READING TWEEN FRANCHISES:
CROSS-MEDIA PRACTICES AND THE DISCOURSES OF TWEEN GIRLHOOD

BY

NAOMI ELANA HAMER

A thesis submitted for
the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Institute of Education, University of London

2010
DECLARATION

I declare that, except where explicit attribution is made, the work presented in this thesis is entirely my own. Any data obtained either by, or with the assistance of, others has been acknowledged either in the Acknowledgements or at an appropriate position in the text. All sources of information, including any quotations, are acknowledged by citation of an appropriate source of reference.

Signed: [Signature]

Date: August 9, 2016

Word Count (exclusive of appendices and bibliography): 79,874 words
THESIS ABSTRACT

The 'tween' age group, particularly preadolescent females between the ages of 8 and 12, constitutes a heavily targeted niche for the branding and cross marketing of products. Consequently, books aimed at tween readers are often part of cross-media franchises that may include film and television adaptations, affiliated music albums, online fan clubs, video games, clothing, and cosmetics. In this context, representations may be adapted across a number of media forms, and conversely, responses to texts may be facilitated by engagement with diverse media. In light of these trends, this research explores how intersecting discourses of tween girlhood are negotiated through cross-media practices by both producers and consumers of tween franchises.

The thesis begins with a review of research from the fields of children's literature criticism, cultural and media studies, girlhood studies, and New Literacies. Building on this review, I outline a theoretical and methodological frame rooted in theories of discourse as articulated through multimodal design and cross-media play. The analysis traces a cultural history of key discourses in Anglo-American texts for and about preadolescent girls. In the following chapters, two tween-oriented cross-media worlds, The Chronicles of Narnia and Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen, are used as case studies to examine the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play in the articulation of these discourses of tween girlhood. Each case study addresses the design of franchise texts (i.e. books, DVDs, tie-in texts); fan cultures related to these texts; and the responses of eight-year-old participants during fieldwork in Toronto, Canada. The conclusion of this thesis discusses the potential application of this doctoral study in future research on cross-media texts and practices.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis would not have been possible without the patience, humour, and encouragement of my supervisors Dr. Andrew Burn and Dr. Rebekah Willett. Their sustained interest in my research and thoughtful feedback, often across time differences and continents, has been greatly appreciated.

I am indebted to the participants in the audience studies for their enthusiastic involvement and contributions to this project. I also express my thanks to numerous individuals who provided inspiration, useful input, and diverse perspectives at various stages of the research process including: Dr. John Yandell, Dr. David Buckingham, Dr. Deborah Youdell, Dr. Eve Bearne, Ryan Andersen, Erin Balser, Arla Hamer, Eliana Neyhus-Smith, the Play, Creativity and Digital Cultures seminar (especially my Sheffield fan club), as well as many other scholars and PhD students I encountered at the Institute of Education. I am grateful to the Overseas Research Student Award Scheme for granting me a scholarship, and to Goodenough College for offering a truly memorable place to live in London.

I am also thankful to a number of eclectic international compatriots, with whom I am honoured to be friends, for continuously cheering me on, and welcoming me into their homes, sometimes for extended periods. I am especially thankful to Collin Raymond who took many breaks from his beloved axioms to engage with this research, and support me with his dedicated encouragement. Lastly, I express my gratitude to my family for the late-night phone calls, airport pick-ups, printer paper, news clippings, and trans-Atlantic visits. Their unconditional love and genuine interest in my work continues to amaze me.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

THESIS ABSTRACT 2

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS 3

TABLE OF CONTENTS 4

LIST OF FIGURES 12

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION 13

1.1 The tween franchise as a cross-media phenomenon 13

1.2 Researching tween girls 15

1.3 Methodological challenges in the study of children’s texts and audiences 18

1.4 Research focus and questions 21

1.5 Structure of the thesis 23

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW OF RELEVANT RESEARCH 26

2.1 The study of tween texts and cultures: An interdisciplinary challenge 26

2.2 Children’s literature criticism 27

2.2.1 Leavisite tradition in children’s literature criticism

2.2.2 Applying literary and critical theory to children’s literature

2.2.3 Feminist theory and children’s literature

2.2.4 Conclusion to children’s literature criticism section

2.3 Cultural and media studies with a focus on girlhood studies 42

2.3.1 The social studies of childhood and girlhood

2.3.2 Research on girls’ recreational reading

2.3.3 Research on girls’ magazines and comics

2.3.4 Research on tween girls and cross-media cultures

2.3.5 Research on girls and consumer cultures
2.3.6 Conclusion to cultural and media studies and girlhood studies

2.4. Multiliteracies and New Literacies approaches to cross-media cultures

2.4.1 The emergence of multiliteracies
2.4.2 Approaches to picture books and image-text relations
2.4.3 Reading media and playing across texts
2.4.4 Social semiotics and multimodal texts
2.4.5 Conclusion to multiliteracies and New Literacies approaches

2.5 Conclusion of the literature review

CHAPTER THREE: THEORETICAL FRAME
3.1 Introduction to the theoretical frame
3.2 Theory of discursive identity
3.3 Theory of discourse-in-use and identity
3.4 Theory of multimodal design as a discursive practice
   3.4.1 Multimodal design, identity and agency
   3.4.2 Social semiotic metafunctions
3.5 Theory of discourse, identity, and cross-media play
   3.5.1 Introduction to play as a theoretical tool
   3.5.2 Theory of thick play and playability
   3.5.3 Conceptualizing play as a discursive practice
   3.5.4 The role of pleasure in play
3.6 Categories of cross-media play
   3.6.1 Paratextual repetition and variation play
   3.6.2 Behind-the scenes-modality play
   3.6.3 Intertextual cross-over play
3.6.4 Intertextual expanded-story play

3.6.5 Phantasmagoric play

3.7 Conclusion to the theoretical frame

CHAPTER FOUR: METHODOLOGIES AND METHODS

4.1 Introduction to methodology and methods

4.2 Methodological approaches

4.2.1 Case study approach to cross-media worlds

4.2.2 Discourse-in-use and the circuit of culture

4.2.3 Discursive history of tween girlhood

4.3 Methods of enquiry

4.3.1 Audience study 1: Exploratory pilot study: London, UK

4.3.2 Audience study 2: Fieldwork study, Grade 3 classroom, McMillan Public School, Toronto, Canada.

4.3.2.1 Focus texts for discussion

4.3.2.2 Semi-structured group interviews/focus groups

4.3.3 Audience study 3: Olsen fan questionnaire and interviews

4.4 Methods of analysis and structure of the case study analyses

4.4.1 Preliminary analysis of the data

4.4.2 Structure of the case study analyses

4.4.3 Analysis of multimodal design

4.4.4 Analysis of cross-media play

4.5 Conclusion of the methodologies and methods chapter

CHAPTER FIVE: DISCURSIVE HISTORY OF TWEEN GIRLHOOD

5.1 Introduction: Tracing a cultural history of representations
5.2 Developmental discourses of moral and social maturation

5.2.1 Books for girls in the eighteenth and nineteenth century: Primers for moral development

5.2.2 Coming-of-age and transformation: The Bildungsroman and the novel of maturation

5.2.3 Novels of Maturation: From *The Pilgrim's Progress* to progressive utopias

5.2.4 School girl stories: From individual maturation to peer-group interactions

5.3 Discourses of childhood innocence and sexuality

5.3.1 Romantic discourse of childhood innocence

5.3.2 Discourse of eroticized innocence: The Victorian 'pure little girl' and Shirley Temple

5.3.3 Narratives of appropriate physical and sexual maturation: From pedagogies of morality to normality

5.4 Popular feminist discourses

5.4.1 Girl power and commodity feminism

5.4.2 The other side of the girl power discourse: Empowering 'at risk' girls

5.5 Conclusion: Mapping intersecting discourses of tween girlhood

CHAPTER SIX: LUCY PEVENSIE IN *THE CHRONICLES OF NARNIA: THE LION, THE WITCH AND THE WARDROBE*

6.1 Introduction to the case study: Narnia as a cross-media phenomenon

6.2 Lewis’s *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950): Production/institutional context

6.2.1 Ideational metafunction in the written text

6.2.2 Lucy in Pauline Baynes’s illustrations: Ideational function
6.2.3 Lucy as focalizer: Interpersonal function

6.2.4 Paratexts: Dedication by C.S. Lewis to Lucy Barfield

6.2.5 Textual function and multimodal composition

6.3 The BBC television serial The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe (1988): Production/institutional context

6.3.1 Lucy through the wardrobe in the BBC serial: Ideational function

6.3.2 Lucy as focalizer in the BBC serial: Interpersonal function

6.3.3 Textual function and multimodal composition

6.4 Disney/Walden Media feature film (2005): Production/institutional discourse

6.4.1 Lucy through the wardrobe in the Disney/Walden Media film feature: Ideational function

6.4.2 Lucy as focalizer in the film: Interpersonal function

6.4.3 Textual function: Multimodal composition

6.5 Lucy in Walden Media/Disney franchise tie-in texts

6.5.1 Lucy’s Adventure (2005) and collectible cereal-boxes: Ideational function

6.5.2 Lucy’s Adventure: Interpersonal function

6.5.3 Lucy in Step into Narnia (2005): Ideational function

6.5.4 Lucy’s diary: Interpersonal function

6.5.5 Lucy as avatar in the franchise video game: Ideational function

6.5.6 Lucy avatar: Interpersonal function

6.5.7 Offer for cross-media play with Lucy discourses in franchise texts

6.6 Behind-the Scenes franchise texts

6.6.1 Lucy/Georgie Henley in The Official Illustrated Movie Companion: Ideational function
6.6.2 Lucy/Georgie Henley in the *Movie Companion*: Interpersonal function

6.6.3 DVD bonus features: Ideational function

6.6.4 DVD bonus features: Interpersonal function

6.6.5 Offer of cross-media play with Lucy discourses in behind-the-scenes texts

6.7 Sites of audience discourse around Lucy Pevensie and Georgie Henley

6.7.1 Behind-the-scenes modality play: Georgie Henley fansite

6.7.2. Intertextual-cross-over play: Lucy fan video

6.7.3. Intertextual-expanded-story/phantasmagoric play: Lucy/Tumnus fan fiction

6.8 Cross-media play in the Narnia focus group responses

6.8.1 Focus Group transcript 1: Are there bloopers? Are there bloopers?

6.8.2 Focus Group transcript 2: She looks like Uncle Vernon.

6.8.3 Focus Group transcript 3: I love Mr. Tumnus

6.8.4 Cross-media play as a discursive practice in the focus groups

6.9 Conclusion to the case study analysis

CHAPTER SEVEN: THE CROSS-MEDIA WORLD OF MARY-KATE AND ASHLEY

OLSEN

7.1 Introduction to the case study analysis

7.2 Production/institutional context: A cultural biography of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen and the *mary-kateandashley* franchise

7.3 Sites of discourse for analysis

7.4 Multimodal design analysis of *so little time* book and television/DVD series

7.4.1 Cover design of *A girl's guide to guys* (2003): Ideational metafunction

7.4.2 Real books for Real Girls: Interpersonal metafunction

7.4.3 *so little time* book and television series: Ideational function
7.4.4 so little time book and television series: Interpersonal function

7.4.5 so little time DVD bonus features: Offer of behind-the-scenes modality play

7.5. Dualstar press release for franchise home products: Offer of paratextual and behind-the-scenes modality play 279

7.6 Public media discourse: Offer of behind-the-scenes modality play and intertextual expanded-story play 283

7.7 Audience discourse: Olsen fans and cross-media play 287

7.7.1 Growing up with the Olsens: Behind-the-scenes modality play

7.7.2 Practices of repetition and variation: Behind-the-scenes modality play and paratextual play

7.7.3 Behind-the-scenes modality play with public media discourse

7.7.4 Meet the Trollsen Twins: Phantasmagoric/intertextual expanded-story play

7.8 Conclusion to the case study 304

CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION 306

8.1 Introduction 306

8.2. The discursive history of tween girlhood in the cross-media worlds 307

8.3 Multimodal design and cross-media play as discursive practices 308

8.4 Reflections on the theoretical frames and methodologies 314

8.5 Implications and applications for future cross-media research 315

8.6 Concluding thoughts 318

REFERENCES 319
APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Preliminary Reading Questionnaire for pilot study and field work 374
Appendix 2: Background information about McMillan Public School 375
Appendix 3: Consent form for field work 376
Appendix 4: Focus group discussion questions 377
Appendix 5: Preliminary transcript analysis for field work discussions 382
Appendix 6: Preliminary multimodal analysis chart: Narnia texts 384
Appendix 7: Permission form for Olsen study interviews 385
Appendix 8: Fan questionnaire for Olsens 386
**LIST OF FIGURES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Social semiotic metafunctions</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Categories of cross-media play for analysis</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Multimodal design case study one</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Multimodal design analysis case study two</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Cross-media play categories case study one</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Cross-media play categories case study two</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Pauline Baynes (1950) Lucy and Mr. Tumnus</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Lucy, Peter and the Beavers BBC (1988)</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Pevensie children BBC (1988)</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Mr. Tumnus BBC (1988)</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Pevensie children Disney/Walden Media (2005)</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 and 13</td>
<td>Tumnus and Lucy Disney/Walden Media (2005)</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14a</td>
<td>Collectible tie-in franchise texts in cereal boxes (front)</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14b</td>
<td>Collectible tie-in franchise texts in cereal boxes (back)</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Lucy avatar <em>Chronicles of Narnia</em> videogame (2005)</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Behind-the-scenes photograph (Georgie and William)</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Film still from <em>Prince Caspian</em></td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td><em>Adventures of Mary-Kate and Ashley</em> video cover</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td><em>so little time</em> book cover (2002)</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td><em>so little time</em> television series DVD (2005)</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21a</td>
<td>“Meet the Trollsen Twins” website</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21b</td>
<td>Dress the Trollsen</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION

1.1. The tween franchise as a cross-media phenomenon

Today's tween segment is the epicenter of the Baby Boomlet, also known as the Echo Boom, and Generation Y, the last offspring of the large and powerful Baby-Boom Generation. Like their parents, today's tweens are an economic force.


Since the 2001 publication of Siegel, Coffey and Livingston's guidebook for marketers, those in the 'tween' age group, particularly preadolescent females between the ages of 8 and 12, have become an established, profitable, and heavily targeted niche for the cross marketing of products. Consequently, books aimed at preadolescent readers are now often part of cross-media franchises that include film and television adaptations, affiliated music albums, online fan clubs, video games, clothing, and cosmetics. J.K. Rowling's Harry Potter (1997-2007), Meg Cabot's Princess Diaries (2000-2007), the mary-kateandashley tween franchise (2000-2008), and the film franchise of C.S. Lewis's The Chronicles of Narnia (2005-2010) are key examples of this cross-media phenomenon.

These popular tween-oriented franchises illustrate the concept of "transmedia storytelling" (Jenkins 2003; 2006). Distinct from the adaptation of a narrative from one media form to another (e.g. a film adaptation of a novel), Henry Jenkins defines a "transmedia story" as one that "unfolds across multiple media platforms with each new text making a distinctive and valuable contribution to the whole" (Jenkins 2006: 95-96).

Building on Jenkins, Carlos A. Scolari (2009) describes 'trans-media storytelling' as:
a particular narrative structure that expands through both different languages (verbal, iconic, etc.) and media (cinema, comics, television, video games, etc.)... The story that the comics tell is not the same as that told on television or cinema; the different media and languages participate and contribute to the construction of the transmedia narrative world. This textual dispersion is one of the most important sources of complexity in contemporary popular culture. (587)

In this context, representations are adapted across a number of media forms, and conversely, responses to diverse texts are facilitated by engagement across media. The consumer of Disney’s popular franchise *High School Musical* (2006) can watch the three films on television, DVD or online, read the associated book series, play the *HSM* karaoke game on the Wii console, produce fan videos on Youtube, download songs from the actress Vanessa Hudgens’s (who plays the main character Gabriella) album, purchase an assortment of merchandise from towels to undergarments, attend a musical stage adaptation of the film, as well as go to a touring live concert performed by the stars of the film.

In this context, the design of books aimed at young readers reflects changes in their production and consumption as part of cross-media narratives. Cross-media texts are designed not only in terms of what the textual narrative represents, but also in terms of how the book fits into the broader meanings of a brand, franchise or cross-media world. Thus, the design of books for tween readers addresses them as not only implied readers of the text but also as potential consumers of other products in a franchise. In addition, tween franchises and fandom exemplify various examples of engagement with textual meaning that may be defined in terms of hybrid forms of cross-media play. Digital technologies and cultures have become central to how tween readers engage with
older media forms such as books, films and television. Preadolescent readers frequently use websites, chat rooms, and other online forums for discussion and reflection on books, particularly those that are linked to popular franchises. Many of these franchises involve online fan communities around the celebrity lives of actors, writers, and producers. These communities of tween readers can illustrate an allegiance to a character that may not have been cultivated in response to the written text in isolation. This may be observed in fan sites dedicated to Emma Watson, who plays Hermione in the *Harry Potter* films (2001-2008), and Georgie Henley, who plays Lucy in the recent film adaptation of *The Chronicles of Narnia* (2005). In light of these trends, popular tween franchises demand an analysis that takes into account the role of these cross-media practices in the articulation of textual meanings particularly around discourses of identity.

1.2 Researching tween girls

The term ‘tween’ first emerged as a marketing category in the 1990s to cultivate and define a distinct consumer niche for those in the 8 to 12 year old age group formerly known as sub-teen, pre-teen or preadolescent (Cook and Kaiser 2004). In its original use as a marketing category, the term was predominantly used by adult producers of ‘tween’ products and franchises, and was not necessarily a social identity that young people would identify themselves with (as observed by Willett 2005). However, the term tween has been employed increasingly across a variety of platforms including news media discourse in North America (Mitchell and Reid-Walsh 2005).

Most news media discourse represents tween culture in relation to the highly profitable tween franchises produced by Disney and Nickelodeon e.g. “Disney’s billion dollar tween machine” from CNNMoney.com (La Monica 2007); or alternatively focus
on the tweens themselves as eager consumers of commercial cultures e.g. “Tweens ‘R’ Shoppers” in *The New York Times* (Jane 2007). The increased visibility of the term tween in reference to a recognized social identity is exemplified by the public media discourse around American President Barack Obama’s two daughters who have been frequently referred to in public media discourse as the ‘First Tweens’ e.g “‘Party in the U.S.A’ for First Tweens” on ABCNews.com (de Nies 2009). Since the 2009 inauguration, Malia, who was 10 years old in 2009, and Sasha, who was 7 years old, have been the inspiration for dolls, fan websites, and children’s fashion trends. Moreover, Obama’s daughters were responsible for choosing the performers for the ‘Kids’ Inaugural: We Are The Future’ concert that was televised through the Disney Channel and included performances by the Jonas Brothers, Miley Cyrus, Demi Lovato, and Bow Wow, all of whom share a tween niche fan-base and have a connection to a Disney franchise (Goldberg 2009).

The majority of public media coverage around tweens, reflects a conflict similar to the public media discourse around young people and media discussed by David Buckingham in *After the Death of Childhood: Growing up in the Age of Electronic Media* (2001). Public media and research discourse related to young people and media often vacillates between a perspective of children as passive victims in the rise of the commercially dominated multi-media age (e.g. Quart 2003; Postman 1982), and a vision of children as active participants empowered through the opportunities of new technologies (e.g. Tapscott 1998; Gee 2003). Comparatively, tweens are represented primarily in terms of discourses of moral panic around media and consumer cultures e.g. “Is your tween a texting addict?” in *The Baltimore Sun* (Shatzkin 2010) or alternatively, tweens are represented as examples of a new species of technologically savvy individuals e.g. “Digital tweens say gimme gadgets” from msnbc.com (Chansanchai 2007).
Public media and research discourse around preadolescent and adolescent female experience predominantly exemplifies moral panics around the intersecting concerns of commercialization, new media, and the increased sexualization of young women (Lamb and Mikel Brown 2006; Pipher 1995; Wolfe 1997). Public media discourse has increasingly intensified its concern for the preadolescent cohort who are represented as extensive consumers of popular and commercial culture. This was particularly observable following the April 2008 *Vanity Fair* feature (Handy 2008) about Miley Cyrus, the star of Disney’s tween-oriented *Hannah Montana* (2006-2011) franchise. The article included photographs by celebrity photographer Annie Leibovitz of Cyrus (then fifteen-years-old) posed wrapped in a bed sheet, revealing her naked back. These photographs triggered a storm of public media coverage around Cyrus who was painted as a formerly innocent role model for preadolescent girls (See Barnes 2008). The reaction to Miley Cyrus indicates a key issue at hand in my research. Within the sphere of her fictional identity, Miley Cyrus is deemed (by public media discourse) as an appropriate role model for tween viewers; however, Cyrus’s life as an adolescent celebrity outside of the condoned franchised texts increasingly threatens to taint the fictional representation of her ‘tween’ identity. The cross-media practices and texts associated with these franchises often meld together intertextual information from various levels of discourse both within and outside of the franchise texts. In addition, this controversy around Cyrus reflects how tween girlhood as a relatively recent social identity has evolved out of a number of competing discourses related to normative feminine identities in cultural representations. In the context of cross-media worlds, tween girlhood is articulated and negotiated through multiple levels of discourse.
In their introduction chapter of the edited volume *Seven Going on Seventeen: Tween Studies in the Culture of Girlhood* (2005), Claudia Mitchell and Jacqueline Reid-Walsh observe that “research within the burgeoning area of girlhood studies…has tended to focus on adolescent girls and even on the ‘grrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrls’ on the other edge of adolescence (17/18 to 25)” (2). Despite the proliferation of cross-media franchises aimed at the tween age niche and the increased public media coverage of this group, the diverse studies of tween girlhood in Mitchell and Reid-Walsh’s volume continue to be among the few examples of scholarly research on the cross-media texts and cultures of tween girls. In light of these gaps in the research, the complex and contradictory cross-media articulations of tween girlhood constitute a relatively uncharted field of academic study.

1.3 Methodological challenges in the study of children’s texts and audiences

Upon completion of my MA in children’s literature, I began this doctoral research in October 2004 with a particular interest in the increasingly influential role of emerging cross-media trends in the production and reception of children’s literature. A number of questions were of particular interest: How does one read cross-media texts in the context of one of these tween franchises? How do these cross-media texts provide potential opportunities or challenges to the range of available discourses for meaning-making? How are these contemporary texts and practices rooted in the history of print texts aimed at preadolescent girls? What are the appropriate methodological approaches for these cross-media phenomena? Specifically, I was interested in how multimodal design, cross-media franchising, and the new practices associated with digital technologies may influence text and literacy practices in ways that had not yet been fully explored.
More than five years later, the field formerly known as ‘children’s literature studies’ in Canada has started to address some of these issues which I begin to unpack in this thesis. For example, the University of Winnipeg, where I currently work as a lecturer, has begun the Centre for Young People’s Texts and Cultures; and the journal housed here, formerly Canadian Children’s Literature has recently received the new title: Jeunesse: Young People, Texts, Cultures. These semantic shifts are emblematic of slow but notable changes in the scholarly study of children’s literature texts. At the same time, few studies have developed new theoretical and methodological frames for the study of young people’s texts and cultures in the context of cross-media texts and practices. The application of hybrid theoretical and methodological frames in this examination provides a significant contribution to this field of study.

David Buckingham and Julian Sefton-Green’s discussion of Pokemon (2003) highlights many research challenges that arise in the academic study of children’s texts and practices in the context of a cross-media phenomenon. The multiplicity, variety, and hybridity of cross-media texts and practices related to Pokemon raise significant methodological and theoretical challenges that are relevant to the cross-media worlds examined in this thesis. Buckingham and Sefton-Green pose the question:

So what is Pokemon in itself? It is clearly not just a ‘text,’ or even a collection of texts - a TV serial, a card game, toys, magazines or a computer game. It is not merely a set of objects that can be isolated for critical analysis, in the characteristic mode of academic Media Studies. It might more appropriately be described, in anthropological terms, as a ‘cultural practice.’ Pokemon is something you do, not just something you read or watch or ‘consume.’ (379)

As Buckingham and Sefton-Green observe, theoretical and methodological challenges in
the study of cross-media phenomena range from how to define Pokemon in itself to the use of frames from various disciplines (media studies, anthropology) to study Pokemon in a way that encompasses texts and cultural practices. The research in this thesis draws upon methodological approaches and theoretical frames from different disciplines in order to combine the analysis of textual and audience data. In this study, the case studies of Narnia and Mary-Kate and Ashley exemplify the transformations of meaning that take place in the context of cross-media narratives. Consequently, this study applies a hybrid theoretical and methodological approach that directly addresses these challenges presented by cross-media texts and literacies.

The expanded definition of literacy proposed by New Literacies researchers provides a starting point for the analysis of discourses within cross-media worlds. Following the New Literacies framework, two key foci have been identified for study: the expanded definition of literacy as socially and culturally constituted; and the examination of texts, practices, and spaces that incorporate emerging new technologies (Barton and Hamilton 1998; Cope and Kalantzis 2000). This doctoral research addresses both of these foci through an examination of the role of cross-media practices in the articulation of cultural discourses around identity.

Colin Lankshear and Michele Knobel (2007) define New Literacies as those practices that both draw upon new technical affordances as well as cultivate a ‘new ethos’ that is often defined as "participatory", "collaborative", and "distributed" (9). Working within the New Literacies frame, one prominent thread of recent research extensively examines the social practices of adolescents in relation to specific media forms such as chat-rooms, mobile phones, and video games (Davies 2006; Ito 2005; Steinkuehler 2006). In addition, diverse research has examined how children use popular
culture texts to socially mediate between the literacy cultures of home, school and peer-
groups in elementary schools and preschool contexts (Dyson 1997, 2003; Mallan and
Pearce 2003; Marsh 2005; Mitchell and Reid-Walsh 2002, 2005). Nevertheless, the
cross-media literacies at the levels of production and consumption of texts for young
people across older (i.e. books, television) and newer media (i.e. mobile phones and
DVDs) are still under-explored in the current research. One strand of New Literacies
research has begun to address cross-media practices with a focus upon social semiotic
theories of discourse, multimodal design, and trans-media narratives (Burn 2004; Kress
and van Leeuwen 2001; Lemke 2005). The examination of discourses of tween girlhood
in this study primarily follows this multimodality/multiliteracies strand of New Literacies
research (with relevant studies reviewed in Chapter Two); however, the development of a
theory of cross-media play as well as multimodal design provides an approach to cross-
media practices that addresses both texts and audiences.

1.4 Research focus and questions

The focus of this doctoral research is twofold: first, to develop an interdisciplinary
theoretical approach for the examination of discourses within cross-media worlds; and
second, to apply this framework to the analysis of tween girlhood within cross-media
worlds. As defined in the theoretical frame in Chapter Three, the term ‘tween girlhood’
in this study refers to a discursive identity that is constructed through and constituted by
discourse. Both tween and girlhood in this study are defined as socio-cultural identity
categories articulated through discourse in specific social, cultural and historical
contexts. The use of the term ‘tween’ refers to a discursive identity that is the focus of
this study while the term ‘preadolescent’ is used as an adjective to reference the age of individuals who are between 8 and 12 years old.

This research provides case study discourse analyses of two distinct cross-media worlds: The Chronicles of Narnia and Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen. I employ the term cross-media world in order to encompass the texts and practices associated with a cross-media franchise or trans-media narrative (as defined above) in addition to its intertextually associated texts such as earlier adaptations of the same narrative or character as well as fan productions. These two case studies were chosen due to their global popularity, high grossing sales, and specific targeting of the tween age niche. Each of these case studies also exemplifies a key trend in tween and children’s media culture.

The research focus is divided into two central research questions:

1) What are the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play in the articulation of discourses of tween girlhood within the cross-media worlds?

2) How are these discourses of tween girlhood within the cross-media worlds rooted in a cultural history of representations?

The thesis extensively addresses the first research question with a primary focus on the analysis of contemporary discourses of tween girlhood and their articulation across media and modes. The second research question (addressed specifically in Chapter Five) elucidates a secondary aim for the study that supports the primary research question. This second question addresses the historical and cultural context for the discourses of contemporary cross-media worlds. As discussed previously, a broader research question
related to methodology also underlines this study: How may the case-study approach to
the analysis of discourses within cross-media worlds contribute to current research on
young people's cultures, particularly studies that incorporate both textual and audience
analyses?

1.5 Structure of the thesis

Following this Introduction, Chapter Two presents an interdisciplinary review of
the relevant research in the fields of children's literature criticism, cultural and media
studies – in particular girlhood studies, and multiliteracies/New Literacies.

Chapter Three builds on this literature review through a discussion of the
theoretical frame for this study. The chapter begins with a theory of discourse and
identity as realized through the articulation of discourse around the circuit of culture.
Multimodal design is theorized as a discursive practice for the articulation of discourses
around tween girlhood. The chapter then explains how this theory of discourse and
identity is complemented by a theory of cross-media play.

Chapter Four elucidates how this theoretical frame is applied methodologically
through a discursive history to trace tween girl discourses at hand in the focus texts, and
two case study analyses of the function of design and play in cross-media worlds. The
chapter also outlines the methods of enquiry and analysis, including three audience
studies. Chapter Five provides a discursive history of tween girlhood, tracing of a
number of key discourses that are articulated in the case studies of cross-media worlds.
These discourses include Romantic childhood innocence, developmental discourses of
social and moral maturation, and popular feminist discourses of girl power, and
commodity feminism. The case studies in Chapter Six and Seven examine the articulation of these discourses of tween girlhood within two distinct cross-media worlds.

Chapter Six explores how discourses of tween girlhood, as articulated in Lewis’s original novel *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950), are translated and re-imagined through adaptation as part of the Disney/Walden Media cross-media franchise of *The Chronicles of Narnia: The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (2005). Using the protagonist Lucy Pevensie as a focus, the first part of the analysis examines the role of multimodal design in the articulation of discourses of tween girlhood rooted in the discursive history. The analysis then examines the role of multimodal design in the adaptation of discourses from the original novel to the BBC television serial (1988) and the recent film adaptation. The second part of the analysis examines the expansion of the film discourses through various franchise tie-in texts. The third part draws upon the categories of cross-media play as an analytical frame to examine how cross-media play functions as a discursive practice at sites of audience discourse from fieldwork and digital cultures.

Drawing upon the same frames for analysis, Chapter Seven examines the articulation of the discourses of tween girlhood rooted in the discursive history in the cross-media world of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen. The first part of the chapter examines the articulation of discourses of tween girlhood through the multimodal design of franchise texts with a particular focus on the book and DVD adaptations of the *so little time* series. The second part of the analysis examines the re-articulation and negotiation of these discourses across DVD bonus features, Dualstar home and fashion products, and public media discourse. The third part of the analysis examines the categories of cross-media play in the audience study of dedicated Olsen fans and digital cultures related to
the Olsens. The conclusion of this thesis in Chapter Eight provides an extensive
discussion and comparison of the findings of the two case studies. The conclusion
addresses the methodological implications and applications of this study for future cross-
media research.
CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW OF RELEVANT RESEARCH

2.1 The study of tween texts and cultures: An interdisciplinary challenge

This review of relevant literature aims to situate my study between three research fields: children’s literature criticism and literary theory, cultural and media studies with a particular focus on girlhood studies, and research in the area of New Literacies and multiliteracies. Historically, research on young people has occurred simultaneously across several, separate disciplines. However, while the influence of research in one area on another has always existed (for example the role of developmental psychology in research on literacy education), critical dialogue or research collaboration between disciplines is a relatively new academic endeavour. In the field of children’s literature, many children’s literature critics study the representation of childhood removed from the responses of real children. On the other hand, work in education, psychology and sociology has often focused on the responses and actions of children, and not on the texts they may encounter in their daily lives. Children’s literature theorist Rod McGillis observes that “the rarefied theorising of the literary academic strikes the practising teacher as arid beyond tolerance, whereas the practical aims of the educationalist seem too limited and limiting to the theorist and historian of children’s literature” (1999: 203). Thus, empirical projects tend to lack critical discussions of texts, and literary examinations fail to account for nuanced engagements by readers. A central aim of my research is to find new methodological and theoretical ways to negotiate this discrepancy.

