff. This proposal recommended a reduction in the number of salary levels for teachers from 13 to 10 and the 'freezing' of the salaries of those staff members11 who were already being paid above the Catholic award until that award 'caught up' - a period of twelve to eighteen months. I informed the staff of my decision at one of our regular, after-school, staff meetings. I gave them my rationale telling them I was basing my decision on the currently accepted practice of at least 95% of Catholic schools in Victoria.12 A profound silence overtook the gathering. The leader of the union spoke briefly against my proposal and the staff meeting came

---

9 During my student days at Marcellin we used to practise for our sporting events either on the bitumen behind the school or on local playing fields which needed to be hired.
10 We worked on a 'shared leadership' model. He recalls the pressures he felt during those three years - particularly when long serving staff began to find some of the changes difficult to accept (Devine, 1992, Corr., p.3).
11 Approximately 10%.
12 There were three reasons for making the decision that Marcellin College teachers should be on a Catholic Teachers' Award.
   a) Marcellin College is primarily a Catholic school belonging to the Archdiocese of Melbourne. It is important not to create divisions or envy within the Catholic system.
   b) While teachers need to be justly paid, they are primarily providing a service to those they teach. Preoccupation with salary levels can disadvantage the quality of service.
   c) The school should be particularly welcoming to those of poorer means, who are often lower achievers and whose parents may not be able to pay full fees.
to an almost immediate close. Many unofficial Marcellin staff meetings and telephone conversations took place in Melbourne that evening. The sportsmaster and the leader of the union resigned from the staff at the end of that year.

Meanwhile I was beginning to feel uncomfortable about all the power which seemed to reside in the hands of the principal. It was becoming unusual, in the early eighties, for Catholic schools to be administered in an autocratic, rather than a collaborative, way. I consequently invited Peter Devine and the recently appointed Business Manager to join me on a newly formed school executive, with my own secretary carrying out the executive's secretarial work. I wanted to rely on these people because of my belief in delegation and also because of my commitments outside the school — particularly with the Commonwealth Schools' Commission, where I was representing Catholic education one day a week.

Two Marist visitors arrived for their biennial visit in May 1982. At the conclusion of their visit, they reported:

Marcellin is still adjusting, after one [school] term, to a new Headmaster and the inevitable change in the style of leadership. Brother John McMahon does not have any specific teaching load. He hopes to meet a ... [cross-section] of students through invitations to RE lessons. He is also absent from the School on a regular basis through his work on the ... [Schools'] Commission.

Brother John would articulate his general approach under two broad headings:
1. The need to pray with his Staff. Prayer is not seen as strong among the Staff.
2. The responsibility to act as a "Chairman" in the functioning of the School ...

Inevitably, in this approach, the Deputy

13 Ms. Julie Ryan doubts that schools were necessarily run in a collaborative way in the 1980s. She adds: 'At many inservices I went to I got the impression that Marcellin was the exception rather than the rule' (1992, Corr., p.2).
14 Every two years, each Marist school is visited for one or two days by two administrators from other Marist schools. The visitors carry out an unofficial and informal evaluation aimed at supporting the principal and leadership team of the school they are visiting. At the end of the visit they write a report which is submitted to the local principal for checking and then forwarded to Marist Headquarters in Melbourne. Visits to Marcellin College took place in 1982, 1984, 1987 and 1989 (Orrell and Lawlor, 1982, Doc. MBA; Gilchrist and Casey, 1984, Doc. MBA; Braniff and Huppatz, 1987, Doc. MBA; Van Roon and Furlong, 1989, Doc. MBA).
Headmaster is called upon to exercise many of the functions previously carried out by the Headmaster. He appears perfectly capable, and willing to do this, but it will take some time for his new role to be clarified and accepted.

The visitors also observed the enrolment change.

A significant change in student clientele is already being experienced at the Junior School through the decision to drop the entrance examination and undertake the acceptance of all applicants from the [local] parishes ... This will mean a broader cross section of academic ability and the need to cater for less able students through remediation and alternative courses in a comprehensive curriculum.

They made reference to 'sporting and academic pursuits'.

Achievement in sporting and academic pursuits ... [has] been receiving less recognition under the new regime, resulting in uncertainty and even threat among some staff and students accustomed to emphasis on these two aspects of education. This has enabled the surfacing and articulation of the objection to compulsory sport by a group of Year 12 students (Orrell and Lawlor, 1982, Doc. MBA, pp.1-2).

Other 1982 developments included the establishing of a Staff Committee made up of the Heads of Departments and Year Level Co-ordinators, which I, as principal, chaired, and of two other committees - one for pastoral care chaired by Br. Allen Sherry and the other for curriculum development chaired by the Head of the Commerce Department (ibid.). In October, we advertised a vacancy for a careers counsellor and subsequently appointed Ms. Julie Ryan to the position. She had been recommended by Marist Brothers who had worked with her on the staff of another school in rural Victoria where she was still working (MC, 1984a, Doc. MC, p.8). Her appointment to the school was to prove an important one.

**SCHOLIUM 6.1 - MS. JULIE RYAN**

Julie commenced at Marcellin College in February 1983. Towards the end of 1984 she was appointed Development Officer which involved chairing and acting as executive officer of the newly formed Development (or Curriculum) Group. In 1987 she became Vice-Principal Curriculum, a position she still held at the end of 1989. In addition to her position at Marcellin, during 1988 and 1989 she acted as a curriculum consultant for the Government's Ministry of Education. Her personal and professional contributions were pivotal to the renewal of Marcellin's educational vision.
By the end of 1982 we had also appointed a Business Manager and established an Advisory Council. This Council, as well as the school executive and the other committees already mentioned, immediately broadened the decision-making processes of the school. Most Catholic schools had school executives at this time and increasing numbers of schools were setting up their own school boards, a subject with which I was familiar since I was then concluding the writing of my Masters thesis on the topic: 'Catholic Secondary School Boards in Victoria'.

During that first year the newly appointed Marist chaplain, Br. Allen Sherry, with whom I lived in community, and I, often shared our concerns with each other about the philosophy of Marcellin College. Al worked in the area of faith development with the senior students, taught religious education, offered meditation classes and ran a Justice Action Group. He saw it as particularly important that we review the school’s philosophy statement and so, after seeking and gaining my approval, and assisted by a long serving staff member, Al drew up a new draft philosophy statement and consulted the staff as to its acceptability. Based on the responses of 70% of the staff, he drew up a revised statement and a set of school aims, both of which are

15 The Advisory Council was set up to assist the principals of the Camberwell and Bulleen campuses by advising upon and monitoring:
(1) strategic planning for the College
(2) policy, procedure and controls to ensure the effective and economical operation of the business affairs of the College
(3) the College finances
Members of the Council were
(1) the two principals until 1988, then the one principal in 1989;
(2) a nominee of the Provincial of the Marist Brothers;
(3) eight persons, normally parents, who were nominated by the principals and approved by the Marist Brothers' representative, from the following categories of professional interests: Education, Financial Management, Law, Business Management, Industrial Relations and Engineering;
(4) the elected Presidents of the Parents' and Friends' Association (from 1987), the Ladies' Auxiliary (from 1988) and the Past Students' Association (from 1988) (MC, 1989, Doc. MC, pp.2-3.

16 Marist Brothers normally live in a community of between two and ten Brothers. The Brothers working at Marcellin College, Bulleen, lived on the school site. Not all Brothers in the community worked in the school but community discussion often focused on the life of Marcellin College. While individual Brothers thought differently about the school, an atmosphere of respect for each individual always pervaded the community’s life. In 1982 the Marist visitors reported: ‘The Brothers, as a group, ... [are] seen to be very important to Marcellin. The parents identified it as a “Brothers’ School”. Their contribution ... [is] seen to vary from personality to personality. However, they ... [are] seen as bringing an extra richness and availability to their pastoral care of the students - and their fellow staff members’ (Orrell, and Lawlor, 1982, Doc. MBA, p.4).
reproduced below (Sherry and Smith, 1983, Doc. MC, p.2):

MARCELLIN COLLEGE

A STATEMENT OF SCHOOL PHILOSOPHY

Marcellin College is named after the founder of the Marist Brothers, Blessed Marcellin Champagnat (1789-1840). The College is a Catholic Secondary School conducted by the Marist Brothers, who, together with the parents of the students and the staff of the school, seek the 'on-going Christian formation of the students through the integration of faith and life' (1). As a Marist school, Marcellin College derives its inspiration from Catholic tradition, the spirit of the Marist Order, and sound educational theory and practice.

The College motto 'Per Virtute ad Altissima' ('through striving reach for the highest') suggests that in our daily living we are not content with just an adequate grasp of living and learning and developing skills. Rather, we are aware that excellence lies in being fully alive as human beings.

(1) The Catholic School, Sacred Congregation for Catholic Education, Art.43.

Marcellin College: A STATEMENT OF AIDS

Marcellin College aims to bring out in its students the confidence to make a deep personal decision to follow the lead of Jesus to his Father.

The College seeks the fostering and nurturing of the faith implanted through Baptism. Endeavouring to place the students' search for meaning and values of life within the Catholic tradition, the College facilitates the students' faith development that they might eventually define their own role in the world, in the light of the Gospels and the teaching of the Church.

Marcellin College, setting out to provide an environment which allows a Christian formation to evolve, places the Gospel values of freedom and charity as the main characteristics of the ethos of the school. The College, then, endeavours to create an environment in which the students can explore their living, even make mistakes, within a context of being cared for.

In its organisation Marcellin College allows for individual freedom and encourages a process of decision-making in which values and individual
worth are reflected through the closest possible relationships between staff, parents and students.

Marcellin College also aims to create and maintain a flexible and enriching educational programme for its students. Such a programme aims to prepare the students to play a creative and sensitive role in society with a special emphasis on the needs of others. To this end the school seeks to develop within the students a critical mind that is sensitive to important social issues so that they will be willing to take a stand from basic Christian principles.

While these statements seemed to gain the general approval of staff, not much was said either for or against them. Staff had merely responded to the writings of their two colleagues (ibid., p.3). I agreed to this process because I wanted staff to think about the school's philosophy. However I came to realise later, that while we benefited from an exercise which put the school's philosophy 'on the agenda', we should have proceeded in a way which included greater participation by members of the Marcellin community. Such engagement may first have prevented the final statement from being rather bland, and second, and more importantly, may have saved us going through the whole process again.

When staff returned for the commencement of the 1983 school year, student enrolments had increased by nearly 100 due to the larger numbers of students in the local area wanting a Catholic education. At this stage, most parents seemed unaware of any significant change in direction at the Bulleen senior campus. We welcomed many new teachers to the staff and enjoyed the associated feelings of growth and optimism. Staff were beginning to realise their opportunities for participating in the policy formulation of the school through the school executive, the staff committee, the curriculum committee or the pastoral care committee. Long serving staff, however, found this hard to accept. They felt taking their suggestions to a committee took valuable time away from their class preparation, believing the principal was the right person to make most school decisions. Incoming staff, however, generally took the committee
structure as accepted practice.

Inservice days were now becoming a more frequent and appreciated occurrence. In September 1983, Br. Allen Sherry led a day's inservice in which he covered topics related to the faith development of young adults. These issues bore a strong relationship with Marcellin's newly articulated philosophy statement. In retrospect, my memory of that day is that most staff were not engaging with the issues Al was raising (DG, 1984, Doc. MC, p.1). Indeed, though now well into my second year of principalship, I felt we had hardly scratched the surface in getting staff to reconsider seriously the educational vision of the school.

However some significant changes were taking place, as Julie Ryan reported when writing later about this period in a Catholic Education Office journal.

Over the last two years [1982-1983] there have been many significant curriculum developments at Marcellin – a special education department has been introduced, a career education program has been implemented, the transition course has been extended and a range of Group 2 subjects [at Year 12 level] now exists (Ryan, 1985, Doc. CEOV, p.6).

These curriculum changes were, of course, in harmony with the revised philosophy statement, particularly in the way they attempted to assist the lower achievers in the school by offering first, the services of a careers teacher and second, more creative and manually oriented courses through both the transition programme for Year 10 and 11 students and the Group 2 Subjects for Year 12 students. During this period Julie detected 'a general feeling among staff that these new directions needed to be co-ordinated' for she now realised some staff were becoming uncertain about 'our future direction'. Such uncertainty was not limited to the staff (ibid.).

Newly appointed Marist Provincial, Br. Des Crowe,

---

17 The 1982 Marist visitors reported: 'Brother Allen Sherry's role as Chaplain was welcomed by many of the Staff who saw the experiment as an interesting development and were supportive of it. Some, however, would be indifferent to his work in the School (Orrell and Lawlor, 1982, Doc. MBA, p.7).
during his 1983 visit to the Bulleen Marist Community, informed me of his own uncertainty about the changes he was hearing about at Marcellin - a school for which he was ultimately responsible. He was worried about my policy of delegation, feeling I was sharing too much responsibility with others. I thought about what Des had said, sought some advice from senior staff and professional colleagues, and a few days later returned to him, with some feeling, to explain our modus operandi and the processes we were employing to discern the future direction for Marcellin College. While I found that exchange difficult, it proved to be invaluable as I was shortly going to depend on Des's understanding and to receive his unqualified support over a tricky matter of student behaviour.

Not long after Des' visit, Br. Julian Casey, representative of the Marist Brothers on the Advisory Council and Supervisor of Marist Schools, presented a report to the Advisory Council offering some guidelines as to how we might handle our forecast operating deficit of $53,000 for the 1983 school year by slowing our capital building programme and increasing our school fees. Plans for our $1 million Creative Arts building were well advanced and we were also preparing to build a new administration centre to replace the existing overcrowded area. Julian described this period as 'a bottleneck of expanding dimensions in the school, namely enrolments, curriculum, capital works and administration'. He added: 'Objective and "formula-ized" methods of allocation of monies to projects, sites and departments seem to be needed' as well as 'a general consensus about the need for hard choices'. I felt the pace quickening (Casey, 1983, Doc. MC, p.1).

Towards the end of 1983, I called for volunteers to organise two staff inservice days scheduled for the beginning of the 1984 school year. Julie Ryan offered to participate and co-ordinate an organising committee. The group was assigned the task of choosing the topics for the inservice. It invited Mr. Gerard Stafford, a resource person at the Catholic Education Office of Victoria, to facilitate and
contribute to these days. Gerard worked with the organising committee for several months and on November 11th presented a paper to the group in which he noted:

Marcellin College is a large and long established Catholic boys' school which has achieved a reputation as being successful in offering a traditional "academic" education to its students. (ie: an education in the grammar school tradition which is oriented towards successful completion of H.S.C.).

Along with many other Catholic secondary schools it now finds itself in a "crossroads" situation whereby it is confronted with the option of choosing to continue in its traditional mode or of seeking to build a new direction for the school community.

He then summarised some of the College's recent developments -information about which he had gleaned from his discussions with the members of the working committee.

The Marist Order's vision for the school, manifested through the open entry policy, for example, is aimed at ensuring that through a more comprehensive curriculum Marcellin will be enabled to cater for the needs of all of its students within its local area. The administrative approach being adopted is collaborative and collegial thus enabling the talents of staff to be identified, welcomed and utilized (Stafford, 1983, Doc. CEOV, p.1).

He then outlined diagramatically the change in direction he saw before the Marcellin community as shown on the following page.

The February 1984 inservice days were devoted to the theme 'Developing the Curriculum - Hopes and Challenges'. After several input, discussion and reporting back sessions, Gerard concluded proceedings with a summarising session in which he described the assembled staff members as having achieved 'consensus' in agreeing, first, to develop principles 'about how Marcellin operates', and second, to examine 'practices which need to be better developed'.

He recommended that the staff meet to consider the setting up of an 'Ad Hoc Planning Group' (MC, 1984b, Doc. MC, p.3).

The staff supported the recommendation to establish a

18 This process type conclusion gave us agreement on how we were going to articulate the principles and practices rather than stating what these principles and practices were at this time.
committee 'to work on a proposal for an enabling structure to facilitate further curriculum development (Ryan, 1985, Doc. CEOV, p.6).

TABLE 6.4 ALTERNATIVE VISIONS FOR MARCELLIN COLLEGE

- Catholic, school community
- Welcoming, empowering, celebrating
- Success, at least for all
- Integration of faith & life
- Relationship oriented rather than competitive, individualistic organisation
- Participation & collaboration
- Student focused
- Emphasises upon building healthy community

CURRENT EDUCATIONAL THINKING

MARCELLIN COLLEGE

PRACTICES

"SECULAR" VISION OF EDUCATION

"CHRISTIAN" VISION OF EDUCATION

学生 needs - effective data?

Parental expectations - myths? anticipation?

MARCELLIN PHILOSOPHY - implications?

CURRENT EDUCATIONAL THINKING

GOSPEL VALUES

Catholic Church - community

OPEN ENTRY, COMPREHENSIVE, COLLABORATIVE LEADERSHIP

STUDENT NEEDS - EFFECTIVE DATA?

PARENTAL EXPECTATIONS - MYTHS? ANTICIPATION?

CURRENT EDUCATIONAL THINKING

MARCELLIN COLLEGE

PRACTICES

"SECULAR" VISION OF EDUCATION

"CHRISTIAN" VISION OF EDUCATION

STUDENT NEEDS - EFFECTIVE DATA?

PARENTAL EXPECTATIONS - MYTHS? ANTICIPATION?

CURRENT EDUCATIONAL THINKING

MARCELLIN COLLEGE

PRACTICES

"SECULAR" VISION OF EDUCATION

"CHRISTIAN" VISION OF EDUCATION

STUDENT NEEDS - EFFECTIVE DATA?

PARENTAL EXPECTATIONS - MYTHS? ANTICIPATION?

CURRENT EDUCATIONAL THINKING

MARCELLIN COLLEGE

PRACTICES

"SECULAR" VISION OF EDUCATION

"CHRISTIAN" VISION OF EDUCATION
I sensed a feeling of excitement in the air because staff were now working together to plan for the future. Some months later the Marist visitors were to enter a note of caution which itself witnessed to the change in tempo:

... the task of the principal requires him not only to encourage the ideas, but also to tame the collected enthusiasms with the constraints of 'people' and 'budgets' and to foresee the implications of each proposal for a wide range of existing thrusts. This is no easy task (Gilchrist and Casey, 1984, Doc. MBA, p.2).

During the first half of 1984, this new committee spent much time producing a role description for such 'an enabling structure.' In addition to staff involvement, this recommended involving representative groups of parents and students, emphasising 'the gradual involvement of students in discussion and planning about the curriculum'. In other words, the proposal committee was informing the Marcellin community of its hope that many staff, parents and students would be involved in future curriculum development processes. Early in its deliberations, the proposal committee defined total curriculum as

all the arrangements made by the school for the promotion of student learning and personal development ... not only the formal curriculum but also the planned arrangements in support of that and also all the personal interactions that occur within the school community (Ryan, 1985, Doc. CEOV, p.6).

This effectively gave the members of the 'enabling group', soon to be called 'The Development Group', the mandate to consider all areas of school life including the school's 'future direction'. No terms of reference were specified for the Development Group because there was the feeling that the Group would have to define its own role rather than be given one. Instead, the proposal committee chose the gospel values of community, service and mutual respect to be those on which the Development Group would

---

19 The role description adopted was one described in a Melbourne Catholic Education Office journal.
20 The development group - informally at least - said its role was to develop the curriculum at the school and that curriculum extended from the Year 10 Maths to the position of the dustbins' (McBeath, 1992, p.1).
base its work. The committee described these values in the following terms:

Community refers to the very way the school members interact with each other. It should be a place where happy and dynamic creativity generates unity through co-responsibility and shared participation.

For community to flourish the value of service is vital. The nature of service highlights the equality of each member so that no one is subservient.

Since the total curriculum has as its aim the total formation of the individual as well as the critical communication of human culture then the value of mutual respect is paramount (Ryan, 1985, Doc. CEOV, p.6).

Meanwhile issues were brewing in other quarters. Since early in 1984, I had become aware that the arrival of our new Marist chaplain, Br. Nick McBeath, was adding another style to Marist chaplaincy. Our first Marist chaplain, Allen Sherry had been expressing his belief that the process of change at Marcellin College was progressing too slowly. Nick, being new to the school, felt less inclined to rush the process. With these two approaches in tension, I called a meeting on April 10th, 1984 of the two chaplains, the Religious Education Co-ordinator, the Assistant Religious Education Co-ordinator, and the Deputy Principal and asked the assistant religious education co-ordinator, Nic Vidot, to chair the meeting. The meeting agreed to take the slower course and left it to the Administration to oversee the renewing of Marcellin's educational vision.

After five drafts and six months, the proposal for the establishment, membership and function of the Development Group was finally ready. Julie Ryan, convenor of the proposal committee, applied for, and was appointed Marcellin College's Development Officer - the title given to the leader

---

21 Julie Ryan believes the seeds sowed 'set clear directions and enabled us all to move further' (1992, Corr., p.3).
22 The agenda of the meeting is shown below:
a) Each to present his/her vision of Marcellin College, a Marist Catholic Secondary School.
b) The role of Administration, R.E. Department, Chaplaincy etc. in the formation/enabling of the above (no.1).
and executive officer of the new group, and a position which
gave her a half-teaching allowance to carry out her
Development Group responsibilities. All teachers, irrespective
of their position in the school, were invited to indicate their
willingness to become elected members of the Development
Group, knowing that membership would involve a
reorganisation of their teaching loads to enable them to
attend meetings during the last period of one school day a
fortnight, a meeting which would continue for an hour after
school on that day. In August 1984, with the elections
completed, the Development Group was born (ibid., pp.6-7).

SCHOLIUM 6.2 - THE DEVELOPMENT GROUP

The Development Group began with nine members, seven of
whom, including Nick McBeath, were elected by the staff,
initially for a two year term, while Julie Ryan and I23
participated in an ex officio capacity. The members came
from several departments, taught at all levels in the school
and were generally men and women in their thirties, some of
whom had leadership positions within the school.

Most meetings involved free flowing discussions. Agendas,
often twenty pages in length, were distributed several days
before the meeting. Members were also reading in their own
areas of expertise - whether it was Scripture, religious
education, or secular educational theory and practice. This
literature nourished our discussions and also provided us
with a different theory base to that coming from the staff
room which was often more oriented towards a private school
approach to education. In this Group we received a more
appropriate theoretical context for Catholic education and
one which assisted our discussions with members of the
school community outside these meetings.

The Development Group insisted on involving other staff,
parents and students in its work by inviting them to
address, in sub-groups, problems which the Group saw as
important for the school. Briefs, which were subject to
Development Group approval, were prepared for these sub-
groups by the Development Officer. All sub-groups included,
and were sometimes chaired by, a member of the Development
Group.

The Development Group met every two weeks from 1984 until
1988 when it became the school’s Curriculum Committee. In
their 1984 report, the Marist visitors suggested ‘such a
group could well become a necessary part of any large school
in the future. Hence the documentation of its experience

23 Nick McBeath believes my presence on the Development Group gave the
members a feeling of freedom. In Fullan’s (1992, p.42) words the people on
the group were ‘empowered’ because they felt they could count on the support
Eight key sub-groups were to be established by the Development Group during the ensuing years.24

With Julie showing expert leadership of creative, talented and hard-working people, the Development Group took to its task like a duck to water. The members felt they were in a 'high status group' and had some responsibility to fulfil the hopes of those who had elected them. Many of them were currently undertaking additional university courses and all were reading extensively so as to be able to participate fully in each meeting. Meetings often overflowed afterwards into informal sessions in offices, carparks or staff members' homes. Staff perceptions of the Development Group varied, as the Marist visitors reported:

Some see it as an 'initiating body', others as a 'resource group for problem solving' others as a 'review panel to monitor everything that happens in the school', others as 'a means of implementing ideas more effectively' and others as 'the school conscience' (Gilchrist and Casey, 1984, Doc. MBA, p.3).

No matter how individuals felt about it, the staff as a whole soon realised this dynamic and forthright group was going to take the school very quickly down a new path. Some staff wondered whether it was the right path. The Development Group was not only building a new vision by creating 'a mental picture of what the future could and should look like' but was also preparing to see to the implementation of this vision (Patterson, Purkey and Parker' 1986, p.88). In September, 1984, Julie Ryan joined the school executive on 'a trial basis' so as to ensure communication with the members of the executive who were not on the Development Group.

But as change became real so the 'reaction' against it was to rise above a murmur. We were about to enter on the

testing stage of our journey.

6.3 - THE TESTING STAGE

On September 14th, 1984, during the school's lunchtime break, a student was tied to a tree and physically assaulted, although not hurt, by a number of his peers to the cheers of surrounding students. Shock waves spread rapidly through the Marcellin community. Letters of complaint were received by the Marist Provincial, Br. Des Crowe, about the lack of discipline at the school. Parents now had an incident to highlight their growing concerns about the school and their feeling that I was away from the school too much — endorsed by the students' choice of my nick name, 'Phantom'. I knew from previous conversations with parents, particularly with a group of mothers at a Parents' and Friends' Dinner Dance, that parents were worried about my style of delegating too much — a practice they thought I would discontinue if I were 'around' more. I had broken it to these parents that I believed strongly in delegation and had put it into effect for six years during my previous principalship. I also told them of the importance of representing Catholic education on government bodies and that I believed all principals of Catholic schools should take their turn on such bodies, even if it did involve being out of the school for one day a week.

A clash of expectations as to the role of a school principal had emerged. I wanted to revise the educational vision of the school, but parents wanted me to concentrate on discipline and school uniform and took the view 'Brother John's running this school, he's a Marist Brother, he knows what to do, why doesn't he get out and do it'? We had reached a testing stage in establishing and implementing Marcellin's renewed educational vision for the College. I was determined to maintain my stance of trusting those to whom I had delegated responsibilities and of standing behind them when difficulties arose, of consulting as widely as possible and of praying with the school community. For, I felt, if God's Spirit is to enliven the school community, the school's
leaders must facilitate, rather than get in the way.

In response to this incident, I had included an article titled *The Discipline of Respect for Others* in the next school newsletter, which offered the following report and invitation:

... The boys concerned have been disciplined but we believe that the whole school community needs to accept responsibility for looking seriously at the attitudes and overall environment that give rise to incidents like this ... A good school should listen attentively to the options of all within it and be prepared to adjust if necessary. With this in mind I invite opinions from parents, students and staff on how Marcellin can become a more peaceful school ... (McMahon, 1984a, Doc. MC, p.1).

Included in the same newsletter was an extract from a student's essay in which he asserted 'The ultimate tragedy is not the brutality of the bad people, but the silence of the good people' (Allsopp, 1984, Doc. MC, p.2). My invitation, and the student's essay, generated a considerable number of parent responses which varied from 'Students must be aware that such acts of violence will meet with strong punishment' (D'Adam quoted in McMahon, 1984b, Doc. MC, p.1) to 'we must change ourselves before we change others' (Collins quoted in McMahon, 1984b, Doc. MC, p.1). The educational vision debate was beginning to enter the public arena through the school's newsletter. I felt an urgent need to clarify and articulate that vision before it became too polarised and individuals got hurt by 'sticking their necks out' unnecessarily over particular causes. This was to take longer than I anticipated.

Marist visitors arrived for their next visit on September 25th. 1984 - merely eleven days after our behaviour problem! Among other things they suggested 'there could be some merit in the appointment of a second deputy provided that such an appointment enabled a closer link to be established between the day to day functioning and the administration' (Gilchrist and Casey, 1984, Doc. MBA, p.3). The visitors concluded their report with the general comment:

There would seem to be a much greater
acceptance of the 'new' principal this year. We came across no grizzling directed towards him; rather a recognition of the changed direction ... simply by a more visible presence on the part of the principal. The school therefore seems poised to consolidate these gains and 1985 should see:
a) further progress in a renewed vision of Marcellin as a Catholic school ... c) a more concerted approach to parents in order to help them understand the changes (Gilchrist and Casey, 1984, p.5).

On October 9th., 1984, through a staff memo (Ryan, 1984a, Doc. MC, pp.1-3), and on October 16th., 1984 through the weekly school newsletter, the Eagle, Julie Ryan invited staff, parents and students to apply to join a philosophy sub-group25 of the Development Group. She explained the work which would be involved for intending members and indicated that recommendations from the sub-group would go 'via the Development Group to the staff and Principal' (1984b, Doc. MC, p.2). Since only a few staff, parents and students volunteered their services, the group's final membership included these self-nominated members and some co-opted members. The philosophy sub-group worked from the following terms of reference which it had received from the Development Group:

(1) The philosophical statement of Marcellin College must have its foundation in Christian principles. It should also draw upon the Marist Educational philosophy.
(2) In drafting the school philosophy statement, the process used should raise the consciousness of the members of the school community.
(3) The sub-group would be responsible for the preparation of appropriate activities to facilitate the involvement of parents, staff and students in the drafting of the document.
(4) The final statement of school philosophy should be comprehensive but concisely stated (ibid., 1984a, Doc. MC, p.1).

The sub-group worked hard on its task, surveying parents, students and staff as to their feelings about the

25 The philosophy sub-group met for its first meeting on November 12th, 1984. Its members included three staff, two parents, two students, Julie Ryan and me (SPSG, 1984, Doc. MC). The Development Group had asked for the final draft of a proposed philosophy statement for Marcellin College to be presented by June, 1985. At its meeting on May 6th. 1985, the group sought an extension for its work until October 1985 - work which was eventually completed in 1986. The group met eight times over its three year period of existence, but it carried out most of its work between meetings.
The questionnaire to parents, for example, asked:
a) Why do you send your son(s) to Marcellin?
b) What are the present good attributes/strengths of Marcellin?
c) In what areas could Marcellin College improve?
d) What do you hope your son(s) will receive from being at Marcellin?
e) What should Marcellin be known for in the wider community (MC, 1985, Doc. MC, p.2)?
Meanwhile the philosophy sub-group was beginning to founder in its work. While a lot of data had been collected, we did not know how to use it to form a statement of philosophy. We wondered how to represent the views of those we had surveyed, how much weight to give the relative opinions of parents, staff and students and how to include Marist educational philosophy and official church teachings on education in our statement. The philosophy sub-group was not to finish its task for some months yet. In the meantime, the Development Group took up the running at the end of which the philosophy sub-group had a less difficult task because a Direction for Marcellin College, Bulleen had been independently articulated.

This came about because by the middle of 1985, the Development Group saw the immediate need to prepare a paper for presentation to staff on 'The Direction for Marcellin College', not least because some staff were still 'waiting and watching' (Gilchrist and Casey, 1984, Doc. MBA, p.2). The group harnessed all its resources, including the fruits of the philosophy sub-group's initial work. Members researched the texts listed in Table 6.5 which they had chosen from their own reading or their current university courses and believed were important resources for Marcellin's present stage of development.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>AUTHOR</th>
<th>YEAR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PEDAGOGY OF THE OPPRESSED</td>
<td>PAULO FREIRE</td>
<td>1972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE CATHOLIC SCHOOL</td>
<td>SACRED CONG.</td>
<td>1977</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONSTITUTIONS AND STATUTES</td>
<td>MARIST BROTHERS</td>
<td>1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLE, RSV,27</td>
<td></td>
<td>1977</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACHIEVEMENTS FROM THE DEPTHS</td>
<td>STEPHEN FARRELL</td>
<td>1984</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHRISTIAN RELIGIOUS EDUCATION</td>
<td>THOMAS GROONE</td>
<td>1980</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OUR MARIST APOSTOLATE</td>
<td>MARIST BROTHERS</td>
<td>1968</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After a series of vigorous Development Group debates, I presented the first draft of a Direction Paper to the Development Group on August 19th., 1985. The Group modified this draft and recommended I write the final paper during the coming school holidays for presentation to the

---

staff on the first day of the final term for 1985. As spokesperson for the Development Group, and in my own capacity as the school's principal, I presented the revised paper to staff on September 9th, 1985.

MARIST EDUCATIONAL VISION 'The Direction for Marcellin College, Bulleen' paper began by recalling the role Marcellin Champagnat had played in the education of youth in rural France in the early eighteenth century, then focused on three themes discussed by the Marist Brothers in their recent Melbourne province assembly held in January, 1983 - 'our commitment to the church', 'our involvement in education' and the 'place of justice and peace in our work' and went on to discuss Marcellin College as a Catholic, comprehensive and local school (McMahon, 1985d, Doc. MC, Art.2.35).

In expanding on the Catholic dimension, I acknowledged the changes in the church since the Second Vatican Council as outlined in Richard McBrien's (1980) Catholicism, and focused on a number of articles from the Church's Document The Catholic School (1978). I argued that the Marist school, as a Catholic school (McMahon, 1985d, Doc. MC, passim),

(1) sees Christ as 'the foundation of the whole educational enterprise' with the 'principles of the gospel' becoming the school's 'educational norms' (CS, 1978, Art.34),

(2) involves the whole school community in the prophetic mission of Christ,

(3) regards its prime purpose as being of service to the Christian education of youth,

(4) strives to enable each student to achieve his or her best,

(5) sees authority primarily for service rather than domination,

(6) includes proclamation of the Word, celebration of the sacraments and witnessing to the gospel, both individually and institutionally, in the school's programme,

(7) recognises the school exists for contributing to the Reign of God rather for building its own good name,

(8) welcomes people of other Christian faiths into its community,
community,
(9) sees its religious education programme as supporting the permeation of the school's Christian vision,
(10) embodies the values it preaches within its structures by, for example, adopting a collegial model of leadership, a model endorsed 'with virtual unanimity' by the Second Vatican Council 'in plenary session' (Burns, 1992, p.550),
(11) is sensitive to the poor, not turning its attention 'exclusively or predominantly' to those from the wealthier social classes for that would be to 'continue to favour a society which is unjust' (CS, 1978, Art.58),
(12) embraces the school's multi-cultural character and
(13) dialogues with culture (CS, 1978, Art.15) participating in political activities which promote the Reign of God.

The comprehensive dimension of the school is described in the paper as
(1) welcoming students of different academic abilities,
(2) enabling students to follow either a narrow academic course at the senior level or a course which covers a wide subject range,
(3) judging its success by students achieving their best rather than by Year 12 academic scores,
(4) aiming to do all things well, recognising that education incorporates all aspects of physical, spiritual and mental development,
(5) welcoming students with physical disabilities, provided the school's resources enable such students to benefit,
(6) expecting teachers to teach across ability groups and
(7) avoiding directing bright students into particular courses.

As a local school, I described Marcellin College as:
(1) serving primarily the children of parents residing in the nearby Catholic parishes,
(2) welcoming the local bishop's involvement in co-ordinating the school's overall pastoral strategies,
(3) taking part in local community activities and
(4) welcoming members of the local community into the school both to participate in the educational programmes and to use the school's facilities.
Ninety staff, from both campuses of Marcellin College, gathered in the Functions Room at the Bulleen Campus to spend the morning listening to a presentation of the direction paper. Throughout the presentation, I attempted to give examples from our current Marcellin experience. The staff listened attentively and at the end of the presentation mainly questioned the reference I made to the need to 're-examine' the school's membership of the Grammar School Association (McMahon, 1985, Doc. MC, Art. 5.44).

This membership was seen by the members of the Development Group as a key obstacle to developing Marcellin's revised educational vision because of their belief that Grammar Schools are basically elite private schools. The Marist visitors had reported about the Marcellin staff in 1982 as follows: 'Many of the Staff were said to be status conscious; well aware that they were working in a Catholic GRAMMAR School with the opportunities for further advancement that such experience would bring (Orrell and Lawlor, 1982, Doc. MBA, p.4). The Direction Paper suggested seeking permission from Marist superiors to discuss the school's membership of the Association. Permission was eventually only indirectly sought through presenting the Direction Paper to the Marist Supervisor of Schools, Br. Julian Casey, who subsequently tabled it for discussion at a Marist Schools' Committee meeting, a committee of which I was a member.

On re-presenting the Direction Paper to official parent bodies later in the year I found parents also felt strongly about the school's membership of the Associated Grammar Schools and wanted to know good reasons why it even needed to be discussed. In then giving the Direction Paper to my Marist superiors, it became immediately clear,

---

28 Julie Ryan, in responding to the draft chapter stated: 'The importance of the document was also in you clarifying your thinking and focusing us on future directions. I don't think it was particularly significant to staff.' (1982, Corr., p.5).

29 Bringing the issue into the public forum proved helpful in providing a clear focus for the broader issue: what kind of school should Marcellin College be? Nevertheless, it did not encourage those members of Marcellin's staff who were, in some sports, trying to cajole students into competing in the Saturday morning competitions. Nor did it encourage the students themselves who were competing enthusiastically for their school week after week.
particularly through the Schools' Committee\textsuperscript{30} meeting, that our Grammar school membership was not up for discussion. When I conveyed this informally to the Development Group members they were disappointed. They knew we had 'lost the battle' - some even thought we had 'lost the war'. I believed we could still achieve our shared vision, albeit in a different way, despite this setback. While I found the decision difficult to accept at the time, I now realise the Grammar School question had taken on too much symbolic significance and had tended to become the end, rather than simply one means among many to helping Marcellin become a more Catholic school. Some months later, at an Advisory Council meeting, Br. Julian Casey communicated the Marist Province's approval of the proposed educational vision as outlined in the Direction Paper, adding that he saw no need to discuss our membership of the Associated Grammar Schools. With the educational vision for Marcellin College approved, I was determined our membership of a sporting association was not going to prevent us from continuing to implement that vision. However as 1985 came to a close, a new challenge was upon us. Marcellin College's overall enrolments had begun to fall for the first time since 1982.\textsuperscript{31} This was to bring a challenge from a new quarter in the course of the following year.

It would prove helpful that at the Marist Brothers' Provincial Chapter held in September 1986, I was elected to the Provincial Council. This meant I was now assisting in the monitoring of the overall policy for the Marist schools of the Melbourne province - including Marcellin College. Working at this level ensured good lines of communication between the Marist provincial, Des Crowe, and Marcellin College's leadership team and ultimately facilitated further changes at Marcellin College.

In 1986, the Advisory Council\textsuperscript{32} had become a very influential group in the school since it

\begin{footnotes}
\item[30] The Marist Schools' Committee is a subcommittee of the Provincial Council. It normally discusses items of current importance in schools where Marist Brothers work.
\item[31] cf. Table 6.2.
\item[32] cf. Footnote 15.
\end{footnotes}
received the Order's response to the educational vision paper,
oversaw the financial management of the school and
acted as an intermediary between the governors of the school (the Provincial Council) and the school principals.

Some senior staff were concerned that the Council included no representative of the teaching staff, wondering, for example, about the extent of the Council's shared expertise in curriculum matters. To the Council, lower enrolments meant less income, smaller expenditure and declining school morale. Council members knew that some students were leaving Marcellin College after completing Years 7 and 8 because of their parents' concern about the senior school's perceived lack of discipline and reduced emphasis on academic excellence. They were less aware, however, that some of these students returned to Marcellin when they found the academic streaming at other private schools too great a challenge - students for whom I believed Marist educators should particularly cater. Nor was the Council as aware of Marcellin's continued good performances at the Year 12 level because of the decision we had taken to adopt the Catholic school policy of not announcing Year 12 pass rates. Members were finding it difficult to resist an 'economic rationalist' approach which views schooling as an industry and individual schools as small businesses subject only to market forces (Dwyer, 1992a, p.17 and 1992b, p.7; TAB, 1992h, p.1147; Slattery, 1992, p.16).

Consequently the Council called for a report from me or my representative on the school's future direction and accepted my suggestion that Julie Ryan would be well placed to present such a report.

33 The risk of this economic rationalist approach was not limited to Marcellin College. Throughout the 1980s it was influencing Australia's major political parties (TAB, 19921, p.1167). The Australian dream of an egalitarian society with a 'fair go' for all in the spirit of 'mateship' had already begun to fade (TAB, 1992h, p.1147). Today, the Australian Catholic Bishops observe that the advocates of economic rationalism believe strongly in the free market and the need to reduce government spending and intervention. These advocates argue for the principles of privatisation and user pays, calling for lower welfare payments and tax and less trade union influence. Taken to extremes, the Bishops see this ideology promoting individualism, the survival-of-the-fittest philosophy and greed (AEC, 1992, p.4).
Bulleen The Next 5 Years. This reminded us of the external influences on the school's curriculum, particularly those resulting from the Government's Ministry of Education. It then highlighted the following basic principles for Marcellin's future:

1. The Religious Education Programme is a commitment of high priority,
2. The school needs to provide for students with a wide range of abilities,
3. The school is committed to a comprehensive curriculum offering,
4. The school is committed to providing for students to Year 12 level and
5. The school is committed to integrated programs (Ryan, 1986, Doc. MC, Art. 2.0).

The Advisory Council seemed generally persuaded of these points and of the high quality of educational opportunities offered to students. They made an issue, however, of the school's recent moves towards non-competitive assessment though these connected intimately with the school's provision for a wide range of ability (as in (2) above). I wondered if the school's educational vision had really permeated the parent body. I had assumed, wrongly it appeared, that they understood from talking with staff and attending parent meetings on the topic that criterion-referenced testing was more consistent with the school's revised philosophy than norm-referenced testing. Initially examinations were discontinued in Years 9 and 10 because I felt they were being used to test teachers, perhaps even

34 Julie explained: 'Over the last 10 years both jargon and practice have changed. We have moved from VUSEB to VISE to VCAB [government bodies]; from core curriculum to option program to common curriculum; from centrally prescribed curriculum to school based curriculum development and from segregation to integration [all government recommendations]' (Ryan, 1986a, Doc. MC, p.1).

35 Considerable changes took place in Marcellin's assessment and reporting procedures over the eight year period. In 1982, for example, formal examinations were held at all levels from Year 9 to Year 12 - generally in the school's gymnasium with the same examination given to all students across the particular year level, irrespective of the teacher. By 1989, formal examinations were held only at Year 11 (internally set) and Year 12 (externally set) with testing now being carried out by classroom teachers setting their own tests at Years 9 and 10. In 1982 all reporting was completed quantitatively, with places in class allocated to students in some classes. By 1989 most reports only carried letter grades.
more than students. While I agreed students needed to be assessed, preferably on a continual basis, I felt there were more professional and direct ways to appraise staff. Changes in the school's assessment and reporting procedures were developed in the Development Group's Formal Curriculum sub-group and subsequently approved by the staff and the school executive. Parents had also had opportunities to express their views. But it was now becoming clear that in many - or most - parents' opinion academic standards were best achieved by hard fought competitive assessment. To their minds, the more mild 'willingness to accept mistakes' proposed by 'pious school philosophy statements' did not help their sons face the realities of the competitive world. I feared economic rationalism was beginning to have its influence on Marcellin's developing assessment and reporting policies.

Fortunately for us, however, the Government's Ministry of Education was introducing more internal assessment and less norm-referenced external assessment - as much as the Universities, who still advocated competitive assessment, would allow politically. Consequently Julie Ryan could conclude her paper to the Advisory Council as follows:

The next 5 years certainly hold many challenges for Victorian schools. It will be a period of rapid change and one requiring constant vigilance. We must be sure that we are meeting the challenges that come from the Ministry of Education and at the same time ensure that we are true to the Christian ethos that should be fundamental to Marcellin College (ibid. Art. 5.0).

A new 'speaker', the Ministry of Education, had entered the Marcellin debate. It also proved helpful to our cause that Catholic Education authorities were strongly supporting the Government's 'non-competitive' position and advocating more school based assessment at all levels, including Year 12. Meanwhile, however, private school lobby groups, including the non-Catholic Grammar schools, continued to express their preference for norm-referenced external examinations.

36 Assessment and reporting in Religious Education were introduced in 1987 (Rijs, 1992, Corr., p.4).
37 As expressed in Marcellin's first Statement of Aims.
38 In October 1992 the Labor Party lost Government. School communities now wonder what the incoming Liberal/National Party's position on assessment and
By 1987, the educational vision for Marcellin College had basically been implemented. Salaries had been brought into line with other Catholic schools, the School Executive was functioning well, the Advisory Council was becoming more involved in policy formulation, staff, and a few students, were working together on committees, the school's newly introduced music programme was growing with school bands and orchestras performing in the new $1 million Creative Arts Building, the administration building had been renovated to provide offices for the expanded leadership team and streaming had been eliminated from Mathematics classes (D, 1991, Doc. MC, p.3; DG, 1985, Doc. MC, p.4.). The Brothers of the Marist province seemed less inclined to speak about 'Bulleen Grammar' and I was spending more time around the school. In addition, the religious life of the school seemed to be developing further, with extra time being allocated to religious education and the classes themselves reduced in size. School Eucharists, available to the whole school community, were becoming a weekly occurrence, retreats were extended from Year 12 to the other three year levels and members of other religious congregations - two priests and one sister - joined the staff. Further responsibilities were now being allocated to department heads, year level co-ordinators and homeroom teachers and the student representative council was becoming more significant in the school. The consolidation of these changes now became the priority and it was to require determination, particularly on the part of the leadership team. We did not want to fight any more battles, but rather to quietly and insistently adhere to the implementation of our agreed vision for the school.

At the commencement of 1987, I formalised the leadership team further by appointing two members of the executive to vice-principal positions. Newly appointed Mr. Paul Herrick (Vice-Principal Administration) took charge of the school's day to day administration and Julie Ryan (Vice-
Principal Curriculum) maintained her responsibility for the school's curriculum development. These, the Religious Education Co-ordinator Nic Vidot who was to be 'redefined' as the Vice-Principal Ministry a year later, the Business Manager, my secretary and I formed the school's leadership team. We were a strong and mutually supportive group.

When the 1987 Marist visitors arrived, they reported on the executive's continued 'support for the direction which the School is taking, and the vision projected by Br. John'. They also highlighted a new difficulty reporting:

In discussion with the Assistants to the Principal [Vice-Principals], it became evident that they felt that the decision-making process in the School was rather cumbersome, with a lot of consultation and several Committee stages absorbing a lot of the original freshness and energy (Braniff and Huppatz, 1987, Doc. MBA, p.1). We had moved from the 'freshness' of the creative stage with the excitement of the Development Group period, through the testing stage to an unfortunate bureaucratizing dimension of the consolidation stage. The visitors also observed first a 'perception that there was some resistance or lack of commitment in the 'Staffroom ethos' to the religious aspect of the School's philosophy' and second that the students 'felt that things had "tightened up" ... since the Executive had become more visible' (Braniff and Huppatz, 1987, Doc. MBA, p.3).

Meanwhile the members of the Advisory Council were still concerned about Marcellin's future, particularly in the light of the 27% decrease in Year 7 enrolments from 1986 to 1987. Consequently the Council formed a Communication Committee, which included the principals of both campuses, and asked it to survey the parents on how they felt about

---

39 This appointment was important, both to acknowledge the centrality of Nic's contribution to the school community, and to demonstrate the importance of Christian beliefs permeating the whole Catholic school structure, rather than being the mere 'icing on the cake' (Walsh, 1983, p.4). By now staff and parents had accepted the principle involved in having a Vice-Principal Ministry because of the Religious Education Co-ordinator's presence on the school executive since 1985 (Rijs, 1992, Corr., p.4).

40 210 in 1986 to 166 in 1987 - cf. Table 6.2.
Marcellin College. The committee employed a professional firm to carry out the research. A member of the firm met with the Communication Committee and discussed our hopes for the survey. The firm then constructed the survey and in May 1987, mailed it to every Marcellin family at Camberwell and Bulleen. Parents returned their completed surveys to the firm's office where the results were collated and analysed into categories and the initial report compiled. The firm's representative then reported to the members of the Communication Committee prior to taking the final report to the June 1987 Advisory Council meeting. I felt we had to go along with this initiative because, while I had tried to assure the Council of the school's future economic viability, I felt Council members wanted the additional assurance of some external proof. I knew staff were very much against such an economic rationalist, number-crunching, mainly computer-collated approach to education, an approach which they believed should remain in the business world and not be applied to human learning. I felt the greatest value of the survey was the opportunity it gave those parents who did not have the time to join parent committees, to describe their feelings about the school in the survey's more open-ended type questions.

49641 fully completed questionnaires were returned. In one of the open ended questions, parents were asked to write down their main reason(s) for sending their boy(s) to Marcellin. 38 different reasons were mentioned with the most frequently mentioned being:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The 'Catholic' factor</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The 'convenient location' factor</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The 'reputation' factor</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The 'educational standard' factor</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The 'discipline' factor</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(MC 1987, Doc. MC, p.8)

Market research exercises such as these have recently become popular in Australia. For example, the same type of

---

41 55% of families.
question was put to parents sending their children to Catholic secondary schools in the Australian Capital Territory in 1985.

**TABLE 6.7 - PARENTS' REASONS FOR CHOOSING CATHOLIC SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN THE AUSTRALIAN CAPITAL TERRITORY - 1985 REPORT**

1. The 'religious' factor 70%
2. The 'education program' factor 58%
3. The 'discipline' factor 48%
4. The 'convenient location' factor 24%
5. The 'reputation' factor 23%

(Anderson, 1990, p.101)

Comparison between these two sets of figures is difficult because of possible different understandings of words such as 'Catholic' and 'religious'. The results do, however, suggest that while the 'Catholic' factor was the most frequently nominated response by Marcellin College parents - in itself an encouraging result - it was not as frequently mentioned as 'religious' by parents with children attending Catholic schools in the ACT.

In another open ended question, Marcellin parents were asked to write down what they considered to be the main strength(s) and weakness(es) of the College - a question also asked by the philosophy sub-group in 1986. The two nominated main strengths were, the encouragement given to Christian standards (25%) and, the care shown by teachers (20%) (ibid., Chart 12), while the school's two nominated most significant weaknesses were lack of discipline at the senior school (19%) and that 'Brother John should be more directly involved with students/less with committees' (17%) (ibid., Chart 13). At the end of this research I felt the Advisory Council had gained little new information from the exercise but had at least taken some action to understand the decrease in enrolments. Coincidentally, the Marist visitors had noted in their 1987 report:

... it appears that a few parents see only the need for academic excellence and do not really understand the Marist philosophy of a broad educational base catering for a wide range of abilities among students set in an atmosphere of Catholic values and individual concern (Braniff and Huppatz, 1987, Doc. MBA, p.4).
In October of the same year, Br. Julian Casey presented to the Advisory Council an explanation for the enrolment changes at Marcellin College. Julian explained that Marcellin's recent decrease in enrolment had been quite expected judging by government predictions of a declining student population in the area. He felt there was no cause for alarm. Things were beginning to settle down.

In 1988 the Provincial Council, of which I was now a member, decided to amalgamate the Camberwell and Bulleen campuses from the commencement of the 1989 school year and to appoint a lay principal who would commence at the beginning of the 1990 school year. In the light of these very significant, but not unexpected, changes the Advisory Council decided to write a constitution 'to clarify the functions of the Advisory Council' and to 'provide some procedural guidelines' for its operation in the future (MC, 1989, Doc. MC, p.1). The Council's Constitution specified, in quite legal terms, 'the purposes for which the College is conducted' as:

1. to provide the students with a Catholic secondary education, including in its curriculum religious instruction in accordance with the principles, teaching and beliefs of the Catholic Church as determined from time to time by the Catholic Archbishop of Melbourne; and

2. to provide the students with a Catholic education according to the educational philosophy of BLESSED MARCELLIN CHAMPAGNAT, the founder of the MARIST BROTHERS (MC, 1989, Doc. MC, p.1).

Mr. Paul Herrick, who had been Vice-Principal Administration since 1987, was appointed Marcellin College's first lay principal. I felt confident the educational vision developed for Marcellin College between 1982 and 1985 would continue to be implemented under Paul's leadership. On November 8th. and 9th., 1989, my last year as principal of

42 Julian's paper included the following sections:
 a) Victorian Patterns in General
 b) Catholic Patterns in Melbourne Archdiocese
 c) The Area Around Marcellin
 d) Marcellin Enrolment Figures
Marcellin College, Marist visitors once again came to the school. They observed:

The day-to-day running of the college lies effectively with the Vice Principals, and their openness and honesty with each other facilitates a very effective team approach...

Members of the R.E. team in a Catholic School have been commissioned with a very special responsibility within the overall mission of the Church. It is great to see that staff are willing and able to be of service to the college community through the acquiring of appropriate religious education qualifications.

The overall effectiveness of the religious nature of the school is very much enhanced by the active presence of the Chaplains [priests]. Chaplains are available for regular liturgical celebrations, counselling, visitation of the sick, contact for both staff and students.

The students appear to be very positive towards the school community as a whole, and are able to verbalise the Catholic nature of the school (Van Rooij and Furlong, 1989, Doc. MBA, p.3).

The Catholic nature of Marcellin College was now more to the fore. I felt my successor would have different educational challenges ahead of him.

6.5 - IN RETROSPECT

At Marcellin College I believed we needed to clarify this Marist school's educational vision because first, if 'we are to educate sensibly' we must above all 'do it with a sense of direction' (Reid quoted in Carr and Kemmis, 1989, p.52) and second, any vision needs to be 'explicitly stated' if it is to be 'enthusiastically and confidently promoted' (White, 1991, p.21). As the school's educational leader, I saw it as my responsibility to see to the articulation of such a vision in a credible and accessible way.

In trying to change the direction of Marcellin College and make it a more Catholic and Marist school, we did not realise how long such a process takes, nor did we anticipate, although perhaps we should have, the resistance we would encounter. Stoll and Fink note
... we have observed a few over-zealous principals try to make all their staff implement a particular goal. We are reminded of the value of the Concerns-Based Adoption Model[43] ... as a measure of teachers' readiness to become involved in an initiative ... and would recommend to all principals that they examine the research on teachers' career cycles[44] ... (Huberman, 1988) and stages of adult development[45] ... to better understand the motivation of the people in their schools (Stoll and Fink, 1992, p.35).

While it is debateable how quickly to move in implementing such a vision, and we possibly moved too quickly, we knew by the time the consolidation stage had arrived, that we simply needed to be insistent that the school's direction was here to stay, at least during my term as principal.

I believe we made some advances in achieving the brief given me by Br. Walter Smith in December 1981. There were also some costs (McLachlan, 1992, Int., LON.).

\begin{table}
\caption{TABLE 6.8 - ADVANCES}
\begin{enumerate}
\item Implementation of a more Catholic school philosophy.
\item More time for religious education classes, school liturgies and community service.
\item Readiness for Government changes in assessment and reporting.
\item Broader based curriculum for all.
\item Greater participation in decision making by members of the school community.
\end{enumerate}
\end{table}

\begin{table}
\caption{TABLE 6.9 - COSTS}
\begin{enumerate}
\item Fall in the school's enrolment.
\item Loss of some competent teachers.
\item Uncertainties about the school among parents.
\item A period of decreased school discipline.
\item Experiences of personal hurt by individual members of staff.
\end{enumerate}
\end{table}

The advances could not have been achieved without the expertise and dedication of the school executive, other key members of staff, many involved parents and some key students. The costs could have been reduced by my being more sensitive to the recent history of the school, by ensuring greater consultation with parents, particularly

---

during the creative period when we were preparing to make decisions which would have a significant impact, and by waiting longer before implementing some of the changes.

It has taken some time for me to be able to reflect more rationally about my own 'performance' as the school's principal. While I feel generally satisfied with the eight years, four of the areas where I lacked judgement are:

(1) On some occasions I delegated too much too quickly adhering too strictly to my belief in 'autonomy over dependency' (Fullan, 1992, p.54). For example, in 1985, I asked Department Heads, including inexperienced people, to short list applicants for teaching positions, without looking at the initial applications myself. Perhaps, as a result of this, the 1984 Marist visitors observed: 'The administrative structure which encourages a devolution of decision making, requires a checking process' (Gilchrist and Casey, 1984, Doc. MBA, p.2).

(2) In delegating responsibilities to others, I provided inadequate specialised training opportunities. For example, as the Marist visitors also observed:

In the process of devolution of responsibility, the Year Level Co-ordinators have picked up a staff supervision task. This seems to be causing problems for the less experienced Co-ordinators and seems to be dysfunctional with a pastoral orientation given to the position' (ibid., p.4)

(3) In retrospect, I should have insisted on a more comprehensive reporting of our Development Group discussions as they were taking place. The members of the group were reading widely and the benefit of this reading, as well as the fruits of the stimulating discussions, were neither being shared with, nor tested by, the wider school and Marist communities. For, as Fullan observes (1992, p.44) educational vision is not something an individual or a group happens to have - 'it is a much more fluid process' and 'must not be confined ... to a privileged few'. More extensive reporting could also have avoided later

46 Fullan (1992, p.42) also acknowledges the tension a leader feels between allowing 'too much freedom' which often results in a 'vague sense of direction and wasted time' and having a 'clearly defined structure' which can generate 'resistance or mechanical acceptance'.

219
uncertainties among members of the school's parent community about the type of school we wanted.

After 1987, when School Executive members became vice-principals, the leadership team's strength ensured the consolidation of the school's revised educational vision. Inviting the Development Officer and Religious Education Co-ordinator onto the executive prior to these vice-principal appointments enabled the executive to test the viability of increasing its size and of broadening its expertise. It also prepared the staff for a leadership team approach to school administration, a team which by 1989 would include a fourth vice-principal as a result of the amalgamation of the two campuses.

TABLE 6.10 - THE SCHOOL EXECUTIVE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>MEMBERSHIP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>P  DP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>P  DP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>P  DP  DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>P  SC  DO  REC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>P  SC  DO  REC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>P  VPAB  VPC  REC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>P  VPAB  VPC  VPM  VPAC  BM  VPS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>P  VPAB  VPC  VPM  VPAC  BM  VPS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CODE:

P  Principal
DP  Deputy Principal
BM  Business Manager
DO  Development Officer
SC  School Co-ordinator
REC  Religious Education Co-ordinator
VPAB  Vice-Principal Administration Bulleen
VPAC  Vice-Principal Administration Camberwell
VPC  Vice-Principal Curriculum
VPC  Vice-Principal Ministry
PS  Principal's Secretary
VPS  Vice-Principals' Secretary

The membership of the Marist Brothers' community changed continually over the eight year period.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>SCHOOL MEMBERS</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>P CH1 YR10(S) T1 T2 REC</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>P CH1 YR10(S) T1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>P CH1 CH2(S) T1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>P CH2(S) T1 T3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>P CH2(S) T1 T3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>P CH2(S) YR9 T1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>P YR9 T1 TA</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>P YR9 TA</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CODE:**
- P: Principal
- CH1: Chaplain 1
- CH2: Chaplain 2
- YR10: Year 10 Co-ordinator
- YR9: Year 9 Co-ordinator
- T1: Teacher 1
- T2: Teacher 2
- T3: Teacher 3
- REC: Religious Education Co-ordinator
- TA: Teacher Aide
- (S): Superior of the Community

(Clarke, 1992, Doc. MBA, p.1)

During 1982 and 1983, the community found it difficult to adjust to the changes in the school, with the superior being the 'meat in the sandwich' between 'the old and the new'. When the new superior, Br. Nick McBeath (CH2S in Table 6.11), arrived in 1984, I felt the community became more relaxed about the school and more sympathetic to its new direction. The expertise of pivotal lay staff, like Julie Ryan, Nic Vidot and Paul Herrick, greatly assisted the process of establishing and implementing the school's revised educational vision. The title 'Development Group' proved advantageous to the 'Curriculum Committee' in embodying the broader concept of 'total curriculum' and in witnessing to

47 Nick McBeath, a trained theologian, arrived at Marcellin College as the school's second Marist chaplain. He immediately joined the Development Group debates and proved a valuable contributor to the philosophy sub-group. The 1984 Marist visitors noted: 'The Chaplain maintains excellent communication with the principal, is supportive yet challenging' (Gilchrist and Casey, 1984, Doc. MBA, p.4). Nick helped the Marist community articulate and nuance the issues the school was addressing. Travelling together to the Philippines for three weeks gave the two of us an opportunity to discuss Marcellin's agenda as we endeavoured to absorb the influence of dire poverty on so many Philippino people. Being popular with staff and students enabled Nick to add much Marist credibility to the developments taking place. By the time he left the school to work in New Guinea, Marcellin's testing stage was over.
the dynamic, rather than merely administrative nature, of curriculum development. We reverted to the term 'Curriculum Committee' in 1988 first, to take a pause from dynamism and encourage 'consolidation' and second, because of perceived overlap with the Heads of Department Group. These leaders of faculties, rather than being appointed permanently as in the past, were now appointed for 2 years, with the opportunity of reappointment - a policy advanced by Catholic Education authorities. Most department heads I appointed were new appointees keen to promote the renewed vision of Marcellin College. The tensions between the newly emerging Department Heads Team and the Development Group were highlighted by the 1987 Marist Visitors who felt the school's

main concern was with the role of the Development Committee [Group]. How do the Department Heads fit in? What exactly does it do? Is its role mainly concerned with curriculum and, if so, why are its representatives elected, rather than Heads of Department. If it makes general decisions, does it overlap the Executive too much (Braniff and Huppatz, 1987, Doc. MBA, p.4)?

It was clear much water had flowed under the Marcellin bridge.