The cross-media worlds in this examination demand an interdisciplinary approach that takes into account theoretical and methodological frames from these distinct research
areas. This review aims to examine relevant research from three fields. The first part of this review outlines relevant examples of children's literature criticism that examine popular fiction texts and representations of girlhood through the lenses of feminist and cultural theory. The second part of the review focuses on cultural and media studies research that examines girls' cultures. This section will also address research that defines 'girl culture' as its own specialized area. This area of research examines girlhood as it is constituted and negotiated through the production and consumption of popular culture texts (i.e. magazines, comics, and websites). The third part of the review outlines relevant research in the field of multiliteracies and New Literacies. The conclusion of this review highlights the gaps in the relevant research and outlines how this doctoral study expands upon the existing research in these three key areas.

2.2 Children's literature criticism

The first section of this review addresses relevant trends in children's literature criticism, particularly from the Leavisite tradition, that contribute to how various children's literature critics have examined popular series fiction for children. In addition, the section highlights literary studies that apply diverse critical frameworks to examine the discourses of childhood and girlhood in print texts.

2.2.1 Leavisite tradition in children's literature criticism

In the realm of literary theory, children's literature criticism is often considered a sub-category of literary studies, and has evolved uneasily as its own theoretical milieu. In many ways, the evolution of children's literature criticism parallels the trends and theoretical perspectives of literary theory. However, children's literature criticism is also
informed by the social functions of children’s literature texts in the “rearing, socialisation
and education of the young” (Sarland 1999: 30). Children’s texts are rarely evaluated,
even in rigorous textual analyses, without identifying how these texts will be read and
more significantly how these texts will be used by children, parents, teachers or
librarians. The social (and often pedagogic) functions of children’s books in school and
extra-curricular contexts tend to be evaluated along with other literary and artistic criteria
and contribute to notions of what constitutes a ‘good’ children’s book, worthy of literary
analysis. In the words of children’s literature critic Peter Hunt (1980), children’s books
cannot be just “good but [also] good for” children (10). Moreover, the pedagogic
discourses of children’s literature are also reflected in the critical evaluations of
children’s books by literary critics. Analyses of children’s literature texts often reflect a
close connection to the functionality of these texts as books written for young readers.
Thus, the interests and needs of the ‘implied reader’ of the text are often central to
children’s literature criticism.

Children’s literature criticism is often informed by personal, political and
academic agenda. Always an uneasy inclusion in academic literature departments,
children’s literature criticism often took the form of socio-historical or thematic surveys.
Early criticism from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries primarily judged children’s
books according to their personal belief that children’s books were written for either
entertainment or for instruction and tended to focus on advising parents, librarians, and
other interested adults on what texts may encourage and develop the reading habits of
young people (Thwaite 1964; Summerfield 1984).

In many books of criticism, the established criteria for judgment were assumed or
implied but not explicitly discussed, called into question, or debated. However, a body of
criteria for judging and evaluating children's books developed in the 1960s and continues to this day. This body of criticism relies primarily on established criteria drawing on the Leavisite tradition in the UK and New Criticism in the US (See Sarland 1999). Leavis's *The Great Tradition* (1948) plays an integral role in the creation of a canon of children's classics in the UK. The central tenet of the Leavisite and New Critic analyses is that "a literary work is a self-sufficient object invested with publicly available meanings, whose features and structure should be analyzed without 'external' reference to the responses of its readers" (Abrams 1993: 270). A key weakness of this approach is the examination of texts as isolated objects removed from the social and cultural contexts of production and reception. Moreover, a liberal humanist discourse in this tradition promotes a type of literary and artistic appreciation that ought to be learned and crafted like the art or literary work that is to be examined. The notion of the novel as an art form is central to this criticism bringing with it class based assumptions about art and literary value. Due to the influence of this Leavisite tradition, popular series fiction, picture books, comics and other popular culture texts aimed at young readers (such as the texts in this research study) are often positioned outside the realm of children's literature criticism.

Children's literature criticism that followed this Leavisite tradition includes papers edited by Egoff et.al. (1969); John Rowe Townsend (1971, 1976); Ted Hughes (1976); Peter Hunt (1980) and Margery Fisher (1986). Significantly, Inglis's *The Promise of Happiness* (1981) is greatly influenced by *The Great Tradition*. Comparatively, while Leavis cites the values in great literature of "intelligence, vitality, sensibility, depth, range and subtlety in the presentment of human experience," Inglis speaks of the related values in children's literature of "sincerity, dignity, integrity, honesty, authenticity, fulfillment, freedom, innocence, nation, intelligence, and heroes"
Many recent collections continue to be based on judgments of quality and value that bring assumptions from the Leavisite tradition (e.g. Styles 1998).

Children's literature critics and writers, for example Aidan Chambers (who is both), critique and define children's literature using language steeped in the tropes of liberal humanism. Chambers (1985) writes that the significance of children's literature (and literature in general) is that "in literature we find the best expression of the human imagination, and for the most useful means by which we come to grips with our ideas about ourselves and what we are" (16). Similarly, the preface to the The Norton Anthology of Children's Literature (2005) concludes with the statement "at once cherished and innovative, children's literature keeps readers alive to the transformative power of learning and delight", exemplifying the continued emphasis on the liberal humanist approach in recent children's literature criticism (Zipes et.al. xxxv).

Due to this continued emphasis on liberal humanist values in children's literature criticism, popular series fiction for children has only been addressed in children's literature analyses (e.g. Hunt 1994; Watson 2000). Research and criticism related to popular series fiction for children and the recreational reading cultures of children follow two distinct routes. One tendency is to examine these texts using a framework outside of literary criticism, often from a cultural and media studies perspective, as will be discussed later in this section of the review. The other common tendency is for literary criticism to attempt to prove that these books should be entered into the canon. Often this 'proof' involves exemplifying how these texts have value according to criteria laid out by the Leavisite tradition. Victor Watson (2000), for example, argues for a serious analytical consideration of series fiction particularly that of Arthur Ransome's Swallows and Amazons. Watson's argument, rather than using its popularity among readers as a basis
for analysis (as may be done in the field of Cultural Studies), instead aims to “demonstrate by analyzing his [Arthur Ransome’s] writing the complexity and humanity-the trust in children – implicit in his apparently simple and beguiling accounts” (Watson 9). Moreover, he notes the “distinguishing characteristic of children’s writing- a ‘poetic’ ability to suggest subtle, complex and private values in simple, transparent and carefully crafted language and form” (9). This commentary exemplifies an examination of Ransome’s work within the Leavisite tradition through the focus on the author’s writing as a craft as well as the overarching belief that the role of children’s literature to introduce children to complex values and concepts through simple language and form.

2.2.2 Applying literary and critical theory to children’s literature

More recent children’s literature critics have offered a critique of Leavisite and liberal humanist approaches to children’s texts through other critical approaches to literary analyses including structuralism, psychoanalytic, postcolonial and feminist and approaches to examine children’s literature over the past thirty years (e.g. Hunt 1991; McCallum 1999; McGillis 1996; Stephens 1992). Most of these criticisms use an ideological perspective that argues that children’s literature texts are constructions in and out of ideology, and that the job of the critic is to deconstruct the work in order to expose its underlying ideological nature (Sarland 1999: 39). Jack Zipes’s (1997) Marxist critique of fairytales initiated a thread of criticism that focuses on social class and ideological conflict, and thereby challenging psychological approaches to children’s literature. Paralleling literary criticism (for adults), these ideological projects represent a movement away from the Leavisite values. However, these ideological criticisms continue to maintain a distance from the actual reading experiences of individual readers. Although
the text is not glorified or romanticized in the same way as in previous criticism, the child reader continues to be romanticized and constructed as a special or distinct type of reader. Moreover, children’s literature continues to be separated as texts that require a special kind of analysis.

Various scholars have drawn upon post-structuralist theories in their examinations of children’s texts. Post-structuralist theory establishes an understanding of the world that defines an inherently dynamic relationship between an individual and their social environment. Bronwyn Davies (1989) argues that post-structuralist theory elucidates the complex, and often contradictory nature of an individual’s shifting identities in relation to texts and social contexts:

By focusing on the multiple subject positions that a person takes up and the often contradictory natures of these positionings, and by focusing on the fact that the social world is constantly being constituted through the discursive practices in which individuals engage, we are able to see individuals not as the unitary beings that humanist theory would have them be, but as the complex, changing contradictory creatures that we each experience ourselves to be. (1989: xi)

The central focus for children’s literature scholars that apply post-structuralist theory is to examine these ‘contradictory’ and shifting identities represented within the texts as well as the subject positions offered to readers by the texts. Moreover, the structures and processes of the social world are understood to have the “capacity to constrain, to shape, to coerce, as well as to potentiate individual action” (Davies 1989: xi). Within the context of post-structuralist theory, literary texts may be revealed as both coercive and heavily encoded with social and cultural definitions or markers. Post-structuralist analyses
primarily aim to deconstruct texts and other media in order to examine and evaluate the various discourses that are at play in the texts themselves.

My theoretical frame outlined in Chapter Three may be situated in relation to the work of children's literature scholars who have applied post-structural frames in their analyses, particularly theories of intertextuality. Both John Stephens (1992) and Robyn McCallum (1999) have drawn upon theories of intertextuality in their detailed examinations of adolescent fiction and the construction of shifting identities throughout these texts. McCallum draws upon the work of Mikhail Bakhtin in order to examine the dynamic relations between various ideologies and subject positions within the adolescent novel. Her work on adolescent fiction focuses on “the representation of subjectivity as being dialogically constructed through interrelationships with others, through language, and in relation to social cultural forces and ideologies; and the use of dialogical narrative strategies to structure narratives, to represent subjectivity and intersubjectivity and to position implied readers as subjects in texts” (McCallum 258). McCallum’s work focuses on the inter-relationships within texts (in relation with other texts) and the potential subject positions that may be taken up by the reader. Her interest as a literary theorist is primarily textual; however, this framework may provide a useful approach to the multiplicity of texts, voices and subject positions in the cross-media discourse in my study. McCallum’s application of Bakhtin’s theoretical work has some useful implications in the examination of young people’s texts and cultures. In Chapter Three, I will elaborate on how a theory of intertextuality, as interpreted primarily by Jenkins (1992), will be applied in my analysis of cross-media play.

Building on cross-disciplinary research in childhood studies (James, Jenks, and Prout 1998) discussed below (in section 2.3.1), another relevant trend in children’s
literature criticism involves a social constructivist and discourse analysis. These analyses call into question the ideological construction and representation of childhood and child readers in children’s literature texts, as well as in children’s literature criticism. A popular perspective within contemporary childhood studies posits childhood as socially and culturally constituted through images, representations, and constructs. Children’s literature theorist Karin Lesnik-Oberstein’s Children’s Literature: Criticism and the fictional child (1994) explains, the “ideas and art [created for and about children produces] a narrative of adults” (13). Using this social constructivist framework, many children’s literature critics view these representations as rich sites to examine competing and interrelated discourses. Lesnik-Oberstein describes childhood as “an identity, a mediator and repository of ideas in Western Culture about consciousness and experience, mortality and values, property and privacy, but, perhaps most importantly, it has been assigned a crucial relationship to language itself” (6). Lesnik-Oberstein provides an overview of issues in children’s literature criticism and how they reflect the intentions, desires, likes, dislikes and moral belief systems of the critic with regards to the role of childhood and the role of literature. She examines the socio-cultural construction of a fictional child in various disciplines including psychoanalysis, and how these are discourses are drawn upon my children’s literature critics to articulate particular agenda.

Lesnik-Oberstein’s examination is quite useful in outlining the discourses at hand; however, her focus on adults and texts limits her usefulness in an examination of literacy cultures of young people themselves. Ironically, the children are often left out of children’s literature criticism. It is still a controversial undertaking in the realm of literary studies. Instead literary critics position the implied, universal, or generalized diverse child reader and hypothesize on the responses by the implied readers. In Chapter Three, I
elaborate on how a theory of discourse and identity may draw upon the work by Lesnik-Oberstein, particularly in terms of the discursive construction of the ‘tween girl’ as an implied or imagined reader/viewer/consumer. In section 2.3.1, I review work in the area of girlhood culture studies that examines (similar to Lesnik-Oberstein with regards to childhood) the construction of girlhood as a mediator for various historical and contemporary discourses.

2.2.3 Feminist theory and children’s literature

Contemporary feminist critics tend to apply two major theoretical approaches to their analyses of literature: gynocriticism that “asks what is specific to the condition of women (as authors or characters) in literature” and gynesis that “focuses on the symbolic space the feminine inhabits in culture” (Norich 1992: 2). Work informed by feminist theory often exemplifies the deconstruction and reframing of these two types of cultural representations. In the words of Audre Lorde (1984), feminist work must follow a new model of actions where, “divide and conquer must become define and empower” (112). As part of this project of redefinition, feminist literary research often focuses its agenda on recovering, revisioning or reinterpreting marginal texts. Thus, the popular series fiction aimed at a young female readership as well as comics, picture books and magazines (that lie outside the conventional definitions of literature) are often examined within a feminist literary framework.

Although there are numerous examples of feminist analyses of popular fiction for and about girls, I will only highlight those articles and books that are methodologically and/or theoretically relevant to my research. Sherrie Inness, in her introduction to the edited volume Nancy Drew and Company: Culture, Gender and Girls’ Series (1997)
confirms the marginal place of these books in critical literary study: “Girls’ series books have been quadruple outcasts from critical circles because they are written for young readers, are targeted at girls, are popular reading, and, even worse, are series books, which often have been regarded with disdain by literary critics” (1). Inness observes that although there is an academic interest in girls’ culture, this volume “seeks to redress the paucity of research on girls’ series” (2). The volume follows this agenda addressing a number of diverse girls’ series books from the 1910s to the 1950s in the United States. This type of research is predominantly informed by a dual feminist interest. Firstly, these studies aim to bring marginal books, often popular texts from history, into the critical realm, while secondly, these texts focus on the ways these texts play a key role in reinforcing cultural ideologies in the socialization of girls. The dual agenda in these studies results in a tension between a nostalgia for girls’ popular culture in the critical archival process while positioning the text as a socializing tool to promote ideological meanings to helpless young female readers.

Earlier work on the popular texts of girls exemplify detailed historical surveys of girls’ series books. Among them, Mary Cadogan and Patricia Craig’s You’re a Brick Angela! A New Look at Girls’ Fiction from 1839-1975 (2003), originally published in 1976, presents an exhaustive historical and thematic overview of English-language fiction from the Girls-Own-Annual to Jane Eyre. However, the generally celebratory and nostalgic tone of this survey undermines some of the critical discussion of the texts. Some of the more recent feminist analyses of fiction for girls envision a number of series books and classics as proto-feminist narratives (for example, Foster and Simons What Katy Read: Feminist Re-Readings of ‘Classic’ Stories for Girls (1995)). Following this type of analysis, K.L. Poe (1997) argues for a feminist reading of Montgomery’s Anne of
Green Gables series that posits these texts as representing a community with a strong underlying matriarchal structure. Moreover, she remarks that "the reader is able to see the growth of a true feminist spirit" (Poe 15) and that Anne "sees her role as unlimited in spite of the conventions that bind her" (16). Similarly, some critics have argued for the matriarchal power of sisterhood in Little Women, and the role of the text as a proto-feminist mouthpiece for Alcott. One analysis, of the books and the film adaptations, concludes that the novel and each of the films operate to covertly and overtly subvert the domesticity that underlines the text. This is exemplified through the death of Beth, the character most obviously coded as appropriately feminine, and by the narrative focus on Jo, the character least conventionally feminine (Kirkham and Warren 1999).

Although these observations are valid, I am wary of celebratory examinations of historical texts. Many of these observations may be strengthened and nuanced by a balanced critique of a number of competing discourses in the text and a discussion of the potential readings of the reader. I will argue later that within the context of these women-centred spaces, the maturation narratives that underline the protagonist's growth (in both Montgomery and Alcott) exemplify normative developmental discourses that require the protagonist to move from individualized to community-condoned behaviour by the end of the series. These normative developmental discourses often run beside constructions of glorified women-only space. In the specific context of tween girl texts, the notion of a girl culture that individuals may join through engagement and consumption of texts and products is often underscored by normative constructions of preadolescent girlhood.

A number of examinations of fiction for girls apply a feminist agenda to revisit history. An edited volume by Claudia Nelson and Lynne Vallone (1994) exemplifies a number of cultural histories of texts for girls, and Kimberley Reynolds's historically and
culturally framed study (1990) examines gender representation in British popular fiction during the late 19th and early 20th century. This research exemplifies the movement towards new historicist approaches to children’s literature. Similarly, Penny Tinkler’s *Constructing Girlhood: Popular Magazines for Girls Growing up in England 1920-1950* (1995) and Mel Gibson’s article “'What became of Bunty?' The Emergence, Evolution and Disappearance of the Girls’ Comic in Post-War Britain” (2003) employ similar frames to investigate the interrelated discourses of gender, class and popular culture in girls’ magazines and girls’ comics. In the second part of this literature review I address relevant studies on girls as readers of magazines and comics in the field of cultural and media studies (McRobbie 1977/1991; Currie 1999).

A number of studies apply media and cultural studies approaches to recent children’s and young adult literature. Irene Gammell and Benjamin Lefebvre’s edited collection (2010) includes various approaches to the popular cultures of production and reception around L.M. Montgomery’s *Anne of Green Gables* (1908). Chris Richards’s work examines public media, marketing, design and fan discourse associated with contemporary young adult fiction with a particular focus on discourse associated with the author Francesca Lia Block (2007; 2008). Elizabeth Marshall’s analyses of preadolescent and adolescent girlhood discourses address diverse texts including: the Nancy Drew series (2003), adult memoirs and non-fiction texts (2007), and *American Girl* dolls and books (2009).

Studies of popular series fiction are particularly relevant to my study of cross-media tween texts and cultures. Deborah L. Siegel’s chapter on “Nancy Drew As New Girl Wonder: Solving it All for the 1930s” (1997) follows a cultural studies framework to examine the shifts in representation of the Nancy Drew series during different time
periods and cultural contexts. Siegel's examination positions the reinvention of Nancy Drew for distinct time periods as contextualized by historical and cultural contexts of production and reception; "not a timeless essence who is always interpreted in the same fashion; instead, she is constructed and reconstructed by readers from different decades, with each generation bringing new considerations to bear on the girl detective’s career" (Inness 9). Siegel focuses on the cultural and historical frame of the first Nancy Drew books "ten years after women had secured the right to vote and one year into the great depression" (Siegel 160). She investigates early volumes of the series in terms of shifting discourses of class, gender, and girlhood, "with the Rise of the New Woman" in the United States during this period (160). Although she focuses her analysis on a close textual reading, this analysis is informed by other textual materials such as guides for parents to children’s reading, advertisements for the series and contemporary historical scholarship on popular images and discourses around gender during the 1930s.

Siegel situates her analysis in relation to the work of feminist theorists including Radway (addressed in the third section of this literature review), in her politicized academic argument that "popular fiction forms must often articulate conflicting discourses, and that the space of popular fiction engages an ideological economy that is far more complex, contradictory and ambivalent than the orthodox Marxist position may imply" (Siegel 161). Her close textual analysis takes into account the conflicted discursive meanings between the illustrations, cover art and the written narrative in these series books. While the cover of one volume depicts Nancy as a "New Woman" the "expression on her face exudes that hallmark self-confidence", an interior illustration "portrays Nancy as a Victorian waif...fearful and small before the older, taller man who threatens her" (Siegel 175). Siegel investigates the conflicting contemporary construction
of Nancy as “a feminist superheroine” in conjunction with the discourse of Nancy Drew’s world as the representation of a moral universe or “a fantasy of purity and stability in an increasingly complex universe” (163). Moreover she elucidates that “Drewness at its point of its inception, was virtually removed from the material reality that most likely shaped the lives of a large portion of Nancy’s readership [the Depression era audience]...while at the same time the social landscape Nancy inhabits bears literal references both to the region and to the time” (Siegel 164). The focus of Siegel’s analysis is the interaction between textual meanings and the cultural, economic and social context of production of historical texts. Although she includes a number of anecdotes and reader quotes (from the back of original editions), she does not focus on how these competing discourses of Victorian morality and proto-feminism (exemplified by the New Women) would have been received by girls during this period.

As discussed in the discursive history of tween girlhood in Chapter Five, the competing discourses (of Victorian morality and proto-feminism) examined in Siegel’s analysis of Nancy Drew continue to be articulated in contemporary tween texts particularly those affiliated with Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen. Siegel’s examination of Nancy Drew takes into account the commercial context of the production of these books, written by ghost writers under the pseudonym Carolyn Keene by the Stratemeyer Syndicate run by “the man known as the Henry Ford of the children’s series mass market” (Siegel 165). This commercialization of series books set the stage for the evolution of children’s book publishing in the context of mass-market entertainment over the last 50 years. Moreover, Siegel examines the popular critique of series fiction as ‘poison’ and the librarian’s disdain over the death of the author in the mass market production of these texts. The lament of the lost sacred relationship between children’s
writer and reader is a prevalent discourse that continues to circulate with regards to children’s engagement with media and popular culture (Siegel 168-169). However, because the series book has become seen as the last vestige of print culture, it is recently viewed in a more complimentary light, because as print texts they support the ‘better a book than television or media’ discourse that is often espoused by teachers, parents and librarians. Given the consistent formulaic threads of narrative, character and theme, not to mention the publishing and marketing tactics, it is important to bring the findings of analyses of series books in earlier periods to an examination of contemporary texts aimed at tween girls.

Siegel’s examination exemplifies how Cultural Studies approaches may be applied to children’s literature texts. However, while Siegel examines the commercial and cultural contexts of popular series books, the multimodal representation of Nancy Drew across popular culture media “ranging from the series book to a cookbook and from a ballet to a rock group” is only alluded to in Siegel’s paper (Siegel 159). Within children’s literature studies, few analyses focus upon the significance of book design, marketing strategies, tie-in franchise texts, and fan discourse in their examinations of literary texts.

2.2.4 Conclusion to children’s literature criticism section

Children’s literature critics within the realm of literary theory tend to avoid children’s texts that explicitly cross modes and media. As discussed in the following section of this literature review, analyses of explicitly multimodal texts such as graphic novels, picture books, franchise series books and movie novelizations are often situated outside of literary criticism within the research fields of cultural and media studies or
literacy education. While some children’s literature texts are more explicitly multimodal than others, it is problematic to examine children’s books without reference to their cultural context of production and the number of associated cross-media texts that are produced and distributed simultaneously with the books themselves. Children’s literature publishing houses have never existed in a vacuum unaffected by the political and social economy or the changing literacy practices of new technologies.

With regards to children’s literature criticism reviewed in this chapter, studies rooted in feminist and social constructivist frames for the analysis of popular texts are most useful to my research. I also situate my research alongside those studies that employ post-structural literary theories in their examination of children’s books. In Chapter Four, I reframe these literary theories in the context of an interdisciplinary methodology rooted in cultural and media studies as well as literacy education. With reference to methodology in literature criticism, I frame my multimodal design analysis of discourse within a socio-cultural history that traces the evolution of a number of interrelated and competing discourses from earlier texts and cultural trends aimed at tween and adolescent girls. This theoretical and methodological framework is developed further in the following sections.

2.3 Cultural and media studies with a focus on girlhood cultures

The study of girls is a relatively new cross-disciplinary field of research. The following sections highlight only a small selection of research on girlhood cultures from different time periods and approaches that are relevant to my own study of tween girlhood and cross-media worlds. Rather than a chronological review of the field, I group
the studies in relation to key trends and themes in girlhood cultures that are relevant to my own study of texts and practices of tween girls.

The first part of the review begins with a discussion of select texts that examine childhood and girlhood as socio-cultural categories constituted by discourse. The chapter continues with a review of cultural and media studies research that explores preadolescent and adolescent girls’ recreational reading of romance and other series fiction. Many of these studies also investigate the social peer dynamics of groups of girls and the negotiation of identities through reading practices. The next section reviews a selection of relevant research including studies that examine: girls’ cross-media texts and practices around magazines, comics, digital cultures, video games and consumer culture. I conclude with a review of research on children’s consumer culture and the role of popular and consumer culture texts in identity construction. I situate my examination of tween girlhood among these studies and hypothesize on ways that this research may be expanded to address the cross-media texts and practices in this doctoral research.

2.3.1 The social studies of childhood and girlhood

This study situates itself theoretically with recent cross-disciplinary research on childhood and girlhood that aims to question, dismantle, and analyze contemporary and historical constructions of childhood as it is articulated through social practices, cultural products, and literary and artistic representation. Building on research in sociology (Stainton-Rogers and Stainton Rogers 1992; James, Jenks and Prout 1998; Holloway and Valentine 2000), this cross-disciplinary movement in the study of childhood addresses conventional discourses of childhood as defined through institutions, texts and social practices and positions children as active social actors. Similarly, there are a number of
examinations (both within and outside of the cultural studies of youth) that examine the
discursive production of adolescence as a category of identity framed by specific
historical, social and cultural contexts (Aitken 2001; Baxter 2008; Lesko 2001; Richards
2008).

David Buckingham’s *After the Death of Childhood* (2001) examines discourses of
contemporary childhood in the context of the new media age. Buckingham sets up his
discussion with an overview of models of childhood specifically focusing on the
interaction between shifting constructs of childhood and changing media and
technologies. Buckingham roots his discussion in the image of the child in public opinion
and the media itself. He identifies that at the core of past and present criticism in this area
is a binary conflict. In many ways a response to Neil Postman’s attack on the rise of
television in *The Disappearance of Childhood* (1982), Buckingham’s text negotiates and
modifies two conflicting views, noting the limits of both perspectives: “To regard
children as *either* passive victims of the media *or* as active consumers is effectively to
view them in isolation from broader processes of cultural and social change”
(Buckingham 2001: 81). Buckingham’s examination of media and research discourse as
well as his proposal for a more nuanced perspective of child agency are useful to my
theorization of tween girlhood as a discursive identity in Chapter Three.

Expanding on work in childhood and youth studies, various studies address
girlhood as a socio-cultural construction. Often situated within girl culture or girls’
studies as its own cross-disciplinary field, a number of papers and books have
significantly theorized the discursive construction of the girl as constituted in texts and
examines the construction of girlhood in Western societies in the context of late
modernity. She examines how young women have been constructed as the subjects of discourse in relation to a concept of 'the future' that positions girls as 'can-do' or 'at-risk' (Harris 2004: 10). She then explores how these discourses play out in the realms of workplace, education, research, policies, and programs focused on revealing girls' voices. Although my examination of cross-media worlds is notably distinct in focus from Harris's sociological analysis, I apply a broad theoretical frame (defined in Chapter Three) that similarly posits girlhood as a discursive identity constituted at various sites of discourse.

Both Harris and Buckingham provide useful theoretical frames for the examination of tween girlhood as a discursive identity; however, a number of diverse studies located in both cultural and media studies and girlhood studies reviewed in the following sections apply methodological approaches that have implications for my study of cross-media texts and practices of tween girls.

2.3.2 Research on girls' recreational reading

Janice Radway's research on middle class women's popular reading practices around romance novels (1984) has influenced many studies on the reading habits of younger female readers. The importance of Radway's study lies in her movement of analytical emphasis from the meanings of the text to the practices of the reader, "on the significance of the act of romance reading rather than on the meaning of the romance" (Radway 222). Significantly, Radway found that the women's enjoyment of the romances was rooted in an escape from reality both in the narratives themselves and in the experience of reading. Popular culture texts are used in distinct contexts and these contexts influence the meanings of these texts. Although Radway has been critiqued on a
number of counts, particularly with regards to her role as feminist researcher in relation to the women in her study and the role of fantasy with regards to pleasure in reading/viewing (Ang 1996), the study is still a significant touchstone for current research on the reading practices of women, particularly in terms of its influence on research related to girls’ recreational reading practices.

*Texts of Desire: Essays on Fiction, Femininity and Schooling* (1993) edited by Linda K. Christian-Smith includes a number of research papers that explore the role of romance in the reading habits of adolescent girls. The volume effectively illustrates the multidisciplinary scope and international interest in this area with research from North America, the United Kingdom, and Australia. The research in this volume stems from feminist and poststructuralist critical analyses and is rooted in the perspective that reading and writing are gendered social practices that position and constitute communities of readers. The research discussed in this volume challenges the notion of reading as a socially or politically neutral act or a purely personal experience. Although this volume is over fifteen years old, it exemplifies the key themes at hand in research on girls’ reading practices inside and outside the school context. The studies outlined in this volume also address issues of structure and agency in girls’ reading that since the publication of this volume been more extensively researched in interactions with media culture and consumer culture.

Radway’s study is often reworked in the examinations of younger female readers in several contributions in *Texts of Desire*. Radway’s notion of reading romances as an act of empowerment, where romance novels act as vehicles through which women may access personal pleasure and fulfilment of desire, is applied to the reading habits of young girls (Cherland and Edelsky 1993). In her introduction, Christian-Smith discusses
the role of reading in schools and addresses the historical issue of differential access for males and females to certain texts. She outlines the complicated historical relationship between women and literacy and traces the evolution of the concept of private reading for personal pleasure. One central element of the romance genre for adolescent females is the significant social function of these texts and their role in peer groups and fan communities. Moreover, building on Fish’s notion of “interpretive communities” (1980), Christian-Smith argues: “Girls construct distinct kinds of shared identities and interpretive communities bounded by the experiences, fantasies and desires of texts of pop culture” (ix). Christian-Smith’s discussion triggers a number of questions regarding changes in the reading experiences of young girls with the centrality of new media in their recreational lives. In many ways my study may be situated as an extension of this earlier research, with a focus on the increased integration of multimodality into the texts girls read recreationally and the ways these texts are positioned in the context of extensive, multi-media textual worlds.

In another chapter in the volume “Retailing Gender: Adolescent Book Clubs in Australian Schools” (1993), Dianne Cooper examines the phenomenon of book clubs in Year Five classrooms in Australia. As the situation with Scholastic Books continues to be similar in Canada, this discussion is relevant to the Canadian participants in my study. During my fieldwork in a grade three classroom in Toronto, I observed the influence of the Scholastic book company through a book fair, and catalogues, as it impacted on the selection of books for purchase by students, parents, teachers and school librarians. Moreover, as part of my fieldwork, I examined the selection of books that were available at the book fair and which of these books the children and teacher purchased. Although
my focus was not on school-sanctioned reading, the influence of Scholastic book sales on
the recreational reading habits of the participants was evident.

Cooper draws upon theory and methodology from political sociology, economics,
critical linguistics and social semiotics to investigate how book clubs function “as a key
institutions in the construction of reading and subject positions of reader/consumers, thus
tracing the textual production of gender from publisher to classroom to reader” (1993: 9).
Her study addresses Ashton Scholastic’s long history of involvement with Australian
schools since the late 1960s and reflects upon the consequences of this relationship.
Cooper cites many concrete examples from sales brochures and aspects of series books
that aid in the construction of a “desire to own” in girl readers. Although her discussion
of visual cues and codes as well as textual repetitive cues in the covers of the Babysitter’s
Club series are particularly insightful, Cooper does not take into account the potential for
resistant readers who make playful and flexible meanings in response to coercive
consumer culture and media cues. Young readers can be particularly savvy in their
understanding of popular culture and the ways in which publishers and advertising
constructs subject positions in their readers/consumers.