### TABLE 6.12 - CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>GROUP</th>
<th>LEADER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>CURR CTTE</td>
<td>SENIOR CHEMISTRY TEACHER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>CURR CTTE</td>
<td>HEAD COMMERCE DEPARTMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984-87</td>
<td>DG</td>
<td>DEVELOPMENT OFFICER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988-89</td>
<td>CURR CTTE</td>
<td>VICE-PRINCIPAL CURRICULUM</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Throughout the eight years, Marist Brothers working beyond Marcellin College also played a significant role in the development process through Provincial consultations, Marist visits and timely suggestions and cautions from the Marist Supervisor of Schools, Br. Julian Casey.48 Continual advice

48 Julian was supervisor of Marist schools and Vice-Provincial from 1982-1988. As Vice-Provincial, he was aware of the different ways the two Provincials approached their overall responsibility for Marist schools. Julian was cognizant of the original mandate Walter Smith had given me. Marist visits came under Julian's authority through his leadership of the Marist Schools' Committee. He also visited the school at other significant times such as in 1983 when the school ran at a recurrent deficit. At the peak of the testing stage in 1984, Julian was one of the Marist visitors.
from professional colleagues also helped to steady and clarify the discerning process, particularly during the testing stage. Having opportunities to share theoretically about our common practice as leaders in Catholic schools enabled us, as members of the school executive, to deepen our own understandings of our current practices and then to articulate our shared understanding to staff, parents and students.

Thus towards the end of 1983, three other Catholic school principals and I felt the need for an opportunity to discuss the leadership of Catholic schools. We agreed to form a 'Leaders' Group' which would meet six times each year. We would bring with us one vice-principal and our religious education co-ordinator. The group commenced early in 1984. Each meeting began with a meal followed by a short period of prayer and then a discussion of a pre-selected article which covered some aspect of leadership of Catholic schools. These discussions gave us the chance to interpret not only the current dialogue in the literature between theology and education and theology and leadership but also between theory and practice. Meetings took place at each school in turn from 12.30 PM to 3.30 PM. The group proved to be of valuable personal and professional support, particularly during Marcellin's creative and testing stages, and a good training ground for present and future Catholic school leaders. The group's methodology of informing discussion of practical issues with current literature was adopted by Marcellin's Development Group and Philosophy Sub-Group. The Leaders' Group was still meeting at the end of 1989.

In final summary, and in some more direct relationship to the focus of this thesis, the Marcellin experience and this critical revisiting of it leave the following in their wake:

1. one fairly elaborate articulation of the meaning of being a Catholic (though perhaps not necessarily Marist) school.

Julian was elected provincial in July 1988 and oversaw the amalgamation of the two campuses and the introduction of the lay principal. His advice throughout proved invaluable in allowing creativity but providing timely, gently worded, advice when necessary. Our relationship remained solid throughout.
(2) a sense that such statements only 'bite' when cashed out in terms of specific issues of the moment, in our case pay policy, admissions policy, assessment policy, job descriptions, grammar school,

(3) a sense of the great importance of the process of defining and redefining a philosophy - because we did it too quickly, we had to redo it,

(4) a sense of the importance to that process of a vibrant development group

(5) and, then too, of communication between this group and both the staff at large and parents

(6) a sense of the great potential for Marist - lay collaboration in creating schools of vision and idealism and

(7) a sense of the inevitability of some families and some teachers choosing to leave such schools.

We now move to Glasgow for our second major case study, where we experience a much older school.
St. Mungo's Academy\textsuperscript{2} has received Government funding for longer than most Marist schools around the world.\textsuperscript{3} The Academy's 134 year history is well respected in both Glasgow and the Order and provides an important backdrop, and reference point, for what currently happens in the school\textsuperscript{4}. Today St. Mungo's has its first lay principal and a Marist Brother as Principal Head of the Religious Education Department. The Marist Brothers are now withdrawing from the leadership of many schools with which they have been traditionally associated. At the same time, they often continue to have a Brother on the staff and sometimes on the School Board. In this case study we study one such school through the eyes of administrators, staff, parents and interested onlookers and look in particular at the current Marist contribution to the school and the educational vision which seems to inspire this contribution.

7.1 - DESCRIBING THE ACADEMY

St. Mungo's Academy is described in the current school handbook as a 'Roman Catholic mixed comprehensive' school with a capacity to enrol 1380 students (SH, 1991, Doc. SMA, p.1). Connie MacKenzie, the Librarian-in-Charge and one of
the non-Catholic members of staff, in the course of my half
hour interview with her, moved from describing St. Mungo's
as 'a state school ... [to] a Catholic school ... [to] a religious
school' (1991, Int. SMA). Still located in the East End of
Glasgow, St. Mungo's continues to serve a principally
working class community where 'there's a lot of deprivation
... a lot of hardship ... [and] a lot of families ... [who] don't
know anything [about religion] (MacKenzie, Int. SMA).

St. Mungo's association with the East End of Glasgow is
a long one. Mrs. Kathleen McNamara, a Principal Teacher of
Guidance, recalls hearing from her uncle who attended St.
Mungo's about

the amount of good work that was done by the
Marists in the East End and the help they gave
particularly to people who were living in poor
areas to encourage them academically and to
support them to go onto higher education
(McNamara, 1991, Int. SMA).

The broad division between east and west Glasgow began
around 1850, when factories and workers' residences were
first located in the east of the city and business premises
and middle class dwellings in the west (Gibb, 1983, pp.118-
119). Glasgow's population had jumped from 77,000 in 1800 to
345,000 in 1850 (Clare, 1958, Doc. SMA, p.1), with nearly 94
per cent classified as working class (Cage, 1987a, p.1)
Pauperism was 'increasing with fearful rapidity' (ibid., 1987b,
p.86). From the time they opened St. Mungo's Academy in
1858, the Marist Brothers have been committed to educating
the poor. Br. Vincent,5 for example, used to visit the poor
children of Townhead and Garnad on Sunday mornings,
ringing a bell to summon them together and then marching
his ragged regiment down the hill to the children's Mass in
St. Mungo's Church' (Clare, 1958, SMA Doc., p.95). In the
afternoon he taught them their catechism (ibid.). Similarly,
Marist historian Br. Clare6 believes, Br. Walfrid's name 'will
always be associated with the Catholic east-end of Glasgow'

5 Br. Vincent, who was associated with St. Mungo's for 45 years, died on 17th
May, 1906 (Clare, 1958, Doc. SMA, p.95).
6 As well as being Head Teacher of the Academy from 1944 to 1960, Br. Clare-
Dr James Edmund Handley (1900-1971) - had a distinguished academic career.
He authored five books including The Irish in Scotland, 1798-1845 and The
Irish in modern Scotland [1845-1945] (Darragh, 1971, Doc. SMA, p.3; Hanley,
1992, Int. SMA).
because of his work with the poor (1968, Doc. SMA, p.91). In 1888, to support the efforts of the St. Vincent de Paul Society in feeding and clothing poor people, Br. Walfrid founded a football team to which he gave the name Celtic, now commonly known as Glasgow Celtic,\(^7\) (ibid.; Mannion, 1992a, Int. LON). Soccer was just beginning to fascinate the working class of Scotland and 'they were prepared to pay for the excitement of watching exponents of the game at play' (Clare, 1968, Doc. SMA, p.92). Br. Walfrid drew up a subscription list for the club, headed by Archbishop Eyre who, while he knew nothing about football, was always prepared to support any scheme that had for its object the welfare of the poor of his flock, and formed the club into a charitable trust. The new club met with great success from its beginning and the prosperity of Br. Walfrid's organisation for charity was assured. However, in 1892, Br. Walfrid\(^8\) was moved to London and Br. Clare observes that the football club committee, freed from Walfrid's restraining hand, ignored the end for which the club had been founded. The last contribution to the Poor Children's Dinner Table was made at the A.G.M. of session 1891-2. The committee after a long and bitter struggle against the honest element among the team's supporters got their way at last and turned the club into a business with themselves as directors and shareholders (1968, Doc. SMA, p.44).

The area in which St. Mungo's is located is now described as an 'Area of Priority Treatment'.\(^9\) This indicates it is in one of the city's poorer districts where large numbers of people are unemployed\(^10\) and many single parent families live (Smyth, 1992, Corr., p.4; McLaughlin, 1992 Int. SMA). Of the students entering the Academy for the first time in 1992, 56.5% came from this area and a further 11% from other Areas of Priority Treatment (Burnett, 1992, Int.

---

\(^7\) The main restaurant at Celtic Stadium is named 'The Walfrid Suite!' (McGroarty, 1992, Corr., p.1).

\(^8\) Br. Walfrid had been Head of St. Mungo's Primary, affectionately called 'the Wee Mungo' (Hanley, 1992, Corr., p.1).

\(^9\) There are 220 of these areas in Britain, with 112 located in Strathclyde regions. Being located in one of these areas gives St. Mungo's 6.7 extra teachers 'because of the difficulties inherent in children from such backgrounds' (McLaughlin, 1992, Int. SMA). Many of these children get food and clothing grants (ibid.).

\(^10\) Up to 90% (McLaughlin, 1992, Int. SMA).
St. Mungo's has never restricted its enrolment to students in the East End, however. In 1953, for example, when 1800 Academy students were being taught in 50 classes, the students were drawn from the western and eastern perimeters of the city 'and almost all the space between, north of the river'11 (Clare, 1958, SMA Doc., p.208; McLaughlin, 1991, SMA Int.). The present Head Tom Burnett recalls a classmate of his own school-days at St. Mungo's who came from the west end of the city, from a totally different background. My father was basically a working chap, his father was a managing director of a firm. We ... became very good friends and I'm now a member of the family because I married his sister (Burnett, 1991, Int. SMA).

When the Academy moved to its new premises in Crownpoint Road in 1975,12 it maintained its presence in the East End of Glasgow (Lewis, 1975, Doc. SMA, p.39; McLaughlin, 1991, Int. SMA).

While St. Mungo's has been catering for poor students, the better off Catholics have normally gone to the Jesuits at fee paying St. Aloysius (McLaughlin, 1992, Int. SMA; Mannion, 1992a, Int. SMA). Others either attended St. Joseph's Dumfries when it was a boarding school,13 the Benedictines14 or the De La Salle Brothers - a similar pattern to that experienced by the first Marist Brothers in France in the nineteenth century when the wealthier Catholics sent their children to be taught by the De La Salle Brothers15 (McHardy, 1991, Int. LON; Goldberg, 1992, Int. LON.; Sheils, 1992, Corr., pp.1-2; Smyth, 1992, Corr., p.4).

According to the present Head Teacher students of all academic abilities currently attend the school (Burnett, 1991, Mtg. SMA). He recalls how the Academy's admissions policy was at one time based on academic ability (ibid.). This meant

---
11 At this time, because the numbers were so large, the decision had to be taken to divert pupils from eight of the feeder schools to a new Catholic secondary school (Clare, 1958, Doc. SMA, p.208; McIachlan, 1991, Int. SMA).
12 The building cost £1.5 million and has a capacity for 1599 students (Lewis, 1975, SMA Doc. p.39; McLaughlin, 1991, Int. SMA).
13 A Marist Brothers' School.
14 At Fort Augustus, Ampleforth and Downside (Sheils, 1992, Corr., pp.1-2).
15 cf. Chapter 5.
that 'only the top one or two from each ... primary school in Glasgow actually got into St. Mungo's' (MacKenzie, 1991, SMA Int.). At the entrance scholarship examination in May 1919, for example, 160 boys from 35 schools competed for 20 places (Clare, 1958, SMA Doc. p.140).

In the 1991-2 school year, St. Mungo's enrolment by year level was: S1 - 174, S2 - 195, S3 - 162, S4 - 152, S5 - 141 and S6 - 50 - a total of 874. Tom Burnett is pleased with the increase in enrolments over recent years:

Last year, into the first year, we had 170 come in - of those 40 were from other areas. This year we have 22416 coming into first year - of those ... 50 are booked for formal placing requests - that is they should be going to other schools but they're requesting to come here instead. And these are from all over the city. That is something which is quite exciting (1991, Int. SMA).

The 1992-3 total enrolment is 982 with 233 of these in S1. 1059 students are expected to be enrolled in the 1993-4 school year (Burnett, 1992, Int. SMA).

### TABLE 7.1 - ST. MUNGO'S ACADEMY'S ENROLMENTS AND KEY EVENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>ENROLMENT</th>
<th>EVENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>ST. MUNGO'S ACADEMY OPENS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1861</td>
<td></td>
<td>THE ACADEMY MOVES TO ST. MUNGO STREET</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1874</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>THE ACADEMY MOVES TO PARSON STREET</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1883</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>FORMER PUPILS' ASSOC. INAUGURATED17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1884</td>
<td></td>
<td>ACADEMY RECOGNISED AS A SEC. SCHOOL18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1892</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>KEY EDUCATION ACT18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>580</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1918</td>
<td>580</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

16 233 students actually enrolled for the 1992-3 year in S1 (Burnett, 1992, Int. SMA).
17 Although the first official reunion of former pupils of the Academy took place in 1876, it was not until 1884 that the Association was officially inaugurated (Clare, 1958, SMA Doc., p.210). The Association subsequently became a major fund raiser, providing bursaries for deserving pupils who required help.
18 When Br. Ezechiel applied for recognition of the Academy as a secondary school 'so strong was the evidence of good work in the past that it was admitted without a dissentient voice' (Clare, 1958, Doc. SMA, p.62). The 1918 Education Act revolutionised Scottish education (Craige, 1968, p.323). It replaced the hundreds of local school boards with thirty-five local education authorities. At the same time, the opportunity was taken to bring the denominational schools within the state system on terms acceptable to all the interested parties, but arrived at only after long and delicate negotiations (ibid.). Within the two years laid down by the Act, practically every denominational school in Scotland, including 226 Catholic schools, had been transferred to the local education authorities with those choosing to remain independent losing all financial aid from government.
1924 1030  ACADEMY TEACHERS RETURN FROM WAR  
1939 1105  
1945 1800  NEW SCHOOL ESTABLISHED NEARBY  
1953 1370  CENTENARY YEAR  
1958 1400  ACADEMY MOVES TO CROWNPON POINT ROAD  
1971 1850  PERIOD OF LOW MORALE BEGINS  
1978 1100  FIRST LAY PRINCIPAL APPOINTED  
1986 450  ST. MUNGO'S ACADEMY AMALGAMATES WITH OUR LADY AND ST. FRANCIS SECONDARY SCHOOL  
1991 874  

**SCHOLIUM 7.1 - MR. TOM BURNETT**

St. Mungo's Academy was administered by the Marist Brothers from 1858 to 1986. Tom Burnett commenced as the Academy's first lay Head Teacher on October 27th, 1986. He received sources (Clare, 1958, SMA Doc., p.139; Craigie, 1966, p.324). St. Mungo's chose to transfer so as to enable as many of the poorer Catholic families to get a Catholic secondary education (McGroarty, 1992, Int. SMA). These 'transferred schools', when taken over by the local authority, were to be maintained as public schools in the same way as existing public schools (Craigie, 1966, p.324). While ecclesiastical authorities in Glasgow first rented, and then handed over their schools for a lump sum to the new Education Committees which had been elected under the Act, the Brothers were allowed to retain ownership of St. Mungo's Academy while renting the premises to the committee (MB, 1967, Doc. SMA., p.42; Clare, 1968, Doc. SMA, p.93 and p.95). This meant the Brothers were 'responsible for repairs in the external structure but everything else for the normal functioning of the school ... [was] provided by the public body' (Clare, 1968, Doc. SMA, p.95).

The local authority appointed and dismissed staff, and all new appointments had to satisfy the Regulations of the Scottish Education Department for the Training of Teachers (ibid.). The churches, however, retained the right to approve every new appointment in respect of religious beliefs and the right to continue religious education according to past practice; the time to be devoted to it was to be no less than formerly, and unpaid supervisors were to be appointed to see that it was being efficiently carried out (Craigie, 1966, p.324; Lamont, 1989, p.201). This Act 'remedied the inequalities of the national system by offering the same opportunities to all pupils irrespective of their religion' and gave the right to the Catholic Church to have its own schools paid for out of state funds (Clare, 1958, SMA Doc, p.10). Craigie claims there is now 'no discernible difference between the public and the "transferred" schools, whether primary or secondary, in buildings, staffing, equipment, educational standards and achievement, or status, and as a result the bitterness of religious acrimony is wholly absent from Scottish education. The number of Catholic schools has increased considerably since 1918 - all being provided by the local education authorities (ibid., pp.324-325). St. Mungo's was finally compulsorily purchased for demolition by the Local Authority in 1974 for £16,000 (Hanley, 1992, Int. SMA; McGroarty, 1992, Int. SMA).

20 The amalgamation resulted from a city-wide process of rationalisation of educational provision. 'Glasgow had to effectively close 1/3 of its schools due to demographic changes and the falling birth rate' (Smyth, 1992, Corr., p.4). The amalgamation was phased with some girls attending the newly amalgamated school at St. Mungo's in 1988 and the rest in 1989. Mercy sister, Sr. Eileen Tracey, one of the present school chaplains, came 'with the girls' when the two schools amalgamated (Tracey, 1991, SMA Int.). Tom Burnett observes: 'When the amalgamation came I thought ... we have ... to look at both traditions ... [and] pick up the best of both ... which I think we probably have done' (1991, Int. STA). The amalgamation is seen to have been a great success (McLaughlin, 1991, Int. SMA; MacKenzie, 1991, Int. SMA).
his vision of the school from former Marist Brother principals as he explains: 'I spent quite a long time with Br. Adrian [the previous head teacher]. Br. Gall, who was a former head teacher, was also very helpful to me. Br. Gall immediately preceded Adrian. So I was able to speak to both previous Brother Head Teachers. That was very useful because they gave me a picture of the school and a vision of the school ... they said "don't be too concerned about the school passing out of Marist control because that's the way things are going nowadays"' (1991, Int. STA).

St. Mungo's has eighty teachers, most of whom are catholics, ten being former pupils of the Academy (Lochrin, 1992, Int. SMA; McLaughlin, 1992, Int., SMA). They teach students in mixed ability classes in Stages 1 and 2, in classes mostly 'organised according to ability' in Stages 3 and 4 and in groups according to student choice in Stages 5 and 6 (SH, 1991, Doc. SMA, pp.8-11). The Academy's Guidance programme gives assistance to students 'in personal, curricular and vocational matters' (ibid., p.8). Connie MacKenzie would like to see Marist Brothers working in this Guidance Department (1991, Int. SMA). Each class has a tutor who checks daily to see the students are progressing satisfactorily. Tom Burnett told the parents of incoming first year students that 'the aim of the curriculum is achievement - we want ... [all children] to achieve to the maximum of their ability' (1991, Mtg. SMA). The curriculum is integrated across a number of areas. Courses offered at Stages 3 and 4 lead to certification by the Scottish Examination Board when students sit for the Scottish Certificate of Education 'at whatever level they are able to cope': credit level, general level or foundation level (Burnett, 1991, Mtg. SMA). This enables all students 'to leave school with qualifications' (ibid.). While they can leave school at 16, 100 Academy students normally stay on for Fifth Year and 50 for Sixth Year (Burnett, 1991, Mtg. SMA; McLaughlin, 1991, Int. SMA).

Tom Burnett believes the Academy must 'give a very strong lead, maybe a stronger lead than in the past', in faith education (1991, Int. SMA)

21 The teachers are appointed by the Strathclyde Regional Council's Education Committee (Mannion, 1992, Int. LON.). To teach in a Catholic School, teachers have to be accredited by the Bishop (McNamara, 1992, Int. SMA).
22 The Senior promoted posts of Assistant Head upwards and certain other posts have to be staffed by catholics (Lochrin, 1992, Int. SMA).
when I was a youngster, faith was something which emanated most strongly from home and grew within the parish set-up ... as a child there was never a priest coming into school to celebrate Mass. It was anticipated you'd go to the parish. This school would perhaps celebrate together in the local church on a feastday, but it certainly was unusual to have services in the school. We've now moved away from that - we can no longer be a hundred percent certain that the faith is being passed on to youngsters in the home the way it used to be. But what we are certain of is that parents have made an option to send their child to a Catholic school because, somewhere in the back of their minds, they know they have an obligation to pass the faith on to their child and ... however unable they feel ... to do that, they feel ... the school is going to be able to assist them ... We then have to create an atmosphere within the school that is a Catholic atmosphere, a Christian atmosphere (ibid.).

Br. Stephen Smyth feels parents often have 'residual faith' expressed in sending their children to Catholic schools 'even if there is no other formal expression of their faith within the family' (1992, Corr., p.2).

The school has a long tradition of external inspections vouching for its academic standing. For example, Mr. Morell, 'who was H.M.I. for Catholic schools in Northumberland, Durham, Yorkshire and Scotland', reported, after his visit on April 16th and 17th, 1860:

Scholars presented at examination ... One master. Premises, furniture, offices, playground, ventilation, good; discipline, good; instruction, good. This school is conducted in a very efficient manner by a religious community, the Marist Brothers. The teacher in charge proposes to attend the next Christmas examination. The grammar, dictation and arithmetic are very satisfactory (quoted in Clare, 1968, Doc. SMA, p.32).

In 1892, soon after Br. Ezechiel was appointed headmaster, he set about revising the curriculum to suit the educational changes of the time (ibid., 1958, SMA Doc., p.62). Ezechiel applied for recognition of the Academy as a secondary school, and 'so strong was the evidence of good work in the past that it was admitted without a dissentient voice' (ibid., p.63).
The Head Teacher is hoping for a large increase in the numbers of St. Mungo's graduates going on to university: 'Although a school in the East End of the city is serving largely a deprived part of the city ... we've still got lots of youngsters here with the potential to go to university. Parents shy away from this prospect because it's daunting to them' (1991, Int. SMA). Many Academy students complete their secondary studies before Stage 5\textsuperscript{23} and consequently do not intend proceeding to higher education at the present time. For example, 7 out of 17 of the current S5B class intend going on to university or further education. The others intend going into trades such as joinery and electrical work. Employment, however, is hard for young people to find in the Glasgow of today (MacKenzie, 1991, SMA Int.).

The Academy's current extra curricular activities include soccer, basketball, debating, chess, photography, school orchestra, choir, school trips, drama, hockey, swimming, computer club, gardening, pro-life cell and rowing (SH, 1991, Doc. SMA, p.14). Football has traditionally played a prominent part in the life of the school. The Former Pupils' Association Bulletin reports, for example, that in 1922, 1923 and 1924 St. Mungo's topped the first division league, scoring 110 goals for the loss of 17 and losing only three points in three years (quoted in Clare, 1958, SMA Doc., p.187). In 1929, the Academy also entered the scout movement by registering a company recruited, organised and governed within the school as the 108th Glasgow (St. Mungo's Academy) Boy Scout Troop (ibid., p.164).

Parents of students are encouraged to join the Academy's Parent Teacher Association and, if they wish, they can represent other parents formally on the School Board which was set up in response to The School Boards [Scotland] Act 1988. The Board is composed of parents, staff and co-opted members, with the Head Teacher as the Board's professional adviser (SH, 1991, Doc. SMA, p.18). Parent

\textsuperscript{23} Students can enter University of Further Education after Stage 5. A lot of the Stage 6 studies are equivalent to first year university standard (Lochrin, 1992, Int. SMA).
positions are filled by election.

7.2 - THE MARIST CONTRIBUTION TODAY

Br. Stephen Smyth continues the Marist contribution to St. Mungo's Academy today. What kind of service does his 'one-Marist-show' represent? Is there a recognisable continuity with the past? Does his work have a clear Marist definition - granted that it is bound to have its own individual stamp? We shall address these and similar questions at some length - through the eyes of Stephen himself and of his colleagues, students and Brothers.

SCHOLIUM 7.2 - BR. STEPHEN SMYTH

Stephen Smyth was born in the East End of Glasgow near where St. Mungo's Academy now stands. When he was 5 he moved to the West End to a local authority, post World War II housing estate (40,000 people). He went to the local catholic primary schools and gained a place in the then 'selective' St. Mungo's Academy. For 6 years he travelled the 9 miles to the Academy, then located at Townhead in the city, even though there was a new catholic comprehensive secondary school across the street from his home (Smyth, 1992, Corr., p.4). Stephen joined the Marist Brothers and after working for some years in St. Joseph's College, Dumfries, joined the staff of St. Mungo's Academy as a drama teacher in 197924 (Hannion, 1992b, Int. LON.). He applied for, and was appointed to, the position of Principal Head of the Academy's Religious Education Department in 198325 (ibid.).

Stephen is described by members of the school community as a coordinator, a catalyst and as having charisma. He sees himself as 'a brother' to those with whom he works, admits his 'first training was in drama'26 and that he comes to the position with 'a background which is experiential rather than academic in a traditional sense' (1991b, Int. SMA; 1992, Corr., p.5). Eileen Higgins describes Stephen as 'teaching what he believes ... from the bottom of his heart' (1991, Int. SMA). His presence at St. Mungo's is as much a result of personal choice as it is of Marist policy. The Marist Brothers in the province27 'look up to Stephen'

24 Since Stephen is employed by the Local Authority, he could be moved to another school, including a non-denominational one (Smyth, 1992, Corr., p.3).
25 Stephen has always taught religious education. In 1991 he was the only religious education specialist on the St. Mungo's staff. He alone had completed a diploma in Religious Education (Mannion, 1992b, Int. LON.). The position of Principal Teacher of Religious Education first came into Glasgow's schools in the 1980s. Previously, Religious Education had not been regarded as being 'sufficiently academic' (McLaughlin, 1992, Int. SMA).
26 Stephen has a Bachelor of Education in Drama and a Diploma of Religious Education (Mannion, 1992b, Int. LON.).
27 The Marist Province of Britain and Cameroon, to which Stephen belongs, has 77 Brothers, 14 of whom work in the Cameroon. A large proportion of the
because he's maintaining a Marist presence at St. Mungo's 'where the Brothers have been for so long.' 28 (Mannion, 1991, Int. SMA). The Province wants to maintain this presence (Mannion, 1992b, Int. LON.). 29 Stephen is also the superior of one of the local Marist Brothers' communities and has been a member of the Provincial Council for the past ten years.

R.E. TEACHER, HEAD OF DEPARTMENT Under Scots law, the Catholic Church is responsible for religious education in Scottish Catholic schools (TAB, 1992a, p.26). Br. Stephen is the Principal Teacher of Religious Education - a position which has only recently been introduced into the school 30 (Monaghan, 1991, Int. SMA). The present Marist contribution to the Academy is most prominently exemplified through this work - a work which continues the tradition of earlier Brothers such as former Head Teacher, Br. Ezechiel, who stated in 1892: 'The course of education pursued at the Academy is based on religion' (quoted in Clare, 1958, SMA Doc., p.62). Stephen oversees his Department's goals and methodologies and assists the teachers personally with their teaching. He is said to have great rapport with staff (Monaghan, 1991, Int. SMA) - striving to help them be authentic in their teaching of religion. Eileen Higgins believes that since 'so few' of the students 'set a foot inside a church nowadays, Br. Stephen's probably one of the few religious, of any description', who enters their lives (1991, Int. SMA). He has over thirty teachers in his department, all of whom also teach in other departments (Smyth, 1992, Corr., p.5).

Stephen's idea here is that the children don't see R.E. being identified with one particular person. But they see a variety of types of teachers, all participating in the process of teaching R.E. In this way the children are spared the horrors of being landed, for too long.
anyway, with someone they do not like (Monaghan, 1992, Int. SMA).

While in practice all Academy students attend two hours of religious education classes each week, officially, parents have a right to withdraw their children from 'formal Religious Instruction and observance' (SH, 1991, Doc. SMA, p.13). To date, no one has elected to use this right (Smyth, 1992, Corr., p.5).

The Religious Education Department's policy document explains the change in the Catholic church since the Second Vatican Council as involving moving:

from IDEOLOGY to VALUES

from CERTAINTY to SEEKING

from OBSERVANCE OF LAW to CREATIVITY
(these are both fidelity responses)

from MERE MEMBERSHIP to RESPONSIBILITY
(especially lay people)

from SOCIAL INTEGRATION to SOCIAL OPPOSITION
(not just accepting the status quo e.g. S.America)

from RELIGION to FAITH

Some key terms are defined in the following ways:

**Evangelisation**
- begins when the individual is in some way challenged by the Gospel\(^{31}\) - only after this initial step can catechesis begin ...

**Catechesis** ...
- to nurture and develop an already existing faith ... - leads to a profound and personal relationship with God through worship and prayer ...

**Religious Education**
- to help to be aware and appreciate the religious dimension of life and the way this has been expressed in religious tradition - leads to a knowledge and understanding of the beliefs and practices of religious tradition (SMA, 1991, Doc. SMA, p.3).

---

31 Flood (1992, p.332) describes evangelisation as 'illuminating ... culture with the light of the Gospel'.
Since 'comparatively few, maybe less than 30%', of St. Mungo's pupils 'practise their religion at home in any traditional sense' (SMA 1991, Doc. SMA, p.6), Stephen describes the role of the Religious Education Department as one of evangelisation adopting an experiential approach to the teaching of R.E. (1991a, Int. SMA):

I see what we're on about here is primarily evangelisation. I'm not wanting R.E. as an exam oriented syllabus ... we're ... trying to give the kids a sense of God, or of respect, or of their own sense of value and I tend to work towards that and I use the R.E. as a means towards that. And so at the end of it they may not be able to quote the 10 of this and the 7 of the other things but they should have a fair idea about signposts (1991a, Int. SMA).

By contrast, when Br. Gall was Head Teacher of the Academy from 1971 to 1978, he felt evangelisation was not really necessary since, at that time, about 90% of the students came from good Catholic homes. Then 'instruction was the norm' (Hanley, 1992, Corr., p.1).

Br. Stephen Smyth's conscious choice of evangelisation as the Religious Education Department's main goal is of interest to the outside observer. Some religious educators would prefer to promote religious understanding rather than evangelisation as religious education's primary goal. The Congregation for Catholic Education believes the catholic school must also play 'its specific role in the work of catechesis' (1988, Doc., Art.69). The Department's adoption of the experiential rather than the content approach to its teaching of religious education is also interesting, particularly in the light of the debate taking place in the current literature about these two approaches (Thatcher, 1991, p.22; Hay and Hammond, 1992, p.145).

---

32 Hughes writes: 'Doctrines are meant to be signposts for our journey through this secular world, not finishing posts encouraging Catholics to stop and remain safely within their Catholic stockade' (1992, p.1397).
33 Pope Paul VI saw evangelisation as 'the essential mission of the Church ... her deepest identity' (1982, Art. 14). Some students come to St. Mungo's 'evangelised' and ready for further 'religious education', while others are unaware of the relevance of the gospel.
34 See also Lane, 1991, pp.20-21.
35 Acting Principal Teacher of Religious Education for 1992, Mrs. Evelyn Lochrin describes this approach as 'to absorb' rather than 'to learn' so that they can 'take what they've learnt and carry ... [it] into their everyday living' (1992, Int. SMA).
Stephen endeavours to give special support to his religious education teachers.

A lot of our teachers came through school just after Vatican II when nobody knew what to teach. And much as they might believe and practise, they really don't know very much. They’re very competent, and very able in their own particular fields of geography or maths, or physics or whatever, but in terms of R.E. they don't know what to teach, they don’t know what’s right and therefore they’re insecure. And so I spend a lot of my time trying to build them up (1991, Int. SMA).

This kind of encouraging support helped Eileen Higgins when she was new to St. Mungo's.

Stephen allowed me to be myself. I always wanted to be a teacher. Stephen said "Teach what you’re comfortable teaching. Don’t try and waffle about stuff you feel unhappy about yourself" ... He wanted me to make as much use of any expertise I had picked up over the years. He made me feel I had a valid contribution to make. That made a real difference to my own self worth ... I found his attitude was very helpful. And he’s like that with absolutely everyone (1991, Int. SMA).

Kathleen McNamara was grateful for Stephen’s 'stimulating ideas' which helped her ‘to take an overall view of religious education’ (1991, Int. SMA). Before joining the St. Mungo’s staff, she was asked by the adviser in Religious Education for the Archdiocese of Glasgow if she would write a report on the Religious Education programme at St. Mungo’s. She recalls:

I was really struck by the tremendous depth of knowledge that so many of the pupils had, particularly the ones that Stephen himself had in his R.E. class. I spoke to some of them, I interviewed them, I talked to them about religious education. What I heard was that if any of them had any problems, Stephen was the one they would go to. They had the greatest respect for him personally, as well as as a teacher (ibid.).

Stephen stresses the importance of a teacher’s relationship with the students.

I think the relationship with kids is the way they will pick up their understanding of God. I
don't think telling them things will make them any different. My own experience of six years of R.E. when I was at school - I hardly remember any of them - two embarrassing stories and one humorous one - apart from that not a lot (1991a, Int. SMA).

Kathleen McNamara describes Stephen's own relationship with the students as one which helps them in their faith - as making it 'a living experience' by the way he shares 'his life experience with them' (1991, Int. SMA).

**SPIRITUAL CARE** Tom Burnett sees Stephen and the two chaplains, Sr. Eileen Tracey and Fr. Willie Monaghan, as looking after the spiritual welfare of the youngsters (Burnett, 1991, SMA Mtg.). Tom finds they work very well together - they don't make too many assumptions about backgrounds ... [and] are prepared to take them [the youngsters] at face value, as they come. They offer them all sorts of additional elements above and beyond what school has to offer ... [especially] outings. Br. Stephen and Fr. Monaghan and Sr. Eileen will organise a bus and take some ... of the kids out to the country just as a day away or they will take them fishing or take them cycling ... various things where they get to know them well, create the rapport between themselves and the youngsters and then build on that (ibid.).

Relationships are enhanced during the retreats which are available for students at two venues - Langbank or the Marist Retreat Centre at Kinharvie, Dumfries. These provide the students with 'a real experience of what it is to be community, of sharing prayers' (ibid.). The Academy's retreat programme includes: S1: half day retreats; S2: day retreats, by class groups, led by a team from the school; S3: voluntary 3 day retreats at Langbank; S4: voluntary 4 day retreat at Langbank and 3 day at Kinharvie; S5&6: voluntary 4 day retreat at Langbank and 3 day at Kinharvie (Smyth, 1992, Corr., p.5; Lochrin, 1992, Int. SMA).

Assistant Head Teacher, Miss Anne Maree Gough, would like to see Stephen's role extended to include more retreat work and less classroom teaching:

---

36 20-25 students normally go on retreats to Langbank and Kinharvie (Smyth, 1992, Corr., p.5).
It struck me ... [the retreat] was a great deal more effective in trying to put across to the youngsters God, the whole idea of church and ... community ... it was a more direct way ... than ... as a religious teaching R.E. in a secondary school (1991, Int. SMA).

Tom Burnett acknowledges the value of Stephen's work in organising a lunchtime Mass four times a week in the 'Blessed Marcellin Chapel' (Hanley, 1992, Corr., p.2). The Mass takes place during the first part of the break and then during the second half Stephen provides a cafe for staff and students who attended the Mass. This gives students an extra opportunity to talk with teachers informally (Burnett, 1991, Int. SMA). Kathleen McNamara recalls:

I was amazed at the number that actually came to lunchtime Masses ... I was amazed at the kind of responses they made at Mass ... I have found, over the years, that children are a bit reluctant to step forward and make a bidding prayer at Mass. They will do it if they've prepared it in advance and have got it written down, but here it was spontaneous and it was so real, praying for relatives ... without any embarrassment at all. I found that quite moving and I was surprised how willing they were to do that. I don't know why I was really so surprised at the numbers - we were talking about 50 children going to Mass, which I thought was tremendous (1991, Int. SMA).

COORDINATOR, CATALYST, CHARISMATIC Tom Burnett also values Stephen's work as 'one of the coordinators of events concerned with personal development of the young folk' (1991, Int. SMA). On the Saturday before my first visit to the school, Stephen had acted as coordinator of the school fete. Tom sees the purpose of the fete (which raised £1500) being

to gather funds so that we then have money in the coffers to subsidise all kinds of ventures which are outside the curriculum - if you like the informal curriculum. Stephen is looked to as being the natural coordinator of these kinds of events (ibid.).

The fete encapsulates

a lot of the ... spirit of the school ... [with] the majority of the teaching staff helping out, large numbers of parents, the Parents' Association and
their friends helping out on stalls, large numbers of youngsters also giving a hand ... as well as the parents who were coming in to buy the stuff (ibid.)

Fundraising has long been part of the life of the Academy. In 1930, for example, funds for the building of a pavilion for the newly acquired playing area were raised 'by means of concerts and bazaars' (Clare, 1968, SMA Doc., p.95).

Eileen Higgins sees Stephen not only as a coordinator but as a catalyst.

If Stephen went, so much of what's good about this school would fall apart, because he's a catalyst, what he can get people to do ... to give of themselves ... without being intimidating, and putting you under pressure and ... it's more in terms of the inspiration (1991, Int. SMA).

Stephen is seen as having charisma. When I asked Bill McGowan if there is 'something that Stephen does here that other R.E. teachers, for example, can't do' he replied: 'There is ... he has got a tremendous amount of charisma ... When he's not ... [at the Sodality] the same feeling is not there' (1991, Int. SMA). Bill sees this charisma as not always a happy attitude ... [Stephen] can come across very strongly and get his feelings across strongly that he's not happy with something, so it's not all a happy attitude, but it's always a good attitude - it is a feeling, it's nothing else other than a feeling, that he's there, that his presence is there, it's good (ibid.). He adds: 'The Parents would do anything for him. I would do anything for him ... he's got magnetism' (ibid.). Mrs. Evelyn Lochrin, a colleague R.E. teacher, sees Stephen 'as a person that you have to help, not for himself because he never asks for himself' (1992, Int. SMA). She adds: 'You don't actually work for him, you work with him' (ibid.).

Stephen is supported by the community of Brothers with whom he lives. Such support has always been a feature of Marist life. Br. Clare reports that from July, 1858, when the Brothers first arrived in Glasgow their communal way of life and their unity of work and outlook rendered easy an interchange of ideas and a pooling for the benefit of all of
methods of teaching that had proved effective ... A large majority of ... [the Brothers] brought to bear on their daily tasks a fine standard of native intelligence and an excellent sense of methodical direction that was, in many instances, a product of French training (1958, Doc. SMA, p.9).

This community support is also exemplified by the Marist Family Mass which is held regularly at the Brothers' House at Partickhill to which Stephen invites present and past students. Tom Burnett observes that 'a strong element of the congregation come from this school' (1991, Int. SMA) as well as many past students - some of whom left school many years ago (Monaghan, 1991, Int. SMA). 115 people attended the 1991 June 6th Marist Family Mass in honour of Marcellin Champagnat (Smyth, 1991a, Int. SMA). This Marist Family group, which has no formal structure, also offers other activities such as prayer groups when, and for as long as, they are wanted (ibid., 1991c, Int. SMA).

7.3 - MARIST VISION AT ST. MUNGO'S

The reflective, sometimes analytic, nature of many of the interviewees comments may already have been noticed and is more marked still in some we have yet to notice. It permits this section's more analytic approach to the St. Mungo understanding of Marist educational vision.

(1) One Marist role is seen to be that of assisting in transitions which schools experience. Thus Stephen's reaction to the nostalgia of former students and their criticisms of current teachers in the school:

I find a lot of these past pupil groups which talk about the great old days of the school and how wonderful the Brothers were ... to be very false ... My own experience of the Brothers in the school [was] sometimes good and sometimes bad. I [didn't] see them as being great angels or great devils ... but very human people doing their bit - some did it well and some didn't (1991b, Int. SMA).

Again Stephen is able to ease the transition from a pre-Vatican II to a post-Vatican II Church. He articulates what it means to be a Marist Brother in today's church and
thereby assists those with whom he works to adjust to the change from having, for example, eleven Brothers on the staff in 1958, to one in 1990. Here Stephen is combining a 'vigorou adaptation' of his work with 'the maintenance of institutional essentials', which are so precious to the Marist institution as a whole (Hogan, 1992, p.454). Again, there is the assistance he has given with the transition to lay principalship. It is not just that Stephen's presence provides a link for the school community between the days when Marist Brothers owned and administered the Academy to today, when the school is owned by the State and completely lay administered. Tom Burnett finds Stephen very helpful and very encouraging. He's a very nice chap. He's a real thorough strength. I spoke a lot with him and I was able to pick up a lot of information about the school. I didn't agree with everything - there are lots of things we don't agree about. When I first started pushing for the kids to come dressed in uniform, Stephen disapproved very strongly ... But he changed his mind ... that's the interesting thing (1991, Int. SMA).

Tom relied on Stephen, and his 'Marist background', in setting up the Academy's parents' group.

When I came, there was no parents group at all. I thought ... I don't like that. We'll have to get a Parents' Association going. So I wrote to all the parents inviting them to a meeting to discuss setting up a parents' group. A fair number turned up and from that we picked a smaller group who could start to get the thing going. We built up from there and we actually built a very strong parents' group. Now Stephen was a real tower of strength there because he made sure he was present at every meeting that was held. He's now become an integral part. Nothing happens but he's there. And that is really terrific. Parents have tremendous regard for him because he is a Marist Brother and also because of the kind of person he is. But there is still the Marist influence. And they're happy there is still a Marist influence (ibid.).

(2) One Brother is seen as capable of maintaining a significant Marist presence in the school, as Tom Burnett explains.

37 Between 1858 and 1986 St. Mungo's had 15 Marist Brother Head Teachers (Hanley, 1992, Int. SMA).
The Marist presence in the school certainly adds tremendously to being able to achieve the vision [of the school]. I have no doubt in my mind that a lot of it is due to the personality of Stephen but ... there is a continued Marist presence ... you're visiting - but you're by no means alone - ... a constant stream of Marist visitors ... spend some time in the school. These are seen by the youngsters, they realise that the school isn't just an ordinary school. And I would say that if there is any one feature which maybe attracts pupils to come to the school, other than the fact that it's a good school - well, we hope ... I think the Marist presence is one which does draw them, it sets the school apart, there's something different about it. People are aware that there is still this one Marist Brother in the school ... sometimes they think we have more (ibid).

In Stephen's words Marist is 'about listening, about being present, about being around' (1991b, Int. SMA). Should St. Mungo's ever have no Marist Brother on the staff, Kathleen McNamara believes it would be 'just like any other secondary school ... I think there's something really special about this place ... a lot of it has to do with its tradition and its history (1991, Int. SMA).

(3) It is seen as a Marist role to form non-authoritarian relationships. Brothers are meant to be approachable people with whom you can discuss problems (Lardner, 1992, Int. SMA; McDonald, 1992, Int. SMA). S5 student David Timlin likes the way Brothers talk to students, rather than giving them punishment (1992, Int. SMA). Another S5 student, Angelina Brady finds Br. Stephen 'doesn't talk like a teacher' as she explains: 'A teacher gives an opinion ... Br. Stephen asks your opinion' (1992, Int. SMA). For Stephen, a Brother's relationship is not 'one that should create dependencies' for, as he remarks: 'a brother can't really tell another brother what to do in the family ... That's why I find it hard not to negotiate with kids - but that might be me' (1991a, Int. SMA). Br. Conrad sees such relationships coming from the family spirit engendered in a Marist school (McGroarty, 1992, Int. SMA).

Stephen sees his work as 'brothering', believing Marist
Brothers 'should be encouraged to find whatever particular apostolate they can "brother" in' (1991b, Int. SMA). He believes 'brothering' is educational in itself, recalling that the word education comes from 'educere, to lead out, to develop, to make a person into all that ... [that person] can be' (ibid.). He asks

if you take time for people and you take care of people, make space for people and you encourage them and their interest and their development, is that not 'brothering', is that not educational (ibid.)?

Stephen prefers to deal with people directly, using the 'tholing' approach if necessary.

If I don't know how to handle the situation I will normally sit it out. I'll wait. I don't like confrontation. I've never liked the concept of confrontation because I've only ever seen it do damage. There's a great Scottish word to 'thole' and if you 'thole' something it means that you don't actually accept it, but you put up with it for the time. It's like endurance (1991c, Int. SMA).

Even in 1882, when the discipline at the Academy was described as 'strict', this 'did not prevent the school from enjoying its full share of the homeliness and camaraderie that flourish in a private, whole-hearted adventure but wilt in the presence of cold officialdom (Clare, 1958, Doc. SMA, p.42).

(4) Marist Brothers are seen as committed to their life and work. Tom Burnett welcomes this 'diligence and dedication':

I think it helps ... especially in today's society to see somebody who is committed. Other teachers come into school, do their job go home and have their life and the kids don't see enough of that sort of teacher but Stephen takes them on fishing trips, takes them on retreats, takes them up to his house for their Masses and gets them involved there. They see him as giving at a time when they probably need

---

38 Stephen emphasises that our age is one 'where people change jobs pretty often' (1991b, Int. SMA).
39 The Brothers adhered to the instruction in their 1853 School Guide (cf. Chapter 4) 'Loquacity is the defect that is most injurious to the teacher, to the discipline of a school and the progress of the pupils; it must therefore be put down and kept down at all costs' (quoted in Clare, 1958, SMA Doc., p.42).
that - lots of adolescents struggle, most of us struggle, but that's a hard time you know ... I think that's important from the religious situation - the fact that young people have somebody in authority who can deal with them at that level. A lot of kids especially need that at this school because of the background that they have - it doesn't give them any kind of real support (1991, Int. SMA).

Marist Brothers are seen indeed as in a different relationship to teaching and school than priests. Kathleen McNamara explains:

To have someone working in a school who's a religious adds an extra dimension which you can't quantify. You see it by the real commitment they have made in their lives. Certainly we have school chaplains but that's not the same. To have someone who's a member of staff who's in a religious order - that adds an extra dimension. It gives people a kind of role model that they can identify with (1991, Int. SMA).

The Academy's present Deputy Head Teacher, Mr. Willie McLaughlin, believes the Brothers regard teaching as so important that they cannot be priests as well (1992, Int. SMA).

Marist Brothers regard education as important. They want their students to make the best of themselves (McLaughlin, 1992, Int. SMA). Willie McLaughlin adds: 'The idea of making the world a better place by improving yourself and the people you come into contact with is a driving idea which I believe to be "Marist" in its origin' (ibid.).

(5) Marist Brothers are supposed to provide role models for their students - each giving 'an example of living', of the virtues of 'tolerance and humility' and of how to be 'unpretentious' (McLaughlin, 1991 Int. SMA and 1992, Int. SMA; Mallon, 1992, Int. SMA). Many Brothers have been looked up to as role models - their example now provides an 'indirect contribution' to St. Mungo's Academy40 (McLaughlin,
Willie McLaughlin focuses on the example of their approach to teaching, as well as their values (ibid.).

Br. Germanus, the Head Teacher from 1918 to 1944, was said to exemplify these values throughout his time as the Academy's Head Teacher. His former pupils subsequently described him as a man who was

never the one to seek the limelight; nor could he patiently endure mere formality and show. To work quietly and unwearyingly in the background was happiness for him; and he thought no task too arduous or too lowly. A deep and unselfconscious humility was an essential part of his nature; and he was always more keenly aware of the duties and responsibilities of his office and vocation than he was of their dignities and privileges. He would have hated to be called an "educationist", for he loathed pretentiousness and sham; and he was proud to regard himself as a teacher (quoted in Clare, 1958, SMA Doc., p.192).

Traditionally, Marist Brothers have seen their contribution to education as inextricably linked with Mary, the Mother of Jesus. Stephen believes the Brothers need to develop a new understanding of their exemplar. He sees Mary as

caring; teaching; listening; walking with; ordinary, everyday, including in language; no pedestal, no plaster saint; encouraging, growing; presence; the 'feminine' qualities in a mostly 'masculine' environment (1992, Corr., p.2).

She is 'a fairly ordinary, caring mother, who's always there ... one who suffered, who went through and endured' (1991b and 1991c, Int. SMA). When he starts his class with a prayer, Stephen often uses 'The Memorare'. He believes Marcellin Champagnat's favourite title for Mary was 'Our Good Mother' and Mariology's direction for today is based on the notion of 'listening' (ibid.).

The Marist Brother is seen as having a love of children. Guidance teacher, Miss. Eileen Higgins, who has been at St. Mungo's for ten years, sees the common quality in the four or five Brothers with whom she has worked during that time, as having 'a love of children' (1991, Int. SMA). These
Brothers express this love by spending 'a lot of time' with their students (ibid.). Connie MacKenzie finds Marist Brothers 'genuinely love teaching and they care about children' - something she would 'hesitate to say about all teachers' (1991, Int. SMA). Such love is important if a humanly enriching evangelisation is to occur. Recent research suggests evangelisation takes place most frequently through personal relationships (TAB, 1992, p.1282). S5 student Angelina Brady describes Br. Stephen as 'not just our Brother but our friend' (1992, Int. SMA).

(8) Marist Brothers provide a service to others. Eileen Higgins insists

Br. Stephen and Br. Alan are what I would think of as Marists in a school - you know what their adopted rule in life is ... they place their [lives] at the service of others ... The kids see a real giving experience - they may not be able to articulate that, but they know it ... Is Br. Stephen taking us here? (1991, Int. SMA).

Stephen sees the vows as enabling Marist Brothers to be 'free FOR, not free FROM' (1992, Corr., p.2) giving them an availability for others (Monaghan, 1992, Int. SMA). For Stephen the vow of celibacy is 'for love and service of other people ... It's not to make us little castles or little islands on our own' (1991c, Int. SMA). This vow enables a Brother's life 'to be at the disposal of the laity ... the Brother has to be seen to be doing the extras' (McLaughlin, 1991, Int. SMA).

(9) Relating to parents is seen as a Marist role. Past student and current chairman of the School Board, Mr. Bill McGowan, sees Stephen's contribution needing a lot of parental support. Bill certainly likes 'what Stephen's doing' adding:

he's fighting it alone just now ... he doesn't push R.E. down people's throats. He wants kids to come to Mass for a love of coming to Mass and he has had a measure of success at that. It's fallen away a wee bit which has given him a bit of concern ... I feel with Stephen's job today, Brother, ... it needs a lot of help from the parents whereas before his community was quite

41 'Celibacy implies a freedom to be unattached, therefore available' (Renate quoted in Bell, 1992, p.1047).
strong, now it's quite small ... the ... Brothers he has at Partickhill are all past the teaching stage - I think bar one (1991, Int. SMA).

(10) Marist Brothers continue to support their former pupils. Willie McLaughlin notes, for example, how 40 people during the course of the term, including some Brothers, come to the Academy's chapel on the First Saturday of the Month for the Fatima Sodality - a prayer experience which has been taking place since 1946 (ibid.). Former pupils also support their Alma Mater because of the what the Brothers have given them, not just for the formal education but for showing them 'a whole way of life' (Mallon, 1992, Int. SMA). Current committee member and immediate past president of the Association, Frank Mallon, comes to the Academy's Friday Mass each week (Lochrin, 1992, Int. SMA). People want to maintain their association with the Marist Brothers. Willie McLaughlin sees himself as a 'lay Marist' adding: 'There's about six or seven of us in this school ... Lots of former pupils, many of them teachers, think of themselves as "Marists" and part of the wider community of Brothers' (1991, Int. SMA; 1992, Int. SMA).

In summary, this chapter has considered the nature of the contribution the Marist Brothers make to St. Mungo's Academy - a government Catholic school, long-standingly Marist, embedded in Scotland's rich history. The Educational Vision which could be deduced from this analysis would be that of Marists contributing to the Catholic education of students from ordinary or poor backgrounds. Even one Brother can achieve a genuinely Marist presence in a school if he possesses certain qualities we have identified. This is an important conclusion inasmuch as St. Mungo's may exemplify the present situation of some, and the future situation of more, traditionally Marist schools.

42 The Sodality is held eight times a year (McLaughlin, 1992, Int. SMA).
43 Frank had been president for 16 years (Mallon, 1992, Int. SMA).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERVIEWEE</th>
<th>ROLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Miss Angelina Brady</td>
<td>S5 student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Tom Burnett</td>
<td>Head Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br Gall Hanley</td>
<td>Former Head Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miss Anne Marie Gough</td>
<td>Assistant Head Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miss Eileen Higgins</td>
<td>Assistant Principal Teacher of Guidance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miss Joanne Lardner</td>
<td>S5 student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs Evelyn Lochrin</td>
<td>Acting Principal Teacher of Religious Education (1992)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Kieran McDonald</td>
<td>S5 student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Bill McGowan</td>
<td>Chairman of the School Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs Connie MacKenzie</td>
<td>Librarian-in-Charge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br Conrad McGroarty</td>
<td>Former staff member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs Betty McHardy</td>
<td>Former Primary School Head Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Willie McLaughlin</td>
<td>Deputy Head Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs Kathleen Mcnamara</td>
<td>Principal Teacher of Guidance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Frank Wallon</td>
<td>Immediate past president of the Former Pupils Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br Chris Mannion</td>
<td>Marist Provincial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fr Willie Monaghan</td>
<td>Chaplain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br Pat Sheils</td>
<td>Marist Historian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br Stephen Smyth</td>
<td>Principal Teacher of Religious Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr David Timlin</td>
<td>S5 student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sr Eileen Tracey</td>
<td>Chaplain</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

250
CHAPTER 8 — MOVING STEADILY ON: ARCHBISHOP MOLLOY

HIGH SCHOOL, NEW YORK

Whatever you desire to have done at the hour of death do now, while you have time, strength and opportunity.

St. Angela

St. Ann’s Academy opened as a catholic school in Manhattan in 1892 and over many decades built up for itself a solid academic reputation. In 1957 it moved to Briarwood in New York’s Borough of Queens where it became Archbishop Molloy High School. Unlike Marcellin College and St.

1 Quoted in Monsour, 1992b, Corr., p.4.
2 The right of churches to educate is grounded in the Bill of Rights adopted with the Constitution in 1791, as expressed in Article 1: 'The Congress shall pass no law respecting an establishment of religion, nor prohibiting the free exercise thereof ...' (Hunt, 1966, p.41).
3 The Marist Brothers came to New York City in 1892 at the invitation of the Blessed Sacrament Fathers who were running the parish of St. Jean Baptiste for French speaking people of Yorkville, Manhattan (AMHS, 1992, AMHS Doc., p.1). In the same year, Frenchman, Br. Zephiriny, having spent some time in London studying English, founded an elementary and secondary academy for boys on the corner of Lexington Avenue and East 76th Street (Thomas, 1961, AMHS Doc., p.13 & p.18). Soon afterwards, this Academy became known as St. Ann’s Academy, named after the Patroness of the American Province of the Marist Brothers (SH, 1991, AMHS Doc., p.2).

Br. Zephiriny ordered a statue of St. Ann from France but could not afford to pay the high import taxes when it arrived. So he went to Washington D.C., where he managed to convince President Theodore Roosevelt to waive the taxes and allow the statue into the country (AMHS, 1992, AMHS Doc., p.1).

Thomas describes St. Ann’s Academy as the ‘first Marist private school in the United States’ (1961, AMHS Doc., p.61). The school began in the Brothers’ house and soon spread to a four storey tenement building which the Brothers purchased from the pastor. As the enrolment increased, other neighbouring properties were purchased in 1897, 1903, 1913 and 1931 (ibid, p.61; AMHS 1992, AMHS Doc., p.1). Resident students were accepted in 1894 and three years later a high school course was added at the request of parents. The first graduates (1900) sat for the Columbia University (Schools of Applied Sciences) tests. The school’s reputation for scholarship attracted additional students.

In order to further ensure the success of the school, the brothers spent long hours in the classroom and in supervised study and recreation. The long school day lasted from eight A.M. to six P.M. every day. This investment in labor also earned for the brothers a very fine reputation (Thomas, 1961, AMHS Doc., pp.61-63).

4 The name was changed in recognition of Archbishop Molloy’s gesture of making the land available for the transferred school.

The Molloy coat-of-arms reflects the union of the two schools. The Beehive represents St. Ann’s Academy and its foundation in 1892. The rampant lion, taken from the coat-of-arms of Archbishop Molloy, represents the present school. Surmounting both of these is the emblem of the Marist Brothers, symbolic of their establishment of both schools. The official date of the foundation of Archbishop Molloy High School [1957] is set in the center of the school’s Latin motto which is translated: ‘Not for school but for life’ (SH, 1991, AMHS Doc., p.2).

251
Mungo's Academy, here we have 31 Brothers working in one school. Such a school is an ideal location to experience Marist Educational Vision in a corporate form.

8.1 - SCHOOL STRUCTURES

The school's yellow brick, four storey building accommodates 78 staff and 1600 students on its first three levels. On the top floor resides a community of Brothers, affectionately referred to as 'The Fourth Floor Community'. In the 1990-1991 school year, 18 Brothers lived in this community, of whom 11 currently work in the school. Three smaller Marist communities, located in nearby districts, accommodate the rest of the Brothers who work at Molloy (MBS, 1990, Doc. AMHS, pp.13-14). Brothers in these smaller communities are seen by some to be living a less 'conservative' Marist lifestyle than those in the Fourth Floor Community (Flood, 1991c, Int. AMHS). This contention is disputed by some in these smaller communities. Another contribution is that Brothers in these smaller communities are 'more dependent on each other' (Palmieri, 1992, Int. AMHS). The Principal, Vice Principal Academics and three other staff live in one of these smaller communities.

Other groups making up the school community include the administration, faculty (staff), students and parents. Everyone I interviewed during my two visits helped me gain an understanding of Marist educational vision at Molloy. However it was only possible to include excerpts from some of these interviews in this analysis. The school's administration includes the Principal (Br. John Klein - until the end of the 1991-1992 school year, and Br. Angelo Palmieri from the beginning of the 1992 school year) and two Assistant Principals - for Academics and for Discipline. The

The Student Handbook notes:

Although the name of the school had been changed and new traditions were being established, such things as the name of the yearbook, the school paper, the school colors, the motto, and the well-known nickname "Stanners," were carried over from St. Ann's Academy (1991, AMHS Doc., p.2).

5 The rest either work in other schools or are retired.

6 Br. Richard Van Houten feels a better distinction to describe the living styles is institutional/community rather than conservative/liberal (1992, Int. AMHS).
seven Department Chairpersons — one for each of English, Guidance, Language, Mathematics, Religion, Science and Social Studies are elected by their departments and not considered to be part of the school's administration (Van Houten, 1992, Int. AMHS).

Of the faculty's 78 administrators and teachers, 40% are Brothers — a high proportion of religious compared with the national average⁷ (Klein, 1991a, Int. AMHS; Dwyer, 1991, p.203). John Klein observes:

when groups of people come in and speak to students about faculty ... they ... talk about the Brothers and in a sense, almost in a generic way, apply the term 'Brother' to all the members of the faculty (1991a, Int. AMHS).

Since a lay teacher costs between two and three times as much as a religious (Maher, 1990, Doc. AMHS, p.5) and no financial aid comes from government sources,⁸ the proportion of religious on the staff has significant financial implications for the school (The contributed services of the Brothers amount to 14% of the school's annual income — see Figure 8.1 on the next page).

Every two or three years, Molloy lay teachers renegotiate their salaries and benefits with the representatives of the Board of Directors — an 'outside' group of Marist Brothers representing the Provincial Council. Such negotiations are a source of tension, as Br. James Maher⁹ explains: 'Understandably, these teachers are concerned about their families and ... retirement years ... [They] demand ... their salaries and benefits be competitive with teachers in state schools' (1990, Doc. AMHS, p.5). Consequently the Brothers find themselves 'grappling with

---

⁷ Nationally, in 1988, the number of Catholic elementary and secondary school faculty members who were religious was 18% and declining (Dwyer, 1991, p.203).

⁸ Federal, state, and local governments grant to Catholic schools, and to lands upon which these schools are built, complete exemption from taxation (Lee, 1987, pp.277-278).

⁹ Br. James Maher was principal of Archbishop Molloy High School from 1980 - 1986 and has been involved in the administration of the school for 13 years. He is now on the teaching staff and a member of the Provincial Council of the Esopus Province, the Marist province in the United States responsible for Archbishop Molloy High School (Klein, 1991a, AMHS Int.).
TABLE 8.1 - FINANCIAL REPORT FOR 1990 - 1991

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operating Income</td>
<td>$4,209,061.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuition &amp; Fees</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Income</td>
<td>$4,209,061.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Disbursements</td>
<td>$4,275,312.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructional</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General &amp; Administrative</td>
<td>314,838.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plant Operation</td>
<td>630,440.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Services</td>
<td>158,990.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital Expenses</td>
<td>134,807.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Disbursements</td>
<td>$5,514,589.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Deficit</td>
<td>$1,305,328.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenue from Non-Tuition Sources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contributed Services</td>
<td>$805,129.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auxiliary services</td>
<td>78,995.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Activities</td>
<td>50,276.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment Interest</td>
<td>65,530.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York State Mandated Services</td>
<td>298,205.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Dances</td>
<td>5,812.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous</td>
<td>25,350.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Operating Net</td>
<td>$ 25,971.76</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
two important justice issues' - fair or competitive wages and service to the less advantaged by controlling tuition increases (ibid.). John Klein also acknowledges this tension:

... there is, certainly under the surface, a little tension between the lay faculty and the Brothers ... almost an occupational hazard ... it's a little thing ... I think part of the tension comes from the fact that we own the school, we're the employers ... and ... when you get into the negotiation of salary and benefits ... and the Marist Brothers are the ones who negotiate with the representatives of the lay staff and then together decide what the salary and benefits are ... these are natural adversarial relationships (1991a, Int. AMHS).