Another chapter in this volume by Meredith Rogers Cherland and Carole Edelsky
(1993) explores the potential for resistant and playful readings of texts. The chapter
charts an ethnographic study in an elementary school middle-class community in order to
explore how sixth grade girls make meaning in their fiction reading. The researchers use
feminist theory in their interpretation of their data. This study focuses on popular fiction
texts in order investigate questions of agency and powerlessness in violent narratives.
Their analysis addresses “resistance” - the negotiation or accommodation of ideological
forces that occurs, and raises the issue of how nuanced responses of accommodation and
resistance in the negotiation of conflicting discourses in texts may be examined critically in the study of girls' reading practices. Bronwyn Davies, in a chapter in this volume (1993), and in her own work on gender in early childhood (1989), discusses how romantic texts may be read in terms of dualism of male/female elements and oppositions of feminine and masculine sides that are rooted in the notion of compulsory heterosexuality. However, Davies argues that post-structuralist theory in the classroom context can make the coercion in the text visible, through reading against the grain. Notably, the call for reading against the grain by Davies (and other researchers in the volume) often elucidates how literacy education research on popular fiction and media often holds an undertone of the Leavisite bias against popular culture texts.

Similarly, the research of Pam Gilbert and Sandra Taylor (1991) calls for a feminist pedagogy that deconstructs popular cultural texts in the classroom in order to negotiate the role of these texts in the social practices of adolescent girls. They discuss how these texts may be brought into the classroom context and the problems that may result among sub-cultures of women in the school context. Gilbert and Taylor’s examine the production and marketing of Dolly fiction alongside Dolly magazine as well as the significance of the serial form of the soap opera and popular fiction. The cross-media branding of texts and episodic narratives discussed in this analysis may be seen as an earlier incarnation of the cross-media worlds I examine in this study.

Gilbert and Taylor argue for an expansion of the “range of available discourses” regarding femininity in popular culture to include these dominant narratives of femininity but also other alternative versions of femininity (72). They agree that introducing new possibilities is difficult as “the space available for resistance and reconstitution of these popular cultural texts is slight” (Gilbert and Taylor 145). This proposal for an expansion
of "available discourses of femininity" relates to the texts and practices in my examination. It is important to understand whether production of texts across modes and cross-media narratives have opened up possibilities for alternative readings in their intertextual multiplicity or have rather closed down possibilities through the construction of a dominating brand concept. Moreover, Gilbert and Taylor cite Chris Weedon (1987) who argues "even when we resist a particular subject position and the mode of subjectivity which it brings with it, we do so from the position of an alternative social definition of femininity. In patriarchal societies we cannot escape the implications of femininity. Everything we do signifies compliance or resistance to dominant forms of what it is to be a woman" (Gilbert and Taylor 86-87). Following Weedon's theory of feminine identity, I wish to draw attention to the notion of 'resistant reading.' The discourses available may be limited but they are not static. As illustrated in the analyses in Chapters Six and Seven, a reader/consumer's engagement with the discourses in a text are bound by the discursive resources available; however, the ways in which they use these resources may be influenced by the context of reading/viewing as well as previous access to alternative discourses they may be drawn upon in their responses. In Chapter Three, I address this issue of available discourses, particularly in reference to Jenkins's conceptualization of fans as 'textual poachers' (Jenkins 1992).

While these studies are over 15 years old, there are many questions raised here that may be revisited and expanded in relation to the analysis of the cross-media texts and practices. Many studies of literacy practices in the context of education research continue to examine reading practices with popular series fiction without a rigorous assessment of the media context of the texts. For example, Mary Napoli's recent ethnographic study in the field of education focuses on girls' meaning-making with
mary-kateandashley brand books (2004). Napoli primarily addresses the social and identification functions of these texts (i.e. how the girls in her study see the Olsens as role models and use them to negotiate a sense of self). However, although she discusses the positioning of readers as consumers through the branding of the books, her analysis provides only brief plot summaries of the various books that the participants engage with in her study, and only alludes to the ways these girls might engage with other media texts and products. Although the issues raised are similar to the experiences of identification some of the participants in my study experienced, these analyses would gain from a social semiotic analysis of various cross-media texts and the girls’ engagements across media texts as well as the print texts. The following sections review research that examines girls’ reading practices in relation to media texts such as magazines and comics.

2.3.3 Research on girls’ magazines and comics

There are a number of research studies rooted in cultural studies and feminist theory that focus on girls’ reading of magazines and comics. In this section, I address a number of these studies of in terms of their relationship to my research on cross-media texts and practices. The work of Valerie Walkerdine, Angela McRobbie, and Dawn Currie provide distinct approaches to their examination of the girls’ meaning making with texts.

Angela McRobbie’s *Feminism and Youth Culture* (1977) and Christine Griffin’s *Typical Girls? Young Women from School to the Full-time Job Market* (1985) may be perceived as among the first notable studies of girls’ cultures that emerged from the Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies in the UK. Significantly, McRobbie’s analysis
of *Jackie* magazine (1977/1991) places reading practices around popular media texts, particularly girls’ magazines, in the context of “powerful ideological forces” (1991: 236). She argues, “each magazine, newspaper or comic has its own conventions and its own style. But within these conventions, and through them, a concerted effort is nevertheless made to win and shape the consent of the readers to a particular set of values” (1991: 235). She elucidates the role of these magazines in reflecting the appropriate development stages of heteronormative middle class womanhood. These stages are spelled out through a series of magazines targeted for different age groups from *Bunty* to *House and Home* (1991: 236). This developmental progression is paralleled in series fiction for girls, for example, demarcated in the Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen series books by the progressive ages of the twins as they are represented on the covers of distinct series. McRobbie further argues “the way *Jackie* addresses girls as a grouping...asserts a class-less, race-less sameness, a kind of false unity which assumes a common experience of womanhood or girlhood” (1991: 236). Thus, the magazine builds normative meanings connected to age and gender addressing “all girls” as an audience.

McRobbie explores how *Jackie’s* design from visual material to layout “facilitates and encourages partial and uneven reading” and not unlike the romance novels of Radway’s study “each feature consists of workings and reworking of a relatively small repertoire of specific themes or concerns which sum up the girls’ world...the terrain of the personal” (1991: 240-241). Repetition and redundancy of meanings are common and important features of advertisement and media texts of all kinds, from soap operas to video games. These elements are also characteristic of children’s books focused on younger readers and series books (romance and others) that are based on a formula and a familiar pattern that will be anticipated by readers. The
significance of repetition across media and particularly in its role in early childhood play and learning must be drawn into this discussion. Work on the role of ritual in popular culture texts for younger children's literacy practices has begun to make these connections (Marsh 2005), and it would be interesting to nuance research on preadolescent girls' reading with the cohesive threads that are evident in many of these practices.

Nevertheless, McRobbie goes on to state that unlike other youth subcultures, girls "play little, if any, role in shaping their own pop culture and their choice in consumption is materially extremely narrow. Indeed the forms made available to them make re-appropriation difficult" (1991: 238). Although she admits that girls may use or read Jackie in subversive ways, McRobbie stands quite firmly on the structure over agency side of the debate in the study of girls and media. Moreover, within McRobbie's Marxist frame (heavily influenced by Althusser), Jackie is seen as a commodity of leisure, necessary for capitalist society to move forward; a consumer object itself that promotes further consumption (McRobbie 1991: 239). Notably, in response to research and critique of her study that followed (Barker 1989; Frazer 1987), as well as changes in the magazines themselves, McRobbie revisited her analysis to reveal a more nuanced perspective on girls' engagements with texts (McRobbie 1991; 1999). However, her earlier study continues to be a significant touchstone as an early study of girls' popular texts and cultures, and has inspired newer studies of girls' magazines and their associated reading practices (Currie 1999 reviewed in this section; Kehily 1999).

Valerie Walkerdine's research on preadolescent girls and popular culture texts in "Someday my prince will come" in Schoolgirl Fictions (1991) and Daddy's Girl: Young Girls and Popular Culture (1997) provides multi-faceted examinations of girls'
engagement with popular culture texts that draws on psychology, psychoanalysis, sociology, ethnography and autobiography. She connects ethnographies of girls at school, with textual analysis using psychoanalytic frames, and self-reflexive theorized memoirs of her own girlhood. She argues that the eroticization of the working-class girl involves an inscription by popular culture “as one who can make a transformation, which is also a self-transformation, which is also a seductive allure” (1991: 263). In *Schoolgirl Fictions* (1991), Walkerdine links the narratives in *Bunty* and *Tracey* to the Anglo-American tradition of orphan comic stories beginning with Harold Gray’s *Little Orphan Annie* which first appeared in 1924. In Walkerdine’s reading, in Shirley Temple’s film roles as classic girl heroines in *The Little Princess* and *Heidi*, Temple was often positioned by the film producers as a vehicle to “charm the hearts of the rich to make the support charity in the middle of the depression” (1991: 23). Walkerdine’s examples related to Shirley Temple and *Little Orphan Annie* provide valid observations about the representation of working-class young girls within Cinderella rags-to-riches narratives. Nevertheless, Walkerdine quickly dismisses the upper and middle class female viewer’s engagement with these Cinderella narratives. She states: “[s]uch a transformation is necessarily no part of middle-class discourse, fantasy and aspiration. Rather, childhood for the middle-class is a state to be preserved free from economic intrusion” (1991: 263).

This may be one middle-class child rearing discourse that certainly could be investigated within a specific historical or cultural context. However, to generalize about both the working-class girl and middle-class girl’s engagement with the transformative narrative seems problematic. Moreover, while Walkerdine’s focus on only one or two girls in her analysis on the one hand allows for a descriptive and extensive investigation of girls’ engagement with popular culture texts, her audience research tends to lead into
autobiographical theorizing. While she is self-reflective about her subjectivity, Walkerdine’s analyses raise a number of questions about the agency of girls to express their voices within the research context as well as in other realms.

Dawn Currie’s recent study of girls’ magazine reading (1999) attempts to fill in the gaps of McRobbie’s studies by pairing sociological content analysis with a semiotic analysis of texts. Similar to Radway, Currie argues that she wishes to explore teen magazines as “discourse rather than simply as cultural objects” moving “beyond the text itself to its reading” (118). However, while her study attempts to balance audience and textual analysis, she does not include detailed discussions of the way social context, in peer groups or with a researcher present may inform the way the girls speak about the magazines. The strengths of the study arise from her focus on disjunctures between the girls’ interests and the common practices of researchers. For example, her content analysis of beauty ads was deemed of less value when the girls’ engagements exemplified their interest in the writing in the magazine, particularly advice columns and articles.

Although Currie discusses the girls’ reading of magazines, particularly advice columns and embarrassing moment features as group experiences with friends, Currie’s study (as well as analyses by McRobbie and Walkerdine) tend to lack rigorous analysis of the dynamics of an ‘interpretive community’ (Fish 1980). Many of these studies allude to the importance of the shared group experience for reading magazines and other popular culture texts; however, they do not analyze in detail the discursive exchanges at hand during these sharing sessions. An approach to conversation discourse analysis or an interpretive approach to children’s role play (Corsaro 1993) for the examination of peer-group meaning making with texts would be usefully integrated to nuance the analysis of
the social dynamics of the adolescent participants in tandem with Currie’s analyses of the
textual design of magazines.

2.3.4 Research on tween girls and cross-media cultures

Within the cross-disciplinary framework of girls’ studies, diverse research examines the texts and practices, global and local implications, of girl culture. One example of this movement is the volume *Growing Up Girls: Popular culture and the construction of identity* (Mazzarella and Pecora 1999) that includes chapters on different girl artefacts and texts in American popular culture including Barbie, teen romance novels, teen magazines, feminine hygiene advertising, American Girl dolls, and popular literature. While a range of studies and articles address the examples of playful engagements by preadolescent girls (particularly in peer groups) with films, television and other cultural texts (Richards 1993, 1995; Russell and Tyler 2002), Rebekah Willett’s chapter “Constructing the Digital Tween: Market Discourse and Girls’ Interests” (2005) raises a number of key issues regarding the online cultures of preadolescent girls - both those websites geared for them and the online engagements they choose themselves. As observed in the introduction to the thesis, examinations of the texts and cultures in relation to tween girlhood continue to be rare.

In relation to digital cultures, various researchers have completed discourse and social semiotic analyses of websites related to girls’ media culture (Davies 2006; Duncan and Leander 2000; Mitchell and Reid-Walsh 2002). In addition, a number of key recent studies extensively examine the role of adolescent girls as producers of cultural texts including the digital fan practices and cultures (Thomas 2007), and the films, zines and websites produced by girls (Kearney 2006). However, Willett’s examination is relevant
to my research in a number of ways. Willett’s chapter is distinct as it examines the
practices of preadolescent girls in terms of the discourse articulated by the websites as
well as the social engagement around these online representations. Moreover, her
discussion of the girls’ engagement as fans on the Eastenders website reflects the
significant social role of these sites in the contexts of both the (physically situated) peer
groups and the digital communities of fans.

Willett observes that the girls in her study did not find the tween-only sites
“particularly captivating” and instead liked to “play around” on different sites (283). For
the tween texts in my research, official websites, similar to the Eastenders site, play a
significant role in representing the origin text, providing supplementary information, and
encouraging fandom through interactive games and features. In addition, the
preadolescent participants in my pilot and fieldwork study were more interested in
finding interactive play online rather than a specific site linked to a particular text or
brand. However, a number of questions are triggered here with regards to the
transferability of research on tweens from one context to another. Willett concludes that
identity construction for this age group is contradictory and often dependent upon social
context as exemplified in the observations of girls in her study (291). How can we extend
this conclusion related to online behaviour to engagements with and across other types of
media? How is the social environment around literature discussions different than the
social dynamic of a computer lab or engagements in an online community? Do certain
modes and media provide opportunities for alternative possibilities for identity?

In the context of the cross-media worlds of this study, the franchise texts present
various venues to engage with books and films. In addition, fans become active
producers of online texts, sometimes poems, photo-collages, creative writing, soundtrack
related listings, and gossip sites. Similarly active and productive online fandom related to television shows, films and video games has been examined by a number of researchers (Burn 2006; Mackey 2004). For all current examinations of young people’s texts and cultures, even those focused on print texts, it is important to address digital cultures as most publishers, authors, and production companies increasingly use digital venues to promote their books.

Moreover, an examination of the reading practices of preadolescent girls across media must take into account research regarding girls and their online engagements. Research that explores the relationships between gender, identity within viewing, playing and consuming practices are useful for framing an examination of multi-modal literacy cultures. It is important to take into account recent changes in technology that influence viewing practices and increasingly merge them with online engagements. In addition, mobile and wireless technologies have influenced the distinct physical and social contexts for viewing. Moreover, the extensive special features of DVDs, and online viewing of television shows, animated films, and music videos on computers, mobile phones and portable music players has shifted how and where children view television and film texts.

2.3.5 Research on girls and consumer cultures

This research examines cross-media discourse in relation to highly profitable, globally distributed, popular cross-media franchises. Thus, this literature review will also examine research that particularly focuses on the commercialization of children’s media culture. The construction of children as consumers is a rich subject for investigation. Most analyses on young people as consumers chart commercial shifts and the potential
effects on education, play, and entertainment (Kline 1993; Seiter 1993; Steinberg and Kincheloe 1997). Other research studies in the realm of cultural and media studies provide critical analyses that frame the texts and social practices of youth cultures in the context of popular culture and corporate politics (Kinder 1999; Mallan and Pearce 2003). Another segment of research examines the role of globalization and the distribution of these products (and their embedded discourses) throughout the global market (Kenway and Bullen 2001; Nayak and Kehily 2008).

Some historians have examined evidence of consumer culture of children before the 20th century. In an article “The Child in the Visual Culture of Consumption 1790-1830” (2006), Patricia Crown examines Rudolph Ackermann’s illustrated book *The New Doll* (1826) and observes that upper middle class women in the early 19th century “were encouraged to express themselves in the private sphere by buying things for their houses and children. A child who was seen to have everything, especially the newest of everything, shows its parent’s success” (Crown 63). Crown’s analysis finds that children are positioned as both prospective consumers and evidence of economic status for their mothers. A number of research studies, primarily from a sociological and ethnographic perspective, have examined the role of fashion and consumer culture in shaping girls’ identity (Malik 2005; Russell and Taylor 2002). More specific to my focus on the discursive construction of tween girlhood, a study by Dan Cook and Susan Kaiser (2004) traces the current marketing and merchandising category of tween to a history of discourses around the preadolescent consumer in the children's clothing industry since the 1940s. Their examination addresses historical trade publications in their role in the creation of an ambiguous and aspirational social identity and the use of fashion to negotiate this age category. Following a similar approach as Cook and Kaiser, in Chapter
Five I trace discourses around tween girlhood that are rooted in cultural representations primarily in fictional print texts aimed at and for girls rather than commercial culture texts. The examination focuses on how cross-media narratives re-articulate these literary discourses.

Other research relevant to this study is work that examines the role of commercial culture in practices of identity construction of preadolescents themselves. While these practices have been extensively theorized for adolescent identity as well as adult identity, the role of commodities in the social identities of children have only begun to be theorized, primarily by Marsha Kinder (1991) and Ellen Seiter (1993). Seiter’s *Sold Separately: Children and Parents in Consumer Culture* (1993) continues to be a useful text in an examination of gendered trends in consumer culture for young children as well as the broader cultural linkages between marketing, toys, children’s literature, television, videos and domestic cultures. Seiter observes the segmentation of home video in the 1980s which first developed young girls as a separate audience and thus niche market. Although these video series such as *Strawberry Shortcake* challenged conventions of children’s stories of the twentieth century which were dominated by active male protagonists, Seiter observes that “something was gained and lost when marketers and video producers began exploiting little girls as a separate market” (157-8).

Seiter discusses the role of consumer culture in the contemporary social lives of children: “Consumer culture provides children with a shared repository of images, characters, plots, and themes: it proves the basis for small talk and play, and it does this on a national, even global scale (297). She also observes how “children make meanings out of toys that are unanticipated by- perhaps indecipherable to- their adult designers”, and, referencing British anthropologist Daniel Miller’s work on material culture (1987),
she argues that the significance of cultural artefacts lies in “their active participation in a process of social self-creation” (Seiter 299). However, the purpose of Seiter’s book is to explore the broader cultural and historical context of children’s consumer culture, and thus, outside of a number of intriguing anecdotes, she does not extensively investigate the individualized engagements of children with these cultural objects.

Current research that connects identity, literacy and popular culture texts often involve the elementary school and early childhood education context. These recent studies attend to issues of personalized use and engagement with popular culture in the localized practices of the home and school. Anne Haas Dyson’s research, which took place at schools in California, exemplifies how children use popular culture texts to mediate between literacy cultures of home, school and peer-groups (Dyson 1997; 2003). Her ethnographic studies examine the significance of peer relationships in literacy practices. She discusses how stories written by children in her study employ superheroes from popular culture in combination with the use of classmates as characters. Her study reflects how literacy texts and practices mediate social negotiations of race, class and gender in group settings (Dyson 1997). Dyson’s research elucidates the significance of the dynamic relationships between popular culture, literacy and identity.

Research on the relationships between popular culture, new media and digital literacy in early childhood are addressed in a selection of research papers edited by Jackie Marsh (2005). Building on earlier work on using popular culture in the classroom context (with Millard 2000), Marsh’s own chapter in this 2005 volume examines the findings from two extensive studies of home-based media-related literacies in England, drawing on questionnaires, field note observations, and interviews with parents and children aged two to four. Marsh draws from a number of theoretical frames from
psychology, sociology, anthropology and post-structural theories of identity as a ‘self-in-practice’ in her analysis of the interrelated roles of play and material culture texts in the practices of young children (2005: 28).

Marsh envisions these artefacts and texts of popular culture as significant mediators of identity development and draws on a number of distinct research studies to apply to her analysis of literacy practice and identity (including Dyson 1997) through an examination of “the dynamic synergy” between the elements of self, others, literacy and identity (Marsh 2005: 33). Marsh extends research in literacy beyond children’s engagement with books, to an examination of affiliated texts and products. For example, Marsh employs a diagram to illustrate one girl’s texts and artefacts related to “the narrative web” of Winnie the Pooh (36). The extensive range of texts in this diagram includes: an umbrella, computer game, books, video, hot water bottle cover and nightdress among other items. Alluding to Dyson (2003), she argues, “moving across modalities, children encounter key interruptions and questions which force them to reconsider perceptions and accommodate new learning about these semiotic systems” (37). However, in both Marsh’s discussion of the texts of Winnie the Pooh and later another boy’s interactions with Thomas the Tank Engine, she focuses on one textual aspect, generally the home video or toy, and its relationship to identity development, rather than examining how children make meaning across or with a combination of these texts.

Marsh leaves the reader wondering how the children in her study “explore the affordances of various modes” through the same narrative (2005: 37). Even her diagram does not allude to the possible roles or relationships of the different texts and artefacts. A central methodological challenge in my research is to make connections between the
identity play and performance with popular culture texts observed by Marsh and Dyson, and the trans-media analyses across texts (Burn 2004; Mackey 2002). I discuss these cross-media methodologies in the final section of the literature review.

2.3.6 Conclusion to cultural and media studies and girlhood studies

There are a number of gaps in the study of girls’ reading practices in cultural studies. Jenkins (1992) notes in terms of fandom that “while some fans remain exclusively committed to a single show or star many others use individual series as points of entry into a broader fan community linking to an intertextual network composed of many programs, films, books, comics, and other popular materials” (40). A related gap in research on girls’ reading practices is a need for more research that traces the continuity of girls’ interactions with these texts across modes, transferring the reading practices and discursive meaning making from magazine reading to popular fiction to romance films and back. My study of tween girlhood aims to bring theories of multimodality and cross-media play to the analysis of girls’ cultures. The application of cross-media issues to the study of girlhood texts and cultures provides the opportunity to view the key issues of agency and power for girls within dominant popular and consumer culture contexts.

2.4 Multiliteracies and New Literacies approaches to cross-media cultures

This part of the review examines research that applies theoretical frames and methodology from social semiotics, reader response theory, and psychology to the examination of cross-media texts and practices. I first discuss the emergence of the field of ‘multiliteracies’ and New Literacies studies and the gaps in research that focus on
cross-media meaning-making (New London Group 2000; Lankshear and Knobel 2007). Through a review of earlier theories of reader-response and text-focused research that examines the convergence of visual and written texts in picture books for younger children, I conclude this section with an assessment of research that specifically examines how young people read or play across different modes and media.

2.4.1 The emergence of multiliteracies

The increasing significance of digital media technologies, on a local and global scale, in social and professional realms has impacted literacy research greatly, resulting in an expanded definition of literacy that accounts for a diverse range of practices across social contexts. This new definition of literacy is both socially situated and involves the integration of multiple modes. Recent research in the New Literacy Studies and the field of multiliteracies exemplifies this definition and a new agenda for literacy education research and practice (Barton and Hamilton 1998; Cope and Kalantzis 2000; New London Group 1996). A proliferation of related research projects in this research field often draw from earlier research related to media literacy and television literacy. Many of these newer projects often reapply methodology and theoretical frames from earlier research to the study of digital literacies, media literacies, visual literacies, critical literacies (among others) with varying degrees of success. In light of these trends, popular tween franchises demand an analysis that takes into account the role of these cross-media practices in the articulation of textual meanings.

As discussed in the introduction to this thesis, the expanded definition of literacy proposed by New Literacies researchers provides a starting point for the analysis of these forms of cross-media meaning-making. Within this framework, literacy is defined as
socially and culturally constituted; as well as incorporating the texts, practices, and spaces that incorporate emerging new technologies (Barton and Hamilton 1998; Cope and Kalantzis 2000). New Literacies are also often defined in terms of the use of new technical affordances in ways that are "participatory", "collaborative", and "distributed" (Lankshear and Knobel 2007: 9). Within this definition the cross-media practices of multimodal design and cross-media play examined in this study are defined as New Literacies. This section of the review attempts to address studies from various disciplines that address cross-media and multimodal texts and practices.

Multiliteracies research and practice is often influenced by reader-response theory in its vision of the meaning-making process. Reader-response theory has played a significant role in children's literature criticism, literacy education as well as literature teaching. One fundamental text in reader-response theory is Louise Rosenblatt's *Literature as Exploration*, first published in 1938. Central to Rosenblatt's argument is her description of a reader's response to literature as a "lived through experience". This view of reading involves the "creation of a dynamic, alternative reality-one that requires the active participation of even, performance of the reader" (Rogers T.: 1999: 140). Although it directly addresses the experience of the reader, in many ways reader response theory continues a romantic and liberal humanist thread in children's literature criticism that has been heavily influential in literacy education.

Work related to reader-response theory (including and often inspired by Rosenblatt) aims to negotiate two stances that may exist for the reader: the *aesthetic* (personal, spontaneous and emotional) stance and the *efferent* (critical, analytical) stance. Moreover, Rosenblatt coined the term "the poem" to "refer to the whole category of aesthetic transactions between readers and texts" (Rosenblatt 1970: 12). Rosenblatt sees
the transactions between reader and text as "an event in time" where "under the magnetism of the ordered symbols of the text, he [the reader] marshals his resources and crystallizes out from the stuff of memory, thought, and feeling a new order, a new experience (1970: 12). *The Cool Web: The Pattern of Children's Reading* by Margaret Meek et al. (1977) exemplifies examinations of these reader-text transactions informed by reader-response theory including papers from literary critics, psychologists, authors and educators. *Where Texts and Children Meet*, edited by Eve Bearne and Victor Watson (2000) also exemplifies the continued influence of reader response theory on literacy education research. This thread of research is rooted in a discourse that continues to articulate a romanticized and Leavisite perception that print texts provide an authentic, meaningful (and often magical) experience that is superior to engagements with other media texts.

The works of reader response theorists [for example, Wolfgang Iser's *The Act of Reading: A Theory of Aesthetic Response* (1978)] have also been adapted to understand reading of other media. For example, a recent paper by Elise Tonnessen called "Practices of Reading: On Paper and Screen" (2005) applies Wolfgang Iser's notion of a text as a "response-inviting structure" to children's reading of text on the Internet (Tonnessen 276). On the one hand these applications draw cohesive threads between our interactions with different texts, while on the other hand they need to critically acknowledge the similarities and distinctions in the contexts of the reading practice.

In her introduction to the edited volume *Art, Narrative and Childhood* (2003) Eve Bearne calls for 'an integrated theory of text' that takes into account changes on the part of texts as well as the way children in the 21st century 'read' texts. Bearne proposes an integrated theory of reading that takes into account both reception of texts and production
of texts. Beame's introduction exemplifies significant steps forward in children's literature criticism in its relationship to literacy education. However, language and literacy education research and practice informed by reader response theory, including current research in multiliteracies, is often rooted in a romanticized notion of a magically infused relationship between text and reader, neutralizing the social practices at hand in the production and consumption of cultural texts. After critiquing the romanticization of children's reading and children's literature from earlier representations and research, Beame transfers a similar discourse of idealized childhood imagination and play to young readers' engagement with new media and multimedia texts.

2.4.2 Approaches to picture books and image-text relations

While predominantly print-based texts in children's literature tend to lack analysis of the design and non-print modes at hand, texts geared at very young children, namely 'picture books' demand an analytical approach that addresses the visual element of the text to some extent. In the context of cross-media worlds, conceptualizations of the picture book as a multimodal experience may be relevant. Moreover, research studies on picture books offer some methodological possibilities for studying cross-media worlds.

The picture book poses a difficult research dilemma for children's literature criticism. On the one hand these books are geared towards very young readers and are positioned by literary theorists in the field of early education, developmental play and language acquisition research. However, on the other hand, many picture books are designed, written and illustrated by established professional artists often rooted from the tradition of classically trained painters and print-makers. Similarly, experimental graphic designers often create sophisticated avant-garde or post-modern picture books. In
response to this range, the study of picture books for younger readers has its own subgroup of analyses on the subject in the field of literary criticism. Much criticism tends to replace the analysis of the structures of literature with the compositional elements of visual art.

There are a number of studies that explore picture book texts through semiotic frames as well as with more psychological and language acquisition interests. Many of these picture book analyses, particularly studies interested in the dynamic interaction between illustration and text, provide methodologies that may be applied to texts for older readers. Most research focused on picture books is related to empirical studies of children’s interactions with visual and verbal systems towards language acquisition. Perry Nodelman (1988) and Maria Nikolajeva and Carole Scott (2001) explore the word/image interactions in children’s picture books in order to create a vocabulary for describing them. Many of these picture book analyses examine the picture book text as a whole artefact, including the visual, textual and paratextual elements such as the title page, covers and endpapers (Nicolajeva and Scott 72-73). While children’s literature texts for older readers are generally analyzed in terms of literary styles and features, social semiotic methods of analysis have been applied to picture books for young readers (Hornberg 2004; Lewis 2001). Analyses of other multimodal texts such as comics have influenced the way researchers examine children’s picture books. *Understanding Comics* (1995) by Scott McCloud is influential in his application of social semiotics to understand how comic writers and readers make meanings from a visual design that combines the two distinct sign systems of written and visual modes.

David Lewis’s examination of contemporary picture books (2001) applies Kress and van Leeuwen’s visual grammar (1996) in an investigation of picture books. This
study may be applied to my research on multimodal children’s books for older readers. However, while these examinations explore understanding of how words and pictures may work together to make meanings, a critical analysis of the greater social and cultural context of these texts and/or the engagements of the reader are often excluded from the discussion. Lewis’s analysis instead attempts to apply the analogy of the picture book as an ecology in order to understand the semiotic interactions between visual and textual elements. The application of Kress and van Leeuwen for the analysis of picture books provide a useful way to approach cross-media texts in this study. In section 2.4.4, I review more recent work that applies social semiotic frames for the examination of cross-media texts and practices.

2.4.3 Reading media and playing across texts

A small selection of research studies addresses the adaptation of narratives across media and modes. While some work, such as Lewis’s study of picture books, focuses on the relationship between visual and textual modes, other work theorizes the textual adaptation of fictional narratives across media and modes (Hutcheon 2006). Another area of research compares the practices of ‘reading’ with the practices of engagement related to other media. For example, Muriel Robinson’s study (1997) compares the practices of reading print texts with the practices of television viewing. In the area of fan and media cultures, Henry Jenkins observes the convergence of cultures of production and consumption as a result of cross-media practices (Jenkins 2006). Margaret Mackey’s eclectic and cross-disciplinary research on children’s literature and literacies addresses all of these theoretical issues related to my research: the changing practices of engagement across media and modes as well as the cross-media adaptation of textual
narratives. Mackey's *The Case of Peter Rabbit: Changing Conditions of Literature for Children* (1998) provides an extensive examination of the historical context of production and the numerous textual incarnations of Beatrix Potter's *Peter Rabbit* from the original to collectible figurines to the CD-ROM. Mackey's analysis of one text, over time and media, exemplifies the strengths in using textual case studies to examine historical, social, cultural and economic influences on textual meaning. Mackey's focus is on shifts in meanings, particularly the overarching message of the narrative, as it moves from one adaptation to another to express the producer's agenda. She also raises some interesting points regarding marketing the author (Beatrix Potter) versus the characters (Peter Rabbit) across texts which may be useful for my examination of tween texts.

Mackey's tone is primarily descriptive in her textual analyses with a focus on the form and design of the different texts. Following the approach of children's literature criticism, Mackey examines how various textual adaptations of Beatrix Potter's *Peter Rabbit* (1902) address an implied child reader. However, her criteria for her analysis of these texts is not articulated explicitly. She also evaluates adaptations with a preference for the original text. For example, she responds quite negatively to drastic changes that move away from the original intent of the text. Although her examination is extensive, it does not take into account the affordances and/or limitations of each media text.

Although her analysis exemplifies the possibility of analysis across a textual franchise, audience responses would provide an informative counterpoint to the textual evaluation of the cross-media texts.

Mackey's *Literacies across media* (2002) examines the impact of cross-media influences on how young readers make meaning. Although, the study took place 1997-
1999 with young people aged 10-14, and the technologies she discusses such as electronic books and DVDs, have in the last five years changed dramatically in efficiency, popularity and usage, her methodology, theoretical frame and focus for the examination are significant to my own research. In this research project, Mackey attempts to reconcile the interrelationships between media and literature in the reading lives of young people. Mackey uses a range of current texts: novels, a picture book, a short story, movies on both video and DVD, computer games, texts in electronic book form, as well as an encyclopaedia and a picture book on CD-ROM (2002: 18). Although there may have been multiple versions of the texts, she was not specifically interested in interactions with distinct versions of the same story as in her Peter Rabbit study. Instead she was interested in the distinct ways children read different media. To what extent a researcher may gain access to the internal process of a reader’s decoding process continues to be a contentious issue.

Mackey views literacy as a social practice and focuses on the recreational use of texts across media. However, in her study, the distinct literacy activities do not always seem recreational. While participants leisurely played computer games in pairs for the analysis of one media form, in order to construct a reading activity with print texts that requires the active response of the reader, she asks participants to read a story and mark words silently. This reading practice is markedly different as a social activity than the act of playing computer games in pairs. Although this provided an “active’ engagement with the book, it also implies a school-type literacy activity rather than a recreational one. This methodological question at hand here is: is there a way of constructing an activity that may be done across media and that will account for the distinct social contexts of literacy practices?
Mackey’s study proposes a useful theoretical frame to examine interactions across texts; however, in her focus on the notion of ‘playing the text’ (2002) in relation to a variety of media and modes, she pays less attention to simultaneous mixed usage of texts or multimodal engagement with the same text. While Mackey’s work is cross-disciplinary in nature, the gaps in her examinations, as in other research in literary criticism and literacy education, are rooted in her need to maintain critical judgements about the texts. She often examines multimodality through a literature-focused lens rather than examining books in the context of cultural and media studies frames. Although she applies theories about play and cognitive psychology to the reading of a number of media, she continues to argue for the concept of the children’s book as a unique and separate kind of text. Moreover, although Mackey alludes to gender and other identity issues, she does not explicitly examine or explore the gendered aspects of literacy as a social practice. For example she observes that in the initial stage of the study, more girls than boys voluntarily and extensively completed their at-home journal of recreational media usage. While she focuses on issues of salience and accessibility in participants’ response to the texts and general interest in the project, she does not investigate these issues in detail or unpack them for social meanings.

Building on her useful conceptualization of ‘playing the text’ (2002), Mackey’s recent study of the recreational ‘thick play’ practices of young adults (2007) provides an important theoretical frame for my analysis of cross-media worlds. This theory of ‘thick play’ is defined and expanded in the theoretical framework outlined in Chapter Three.

2.4.4 Social semiotics and multimodal texts
Language and literacy research rooted in the study of social semiotics examines the composite or multimodal forms that are characteristic of information and communication technologies. Gunther Kress and Theo van Leeuwen’s (1996) theories of multimodality and visual grammar for the analysis of textual meanings are applied to the analysis of distinct multimodal texts from science textbooks to web pages. Notably, theories of multimodality have been developed in relation to analytical issues raised by hypermodality and distributed narratives (Lemke 2005; Leander and McKim 2003).

While I situate my research within this new pluralized literacies movement, it is important to explore both the similarities and differences between engagement with specific media texts (for example television viewing) and the reading of multimodality across a range of associated media texts. This part of the literature review will assess recent research that specifically examines or gives methodological insight to how children read across modes within the same text and across media within the same textual franchise.

Andrew Burn and David Parker’s Analysing Media Texts (2003) provides an accessible and practical methodological frame for analysis of multimodal media texts. Rooted in Kress and van Leeuwen’s visual grammar (1996), as well as adapting earlier applications of semiotics to children’s television (Hodge and Tripp 1986), Burn and Parker apply a social semiotic frame for analysis to a number of different texts across media including: websites, student-produced digital videos, a video game and an audience response to a film. Compared to Robert Hodge and David Tripps’s complicated (and jargon-heavy) semiotic analysis of television cartoons aimed at young viewers (1986), I find Burn and Parker provide a useful frame to analyze multimodal texts according to representational, compositional and orientational metafunctions. While
many audience studies are descriptive and brief in their discussion of texts before diving into the audience discourse, this framework provides a rigorous method of analysing text that takes into account the potential readings of the viewer. This is particularly evident in Burn and Parker’s website and video analyses. Moreover, the analysis of the hybrid modality of the *Harry Potter* video game is both rigorous and clear in its analysis of a text that employs two modes (in this case ludic and narrative).

This approach to multimodal texts may be easily adapted for my textual analysis of multimodal tween texts; however, Burn and Parker’s approach leave room for improvement, particularly in the combined analysis of textual and audience data. For example, Burn and Parker examine one teenager’s response to the film *Hannibal* (2001). Although the analysis provides a structure for analysis that may run beside a textual analysis, in terms of a rigorous examination of discourse it requires further expansion. Moreover, the focus on the representational and orientational functions of the text seems to overlook a number of compositional points. Similar to Hodge and Tripp, the analyses of audience and text are separated, and are not integrated for an overall understanding of the viewing experience. This application of social semiotics to the reading of narrative and ludic cultures is expanded in recent work on computer games (Carr, Buckingham, Burn, and Schott 2006).

Burn’s article “Potterliteracy: Cross-Media Narratives, Cultures, and Grammars” (2004) comes closest to my research in terms of an examination of the same textual narrative across media and modes as well as the response to these texts by young people. Burn argues in reference to the *Harry Potter* book series phenomenon and its many textual incarnations across film, video game and merchandise, “we can no longer afford to see literature as an entirely distinct mode and culture, with its own distinct literacy”
(2004: 5). Moreover, he observes that “[w]e need to think, then, how different literacies come into play, how they connect, what they have in common. We also need to consider how these are located in the context of children’s contemporary media cultures – the games they play, the films and TV programmes they watch, the comics they read” (2004: 5). He wishes to examine a micro-level moment in this cross-media phenomenon in order to understand broader meanings.

He examines one specific moment in the book, film and video game of Harry Potter and the Chamber of Secrets and combines this textual analysis with observations and interviews with 11- and 12-year-old children. As my research employs a similar model of analysis across media texts for the same narrative, many of the elements of Burn’s analysis are useful in terms of understanding meaning-making across different texts, although there are gaps in this approach in the analysis of discursive negotiations and constructions of identity. As in the analysis of an adolescent boy’s response to Hannibal (Burn and Parker 2003), Burn regards the texts and the children’s talk “as one semiotic and cultural continuum, which can be analysed using the same framework. The children’s engagement, response, interpretation will be viewed as a cultural and social process; but it will also be viewed as a semiotic transformation of texts” (Burn 2004: 7).

A strength of the analysis is the focus on one particular scene and how this one scene may act as a lens for a broader discussion of meaning shifts across media and connections to historically rooted themes from children’s literature. Another strength of the analysis lies in its organizational structure that places the children’s talk alongside each metafunction of the texts. However, in structuring the discussion this way, Burn focuses only on the aspects of the children’s discussion that relates to the related elements of the texts. While this type of analysis is rich in understanding shifts across
media forms, the analysis of audience may be problematic in terms of an examination that wishes to present a more detailed account of meaning making by an individual child in relation to their own identity and how this is represented in their discussion about the text.

In addition, using the metafunctions to explore more than one discursive theme alongside changes in the text across media proves to be a limiting factor in the analysis. For example, an exchange quoted between Ogedei and Iona over whether the goodness of Harry Potter's character makes him likeable might elucidate other opportunities for analysis of social dynamics of the texts across media and mode. While Iona thinks that “You have to keep Harry as nice as possible” Ogedei remarks that “he’s like a teacher’s pet”, arguing that Harry would be more likeable if he could “get better spell” (Burn 2004: 9). While Burn briefly discusses the “tendency for boys to distance themselves from Harry’s ‘goodness’ subverting it by demands for violence or toughness,” further discussion of these issues of gendered readings and performances in groups as well as how the text constructs the hero in a certain way to appeal to a cross-gendered audience, are outside of the frame of this discussion. However, the social semiotic analysis structure exemplified here provides a number of possibilities for a discursive analysis of both text and audience of cross-media narratives (2004: 9). Moreover, while Burn discusses the affordances of each text for viewers, confirmed by the children’s discussion, he does not particularly situate these texts in terms of their role in the whole textual franchise, as different types of commodities with different niche markets or how these distinct texts work with or against each other to reach different types of readers, players and viewers, different age groups, or assumed gender preferences. This type of
analysis must be expanded to explore how children might use these texts in different contexts and social functions.

2.4.5 Conclusion to multiliteracies and New Literacies approaches

In a chapter (2008) addressing the potential for multimodal methodology in the analysis of both texts and audiences, Andrew Burn observes that "[N]o full project has connected a semiotic analysis of media texts with research into the cultures of those who produced them and those who received them" (2008: 152). This analysis of the cross-media worlds of tween franchises illustrates a case study approach to the challenge of connecting audience and textual data within a theory of multimodal discourse and design. A key challenge in this study is that within a social semiotic analysis of multimodal design, it is difficult to provide an analysis that is focused (in its analysis of the specific design of discourse) and yet broad in scope (in order to address the flow of meanings across various articulations of discourse). As addressed in this section of the literature review, within the area of multiliteracies and New Literacies, these challenges are grappled with in a variety of ways. In my analyses in Chapter Five and Six, I integrate a theory of cross-media play with a theory of multimodal discourse and design in order to capture both the micro-analysis of specific articulations of discourse with a macro-analysis of practices that occur around these cross-media worlds.

2.5 Conclusion of the Literature Review

My literature review addresses relevant research and approaches from the fields of children's literature criticism, girls' studies, multiliteracies and New Literacies. While literary scholars have studied the popular texts of young girls, many of these studies
constitute historical accounts or textual analyses of the representation of girls and femininity. While all of these examinations offer insight into the representation and discursive construction of girlhood, they usually do not address the role of the text as a design object and the cultural and social contexts in which they are produced and consumed. For example, only a select number of literary analyses address the significance of cover design to target a certain kind of readership or the ways young people engage with these texts within informal social spaces both inside and outside of school contexts (See Richards 2007). Moreover, only a few examinations that are framed by cultural and media studies approaches address the media cultures that surround children’s and young adult literature (e.g. Marshall 2009; Richards 2008).

A number of studies have used a cultural or media studies frame to study the texts, cultures and practices related to preadolescent and adolescent girls. Within the realm of cultural studies, the sub-areas of girlhood studies and children’s media culture have emerged as specialized areas of study drawing upon multidisciplinary approaches. This review highlights some key research on the popular fiction, film, and digital cultures of preadolescent girls. However, gaps in cultural studies and girl studies research include studies that examine connections across media representations and practices i.e. how digital cultures may extend popular fiction reading and conversely how digital cultures may be heavily rooted in earlier representations. Moreover, research on cross-media texts elucidates changes in the power and agency of young readers/viewers in relation to these texts. This study also extends research on the cultures of young girls with the inclusion of analyses of discourse in both texts and audience engagements.

Researchers in the area of multiliteracies and the New Literacies have focused on multimodality, digital technologies, media literacies and gaming worlds in order to
expand notions of literacy to include new technologies and practices. Others have examined the role of popular culture texts in the literacy practices of young people in classroom settings. Most significant to my research is recent work that examines meaning-making across media adaptations of written texts. While many of these studies focus on multimodal texts as resources for identity work, this research expands this initial work with a focused analysis on the ways discourse may be articulated across media by producers and consumers.

Framed by theories of discourse, this study situates contemporary texts and practices in the current context of cross-media culture while connecting them to older media, practices and representations. This research attempts to reconcile approaches to texts and audiences, in order to complicate discourses around preadolescent girls as victims to a coercive and monolithic commercial media culture or the idealizations of young fans creatively producing fan productions using digital practices and cultures. In the following chapter (Chapter Three) I propose an integration of a theory of multimodal discourse and design with a theory of cross-media play in order to elucidate the articulation of competing discourses at various sites of a cross-media world.
CHAPTER THREE
THEORETICAL FRAME

3.1 Introduction to the theoretical frame

As described in the Introduction to this thesis, the focus of this study is twofold: first, to develop an interdisciplinary theoretical and methodological approach for the examination of discourses of tween girlhood articulated within cross-media worlds; and second, to apply this framework in the analysis of multimodal design and cross-media play in the articulation of these discourses. Thus, rather than a clear distinction between theory and methodology, the theoretical frame defined in this chapter is directly expanded through the methodologies and methods outlined in Chapter Four.

This chapter begins with the theory of tween girlhood as a discursive identity (3.2). The second section proposes a theory of identity as articulated and enacted through discourse-in-use (3.3). The third section focuses on the theory of discourse-in-use as articulated through multimodal design (3.4). The final section combines this theory of multimodal design with a theory of cross-media play (3.5).

3.2 Theory of discursive identity

In this study, identity is theorized within the post-modern frame posited by Stuart Hall, namely that identity is "the contextual and shifting understanding of 'who' we are in a particular social, cultural, and historic location" (Pomerantz 2006: 176). In an influential article on “The Question of Cultural Identity” (1992), Hall conceptualizes a post-modern self where the subject takes up multiple, fragmented and often contradictory identities:

The subject assumes different identities at different times, identities which are not
unified around a coherent 'self.' Within us are contradictory identities, pulling in different directions, so that our identifications are continually being shifted about.

(Hall 1992: 277)

Following this conceptualization of the post-modern subject, these multiple, shifting identities may be constituted and articulated through discourse at particular social, cultural and historic locations.

As will be elaborated in the following section (3.3), this study draws upon James Gee's broad definition of discourse as ways of being, thinking and perceiving the world, articulated at various sites through language and other modes of communication (Gee 2005: 22-23). The analysis focuses upon how tween girlhood is articulated and enacted through discourse in a number of ways. This study of tween girlhood is framed by recent work in girlhood studies by Aapola et.al (2005) that conceptualizes girlhood as:

constructed socially, rather than merely as a stage of life fixed by biological processes and programmed psychological development... girlhood as a site of both competing narratives and an experiential process grounded in historical, material, and discursive contexts. Girlhood is something that is both individually and collectively accomplished through participating in the social, material and discursive practices defining young femininity. (Aapola et.al 1)

Following this theoretical framework, girlhood may be defined as a discursive identity that is articulated through discourse in various cultural contexts. The term discursive identity may be defined as “the contextual and shifting understanding of ‘who’ we are” realized through the articulation of discourse (Pomerantz 2006:176). In this study, tween girlhood is examined as a discursive identity that is articulated through diverse modes and media within the context of a cross-media world.
3.3. Theory of discourse-in-use and identity

In this section of the theoretical frame, I outline how tween girlhood may be articulated through discourse-in-use in specific contexts. In *Archaeology of Knowledge* (1969), Michel Foucault defines discourse-in-use as a focus for examination: “We must be ready to receive every moment of discourse in its sudden irruption; in that punctuality in which it appears... Discourse must not be referred to the distant presence of the origin, but treated as and when it occurs” (2002: 28). Foucault’s theories of discourse are influential to most contemporary frames for the study of discourse-in-use; however, he does not provide a systematic methodological approach for the analysis of discourse-in-use. Thus, while I acknowledge the significant influence of Foucault’s theories on the study of discourse in various contexts, in order to focus my analysis, I frame my study with two specific theories of discourse-in-use: Gee’s theory of discourse-in-use (2005), and Kress and van Leeuwen’s theory of discourse and multimodal design (1996; 2001).

I draw upon James Gee’s theory of ‘discourse-in-use’ (2005) as a broad frame to understand this process. In *An Introduction to Discourse Analysis: Theory and Method* (2005), Gee defines the articulation of discourse through semiotic resources as the concept of ‘discourse-in-use’. This concept refers to “how language is used ‘on site’ to enact activities and identities” (Gee 2001: 7). Gee defines ‘language-in-use’ as ‘discourse’ with a ‘little d.’ Building on this definition of little d discourse, he further observes that:

activities and identities are rarely ever enacted through language alone...you use language and ‘other stuff’-ways of acting, interacting, feeling, believing, valuing, and using various sorts of objects, symbols, tools, and technologies- to recognize yourself and others as meaning and meaningful. (2001: 7)
Gee distinguishes between 'little d' discourse as 'language in use' with a definition of "big D discourse" as "language-in-use plus non-language stuff" (2001: 7). In this study, I closely examine how big D discourses articulate tween girlhood at various sites within a cross-media world. The following sections (3.4 and 3.5) explicate how multimodal design and cross-media play are specifically theorized as discursive practices that function to articulate big D discourses of tween girlhood. My use of the term 'discourse' in this thesis refers to the broader definition of big D discourse, namely "language-in-use-plus non-language stuff" (Gee 2001: 7). I do not use the term 'big D discourse' explicitly throughout the analysis, rather I focus on multimodal design and cross-media play as specific practices that articulate discourses. As will be elaborated in the following sections of the theoretical frame, multimodal design and cross-media play are theorized as discursive practices that play a role in the articulation of big D discourse at various sites.

Although the focus of my analysis is on multimodal design and cross-media play, I recognize that various other cultural literacy practices outside of the scope of this analysis, may also be enacted for the articulation of tween girlhood. For example the embodied performance of discourses of tween girlhood in particular social contexts (both in the physical and virtual world) is outside the scope of this specific analysis. Rather, this study focuses on the articulation of discourses of tween girlhood through various cross-media texts and discourses articulated through those texts. The following section on multimodal design elaborates on this analytical focus in more detail.
3.4 Theory of multimodal design as a discursive practice

In this study, I theorize discursive practices as those practices that negotiate and articulate discourses through the use of semiotic resources across modes and media. Bronwyn Davies and Rom Harre (1990) discuss how discourses may be drawn upon for the articulation of identity in terms of the ways "[i]ndividuals 'take themselves up' as individuals through various discourses (along with the inevitable contradictions among them) as they are made available in spoken and written form" (Fearnie et al. 1993: 98). Multimodal design in this analysis is examined as a discursive practice where individuals 'take up' discourses of tween girlhood at different sites across a cross-media world.

Building on Gee’s concept of discourse-in-use, discussed in the previous section, I employ social semiotic theory, as defined by Gunther Kress and Theo van Leeuwen (1996; 2001), to examine how multimodal resources are specifically used to articulate discursive identity. As touched on earlier, this analysis is informed by a social semiotic approach, as opposed to semiotic analysis, referring to studies of meaning-making that employ more pure formal linguistic approaches. Social semiotics involves functional approaches that conceptualize meaning-making as a social practice situated in particular social, historical, cultural and political contexts. Rooted in socio-linguistics, particularly the work of Halliday (1975; 1978; 1985), Kress and van Leeuwen (1996; 2001) adopt a model from linguistic analysis in their development of a visual grammar for the analysis of multimodal design. At the centre of this approach is a theoretical argument for an emphasis on design that proposes that semiotic material functions as resources for meaning-making. Particularly in the field of New Literacies research, Kress and van Leeuwen among others (Burn and Parker 2003; Lemke 2005) have built upon this initial model for visual representations for the examination of multimodal discourse and design.
The following sections further elucidate how I draw upon these models in the analysis of the cross-media worlds.

3.4.1 *Multimodal design, identity and agency*

'Multimodal' is a concept coined by Kress and van Leeuwen to define "any text whose meanings are realized through more than one semiotic code" often integrating several modes of communication in its representation (Kress and van Leeuwen 1996: 183). In this frame, discourse is realized through the multimodal design of texts, spaces and practices. In terms of the formulation of discourse at the level of multimodal text, I employ Kress and van Leeuwen's notion of *design* as an articulation of discourse through orchestration of multimodal resources. Kress and van Leeuwen define design as "means to realise discourse in the context of a given communication situation. But designs also add something new: they realise the communication situation which changes socially constructed knowledge into social (inter-) action" (Kress and van Leeuwen 2001: 5). In this frame, discourse is realized through multimodal articulation, in the design of the texts and in the use of these texts as resources for meaning making across modes and media. Kress and van Leeuwen (2001) propose that design:

requires the choices of materials and modes which for reasons of cultural history and provenance, or for reasons of the individual's history, are best able to (co-) articulate the discourses in play at the particular moment...That involves selecting the material forms of realisation from the culture's existing repertoire, and of selecting the modes which the producer of the text judges to be most effective (whether consciously so or not is not the issue at that point) in relation to the
purposes of the producer of the text, expectations about audiences and the kinds of discourses to be articulated (2001: 31).

The theory of identity in this analysis conceives discourse as rooted in a cultural history of discourses around tween girlhood that may be selected from the existing cultural repertoire and articulated through design. The methodological approach to discursive history in this analysis is further expanded in Chapter Four.

Following this theory of discourse as articulated through design, agency is defined as the capacity of an individual to negotiate and articulate identity through discursive practices, in this case multimodal design. Moreover, I add to this definition of agency with Davies's vision of agency as "...never freedom from discursive constitution of self but the capacity to recognize that constitution and to resist, subvert and change the discourses themselves through which one is being constituted" (1990: 51). Thus, agency is defined as not only the capacity to articulate identity through discourse but also for individuals to subvert, resist, and change discourses through discursive practices (of multimodal design and cross-media play). Similarly, Gonick observes "a double movement between a subject speaking/writing her way into existence by using stories or discourses that are available and in the moment of doing so, also subjecting herself to the constitutive force and regulative norms of those discourses" (2003: 10). Notably, the practices of multimodal design and cross-media play may provide opportunities for individuals to articulate available discourses and potentially 'recognize' the constitution of identity within discourse; however, the extent to which these practices are able to afford the capacity for individuals to subvert, resist, and change discourse is a question that is addressed in the analysis. The following sections elaborate on the roles of
multimodal design and cross-media play as discursive practices in the cross-media worlds of the case studies.

3.4.2 Social semiotic metafunctions

Borrowing from Halliday’s linguistic metafunctions of language for the social semiotics of language (1978; 1985), Kress and van Leeuwen propose a multi-layered multimodal design analysis. Drawing on Halliday’s terms, Kress and van Leeuwen propose that:

visual design, like language, indeed all semiotic modes, fulfils two major functions...an ideational function, a function of representing ‘the world around and inside us’ and an ‘interpersonal function’, a function of enacting social interactions as social relations. Whether we engage in conversation, produce an advertisement or play a piece of music, we are simultaneously communicating, doing something to, or for, or with others in the here and now of social context. (1996:13)

Similar to Gee’s theory of discourse-in-use, within this frame all modes of communication are produced within social contexts. The grammar of visual design (1996) that has been elaborated into a multimodal theory (2001) provides a framework to analyze the articulation of multimodal discourse. Notably, multimodal design may be perceived as both a theoretical frame and a methodological approach for analysis of discourse. In this section, I outline the elements of Kress and van Leeuwen’s theoretical framework that are significant to this study; while the method for analysis, that draws upon the theoretical elements highlighted below, is further detailed in Chapter Four and Figure 1.
Following Kress and van Leeuwen's theoretical frame, the ideational metafunction is defined as "the ability of semiotic systems to represent objects and their relations in a world outside the representational system" (1996: 45). Moreover, the objects (elements in the representation) are defined as 'represented participants' that may be part of narrative or conceptual processes of representation (1996: 56). For example, the cover of C.S. Lewis's *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950) may depict a painted image of Aslan, the lion, in battle with the White Queen. In this example, the lion and the Queen are defined as represented participants in a conceptual representation that visually articulates religious morality: the dark colours that represent the Queen visually as morally flawed, and the bright colours that represent the lion as morally strong.

In this analysis, the ideational and the interpersonal metafunctions are the focus of the multimodal design analysis. The interpersonal metafunction is the most significant element of the design analysis. The interpersonal metafunction refers to a particular social relationship between producer and consumer that is created through the design. Kress and van Leeuwen identify two kinds of participants that are significant to my analysis: *represented participants* (the people, the places, and the things depicted in
images), and interactive participants (the people who communicate with each other through images, the producers and viewers of images) (1996: 119). Thus, while the lion and the Queen, discussed above, are the represented participants, the interactive participants include the reader of the text (who may be a young reader, a teacher, a parent and so on), the author, the illustrator of the painting, the designer of the cover, as well as other individuals involved in the publication and production of the book. These different groups of participants are central to my analysis of multimodal design as a discursive practice in the ways interactive participants are placed into relationships with represented participants and other interactive participants. Moreover, my analysis of multimodal design focuses on three kinds of relations involved in the design of visual images and other multimodal elements. Kress and van Leeuwen outline these relations as follows:

1) relations between represented participants

1) relations between interactive and represented participants (the interactive participants’ attitudes towards the represented participants); and

2) relations between interactive participants (the things interactive participants do to or each other through the images). (1996: 119)

The study focuses on how tween girlhood is articulated through ideational and interpersonal metafunction with reference to these three types of relations outlined by Kress and van Leeuwen.

Building upon these relations, the focus of my analysis is how tween girlhood as a discursive identity is realized through the multimodal design of various texts as part of a cross-media world. The analysis specifically examines how discourses of tween girlhood are articulated through these levels of relations between represented participants and interactive participants. Moreover, the analysis examines how tie-in franchise texts
in both case studies provide specific offers for cross-media play elaborated in the final section of the theoretical frame.

Another element of the interpersonal metafunction which is addressed specifically in my analysis is the concept of modality. Kress and van Leeuwen explain that the “term ‘modality’ comes from linguistics and refers to the truth value or credibility of (linguistically) realized statements about the world” (1996: 160). One focus of the analysis is on how the practices of multimodal design and cross-media play negotiate and articulate this relationship with truth or reality; and the element of modality as a crucial function in the articulation of discourses around tween girlhood. Kress and van Leeuwen further argue that the “concept of modality is equally essential in accounts of visual communication. Visuals can represent people, places and things as though they are real, as though they actually exist in this way, or as though they do not” (1996: 161). Modality is a key element in the creation of fantasy spaces and characters in the cross-media worlds. The concept of modality will be further expanded in my theory of cross-media play in section 3.6.2.

The textual metafunction is the third part of social semiotic analysis of design proposed by Kress and van Leeuwen. This textual metafunction refers to the composition of the ideational and interpersonal elements into “a meaningful whole” (1996: 181). Moreover, multimodal theory (2001) specifically elaborates on how texts combine multiple semiotic modes to communicate meaning. The focus of the multimodal design analysis is primarily the ideational and interpersonal metafunctions (and the relations highlighted above) while the textual metafunction is examined in relation to the other two metafunctions (i.e. how the multimodal composition of the text supports the ideational and interpersonal functions). However, I address elements of the textual
function that are particularly significant to the texts as a 'meaningful whole' and in the case of franchise texts, I address the compositional elements that relate to the branding for a specific franchise. A summary of the key issues for the analysis of these three metafunctions is found in Figure 1.

Kress and van Leeuwen's model provides a key theoretical frame applied in the analysis; however, the cross-media worlds examined in this study provide a number of challenges to this framework. The texts and practices for analyses are discursively articulated, not only by their function as multimodal resources for meaning making, but also their location as part of cross-media worlds. While multimodal theory and methodology examines the design of multiple modes, most of the cross-media texts and literacies in this study involve a move beyond multimodality to the distribution of discourse across different media with a variety of intertextual linkages. Thus, a theory of cross-media play is detailed in the following section and the analytical method to examine multimodal design and cross-media play in the analysis chapters is provided in Chapter Four.

3.5 Theory of discourse, identity, and cross-media play

The central research question posed in the introduction to this thesis asks: what are the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play in the articulation of discourses of tween girlhood within the cross-media worlds? In the previous section, I outline a theory of multimodal design that I apply in the case study analyses. However, the theory of multimodal design does not fully account for the cross-media practices that characterize engagements within cross-media worlds. In order to account for these cross-media engagements and their role in meaning-making, in this section, I frame a theory of
cross-media play. The following section begins with a discussion of Mackey's theory of 'thick play' (Mackey 2007) and Kucklich's theory of 'playability' (Kucklich 2003-4). These theories frame the analysis of cross-media play with the discourses of tween girlhood in cross-media worlds. Using 'thick play' and playability as broad frames, I examine five types or categories of play within the cross-media worlds of the case studies (see section 3.6). I use these categories in order to expand upon the findings in the analysis of multimodal design. In this analysis, the term game refers to a specific type of media or mode (the ludic) that may have a role in the playability of the text and in the types of cross-media play. This theory of cross-media play theorizes play as a discursive practice through which individuals may articulate and actively negotiate the discourses of tween girlhood.

3.5.1 Introduction to play as a theoretical tool

There are various approaches to the study of play from multiple disciplines including cognitive psychology, anthropology, sociology, literacy education, and cultural studies frameworks. Brian Sutton-Smith in The Ambiguity of Play (1997) reviews the diversity of play types from solitary play to celebrations and festivals. Moreover, as elaborated later in this section, Sutton-Smith also defines seven rhetorics that characterize the interpretation of play from various disciplines and traditions. His discussion of the 'ambiguity' of the concept of play elucidates both the potential of using 'play' as a theoretical tool in the examination of cross-media practices as well as the challenges that may arise.

In her work on cross-media literacy practices, Margaret Mackey similarly highlights the open definition of the word 'play' and its various uses:
I have come to recognize that there is, after all, a common word that will make room for a variety of activities, with multifaceted and multimedia connotations. That word is \textit{play}. We use it as a verb to talk about music and games: we play the piano or play tag. As a noun, of course, it is a staged drama. But we can also have a play of light (on water, on a screen), or a play on words. The word has a valid function in many of the ways we talk about the arts; in that sense it is multimodal.

(2004: 236)

In this passage, Mackey observes the potential application of the term ‘play’ in a variety of contexts particularly relevant to studies of multimodality and cross-media practices.

In order to navigate the openness of ‘play’ as a concept, Jackie Marsh and Elaine Millard (2000) draw on definitions of play from Catherine Garvey’s text \textit{Play} (1977) as a “useful starting point” (Marsh and Millard 44). While these definitions may reflect discourses from developmental psychology and other areas that study play (as reviewed by Sutton-Smith 1997), Garvey’s definitions are not employed here to address these discourses and assumptions around the concept of play. Rather, these definitions are used here as a way to define the use of play in this study as a theoretical tool and to illustrate how Mackey’s definition of ‘thick play’, elaborated in the following section (3.5.2), distinguishes itself from these definitions provided by Garvey.

Garvey’s (1977) definitions of play are as follows:

1. Play is pleasurable, enjoyable. Even when not actually accompanied by signs of mirth, it is still positively valued by the player.

2. Play has no extrinsic goals. Its motivations are intrinsic and serve no other objectives. In fact, it is more an enjoyment of means than an effort devoted to some particular end. In utilitarian terms it is inherently unproductive.
3. Play is spontaneous and voluntary. It is not obligatory but is freely chosen by the player.

4. Play involves some active engagement on the part of the player (Garvey 1977: 10 as cited in Marsh and Millard 2000: 44).

The cross-media play examined in this study shares some of the qualities of play highlighted in these definitions of play. Cross-media play may be defined as pleasurable, enjoyable, positively-valued by the player, and involving active engagement. However, in three key ways, the type of cross-media play examined in this research is more appropriately described by Mackey’s theory of ‘thick play’ (2007) elucidated in section 3.5.2. First, unlike the play defined by Garvey, the cross-media play in my study may have extrinsic goals; however, it may not necessarily be considered useful or productive in utilitarian terms. Second, the cross-media play I examine in this analysis generally involves active engagement on the part of the player; however, in some cases this engagement may be limited. Third, the cross-media play is not obligatory but the contexts of play are not entirely voluntary. For example, although the focus groups in my classroom research were voluntary, the DVDs we viewed were not freely chosen by the group, and thus, may account for the type of play with the discourses that I observed.

3.5.2 Theory of thick play and playability

The theory of play in this study is primarily framed by Mackey’s conceptualization of ‘thick play’ in her most recent work on the recreational literacies of young Canadian adults (Mackey 2007). Building on anthropologist Clifford Geertz’s concept of “thick description” (1973), Mackey coins the term ‘thick play’ to understand “the intense commitment, of extensive time and energy devoted to particular forms of
text and particular narratives" (2007: 173). Mackey focuses on thick play in relation to extensive fictional universes and trans-media narratives which are comparable to the cross-media worlds of *Narnia* and *Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen* examined in Chapter Six and Seven. Mackey observes that the participants in her study “expressed a preference for some kind of enlarged fictional universe that expanded beyond the limits of a single title” (182). She uses *The Lord of the Rings* as an example of what she has defined as the ‘Big World’ phenomenon, namely the fictional world created by Tolkien is expanded beyond a single title to a trilogy of books and *The Hobbit*, a prequel, as well as related stories, languages, histories, maps and legends of Middle Earth in *The Silmarillion*.