In interviewing lay staff, I picked up a scent of this salary issue being a source of tension. (In general I felt lay staff may not have been completely forthcoming with me on this and other matters, identifying me as a Brother.) An additional pressure on budget is foreshadowed in the 1990 Report of the Middle States Visiting Committee's recommendation that 'measures be taken to reduce class sizes further' (RMSVC, 1990, Doc. AMHS, p.4). Average class sizes at Molloy have recently been reduced (1986) from the low 40s to mid to upper 30s (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.22). Nevertheless, these sizes are still high compared to Catholic schools in the British Isles and Australia during the 1980s.

The Molloy faculty is very stable, averaging seventeen years at the school (AMHS, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.3). All the Brothers on the faculty have at least a Masters Degree and some have Ph.Ds. Bernard Flood believes the Brothers are well educated in the same way as Marcellin Champagnat was 'for his day ... the priest was the educated man of the parish' (1991b, Int. AMHS). John Klein describes the lay staff as 'highly talented, very good teachers ... really, remarkably good teachers' adding 'a lot of lay people would be very strong in the fact that they offer something very unique to the school - and indeed they do ... They offer just as good examples [as the Brothers] of good ... believing lay people'. When employing a new lay member of staff, John seeks a person who 'is a self-starter ... has an excellent command of the material in the field, is creative and
independent thinking ... likes kids ... and ... is a believing, practising Catholic' (1991a, Int. AMHS). The educational quality of the school is monitored in at least two ways. First, every three years, the Provincial Council of the Marist Brothers (the school's Board of Trustees) appoints an evaluation team of administrators and teachers from other Marist schools to assess 'the effectiveness of the school's organizational structure'(SSRP, 1986, Doc. AMHS, p.14) - the most recent evaluation took place in December 1991 (Klein, 1991a, Int. AMHS). Second, the older Brothers who live in the Fourth Floor Community, engage in a healthy, intergenerational dialogue with the Brothers and lay staff who work full time in the school.

SCHOLIUM 8.1 - BR. JOHN KLEIN

John Klein is described by the retired Br. Bernard Flood\(^\text{10}\) as 'a capable young man ... who's very much interested in schools' (1991c, Int. AMHS). He was appointed principal of Archbishop Molloy High School in 1986 after he had taught history and religion, and been involved in the administration of the school for the previous twelve years (AMHS, 1992, Doc. AMHS, p.192; Maher, 1992, Int. AMHS). A doctoral graduate in American history, in 1985 he was named one of the Educators of the Year by the New York State Association of Teachers and, in the same year, received an award from the University of Chicago as an outstanding Secondary School Teacher. As the school's principal, he adopts an open door policy to students, parents, faculty and other administrators (SSRP, 1986, Doc. AMHS, p.13). He knows 1000 of the 1600 students 'quite personally' (Klein, 1991b, Int. AMHS). He has been instrumental in the development of the Alumni Association\(^\text{11}\) which now reaps in $300,000 a year for the school and helped establish the 'Academic Awards Assembly' for Molloy students (AMHS, 1992, Doc. AMHS, p.192). In 1992 he was elected provincial of the Esopus Marist Province, one of two American Marist Provinces.

SCHOLIUM 8.2 - MARIST BROTHERS AT MOLLOY

Marist Brothers belonging to the Esopus Province of the United States can apply to the principal for a teaching position at Molloy. Should a position be available they then obtain permission from the Provincial to move to that school. American Brothers are not 'sent' or 'appointed' by the Provincial or Marist province to a particular school in the same way as they are elsewhere in the Marist world. Once Brothers take up their position at Molloy, they can

---

\(^{10}\) Br. Bernard Flood is a senior member of the fourth floor community. He has been Director of Development at Archbishop Molloy High School, Director of Education for the Marist Province of Esopus, Superintendent of Education at Birmingham, Alabama and Director of the Catholic Schools' Administrators for the State of New York (Klein, 1991a, AMHS Int.).

\(^{11}\) The Development Office conducts an annual appeal to 7,500 alumni (RMSVC, 1990, Doc. AMHS, p.23).
stay until they seek a change—some seeming to make a life commitment to the school in an almost 'Benedictine' way.

In 1991, Marist Brothers held the following administrative positions at Archbishop Molloy High School:

- Principal
- Assistant Principal for Academics
- Assistant Principal for Discipline
- Treasurer
- Assistant Treasurer
- Department Chairperson of Guidance
- Director of Religious Activities
- Director of Programming

They teach in the following faculties:

- Social Studies
- Religion
- Guidance
- English
- Language
- Science
- Mathematics


**SCHOLIUM 8.3 - STUDENT ACCEPTANCE TO THE SCHOOL**

Students are accepted into Archbishop Molloy High School primarily as a result of their performance in the Cooperative Entrance Examination when they are in 8th grade. They arrange to take this test through their local Catholic elementary school. Elementary school records, as well as principals' and teachers' recommendations, are also reviewed prior to students being accepted. In 1986 approximately 1,900 students were taking the Cooperative Entrance Examination and nominating Archbishop Molloy High school as one of their first three choices. Currently 1,600 students are applying to Molloy in this way. Students, in general, must score above the 70% (national percentile) on the entrance examination in order to be admitted (SSRP, 1986, Doc. AMHS, p.2; AMHS, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.13; Van Houten, 1992, Int. AMHS).

The families of Molloy students reside mainly in Queens county and the bordering counties of Brooklyn and Nassau. Two million people of diverse ethnic, economic and religious backgrounds live in this region which is served by 100 Catholic elementary schools and 300 public elementary and junior high schools. Molloy students come from 118

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>NUMBER OF CATHOLICS (Millions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1829</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1840</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1880</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td>15.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>48.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>58.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

elementary schools, 85% from Catholic schools (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.32A; SSRP, 1986. Doc. AMHS, p.1). The school reported recently:

Demographic changes in the nation and the region are a concern for this school. While we have maintained a full enrollment since opening in 1957, the decreasing number of school age children in both public and private schools has affected the academic quality of the students we admit.

The number of students in the eighth grade in the Catholic schools of Queens county is now 40% of what it was twenty years ago. Statistics on elementary enrollments from the diocese indicate that while the numbers will not greatly decrease in the next eight years, neither will they improve.

These statistics motivate the school's expanded efforts to recruit students by maintaining good relations with feeder schools. We are also working to expand financial support from alumni and parents to generate an endowment fund to help control the cost of tuition (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.32A).

While this statement suggests the school is keen to maintain its academically elite enrolment, more recent developments suggest to newly appointed Assistant Principal for Academics that the school will be doing very well simply to remain fully enrolled:

There are 24 catholic high schools in our diocese. There are only two right now that are fully enrolled ... we can see that we're going to have to take a more diverse student body if we're going to remain fully enrolled (1992, Int. AMHS).

This would seem to be consistent with the 1990 Report on the Middle Sates Visiting Committee which recommended that 'the program be explored for ways to address the needs of students who are not succeeding in a regents course of study' and that 'the current policy which permits students to pass a course by passing only the regents examination be re-evaluated' (RMSVC, 1990, Doc. AMHS, p.4).

Greeley observes recently that 'American Catholics ... have been affected by the so-called divorce revolution ... In the early seventies 16 percent of Catholics ... had been
divorced. In the mid-1980s the ... [figure] had risen to 27 percent' (1990, p.99). Molloy students, however, grow up in more stable homes than the average American Catholic. 80% come from families where both natural parents are living at home while 11% of students live with one divorced or separated parent who has not remarried (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.39). John Klein finds the very small numbers of students from divorced homes quite surprising, especially compared to other Catholic schools (1991b, Int. AMHS).

In the majority of the homes of Molloy students, both parents work, as do the older children on a part-time basis, in order to supplement the family's income (ibid.). A recent statistical return, for example, indicated that 80% of the mothers of Molloy students are in the paid workforce (Klein, 1991a, Int. AMHS). In the United States as a whole, Catholics have, or are about to, become, with the exception of the Jews, the most affluent denominational group in American society (Dwyer, 1991, p.200). No families in the Archbishop Molloy school community have incomes below the poverty level (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.38). Yet one American child in every four is brought up in poverty13 - a fact which can cause some observers to ask: 'Why are religious orders still involved in this option for the rich' (Norris, 1991, p.13; Riordan, 1992, p.741)? Former Molloy student, Br. Richard Van Houten feels this is a 'simplistic view' as he explains:

Typically the parents that we have - they're not ... desperately poor people - but ... both mother and father go to work ... the students from the age of 15 or 16 are delivering newspapers or working in a deli or working in McDonalds so that they can afford tuition, so that they can afford College ... So I don't characterize those people as rich. I think a rich family is a family where you don't have to have both ... [the parents] and the children out working ... I think we're talking about working class, lower middle class people in general (1992, Int. AMHS).

John Klein sees reflection on the life of Marcellin Champagnat

13 In America the child poverty rate rose by more than 11% during the 1980s reaching 17.9% in 1989. 'Black children were the most likely to fall into this group. In 1989 a black child had a 39.8% chance of living in poverty, a Native American child a 38.8% chance and a Hispanic child a 32.2% chance. The figure for Asian children was 17.1% and for white children 12.5%' (Time, 1992, p.15).
as beneficial in helping to answer some of these dilemmas:

I think it ... causes us to reflect upon what are we really trying to do in every one of our schools? And are our schools really existing just to maintain the status quo? Or are we trying to operate the schools in order to inculcate faith and encourage students to be sensitive to the needs of the people less fortunate than themselves (1991a, Int. AMHS)?

This represents the 'trickle-down' view of social justice through elites which has had a long and not dishonourable history in religious order schools - but which is nowadays on the defensive. We shall see, however, that the Molloy curriculum pays more than lip-service to it.

American Catholics are generally at the top of America's educational bracket (ibid.). At Archbishop Molloy, 29% of mothers and 33% of fathers have a bachelor's degree or a higher qualification (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.39). Yet, James Maher believes the school can no longer assume its students have already experienced 'the mystery of faith' in their families (1990, Doc. AMHS, p.7). He supports Bishop Malone's assertions about parents of Catholic school children:

Many of the older parents raised before the Second Vatican Council are confused and do not understand the changes. It is comparable to their children learning the 'new math'; they are hesitant and timid about getting involved lest they misguide their child or reveal their own ignorance.

The development of the younger parents raised during the Council lacked clear direction and informed content. Many spent their adolescence and early adult years away from the Church. Now they have returned and they want their children raised in the faith. No wonder they feel insecure, they are learning as their children learn.

The third group, immigrant or minority parents are sending their children to Catholic schools for quality education and clear values. They are insecure partners with us because they are living in a strange land, struggling with a new language, and not always experiencing the support and comfort their culture provided (Maher, 1990, Doc. AMHS, p.7; 1992, Int. AMHS).

Richard Van Houten observes there are now very few of these 'older parents' left at Molloy: 'Most of the parents are
my age. Vatican II happened when I was at elementary school' (1992, Int. AMHS).

Both the Catholic Church and American educationists have stated strongly that the primary responsibility for the education of the child resides with the child's parents. Lee contends parents have the right 'to form the basic policy of the school ... American Catholic schools at all levels give the parents virtually no voice in the determination of school policy' (Lee, 1967, p.304). While there is a group of parents who run the dances for Molloy's parents (Klein, 1991a, Int. AMHS), there has been little parent involvement in Molloy's policy formulation over recent years as indicated by the following return for the Secondary School Recognition Program:

Archbishop Molloy enjoys a very close working relationship with our students' parents and they are actively encouraged to contact both members of the faculty and administration when they have concerns. The regard that both our present parents and our alumni parents have for the school is clearly indicated by the fact that during the past year these groups have contributed over $600,000 toward our capital fund (SSRP, 1986, Doc. AMHS, p.15).

This seems likely to continue. Richard Van Houten, for example, insists

parents have the right to choose the school ... but they certainly don't set the school's policy. If you try to apply that logic to any other profession - imagine choosing a doctor and then going in and telling him [or her] how to practice medicine, choosing a lawyer and telling him [or her] how to interpret the law (1992, Int. AMHS).

Br. Angelo Palmieri adds:

I think Lee is correct in saying ... [that parents have the right to form basic policy of the school] but I can honestly say we have no intention of letting that go because even when we do adopt school boards - which we are going to be doing and there will be parents on that board ... the responsibility of the board ... [will be] to protect the catholic identity of the school and they certainly are not going to have any say in changing that (1992, Int. AMHS).

Enrolments at Molloy have been relatively stable since
the school moved to Briarwood even though the percentage of nonpublic school enrolment in catholic schools has been declining.14

### TABLE 8.2 RECENT ENROLMENT TRENDS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>STUD.</th>
<th>FAC.</th>
<th>BROS.</th>
<th>EVENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1938</td>
<td>650</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1944</td>
<td>800</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1949</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1956</td>
<td>1156</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1957</td>
<td>1250</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>SCHOOL MOVES TO BRIARWOOD15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961</td>
<td>1756</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964</td>
<td>1684</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>1590</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>1561</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>1578</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>1567</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>1581</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>1595</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Archbishop Molloy's Students

Archbishop Molloy's students are educated at four levels: Freshmen (Year 9), Sophomores (Year 10), Juniors (Year 11) and Seniors (Year 12) (SSRP, 1986, Doc. AMHS, p.1; Klein, 1991b, Int. AMHS). Tuition levels are the same for each of the four classes. In 1986, when Molloy's tuition was $1755 per year it was the lowest for a private school in the Borough of Queens (SSRP, 1986, Doc. AMHS, p.2 and p.17; AMHS, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.13). Tuition in 1991 was $2895 and for the 1992-1993 school year is $320016 (Palmieri, 1992, Int.

---

14 Since 1965 the figures are: (Hunt and Kunkel, 1984, p.1; Dwyer, 1991, p.173).

15 When the school moved from Manhattan to Briarwood, students in 6th, 7th and 8th grades also came. These grades were phased out and the school changed from taking students from 6th to 12th grades to 9th to 12th (Van Houten, 1992, Int. AMHS).

16 Br. Angelo Palmieri describes this fee as 'not the high end' for 'a middle class area' (1992, Int. AMHS). Of the 24 catholic high schools in the diocese that covers Brooklyn and Queens, Archbishop Molloy High School's level of tuition is 'second from the bottom' including schools in the poor areas of Brooklyn. The one school that has lower tuition than Molloy is
AMHS). The Student Handbook states: 'Students with overdue tuition are subject to suspension from class. This rule will be strictly enforced' (SH, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.20). (Tuition, as indicated earlier, would be much higher if it were not for the contributed services of the Brothers (AR, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.3)). Once students commence at the school, 98% of them complete the four years. In 1989, 75% of the seniors were 16 years of age and 21% 17 years old (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.23). Of the 343 graduates of the 1991 Molloy class, 336 (98%) are attending 96 different Colleges and Universities, including Marist College, Poughkeepsie - the one College in the United States which the Marist Brothers formerly administered and where they still teach (AR, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.i).

The ethnic composition of Molloy's students continues to change gradually (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.22; Van Houten, 1992, Int. AMHS).

### TABLE 8.3 - ETHNIC COMPOSITION AS PERCENTAGE OF THE STUDENT BODY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GROUP</th>
<th>1984</th>
<th>1989</th>
<th>1991</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AMER. INDIAN/ALASK.</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLACK</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HISPANIC/ASIAN</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>14.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACIFIC ISL.</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>88.3</td>
<td>74.2</td>
<td>73.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUR-ASIAN/INDIAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In 1980, 14% of students in public high schools were black, compared to 6% in Catholic schools (Crain and Rosse1, 1989, p.186). Greeley observes that while 'Catholic school attendance has been declining, the enrollment of blacks and Hispanics (at least half of the former not Catholic) in Catholic schools has been increasing dramatically' (1990, p.170.). At Molloy this is true of Hispanics but not of blacks partly because New York City's Hispanic population has been increasing more quickly than the Black population (Van Houten, 1992, Int. AMHS). New York's migrants, Bernard Flood contends, came initially from Northern Europe - England and Germany: 'The next big wave were Italian ...
and now we have, in New York City, people from all over South America - Columbia, Ecuador, Bolivia ... and the latest group are Asians - Koreans' (1991b, Int. AMHS). Dan Sullivan believes New York is 'getting more Africans ... than ever before ... [and] we've got so many "illegals" in the United States now, it's unbelievable' (1991, Int. AMHS).

The proportion of those attending Archbishop Molloy High School who are Catholic is 93% - 96%, high compared to Catholic schools in Australia. (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.22).

In the State of New York, the Commissioner of Education has responsibility for the education of all children. While Dwyer claims that generally the American States place few constraints on the curriculum of a school18 (Dwyer, 1991, pp.192-193) Richard Van Houten feels that in New York these constraints are 'very specific ... detailed ... and demanding' (1992, Int. AMHS). In a 1986 Secondary School Recognition Program return, the school reported:

Since our school follows the Regents curriculum prescribed by the State of New York, our sequencing is determined by that curriculum of science, mathematics, foreign language, history and English. Our elective courses in those areas go beyond the Regents curriculum by offering an extensive Advanced Placement Program and by encouraging qualified students to participate in the St. John's University Extension Program or the Queens College Honors Program (SSRP, 1986, Doc. AMHS, p.13).

60% - 70% of the courses students take over their four years at Molloy are governed by State regulations (Van Houten, 1992, Int. AMHS). Angelo Palmieri believes New York has 'the model program' of any State (1992, Int. AMHS).

The school adds to these State requirements by expecting students to study 'three years of Math and three years of Science - [whereas] the State only demands two years' (Palmieri, 1992, Int. AMHS). In ways such as these the school believes its curriculum responds to its 'academically capable student body' by providing a

---

18 In the State of New Jersey, for example, students are only required to take physical education, safety education and driver education (Van Houten, 1992, Int. AMHS).
'challenging college preparatory course of studies which emphasizes critical thinking, creative writing and the development of solid study skills' (SSRP, 1986, AMHS Doc., p.2). Every year 1 or 2 new elective courses are introduced to replace ones that are not attracting students (Van Houten, 1992, Int. AMHS).

Assessment forms an important part of Archbishop Molloy's programme. Throughout their four years, students undertake a range of 'scholastic aptitude and achievement' tests. They are expected to take the New York State Regents examinations in each subject for which there is an examination. The school evaluates its programme on these examinations. 'These test results give the school an objective measure of student performance in biology, chemistry, physics, Math 1, Math 2, Math 3, Global Studies, American studies, foreign languages and English' (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.25). The school reports:

Archbishop Molloy ... is perhaps one of the very few schools in New York State in which every student completes the entire Regents program in [English,] Biology, Chemistry and Physics, as well as the three year Foreign Language requirement and the entire Regents Mathematics sequence (SSRP, 1986, Doc. AMHS, p.6).

A Scholastic aptitude examination (PSAT) is given in both grade 10 and grade 11 as a practice test for College Admissions (SAT) (Palmieri, 1992, Int. AMHS). Gifted and talented students are identified upon admission to ninth grade through the co-operative entrance examination, elementary and junior high school records, and recommendations by eighth grade teachers (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.25). While no students need basic skills remediation, students may seek, through their guidance counsellor, the assistance of a senior student as a tutor. During the 1985-1986 school year, for example, 150 students received tutors (SSRP, 1986, Doc. AMHS, p.7).

89% of Molloy students intend taking a 4-year college or university course when they leave school. A full-time college guidance counsellor assists students in making such choices. Every senior student attends a weekly guidance
class during the fall of senior year. A college night is held at the school for parents and students to attend presentations by college representatives (SC, 1989, Doc. AMHS, p.26).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OCCUPATION</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PROFESSIONAL</td>
<td>55.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MANAGERIAL</td>
<td>22.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNKNOWN</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOVERNMENT</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SKILLED WORKER</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIVIL SERVICE</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGRICULTURAL</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MILITARY</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEMISKILLED WORKERS</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTHER</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The school also 'aims to help each student come to a personal awareness of God through religion class, liturgy, and retreat experiences'. It has both a Religion Department and a Religious Activities Office (both involving Marist Brothers). The chairperson of the Religion Department, Dr. Robert Englert, insists: 'Molloy seeks to match academic excellence with compassion, integrity and a profound sense of life's mystery. We are a religious school that teaches mystery and justice, as much as we advocate success (AMHS, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.5). Periodically students are invited to participate in a total school liturgy, such as the one which took place on the last school day of the 1991 calendar year. 500 students chose to stay after classes concluded for that late morning Mass. The students also appreciate the retreats offered by the school, as Senior student, Chris Damiani reports:

The Brothers ... take us Upstate ... they bring religion into it ... before I came here I just went to Mass because I thought I was supposed to, but since ... the retreats ... I start to listen to what they say at Mass ... it gives my religion new meaning ... I understand ... now ... why I believe and what I believe instead of just believing because that’s what the nuns taught.

---

19 Numbers at these total school liturgies vary from 200 to 500 (Sheerin, 1992, Int. AMHS).
20 Br. Michael Sheerin, who co-ordinates these retreats, observes that about 1/4 to 1/3 of the student population take advantage of them (1992, Int. AMHS).
Students may volunteer for the school's service programmes such as the running of shelters for the homeless, visiting the sick in hospitals, collecting food, toys and jackets for the poor and helping handicapped children (SSRP, 1986, Int. AMHS, p.15; Flood, 1991c, Int. AMHS; Cassidy, 1991, Int. AMHS; Sheerin, 1992, Int. AMHS). My sense is that there are significant, but not large, numbers of students involved in these programmes - perhaps 25%. Bernard Flood recalls lawyer, Mr. Bob Hayes, a 'Molloy graduate', who brought to court, and won a test case for the homeless in New York City. Bob, who insisted in court 'that the city must provide something for these people' ... claims he 'got the idea from working with the Brothers in these kinds of projects'. Bob's photograph is proudly displayed in the school's Hall of Fame (1991b, Int. AMHS).

The school's Art and Music programme, which involves all Molloy students, began six years ago (Klein, 1991a, Int. AMHS). Since 1987, when the Ralph DiChiaro Arts and Sciences Centre was opened (SH, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.2), music has taken on an even more important part in the life of the school. The school's stage band recently came second in two national championships (Sapienza, 1991, Con. AMHS).

Many extra curricular activities are available to Molloy students. For example they are able to participate in the occasional Saturday night school dance which normally attracts 2000 students (Klein, 1991b, Int. AMHS). They can also join a variety of clubs. These include 'chess, math, physics, biology, chemistry, political science, drama, fiction, poster, French, German, Irish, Spanish, Ebony Youth, model cars, speech and debate' (AMHS, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.9). Molloy's sporting programme is also extensive including track, soccer, baseball and intramural sports: basketball, bowling, softball, handball, touch football and volleyball (ibid.). John Klein gives an example of the skilled coaching available to the students:

the basketball and baseball coach ... has been at
Molloy for 33 years ... and has the greatest number ... of baseball victories of any coach in the United States - he had his thousandth victory last year and in basketball last year he had his fifteen hundredth win and so he has been named in the past three or four years the top baseball coach in the United States and then was named the top basketball coach in the United States (1991a, Int. AMHS).

8.2 - MARIST VISION AND CONTRIBUTION

This section will start out from the school's official statement of philosophy and will then offer an analysis of both the most significant contributions made by the Marist Brothers to the school - in particular as these are identified by interviewees - and of the vision that is operative in these contributions. It will pay an increasingly particular attention to one group of interviewees, namely, the students. The articulacy and forthcomingness - they regularly sought me out to be interviewed - of these bright New York young people was a real feature of this case-study. More important, perhaps, was the substance of their views on - one might say of their testimony to - the Marist role in the school. One occasion was particularly worthwhile, namely, a group interview with 7 Seniors and 5 Juniors which offered its own check on what was being said. This check resulted from the students' interactions with each other. If a student's statement resonated with the other students, it was normally amplified by them. But if a statement did not resonate with its listeners, it was either let go or the student who had made the statement was teased about what he had said.

PHILOSOPHY STATEMENT Let us start with the formal Statement of the school's philosophy. My research questions did not directly ask about such a Statement, though if one had been a central part of the school's recent experience, that fact should have emerged in the responses of interviewees. In fact the very existence of the Statement emerged only in one interview, and that very much in the manner of an afterthought. This strongly suggested to me that in terms of the process of its development it was not
comparable in significance to Marcellin College's Statement — that is, it was unlikely to have involved widespread discussion and consultation among the staff as a whole. Returning to it, however, at the stage of data analysis I became aware that it is a significant document in terms of content. By this I refer less to a certain crispness and clarity, which it possesses, than to the fact that it captures very accurately the practice and experience of the school as that emerges in the interview data still to be presented.

As a Catholic, college preparatory school for boys, Archbishop Molloy High School endeavors to offer each of its students a challenging academic program rooted firmly in Gospel values. Committed to the education of the whole person, the Archbishop Molloy administration and faculty believe in creating a caring environment which addresses the religious, academic, personal and physical needs and concerns of each individual student. As a result, the understanding of our students is broadened and deepened, according to their age and mental ability, so that they will ultimately choose to lead fully human, adult, Christian lives.

As a Marist school, Archbishop Molloy exists primarily to foster our students' growth in the Catholic faith. We offer an educational program that integrates this faith with culture and learning as Jesus Christ and Marcellin Champagnat, the founder of the Marist Brothers, envisioned. Through proclaiming the Gospel message we strive to educate for justice by increasing our students' understanding of global, national and local problems and by developing their personal sensitivity to cultural differences. We further endeavor to increase their willingness to serve those less fortunate.

As an academically selective school, Archbishop Molloy provides a rigorous academic program for each student. Through academics and the school's extensive extra-curricular activities and athletic programs each student is encouraged to use his intelligence creatively, constructively and originally.

Particularly concerned with our students' affective and personal needs, Archbishop Molloy offers an extensive counseling program. Attentive and available to all our students, we take special care of students who are experiencing difficulties.

Finally, Archbishop Molloy High School explicitly
encourages Christian moral values in its curriculum, in the relations it fosters among the members of the school community, and in the expectations it has of its faculty and students.

Also available to members of the school community is the following list of the school's goals:

I As a Catholic School, Archbishop Molloy High School offers an education firmly rooted in Gospel values. We endeavor to accomplish this by:
1. Creating a positive school climate, built on a sense of caring and affirmation within a structure of order and clear rules.
2. Offering a mandatory religious education program for all four years.
3. Providing liturgical and paraliturgical experiences for our students.
4. Inculcating Christian values across the curriculum.
5. Offering an extensive retreat and encounter program for students in each year.

II. As a Marist School, Archbishop Molloy High School strives to educate for justice by fostering our students' understanding of global, national and local problems. As a result, we hope that they will become involved and responsible citizens who are sensitive to the needs of those less fortunate. We attempt to do this by:
1. Specifically addressing issues of social justice in the curriculum, most especially in Social Studies and Religion classes.
2. The Work of the Religious Activities Office and the wide range of service opportunities offered to our students.
3. The efforts of the school's tutoring program through which students assist other students who are experiencing academic difficulties.
4. Sponsoring summer camps for handicapped and economically disadvantaged children.
5. Initiating mission collections each week, specific "drives" for toys, canned food, clothing and our annual Fast-A-Thon project.

III As an academically selective school, Archbishop Molloy High School provides a rigorous academic program which challenges each of our students. We attempt to do this by:
1. Offering a demanding college preparatory program which adheres to the N.Y. State Regents curriculum for all students.
2. Encouraging our students to be independent and critical thinkers.
3. Striving to enable each student to become an ongoing learner in accord with the school motto,
"Not for school, but for life".

4. Providing opportunities for honors and advanced placement and college credit courses for qualifying students.
5. Encouraging learning outside the classroom through programs like International Day and Activity Days.
6. Complementing our curricular program with an extensive co-curriculum program, designed to develop the diverse interests and talents of the student body.
7. Providing an excellent athletic program in both inter-scholastic and intramural sports.

IV. As a school concerned with our students' affective needs, Archbishop Molloy addresses this area by:
1. Offering a strong guidance program, with a particular emphasis on personal counseling.
2. Developing student self-esteem through programs like Peer Group counseling, Big Brother ...
3. Striving to educate the whole person.
4. Addressing the personal needs of our students through a fair, consistent discipline policy.
5. Instilling a sense of good sportsmanship and personal achievement through our athletic and extra-curricular programs.
6. Attempting to offer our students opportunities to develop personal leadership skills (Goals, 1991, Doc. AMHS, pp.1-2).

John Klein feels this new philosophy statement and set of school goals spells out 'in very precise terms what we think a Catholic and a Marist school should be' (1991a, Int. AMHS). He emphasises the article in the Constitutions and Statutes (1986) of the Marist Brothers which describes the Marist school as offering families an approach to education which endeavours to draw 'faith, culture, and life into harmony'(MB, 1986, Art. 87).

**MARIST SPIRITUALLITY AT THE SCHOOL** Significant Marist days, such as June 6th, the anniversary of Marcellin Champagnat's death, and January 2nd, the anniversary of the Congregation's foundation, cannot be celebrated at Molloy because June 6th coincides with examinations and January 2nd occurs during school holidays. Other Marist activities, however, are very occasionally held for Molloy students. For example Molloy students met recently for a weekend with students from other Marist and non-Marist schools to discuss the life of Marcellin Champagnat (ibid.). Senior, Dan Turner
recalls

the Champagnat day ... was a celebration for the ... [200th] anniversary [of the birth] of Marcellin Champagnat and there were Marist ... [students] from all over the United States there ... [While] each school the Marist Brothers ran had its own identity and had its own characterisations, all the schools had one common vision and all the Brothers had one common vision and one common goal ... the New Yorkers, the people from Chicago and Mississippi and Oregon ... as different as they were culturally and geographically, their vision was the same ... what the Marist Brothers ... [instilled] in them was the same.

When I asked Dan to summarise that vision of the Marist Brothers he replied: 'to make their students the best people possible' (1991, Int. AMHS).

While Bernard Flood sees the characteristics of Marist education as devotion to the Blessed Virgin and knowledge of the catechism, and wonders whether present Molloy students leave the school with 'a lasting devotion to the Blessed Virgin' (1991b, Int. AMHS), Mr. Richard Salmon, who has taught at Molloy for 31 years, feels

Marist spirituality begins to melt into the education ... a kind of spirituality that seeks, ... in the life of Mary, ... a model for living the Christian life ... I ... think of Mary as a humble person ... she wasn't really dancing into the middle of the stage ... whatever we would be teaching would have those Marian virtues ... that we would deal with our students fairly, and openly ... there's a certain openness [in a Marist school] ... it is a concern for the spiritual growth of the student, that the student be honest ... kind ... just ... and for that to happen the teacher must embody all of these virtues ... I see this as an outgrowth of taking Mary as the centre of Marist spiritual life (1991, Int. AMHS).

John Klein believes Marcellin Champagnat's spirit is evident in the 'whole life of the Brothers' although 'maybe not as openly articulated ... [as] in Spain or in the Hermitage province [in France] (1991a, Int. AMHS). John sees Marcellin Champagnat's spirit evident in the way the school helps

all students, especially those experiencing difficulties ... helping the least favoured ... it doesn't have to be the financially least favoured but it's really the kids that need you the most and that's ... [why] we put a tremendous
emphasis on the Guidance Department ...[on] our support groups in the school ... trying to build self esteem ... not just [of] the kids who are doing well because we're not here just for them ... I think we've made an effort to help kids that might be very strong academically - the kids here are very bright - but kids who are experiencing personal and family difficulties (1991b, Int. AMHS).