Mackey alludes to Peter Lunenfeld’s definition (2000) of “an aesthetic of unfinish” to describe this phenomenon: “Technology and popular culture propel us toward a state of unfinish in which the story is never over, and the limits of what constitutes the story proper are never to be as clear again” (Lunenfeld 14). As discussed in the introduction to the thesis, I employ the term *cross-media world* in order to encompass the texts and practices associated with a cross-media franchise or trans-media narrative in addition to its intertextually associated texts such as earlier adaptations of the same narrative as well as fan productions.

This theory of ‘thick play’ and Lunenfeld’s ‘aesthetic of unfinish’ are closely related to the concept of ‘playability’ that may be applied to cross-media texts. Drawing on the term’s usage in game criticism, Julian Kucklich (2003-4) defines ‘playability’ as “the extent to which a certain game has the capability to provide enjoyment for a player over an extended period of time. Therefore, playability is closely related to replayability, i.e. a game’s power to challenge the player to another go at the game after it has been ‘solved’” (Kucklich 5). In the context of a cross-media world, the element Kucklich
describes as ‘replayability’ applies to both the return to the same text again for another viewing/playing/consuming/reading experience as well as its potential for replayability within the cross-media world more generally. For example, the viewer of a mary-kate-and-asheley DVD bloopers reel may return to the same bloopers reel, to re-watch a particular DVD or series of films.

Using these theories of ‘thick play’ and playability as a framework, in the following section I conceptualize the role of cross-media play as a discursive practice within the cross-media worlds.

3.5.3 Conceptualizing play as a discursive practice

Situated within the framework of New Literacies studies (addressed in the introduction to this thesis as well as the literature review in Chapter Two), the cross-media play observed in this study is defined as a discursive practice. However, while Mackey (and others in the field) are concerned with the value of play for the development of expertise related to literacy learning, my focus is on the role of play in the articulation of discourses of identity. Although there are pedagogic implications that may be observed in these practices, I am focused upon their implications as socio-cultural practices.

While Mackey’s interest is on the act of playing and its potential for expertise and learning, she only briefly addresses the implications of a prolonged relationship as a consumer with a particular narrative universe. Henry Jenkins argues that “media audiences must not simply buy an isolated product of experience, but rather, must buy into a prolonged relationship with a particular narrative universe, which is rich enough and complex enough to sustain their interest over time and thus motivate a succession of
consumer choices" (2003: 284). The examination of cross-media play defined as a discursive practice highlights the potential for agentive articulation and negotiation of discourses within and outside franchises and cross-media worlds. Notably, these prolonged engagements with specific narrative universes have potential implications for theories of habitus and identity formation (Bourdieu 1984; Butler 1999). Although I allude to some of these implications throughout the analysis, an extensive discussion of how these concepts may be applied in this context are outside of the scope of this specific study. These issues are raised in the conclusion of this thesis with regards to expansions of the study in an extended ethnographic component where these elements may be properly analyzed.

3.5.4 The role of pleasure in play

Another issue that arises in this examination is the role of pleasure as a characteristic of play, and more importantly, the relationship between pleasure and discursive practices. To address this issue in my analysis, I draw on Roland Barthes's distinction in *The Pleasure of the Text* (1975) between texts of 'plaisir' (pleasure) and texts of 'jouissance' (bliss):

Text of pleasure (plaisir): the text that contents, fills, grants euphoria; the text that comes from culture and does not break with it, is linked to a comfortable practice of reading. Text of bliss (jouissance): the text that imposes a sense of loss, the text that discomforts (perhaps to the point of a certain boredom), unsettles the reader's historical, cultural, psychological assumptions" (1975: 14).

Perry Nodelman and Mavis Reimer (2003) elaborate on these two types of texts in relation to children's literature texts. In their discussion they observe that due to the
bodily pleasures associated with texts of bliss as well as the anarchic, strange, and disruptive nature of these texts, children’s literature is often assumed by adults to be ‘texts of pleasure’ that conform to familiar, comforting, and culturally condoned patterns. Moreover, these texts are seen as socially acceptable for young readers who are not culturally condoned to engage in bodily pleasures (Nodelman and Reimer 24). Nevertheless, Nodelman and Reimer propose an examination of children’s texts that take into account the potential for these texts to produce these two types of pleasure. In my analysis, both case studies exemplify franchise texts that follow the normative discourses related to child sexuality as well as other culturally appropriate behaviour. However, the two case studies reveal examples of both types of pleasure through engagements with cross-media texts. The analysis reveals forms of disruptive play, and assesses the potential to challenge normative discourses of tween girlhood through phantasmagoric play in relation to franchise texts. Moreover, other categories of play such as the intratextual and intertextual play may provide opportunities for ‘jouissance’ in relation to franchise texts.

3.6 Categories of cross-media play

Building on Mackey’s theory of ‘thick play’ and Kucklich’s theory of playability as a broad framework, I examine five types of cross-media play within the cross-media worlds of the case studies: 1) paratextual play; 2) behind-the-scenes modality play; 3) intertextual expanded-story play; 4) intertextual cross-over play; and 5) phantasmagoric play. (See Figure 2 for a summary of these categories.) These categories are employed to examine the role of these types of cross-media play as discursive practices. These categories also provide an analytical model to address specific examples of agency,
pleasure and the regulation of cross-media play with discourses within these cross-media worlds. As previously discussed in the section on discourse-in-use, there are many other types of play significant to cross-media worlds that were outside the scope of this study, and are thus, not addressed in this analysis. For example, forms of play through practices of imitation, performance, or role-playing are beyond the scope of this analysis. Figure 2 below outlines the key characteristics of each of the categories of cross-media play. In the sections to follow, I define these categories of cross-media play.

Figure 2: Cross-media play categories for analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of cross-media play</th>
<th>Key characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Paratextual play**          | • Engagement with discourses in tie-in texts and adaptations  
|                               | • Repetition and variation in play practices |
| **Behind-the-scenes modality play** | • Practices that engage with issues of modality in the texts  
|                               | • Engagement with the world beyond the text (biographical information about actors, directors, authors)  
|                               | • Blurring of discourse between fictional and ‘real’ representation |
| **Intertextual-cross-over-play** | • Cross-over practices with discourses from texts outside the cross-media world and tie-in texts  
|                               | • Playing around with a variety of texts (low and high commitment) |
| **Intertextual expanded-story play** | • Practices that expand the textual discourse  
|                               | • Expansion through focalization on specific characters and relationships other elements in the narrative |
| **Phantasmagoric play**       | • Anarchic and disruptive engagement with discourses  
|                               | • Carnivalesque, nonsense, parody, satire |
3.6.1 Paratextual play

Mackey observes that “the activity of constructing knowledge, even expertise, out of a collection of what might be called ‘outer texts’ led to a different kind of satisfaction. In these cases, ‘unfinish’ presented room for big world play and the potential to ‘thicken’ the experience of the story in ways that were clearly satisfying” (2007: 209). In many of the cases observed by Mackey in her study, these outer texts may be defined as the paratexts of the franchise texts.

Rooted in Gerard Genette’s (1980) theory of transtextuality and intertextuality (See intertextual cross-over play section), Dan Harries (2000) defines paratextuality as “the interconnection generated between the text and its associated extra-textual elements such as film posters, soundtracks, reviews, and promotional material” (29). However, in this study, the definition of tie-in texts that may be involved in paratextual play expands beyond this definition to include promotional, behind-the-scenes and tie-in franchise texts such as books, dolls, clothing, and video games. Paratextual play may also include affiliated texts that may be only loosely affiliated with the franchise for example engagement with older versions or adaptations of a narrative as a way to engage with the discourses in the franchise.

Mackey’s concept of ‘thick play’ is characterized by engagement that involves both repetition and variation. This category arises from an observation made by Linda Hutcheon (2006) about the pleasure that results from engaging with adaptations of texts: “part of pleasure comes from repetition with variation, from the comfort of ritual combined with the piquancy of surprise, part of pleasure is recognition, part is change” (4). This type of pleasure may fall under Barthes’s definition of a text of plaisir defined in the previous section (3.5.4). In reference to fans of Harry Potter films, Mackey
observes “the inevitable comparison with the [Harry Potter] books means that fans are rather less likely to be absorbed into the workings of a single schema. In a sense, watching a film adaptation of a well-loved book is always already an engaged experience” (2007: 181). In this context, the adaptations involve some form of repetition while the shift in media implies a form of variation. This category of play is examined primarily through practices of repetitive engagement with texts. For example, the repeated viewing of particular episodes or scenes of a film is defined as paratextual play through repetition and variation.

3.6.2 Behind-the-scenes modality play

In the analysis paratextual play is often closely linked to modality play. Modality play refers to practices that engage with issues of modality in the texts. Mackey (2007) distinguishes between immersion and engagement:

Most readers, viewers, and players are familiar with two associated phenomena. One is the sensation of being completely absorbed in a fictional world. A different form of involvement includes the capacity to move in and out of that absorbed attention in order to consider wider questions about the fiction, yet without entirely leaving the ‘fiction zone’ (177).

Although Mackey discusses the interaction between real geographical spaces and fictional ones in a fan’s engagement with a narrative world, she does not address modality issues of celebrity and the ‘real life’ identity of actors and relationships behind the characters in the fictional world. In my study, the representation of Lucy in the Disney/Walden Media film adaptation of The Lion, the Witch, and the Wardrobe, is complicated by connections to the representation of Georgie Henley in both the franchise
paratexts as well as fan-produced venues. The role of modality play in the cross-media world of Mary-Kate and Ashley is further complicated by the extensive blurring of real and fictional identities at various levels of the cross-media world. In both of these case study analyses, I examine how this modality play functions in the articulation and negotiation of the discourses of tween girlhood at various sites of the cross-media worlds.

One specific type of modality play may be defined as intratextual play. Intratextuality is defined as "the process by which a film refers to itself within the text in an overtly self-referential manner. This is evident in a number of parody films, such as Spaceballs" (Harries 2000: 27). Other forms of self-parody may occur through self-referential allusions to stylistic and technical elements of film. This type of intratextual play occurs in the franchise texts, the paratexts, as well as other elements of the cross-media world (for example Mary-Kate and Ashley engaged in self-parody around the conventions of their own productions when they appeared as hosts on the comedy sketch show Saturday Night Live in April 2007). Nodelman and Reimer argue that "the pleasure of seeing through literature" and "the pleasure of exploring the ways in which texts sometimes undermine or even deny their own apparent meanings" may be defined in terms of Barthes's jouissance (see section 3.4.5). In the context of the cross-media worlds of this study, behind-the-scenes modality play is the primary example of this type of pleasure through cross-media play.

3.6.3 Intertextual-expanded story play

In this category of play I draw upon the term 'intertextuality', coined by Julia Kristeva in reference to Mikhail Bakhtin's theoretical work (1981). Kristeva's conceptualization of intertextuality posits that "any text is a mosaic of quotations; any
text is the absorption and transformation of another” (Kristeva 1980:66). While most literary critics continue to focus on the ways intertextuality functions within the texts, research on audience studies have taken up the concept of intertextuality in relation to the practices and cultures of fandom. Jenkins addresses this element of textual engagement in terms of the participatory and production oriented aspects of fandom in both Textual Poachers (1992) and Convergence Culture (2006). Most notably, Jenkins defines how “media fans take pleasure in making intertextual connections across a broad range of media texts” (1992: 37). This conceptualization of intertextual play draws upon what Jenkins defines as ‘textual poaching’ (1992). In his theorizing of fan writers and fan producers, Jenkins draws upon Michel de Certeau’s work on popular reading in The Practice of Everyday Life (1984).

Jenkins describes de Certeau’s understanding of popular reading “as a type of cultural bricolage through which readers fragment texts and reassemble the broken shards according to their own blueprints, salvaging bits and pieces of the found material in making sense of their own social experience” (Jenkins 1992: 26). In addition, in this theorization of intertextual play, I draw upon a broad definition of intertextuality that refers to “the ways in which written and visual texts were interrelated but also to the text of one’s own life, as a collection of various overlapping experiences” (Sipe 2000: 256). Many of the responses in my audience studies exemplify intertextual play that draws together fictional texts with narratives of biographical experience.

Mackey and Jenkins both observe the diverse and extensive manner by which fictional universes may be expanded through intertextual play. These practices that may include: geographical expansion, chronological expansion, narrative extensions, focalization on secondary characters, parodic revisions of the narrative, and crossovers
between fictional worlds (Jenkins 1992; Mackey 2007). These cross-overs between fictional worlds are discussed in the following category of cross-media play.

3.6.4 Intertextual-cross-over play

Jenkins (1992) notes that “while some fans remain exclusively committed to a single show or star many others use individual series as points of entry into a broader fan community linking to an intertextual network composed of many programs, films, books, comics, and other popular materials” (40). Moreover, viewers/readers/consumers may textually dabble across various cross-media worlds while fulfilling an interest in the technical elements of media texts, rather than narrative elements. This category of intertextual play in the analyses in Chapter Six and Seven allows for this diversity in engagement that includes both highly invested ‘thick play’ and more of a recreational dabbling across texts and media that may be superficial, confined to the social context, and highly ephemeral. Mackey defines this as “playing as fooling around,” and the “exploration of possibilities with no commitment. We try one option in our minds, mentally extend our understanding of possible outcomes, weigh our view of potential consequences” (Mackey 2004: 240-241). While some of the participants in my study were self-professed Narnia or Mary-Kate and Ashley fans, others were only invested in the texts for brief periods, over a week, a month or only during the focus group discussion and they drew upon a range of discourses from outside the cross-media worlds.

In the analysis, I highlight these diverse types of commitment to a specific fictional world through intertextual play. Nevertheless, intertextual play may involve intentional engagement with the discourses within the primary focus text as well as a
dialogue with a range of available discourses. Tzvetan Todorov, in his work on Bakhtin (1984), argues that “intentionally or not, all discourse is in dialogue with prior discourses on the same subject, as well as with discourses yet to come, whose reactions it foresees and anticipates” (Todorov x). Thus, an examination of intertextual play alongside an examination of multimodal design may highlight relations between discourses in the text with a discursive history of tween girlhood as well as the relations between audience engagements and textual discourse.

3.6.5 Phantasmagoric play

This final category of play is framed by Sutton-Smith’s conceptualization of child phantasmagoria (1997: 151-172). In his discussion of this type of play, Sutton-Smith highlights how rhetorics of development and other discourses around childhood have worked to suppress and rationalize this type of play. Similar to Nodelman and Reimer’s observations around children’s literature and pleasure, Sutton-Smith observes that children “are allowed much less freedom for irrational, irreality, wild, dark, or deep play in Western culture than are adults” (1997: 151). He argues that despite evidence of this type of child fantasy and play, relatively little research has extensively addressed it. This category of play is related to elements that are defined outside of normative discourses of childhood imagination, fantasy, and play: irrationality, wildness, unregulated sexual desire, incest and other taboos, scatological images, exaggerated distortions of everyday events and characters, tricksters, clowns, vulgarity, body humour, violence, pain and gore, the bizarre and the strange. This type of play may take on the form of riddles, rhymes, gaming, jokes, pranks, tales and legends (Sutton-Smith 1997: 157). While folklorists examine these elements in their research it is often in relation to adult cultural
practices (such as festivals and other events) and remediations of fairytale and folkloric
texts. Sutton-Smith hypothesizes that this type of play may be more common in young
males as storytellers, while girls tend to be more structured and ordered in their
storytelling, I would argue that the social context (particularly in terms of story writing)
and form of play may influence the tendency towards phantasmagoric content (Sutton-

Sutton-Smith argues that “play is a deconstruction of the world in which they
[children] live. If the world is a text, the play is a reader’s response to the text…All
players unravel in some way the accepted orthodoxies of the world in which they live,
whether those orthodoxies have their source in adult or child peer
groups” (1997: 167). Following this observation, phantasmagoric play may often function to complicate the
power relations between voices and individuals from various sites of articulation in a
cross-media world. Bakhtin’s concept of the ‘carnivalesque’ similarly captures the role of
this type of phantasmagoric play as a potential subversion or inversion of the dominant
discourses of a society (Bakhtin 1984). Sutton-Smith observes that this type of play may
take the form of nonsense, parody and satire in a range of forms including “bathroom
jokes, cruel jokes, gross jokes, elephant jokes, Dolly Parton jokes” (1997: 165) While
parodic revisions of narratives may be defined under the category of intertextual play, the
use of parody often draws upon elements of phantasmagoria and the carnivalesque
particularly in the use of anarchic or irreverent elements. Conversely, phantasmagoric
play often occurs in relation to intertextual play. Depending on the nature of the parody,
and the level of critique, these categories of play may function in tandem to challenge
power relations in a cross-media world and disrupt regulation of discourse. This
disruption may occur at different degrees dependent on the context in which the play
occurs. A comparative summary of the five categories of play and their key characteristics is outlined in the figure below (Figure 2). The application of these categories in the analysis of the cross-media worlds is further elaborated in Chapter Four.

3.7 Conclusion to the theoretical frame

This chapter maps out a theoretical frame that is applied to the analysis chapters. The chapter began with a theory of tween girlhood as a discursive identity that is constituted through discourse. The next section (3.2) draws on Gee’s theory of discourse-in-use (2005) and how identities may be articulated through discourses in different social contexts. Building on this theory of discursive identity and discourse-in-use, section (3.3) theorizes multimodal design as a discursive practice and defines how agency may be conceptualized within this framework. Due to the limits of multimodality as a theory to examine the articulation and negotiation of discourse within cross-media worlds, the following section (3.4) expands upon this theory of multimodal design with a theory of ‘thick play’ with discourse across media, and defines how cross-media play may also be conceptualized as a discursive practice. The final section (3.5) theorizes and outlines five categories of cross-media play with discourses of the cross-media worlds. This theory of cross-media play as a discursive practice is drawn upon as a significant analytical framework in the case study analyses.

In the following chapter, this theoretical frame is further detailed in terms of how these theories are applied through a historical tracking of the emergence of tween girl discourse (Chapter Five) and two case studies for analysis (Chapter Six and Seven). In addition, Chapter Four outlines the methods of enquiry and analysis as well as the selection of case studies and data for analysis.
CHAPTER FOUR
METHODOLOGY AND METHODS

4.1 Introduction to methodology and methods

In the previous chapter, I map out a theoretical frame for the analyses of discourses of tween girlhood within cross-media worlds. In the first part of this chapter, I expand upon how the theoretical frame is extended and applied using the circuit-of-culture model as a broad methodological frame for the analyses of various sites of discourse within cross-media worlds. This section of the chapter concludes with a discussion of the discursive history as a methodological approach that traces discourses of tween girlhood examined through the case studies. The second part of the chapter outlines the methods of enquiry employed in this study including the data collection processes, chronology of audience studies, and preliminary analysis of data. The final section first outlines the methods of analysis implemented for examination of the role of multimodal design and cross-media play in the case studies.

4.2 Methodological approaches

The following sections outline the methodological approaches applied in the analysis chapters. These include: a case study approach to cross-media worlds, discourse-in-use within the circuit of culture model, and a discursive history of tween girlhood. Following this framing of these methodological approaches, I highlight my methods of enquiry and analysis.
4.2.1 Case study approach to cross-media worlds

The overarching methodology employed in this study is a case study approach to cross-media worlds. Robert E. Stake (1995) defines the case study approach as “the study of the particularity and complexity of a single case, coming to understand its activity within important circumstances” (xi). In the field of children’s media culture, Mitchell and Reid-Walsh (2002) propose “to consider examples of popular culture as case studies for analysis: both as objects that exist in their own right, in their own period and context, and as texts which provide us with a way to examine the space of children in society” (8-9). Similarly, Stake discusses how cases are of interest for case studies “both their uniqueness and commonality” (1995: 1). The two case studies in this thesis exemplify shared cultural discourses and practices that are comparable to other tween franchises and cross-media phenomena. At the same time, these case studies reveal articulations of tween girlhood within specific texts, practices and contexts.

*The Chronicles of Narnia* and *Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen*, as case studies of cross-media worlds, exemplify two Anglo-American, English language representations aimed at preadolescent audiences. The case studies were selected because of their global popularity, high grossing sales and specific targeting of the tween age niche. Moreover, they have extensive fan cultures both affiliated with franchises, and in relation to the broader cross-media world. In addition, each of these case studies also exemplifies a key trend in tween and children’s media culture more generally. Narnia represents the trend of blockbuster film adaptation and franchising of classic and popular children’s texts, particularly of the epic fantasy adventure series genre for the tween and teen audiences. Examples include: *Harry Potter, Golden Compass*, and most recently the *Twilight saga*. Comparably, the *Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen* cross-media world is centred around a
highly gendered character-oriented franchise. The cross-media world encompasses
television and film features, related merchandise, as well as sites of discourse related to
Mary-Kate and Ashley outside of the official franchise texts in the realms of celebrity
gossip and fashion. These texts are focused on everyday adventures and foibles and
social development of young girls. Other examples include: *Hannah Montana* (2006-
many others. These two influential traditions are extremely prevalent in contemporary
cross-media franchises for young consumers/readers/viewers. In addition, they are
connected to various examples outlined in the discursive history in Chapter Five.

A case study approach provides a useful tool to address the complexities of a
diverse selection of data and provides structure to the analyses of discourses articulated
in both texts and audience practices. The circuit-of-culture model discussed in the
following section further elucidates how the case studies of cross-media worlds in the
analysis chapters provide structure for the analysis of diverse sites of discourse-in-use.

### 4.2.2 Discourse-in-use and the circuit of culture

In *An Introduction to Discourse Analysis: Theory and Method* (2005), Gee
proposes that theories of discourse (both his own and other scholars) may be used as
‘tools of inquiry’ or ‘thinking devices’ to “guide inquiry in regard to specific sorts of data
and specific sorts of issues and questions” (7). Following this proposal, in this study I
employ a theory of discourse-in-use as a ‘tool of inquiry’. As discussed in Chapter Three,
the analysis examines ‘discourse-in-use’ with regards to various sites of articulation both
in audience and textual data. An adapted version of du Gay et.al.’s ‘Circuit of Culture’
framework (1997), highlighted in this section, provides a methodological framework to examine discourse in use across the case studies.

In relation to research in children's media culture, Buckingham argues for "a return to the positive dimensions of the Birmingham tradition... the analysis of children’s media cultures needs to look more broadly, to re-locate its account of children as an audience in the context of a more comprehensive analysis of the relationships between cultural institutions, texts and audiences" (Buckingham 2000: 52). In order to address these diverse relationships between institutions, texts and audiences in the analysis of discourse-in-use across the case studies, I apply an adapted version of the "circuit of culture" model as proposed by du Gay et.al. (1997) as a methodological framework for analysis.

The 'Circuit of Culture', a British Cultural Studies approach, rooted in the Birmingham School, provides a methodological framework for the examination of cultural texts or artefacts in the context of broader cultural processes from production to reception. The most well known example is the case study of the Sony Walkman (du Gay et.al 1997). In this study, du Gay, et al. illustrate how a cultural text or artefact moves through five major cultural processes: "Representation, Identity, Production, Consumption and Regulation" i.e. "how it is represented, what social identities are associated with it, how it is produced and consumed, and what mechanisms regulate its distribution and use" (2003: 3). The focus of their analysis is "the biography of a cultural artefact in terms of a theoretical model based on the articulation of a number of distinct processes whose interaction can and does lead to variable and contingent outcomes. By the term 'articulation' we are referring to the process of connecting disparate elements together to form a temporary unity" (2003: 3). In the case study analyses in this study,
the focus is on cross-media worlds rather than a specific cultural artefact or commodity. The cross-media worlds themselves are constituted by multiple articulations of discourse at various sites.

Broadly, the cross-media worlds are examined in terms of sites of discourse that take into account the sites of texts, audiences and institutions. The case study analyses focus on sites of textual discourse (books, film and television adaptations, franchise tie-in texts, video games and merchandise); and sites of audience discourse (field work transcripts; fan websites, fan videos and fiction; fan questionnaires; digital culture associated with the cross-media worlds) while framing these analyses with an overview of relevant discourses related to the institutional/production context (industry, public media, authors, publisher). The collection of data for analysis, and selection of case studies as well as the sites of discourse for analysis are outlined in the second part of this chapter.

These selected sites of discourse in the analysis exemplify the intersection of the cultural processes defined by du Gay et. al (1997) in relation to cross-media worlds: representation, identity, production, consumption and regulation. The focus of the analysis is primarily on the relations between identity and representation. Diverse sites exemplify the intersection between these two key cultural processes as well as different examples of consumption, production and regulation. Moreover, cross-media worlds illustrate the blurring boundaries between practices of consumption and production. For example, in Chapter Seven, the analysis of the representation of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen in Teen Vogue magazine (Waterman 2007a; 2007b) exemplifies how a site of discourse may illustrate an intersection of these cultural processes. The article articulates tween girlhood as a discursive identity through the representation of the Olsens.
Moreover, the writer of the article is both a fan consumer as well as a producer of discourses around the Olsens in her role as a producer of public media. Regulation occurs on various levels of this site of articulation including the regulation of discourse by the magazine, the author, the franchise, and the self-regulation of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen themselves.

In the following section, I elucidate how the discursive history functions to provide a socio-historical background for the discourses articulated at various sites of the cross-media worlds in the analysis.

4.2.3 Discursive history of tween girlhood

In Chapter Five of the thesis I present a discursive history of tween girlhood. This discursive history identifies the key discourses negotiated in the present moment and historicizes them in the cultural contexts of Anglo-American texts produced for and about girls since the eighteenth century. Anoop Nayak and Mary Jane Kehily (2008) observe the relevance of connecting historical perspectives to contemporary analyses of girlhood: “In mapping out the terrain of new femininities, commentaries may have a tendency to emphasize the fissures with the past at the expense of continuities. The seemingly different new girl older may present a reshaping of normative femininities that provide many points of connection with the past” (73). Thus, the discursive history is integral to the examination of contemporary phenomena in the case study analyses in order to trace connections between current articulations of discourses and past articulations.

Notably, the tracing of a discursive history of tween girlhood has some resemblances to Foucault’s conception of a ‘genealogy of discourse’ (1969). More
specifically, the discursive history shares some of the same features as Catherine Driscoll's adaptation of Foucault's genealogical approach in *Girls: Feminine Adolescence in Popular Culture and Cultural Theory* (2002) as "a history that does not look for causes and points of origin so much as map how things and ideas are possible within a given context" (Driscoll 3-4). For example, Driscoll, drawing on her own research, explains that "a genealogy of feminine adolescence would trace the deployment of use of that idea in relation to the concepts of childhood and womanhood as well in relation to other discourses on the modern world...I analyze how girls are articulated in specific sites" (5). However, while the discursive history in Chapter Five is similar to Driscoll's approach, I do not use the term genealogy in this study. The primary reason for this choice is that my analysis departs in significant ways from the genealogical method following the discursive history to focus on the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play in the articulation of the discourses.

The discursive history (in conjunction with the case study analyses) can be understood as an adaptation of the methodological approach of the cultural biography of an object proposed by Celia Lury (1996) in reference to the work of Arjun Appadurai (1986). Similar to the circuit of culture model Lury argues for "the investigation of changes in the meaning and status of objects as they circulate in the everyday world" (20). Rather than 'objects', the examination in this study focuses on the circulation of discourses of tween girlhood in relation to a cross-media world. Lury draws on Appadurai's (1986) two-tiered investigation of cultural artefacts:

two kinds of trajectory of things, differentiated by temporality and scale: 1) the life history of a particular object, as it moves through different hands, contexts and uses, leading to the identification of a specific ‘cultural biography’ of the
object. And 2) the ‘social history’ of a particular kind or class of object, as it undergoes long-term historical shifts and large-scale dynamic transformations...the social history of things constrains the course of more short-term, specific and intimate trajectories, while many small shifts in the cultural biography of things may lead, over time, to shifts in their social history. (Lury 1996: 19)

Thus, the combination of the discursive history and the cross-media world case studies address elements of both the long-term and short term cultural biographies or social histories proposed here.

The articulations of tween girlhood examined in the case studies of The Chronicles of Narnia (Chapter Six) and Mary-Kate and Ashley (Chapter Seven) reveal key tensions between developmental and sexual maturation discourses and Romantic discourses of wonder and innocence. The tension between these discourses may be traced through the cultural history of representations around preadolescent girlhood. The discursive history in Chapter Five traces the cultural histories of a selection of key discourses around tween girlhood. The case study analyses then examine how these are negotiated and articulated in various ways at various sites within the cross-media worlds.

4.3 Methods of enquiry

There are three analysis chapters included in this thesis: a discursive history of the tween girlhood and two case study analyses. These chapters are the result of various stages of exploratory audience research as well as ongoing analyses of textual and audience data. The first audience research segment was an exploratory pilot study with an eight year old girl in London, UK (2004-2006). The second segment involved
ethnographic work and semi-structured group interviews with students from a Grade 3 (children ages eight to nine) classroom in Toronto, Canada (2006). The third segment involved questionnaires from a self-selected group of fans of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen contacted through a fan website as well as in-person interviews with the webmaster and a small selection of participants (2008). All of the studies drew upon non-probabilistic sampling methods (Paly 1997: 136-140) that are defined in further detail in the following sections.

Because the audience studies constitute only one segment of the broader case-study approach to cross-media worlds, a large amount of audience data in not presented in this study. However, these data sources were greatly influential on many critical decisions throughout this project including: the selection of focus texts, the key discourses for analysis and the methodological approaches to data analysis. I have included a selection of documents related to the exploratory pilot, the fieldwork, and fan survey in the Appendix to give a richer context for the audience studies data. I have also included consent forms. The audience studies follow the British Educational Research Association ethical guidelines and ethical review by the Institute of Education. All of the names (including the name of the school and teacher) from the audience studies are pseudonyms.

4.3.1 Audience study 1: Exploratory pilot study: London, UK

This first audience study was an exploratory pilot research with an 8-year-old girl living in London, UK. This was a convenience sample (Palys 1997: 136). I first met Elizabeth as a weekly babysitter for her and her younger brother from October 2004. However, I arranged to meet with her on a number of occasions after school or on
weekends for play-dates and outings to discuss books and media formally and informally. Over the course of eighteen months, I observed, at times took extensive notes, video-taped and audio-taped a number of trial interviews with Elizabeth alone and also on select occasions with two of her close female friends. We also attended two theatre performances, watched various Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen DVD series and television episodes, visited bookstores, and discussed books.

On a number of occasions, I audio and video taped unstructured and semi-structured discussions about books and media. The central aim of this pilot was to gain a sense of the field, to pilot interview questions and ethnographic techniques, and to conduct preliminary analyses of audio and video transcripts. Although little of the data gathered during this period is used in the analysis chapters which follow, the information garnered during this pilot was extremely valuable, allowing me to gain knowledge of texts and practices of preadolescent readers. It also raised a number of challenging questions regarding both my research focus and the methods for analysis. In response to this pilot research, I narrowed my research to a select group of focus books. My final selection of books was confirmed upon preliminary research in a grade three classroom in Canada in April 2006.

4.3.2 Audience Study 2: Fieldwork study, Grade Three classroom, McMillan Public School, Toronto, Canada.

The fieldwork aspect of my research occurred between April and July 2006 in a Grade Three classroom in Toronto, Canada. The majority of the data was collected during June 2006. McMillan Public School is a publically funded school in a predominantly middle class neighbourhood in North Toronto. The school has a high
percentage of new immigrants, the majority from Korea, China and Japan. Although many of the students in the classroom would consider English as their second acquired language most of these students are considered functionally bilingual. [See Appendix 2 for background information about the school site.]