Br. Stephen Minogue speaks individually, at least once each year, with every Freshman in his five Home Rooms. During these counselling sessions he talks to each student about Marcellin Champagnat because he wants the students 'to know why the Marist Brothers are in the school' (Minogue, 1991, Int. AMHS). As he tells Marcellin's story - which, from listening to him tell it to me during the interval of the school's 1991 Christmas concert, I know he tells it with great enthusiasm - Stephen holds up a Spanish book portraying Marcellin's life in pictures, pointing to the relevant picture during his account. He describes to them the story of Marcellin Champagnat's charismatic founding experience in which Marcellin was inspired to found the Marist Brothers (see Ch.5). Here Stephen is adopting 'a theological method fully compatible with historical awareness' as is recommended for the process of reunderstanding the relevance of religious congregations for today (Ommen, 1974, p.629).

I tell the story about Father Champagnat. This is a Spanish book O.K? And I explain everything to them. Think France 1816. Here he is being ordained ... And then I tell them about the French Revolution - France is drained and ... when he landed at this place there's a lot of unemployment, drinking and gambling ... The church is kind of falling apart. So he knows what he has to do here. He sets it up in about two years. And he's walking down the street ... about the only street in the town ... someone ... [comes] running after him and says: "My brother just died" ... So he ... [says] "Ah let's go and see him then". So here the two of them set out ... And then the mother's waiting for them and she says 'he's dying'. So then Fr. Champagnat goes into the room and when he sees the boy and what condition he's in he says "leave ... me

---

alone with him". He pulls a chair up to the bed and he says ... ah ... "let's say the Our Father because you've got to meet God in a little while, you know". And the little boy says "God, who's God?". "Don't you ever pray to God?" He says "No, who is He?" So Fr. Champagnat has to hold him up for two hours and then tell him, as a real catechist starting from scratch - because he doesn't know how to read nor write, nor had he ever heard of God. He has to tell him ... there is a God that loves him and that there's a whole life beyond this. He hears his confession, gives him Holy Communion, baptises him and then gives him a fourth sacrament with the powers of the priesthood - four, four sacraments. And of course I try to speak a little bit about vocations in here too - give the kids all the ideas and let the Spirit take it from there. My job is just to tell them what I know and that's it. And I say: just because he baptises him is enough ... when a child dies ... after baptism he goes straight to heaven. So he [Fr. Champagnat] gives him the last sacrament, the sacrament of the sick and anoints his body. And he says goodbye to the mother, consoles her and as he's walking down the hill ... a little boy again runs after him and says "would you come back?" and [when he returns] the mother says "he's dead". So Fr. Champagnat just goes in and he prays over the body this time ... he kind of goes into a stage of anguish ... "My goodness" he said, "what would have happened if I weren't there with that fellow? How many children all over France" ... and I point to that picture ... I use this picture of the Mother and Child ... "how many children are there all over France that have been dying just like this fellow over here with nobody around ... ? And what about the children all over the world? We've got to have Brothers. They've got to catechise them, teach them their catechism, teach them how to read, put a pencil in their little fingers" ... that's exactly what the Brothers are doing at Molloy High School (Minogue, 1991, Int. AMHS).

Such an account reveals the deep feeling one Marist Brother has for his founder - a feeling common to most Marist Brothers. Theological interpretations of Marcellin Champagnat's life may differ from one Brother to the next, but Champagnat still provides a common bond between Brothers - a bond which is apparent in a Marist school like Archbishop Molloy High School, judging by the discussions I had with the Brothers about their founder.

A PROPHETIC SCHOOL? - RELIGIOUS PROGRAMMES, GUIDANCE, AVAILABILITY For John Klein, the school's religious
programmes, the retreats and the guidance programmes are its main 'prophetic' dimensions. Referring to other areas he speaks with a certain ambivalence:

in other areas we haven't been prophetic enough ... you have to deal with the realities that you're in in terms of the students you serve, their parents, the communities ... and then also dealing with the reality of the people you work with in the school - the Brothers and the lay staff ... there's a tension. I think I'm someone who tends to be rather conservative myself - although I would like to say progressive in some ways ... I think Molloy is a place where change comes slowly ... I think that's a strength of the school (1991, Int. AMHS).

I interpret the tension to which John refers as first, between Molloy's present educational practice and a more prophetic Marist vision as hinted at in the school's statement of goals and second, between what John might like Molloy to become and what parents and staff would 'allow'. Br. Ben Consigli, the youngest member of the Molloy faculty, sees Brothers creating change in society through schools: 'it's subtle ... it's similar to the mustard seed, similar to the yeast ... we may not see it ... [even though] in America we ... want to see the result right away ... and I don't think we can' (1991, Int. AMHS). John Klein's positive claim on behalf of religious programmes and guidance at the school, however, is borne out by the evidence — which indeed supports one further dimension in which the Marist contribution is a marked one, namely, the general availability and presence of Brothers to the students.

Marist Brothers play a major role in the school's Guidance Department, which includes eight counsellors, six of whom are Brothers — a ratio of 1 member of staff to 175 students (AMHS, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.3; AMHS, 1992, Doc. AMHS, pp.204-205; Lee, 1967, p.298). While the department 'sets specific objectives for each of the four years ... [the] common thread ... is a commitment to the development of the whole person, and the recognition of the students' psychological and emotional well-being' (Vellucci, 1991, Doc. AMHS, p.1). During sophomore year, peer group counselling takes up one quarter of the religion programme (Grimpel,
Senior, John De Meo explains that in peer group counselling:

... you sit in a group of 5 or 7 guys and two senior counsellors and a Brother and you talk about your problems and ... the Brother - ... he doesn't really say anything he's just the adviser - the two seniors lead the group ... [you get] a point of view from a Brother, you also get a point of view from a guy who's two years older than you and you can kind of relate to him ... [as] a friend ... instead of going to ... a Brother or a lay teacher ... if you talk to one of your peers - that helps a lot ... I know ... it's saved some lives at times (1991, Int. AMHS).

Senior, Dan Turner describes the Brother's point of view as 'unique in that it's not judgemental ... it's not looking necessarily to solve the problem ... [and it's coming from] someone who's just older and with more experience of life' (1991, Int. AMHS). Senior, Robert Lang remarks:

... most of the Brothers ... [who] run the guidance counselling - they're all ... they're very good, they ... know how to treat you ... how to give advice to you ... how to help you ... you always have someone to rely on.

Robert feels the Brothers are up to date with the times, ... they talk to you in your words, in your state of mind ... they don't stress ... values of .. old times, ... the 50s or 60s, they stay within your time period ... they know how teenagers of today act ... they stress tradition because they always ... remind you of God ... of your religion and of your faith ... so you always realize that God is present and God is there (1991, Int. AMHS).

Junior, Craig Katinas feels the Brothers have changed his life: ' ... they've directed my life into a positive direction' (1991, Int. AMHS).

It is relevant at this point to notice a change in the pattern of Brothers' roles in the school over the last generation. Whereas the proportion of Brothers on the faculty was halved between 1961 and 1991, the proportion of classes taught by Brothers was reduced to a quarter. One factor in explaining this asymmetry is likely to be the increased average age of the Brothers and a larger number of partly retired Brothers on the faculty. But another likely factor is a greater Brother involvement in Guidance.
TABLE 8.5 - RELATIVE NUMBER OF BROTHERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>1961</th>
<th>1991</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NO. TCHRS.</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO. LAY TCHRS.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO. BROS.</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% BROS.</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% CLASSES TAUGHT BY BROS.</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

But it was a more general availability of the Brothers to the students that came across most strikingly from the data. History and Art teacher, Br. Hugh Andrew, stresses this availability. He describes 'the relative freedom that a Brother has ... [to be] available for them ... of helping them out in very difficult situations, [such as] having to ... go with them some place in the middle of the night' or visit them in hospital (1991, Int. AMHS). Br. Michael Sheerin enjoys the way students come into his Religious Activities Office after school 'just to hang out'. He invites them to 'just become part of what we do' (1992, Int. AMHS). Senior, John Grimpel benefits academically from the availability of the Brothers:

They're always around. They give you all the time you want ... for example, last year in Math ... I was struggling ... the one Brother I had - he was there every day after school ... the lay teachers - they're good, but they have to go home. This Brother - he lived in the school so he was always there from 2.00 o'clock to 3.00. I went to him every afternoon ... and I did so much better in the subject... that's the main thing you know - they're always here for you (1991, Int. AMHS).

Senior, Steve De Castro notes

you don't see ... a lot of principals go to any athletic type of event ... that's where we stand out ... we'll see Br. John at a basketball game, or a baseball game, or swimming, or a soccer game ... and you also see some other Brothers there ... there might be a Brother coaching the team ... they always try to help us (1991, Int. AMHS).

Junior, John Dorsa likes the opportunity to get advice from a Brother if he has a problem with one of his friends.

There's always a Brother around to talk to ... if I have a problem with one of my friends and I
don't know how I'm going to solve it, I go and see one of the Brothers and see how he suggests I solve it (1991, Int. AMHS).

Brothers contribute to the lives of their students through the way they establish a camaraderie with them - a camaraderie 'which does not exist in ... some other schools'.

There's a certain familiarity and common respect and mutual confidence that the ... [students] have in the Brothers ... as a result of that, a confidentiality [develops] where the youngsters will come and speak to the Brothers not only within the guidance structure ... but after school (Flood, 1991b, Int. AMHS).

Senior, Steve De Castro doesn't see the Brother as 'a father figure, but just ... [as] a friend' (1991, Int. AMHS). John Klein observes there is

a very warm type of feeling between ... the Brothers and the students ... it affects the discipline of the school, because the discipline is not oppressive ... they [the students] know what they're ... expected to do and if they don't [do it] they're held accountable (1991a, Int. AMHS).

Senior, John Grimpel appreciates the way the Brothers give you a sense of discipline ... they make you wear a tie ... it disciplines you for the outside world, the business world ... they also allow you to have four minutes in between classes ... if you don't get to class before four minutes you go down and get a late slip and you serve detention after school (1991, Int. AMHS).

Junior, Mark Gorman sees the Brothers providing a framework

... it's not ... rigid, the Brothers are very flexible ... there are so many different types of kids ... coming from all different races ... the Brothers ... suggest things but they don't force anything upon you ... you have the power inside yourself ... they don't ... do it for you, you're going to have to do it for yourself ... they give you a framework where, if you mess up, ... you'll still feel safe that you can fall back on them ... they don't baby us to the point where we're totally dependent on them ... they give us the power to control our lives (1991, Int. AMHS).

English Department Chairperson, Mary Pat Gannon, sees

22 Br. Dennis Dunne, former Provincial of the Poughkeepsie Province and visitor to Archbishop Molloy High School's Fourth Floor community describes this camaraderie as familiarity, common respect and mutual confidence (1992, Int. AMHS).
Marist Brothers having 'freedom to educate, not in the sense of imposing something on people, but in the sense of ... educere' (1991, Int. AMHS).

John Klein focuses on the presence of the Brothers and its relation to the tone of the school:

their ability to communicate with the students, ... [their] interaction with the students ... [their] genuine concern for them - [this] sets a very important tone for the entire building ... Certainly the amount of time the Brothers put in is really remarkable - and they're at everything. So it's a question of significant visibility and involvement in the life of the school - the Brothers set the tone (1991, Int. AMHS).

Senior, Robert Lang feels 'the Brothers give you ... security ... which gives the school a sense of family' (1991, Int. AMHS). Senior, John De Meo also emphasises the family dimension of the school:

I went to a public school from first grade to eighth grade ... my first two weeks here - I was ... in total shock ... when I came to Molloy ... I had some problems ... I could always go to a Brother ... and ask him questions ... it's like a big family, like we're all brothers - it sounds weird and corny ... like Br. John's our father ... we do everything together ... we go to liturgy ... I wasn't used to that coming from public school ... you have two families - you have your family at home and you have your family at school (1991, Int. AMHS).

Junior, Craig Katinas, describes the school as 'a really close knit school ... more of a brotherhood' pointing out, with appreciation, that 'the principal ... knows your name. It's ... funny to know that because ... I went to a really small Grammar school ... [and] she [the principal] had no idea ... [what] my name was' (1991, Int. AMHS).

The Brothers show a keen interest in the lives of each student. Senior, Chris Damiani thinks 'the Brothers make it their business to know what's going on - like some of the lay teachers they'll just talk to you, but the Brothers want to know what's going on in your life ... all the Brothers say "How are you doing - is everything O.K. in this class, in that class"? They make sure that you're doing all right.
because ... they like everybody' (1991, Int. AMHS).

This marked and appreciated interest and availability of the Brothers is connected in the student 'eulogies' with the general approach to education they associate with the Brothers. Junior, John Dorsa feels 'the Brothers give a sense of motivation ... because ... when you see all the names in the Hall of Fame .. you see ... the impact the Brothers have on these people'(1991, Int. AMHS). Yet Junior, Craig Katina feels the Brothers accept a student's best and don't expect any more of him. He gives an example: 'If [you have] ... a 70 average and if you honestly say that's your best, then they accept you for it ... they're more proud of that guy with the 70 average [who] ... tried really hard than the kid with ... the 99 average ... [who] didn't try at all ... and they feel the same way for you - you should expect no less of yourself except the best' (1991, Int. AMHS).

Junior, Mark Gorman feels the education the Brothers provide is an all round education - 'they don't stress one aspect of our lives over another. They help us in academics, athletics, spiritual ... social ... when we come out of Molloy we're not just ... [people] who can study ... instead of stressing just one thing, they stress the whole package' (1991, Int. AMHS).

Former student of the school, Br. Angelo Palmieri, sees the Brothers contributing to the faith development of the students, believing 'God is made real for New York City youth' at Archbishop Molloy High School (1991, Int. AMHS; 1992, Int. AMHS). Classes often begin with a reading from Scripture, a short period of meditation or a prayer to Marcellin Champagnat (Van Houten, 1992, Int. AMHS). Larger numbers23 of Senior students are becoming Eucharistic ministers to enable them to take the Eucharist to people in hospitals (Sheerin, 1992, Int. AMHS).

Finally, Marist Brothers contribute their example to the students, lay teachers and parents (Flood, 1991b, Int. AMHS).

23 13 in 1991 as compared to 38 in 1992 (Sheerin, 1992, Int. AMHS).
They are 'hard working, serious, encouraging [and achieve] extraordinary academic performances [from the students] (Klein, 1991a, Int. AMHS). Brothers are 'dedicated for life, not just [for] part of the time' (Mona han, 1991, Int. AMHS). John Dorsa sees that the Brothers are 'dedicated to their work as Brothers' adding: 'so I feel I can be dedicated in my work as a student' (1991, Int. AMHS).

CONCLUSION As a Marist Brother researching this Marist school, I felt very much at home. Walking the corridors I could speak to other Brothers who were going about their Marist work with enthusiasm and dedication. I felt a shared sense of purpose, a seeking for a common goal - the Christian formation of youth through education - and therefore an institutional charisma. An atmosphere of learning seemed to permeate the school. The experience reminded me of Australian Marist schools where I had worked in the 1960s and 1970s.

Structurally influential factors on Molloy's vision include:
(1) the large number of Brothers on the faculty,
(2) a high degree of stability amongst the faculty,
(3) selection of students on the basis of academic ability and
(4) a high degree of acceptance of the school as it is.

The findings of this study suggest the overarching aim of the Marist Brothers, in supporting thirty one Brothers at Archbishop Molloy High School, is to provide middle class, academically gifted boys, who live in the Queens county of New York City, with a good quality, well rounded Catholic education - but also with a sustained experience of familial, intergenerational and concerned community - at a reduced cost, so that they will be able to pursue a college or university education, prior to entering a professional career, a fulfilling life and a responsible citizenship that includes an inclination to criticise intelligently social injustice.

This third case-study deliberately sought out a school with a large number of Marist Brothers working in it. Perhaps then the last word might be left with Br. Michael
Sheerin, who has been working at Molloy for fifteen years, and who feels 'very motivated' by the Marist Constitution which says 'ours is a community apostolate'. He elaborates: 'I like that ... because I was alone for two years in a parish and I did not like that. I was working with very good priests and nuns but nobody was Marist ... and I learned in that experience that I have a community's call' (1992, Int. AMHS).

TABLE 8.6 - INTERVIEWEES REFERRED TO IN THE CHAPTER

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERVIEWEE</th>
<th>ROLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Br. John Alexius</td>
<td>Assistant Treasurer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Hugh Andrew</td>
<td>American History and Art Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Peter Cassidy</td>
<td>Cafeteria supervisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Ben Consigli</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Chris Damiani</td>
<td>Senior student (Year 12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Steve De Castro</td>
<td>Junior student (Year 11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. John De Haan</td>
<td>Senior student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. John Doherty</td>
<td>Junior student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Louis Dubois</td>
<td>Former Teacher at St. Ann's</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Dennis Dunne</td>
<td>Visitor and Former Provincial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Bernard Flood</td>
<td>Former Director of Marist Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Mary Pat Gannon</td>
<td>English Department Chairperson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Mark Gorman</td>
<td>Junior student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. John Grimes</td>
<td>Senior student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Craig Katina</td>
<td>Junior student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. John Klein</td>
<td>Principal (-1992)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Robert Lang</td>
<td>Senior student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Angelo Palmieri</td>
<td>Assistant Principal For Academics (-1992)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Richard Salmon</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Juan Salvador</td>
<td>Study supervisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Michael Sheerin</td>
<td>Co-ordinator of the Religious Activities Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Aquinas Smollen</td>
<td>Teacher of Biology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Dan Sullivan</td>
<td>Member Fourth Floor Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Dan Turner</td>
<td>Senior student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Stephen Minogue</td>
<td>Guidance Counsellor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br. Richard Van Houten</td>
<td>Assistant Principal for Academics (1992-)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

L. Kenneth Marshen

Junior student
CHAPTER 9 - EIGHT LOOK AT THREE

A living tradition then is an historically extended, socially embodied argument, and an argument precisely in part about the goods which constitute that tradition.

MacIntyre

This chapter introduces eight more schools to give the research further breadth. Rather than an extensive questionnaire, I chose to send these schools drafts of the three case study chapters, thereby endeavouring to provoke their imaginations in a different way. I hoped this would encourage them to discuss

1) the Marist character of their own schools,
2) the Marist character of the three case study schools and
3) whether there is much comparability between their school and any or all of the three case study schools.

I invited ten schools, from seven different countries, during February 1992, to participate in this part of the research. Five accepted within five weeks and four more by the end of June. Since the tenth school, in Zimbabwe, had not replied by August, a representative of a school in Zambia agreed to act as respondent for his school instead. I asked the principals of these ten schools to nominate five people who would be prepared to respond to each of the three chapters. I sent the principals one copy of the three chapters (92 pages in total), assuming (incorrectly, I suspect in hindsight) that copies would be made at the school and given to each respondent, or the chapters I sent passed around in turn, to each of the five respondents in that school. As the research period came to a close, I was getting feedback that I had been over optimistic in my request. Schools were finding the task too burdensome. I was beginning to recognise the difficulty of getting more complex data by correspondence, particularly when some of the people being researched were invited by the principal, rather than the researcher, and when they did not feel directly involved in the research - like those participants verifying the three case study chapters in Melbourne,

1 1990, p.222.
Glasgow and New York. Instead of the promised 31 responses, I only received 8, one from each of 8 schools in 6 different countries. Fortunately, they were eight enlightening responses. Two of them resulted from an interview I conducted in Bayonne, New Jersey with two principals together.

The eight responses, in addition to providing data on their own schools, also proved helpful in rewriting the three case studies. Respondents had analysed the data at a second level — an analysis which, in some parts, agreed with my initial analysis and, in other parts, disagreed. I was able to rethink and tighten up my analyses of the sections where the respondents had disagreed, before writing the final drafts of those chapters. The eight respondents' analyses also did a service to the overall findings of the study, by helping me to gather up the understandings obtained from each case study into a more focused understanding of Marist Education in general. The conclusions benefit from this contribution.

Though 'triangulation' is always desirable, it seemed of less importance for these eight schools than for the three case study schools, because the respondents were also engaging with the issues raised by the case studies themselves, as opposed to just reporting on their own schools. Nevertheless, I obtained data on the responding schools from other sources. These included 1) official literature about the schools, 2) Marist publications and 3) interviews with Brothers in Poughkeepsie, New York, Paris, Dublin, Glasgow and London who were familiar with the responding schools. I also had background information on the schools from my own visits to five of the eight - Campbelltown (Sydney), Ashgrove (Brisbane), Sargodha (Pakistan), Bayonne (New Jersey) and Singapore.

This chapter, 'Eight (individuals) look at Three (schools)', concentrates on what these respondents have said or written after reading the case study chapters. They responded to five, quite normative questions:
(1) What do these analyses capture of Marist educational work in your school?
(2) What do these analyses omit of Marist educational work at your school?
(3) Do these analyses do justice in today's world to Marcellin Champagnat's educational vision? What would you like to add?
(4) What part do you believe Marist history plays in the contributions Marist educators are making at your school today? Can you give some examples?
(5) How do you believe Marist educators resolve the tension between the need to be authentic to the educational vision of Marcellin Champagnat while still being relevant, and even prophetic, for today's educational needs?

Most respondents chose to answer the questions freely and not to be restricted to answering each question in turn. Three spoke more generally and at some length about the topic of the thesis: Educational Vision: A Marist Perspective.

The written responses, which averaged five pages in length, focused more on issues than on either the respondents' own schools or the case study schools. Usually, comment on the case study and responding schools provided the launching pad for respondents to discuss their own more general experience of Marist education. The interview with two American Brothers, one working in New Jersey and the other just returned from Liberia (but with previous experience of New Jersey), lasted for an hour and a quarter and consequently produced more data than the written responses. These two Brothers were more inclined to talk about the case study schools in Melbourne and Glasgow than about the New York school, which belongs to their own province. They disagreed on some issues.

In quoting the responses, I group in different sections what the respondents said about (1) the three case study schools (about 38% of what follows) (2) about their own schools (about 48%) and (3) about any generalisable Marist charism in schools (about 14%). I endeavour to be faithful to the differing quantities and qualities of the data and yet
represent the views of all eight schools. I chose not to act as mediator. But, having selected and ordered the data according to themes, to let the quotations speak for themselves. I reference them by the location of the school and the respondent's role. Names of the respondents can be identified by referring to the descriptions of the schools. Draft copies of this chapter were sent to the respondents and the principals of all ten schools. Three replied with corrections or suggestions.

9.1 - THE SCHOOLS

(1) Marist College, Ashgrove is a boarding and day school located close to the centre of Brisbane. It belongs to the Sydney Marist Province. The school, which began in 1940, currently has a staff of 80, including 9 Brothers, and an enrolment of 1277 boys. The respondent for this school is a recently retired teacher, Mrs. Pat Monsour, who commenced teaching at the school in 1975. Her response is leisurely and eloquent, more descriptive than normative and contributes a good deal on the topic of Marist work in boarding schools which had not arisen in the three main study schools. I use Pat's response frequently during this chapter (Heinrich, 1992, Corr.; Monsour, 1992a and 1992b, Corr.).

(2) St. John's High School, Dundee, Scotland began in 1931. This city day school currently enrols 730 boys and girls and has one Brother on a staff of 56. The school's recently retired principal, Br. Bede McCabe, responds for the school in the light of his 26 years as the school's Head Teacher. His response reflects his joy at having completed his working life as a successful school principal - as exemplified by his telling me in his response of the representative of the Local Education Authority who said about St. John's, Dundee: 'this is the most caring school community I have ever seen in my life'. Bede's normative response reflects more on his own experience than on the case studies. He answers the questions in order (McCabe, 1992a and 1992b, Corr.).
(3) St. Francis High School, Plebebo, Liberia began as a day school in 1973. Marist Brothers went to the aid of the school in 1986 at the invitation of the local Bishop. The school has a large campus, but no water or electricity. Currently, there is one Brother on the staff of 12. 420 students attend the school. I interviewed the school's immediate past principal, American Br. Leo Shea, who concluded his term as principal in June 1992. He had some strong feelings about the issues emerging from the case studies, spoke more normatively than descriptively and freely gave his views about Marist Education. Some of these views reflected his earlier experience as Vice-Provincial of the Marist Province of Esopus. On receiving a copy of the draft of this chapter, Leo wrote back expressing his enthusiasm for the themes discussed. I refer to him frequently (Shea, 1992a, Corr.; Shea, 1992, Int. BAY.; FMSM, 1991a, p.45).

(4) The Marist Brothers opened Marist High School, Bayonne in New Jersey as a city day school in 1954. For a number of years its enrolment ranged from 700 and 900 boys. The school now enrolls 590 boys and girls and has a staff of 36, 9 of whom are Marist Brothers. The school no longer serves just the city of Bayonne, but has an outreach to the northern part of the Hudson county. Students travel by buses from these areas. The present principal, Br. Edmund Sheehan, is the main respondent for the school. He seemed to have thought a lot about the three case studies, spoke quite normatively and was keen to describe Marist Education ideologically. His response is referred to frequently in the chapter. Br. Leo Shea also adds some comments about his time as a teacher at this school (Shea, 1992, Int. BAY; Sheehan, 1992, Corr.; Sheehan, 1992, Int. BAY.).

(5) Sargodha Catholic School, Pakistan opened in 1989 and has grown rapidly. There are now 800 day boys and girls in the school and 36 on the staff, 3 of whom are Marist Brothers. When I visited the school in December, 1989, I found Sargodha to be a small town, located in a rural area, 400km south of Lahore. The current bursar of the school, Australian Br. Walter Smith, responds for the school. Walter
was provincial of the Melbourne Province when I began my principalship at Marcellin College and the Brother who gave me my initial brief in 1981. He was generally normative in his responses, completing his responses quite quickly, devoting a page to his ideas on Marist Education. I refer to his response frequently in this text (Smith, 1991a, 1991b and 1992, Corr.).

(6) Maris Stella High School, Singapore currently enrols 3,600 students and has a staff of 150, including 2 Brothers. This academically selective, city day school began in 1958. The school's respondent is the principal, Br. Tony Tan, who has been working in Singapore for the past ten years. I had earlier spoken with him at some length when I visited the school in December, 1989. In his written response, Tony speaks more about his own school than the case study schools. Further data on this school came from Mr. Er Kwong Wah (Government Permanent Secretary - Education) and Mr. Wee Heng Tin (Director of Schools - Ministry of Education), who both contributed messages to a school brochure celebrating the opening of the school's new primary section in 1989 (Heng Tin, 1989, p.6; Kwong Wah, 1989, p.7; Tan, 1992a and 1992b, Corr.; MSHS, 1989, p.2).

(7) St. Gregory's College, Campbelltown, is one of twenty Marist schools located in Sydney. The school enrols day and boarding students and belongs to the Marist Province of Sydney. When the school opened in 1926, it was mainly surrounded by farms. Located some 30 km from the city centre, it is now part of Sydney's urban spread. It currently enrols 1002 boys and has a staff of 66, 9 of whom are Marist Brothers. Responding for the school is the recently appointed principal and contemporary of mine, Br. Paul Hough. His response, more normative than descriptive, answered the questions sequentially, until it reached the Archbishop Molloy Chapter. Since Paul had recently spent some time in New York, he responded to this case study from his own experience. Throughout he refers at length to his present school and adds a good deal to the study about the boarding dimension of Marist education. He had a good
understanding of my research as a whole, since we had discussed it at length when he stayed with me in London in 1991 (Hough, 1992a and 1992b, Corr.).

(8) St. Paul's Secondary School, Zambia, opened in 1960. Of the staff of 22, 4 are Marist Brothers. This boarding and day school currently enrolls 530 students. Mr. Tony Simpson, responds for the school. He has taught at the school since 1974, is now the school's deputy principal, and is currently on study leave in England, like me completing doctoral studies on the Marist Brothers - 'how they live, work, communicate their vision and how it is seen, understood and received by the teachers, pupils, people around'. He responds to the case studies in a leisurely and analytical way, reflecting his interest in both the content and the methodology of the study (Simpson, 1992a and 1992b, Corr.; Simpson, 1992, Int. LON.).

9.2 - WHAT THE RESPONDENTS SAID ABOUT THE THREE CASE STUDY SCHOOLS

IN GENERAL

Each analysis was reflective in some way of Marist educational work at Ashgrove (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

I think these analyses capture most of the best things at St. John's H.S. (Dundee, Recently Retired Brother Principal).

I enjoyed reading the Chapters, particularly the Marcellin one ... Naturally my reading of this chapter was a little more subjective ... knowing the characters and quite a lot of the history of those days (Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

Unlike the Marist mission schools mentioned by you, Maris Stella High School is extremely popular and the enrolment is bursting with a population of more than 3000 pupils. The Singapore government has given the school a further grant of twenty five million Singapore dollars to upgrade our present facilities and the project should be ready in 1994 (Singapore. Brother Principal).
My first general reaction is how similar - in many respects - the themes I encounter in your account ... [are to] my own experience [of] working with the brothers in Zambia (Zambia, Lay Deputy Principal).

One of the questions that always comes up as we look at ourselves is who are we serving? And as I read your account of the developments at Marcellin College, the chain of events at St. Mungo’s, and a little bit, although you didn’t focus on it in the Molloy scenario, the question always present is: Who are we serving? And we always seem to be wondering: Are we serving the people who should be served? And I don’t know if this is as important a question as we make it - I think we serve the people that we have, whether they be at St. Francis in Liberia, or Marcellin College in Australia, and we do the best for them that we can - they have different needs - and I think that’s part of Marist Education. In some cases we are going to be serving youngsters who are rather talented academically. In other cases we are going to be serving youngsters who are really struggling in school work. I don’t think we should set up hard categories - we work with these, and we don’t work with those and I think the history of St. Mungo’s illustrates that what today could be a school for a very elite group of students, tomorrow could be a school that is gasping for survival. And so we kind of work with what the Lord gives us to work with. And He does that through the Church. We shouldn’t think of our work as catholic educators divorced from what’s going on in the local Church in which we’re serving (New Jersey, Brother Principal).

[A] theme that comes through is the 'problem' of 'success'. How the brothers' schools - like other mission schools - become quickly very 'successful' and are therefore targeted as avenues for advancement - attracting in Zambia - always a certain percentage of children from more privileged backgrounds. The current debate for the brothers: Should we stay here as we are more and more catering for our elite? - They do have a place to train mechanics - their students being those who generally have failed to get into senior secondary school (Zambia, Lay Deputy Principal).