This audience study reflects a combination of purposive and convenience sampling (Palys 1997: 136-137). Purposive sampling is appropriate for this research which may be defined as “inductive, exploratory research (where the researcher is trying to get a preliminary feel for the people or phenomenon being studied)” in this case the cross-media phenomenon of tween franchises (Palys 1997: 137). The choice to begin research in this specific classroom reflects practical and theoretical considerations. With regards to the significance of gatekeepers in order to access research subjects: “connecting with one person who can act as an ‘in’ and/or ‘key informant’ can mean all the difference between getting a project off the ground or not” (Palys 1997: 200). This is a valid observation in the context of access to school classrooms and access to subjects in research with young people; but as an international doctoral student living in London, there were many hurdles to overcome with regards to accessing research subjects for my studies. As a friend and former teacher/colleague at a fine arts summer program, Brian Henderson was an ideal teacher-collaborator for this project. The opportunity to do research in the classroom of a friend and have access to time throughout the school day over a few months seemed ideal given the time frame and financial constraints of my research. As my research did not involve direct observation of classroom curriculum or teaching practice, I did not feel this bias or subjectivity would hinder my research.

Organizing my classroom visits in December 2005, I conducted preliminary visits in April 2005 and then returned for the month in June 2005 where I spent at least three
days per week at the school. We decided that the end of the school year would be the best month for my research as the classroom would be most relaxed and the number of structured classroom lessons limited. Also, after spending April and May preparing and writing the provincially required Ontario Grade Three standardized tests, Brian hypothesized that the students would be very eager to do something more creative and informal and would be eager to interact with a new person in June.

The selection of this research site helped strengthen my ability to collect data. My Canadian background meant that I was familiar with many of the cultural and institutional details of the Canadian classroom. Furthermore, my work background and friendship with the classroom instructor helped encourage a less formal environment for the respondents comparable to the atmosphere of an after-school program or a summer camp program than a formal classroom setting. For this type of research, I think it was appropriate and possibly helpful, because the focus is on how children mediate texts across educational and non-educational settings. Collecting the data in Canada also allowed me to introduce texts from England that were not widely known in the Toronto classroom. In addition, texts produced originally in the United States such as The Princess Diaries and Mary-Kate and Ashley franchised texts were easily available in the Toronto classroom, school and public library, and also viewed on television and DVDs.

4.3.2.1 Focus texts for discussion

After piloting the book preference survey with Elizabeth and a select set of her friends, I gathered book preference surveys from the Canadian classroom students. From these initial surveys, as well as input from the classroom teacher and Elizabeth, I narrowed down my list of cross-media tween texts to include texts that were of current
interest to the students. One of the case studies, C.S. Lewis’s *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* was not initially selected for examination; however, because of the release in December 2005 of the film adaptation, this text was one of the most popular texts to discuss or claim as a favourite by Elizabeth and her friends in London, as well as the students in the Toronto classroom in early 2006 when I distributed the book preference surveys. As I began the fieldwork in the spring 2006, I selected six focus cross-media texts: the *mary-kateandashley* franchise, Meg Cabot’s *Princess Diaries* and the Disney film adaptations/franchises, Lauren Child’s *Clarice Bean* and *Charlie and Lola* books (and animated series), Jacqueline Wilson’s *Tracey Beaker* (BBC television series), *Hana’s Suitcase* (play and television documentary), and C.S. Lewis’s *Lion the Witch and the Wardrobe* (Disney/Walden Media franchise texts, the BBC adaptation and other film franchise texts). Although I provided and distributed multiple copies of these books to different groups as well as other secondary texts, I gave the children as many opportunities as possible to discuss and share their own reading and media interests. This approach may have reduced the amount of data on the specific focus texts; however, due to the exploratory nature of the study, I was more interested in trends in popular texts and common patterns in their engagements with the texts. [See Appendix 1 for the preliminary reading questionnaire.]

4.3.2.2 Semi-structured group interviews/focus groups

My data collection included a mix of qualitative methods. My data include transcripts of audio recordings of all group discussions as well as video recordings of selected groups, my notes from focus group interviews and individual responses to DVD clips, websites, books and other products. I also collected book preference surveys and
overall book and media usage surveys, creative writing and art related to their favourite texts, post-it note responses to things they found funny or interesting in their reading of various texts, and website reviews.

Although my focus is on texts particularly geared towards tween girls, I was aware that focusing only on the female students in the classroom would limit my analysis and focus the engagements with the texts in particular ways. Thus, in my fieldwork in the Grade 3 classrooms, I collected data and interviewed all of the students in the class regardless of gender. I coordinated two sets of group interviews, one set with male and female participants together in small groups to discuss the *Narnia* texts; and one set of group interviews with gender divided peer groups. As I wished to get as many opportunities to speak to the children in different social contexts, I met with each child at least twice (if not many more times) in different contexts: in gender segregated groups, in mixed co-ed groups, in smaller and larger groups (between two and six participants), and in groups based on friendships. Bruce L. Berg (2007) regards focus groups as “intended to encourage subjects to speak freely and completely about behaviours, attitudes, and opinions they possess” (123). In order to triangulate my data, I aimed to have a variety of methods for finding out information about texts, and I also changed to composition of the groups in order to hear the children’s responses with different peer groups. The focus of this data collection was to collect examples of discourse-in-use in various contexts and cross-media texts. [See Appendix 4 for the focus group discussion questions.]

Following Buckingham (1993), I aimed to create an atmosphere of informal discussion around texts by beginning focus groups with an activity: watching a DVD clip, playing with a website, or looking through a selection of books. From this activity, we would chat about the text at hand, and this would lead the conversation towards other
texts and questions. Particularly, the children's responses and engagements during the viewing activity allowed a way of accessing responses that were more typical in contexts without a researcher. Some researchers critique studies of children's recreational culture inside the school setting, claiming that observations of home and community settings are more appropriate for collecting information about these practices (Mitchell and Reid-Walsh 2002; McRobbie and Garber 1991). However, I found the unstructured spaces of the school day and peer culture ideal opportunities for understanding the role of these texts in the social lives of peer groups. As observed by Anne Haas Dyson in her research on the literacy cultures of elementary school peer groups (1997; 2003), many popular series books and other tie-in franchise texts function as non-school popular culture artefacts that are allowed in the classroom environment. These texts become an integral link to their non-school identities and also objects of discussion and engagement as part of peer culture. These texts act for many of the participants as mediators between home, community, and school experiences.

I met the children in a variety of semi-formal settings in the classroom, playground and school library. The more extensive focus group discussions, especially the videotaped sessions occurred in an unsupervised corner of the school library with a number of tables and comfortable armchairs. In order to draw out additional explanation and responses from the subjects I tried to downplay my authority as an adult and outsider to the school. As recommended by Eilis Hennessy and Caroline Heary (2005) with regards to research with children in focus groups: “The moderator should set him or herself apart from other authority figures and emphasize that his or her role is not to judge or discipline the children” (242). Within the focus groups, I emphasized the fact that I was living in London, England and that I may not be up to date on all the newest
Canadian cultural references. I was introduced to the students as “Naomi.” As a researcher following a feminist qualitative method, I realize that my role in research is at times shifting and ambiguous. As an adult researcher, I realize that it is a challenge to gain insider access to children’s culture. However, I posited myself as a friendly, non-teacher who had read and viewed most of the books and films they spoke with me about. My position in the school context was ambiguous, and in my field notes I attempted to be as self-conscious and aware of subjectivities as possible when collecting and analyzing data.

4.3.3 Audience study 3: Olsen fan questionnaire and interviews

This third audience study exemplifies purposive and snowball sampling of a specific fan community (Palys 1997: 137-139). A questionnaire (provided in Appendix 8) was distributed to twenty fans of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen who are in their late teens and twenties in September 2008. These older respondents, many who are around the same age as Mary-Kate and Ashley themselves, represent the early fan base of the girls and literally ‘Grew up with the Olsens.’ The majority of the respondents responded to a request that the webmaster posted on my behalf on the mkashley.com fan website. In turn, one of the fans put up my posting about the questionnaire on another fan community. In addition, I conducted interviews with two older fans (Julie and Julia) who I met through personal connections (who also filled out a questionnaire) as well as an interview with Erin Balser, the webmaster of the mkashley.com fansite. Through information gathered through these interviews and questionnaires, I also examined selected fansites designed by the respondents to my questionnaire.
The 20 respondents were between the ages of 17 and 26 and currently live in diverse countries including, New Zealand, Greece, Australia, Germany, Spain, France Argentina, Hong Kong/China, USA, UK and Canada. The backgrounds of the respondents ranged from those who only watched the original Olsen home video series or the sitcom *Full House* when they were younger to those fans that have created their own fansites and fanfiction dedicated to the Olsens. [See Appendices 7 and 8 for the fan questionnaire and consent form].

4.4. Methods of analysis and structure of analysis chapters

4.4.1 Preliminary analysis of the data

This research reflects an 'iterative process' involving the analysis of the same texts and audience data multiple times using diverse frames (Palys 1997: 298). The three audience studies took place at different phases in the doctoral research process, and over the course of the research process, reflect a narrowing down of the focus texts, and practices for analysis. While analysis of focus group data involved specifically identifying themes, categories and units of analysis (Vaughan et al. 1996). Upon deciding which texts would prove useful case studies (discussed in section 4.4.2 below), the focus group data was analyzed using multimodal semiotic analysis. The data from these questionnaires and interviews was coded using a “category system” that involves the creation of “a set of mutually exclusive and exhaustive, categories into which any given behaviour might be classified” (Palys 1997:193). From this initial analysis arose the final selection of discourses and categories of play for analysis. [See Appendix 5 for a sample of a preliminary transcript analysis].
4.4.2 Structure of the case study analyses

The analysis in Chapter Five traces a discursive history of tween girlhood. The case studies in Chapters Six and Seven draw upon this discursive history in the examination of how these discourses, rooted in a cultural history of representation, are articulated within the cross-media worlds of the case studies. Each case-study analysis addresses the intersection of key discourses of tween girlhood articulated at different sites within the cross-media world. These articulations were chosen in order to examine discourse across various cross-media sites including fan cultures and practices, group engagements, responses during audience studies, and associated adaptations (such as BBC *Narnia* television serial in a discussion of the contemporary cross-media world around the Disney/Walden Media franchise).

The structure of the two case studies is dependent on the articulations for analysis; however, each case study draws on the broad cultural processes of institutional/production contexts, texts, and audiences. The structure of each case study analysis focuses on the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play in the articulation of discourses. In the first case study (Chapter Six), the sites of discourse around Lucy Pevensie for analysis include: C.S. Lewis’s original novel and Pauline Baynes’s illustrations, the BBC television serial, the Disney/Walden Media film, various affiliated franchise texts (e.g. Lucy franchise tie-in texts, DVD bonus features, the Lucy avatar from the video game), fan sites around Georgie Henley (who plays Lucy), a fan video, fan fiction, and focus group responses from field work from the grade three classroom in Toronto. The analysis addresses the production discourse around diverse adaptations of Lewis’s text. In the second case study (Chapter Seven), the sites of discourse for analysis of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen include: the *so little time* book and
television/DVD series, DVD bonus features, the Dualstar press release for *mary-kateandashley* home and fashion line, features in fashion and style magazines, responses from Olsen fans, fan and anti-Olsen texts from digital cultures.

4.4.3 Analysis of multimodal design

For each case study, the examination includes an analysis of discourse as articulated through multimodal design. An adapted form of the analysis proposed by Kress and van Leeuwen (1996; 2001) and redefined by Burn and Parker (2003) is employed. The analysis examines the articulation of discourses around tween girlhood (that are outlined in the discursive history in Chapter Five) through multimodal design of cross-media texts. The specific focus of the case study analysis chapters is the ideational and interpersonal metafunction with analysis of textual only in relation to or support of the first two metafunctions. (See Figure 3 and 4 for a multimodal design analysis chart that highlights key analytical elements for the analysis.)

Figure 3: Multimodal design analysis

Case study 1-Lucy Pevensie in *The Chronicles of Narnia*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ideational</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpersonal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 4: Multimodal design analysis

Case study 2-Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Multimodal design</th>
<th>Book jacket/brand image</th>
<th>So little time book</th>
<th>So little time DVD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ideational</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpersonal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.4.4 Analysis of cross-media play

Each cross-media case study highlights a number of examples of play with cross-media discourse. The application of a theory of cross-media play provides the opportunity to expand the analysis beyond discussion of specific articulations to a broader perspective on play within these cross-media worlds. The combination of distinct analyses of multimodal design and play contributes to a richer analysis of tween girl discourses in a dynamic and complicated cross-media context. The five categories of cross-media play outlined in the theoretical frame are applied in the analysis. These categories are applied both to franchise texts in terms of how they may provide offers for cross-media play and more extensively in the audience studies and fan culture texts. The analysis of the franchise texts addresses how discourses are expanded and articulated through the multimodal design of the texts. The analysis of the audience studies and fan culture texts focuses on how these discourses from franchise texts are expanded, conflicted, ignored or elaborated through cross-media play and multimodal design. Figure 5 and 6 summarize the key points of the cross-media play analysis for the two case studies.
Figure 5: Cross-media play analysis- Lucy Pevensie in *Chronicles of Narnia*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cross-media play categories</th>
<th>Georgie Henley fansite</th>
<th>Lucy/Breakaway fan video</th>
<th>Lucy/Tumnus fan fiction</th>
<th>Lucy wardrobe focus group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Paratextual play</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bloopers transcript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Uncle Vernon/Lucy transcript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tumnus transcript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Behind-the-scenes modality play</em></td>
<td>Georgie/Lucy and other child stars</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bloopers transcript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Uncle Vernon/Lucy transcript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tumnus transcript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Intertextual-cross-over-play</em></td>
<td>Cross-over with <em>Princess Diaries</em></td>
<td>Cross-over with adolescent romance fic</td>
<td></td>
<td>Uncle Vernon/Lucy transcript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Intertextual expanded story play</em></td>
<td>Expanded maturation narrative</td>
<td>Expansion on characters and relationship</td>
<td></td>
<td>Uncle Vernon/Lucy transcript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Phantasmagoric play</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Relationship with faun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bloopers Tumnus</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 6: Case study 2 *Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cross-media play categories</th>
<th>Website/home products</th>
<th>DVD bonus features</th>
<th>Public media discourse</th>
<th>Survey responses from fans</th>
<th>Meet the TrollSens website</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Paratextual play</em></td>
<td>Offer of paratextual play</td>
<td>Offer of play with repetition and variation</td>
<td>Offer through repetition</td>
<td>Play with franchise texts/photographs</td>
<td>Repetition and variation in parody</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Behind-the-scenes modality play</em></td>
<td>Offer of behind the scenes play through link to real Olsens</td>
<td>Offer through self-parody</td>
<td>Offer through blurring of identities</td>
<td>Blurring of discourses</td>
<td>Blurring identities of Full House</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Intertextual-cross-over-play</em></td>
<td>Offer through connections</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Cross-over between genres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Intertextual expanded-story play</em></td>
<td>Offer of expanded story.</td>
<td>Offer through expansion real lives of Olsens</td>
<td>Play with public media discourse</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expanded story through parody</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Phantasmagoric play</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Olsens as trolls/anarchic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.5 Conclusion to methodology and methods

This chapter has built upon the theoretical frame outlined in the previous chapter. The first section defined the case study approach that is applied in the analysis, particularly in the application of a discursive history, and the circuit-of-culture model as a broad theoretical frame for the analysis of cross-media worlds. The second part of the chapter outlined the methods of enquiry employed in this study and the collection of data that is examined in the case study analyses. The final section of the chapter delineated the methods of analysis implemented for examination of the role of multimodal design and cross-media play in the structure of the case study analyses.
5.1 Introduction: Tracing a cultural history of representations

In Chapter Three, I have framed a theory of discourse and identity in the context of Hall's concept of the post-modern subject. Within the cross-media worlds of this study, identities are shifting, multiple, and discursive in nature, articulated through different sites of intersecting discourses. Brockmeier (2001) has also argued that identity may be perceived as a palimpsest "a text being written over previous texts, manuscripts, or other writing material, but in a way that the earlier layers of writing can shine through the more recent layers" (221-22). This chapter presents a discursive history to reveal some of the layers that may underline the more recent articulations of tween girlhood. Tween girlhood is defined in this analysis as a discursive identity that may be constituted by multiple, intersecting discourses that may shift and change with each site of articulation.

Henry Jenkins in his introduction to the Children's Culture Reader (1998) alludes to the "semiotically adhesive child" that carries many contradictory meanings because "our modern sense of the child is a palimpsest of ideas from different historical contexts—one part Romantic, one part Victorian, one part medieval, and one part modern. We do not so much discard old conceptions of the child as accrue additionally meanings around what remains one of our most culturally potent signifiers" (15). The representations in both case studies articulate the intersection of competing discourses that have underlined Anglo-American children's texts since the sixteenth century. Walkerdine argues that "girls are constituted as objects at the intersection of a number of competing claims to truth. They are viewed as pathologized objects of a psychological and pedagogic gaze as
well as eroticized objects of a sexualized gaze as potential women" (cited in de Ras and Lunenberg 1993: 3). Building on this, contemporary representations of girlhood reveal a complex relationship between a number of intersecting and often competing discourses. Moreover, the discursive articulation of the tween girl often draws upon a combination of discourses related to childhood and adolescent femininity.

The articulations of tween girlhood examined in the case studies of *The Chronicles of Narnia* (Chapter Six) and *Mary-Kate and Ashley* (Chapter Seven) reveal a key tension between developmental discourses of moral and social maturation often associated with adolescent narratives, and a Romantic discourse of childhood innocence and wonder. This tension between historically rooted discourses is further complicated by the articulation of the contemporary discourses of popular feminism. Moreover, the articulation of these discourses of tween girlhood at various sites of a cross-media world (often simultaneously) results in diverse articulations of tween girlhood. In order to outline the evolution of these key discourses of tween girlhood and the significant tensions between them, rather than a chronological history of cultural representations, this chapter draws upon various examples from the cultural history of Anglo-American texts for and about preadolescent girls. The chapter examines three intersecting discourses: discourses of moral and social maturation; discourses of Romantic childhood innocence and sexuality; and popular feminist discourses.

5.2 Developmental discourses of moral and social maturation

This section traces developmental discourses of moral and social maturation that are influential in the representations of tween girlhood in the cross-media worlds. The section discusses books for girls in the eighteenth and nineteenth century, the
bildungsroman and a focused discussion of the novel of maturation as well as the school girl stories. This section begins to introduce the tension between dominant discourses of maturation and a discourse of Romantic innocence that pervades most sites of discourse around tween girlhood.

5.2.1 Books for girls in the eighteenth and nineteenth century: Primers for moral development

Developmental discourses of moral and social maturation in Anglo-American representations of girlhood are often rooted in the moral primers of Protestant Christianity. Until the late nineteenth century, when state controlled compulsory education was launched in England, religion, particularly Protestant Christianity, was central to children’s book publishing and literacy education. Exemplars of this included: the work of James Janeway’s *Token for Children, being an Exact Account of the Conversion, Holy and Exemplary Lives, and Joyful Deaths, of Several Young Children* (1671-72 in England and later in Boston with New England examples in 1700); John Bunyan’s *The Pilgrim’s Progress* (1678); the writings of Isaac Watts; and publications of the Religious Tract Society. Comparatively, in the United States, the American Tract Society, the American Sunday School Union, and many English texts, such as *The Pilgrim’s Progress*, dominated three centuries of publishing (Zipes et.al. 2005: 503).

Many of these publications represented Puritan ideals for children and were distributed through the Sunday School movement beginning in the 1780s. These texts exemplify an explicitly pedagogic agenda, using children’s books to teach religious moral values.

Throughout the seventeenth and eighteenth century, texts were increasingly produced with a dual aim: to teach moral lessons but also to model appropriate social
etiquette. Moreover, with the rise of the middle class, the specific gender address of conduct books became more and more apparent. Middle class boys were to learn how to succeed in work and in social and political life, while girls were encouraged to focus on manners, morals and codes of behaviour (Zipes et al. 2005: 1417). Sarah Fielding’s *The Governess; or, Little Female Academy* (1749), the earliest known long work of fiction for young readers, exemplifies an explicit address to young girl readers. In this text, Mrs. Teachum imparts lessons about proper behaviour and etiquette to nine young girls. During leisure time, an older girl tells fairytales to the other girls. However, in the editions of *The Governess* popularized in the nineteenth century by Mrs. Mary Sherwood (first published in 1820), the two fairy tales were eliminated, retaining only the sections on moral lessons. As discussed in her introduction to the Broadview Edition (2005), Candace Ward observes that this omission of the fairy tales “reflects nineteenth-century trends in children’s literature that emphasized religious content and deemphasized imaginative play” (Ward 2005: 37). Maria Edgeworth voices this sentiment famously in her preface to *The Parent’s Assistant* (1796): “But why should the mind be filled with fantastic visions, instead of useful knowledge? Why should so much valuable time be lost?” (as cited in Zipes et al. 2005: 552). Contemporary texts often exemplify this historical discursive tension between fantasy and fairytale aimed at preadolescent female readers and the aim to focus narratives on moral instruction and social maturation.

The cautionary tale for girls is a prevalent motif in children’s texts from those for the very young in picture books to adolescent fiction in the past until present day. One nineteenth century example is *A Peep Behind The Scenes* (1877), written by Mrs. Octavius Frank Walton and published by the Religious Tract Society. This dramatic cautionary tale aims to save young girls from entering the arena of the devil (i.e. a
theatrical career). The most popular and famous of Walton’s books for young people, the story follows 12-year-old Rosalie who acts in a travelling theatre "The fair may look attractive, and it may seem exciting and glamorous to be on the stage, but the reality is very different, including hard work, illness, exhaustion and the exploitation of children. Rosalie must perform even while her mother is dying" (Mrs. O.F. Walton 1877).

In a similar vein, a number of religious periodicals for young readers included a combination of cautionary tales and moral messages in their selection of articles. For example, The Monthly Packet, a periodical of “Evening Readings for Younger Members of the English Church.” published articles “mainly of a religious nature with lighter serials such as Yonge’s historical romance Little Duke aimed at Victorian teenaged girls” (Cadogan and Craig 22). In 1866, Aunt Judy’s Magazine, another periodical, was initiated for a younger age group. It contained whole page illustrations and published children’s writers such as Hans Christian Andersen and Lewis Carroll. Aunt Judy’s Magazine “contained its share of dire warnings to those who failed to count their blessings” (Cadogan and Craig 25). In one story, The Princess Discontent (published as an anonymous serial in 1867), the narrative charts the experience of princess who begs her fairy godmother to change her into a fairy. Yet, when she tires and longs to become mortal, she awakes to find herself transformed into a toad. (Cadogan and Craig 25). Although most texts for girls were didactic in nature, some children’s texts became infused with fantasy and allegory in order to portray spiritual development. The Princess and the Goblin (1872) by George MacDonald exemplifies this type of allegorical fantasy that later inspired C.S. Lewis’s Narnia series in the 1950s.
5.2.2 Coming-of-age and transformation: The Bildungsroman and the novel of maturation

Developmental discourses of moral and social maturation are also apparent in narratives of coming-of-age and transformation. Coming of age may be defined as the transition from childhood to adulthood and could imply a process or period of physical, social, emotional, legal, religious and cultural transformation that may be involved in an individual's maturation. Coming-of-age narratives have played a central role in fiction, film and other media texts about and for Anglo-American young people over the last century. While the coming-of-age and transformation discourse is usually associated with adolescents, tween texts often exemplify a relationship with this discourse in their representations of preadolescents. Contemporary coming of age texts about adolescent characters are often defined by literary critics as *bildungsromans* or *novels of formation*. *Bildungsroman* is a German term used to describe a novel whose subject is “the development of the protagonist’s mind and character, in the passage from childhood through varied experiences-and often through a spiritual crisis-into maturity and the recognition of his or her identity and role in the world” (Abrams 1993:132). A bildungsroman consists of characteristic elements that may include: a journey triggered by some event, loss or trauma that moves the protagonist away from home, often through exile or escape; a maturation process that involves struggling against internal and external obstacles; the protagonist's rebellion against societal norms. Other common elements may include first experiences with love, sex, drugs, and other illicit 'adult' activities that usually relate to the protagonist's rebellion or spiritual development.

The first bildungsromans are considered to be the German novels: K.P. Moritz's *Anton Reiser* (1785-90) and Goethe's *Wilhelm Meister’s Apprenticeship* (1795-96).
Charles Dickens’ *David Copperfield* (1850) and *Great Expectations* (1861) are often cited as early examples of coming of age novels in the Anglo-American tradition. These accounts of the emotional and moral development of male protagonists from boyhood to adulthood influenced many coming of age novels that followed. A number of coming of age books in the fantasy genre exemplify the influence of mythological tales which involve a hero’s journey to find a specific object, person or place. They typically employ male protagonists undergoing a journey or adventure when they become aware of their special powers or inherited status. J.K. Rowling’s *Harry Potter* series (1997-2007) may be seen as the most recent of a number of popular fantasy book series that involve a young male hero who must come to terms with his special power including Susan Cooper’s *The Dark is Rising* series (1965-77), Ursula LeGuin’s *Earthsea* novels (1968-2001) and Lloyd Alexander’s *The Chronicles of Prydain* (1964-73). Elements of C.S. Lewis’s *The Chronicles of Narnia* reflect these fantasy quest narratives.

While coming-of-age narratives that focus on female and male protagonists draw upon shared themes and experiences, two gendered (and predominantly heterosexual) narrative traditions have evolved: the novel of formation and the novel of maturation. In her discussion of adolescent literature as a genre, Roberta Seelinger Trites (2000) distinguishes between two types of texts about maturation: the Bildungsroman and Entwicklungsroman. While “Entwicklungsroman can be thought of as novels of growth and development, whereas Bildungsroman are coming-of-age novels that are sometimes referred to as ‘apprenticeship novels’” (Trites 2000: 9-10). Moreover, Trites cites Pratt’s argument that coming-of-age narratives focused on female protagonists are often situated within “the novel of mere growth, mere physical passage from one age to the other without psychological development” (Trites 2000: 36). Similarly, while texts aimed at
tween readers tend to draw upon many of the common themes and characters from the Bildungsroman model, generally these preadolescent texts fall into the former category of the Entwicklungsroman, as they do not depict a full transformation into adulthood.

5.2.3 Novels of Maturation: From The Pilgrim’s Progress to progressive utopias

The representations of social and moral development through narratives of maturation in Louisa May Alcott’s *Little Women* (1869) and L.M. Montgomery’s *Anne of Green Gables* (1908) may be considered models for contemporary tween girl books. The transformative narrative that follows Alcott’s protagonist Jo from tomboy to a maternal mentor figure, and Montgomery’s Anne from a tempestuous orphan to a Christian-minded schoolteacher may be viewed as a template for many tween texts, particularly those that chronicle the life of a young female protagonist over a series of books. *The Princess Diaries* (2000) by Meg Cabot, with its related sequels and film adaptations, exemplifies a new interpretation of these transformative narratives.

In his introduction to *Coming of Age in Children’s Literature* (2003), Victor Watson defines a number of eighteenth and nineteenth century fictional narratives about young women as ‘novels of maturation’ (Watson 2003: 10-12). In his introduction to the volume, Watson links the theme of maturation in fiction with the word ‘progress’ and also specifically with John Bunyan’s *The Pilgrim’s Progress* (1678) which posits life as a journey towards salvation (Watson 2003: 4). Books that follow narratives of maturation about young women tend to pair religious pedagogy regarding moral ascent with progressive discourses surrounding a girl’s physical and social development. Watson cites the heroine of Daniel Defoe’s *Moll Flanders* (1722) as possibly the first account of a girl’s maturation in the English novel (2003: 4-5), and argues that Charlotte Bronte’s
novel *Jane Eyre* (1847) may also be viewed as an early novel of maturation that greatly influenced an emerging group of texts with young female protagonists (Watson 2003: 8-9).

Mary Cadogan and Patricia Craig (2003) identify Charlotte M. Yonge, a Sunday School instructress turned writer of books for girls, as one of the originators of the girl’s story in England. The linkage between social and moral development is clearly modelled her stories that encouraged young upper class women to “view themselves as eventual wives and mothers, counting their blessings, doing their duty and maintaining the established structure of society” (Cadogan and Craig 17). While many of Yonge’s heroines seem to be idealized genteel young women, the teenage heroine Etheldred in Yonge’s *The Daisy Chain or Aspirations* (1856) seems to be an antecedent for Jo from Alcott’s *Little Women* (1868) and Anne from Montgomery’s novel *Anne of Green Gables* (1908). Ethel is described as “awkward, plain, untidy and short-sighted, but kind-hearted, with a great dedication to religion” and her elder sister Margaret expresses her concerns regarding her character, “Dear, dear Ethel, how noble and high she is!...If those high purposes should grow out into eccentricities and unfeminineness, what a grievous pity it would be” (cited in Cadogan and Craig 19). Similarly, Meg often reproaches Jo for her unfeminine behaviour in *Little Women*, “You are old enough to leave off boyish tricks and behave better, Josephine” (Alcott 1993: 7). In many of these texts, the desire to ‘do good’ in political or social realms outside of the domestic sphere is tied to the risk of becoming ‘unfeminine’. In addition, many of these texts closely link the control of physical appearance with gendered personality traits.

Based on Alcott’s own family life and experiences during the American Civil War of 1861 to 65. Alcott’s *Little Women* opens with memories of the March sisters re-
enacting Bunyan's *The Pilgrim's Progress* when they were younger girls and "in the course of the account of their family life each is given a chapter written around a *Pilgrim's Progress* episode" (Zipes et. al. 2005: 515). Watson argues that because *Little Women* is constructed upon the moral trajectory of *The Pilgrim's Progress*, readers are not invited into the personal experiences of maturation and growth of the individual characters. Watson muses "the dark places of the March sisters' souls are not explored...how interesting it might have been to have known why Jo is so angry when Meg falls in love; or why fathers are more significant by their absence" (Watson 2003: 11).

Alternatively, some feminist literary critics view *Little Women* as a proto-feminist narrative. Alcott who never married and had worked as a domestic worker, a teacher and later as a military nurse during the Civil War would often voice her proto-feminist beliefs through Jo: "I can't get over my disappointment in not being a boy, and it's worse than ever now for I'm dying to go and fight with papa, and I can only stay at home and knit like a poky old woman" (Alcott 1993: 5). Pat Kirkham and Sarah Warren (1999) consider girlhood in four versions of *Little Women*, from L. M. Alcott's 1868-9 classic novels, to the film versions of 1933, 1949 and 1994. Overall they conclude that the novel, and each of the film adaptations to follow, operate to covertly and overtly subvert the cult of domesticity. The narrative itself does this through the death of the character most obviously coded as "appropriately feminine," Beth, and by championing the character operating the least within these confines, Jo (Kirkham and Warren 1999).

*Little Women* as a popular serial was shortly followed by *Good Wives* (1869), *Little Men* (1871), and *Jo's Boys* (1886). Similar to Etheldred in Yonge's earlier moralistic novel *The Daisy Chain* (1856), one of the main narratives in *Little Women* is
Jo’s transition “from tomboy to great-earth mother” (Cadogan and Craig 36-37).

Similarly, Anne, in L.M. Montgomery’s *Anne of Green Gables* series, progresses from a spirited and tempestuous orphan in the first novel to a Christian-minded schoolteacher and mother (with child-like goodness and spirit) in later sequels. Other stories that follow this “maturation” process include American writer Susan Coolidge’s *What Katy Did* (1872) and its sequels *What Katy Did At School* (1873) and *What Katy Did Next* (1886). Katy is also a tomboy who does not care for sewing or good manners, until she is crippled by an accident which prevents her from walking for several years. In the second book, Katy and her sister Clover are sent to boarding-school; while in the third book, Katy goes to Europe where she meets a young US naval lieutenant and becomes engaged.

Watson charts the rise of domestic family fiction in North America as beginning with *Little Women* as a prototype for Coolidge’s novels, followed by Kate Douglas Wiggin’s *Rebecca of Sunnybrook Farm* (1903), L.M. Montgomery’s *Anne of Green Gables* and its sequels (1908-21), as well as Eleanor H. Porter’s *Pollyanna* (1913) (Watson 2003: 12). Notably, a Romantic discourse of childhood innocence (discussed in section 5.3) provides a tension within these domestic narratives of maturation. All of these books share “a feeling of loss and regret that the heroically reckless and imaginative child must renounce the person she once was in order to accept a diminished adult role” (Watson 2003: 12). Similarly, Walkerdine observes that in relation to psychoeducational texts and practices “The little girl as growing into a nurturant quasi-mother jostled for space uncomfortably against the trope of the child” (Walkerdine 1997: 80-81). Within many novels of maturation, the image of childhood and its related elements of imagination, fantasy and play constructs these characteristics of girlhood as
only acceptable before adolescence. Thus, in the maturation process of these texts, the female protagonist must learn the limits of the fantasy in order to move beyond her child-like qualities and progress towards adulthood.

Montgomery’s *Anne of Green Gables* (1908) provides a key example of this tension in novels of maturation. Over the course of the novel, Anne must overcome a series of domestic, social and academic obstacles in order to become a successful young woman in Avonlea. For example, following the “Unfortunate Lily Maid” incident, Anne reflects upon the lessons she has learned through a series of mistakes:

The affair of the amethyst brooch cured me of meddling with things that didn’t belong to me. The Haunted Wood mistake cured me of letting my imagination run away with me. The liniment cake mistake cured me of carelessness in cooking. Dyeing my hair cured me of vanity... And today’s mistake is going to cure me of being too romantic. I have come to the conclusion that it is no use trying to be romantic in Avonlea. It was probably easy enough in towered Camelot hundreds of years ago, but romance is not appreciated now.

(Montgomery 1968: 242)

As represented in this passage, a discourse of social and moral maturation dominates the narrative. However, while one of Anne’s continued lessons throughout the series is that she must learn the appropriate uses and limits of her imagination (i.e. “there is no use trying to be romantic in Avonlea”). Nevertheless, Matthew’s response to Anne’s self-reflection (cited above) portrays the conflicted message of the book: “don’t give up all your romance, Anne,” he whispered shyly, “a little of it is a good thing—not too much, of course—but keep a little of it, Anne” (Montgomery 1968: 242). While, Anne must learn to not “let her imagination run away with her,” the appeal of Anne’s character is her
infectious innocent, and imaginative spirit. As Nodelman remarks, heroines like Anne, “look Duty in the face, their spirits are not quenched by it. They age without losing their childlike qualities, grow up without actually growing up; that is the heart of the appeal of these novels” (Nodelman 1996: 80). Following, Walkerdine’s observations regarding the representation of young females as both proto-mothers and innocent children, Anne’s maturation in the novel involves her mothering of Marilla and Matthew through her Romantic and youthful spirit.

5.2.4 School girl stories: From individual maturation to peer-group interactions

The schoolgirl story, that gained popularity through a number of series in the United Kingdom, may be perceived as another influence on the discourses of contemporary tween texts. Among the school stories series books, Elinor Brent-Dyer’s Chalet School (1925-1970) and Enid Blyton’s Malory Towers (1946-1951) may be viewed as predecessors of contemporary tween series books. Although Fielding’s The Governess (1749), used the school as a setting for moral lessons, the school story genre, particularly the boys’ school story, popularized in nineteenth-century England with Thomas Hughes’s Tom Brown’s Schooldays (1857) among others. The gender divide in the school story worlds reflected distinctions in sex-segregated or differentiated education in England (Cadogan and Craig 2003). Earlier school girl stories such as A World of Girls (1886) by L.T. Meade, and the boarding school stories of Angela Brazil such as The Luckiest Girl in the School (1916), often adopted elements of the boys’ school stories and added in elements of friendship between girls, and emotional content in general. Many of the conventions of the schoolgirl series were echoed in peer group focused stories published in the United States. Peer group stories in the United States
often involved summer camp or an after school club (for example *The Babysitter's Club* series (1986-2000) by Ann M. Martin), in order to create similar circumstances as the boarding school narratives; worlds where the world of the peer-groups forms the central relationship for the protagonists.

Although situated at school, these stories were less about intellectual education itself, than focused upon physical, moral, and character education. Many of the themes from novels of maturation remained central issues in the movement from the domestic family story to the girl’s school story. For example, the meaning of home for Anne extends outside of Green Gables to an assortment of kindred spirits and bosom friends in Avonlea. Diana Barry becomes Anne’s “bosom friend”, who the latter describes as “an intimate friend… a really kindred spirit to whom I can confide my inmost soul. I’ve dreamed of meeting her my whole life” (Montgomery 1968: 62). In schoolgirl stories, although the girls may be removed from parents and siblings, the issues of authority, peer groups, bosom friends and personal development continue within the confined sphere of the school. Relationships between girls (and thus the positive and negative characteristics of living in a community of women) are often a central focus of the stories.

Good girl and bad girl dichotomies that are often a central tension in contemporary stories aimed at tween girls were already evident in these school stories. Following moral and social development standards set up by earlier novels of maturation, in school stories, good girls are coded as acting with adjustable and appropriate behaviour while bad girls are tomboyish and resistant and often wish to pursue non-traditionally feminine pursuits. Cadogan and Craig identify a “tomboy-taming process” in nineteenth century fiction that mirrors the narratives of Anne and Jo discussed earlier. Meade’s stories often had a “hot-blooded heroine” who acts “a foil for more sober girls,
by whose virtuousness they are moulded into acquiescent personalities” (Cadogan and Craig 53-54). Many female protagonists of this later period are described with physical delicacy and beauty and thus, are connected to goodness. Beth in Little Women and to some extent Diana in Anne of Green Gables may also be examples of this connection. These two characters also act as foils to Jo and Anne, both exuberant tomboys. Certainly, the significance of teacher/mentors, schoolmates and later Anne’s role as a teacher herself connect many novels of maturation with the school story genre with a continuation of the same discursive themes in the school context.

In an article on the Chalet School book series, Jansson (2003) links popular school stories to Victorian didacticism, aspiration and moral teaching that underlined advice and guidance literature of the nineteenth century. Jansson outlines three possibilities for women in Brent-Dyer’s school stories: a career woman, married, or a candidate for spiritual life (2003: 55). Moreover, Jansson argues that the notion of the angel/child/saviour is epitomized in the Chalet School stories through the character of Robin Humphries, Joey Bettany’s adopted sister. Joey is a career woman, mother of eleven children, wife, an exuberant and spiritual guide and mentor to many of the girls in the school stories. In comparison, Joey’s sister Robin has been sent to the Chalet school to be supervised by the Sanatorium nearby, as she is vulnerable to tuberculosis, which killed her mother. These texts explicitly articulate a dominant discourse of social and moral maturation. However, many of these representations of moral maturation in the school girl stories and the novels of maturation that preceded them are also underscored by a discourse of Romantic childhood innocence and wonder. This influential discourse is discussed in the following section.
5.3 Discourses of childhood innocence and sexuality

This section builds on the discourses of social and moral maturation in the previous section with an examination of the Romantic discourse of childhood innocence and wonder. The section expands on this literary discourse with the discourse of eroticized innocence associated with the concept of the eroticized pure little girl of the Victorian period and the representation of Shirley Temple within a similar discourse in a later period. The section concludes with a discussion of the movement from discourses of morality to discourses of normality with regards to the representation of appropriate physical and sexual maturation for preadolescent females.

5.3.1 Romantic discourse of childhood innocence and wonder

A predominant discourse of childhood innocence and wonder derived from Romanticism pervades the majority Anglo-American children’s literature and other cultural texts about childhood and girlhood. Thacker and Webb (2002) observe that “it is often claimed that the image of the romantic child has been a key point of reference for the birth of children’s literature since the beginning of the nineteenth century” (Thacker and Webb 13). Discourses rooted in the Romantic Movement of the 19th century is particularly connected to ideas in William Blake’s Songs of Innocence and Experience (1789), as well as work by other well-known Romantic writers and poets such as William Wordsworth and Samuel Coleridge. Romanticism is particularly associated with the “fascination with childhood and a desire to recapture an innocent apprehension of the world” (Thacker and Webb 13). This Romantic discourse conceptualizes childhood as an innocent sphere, separated from sexuality and other adult corruptions; and directly linked
to intuitive experiences of imagination and wonder. The child is often positioned in this discourse as visionary or prophetic in their purity and innocence.

Jenkins observes that “[t]he Romantics valued the child’s easy access to the world of the imagination and sought to free themselves to engage with the world in a more childlike fashion” (1998:18). Within the frame of Romanticism, children’s literature was viewed as a venue for a pure or sublime experience of ‘child-like’ wonder, fantasy and the imagination. This discourse emphasizes fantasy and fairytale as well as connections to nature as modes to experience childhood wonder. The emphasis on nature and the sublime has been connected symbolically not only to the image of the openness of childhood but also to the feminine in psychoanalytic theory (for example Julia Kristeva’s discussion of feminine imaginary and poetic language 1980). Moreover, Romantic discourses in children’s literature texts tend to exemplify both “the author/artist as possessor of particular kinds of superior knowledge and the valorisation of the power of the imagination” (Thacker and Webb 4). These discourses influence the imagined relationship constructed between adult author and child reader.

5.3.2 Discourse of eroticized innocence: The Victorian ‘pure little girl’ and Shirley Temple

Many texts about and for preadolescent girls exemplify an idealization of Romantic childhood innocence through the representation of the girl-child who is characterized by both innocence and wonder. Building on work by James Kincaid (1992) on the eroticization of childhood innocence in Victorian culture, Carol Mavor (1996) examination of Lewis Carroll’s photographs of young girls, describes the image of the little girl in the Victorian period as:
both sexual and nonsexual, the body of the little girl marked her as simultaneously different from the male viewer and (according to cultural conventions) lacking the marks of true womanhood. As ‘pure little girl,’ she was supposedly nonsexual. Yet given the work of Freud and Foucault, the ‘cult of the little girl’, the artistic treatment of her image, the uneasy law of the period, and so forth, we cannot read her as anything but sexual. She was thus both woman and not-woman; she played safely and dangerously (Mavor 170).

Lewis Carroll’s *Alice in Wonderland* (1890) provides an appropriate site to begin to unpack the competing discourses around the Romantic idealization and fetishization of childhood innocence in relation to the girl-child protagonist. For example, in Lewis Carroll’s poem that opens *Alice in Wonderland* (1890) Alice is envisioned as the idealized girl-child. The poem, whose narrator’s tone is distinct from the narrator of the prose tale, speaks of a “Dream-child moving through a land/Of wonders wild and new,/In friendly chat with bird or beast...Alice moving under skies/Never seen by waking eyes” (Carroll 2001: 345). This poem positions Alice as a mythic dream-like creature, a representation that provides a tension with the often stubborn and impetuous girl-child in the primary narrative.

Shirley Temple exemplifies another example of this paradoxical stance of the eroticized innocent girl-child in the form of the child star. Graham Greene famously caused a public moral outcry in 1937 when he described Shirley Temple in the film *Wee Willie Winkie* (1937) as a “fancy little piece” whose admirers were predominantly middle-aged men (as cited in Nash 2006: 162). Moreover, he observed the central relationship in her films was often between a doting wealthy, middle aged man and the child star. As highlighted in Chapter Two, Valerie Walkerdine in *Daddy’s Girl: Young*
girls and popular culture (1997) examines both Shirley Temple and the young protagonist of Little Orphan Annie from the comic strip originally created by Harold Gray (1924-2010). These two related types of little girls represented in popular culture from the Great Depression onwards who often charms curmudgeon upper class men into better behaviour. Walkerdine proposes that "the character of Annie was an adult fantasy, portrayed for adults and not child appeal" (1997: 82). However, while Little Orphan Annie as a fictional character was able to remain an adult fantasy of idealized innocence, the discourse around Shirley Temple, as both a real girl and a cultural icon exemplifies a common tension between the discourse of Romantic innocence and the discourses of maturation.

The maturation of child stars, particularly female child stars is often articulated in public media discourse in tandem with the fictional narratives on film in which they are represented. Ilana Nash observes how Shirley Temple's maturation into an adolescent was followed closely by the media and her attempts at taking on adolescent and mature roles resulted in critical responses that focused as much on the film as Temple's evolution into womanhood (2006: 162-163). This particular type of tension in discourses around Temple may be perceived as an earlier incarnation of tensions examined in the case studies, particularly in relation to the maturation of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen both within and outside textual narratives.

5.3.3 Narratives of appropriate physical and sexual maturation: From pedagogies of morality to normality

While the concept of maturation implicitly involves physical development in as part of the movement towards adulthood, in earlier novels of maturation such as Little
Women and Anne of Green Gables the theme of sexuality and sexual development is not explicitly spelled out. Rather, due to the tension between discourses of innocence described in the previous sections and discourses of maturation, sexual development has often been an absent but implicit theme in preadolescent and adolescent female narratives. However, sexual maturation is often alluded to in the narrative, often underlined by discourses of social and moral development.

Romantic/sexual awakening for “innocent” tomboys is implicitly alluded to in a number of texts. Usually sexual awakening is brought on by an interaction with a young man where his sexual interest is identified. For example, Alcott describes one of Jo’s first encounters with the boy next door, Laurie: “The solitary, hungry look in his eyes went straight to Jo’s warm heart. She had been so simply taught that there was no nonsense in her head, and at fifteen she was as innocent and frank as any child” (Alcott 1993: 52).

Comparatively, a romantic moment between Anne and Gilbert in Anne of Green Gables describes “an odd, newly awakened consciousness under all [of Anne’s] outraged dignity that the half-shy, half-eager expression in Gilbert’s hazel eyes was something that was very good to see. Her heart gave a queer little beat” (Montgomery 1968: 188). The third person narrator in these earlier texts observes hints of sexual maturation but at the same time, remains outside true self-awareness with regards to these developments. These narratives rarely allow the voices of the protagonists to challenge the level of innocence that is described by the narrator.

An uncomfortable relationship between the concepts of sexuality and childhood continues to be articulated in contemporary representations of tween girlhood. Stuart Aitken (2001) observes that because childhood is conceptually separated from the adult
world, and its related vices and realities, children are conceptualized as both innocent and wild simultaneously:

Children are excluded from many moral judgments because they are embodied by discourses that foist a child-centred pedagogy on a socially constructed innocence or wildness. Through their bodies, children are seemingly exempted (or, rather, located differently) from the moral order until they can be marked as other or with appropriate maturation, embraced (67).

Moral and social guides for appropriate maturation through appearance and behaviour have been identified as a key discourse throughout the history of representations; the bodily experiences of maturation for preadolescent girls in cultural representations for and about tween girlhood are relatively recent.

The absence of representations around the reality of physical and sexual maturation for preadolescent and adolescent females (and women in general) are characteristic of texts aimed at preadolescent girls in the past and present (including the cross-media worlds of this study). Prior to the 1970s the only children’s book that mentioned menstruation was Louise Fitzhugh’s *The Long Secret* published in 1965 “which offers the jolly imagery of rotten pebbles cutting you up inside and then falling out of you” (Barry 1998:7). However, since its publication in 1970, *Are you there God, It’s me Margaret* (1970), and other puberty-themed novels by Judy Blume have addressed issues of physical development head on. Margaret asks “Are you there God? It’s me Margaret. Gretchen, my friend, got her period. I’m so jealous God. I hate myself for being so jealous, but I am. I wish you’d help me just a little. Nancy’s sure she’s going to get it soon, too. And if I’m last I don’t know what I’ll do. Oh please God, I just want to be normal (Blume 100). From the point of view of 12-year-old Margaret, the narrative
follows a group of young female friends who race to be the first through developmental hurdles of breast development, menstruation and heterosexual relationships.

Blume’s text illustrates how children’s and adolescent literature (along with the conventions of agony aunt columns and teen magazines) become ways to engage with and consequently solidify discourses of normal physical development for young women. Moreover, this text turns narratives of appropriate moral and social development into primers for young readers about what is ‘normal’ sexual development. Blume’s text has a dual message. She defines for her young readers what changes are included as part of normative adolescent development; but more significantly she also confirms that anxiety about and preoccupation with normative development is also ‘normal’ behaviour. In contemporary children’s and adolescent literature, the discourse of ‘normal’ development has taken the role of appropriate moral conduct and development central to earlier novels of maturation.

In *The Trouble with Normal* (1997), Mary Louise Adams thematically sets up the central concept of the dyad whereby normality and abnormality co-exist as a dynamic pair that inform power relationships within western cultures: “The terms themselves are relative, making sense to us only as a dyad. If there was no abnormality, the concept of normality would not make sense” (Adams 84-85). She alludes to Foucault’s construction of public discourses as “a powerful site of and mechanism for the regulation of sex” and normalization works as an act of moral regulation to distribute power (Adams 134). Public discourses, including these texts for young girls, use language as a tool to define and thus control normative sexual development, identities and behaviour. Adams identifies that according to many of prescriptive texts, including children’s and adolescent literature, ‘normal’ meant “middle class, white with proper expressions of
gender” (Adams 87). Barry’s description of Blume’s coming-of-age texts would confirm this definition of normality: “Judy Blume’s books are a hymn to normalcy. Set in the suburbs, they usually center on children whose fondest wish is to not be deviant—they frequently have exceptional friends or siblings, but themselves show no quality remotely out of the ordinary” (Barry 1998: 3).

On the other side of the ‘normalcy’ of Blume’s protagonist, a tendency in teen, and more recently tween, realistic fiction since the 1960s has been the emergence of what has been termed “the problem novel”. The most famous of these problem novels is Go Ask Alice: A Real Diary (1971). The novel is presented as a diary of an anonymous teenage girl (‘edited’ by Beatrice Sparks), who begins as a drug addict at age 15 and dies of an overdose after her 17th birthday. This text became a model for this genre that filters into both literary and popular series fiction for young readers that aims to depict the real-life problems of adolescents including: drugs, alcohol, abuse, pregnancy, and sexually transmitted diseases (Go Ask Alice 1971). Distinct from the Blume’s “hymns to normalcy” (Barry 1998:3), the problem novel works to institute normal (i.e. morally appropriate) teenage behaviour using fear tactics regarding the consequences of immoral and abnormal behaviour. The discourses of the problem novel and problem girl as opposed to normative development are re-articulated again in the context of popular feminist discourses.

5.4 Popular feminist discourses

Popular feminist discourses are often drawn upon in the articulation of tween girlhood in the cross-media worlds of the case studies in conjunction with older discourses of maturation, and Romantic innocence. This section addresses the various
incarnations of the girl power discourse, particularly in terms of mainstream popular
culture forms of girl power including commodity feminism, and the discourse of adult
women ‘empowering’ young girls.

5.4.1 Girl power and commodity feminism

The tween texts in the study primarily exemplify mainstream and popular culture
articulations of girl power often associated with Third Wave Feminism. In an article on
the articulation of girl power in various television programs on the Nickelodeon cable
network, Sarah Banet-Weiser (2004) further observes that:

In the mid-1990s, The Spice Girls, a manufactured, pop-music girl-group,
adopted “Girl Power!” as their motto. And, at the same time, the alternative
internet community the Riot Grrrls incorporated girl power ideology in their
efforts to construct a new kind of feminist politics (120).

Building on this understanding of girl power as associated with both alternative culture
and popular culture, Harris (2005) outlines diverse celebrities connected with girl power
including Courtney Love, Buffy the Vampire Slayer and Spice Girls who are “deemed to
embody girlpower because they are outspoken, not afraid to take power, believe in
themselves, and run their own lives” (17). Many representations of tween heroines draw
upon the qualities of outspokenness, and individuality exemplified by these ‘girl power’
celebrities.

Harris also describes how elements of punk culture were taken up by more
mainstream representations of girl power, ultimately resulting in what some define as
commodity feminism: “punk philosophy of DIY (do it yourself) and individual
responsibility for social change lent itself easily to its transformation into a discourse of
choice and focus on the self. Since this reinvention, it has become a catchphrase for young women’s new style of display and attitude” (2005: 17). The discourse of commodity feminism positions consumer choices, primarily those related to fashion and individualized style, as a mode to realize ‘girl power.’ However, the mainstreaming of the girl power discourse often reflects the influence of developmental discourses of appropriate social and moral maturation. In her research on adolescent style, Shauna Pomerantz (2006) observes that the discourse of individualized choice is often negotiated in relation to a discourse of appropriate and normative appearance: “[W]hile girls had agency to carefully and creatively negotiate their identities, they were also positioned with economic, cultural, and religious realities that meant a girl could not simply buy whatever she wanted or wear whatever she felt like wearing” (Pomerantz 185).

Moreover, as exemplified by the mary-kateandashley products, the offer of girl power to tween girls is often limited to a select number of developmentally appropriate options for the articulation of individualized style.

5.4.2 The other side of the girl power discourse: Empowering ‘at risk’ girls

In Future Girl (2005), Anita Harris outlines the construction of the ‘can do’ girl and the ‘at risk’ girl as offshoot discourses of the new girl power identity: “Girlpower is intended to provide young women with the tools for mainstream success, and those who stray from this path are constituted as delinquent risk takers. Young women who are involved in gang, commit crimes, or act violently are often depicted as byproducts of girlpower out of control” (29). The discourses of the ‘at risk’ girls discussed by Harris are often articulated in texts aimed at tween girls with the hope of ‘saving’ girls before they become ‘at risk’ adolescent women. These texts draw upon this discourse to
empower girls in the face of media commercialization, sexualization, body image disorders, and violence. Clinical psychologist, Mary Pipher’s *Raising Ophelia: Saving the Selves of Adolescent Girls* (1994), cited below, continues to be a touchstone for the at-risk girl discourse:

But girls today are more oppressed. They are coming of age in a more dangerous, sexualized and media-saturated culture. They face incredible pressures to be beautiful and sophisticated, which in junior high means using chemicals and being sexual. As they navigate a more dangerous world, girls are less protected. As I look at the culture that girls enter as they come of age, I was struck by what a girl-poisoning culture it was. (12)

While some recent texts are directed at parents and adults concerned about young women such as *Packaging Girlhood: Rescuing Our Daughters from Marketer’s Schemes* (2007) by Sharon Lamb and Lyn Mikel Brown, other texts such as Heather M. Gray and Samantha Phillip’s *Real Girl/Real World: A Guide to Finding Your True Self* (2005) are produced within this discourse but in the form of advice books for girls. Tween girl texts tend to engage with both the mainstream incarnation of girl power and the empowering ‘at risk’ girl discourses.

5.5 Conclusion: Mapping intersecting discourses of tween girlhood

This chapter has mapped the key intersecting discourses as well as various tensions that constitute contemporary tween girlhood, particularly in the cross-media worlds in this study. Each cross-media world (in Chapter Six and Seven) exemplifies an intersection of these discourses of tween girlhood outlined in this discursive history. The tracing of a discursive history sets the stage for the analysis of discourses in the case
studies. The discourses of moral and social maturation, Romantic innocence and sexuality, and popular feminist discourses highlighted in this chapter are re-articulated and negotiated at various sites of a cross-media world to articulate tween girlhood as a discursive identity.

The following two analysis chapters exemplify two cross-media worlds that articulate the discourses of tween girlhood outlined in this discursive history in distinct manners. The examination of Lucy Pevensie from C.S. Lewis’s *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950) focuses on how this canonical children’s text articulates various discourses outlined in the discursive history, and how these are translated across media as part of the Disney/Walden Media franchise. The cross-media adaptation and franchising of Lewis’s text significantly illustrates how older discourses continue to be rearticulated and reinforced in contemporary cross-media cultures of tween girlhood, often through multimodal design. At the same time, various sites of articulation illustrate the potential for disruption or negotiation of these discourses through multimodal design and cross-media play.
CHAPTER SIX


6.1 Introduction to the case study: Narnia as a cross-media phenomenon

Long considered a canonical text of English-language children’s literature, C.S. Lewis’s *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950), the first of seven known collectively as *The Chronicles of Narnia*, has been widely distributed globally, translated into multiple languages, and adapted across various formats. In 2006, the novel had sold over 100 million copies since its initial publication, and approximately 20 million copies over the previous ten years (Kelly 2006). Thus, the *Narnia* series may be perceived as a shared cultural touchstone for a broad international audience of readers.

C.S. Lewis himself and the *Narnia* texts have attracted the divergent interests of literary academics, literacy educators, and theologians. The critical response to C.S. Lewis and the *Narnia* books has been extensive and varied. While many continue to laud Lewis’s children’s texts, others are critical of the text in terms of literary merit as well as the religious and cultural values that underlie the narrative. Phillip Pullman, the author of *The Golden Compass* and *His Dark Materials* trilogy, has been notably vocal in his anti-Lewis and anti-Narnia stance. In an article in *The Guardian* in 2002, John Ezard quotes Pullman as describing the text as religious “propaganda”, “monumentally disparaging of girls and women” and “blatantly racist” (Ezard 2002). At the same time, while Christian-oriented groups often support Lewis’s weaving of Christian allegory through a fantasy narrative aimed at young people, other groups critique the texts as anti-Christian and promoting witchcraft (Brown 2003). In the midst of these criticisms, the *Narnia* texts continue to sustain their popular appeal. The BBC Big Read (2003) placed
The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe at number nine in the top 100 best-loved books ("The Big Read" 2003), and the New York Public Library lists the novel in the top 100 favourite children books for recommended reading ("Recommended Reading" 2010). The continued popularity of these texts may be related to the multiple cross-media adaptations of Narnia in diverse time periods and production contexts.

Since its publication, The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe has been adapted into a theatrical production, a radio play, an animated feature (1979), and twice as a television serial (1967; 1988). Most recently, the 2005 release of the Disney/Walden Media film remodelled the text within contemporary commercial and cross-media cultures. The total worldwide box office revenue was cited as $744,783,957, making it the 20th highest grossing movie of all time ("World Wide Grosses" 2005). The release of this feature film also produced an extensive franchise that includes: two feature film sequels The Chronicles of Narnia: Prince Caspian (2008) and The Chronicles of Narnia: The Voyage of the Dawn Treader (2010); DVD bonus features; collectible products; video games; and interactive websites. While all adaptations of Lewis's text involve the translation of textual discourse into a new context or format, the recent Disney/Walden Media film exemplifies the translation of discourse across a number of media forms simultaneously in the context of a branded franchise. In addition, the Narnia books and film franchise involve extensive digital fan communities that may expand discourse far beyond the limits of the fictional characters and narratives. My definition of Narnia as a cross-media world encompasses these various sites of articulation.

This case study illustrates how the discourses around the preadolescent female protagonist Lucy Pevensie in a canonical children's literature text have been re-articulated through filmic adaptation, across franchise texts and diverse audience
contexts. Using the protagonist Lucy as a focus, this chapter examines the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play as discursive practices in the articulation of discourses around tween girlhood in the cross-media world of *Narnia*.

The first part of the chapter provides a social semiotic analysis of the articulation of key discourses in the original novel (1950) through the multimodal design of Lucy in C.S. Lewis’s written text and Pauline Baynes’s illustrations. The analysis reveals how multimodal design of Lucy, particularly in a key textual segment “Lucy Through the Wardrobe”, articulates the intersection of competing discourses highlighted in the discursive history of tween girlhood (outlined in Chapter Five), particularly the tension between Romantic childhood innocence and developmental discourses of moral and social maturation. The analysis compares the adaptation of these discourses in the multimodal design of this textual segment in two distinct institutional/production contexts: the BBC television serial (1988) and the Disney/Walden Media film (2005). The second part of the analysis focuses on how the discourses from the multimodal design of the film are expanded and re-articulated through various tie-in franchise texts. In addition, the analysis examines how each of these franchise texts may provide offers for cross-media play. The third part of the analysis examines the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play as discursive practices at selected sites of audience discourse both in digital fan cultures and focus group responses from fieldwork in Toronto, Canada. This three-tiered analysis focuses on the roles of multimodal design, and cross-media play as discursive practices in the articulation of discourses of tween girlhood in relation to Lucy Pevensie.
6.2 Lewis's *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* (1950): Production/institutional context

The analysis of the visual and textual representation of Lucy Pevensie in the original novel by C.S. Lewis reflects a number of elements at hand in the production context. Lewis's allusions to Christianity, diverse mythologies, Romantic literature, and fantasy narratives in the representation of Lucy, reflect his background as a medievalist, literature professor at the University of Oxford, theologian, and Christian apologist. Although he is most known for *The Chronicles of Narnia*, the majority of Lewis's work is related to Christianity including texts such as the recount of his conversion in *The Pilgrim's Regress* (1933) and *Surprised by Joy* (1952). Moreover, James Russell (2009) describes “Lewis’s status as the public face of British Christianity (and as the key voice of ‘Christian apologetics’) when he was asked by the BBC to deliver a series of radio addresses which considered the role of the Christian individual and the travails of a Christian nation at a time of war” (62). This public Christian role as well as Lewis’s participation in housing evacuated children from London during the Blitz are key influences on the nationalist discourse in *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe*. Significantly, the utopian world of Narnia reflects a cultivated nostalgia for a British chivalric past and Arthurian mythology in addition to the use of Christian symbolism.

In addition, his relationship with J.R. Tolkien as a member of a writing group at Oxford called the Inklings is also a notable influence. There are various connections and comparisons made between Tolkien's *Lord of the Rings* fantasy series in popular and critical discourse. These connections between Tolkien and Lewis continue in the relationship between the feature film-adaptations of both fantasy series at levels of production and audience reception (Jacobs 2005: 305-314). While this analysis focuses
on discourses around Lucy in *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe*, the text is situated within a series of *Narnia* texts that expand many of the discourses found in the first novel. These influential elements related to the production context are addressed in terms of their relevance to the articulation of discourse around Lucy Pevensie in the original novel as well as the 1988 and 2005 adaptations.

### 6.2.1 Ideational metafunction in the written text

*The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* charts the experiences of the Pevensie children (Peter, Susan, Edmund and Lucy) after they are evacuated from London during World War II (circa 1940) and sent to live with an old Professor in the country. During exploration of the Professor’s house, Lucy finds a magic portal through a wardrobe to a land called Narnia; a land which is stuck endlessly in a long winter under the power of the White Witch. Although they do not believe her initially, first Edmund (who is enchanted by the White Witch) and then all of the siblings enter Narnia through the wardrobe. The Pevensies discover that they are the subjects of an ancient prophesy that foretells that when they return as the rightful kings and queens of Narnia, Aslan, an elusive and powerful lion, will return as the true ruler of Narnia. The novel charts the quest of the siblings to find Aslan, rescue Edmund, and fight the Witch and her followers. In the genre of fantasy adventure, the narrative may be read as a Christian allegory as well as a rite-of-passage quest tale.

Lucy is the youngest of the Pevensie siblings and the first to discover and access the fantasy world of Narnia. Although her siblings do not initially believe her discovery of Narnia, Lucy continues to stand by her belief until they all embark upon their adventure. Throughout Lewis’s *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe*, the linguistic and
visual representation of Lucy Pevensie primarily articulates the discourse of Romantic childhood innocence and wonder. Moreover, Lucy is represented as the most faithful believer in Aslan of the Pevensie children. In addition, Lucy and Susan are witnesses to Aslan’s sacrifice on the Stone Table in order to save Edmund, the most explicit reference to Christian mythology in the text (Lewis 2005: 154-155). Lucy’s participation in this event emphasizes her function as a moral symbol of faith and innocence.

The discourses surrounding Lucy Pevensie in the original novel may be highlighted in its first chapter particularly the key segment that includes Lucy’s first discovery of the wardrobe as a magic portal into Narnia until her first meeting with the faun, Mr. Tumnus by the lamppost (Lewis 2005: 6-10). After a brief description of the Pevensie children’s departure from London during World War II, the written narrative moves quickly to the depiction of the four siblings exploring the Professor’s house, and Lucy’s discovery of the wardrobe. In this segment, both Lewis’s linguistic representation and Pauline Baynes’s visual representation of Lucy articulate a tension between the discourse of moral and social development, and the Romantic discourse of childhood innocence and wonder.