I found the comparison (contrast) of these two schools [St. Mungo's and Archbishop Molloy] of value ... finally what comes out is the life of each Monk and the extent that he sees himself living the Marist Charism and affecting the school community by his life and work ... My own idea (and policy) was to work on the
assumption that even one Monk can be a very effective transmitter of the Marist spirit and charism (Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

In ... chapter (7) & in chapter (8) - I'm rather concerned about the decision to name the sources ... the texts do tend to sound rather hagiographical - not much in the way of contradiction - which I'm sure you are well aware (!) is constantly going on (Zambia, Lay Deputy Principal).

MARCELLIN COLLEGE, MELBOURNE

Type of school

Chapter ... [6] is describing a school which is in a constant state of evolving and changing and developing. I think what the Principal set out to do ... was ... to move in such a direction as to be more consistent with Marist educational philosophy. This is particularly emphasised by the role of the Grammar School question. In my present school here at Campbeltown, I feel the same challenge is present, namely to keep directing the whole human organisation and the people in it, to keep them moving in the direction of Marist educational philosophy. I would also have some concerns about those who are enrolled here, the nature of sport in the place, where the place is perceived to be more of a private school rather than a Catholic school, and whether the quality of teaching and learning in the classroom is as important as external results in examinations. To this extent the ... [Marcellin College] chapter captures similar concerns (Sydney, Brother Principal).

I'm struck by the importance of the physical environment ( ... the grass!!) - several students have told me that when they are at school they feel that they are 'no longer in Africa' but 'in Europe' - and they single out the lawns and the flowers (Zambia, Lay Deputy Principal).

Administration

I ... believe that the Marist Principal needs to be a person who is fairly 'hands on' and is seen consistently around the school ... I believe that most people in the school should see him at least once a week in their own particular area, whether it be the printing room, the secretarial area, the tuck shop, the technics block, the maintenance shed, etc. etc. I really think that
this is one of the problems you had at Marcellin being out of the school one day a week. The
delegation style that you had, seemed to be
borne partly out of the necessity of only being
in the school four days a week (Sydney, Brother
Principal).

In the decision making process of the College,
there seemed to be so many boards and so many
different groups (Liberia, Immediate Past Brother
Principal).

Why did it take so long (historically) to appoint
a brother as school chaplain? (Zambia, Lay
Deputy Principal).

If we can be clear on our educational vision as
Marists, then we have to work at getting this
across to a lay staff, and try to get them to put
into effect those aspects of that vision which we
see as Marist. This is much more difficult ... but a very worthwhile ambition. It is the one
that most of us face in our Marist schools today.
Your account [in the Marcellin College chapter]
shows the path to clarifying that vision
(Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

Change

It seems that, even though you might speak of
empowerment, what actually took place in the
school, at the period of time you describe in
detail, was the introduction of a new style of
operating a school, which came not so much from
a gradual education or inclusion of faculty
consensus but rather from on top and was more
or less introduced from top down in the school
(New Jersey, Brother Principal).

I think of all the things that struck me in the
remarks and happenings at Marcellin, the one
that I felt most kinship with, was the question
of salaries where the new administration came
into the school with the notion of adjusting
salaries to be more in line with what other
catholic schools were offering rather than what
the more elite private schools were offering ... this meant ... paring back some salaries and this
to me betokened problems from the outset. I
think it betokened a rough relationship with the
faculty and perhaps a lot of misunderstanding.
Because when you talk about money, all sides
are always convinced that they're right ... the
way I see things is not the way the teacher of
Chemistry sees things as he's trying to raise his
family. And so I think this question became
quite a prominent one as I read your account,
[it] kind of sent up some sort of a flare that there was an inherent difficulty in what the vision of a catholic school was as being implemented in Marcellin (New Jersey, Brother Principal).

I'm particularly interested in the relationship/s between the 'brothers' and the 'lay' members of staff - & the demands (?) made upon the lay-teachers financially and otherwise - to conform - at least in some way - with what may be promulgated as - or negotiated as - the Marist vision - and the inevitable stress and tension involved - which may or may not be creative ... In Zambia - with one or two notable exceptions - I would say that the teaching staff are not in sympathy with Marist aims and indeed would have great difficulty identifying what they might be (Zambia, Lay Deputy Principal).

You also opened the school more to children of different academic backgrounds, of achievements, aptitudes. Now looking back on that, could you handle all those children? (Liberia, Immediate Past Brother Principal).

ST. MUNGO'S ACADEMY, GLASGOW

Brothers

Brother Stephen certainly seems to have some sense of charism ... He ... seems to be content to spend time with fellow teachers and help them in their work. Here at St. Gregory's most of the Brothers are concerned with boarding duties, and not many would be seen as tops in their academic fields ... We certainly do not have a large pool of Brothers who are happy to spend their time in the classroom and help other inexperienced teachers (Sydney, Brother Principal).

I felt that ... the St. Mungo's account spends too much time, too much detail, on one person ... Stephen. An aspect of Stephen's influence (and it is obviously a very effective one) would be the very strong influence which the Monks exercised in that school community over many years. I remember going there in 1966 and thinking then, what powerful and effective Monks were directing the school (Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

Is the role of Stephen then to 'convert' the teachers? Also one is struck how one man - in spite of all the difficulties - can articulate one
vision: 'This is a brother – a Marist brother'. With a community of brothers you have presumably competing/conflicting voices. The 'vision' then is constantly up for grabs, for negotiation, for reconstruction (Zambia, Lay Deputy Principal).

I found the story of St. Mungo's a very sad story, in a certain sense, even though we can say how wonderful it is that this one Brother is doing so much, I think it's a very – well sad might be too secular a light to cast on it – but it certainly is illustrative of the impermanence of human institutions which we think are so wonderful and so important (Bayonne, Brother Principal).

I'm wondering just how equipped the institution of the Province was to cope with what was going on at St. Mungo's. I realise that in Great Britain there had been a fall in numbers [of Brothers], and perhaps this strapped them so much that they really couldn't cope with these kind of changes that were taking place (New Jersey, Brother Principal).

Br. Stephen's reaction ... saying that 'in the good old days' there were some good teachers and there were some weak teachers and the same is true today. I felt that captured some of our own experience here in Australia (Sydney, Brother Principal).

What struck me was the religious education and the Brothers' role in the school ... there's only one Brother still in the school, so that Brother is key in that school. What he's doing is very important, but if he goes it will only be continued if somebody with the same calibre, the same interests as that Brother [replaces him] (Liberia, Immediate Past Brother Principal).

Marcellin Champagnat

The account of St. Mungo's Academy certainly reflects Marcellin Champagnat's educational vision. It was ... valid for a certain point in history, and it has changed according to circumstances. It has catered very well for academically selected students, and perhaps Champagnat's vision would now be questioning what such a school, or what such a group of Brothers, would be able to do for those students at the other end of the spectrum (Sydney, Brother Principal).
Marist spirit

I found the Molloy chapter interesting and coherent; well put together. You have brought out the bases of Marist Spirit and Marist influence well (Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

The spirit apparent at Archbishop Molloy was familiar, the total dedication of some brothers to their charges both in terms of time and interest, the feeling of acceptance by the boys (and in our case by the staff) was a familiar atmosphere. There was no judgementalism, or very little. Teaching by encouragement, lifting morale by positive feedback for both students and staff, developing enthusiasm and commitment by the brothers' example were all recognisably the same in both schools (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

Brothers

If you have 40% of the staff as Marist Brothers, then all those aspects of Marist Spirit that you outlined ... in the Molloy Chapter can be developed: availability, friendliness, sense of security, all-round education etc. etc. as well as being fully responsible for the professionalism of the school and the development of faith, etc. etc. (Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

One reaction that I have reading your assessment is the presence of the Brothers at Molloy as a physical force in contrast both to Mungo's and to Marcellin College ... Even in comparison to the typical catholic school in the United States today, it's an anomaly ... part of its current success is enhanced or enabled by the presence of all those Brothers there. Hopefully it will continue for a while, but it's not going to continue forever (New Jersey, Brother Principal).

The poor

... you refer to the fact that no families ... have incomes below the poverty level. Our Australian experience ... would suggest that there are a considerable number of people in our schools who are below the poverty level ... Probably there should be more, because a number of families would ... feel unwelcome and ... would
not even start asking the questions about getting into Australian [Marist] Schools. I have had this experience with some people here, in the Campbelltown area, who were practising Catholics, but felt that it was not even worth asking the question, as the school was perceived to be for middle class people (Sydney, Brother Principal).

True to our foundations, we reach out to the poor in our schools and in our other work amongst youth. This must be seen as actually going out to the marginalised and materially poor in many cases. The Church embraces all strata of society, so we will, at times, be engaged with the well-off. And therefore we must do what Molloy attempts ... see that the young people we teach or deal with have that desire to go out to the poor in a variety of ways (Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

Mary

Perhaps what has become our most difficult characteristic to put into practice is the love for Mary which should come through in our teaching and in our work. This is written up well in the Molloy case (Pakistan, Bursar).

9.3 - WHAT THE RESPONDENTS SAID ABOUT THEIR OWN SCHOOLS

Location

We went there [to Liberia] because Br. Basilio [the Superior General] wrote and said that he hoped that each Province of the Institute would have a mission. Our Province had the Philippines, but it had become an independent district, so would we be interested in going some place? So I asked him what he wanted us to look for. And he said: 'I want you to look for a country where there are no Marist Brothers - in an area where people don't want to go. Stay in education' (Liberia, Immediate Past Brother Principal).

School Goals

Two main challenges that we have identified are firstly, the need to establish a more 'Catholic' atmosphere in the school and secondly to continue maintaining and consolidating ourselves as one of the 'excellent' Special Assistant Plan
The Marist educators here will continue to frame and reframe the school goals in keeping up with the times and align them as closely as possible to Marcellin Champagnat's vision. Our goals can change but our Marist Mission Statement [as below] will always remain as an 'inspiration' to our Marist Institution and ideals (Singapore, Brother Principal).

Mission Statement

The following mission statement is the outcome of the deliberations and distillations from the Marist Philosophy:

'Our Marist Mission provides an educational programme that blends faith, culture and life through a climate of cordiality, cooperation and constructive dialogue and thus effects the total formation of the individual, giving due respect to his unique human dignity.'

'In order to educate children well, we must first of all, love them.'
Marcellin Champagnat, founder of the Marist Mission (Singapore, Brother Principal).

I would say the brothers have - especially in recent times - done little to articulate their vision and their aims ... it seems to me that the brothers on the whole perceive themselves/project themselves as men of 'action' and as a consequence 'men of few words' - at least 'public words'. This has a particular irony in a 'culture' in which missionaries are often identified as men (!) who have come to 'preach the word of God' - and in which orality and oral skills play such a large part in everyday intercourse and hold a special high status (Zambia, Lay Deputy Principal).

Evangelisation

I see the evangelizing process as key to what the Brother does ... When I look at the level of religious awareness of youngsters who attend a school like this - this school is at least 30% non-catholic and of the 70% who are catholic, I would say no more than half come from church going families - we're really talking more about the process of evangelization than ... catechizing (New Jersey, Brother Principal).

Being 'prophetic' involves confrontation of society's accepted values at the time. In
Australia's case we're a pretty materialistic lot and rich? schools like Ashgrove can fall into the technology trap. 'But the computers are so out of date'. It needs a lot of prayer and discernment. I guess the Provincial assemblies are for that. I'm glad I don't have to make that sort of decision (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

**Pedagogy**

We are endeavouring to establish a professional approach to teaching and to set up a solid core curriculum. This is very difficult in the Pakistani context (Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

... the students knew almost nothing. They would be comparable, in the United States in the 12th grade, to about 6th or 7th grade and the teachers would be about that standard also (Liberia, Immediate Past Brother Principal).

We are a government aided school, also called a 'Grant in Aid' school which has been given the status of a 'Special Assistance Plan School (SAP)' in recognition of its excellent academic achievements. There are about 9 schools accorded this status [in Singapore]. The SAP schools accept only high achievers (top 10 percent of the cohort at national level) who have passed the Primary School Leaving Examination (PSLE). Pupils in SAP schools study two first languages, namely English and Chinese (Singapore, Brother Principal).

When I took over ... the first thing I did - the faculty were beating the children with these, well they're like whips, branches that really hurt - so at the first faculty meeting, I collected them from all the teachers and I broke them in front of them and I told them that I would fire anyone who touched a child in any way - that that wasn't education. Now, of course, they were furious, they had never taught without a stick (Liberia, Immediate Past Brother Principal).

A Marist school must be characterised by its sincere and sensible attempt to reach the needs of each individual student ... For a Marist this is based on the deep respect for the individual student as a child of God (Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

We encourage staff to conduct as many clubs, musical associations, games, training sessions, dance etc. during lunch time & after school as
possible. This engenders good morale, understanding between staff & pupils, and promotes aesthetics & leisure activities. I ran a Youth Club for Seniors over 24 years in Dundee & 14 in Birmingham - I believe this was the most fruitful part of my apostolate insofar as it kept young Catholics together, strengthened the faith and encouraged ... [Christian] marriages' (Dundee, Recently Retired Brother Principal).

I have fond memories of a Year Nine student who was a pupil in my Speech and Drama [class] and one of the shyest and most withdrawn boys I have ever had. His dorm-master came by one afternoon just as I discovered I had a flat tyre and without hesitation called him over to change my tyre. With speed and dexterity the job was done; he nodded his head and brushed off my thanks (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

Family Spirit

The spirit of the monks is unique, one nun giving as her opinion 'The brothers have great devotion to Our Lady, she would always see that they have feminine qualities.' I would see this as a genuine family spirit, embodying compassion, especially for students who are disadvantaged in any way. On one noteworthy occasion, a student who had been expelled two years previously from another Brisbane school was elected school captain, a triumph for himself and for Ashgrove. Of course not all the long suffering is as productive and there have been occasions when students have been allowed to remain at school and their behaviour even after numerous warnings has been destructive of morale for other students and staff as well (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

St. John's have the benefit of a large female presence (50% girls and 50% female staff) which tends to create a greater family quality of community and offers the 'female' graces of gentility, serious study attitudes, courtesy, and the female slant in thinking, discussing & artistic expression (Dundee, Recently Retired Brother Principal).

In the seventeen years since I began teaching at Ashgrove there have been considerable changes in the composition of the staff. Originally there was a larger proportion of brothers to lay staff, and in my opinion a better overall relationship between the two groups. There is some element of "them" and "us" now which was not so evident earlier on. Historically, teachers'
salaries have not kept pace with comparable rates in other fields of work, the metal trades being the reference point, and the shortage of brothers has placed heavy loads on the ones remaining (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

Perhaps because of the boarding school situation there seems to be plenty of opportunity for t.l.c. Sister Dorothy, the school counsellor, spends every night in first term sitting on the edge of the bed with some tearful grade eight student listening to the details of the high cost of breeding bulls and other family news; one brother carefully stuffed Easter eggs into the shoes of the boys in his ... [dormitory], although one student remarked that the Easter Bunny had got the dates wrong (They were actually going home for Easter) (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

Marcellin Champagnat

What is clear to me at present is that there are many people associated with St. Gregory's here who do not understand what Marcellin Champagnat's educational vision was then, and is today. By way of example we recently had a Champagnat week finishing on June 6, the Feast Day of Blessed ... [Marcellin] Champagnat. Many staff members asked the question 'What is this Champagnat all about?' ... On reflection, many staff come and go over the years, and it can very easily be assumed that they are familiar with the things that we are familiar with. Hence I believe we have to educate our people constantly about just who ... Champagnat was, some of the stories surrounding his life, and allowing his humanness to come through that way. I believe it is in the stories that are told and in the personalities, that ... Champagnat's vision finds expression (Sydney, Brother Principal).

In 1990 ... Marist teachers numbering about 120 from both the Primary and Secondary schools gathered together at the seminar 'In the footsteps of Champagnat - Challenges of the 90's' where Brother Frederick ... [McMahon] was invited as our very important guest of honour to deliver a lecture on the life of our great Founder. In that Seminar, the lay Marist educators were provided the opportunity to discuss the vision and mission of Champagnat and in the process to try and better understand his life and philosophy. It was also a time for the participants to reaffirm their commitment 'Towards a better Maris Stella High School
I do not see any particular tension between the suggested need to be authentic to the educational vision of Champagnat while still being relevant, and even prophetic for the educational needs of today's students. An order that has been successful for so long in so many different countries has obviously gained an enormous body of educational expertise. Champagnat showed himself able to cope with his own limitations and those of his followers, while making every effort to provide for the accommodation, training, and spiritual guidance of his brothers and their charges (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

While there is some tension between Marcellin Champagnat's educational vision and today's needs, I think as long as the question is being asked, then it is also being resolved. I believe there are Marist ways of going about things. More specifically, one problem at present on my mind is the question of rubbish in the yard. I think Marcellin Champagnat's attitude to rubbish would be first of all not to condone the place being left dirty. Secondly, he would probably gather together some boys and talk to them about the problem and see what they felt should be done about it. Thirdly he and the boys would probably work together and remove the rubbish (Sydney, Brother Principal).

Religious Education

There seems to be a swing back to the teaching of Catholic dogma but not before many students have left school with an inadequate knowledge of the truths of our faith. While mere head learning can be sterile there needs to be a solid grounding in doctrine consistently taught with faithful practice of religion at the same time. So many young people these days seem never to have come to know Jesus as their Friend and Saviour and to have substituted New Age teaching with its reliance on their own powers or, at best, an ... [impersonal] power with Jesus relegated to the place of holy man (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

When I went to Liberia ... the big question on my mind [was] how am I going to make this school, which is so terrible, into not only a good school, but a catholic school. I decided, I would teach religion ... And I asked the other Brothers to do the same thing ... I think we were successful ... and I wonder if that's part of our
call to get back into direct religious education – proclamation of the gospel in a classroom (Liberia, Immediate Past Brother Principal).

Student Intake

The student body is largely drawn from blue-collar families (Bayonne, Brother Principal).

Because Ashgrove is a boarding school, although day students are a very homogeneous group of Middle and Working-class youth, country boys from as far away as Northern Territory, New Guinea and Asia have leavened the mixture (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

Blessed Marcellin, if he were to pay a visit to the 3 selected schools and to St. John’s H.S. Dundee ... would probably sense that many of our pupils are by no means poor, but may be very deficient in their religious faith commitment, reflecting their backgrounds where so much consumerism, worldly pleasure and general godlessness increasingly exist – and I can see him longing to tell these kids how important they are and how much God loves them – a need for fresh evangelisation (Dundee, Recently Retired Brother Principal).

Boys have been admitted who represent a wide spectrum of ability from exceptionally gifted to clearly brain-damaged. In one Year 10 English class I had two very limited students, one who had had a brain tumour removed and the other having suffered a severe birth injury. They spent most of their time in withdrawal groups and the facilities were far from adequate, but at the end of the year they happily joined us in the drama production of the reading of Caesar’s will from 'Julius Caesar'. They were always accepted by the other students as part of the class (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

The school’s student body currently is a very mixed student body, fairly diverse. I would say that about 15% of our students would be described as Hispanic students, about 25% to 30% of our students would be African-American students ... another 10% would be Asiatic or Philippino and the remainder white students with European ancestry – primarily Italian and Polish (New Jersey, Brother Principal).
Prayer

It is ... our tradition to say the 'Hail Mary' every morning, in keeping with the mission of our Founder and to continue reminding our pupils that it is Mary who inspired him to found all our schools (Singapore, Brother Principal).

I always commenced Staff meetings & parent meetings with a prayer. Non-Catholic members always showed appreciation of this; some even acted as readers and one as cantor! (Dundee, Recently Retired Brother Principal).

We are a Christ Centre school, and therefore we shall promote the inculcation of Christian values, but at the same time recognise the importance to respect and tolerate the religious rights and beliefs of others who are non-Catholics (Singapore, Brother Principal).

Marist history

Marist history does play a part [in the contribution Marist educators are making to the school], but I think the connection is fairly vague and tenuous. The traditions of the school here embody elements ... such as plenty of hard physical work, particularly in the early days, a sense of things being rustic and raw, rather than smooth and polished, and a strong tradition of the Brothers working with the boys, day and night and all weekend (Sydney, Brother Principal).

A clear link with Marist history occurs each year on 6th June when a liturgy and other special celebrations recall the humble village priest who began such an important educational order. Several years ago, a school tour was organised to Marist places in France and to the Mother House in Rome. Marist training is evident in the care with which brothers prepare their school work and their dedication to excellence in their own personal development and the encouragement of the staff and students. French has received preferential treatment in staffing and a student from a Marist school in France was in attendance at Ashgrove for a semester. On regular trips to Noumea, the Marist connection is also in evidence (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

The story of Marie Stella is an inspiring one. It was founded by a Marist Brother, the Reverend Brother Chanel. He began humbly without a school to call his own. He taught his pupils in
borrowed premises and it took him nine years to
gather the necessary resources to build his
school. The completion of the Primary section
building extension is a milestone for Maris Stella.
It is a living monument to the ideals that
Brother Chanel lived by: unquestioning trust in
and dedication to God; loyalty to his faith and
perseverance in the vocation he had chosen for
himself (Singapore, Government Permanent
Secretary of Education).

9.4 – WHAT THE RESPONDENTS SAID ABOUT A GENERALISABLE
MARIST CHARISM IN SCHOOLS

Marist Education

It's a big question. Is there even such a thing?
Well, the first thing that comes to my mind is
schools. I think we're good at it. And I think
that most of our Brothers like being in schools
(Liberia, Immediate Past Brother Principal).

Marist education is discovered by looking at the
practice of the Brothers over our history. One
of the things that struck me ... about Marcellin
Champagnat was that he had very little
experience in schools. He didn't go to school.
The only schooling he had, prior to the
seminary, was some cramming for it. He didn't
know what schools were. His life gives some
examples of how we might behave towards people
we are educating. But I don't think he has
very much to teach us about schools. I think
the Brothers who came as his followers have
something to teach us in their practice of
schooling in which, I would imagine, they
absorbed, or tried to carry on, some of the
values that he exemplified (New Jersey, Brother
Principal).

[Marist] educational vision remains much the
same ... we may have to change our methods and
styles (Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

The education we offer must be of the highest
quality. Anything else is failing those for whom
we take on a serious responsibility. I often say
... that before we think of anything else - we
must be running a GOOD school (Pakistan,
Brother Bursar).

... we should not restrict ourselves just to one
local church and say, well, I only work in this
archdiocese or that diocese - I think one of our
advantages as a Congregation is our ability to
move into different areas where the Church is and where we can be of service to it (New Jersey, Brother Principal).

[We need] to share our vision of a ... [Catholic] School with parents, staff and pupils ... [by] working together towards a declared, understood and implemented Mission Statement' (Dundee, Recently Retired Brother Principal).

... the schools ... can turn very easily into private schools and many of the parents don't send the children to the school for the reason that we would like ... They want them to get a good education in order to get into a good College, get a good job and to make money ... I think we sometimes give ourselves a gold star when we don't deserve it ... we're called ... to be religious educators and we have to proclaim the gospel and live the gospel as best we can ... it seems to be kind of a lost agenda in many situations - we love to run good schools ... but how good are they as far as what ... we really want from these schools? (Liberia, Immediate Past Brother Principal).

Marcellin Champagnat

Champagnat listened to what the Spirit was saying to the Church & took on the challenge (in his case, the education of poor villagers). This challenge can change: we must be receptive, courageous, open-minded, believing like Mary, and be prepared to be used by the Spirit (Dundee, Recently Retired Brother Principal).

Indeed, one wonders if it would not be more helpful to put some of the current educational theory to the test of how it fits in with the thinking of Marcellin rather than the other way round. Especially in the teaching of religion. Human nature does not change very much, and if boys needed to learn how to use a trowel and cope with life under the vagaries of various French governments in the eighteenth century, while making their way to Heaven with the help of God and their Good Mother, a calculator and computer simply come as part of the package, the eternal verities remain the same (Brisbane, Recently Retired Lay Teacher).

Religious Education

The whole area of religious education and the Brothers seems to be key to me ... I think we're religious educators (Liberia, Brother Principal).
The first priority in our work amongst the young must be 'The Catechism'!! ... our effort to develop their faith (Pakistan, Brother Bursar).

[Marist schools offer] an ethos of Christian spirituality [where the] experience of faith [particularly through prayer, is central] ... [Priest chaplains are seen to be] a dynamic part [of Marist schools] (Dundee, Recently Retired Brother Principal).

Students

When I was the Director of Education [for Marist Schools in the Esopus Province], I found, if I had to say what I picked up when I went to a Marist school, it was tremendous respect for the student. I felt that was a real characteristic of all the schools that we ran - that the teachers, thanks to the principal I think, and some of the Brothers, or maybe it just came from the teachers, but the students, I found, liked the school and were treated with respect (Liberia, Immediate Past Brother Principal).

The study of Marist Education

I think this [research] is a very worthwhile undertaking and very helpful ... I think we have very little to go on in getting a sense of Marist Education. Something like this helps - especially being rooted in some practical case studies of what Marist Education has been in three different schools in three different locations. I would be interested in ... an additional elucidation of one of our schools in a Spanish speaking country to see what that would add to this picture of Marist Education (New Jersey, Brother Principal).
CONCLUSIONS

It is not that the Gospel has changed, it is that we have begun to understand it better.

John XXIII

In brief these are the more general conclusions of the thesis, some of them emerging from individual studies and/or chapters, others from juxtapositions of several studies and/or chapters. The first two relate to the theoretical framework of the thesis, and mirror each other up to a point.

(1) In strictly sociological terms the Weberian account of charismatic authority, and the concept we derived from that of a charismatic social movement, while being deeply illuminative when applied to religious orders and their life-cycles, are at the same time expanded and challenged by that application. In particular, the Weberian account of the routinisation of charisma is challenged, and potentially greatly expanded, by noting both the charism-preserving features of religious orders, and their tendency to throw up 're-founding' and otherwise secondarily charismatic figures. It would seem to be open to Weberians to accommodate the case of the religious order either by treating it as an 'ideal type' in its own right, though one that relates to the ideal type of charismatic authority, or by modifying the account of charismatic authority.

(2) The already large and still growing theological literature relating to religious life, and the theological self-understanding of contemporary religious congregations which is both reflected in and shaped by that literature, would benefit from some detailed engagement with the Weberian literature on charismatic authority and movements - both at the conceptual level of improved self-understanding and the practical level of better policy-making. In particular such engagements would open up further the important questions of the relationship or tension between charism on the one hand and each of tradition and rational bureaucracy on the

1 Quoted in TAB, 1992k, p.1216.
other.

The remaining conclusions are more practical in character and they draw upon broader swathes of the studies comprising this thesis.

(3) Marist Brothers are described as displaying, or aspiring to,

a) an enthusiasm for educating young people in professional, non-authoritarian and unpretentious ways
b) an availability to, and love of, those being taught
c) an understanding of Mary which sees her as a caring woman of faith
d) a respect for and love of, Marcellin Champagnat as a man of action, always conscious of the presence of God, determined, sympathetic to uneducated youth especially slow learners, committed to the non-evangelised, a priest who enjoyed manual work and
e) a relaxed attitude to any supposed tension between being authentic to Marcellin Champagnat's educational vision and prophetically relevant for today's educational needs.

(4) Marist Brothers and Marist Schools link evangelisation and education. Catholic schools continue to provide a viable, valid and important medium for their work in educational, Christian and Marist terms.

(5) It is possible to maintain a Marist ethos, or at least make a significant difference to the ethos of a school with different levels of contribution from Brothers. Successful models include having a) a Marist principal and a small group of Brothers on the staff, b) one Brother on the staff as, say, the Head of the Religious Education Department and c) a Marist principal with, say, a third of the staff Brothers.

(6) The defining of a school philosophy statement can be a helpful way of re-orienting a school provided the discerning process involves the majority of staff and representatives of the other major groups within the school community. A Development Group can contribute conceptual and
methodological assistance to such a process.

(7) Marist Brothers acknowledge an option for the poor. Marist schools interpret this differently, while typically investing considerable energy and/or anxiety in re-evaluating their own interpretations. Some of the differences in question seem to result from the circumstances of the society in which they are working, others from more general differences of philosophy. New locations for Marist work often include poorer areas, sometimes in developing countries such as Liberia and Pakistan and dioceses which are new to the Congregation's work as was Marcellin Champagnat's wish.

(8) Marist Brothers give a high priority in schools to religious education, religious activities such as liturgies and retreats and guidance programmes.

(9) The Marist Brother/lay-teacher relationship varies considerably across the contexts studied but is a form of some attention in all contexts. Often lay staff working in Marist Schools speak of how they have been influenced by the Brothers. Here the study of the Society of Jesus suggests that Marist Brothers might also see the spirituality of their founder being incarnated in one way by Marist Brothers and in another by lay staff. Staff of Marist schools generally might be described as 'Champagnat Educators'. Since the Brothers know Marcellin Champagnat's spirituality through their initial and ongoing formation, they could assist lay staffs to become familiar with his life and his ensuing movement. New and re-edited studies of Marcellin Champagnat's life provide good resource material for such an exercise. The recent formal launching of the Champagnat Movement of the Marist Family offers a helpful backdrop for the increasing interest in the spirituality and educational vision of Marcellin Champagnat among lay people.

---

I recommend that:
(1) Marist schools seek ways of involving lay staff in the study of Marcellin Champagnat's philosophy. This could help avoid tensions which can arise between lay staffs and the Brothers when considering the goals of a school, Marist pedagogy and lay teachers' salaries;
(2) Marist schools benefit more from the international nature of the Congregation and the different expressions of Marcellin Champagnat's philosophy which are evident in schools worldwide. This could involve the publishing of a journal which discusses the characteristics of Champagnat Education as experienced in different cultures; and
(3) the Marist Congregation regularly co-ordinate an articulation of the theory of Champagnat education through worldwide consultation. An international commission could facilitate such a process.

I entered this research seeking a normative answer to the question 'What is Marist Education'. I emerge with some descriptive responses. The thesis has considered some fine examples of Marist Brothers at work, juxtaposed these with the inspiring work of Marcellin Champagnat, rich sociological and theological considerations and the enlightening experiences of other charismatic social movements. Ultimately, however - to make my own the words of a confere - the call to Marist educators is synthesised community-wise and personally 'in the deepest places within us as each day we confront life in the world, in society, in the workplace, in the family' (Crowe, 1991, p.25).
# BIBLIOGRAPHY

## LIST OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BOOKS AND ARTICLES</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCERT</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CORRESPONDENCE - INWARD</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOCUMENTS</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOMILY</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERVIEWS</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LECTURES</td>
<td>354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEETINGS</td>
<td>354</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## BOOKS AND ARTICLES

- **Adie, M.** (1990a) 'Restoring responsibility', *Education*, 176, 24, 14th December.
- **Adie, M.** (1990b) 'Basic or marginal?', *Education*, 176, 25/26, 21st/28th December.
- **Anderson, D.** (1992) 'Access to university education in Australia 1852-1990:
changes in the undergraduate social mix', *Higher Education Review*, 24, 2, Spring, pp.8-36.


for In-Service, Evaluation and Appraisal in Catholic Schools.


Booker, R. (1991) 'Responding to the Needs of the Context', Educational Psychology in Practice, 7, 1, April, pp.3-10.


Booker, R. (1991) 'Responding to the Needs of the Context', Educational Psychology in Practice, 7, 1, April, pp.3-10.


Athlone.


Chapman, J. (1991) *School Effectiveness and Management: The Enmeshment of the Qualitative and Quantitative Concerns of Schooling*, A keynote address presented to the International Congress of Effective Schools, January.


Coleman, P. and Collings, J. (1990) *In the Web: Patterns of Influence Affecting School Improvement*, (Mimeo), Simon Fraser University.


for Racial Equality.
Common Wealth For the Common Good: A Summary of the Bishops' Statement
Connell, N. (1987) 'Research and writing in the history of education' in
of London Institute of Education.
Craigie, J. 'Denominational Schools in Scotland' in Bereday, G. and
Cronbach, L. (1975) 'Beyond the Two Disciplines of Scientific Psychology'
Daiute, C. (1985) 'Do writers talk to themselves?' in Freedman, S. (Ed.)
Acquisition of written language responses and revision, Norwood, Ablex.
Daly, P. (1991) 'How Large are Secondary School Effects in Northern Ireland?
School Effectiveness and School Improvement, 2, 4, pp.305-323.

317
Dialogue, New York, Paulist.


Delizy, B. For the sake of the Kingdom Vocation, community and mission in the religious life, Slough, St. Paul.


Dewey, J. (1933) How We Think, Chicago, Regnery.


Donohue, J. (1985) 'Notes on Jesuit Education', America, 158, 26th October, pp.252-258.


Dwyer, B. (1992b) 'Creating a New Educational Culture', Conference, 9, 3, August, pp.7-10.


Griffiths, B. (1992) 'In Jesus' name', The Tablet, 245, 7915/6, 18th/25th April, pp.498-499.

1, March, pp.69-84.


Handley, J. (1943) The Irish in Scotland, 1798-1845, Cork, Cork University.


324
Holohan, G. (1981) 'How can a Province find expression for its particular charism and its sense of corporate apostolate in such situations as: high proportion of lay staff, lay principals, diocesan systems, schools involving other orders?', An Address, Marist Brothers' Principals' Conference, Perth.
Howard, C. (1966a) 'Foreword' in Marist Brothers of the Schools (1966) Constitutions and Statutes, Rome, Marist Brothers, 8th December.


Hume, B. (1991a) 'St. Ignatius then and now' The Tablet, 245, 7879, pp.954-955.

Hume, B. (1991b) 'Four points for the Synod', The Tablet, 245, 7897, 7 December.


Jencks, C., Smith, M., Acland, H., Bane, M., Cohen, D., Gintis, H. Heyns, B. and Michelson, S. (1972) Inequality: a reassessment of the effect of
family and schooling in America, New York, Basic.


Johnson, R. 'Cultural Studies and Educational Practice', *Screen Education*, 34, pp.5-16.

Joppe, C. 'Social Movements during cycles of issue attention: the decline of the anti-nuclear energy movements in West Germany and the USA', *British Journal of Sociology*, 42, 1, March, pp.43-60.


King, R. (1978) *All Things Bright and Beautiful?*, Chichester, Wiley.


Kriesberg, L. (Ed.) (1978) Research in Social Movements, Conflicts and Change, Volume 1, Greenwich, JAI.


Lang, O. (Ed.) (1898) Educational Creeds of the Century, New York, Kellogg.


Leithwood, K. (1992) 'Editor's Conclusion: What Have We Learned And Where Do We Go From Here?', School Effectiveness and School Improvement, 3, 2, pp.173-184.


Lodge, B. (1991b) 'Anglican doubts are fuelled', Times Educational Supplement, 3914, 5 July.

Lodge, B. (1991c) 'Dr Carey turns on his own campaign', Times Educational Supplement, 3925, 20 September.


MacDonald, B. and Walker, R. (1977) 'Case Study and the Social Philosophy of Educational Research' in Hamilton D., Jenkins, D., King, C.,
Marist Brothers (1936) Our Models in Religion, Grugliasco, Marist Brothers.
Marist Brothers (1991) 'Marist Conference for School Administrators', Marist Newsletter, 22, 8, September, pp.8-11.
Marist Brothers (1992) daring in hope XIX General Chapter, Rome, Marist Brothers.
Marist Brothers of the Provinces of the United States (1992) Religious Calendar, New York, Marist Brothers.
Marist Brothers of the Schools (1960) Common Rules, Saint Genis Laval, Marist Brothers.
Marist Brothers of the Schools (1969) Our Marist Apostolate Documents of the 16th General Chapter, Sydney, Marist Brothers.
Marist Brothers of the Schools (1986) Constitutions and Statutes, Rome, Marist Brothers.
Marist Brothers of the Schools (1990) Constitutions and Statutes, Poughkeepsie, Marist Brothers.
Marist Brothers of the Schools (1991a) Living our Constitutions, Rome, Marist Brothers.
Marist Centenary Digest (1967) 'The Marist World', Durban, Marist Brothers.
Marist Newsletter (1991) 'Guatemalan slayings linked to far right', 22, 7, August.
Marist Prayer Book and Religious Calendar (1991), Drummoyn, Marist Brothers.
Marks, J. (1991) 'School Boards - "The Mortent Formula" "When you're on a Good Thing ... !", Catholic School Studies, 64, 2, October, pp.38-41.
Martin, J. (1957) 'Marriage, the family and class' in Elkin, A. (Ed.) (1957) Marriage and the Family in Australia, Sydney, Angus and Robertson.
Mountbatten Eighty years in pictures (1919), London, Macmillan.
Murphy, E. (1885) To the Third World, Irish Messenger.


Newmann, F. (1991) 'Linking Restructuring to Authentic Student Achievement', Phi Delta Kappan, 72, 6, February, pp.458-463.


Pawley, M. (Ed.) The Unity We Seek, London, Darton, Longman and Todd.
Polding, B. (1839) 'Pastoral Letter', Australian Chronicle, 2 August.
Pring, R. (1990) 'Professionals demoted', The Tablet, 244, 7838, 6th

Rolheiser, R. (1991) 'Love is the eye' Catholic Herald, 5482, 28th June.


Rule of the School and Plan of Studies of the Society of the Sacred Heart of Jesus (1904), Roehampton, Convent of the Sacred Heart.


Schiffer, I. (1973), Charisma, Toronto, University of Toronto.


Schmidt, J. (1986) Praying Our Experiences, Minnesota, St. Mary's.


Society of the Sacred Heart Heritage and Horizon Sacred Heart Education, Roehampton, Society of the Sacred Heart.


Researcher, 7, 2, February, pp.5-8.


Steedman, C. Childhood, Culture and Class in Britain: Margaret McMillan, 1860-1931, Camden Town, Virago.


London and New York, Routledge.
The Courier Mail (1991) 'Vintage Bob back with a g'day and an 'ow-are-ya', 12 June.
Macmillan.


Tillard, J. (1977) There are Charisma and Charisma, Bruxelles, Lumen Vitae.


Times Educational Supplement (1991a) 'Have we really got an effective education system?', 3905, 3 May.

Times Educational Supplement (1991b) 'Fear of appraisal restricts women', 3929, 18 October.


Webster, R. (1991) 'Will the real George Orwell please stand up', The Tablet, 245, 7892, 2nd November.


Wexler, P. (1987) Social analysis of education After the new sociology,


CONCERT

ARCHBISHOP MOLLOY HIGH SCHOOL


CORRESPONDENCE - INWARD

Devine, P. (1992) Response to Ch. 6 sent from Melbourne, 22nd August.
Hanley, G. (1992) Response to Ch. 7 sent from Glasgow, 9th October.
Hough, P. (1992b) Responses to the three case study chapters sent from Campbelltown, 14th August.
Hough, P. (1992c) Response to Ch. 9 sent from Campbelltown, 22nd October.
McCabe, B. (1992b) Responses to the three case study chapters sent from Dundee, 5th September.
McGowan, P. (1992) Correspondence sent from Clondalkin, 10th April.
McMahon, F. (1992) Response to Ch.4 sent from Sydney, 26th September.
Monsour, P. (1992a) Letter accompanying the responses to the three case study chapters sent from Brisbane, 30th August.
Monsour, P. (1992b) Responses to the three case study chapters sent from Brisbane, 30th August.
Okwe, F. (1992) Correspondence to C. Nannion and the Brothers of the province of Britain and Cameroon sent from Nigeria, 16th August.
Rijs, E. (1992) Response to Ch.6 sent from Warragul, 28th September.
Ryan, J. (1992) Response to Ch. 6 sent from Melbourne, 10th August.
Shea, L. (1992a) Correspondence sent from Pleebo agreeing to an interview in Bayonne in July and including some statistics on St. Francis High School, 15th May.
Shea, L. (1992b) Response to Ch.9 sent from Cambridge, 26th October.
Shels, P. (1992) Response to Ch.7 sent from Glasgow, 7th September.
Sherry, A. (1992) Response to Ch.6 sent from Kilmore, 9th August.
Simpson, T. (1992b) Responses to the three case study chapters sent from Manchester, 2nd August.
Tan, A. (1992b) Responses to the three case study chapters sent from Singapore, 28th September.

DOCUMENTS

ARCHBISHOP MOLLOY HIGH SCHOOL

Archbishop Molloy High School (1991), New York, Marist.
Archbishop Molloy High School (1992), Blue and White '92, Briarwood, Archbishop Molloy High School.

GEORGETOWN PREPARATORY SCHOOL

Prospectus (1992), Director of Admissions.

CATHOLIC CHURCH

Marianus Cultus (2nd February, 1974) Devotion to the Blessed Virgin Mary by Pope Paul VI, Ottawa, Canadian Catholic Conference.
CATHOLIC EDUCATION OFFICE OF VICTORIA (AUSTRALIA)


GEORGETOWN PREPARATORY SCHOOL


JESUIT SECONDARY EDUCATION ASSOCIATION, WASHINGTON DC

News Bulletin (1991), 22, 2, October, Jesuit Secondary Education Association

MARCELLIN COLLEGE

Ad Altissima 1990 Marcellin College (1989), Bulleen, Marcellin College.
Marcellin College (1985) Questionnaire for Parents, Bulleen.

MARIST BROTHERS' ARCHIVES, MELBOURNE

Marist Brothers Melbourne Province (1984) Marist Brothers in Catholic Schools A Paper developed and presented by the Schools' Committee of the Melbourne province, November.
Marist Brothers Melbourne Province (1991) Province of Melbourne Ministry Policy Draft For Discussion and Comment, April 8th.

MARIST BROTHERS' ARCHIVES, ROME

Delorme, A. (1990) Legislation de l'Institut, EUR.

MARIST BROTHERS' SYDNEY PROVINCE


ST. CHANOND (FRANCE)


ST. MUNGO'S ACADEMY

Paola, L. (Ed.) (1957) Marist Centenary Digest, Durban, Marist.
Strathclyde Regional Council (1977) Saint Mungo's Academy Glasgow, Glasgow.

UNITED WORLD COLLEGES

United World Colleges.


Jenkins, C. Kurt Hahn, (Mimeo), United World Colleges.

Nohi-Oser, H. Reminiscences on Kurt Hahn, (Mimeo), United World Colleges.


UWC News (1990a) 1, 2, March.

UWC News (1990b) 1, 3, September.

UWC What are the united World Colleges? (1991), United World Colleges.

United World College of South East Asia (1990), United World Colleges.


Waterford Kamhlaba United World College of Southern Africa, United World Colleges.

HOMILY


INTERVIEWS

ARCHBISHOP WOLLOY HIGH SCHOOL


De Neo, J. (1991) 16th December.


Dubois, L. (1992) 7th July.


Flood, B. (1991a) 12th December.

Flood, B. (1991b) 13th December.

Flood, B. (1991c) 13th December.


Grimpe1, J. (1991) 17th December.


Klein, J. (1991a) 13th December.

Klein, J. (1991b) 13th December.


351
Maher, J. (1991) 19th December

BAYONNE (NEW JERSEY)
Voegtle, L. (1992) 7th July.

DUBLIN

LAUSANNE

LONDON

NEW YORK

POUGHKEEPSIE (NEW YORK STATE)
ROCKVILLE (MARYLAND)


ST. CHAMOND (FRANCE)


ST. MUNGO'S ACADEMY

Shells, P. (1991a) 10th June.

VICTORIA (CANADA)

Samier, E. (1992) Interview held at the University of Victoria, British Columbia, 3rd January.

WASHINGTON DC

LECTURES


MEETINGS

ST. MUNGÓ'S ACADEMY

Burnett, T. (1991) Meeting for parents of incoming First Year students held at the school on 10th June.
APPENDIX - SUMMARY OF OUTWARD CORRESPONDENCE

CHAPTER 1 - CHARISMATIC SOCIAL MOVEMENTS: A WEBERIAN PERSPECTIVE

To Br. Maurice Bergeret re his thesis on the theoretical framework for a catholic school - 15/3/91

To Eugenie Samier thanking her for helping me to understand Max Weber's works - 10/2/92

To Professor Guenther Roth thanking him for helping me to understand Max Weber's works and for the documentation - 25/2/92

To Eugenie Samier with a copy of the draft chapter - 30/9/92

CHAPTER 2 - THE SELF-UNDERSTANDING OF CONTEMPORARY RELIGIOUS CONGREGATIONS AS CHARISMATIC SOCIAL MOVEMENTS

To Br. Eugene Dwyer re information on social movements as they apply to religious congregations - 9/5/91

To Br. Mark O'Connor inviting him to respond to the draft chapter - 27/9/92

CHAPTER 3 - CHARISMATIC SOCIAL MOVEMENTS AND EDUCATION

To the Summerhill School Secretary re my speaking with school personnel - 18/5/91

To the Summerhill School Secretary thanking her for the welcome and telling her of my change of plans - 12/7/91

To Fr. Charles Costello of the Jesuit Secondary Education Association in Washington - 6/10/91

To Fr. Charles Costello confirming arrangements for my visit - 26/11/91

To Fr. Charles Costello thanking him for his help during my visit - 15/2/92

To Fr. Tom Roach thanking him for speaking with me when I visited Georgetown Preparatory School in Washington - 15/2/92

To Richard Taylor asking him to verify the United World Colleges part of the chapter - 10/9/92

To Charles Costello asking him to verify the Jesuit part of the chapter - 11/9/92

To Tom Roach asking him to verify the Jesuit part of the chapter - 11/9/92

To Fr. Henry Haskee asking him for his response to the Jesuit part of the chapter - 30/9/92

CHAPTER 4 - MARCELLIN CHAMPAGNAT'S MOVEMENT

To Br. Richard Dunleavy re statistics for the Marist Congregation - 5/3/91

To the Distribution Officer re the video "The Power of Vision" by Joel Barker - 12/4/91

To the Distribution Officer requesting transcript for the video "The Power of Vision" by Joel Barker - 30/4/91

To the Distribution Officer agreeing to pay $94.95 for Joel Barker's Vision package - 25/5/91

To Br. Brian Sweeney requesting information on the Marist Congregation today - 4/6/91

355
To the Melbourne Province's Marist Newsletter inviting the Brothers of the Province to convey their thoughts to me on the relationship between Marist educational vision today and the Founder's charism - 1/7/91

To Br. Chris Mannion in Ireland re proposed conference on Marist Schools - 16/7/91

To Br. Charles Howard in Rome re proposed conference on Marist Schools - 6/8/91

To Sr. Elizabeth Smith re documents on how the sisters of the RSCJ Congregation link the spirit of their foundress with their endeavours today - 22/8/91

To Br. Charles Howard re literature from the forthcoming conference in Spain - 9/9/91

To Br. Leonard Voegtle regarding seeking anything relevant to Marist educational vision in Marcellin Champagnat's letters - 9/9/91

To Br. Chris Mannion re papers from the Madrid Conference - 9/9/91

To Sr. Mary Coke, Provincial Archivist, re documents on how the sisters of the RSCJ Congregation link the spirit of their foundress with their endeavours today - 9/9/91

To Sr. Mary Coke thanking her for allowing me to interview her and to borrow specific books - 19/9/91

To Br. Chris Mannion requesting a copy of the life of Br. Alfano - 6/10/91

To Br. Chris Mannion re making a time to meet - 14/10/91

To Br. Charles Howard thanking him for the Marist literature from Spain which he sent - 23/10/91

To the Provincial of the Chile province asking him to send me any material published in English on Marist education - 23/10/91

To Professor Jerry Starratt re meeting him in New York to discuss educational vision - 26/11/91

To Br. Chris Mannion welcoming a meeting with him in February and asking him for Marist documents - 29/1/91

To Br. Richard Dunleavy thanking him for the Marist documentation he forwarded - 18/2/92

To Br. Paul Ambrose thanking him for his interview re Marist history and charism - 28/2/92

To historian Br. Valerian Braniff asking him to check the chapter on Marcellin Champagnat's movement - 6/8/92

To historians Br. Gabriel Michel and Br. Alexander Balko asking them to check the chapter on Marcellin Champagnat's movement - 12/8/92

To historian Br. Stephen Farrell asking for feedback on the Marcellin Champagnat Chapter - 13/8/92

To historian Br. Frederick McMahon asking for feedback on the Marcellin Champagnat Chapter - 15/8/92

To Br. Chris Mannion seeking feedback on the Marcellin Champagnat and St. Mungo's Academy Chapters - 24/8/92

To Br. Len Voegtle thanking him for reading the draft of my chapter on Marcellin Champagnat and for the opportunity to interview him in Bayonne - 5/9/92

To Br. Brian Sweeney asking him to send me copies of the recent translation of Marcellin Champagnat's letters - 8/9/92
CHAPTER 6 - DISCERNING A DIRECTION: MARCELLIN COLLEGE, MELBOURNE

To Mr. Paul Herrick requesting documents on Marcellin College - 29/4/91
To Mr. Paul Herrick seeking statistics on Marcellin College - statistical diagram included - 23/10/91
To Mr. Paul Herrick requesting further documents on Marcellin College. Thesis summary included - 28/10/91
To Br. Oliver Clarke requesting information on the history of Marcellin College - 27/11/91
To Br. Jim Jolley thanking him for the documents he sent me on Marcellin College in response to my postcard of 10/12/91 - 5/2/92
To Mr. Paul Herrick thanking him for the documents he sent me on Marcellin College - 5/2/92
To Br. Oliver Clarke thanking him for the information on the history he sent over and asking for some more details - 18/2/92
To Br. Des Crowe thanking him for his response to the Marcellin College chapter - 21/8/92
To Mr. Peter Reis responding to his interest in my work and inviting him to comment on the Marcellin College chapter - 28/8/92
To Br. Austin Redden thanking him for his response to the Marcellin College chapter - 28/8/92
To Br. Allen Sherry thanking him for his response to the Marcellin College chapter - 28/8/92
To Ms. Julie Ryan thanking her for her response to the Marcellin College chapter - 31/8/92
To Br. Nicholas McBeath thanking him for his response to the Marcellin College chapter - 1/9/92
To Mr. Peter Devine thanking him for his response to the Marcellin College chapter - 2/9/92

CHAPTER 7 - BUILDING ANEW: ST. MUNGO'S ACADEMY, GLASGOW

To Br. Stephen, Religious Education Co-ordinator of St. Mungo's Academy, Scotland - 22/5/91
To Br. Stephen Smyth with photographs and copies of correspondence referring to my initial reflections on St. Mungo's - 13/7/91
To Br. Stephen Smyth re proposed meetings for 1992 - 21/11/91
To Mr. Tom Burnett enclosing the draft chapter on St. Mungo's - 12/8/92
To Br. Cormac Shiels asking him to check the chapters on St. Mungo's and Marcellin Champagnat - 14/8/92

To Mr. Tom Burnett suggesting a date for my visit to St. Mungo's - 3/9/92

To Br. Stephen Smyth asking him to check the draft chapter on St. Mungo's Academy - 7/9/92

To Br. Chris Mannion seeking accommodation for my return visit to St. Mungo's Academy - 13/9/92

To Mrs. Connie MacKenzie thanking her for lending me some historical documents on St. Mungo's Academy - 24/9/92

To Br. Gall thanking him for lending me some historical documents and inviting him to respond to the chapter - 24/9/92

To Br. Conrad together with a copy of the chapter for his response - 24/9/92

To Br. Pat Sheils thanking him for his response to the draft chapter - 25/9/92

To Br. Stephen Smyth thanking him for his response to the draft chapter - 25/9/92

CHAPTER 8 - MOVING STEADILY ON: ARCHBISHOP MOLLOY HIGH SCHOOL, NEW YORK

To Br. Ken Curtin re choice of school for study in America - 11/5/91

To Br. Richard Dunleavy re choice of school for study in America - 11/5/91

To Br. John Klein requesting permission to study Archbishop Molloy High School in Jamaica New York - 13/9/91

To Br. John Klein concerning my forthcoming study of Archbishop Molloy High School in New York - 17/11/91

To Br. John Klein congratulating him on his new appointment and suggesting dates for the second round of interviews - 18/2/91

To Br. Regis booking accommodation for my return visit to Archbishop Molloy High School - 18/3/91

To Br. John Klein re my return visit to the school to check my results - 24/5/92

CHAPTER 9 - EIGHT LOOK AT THREE

To Br. Walter Smith at Sargodha informing him about my study - 31/1/91

List of schools responding to chapters 1, 6 and 7 - 17/2/92

To school communities requesting their responses - 17/2/92

Questionnaire sent with the letter - 17/2/92

To five schools yet to respond to the letter of February 17th., 1992 - 8/4/92

To the following people thanking them for agreeing to respond to the three chapters: Br. Bede McCabe - Br. Paul Hough - Br. Terence Heinrich - Br. Edmund Sheehan - Br. Walter Smith - Br. Thomas Kelly - 13/4/92

Letter and copies of the three chapters to representatives at the ten responding schools - 30/6/92

Fax to Br. Paul Hough clarifying his list of responders - 28/7/92

358
Letter and copy of three additional chapters to Mr. Tony Simpson, responding from a Zambian perspective - 8/8/92

To Br. John Patrick thanking him for informing me about Bede’s inability to respond while he’s away - 10/8/92

To the following Brothers informing them of the deadline for responding to the three chapters: Br. Bede McCabe - Br. Anthony Tan - Br. Larry Lavallee - Br. Patrick McGowan - 4/9/92

To Br. Walter Smith thanking him for his first response on the Marcellin College chapter and clarifying some details concerning his response to the three chapters as a Marist Brothers based in Sargodha - 4/9/92

To Br. Paul Hough thanking him for his response to the three chapters - 7/9/92

To Br. Bede McCabe thanking him for his response to the three chapters - 9/9/92

To Mrs. Pat Monsour thanking her for her response to the three chapters - 15/9/92

To Mr. Tony Simpson seeking some further data to supplement his response to the three chapters - 25/9/92

To the following people inviting them to read the draft of Chapter 9 and offer any corrections or additions: Br. Terence Heinrich - Br. Edmund Sheehan - Br. Paul Hough - Br. Larry Lavallee - Br. Patrick McGowan - Br. Bede McCabe - Br. Leo Shea - Mrs. Pat Monsour - Mr. Tony Simpson - Br. Walter Smith - Br. Tony Tan - Mr. Phillip Chewe - 13/10/92
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACCO</td>
<td>Academic Publishing Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACER</td>
<td>Australian Council for Educational Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACSA</td>
<td>Australian Curriculum Studies Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>Australian Capital Territory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AD</td>
<td>After Death</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AEC</td>
<td>Australian Episcopal Conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGM</td>
<td>Annual General Meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIDS</td>
<td>Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALP</td>
<td>Australian Labor Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amer</td>
<td>American</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMHS</td>
<td>Archbishop Molloy High School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APT</td>
<td>A Pilgrim's Testament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AR</td>
<td>Annual Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arc</td>
<td>Archives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARCIC</td>
<td>Anglican-Roman Catholic International Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASAP</td>
<td>As Soon As Possible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASSOC</td>
<td>Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aust</td>
<td>Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AV</td>
<td>Average</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAC</td>
<td>Baccalaureate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAY</td>
<td>Bayonne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BBC</td>
<td>British Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BC</td>
<td>Before Christ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRDG</td>
<td>Boarding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BROS</td>
<td>Brothers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c</td>
<td>circa (about)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C’WELL</td>
<td>Camberwell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAFOD</td>
<td>Catholic Fund for Overseas Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAP</td>
<td>Church Action on Poverty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CASS</td>
<td>Creative Aesthetic or Social Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCEE</td>
<td>Council of European Bishops' Conferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCJP</td>
<td>Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCL</td>
<td>The Code of Canon Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Catholic Ethos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDV</td>
<td>Catholic Education Office of Victoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CERI</td>
<td>Centre for Educational Research and Innovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cf.</td>
<td>confer (compare)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ch.</td>
<td>Chapter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chm.</td>
<td>Chairman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAR</td>
<td>Characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIC</td>
<td>The Congregation for Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life (Church Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp.</td>
<td>Compiler</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Con.</td>
<td>Concert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONG</td>
<td>Congregation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corr.</td>
<td>Correspondence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRE</td>
<td>Commission for Racial Equality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS</td>
<td>The Catholic School (Church Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSSR</td>
<td>Redemptorist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTS</td>
<td>Catholic Truth Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTTE</td>
<td>Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CURR</td>
<td>Curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Diary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAI</td>
<td>Dissertation Abstracts International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DC</td>
<td>District of Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ded</td>
<td>Dedication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DES</td>
<td>Department of Education and Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DG</td>
<td>Development Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doc.</td>
<td>Document</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DV</td>
<td>Dei Verbum (Church Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EB</td>
<td>Encyclopedia Britannica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ed.</td>
<td>Editor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERA</td>
<td>Education Reform Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>et al.</td>
<td>et alii (and others)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ET</td>
<td>Evangelica Testificatio (Church Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euch.</td>
<td>Eucharist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV</td>
<td>Evolution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAC</td>
<td>Faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCJ</td>
<td>Faithful Companions of Jesus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMS</td>
<td>Fratres Maristae a Scholis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMSEC</td>
<td>FMS Echo (Marist Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMSN</td>
<td>FMS Message (Marist Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FP</td>
<td>Former pupil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FPAB</td>
<td>Former Pupils' Association Bulletin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frs.</td>
<td>Francs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GATT</td>
<td>General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GFT</td>
<td>Go Forth and Teach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GN</td>
<td>Grant Maintained</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

361
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GPS</td>
<td>Georgetown Preparatory School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GS</td>
<td>Gaudium et Spes (Church Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ha.</td>
<td>hectare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Homeroom Chart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV</td>
<td>Human Immunodeficiency Virus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HMI</td>
<td>Her Majesty's Inspectorate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HMSO</td>
<td>Her Majesty's Stationery Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hom</td>
<td>Homily</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HS</td>
<td>High School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSC</td>
<td>Higher School Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IB</td>
<td>International Baccalaureate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ibid.</td>
<td>ibidem (in the same place as quoted above)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBO</td>
<td>International Baccalaureate Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICAJE</td>
<td>International Commission on the Apostolate of Jesuit Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INES</td>
<td>International Educational Indicators Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INS</td>
<td>Interscol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Int.</td>
<td>Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISIP</td>
<td>International School Improvement Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JSEA</td>
<td>Jesuit Secondary Education Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEA</td>
<td>Local Education Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lect.</td>
<td>Lecture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LG</td>
<td>Lumen Gentium (Church Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LON</td>
<td>London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LVP</td>
<td>Local Vocation Promoter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MB</td>
<td>Marist Brothers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBA</td>
<td>Marist Brothers' Archives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBBUS</td>
<td>Marist Brothers of the Provinces of the United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBS</td>
<td>Marist Brothers of the Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MC</td>
<td>Marcellin College</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCD</td>
<td>Melbourne College of Divinity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHS</td>
<td>Marist High School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MN</td>
<td>Marist Newsletter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPBRC</td>
<td>Marist Prayer Book and Religious Calendar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MR</td>
<td>Mutuae Relationes (Church Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSHS</td>
<td>Maria Stella High School (Primary)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mtg</td>
<td>Meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Nostra Aetate (Church Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NATO</td>
<td>North Atlantic Treaty Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCC</td>
<td>National Curriculum Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCEA</td>
<td>National Catholic Education Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OM</td>
<td>Office Memorandum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSB</td>
<td>Order of St. Benedict</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OT</td>
<td>Old Testament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OXFAM</td>
<td>Oxford Committee for Famine Relief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PC</td>
<td>Perfectae Caritatis (Church Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGH</td>
<td>Poughkeepsie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pref.</td>
<td>Preface</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROF</td>
<td>Profile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSAT</td>
<td>Preliminary Scholastic Aptitude Test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSH</td>
<td>Parent/Student Handbook</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSLE</td>
<td>Primary School Leaving Examination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RC</td>
<td>Roman Catholic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RD</td>
<td>The Religious Dimension of Education in a Catholic School (Church Document)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RE</td>
<td>Religious Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFR</td>
<td>Review for Religious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMSVC</td>
<td>Report on the Middle States Visiting Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RNLI</td>
<td>Royal National Lifeboat Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rs.</td>
<td>Rupees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSV</td>
<td>Revised Standard Version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td>South</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>Sturm Abteilung (Storm Troop)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAP</td>
<td>Special Assistance Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAT</td>
<td>Scholastic Aptitude Test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>School and Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOTVEC</td>
<td>Scottish Vocational Education Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCSP</td>
<td>The Sargodha Catholic School Project Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEB</td>
<td>Scottish Examination Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEC</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SM</td>
<td>School Handbook</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SJ</td>
<td>The Society of Jesus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SN</td>
<td>Staff Manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMA</td>
<td>Saint Mungo's Academy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPSG</td>
<td>School Philosophy Sub-Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRC</td>
<td>Strathclyde Regional Council</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

363
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SS</td>
<td>Schutz Staffel (Body Guard)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSH</td>
<td>Society of the Sacred Heart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSRC</td>
<td>Secondary School Recognition Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUD</td>
<td>Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAB</td>
<td>The Tablet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TCHRS</td>
<td>Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TM</td>
<td>Transcendental Meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TES</td>
<td>Times Educational Supplement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIB</td>
<td>The International Baccalaureate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tlc</td>
<td>tender loving care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOM</td>
<td>Third Order of Mary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trans</td>
<td>Translator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNC</td>
<td>United World Colleges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCAB</td>
<td>Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VISE</td>
<td>Victorian Institute of Secondary Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vs.</td>
<td>Verse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VUSEB</td>
<td>Victorian Universities and Schools Examinations Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WASH</td>
<td>Washington</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YR</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>