Devin Brown (2003) proposes that the Narnia texts follow the developmental discourse of mythic and quest narratives:

Following a universal pattern-departure from a familiar home, initiation into a larger unknown world, trial and testing, some form of death and renewal, and then finally return and reinvigoration-the Narnia protagonists can be seen as incarnations of what Joseph Campbell has labelled the hero with a thousand faces, and can serve as models in the process of maturation and development. (99)
However, while the novel as a whole exemplifies elements of the mythological quest narrative, each child protagonist articulates a specific developmental moral trajectory throughout the novel, and the *Chronicles of Narnia* as a series. As discussed in Chapter Five, Watson observes that the dominant maturation discourse in British children’s literature may be traced specifically to the influence of John Bunyan’s allegorical narrative that posits life as a journey towards salvation, *The Pilgrim’s Progress* (1678) (Watson 2003). As a canonical text in this tradition, Lewis’s novel articulates a discourse of social maturation that is closely linked to moral development for the child protagonists (Trim 1995). As part of an allegorical framework, the maturation of each child protagonist exemplifies a specific moral trajectory rather than an individualized quest narrative. Thus, the representation of Lucy Pevensie is often in relation to the developmental discourses of her siblings.

In the introductory chapter of the novel, the Pevensie children are initially described with few details related to their physical appearance. Rather, the characterization of the child protagonists relies on narrative action and what Kress and van Leeuwen define as “circumstances” (characterized by a relational association in the representation to a setting, person (circumstances of accompaniment), or object (circumstances of means) in order to gain information about character attributes (Kress and van Leeuwen 1996: 72-73). The narrator reveals that the Professor “was so odd-looking that Lucy (who was the youngest) was a little afraid of him and Edmund (who was the next youngest) wanted to laugh” (Lewis 2005: 4). In this early description, the ages of the children are defined only through circumstances of accompaniment; in relation to each other, and initially in terms of their responses to the old Professor. Lewis characterizes Lucy as young and fearful, and Edmund as young and mischievous.
Edmund is the focus of an explicit moral challenge throughout the novel, and even in this early description, his actions are contrasted with those of his consistently innocent and faithful younger sister.

In terms of a discourse of gendered maturation, Lucy is often represented in contrast to her older sister Susan. While in the first Narnia text, Susan is presented as a well-behaved role model for her younger siblings, later in the series in The Last Battle (1956), Susan’s development into a young woman who focuses on “nylons and lipstick and invitations” disconnects her from the fantasy world (Lewis 1986: 128). Susan’s movement into adulthood exemplifies a coming-of-age transformation discourse that underpins most novels of maturation about adolescent female characters; however, this transformation discourse contradicts the Romantic childhood of Lewis’s Narnia. Although an extensive discussion of Lewis’s depiction of Susan is outside the scope of this analysis, it is significant to note that Susan’s coming-of-age narrative works to reinforce Lucy’s representation within a discourse of childhood innocence. Similarly, Lucy’s role as the innocent female child is further emphasized through the representation of the other significant female figure in the narrative: Jadis, the White Witch. Inspired by Hans Christian Andersen’s fairytale “The Snow Queen”, Circe from Homer’s Odyssey, Medusa of Greek mythology, as well as other witches in Nordic mythology (Kirk 2005b: 10), Jadis, exemplifies the femme fatale qualities of these mythological characters as well as the majority of powerful adult females in popular texts for young people including the witches, evil stepmothers and jealous queens of Disney’s animated adaptations of fairytales (Do Rozario 2004).

The wardrobe segment illustrates the articulation of the Romantic child discourse through the representation of Lucy. In the lead up to this segment, the exploration of the
house is narrated in third person following the experience of all four children together as they examine different rooms in the old house. The narration visually describes what all four children view in the different rooms until Lucy remains behind to explore the wardrobe:

‘Nothing there!’ said Peter, and they all trooped out again—all except Lucy. She stayed behind because she thought it would be worth while trying the door of the wardrobe, even though she felt almost sure that it would be locked. To her surprise it opened quite easily, and two moth-balls dropped out. (Lewis 2005: 6)

The logic behind Lucy remaining behind to examine the wardrobe is merely that she was curious: “she thought it would be worth while trying the door of the wardrobe” (6). She is separated at this point from the other characters in terms of her ‘child-like’ innocent curiosity. Thus, the wardrobe segment significantly affirms Lucy’s ideational function in the articulation of the Romantic discourse of childhood innocence and wonder. Following this discourse, Lucy is represented as an innocent, preadolescent girl whose curiosity, mixed with goodness, gives her special access to magical powers or fantasy spaces. In addition, Lucy’s role as primary focalizer for the experience of fantasy and wonder reaffirms her place within the discourse of Romantic childhood.

As elaborated in the analysis of the interpersonal metafunction in the next section, Lucy’s experience through the wardrobe is represented through extensive perceptual and psychological description in order to capture Lucy’s point-of-view. Ideationally, this emphasis on detailed perceptual description highlights her intuitive and curious nature as well as her openness to experiences of wonder. Thus, Lucy becomes both representative of wonder as well as a focalizer for the experience of wonder for the adult writer.

Moreover, the first chapter concludes with Lucy’s meeting with the faun, Mr. Tumnus.
This mythical creature is introduced as “only a little taller than Lucy herself and he carried over his head an umbrella, white with snow. From his waist upward he was like a man, but his legs were shaped like a goat’s (the hair on them was glossy black) and instead of feet he had goats hoof” (Lewis 2005: 10). He also “had a tail”; “a red woollen muffler round his neck”; and “a strange, but pleasant little face, with a short pointed beard and curly hair, and out of the hair there stuck two horns, one on each side of his forehead” (Lewis 2005: 10). This detailed description of the faun contrasts with the description of the child protagonists that are represented primarily in terms of narrative action to gain information about character attributes.

Lucy’s interaction with the faun emphasizes her curiosity, and openness to experiences of magic and wonder; qualities associated with the idealized child of the Romantic movement. In addition, as a faun, a half-goat, half-human creature from Roman mythology, Mr. Tumnus has a range of mythical associations. Fauns are spirits, followers of Bacchus that are often compared to the satyrs of Greek mythology and the god Pan as well as pastoral and rustic elements (i.e. shepherds, flocks, nymphs, harps) but also to drunken revelry, sexuality, and fertility (Kirk 2005b). These qualities of Tumnus as a mythical creature further emphasizes Lucy’s role as a Romantic heroine. Notably, this description of Tumnus accentuates his human characteristics as well as his mannered and civilized qualities: his “pleasant little face”; “umbrella”; and “red woolen muffler” (Lewis 2005: 10). Nevertheless, as a signifier of sexuality and animalistic tendencies he connotes various elements that create conflict with Lucy’s otherwise innocent character.
6.2.2 Lucy in Pauline Baynes’s illustrations: Ideational function

In the original edition of the novel (1950), the first representation of Lucy is articulated through Pauline Baynes’s cover illustration. The key ideational function of this visual representation is the articulation of Romantic childhood innocence and wonder developed in the written text. The cover illustration provides a pen and ink depiction of two young girls, presumably Susan and Lucy, wearing pigtails and colourful...
dresses as they playfully ride a lion (Lewis 1950). In addition, this central conceptual representation is framed by the stylized depiction of two fauns holding leafy branches. Lucy’s closeness to and playful ease around the lion in conjunction with the pastoral imagery foreshadows Lucy’s role in the written text as a symbol of innocent faith and wonder.

Following the cover illustration, Baynes’s black and white, pen and ink illustrations dispersed throughout the written narrative do not visually represent Lucy until the conclusion of the wardrobe sequence. This illustration represents Mr. Tumnus and Lucy walking arm and arm in the snowy woods (Lewis 2005: 13). (See Figure 7 for Baynes’s illustration). Lucy is represented as a small, thin girl, about a head shorter than the faun, wearing a short-sleeved dress with a bow at the back and knee socks. Her hair is tied into two plaits with bows at the ends. Similar to the cover art this simple, stylized depiction of Lucy reflects the idealized and often stereotypical childhood figures characteristic of children’s picture books of the 1950s. The image of Lucy resembles other picture book protagonists from this period, such as the young girl in Dr. Seuss’s *The Cat in the Hat* (1957). The amount of information about her character is limited to the barest signifiers of an Anglo-American young girl in the early part of the 20th century: dress, bows, plaits, knee socks, and small stature.

Not unlike the cover illustration, this visual representation supports the salient discourse of Lucy as a Romantic child. In this particular image, the representation alludes to her innocent connection to elements of wonder, nature, and fantasy, in this case exemplified in her closeness to the mythological character of the faun. It is significant that this visual representation does not share the undertones of violence (sexual or otherwise) or seduction often represented by an unknown, male adult animal in the
woods, particularly within the moral development discourse exemplified by the Grimms' and Perrault's versions of Little Red Riding Hood (Zipes 1983; Greenhill and Kohm 2009). Susan Brownmiller (1975) argues:

*Red Riding Hood* is a parable of rape. There are frightening male figures abroad in the woods—we call them wolves, among other names—and females are helpless before them. Better stick close to the path, better not be adventurou. If you are a lucky a *good, friendly,* male may be able to save you from certain disaster” (310).

This discourse of moral or social pedagogy aimed at young females is absent from Baynes's visual representation of Mr. Tumnus and Lucy, of similar height, walking arm and arm in a jovial fashion.

Lewis's written text (in the chapter following the wardrobe segment) mirrors the innocent mood of the illustrations: “And so Lucy found herself walking through the wood arm in arm with this strange creature as if they had known one another all their lives” (2005: 14). Furthermore, in the following section when Mr. Tumnus reveals his intentions to kidnap her, following the discourse of the Romantic innocent, Lucy speaks entirely without fear and presents complete faith in the faun's goodness: “I don’t think you’re a bad Faun at all,” said Lucy, ‘I think you are a very good Faun. You are the nicest Faun I’ve ever met” (2005: 18). Lucy's idealized innocent nature and thus, faith in the goodness of all creatures essentially transforms Tumnus, in the words of Brownmiller, from a potentially “frightening male figure abroad in the woods” into a “good, friendly male” (1975: 310). Nevertheless, the visual and linguistic allusions to the Little Red Riding Hood tale, and its associated discourses of preadolescent sexuality, moral development and danger, complicates the representation of Lucy's idealized innocent nature in her relationship with Mr. Tumnus. Furthermore, as discussed in later
sections, these intertextual associations may be negotiated and articulated in diverse manners by readers, viewers, and producers in their adaptations of the text.

6.2.3 Lucy as focalizer: Interpersonal function

The wardrobe segment emphasizes Lucy’s ideational function in the articulation of the Romantic childhood innocence. In addition, this segment also exemplifies Lucy’s significance to the interpersonal function of the text. This segment presents an offer to the reader through the representation of Lucy as a focalizer for the entry into the fantasy realm. Gerard Genette distinguishes between three different facets of focalization: a perceptual facet of focalization (i.e. time, space, sensory range); a psychological facet (i.e. mind and emotions-cognitive and emotive); and an ideological facet that articulates the underlying discourses intended by the author (Rimmon Kenan 2005: 83). A third-person adult narrator follows the individual Pevensie children at different times in the novel. However, the perceptual and psychological facets of the wardrobe experience are represented solely through Lucy’s point of view:

she noticed that there was something crunching under her feet. “I wonder is that more moth-balls?” she thought, stooping down to feel it with her hand. But instead of feeling the hard smooth wood of the floor of the wardrobe, she felt something soft and powdery and extremely cold. “This is very queer,” she said, and went on a step or two further. (Lewis 2005: 8)

In this wardrobe sequence, the perceptual (“stooping down to feel it with her hand”) and the psychological (“This is very queer”) facets are focalized through Lucy while simultaneously reinforcing the ideational function of the representation for Lewis (the ideological facet in Genette’s theory) as an innocent child, connected to wonder and
imaginative experiences (2005: 8). The following passage from the wardrobe segment further exemplifies these different facets of the focalization:

Looking into the inside, she saw several coats hanging up—mostly long fur coats. There was nothing Lucy liked so much as the smell and feel of fur. She immediately stepped into the wardrobe and got in among the coats and rubbed her face against them, leaving the door open, of course, because she knew that it is very foolish to shut oneself into any wardrobe. Soon she went further and found that there was a second row of coats hanging up behind the first one. It was almost quite dark in there and she kept her arms stretched out in front of her so as not to bump her face into the back of the wardrobe. She took a step further in—then two or three steps—always expecting to feel woodwork against the tips of her fingers. But she could not feel it. (2005: 7)

The creation of an interpersonal relationship between Lucy and the reader relies primarily on the perceptual experience of the wardrobe. The emphasis on visual and auditory experience in this passage produces Lucy’s point-of-view as she moves through the wardrobe. However, in addition to the perceptual descriptions there are moments of psychological focalization. For example, she “likes the feel and smell of fur” indicates both sensory and affective experience (2005: 7). These facets of the interpersonal function of the representation cultivate a close proximity between the reader and Lucy. However, the passage also illustrates an example of the adult narrator interjecting during the child’s perceptual point of view. The narration remarks that Lucy left the wardrobe door open “of course, because she knew that it is very foolish to shut oneself into any wardrobe” (2005: 7). This narrative interruption emphasizes the goodness of Lucy and
articulates a pedagogic discourse of appropriate moral and social maturation that underlines the history of Anglo-American children’s literature.

As outlined in the theoretical frame (Chapter Three), modality, namely the relationship of the representation to reality, truth or credibility, is a significant element in the interpersonal function of the multimodal design (Kress and van Leeuwen 1996). In this segment of the text, Lucy’s role as focalizer for the wardrobe experience is integral to the modality claim of the narrative i.e. the degree of believability of Narnia as a fantasy world and the fantastical experiences of the Pevensie children in relation to Narnia including the wardrobe as a portal to the fantasy realm. The extensive perceptual and psychological details of the wardrobe experience from Lucy’s perspective functions to provide a close proximity between the reader and Lucy but also functions to increase the modality of the representation.

Distinct from the multi-faceted focalization in the written text, the visual representation of Lucy in the illustrations does not provide the perceptual or psychological experience of the wardrobe from Lucy’s point-of-view. Rather, although Lucy is central to the illustrations, her depiction as a two-dimensional, stylized girl figure frolicking with Aslan on the cover, and with Mr. Tumnus in the textual illustration (Figure 7), emphasizes the discourse of childhood innocence produced by adult authors and artists. The framing of the images, in conjunction with the low modality of the illustrations, positions the viewer/reader at a far social distance from the represented participants. Moreover, this interpersonal function of the illustrations cultivates a relationship characteristic of classic children’s literature texts between adult writers and artists of children’s texts with an imagined child reader (interactive participants) as well as idealized child characters (represented participants). A tension exists between Lucy’s
ideational function as a representation of Romantic childhood innocence, and the interpersonal offer to an implied child reader to relate to Lucy as a ‘real’ child who discovers a magical world.

6.2.4 Paratexts: Dedication by C.S. Lewis to Lucy Barfield

As discussed extensively with regards to the film adaptations, paratexts may contribute to the ideational and interpersonal meanings articulated through the primary representations. In the novel, Lewis has included a dedication “To Lucy Barfield”, the author’s goddaughter that is significant to discourse around Lucy in the text itself. The dedication appears as follows:

My Dear Lucy,

I wrote this story for you, but when I began it I had not realized that girls grow quicker than books. As a result you are already too old for fairy tales, and by the time it is printed and bound you will be older still. But some day you will be old enough to start reading fairy tales again. You can then take it down from some upper shelf, dust it, and tell me what you think of it. I shall probably be too deaf to hear, and too old to understand, a word you say, but I shall still be your affectionate Godfather, C.S. Lewis

(Lewis 2005: Dedication).

In addition to the written text and illustrations, this paratextual element articulates another link to the discursive history of tween girlhood through ideational and interpersonal function of its written text. At an ideational level, this dedication situates Lewis in the realm of other children’s literature authors who produce texts within the Romantic discourse of children’s literature. Similar to Lewis Carroll’s Alice poem
(Carroll 2001), discussed in Chapter Five, this dedication reflects the adult, often middle-aged male author's idealization of the Romantic childhood as a time for fairy tales and wonder. The dedication represents the nostalgic remorse around the maturation of children associated with the Romantic discourse ("you are already too old for fairytales"). Moreover, this represents the loss of innocence and wonder connected to the maturation of preadolescent girls ("girls grow quicker than books") specifically in the narratives of Lewis's *Narnia* texts (Lewis 2005: Dedication).

In terms of the interpersonal function of this dedication, a relationship is represented explicitly between an adult male (Lewis) to a specific but idealized female reader (his goddaughter). It represents a particular relationship between the doting older man and a younger woman that is observed throughout the discursive history (in Chapter Five) not only in relation to Carroll's *Alice in Wonderland*, Montgomery's *Anne of Green Gables*, and discourses around Shirley Temple. However, despite its fantasy idealization of childhood, through the allusion to a 'real' girl named Lucy, a high modality claim is produced for its readers who are offered a possible relationship with a real Lucy outside of the text in addition to the fictional Lucy within the text. Moreover, the real Lucy outside of the text is represented in relation to a maturation discourse that creates a tension with the idealized fictional Lucy who is represented as an innocent child outside of maturation discourses. In addition, the offer for the adult Lucy who will be "old enough to start reading fairy tales again" (Lewis 2005: Dedication) alludes to the Romantic concept that idealizes children's literature as a mode to "recapture an innocent apprehension of the world" (Thacker and Webb 2003: 13). The nostalgic tone of this dedication offers an implied adult reader a Romantic discourse of childhood for their own engagements with the text.
6.2.5 Multimodal composition of Lucy

Both the visual and linguistic elements of the representation situate Lucy as a salient element in the overall composition of the text, particularly in the Lucy through the Wardrobe segment. Moreover, the combination of ideational and interpersonal functions primarily articulate Lucy in relation to the discourse of Romantic childhood innocence and wonder. Nevertheless, the moral development discourse that underlines the narrative creates various tensions with the discourse of innocence particularly in Lucy’s role in relation to Susan’s maturation, Lucy’s interaction with Mr. Tumnus, and the linkage to a ‘real’ Lucy’s maturation outside of the text through Lewis’s dedication to his goddaughter. Moreover, while the visual representation of Lucy supports the discourse of childhood innocence, the written text provides the opportunity for the reader to engage with the text through Lucy’s point-of-view. This interpersonal offer to the reader may allow for alternative interpretations or extensions at sites of adaptation and audience engagement with the discourse of Romantic childhood innocence. The following section examines how these discourses articulated through the representation of Lucy in Lewis’s original novel are taken up in the multimodal design of the BBC television serial.

6.3 The BBC television serial The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe (1988):

Production/institutional context

The BBC television serial of The Chronicles of Narnia: The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe provides an older filmic adaptation to examine in comparison to the recent Disney/Walden Media film. This adaptation was originally broadcast in 1988 over six episodes. The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe was the first of three other television productions between 1988 and 1990 that adapted Lewis’s other Narnia texts: Prince
Caspian, The Voyage of the Dawn Treader and The Silver Chair. The complete set of these four adaptations were re-released as “The Complete Four-Disc Collector’s Edition” on DVD in 2005, perhaps hoping to take advantage of the upcoming release of the Walden-Media/Disney feature film. The DVD collection is formatted episodically as the television serial was originally broadcast and uses the original score. This DVD edition was used as one of the discussion texts in the audience focus groups.

The BBC adaptation exemplifies conventions in the filmic adaptation of canonical children’s literature common to earlier periods of children’s film and particularly adaptations produced by the BBC. Ian Wojcik-Andrews (2000) observes that “filmed adaptations of canonical works of children’s literature appeared as early as 1899, when George Melies completed a version of Cinderella (Cendrillon) (55). However, the national production context (as well as the time period) strongly influences the selection and adaptation of particular canonical works and narratives. In relation to the Narnia adaptations, the BBC and the Walden Media/Disney adaptations reflect distinct agenda and national trends in children’s cinema. Wojcik-Andrews compares the evolution of children’s cinema in the United States and Europe. While “[i]n the United States, children’s cinema evolved into the family film... in Europe the culture of state subsidies kept a fledgling children’s cinema alive” (17-18). This culture of subsidies results in the adaptation of worthy, canonical and classic children’s texts aimed at young readers/viewers but also the adaptation of those that emphasize national (in this case British) stories, characters and settings. The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe (1988) focuses on a significant moment for national identity in British history and emphasizes a particular vision of British identity from the World War II period as resilient, brave and faithful.
The BBC adaptation of *Narnia* (1988) also reflects the BBC’s selection of particular canonical texts to draw upon the nostalgic recollections of parents’ of books and films from their childhoods. As observed by Buckingham in relation to publicity material produced by BBC children's programming: "the BBC still tends to hark back to the past, invoking (or indeed re-inventing) tradition-and in the process, playing to parents' nostalgia for the television of their own childhoods." (2005: 479). This is significant both to the initial production of the text in 1988 and the re-release of the episodes on DVD in 2005.

**Figure 8:** Peter (Richard Dempsey) and Lucy Pevensie (Sophie Wilcox) and the Beavers (BBC 1988).
Figure 9: Peter (Richard Dempsey), Susan (Sophie Cook), Edmund (Jonathan R. Scott) and Lucy (Sophie Wilcox) in BBC serial (1988)

Figure 10: Mr. Tumnus (Jeffrey S. Perry) in BBC serial (1988)
6.3.1 Lucy through the wardrobe in the BBC serial: Ideational function

Wojcik-Andrews observes that many film adaptations of canonical children's literature texts emphasize fidelity to the original material at both the levels of production and criticism (Wojcik-Andrews 2000: 188-189). The BBC tradition of literary adaptations of children's texts exemplifies this trend, and the adaptation from Lewis's text is faithful in terms of plot and dialogue. Moreover, the representation of the Pevensie children in the BBC adaptation reinforces Lewis's representation of Caucasian, upper-middle class, well-mannered, and traditionally-gendered children. However, the visual and linguistic representation of the central characters to signify specific moral and social qualities is shifted in this adaptation. For example, in Lewis's text, discourses related to Lucy's character are articulated through her physical characteristics as well as qualities and actions in relation to her siblings. The four siblings are distinguished by physical attributes that are conventional semiotic signifiers to age and gendered maturation.

Comparatively, in the BBC serial, the four siblings appear physically close in age. (See Figure 8 and 9 for film stills of the Pevensie children in the BBC serial). Peter (Richard Dempsey) stands about the same height as Susan (Sophie Cook) and is only marginally taller than Lucy (Sophie Wilcox) and Edmund (Jonathan R. Scott). In addition, in Lewis's text and Baynes's illustrations, Lucy's smallness and youth connote her role as an innocent child while Susan's beauty and maternal qualities exemplify her role as an adolescent female in the process of maturation. In this adaptation, Susan physically appears close in age to Lucy. Rather, they are distinguished by other (non-age related) physical attributes and social mannerisms. Susan is marginally taller, has long blonde hair in braids, and speaks in a controlled manner throughout the episodes. In contrast, Lucy has a short haircut, a round face with chubby cheeks, and large front teeth.
Her appearance in conjunction with exuberant speaking tone and exaggerated facial expressions may be intended to connote child-like innocence and wonder. Moreover, Lucy’s exuberant tone is contrasted with Peter and Susan’s modelling of upper class propriety in tone and behaviour as well as Edmund’s inappropriate, mischievous and often acerbic tone. However, the lack of distinction in physical age from her siblings creates a conflict with the ideational function of Lucy’s representation in the written text.

In the 2002 reunion of the four child actors included in the collector’s DVD, Richard Dempsey (who played Peter) observes: "We were quite unusual for what people would think the Pevensies would look like. I didn't think we looked like anything the Pevensies would look like in their imaginations. I think they took a risk on the family" (The Chronicles BBC 2005: DVD bonus features). Moreover, Sophie Wilcox who played Lucy observes "I didn't look anything like Lucy If you look at the books and the original drawings she was quite tall and skinny and had long plaits and I was a short little dumpling with great big puffy face and short hair" (The Chronicles BBC 2005: DVD bonus features). Although commentary on the casting from the director (Marilyn Fox) is unavailable, I would argue that due to the time period (1980s), and the conventions of casting child actors in the European context, the director of this production may have intentionally chosen to cast young people based on their ability to play the roles rather than the stereotypical physicality implied by the written text and illustrations of the novel. However, this unconventional casting may conflict with the ideational and interpersonal functions of Lucy’s representation in the original text that links her physical appearance to her moral and social character. This ideational issue is discussed in the more recent film adaptation, and the audience response to the BBC adaptation in the following section of the chapter.
Leading up to the scene of exploration around the house, the children are shown sitting around the table. Following the dialogue in the written text, Susan is positioned as the mother figure as she collects the soup bowls and Peter plays father hoping to initiate excitement from his siblings about what they might find around the house and the woods nearby. This scene leading up to the discovery of the wardrobe reaffirms the moral development discourse in the original written text, identifying individual qualities of the four siblings only in terms of relation to each other. In addition, elements of British national identity are emphasized through dialogue added to the narrative for this adaptation. For example, on the train to the Professor’s house, Peter remarks about “how lucky they are to be sent away from London” and upon arrival the Professor comments about how they each must do what they can (The Chronicles BBC 2005).

The musical soundtrack constitutes a significant mode in this adaptation. The musical theme, composed by Geoffrey Burgon, consists of a slow, melodic instrumental played by a trumpet (Burgon 1988). Slow orchestral music is also used in the scene as the children explore the house. While the Disney/Walden Media adaptation involves a dramatic crescendo of the musical score when Lucy enters the fantasy world, the focus of the BBC adaptation is on Lucy’s response to the world amidst the fog. The musical score that accompanies Lucy’s entrance through the wardrobe is similar to when the children are exploring the house (Burgon 1988). This choice of music during this scene contributes to the discourse of Romantic childhood innocence through the creation of an aura of mystery and slow anticipation.
6.3.2 Lucy as focalizer in the BBC serial: Interpersonal function

The pacing of the BBC television serial closely follows the pacing of the written text. In the wardrobe scene, the four children are represented as moving slowly as they explore rooms in the Professor’s house. The Pevensie children are depicted entering the empty room, looking around slowly, standing as though in a theatrical tableau, and then exiting the room with Lucy remaining at the door. Lucy is depicted as moving slowly towards the wardrobe, and then in reference to the adult narrator’s interjection about appropriate behaviour when entering the wardrobe (discussed in the previous section) this adaptation represents Lucy exaggeratedly keeping open the wardrobe door before entering the wardrobe.

The pacing of this adaptation provides a filmic representation of the suspension of time that follows the incremental action of the written text by a number of distinct camera shots of Lucy as she moves through the wardrobe. When Lucy enters the wardrobe, the camera jumps to a close-up shot of Lucy’s face surrounded by fur coats. As she opens the door the camera shot cuts to the view out from the point-of-view of Lucy inside the wardrobe. The camera zooms in on her facial response. This adaptation also adds a number of theatrical elements that allude to the modality of fantasy that is entered. The wardrobe is first represented as dark but then Lucy is represented as slowly having light on her face, this is quickly followed by some mist, which indicates for the viewer the transition into a fantasy space. “How funny” Lucy says, slowly putting on a fur coat and walking out onto the snow. She pauses and then says out loud to herself: “I’m sure I can always go back.” (The Chronicles BBC 2005). This vocalized internal monologue is followed by a close shot of Lucy’s foot walking into the snow, and then a
representation of the aerial perspective from above the lamppost down at Lucy’s position in the frame.

Although these different perspectives add variety to the representational focus, the focalization on Lucy’s experience that is central to the written text is displaced somewhat as we view Lucy from a number of different angles. This adaptation primarily relies upon Lucy’s facial expressions and verbal responses to the fantasy of Narnia. Lucy is the focalizer for the experience; however, due to the constraints of the set, costumes and other production elements, viewers experience the fantasy realm through identification with Lucy and her responses to the world, rather than through a high modality in their experience of the fantasy world as a spectator articulated in the Disney/Walden Media film.

Although the dialogue of the Lucy’s meeting with Mr. Tumnus follows the written text closely, the visual representation of Mr. Tumnus, played by Jeffrey S. Perry (See Figure 10), through costuming and casting changes the interaction between these two characters, and thus, shifts the discourses highlighted in Baynes’s illustration. Unlike the depiction in Baynes’s illustrations of a bare-chested faun wearing only a scarf, the faun in the BBC adaptation is represented as an older gentleman with a full head of hair and beard. He wears a light overcoat and a scarf and underneath over a costume of white fur. While in the written text Tumnus is described as “only a little taller than Lucy herself” (Lewis 2005: 10), in this adaptation the difference in height between the actors is emphasized. Moreover, as Lucy and Mr. Tumnus speak, the faun circles her. The representational effect is a stylized representation that resembles theatre stage blocking rather than a candid interaction. Both the physical distance between the actors in the stage blocking of the scene, as well as the observable difference in height and age
between Lucy and Mr. Tumnus result in a more distanced relationship represented between Lucy and Mr. Tumnus (compared to the visual and linguistic representation in Lewis's novel). These changes in the representation of the relationship between Lucy and Tumnus provide discourses that continue to be conflicted but distinct from the original novel. Because the two figures seem to have little connecting them, the potential danger of an adult creature kidnapping a preadolescent girl is raised; however, the potential moral danger of Lucy's potential attraction to the faun (implicit to the visual and written image of the two kindred spirits walking happily in the woods in the novel) is diminished.

6.3.3 Multimodal composition of the BBC serial

The BBC adaptation of this textual segment reveals various issues related to the production context that distinguish these two filmic adaptations. Firstly, the time period in which the BBC serial was produced (1980s) is reflected in terms of the potential affordances of the technology at the time. In addition, the technical prowess of the production would have been informed by budgetary restrictions of a public broadcast corporation. In addition, as with many BBC adaptations of classic children's literature, both the screenplay and the filming conventions are theatrical in approach. There are many long shots that represent the whole set at one time, in contrast to the mixture of close-up and wide angle shots that characterize Hollywood films. In the BBC serial, the movement through the wardrobe itself is less dramatic in its use of audio-visual effects.

Geoffrey Burgon composed scores for various literary adaptations on British television including Brideshead Revisited (1982). Thus, the musical score of the Narnia adaptation intertextually connects this text to other scores composed by Burgon (Burgon
While Baynes's cover art situates Lucy within a discourse of Romantic children's literature, in a similar manner, the musical score as well as theatrical staging would produce an interpersonal relationship with the implied audience that would value fidelity to the discourses of Lewis's novel as a canonical children's literature text.

6.4 Disney/Walden Media feature film (2005): Production/institutional discourse

A number of key elements in the production context distinguish the recent film adaptation from the BBC adaptation. Firstly, the role of Walden Media and its particular corporate mandate influences the production of the film. Moreover, while Walden Media gained the rights to adapt Lewis's *Narnia* novels in 2003 and controlled the production, the Disney Corporation acted as the distributor for the film and contributed significantly to the budget as well the production of extensive franchise texts for of the film that are examined in the next part of this chapter. Established in 2001, Walden Media is described by producer Perry Moore as "a film studio devoted to making quality films with educational merit" (Moore 2005: 1). Characteristic of the official corporate discourse, the emphasis is on educational merit and 'quality' that encompasses Leavisite judgments (discussed in the literature review in Chapter Two in relation to children's literature criticism). Following this agenda, the majority of films produced by Walden Media are adaptations of award-winning and popular children's fiction including *Holes* (2003), *Charlotte's Web* (2006), and *Bridge to Terebithia* (2006). Lewis's step-son Douglas Gresham gave approval for this film adaptation and is listed as a co-producer of the film. Gresham's participation in the film (and as a voice of behind-the-scenes discourse in the DVD bonus features) functions both to confirm the literary fidelity of the
James Russell (2009) examines the role of Evangelical Christian audiences in the United States as a key target for the film’s marketing. He argues that “The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe provides an interesting example of the ways Hollywood has attempted to address the avowedly faithful audiences who appeared on the industry’s radar following the success of Mel Gibson’s The Passion of the Christ in 2004” (Russell 60). He further discusses how promotion for the film “repeatedly used the figure of an imaginary, generic child (and the conception of children as innocents who be shaped into citizens) to discuss the future trajectory of the nation” (60). While sustaining the British setting of the film and employing British actors, the film cultivates a generic discourse about children and families and their survival during periods of trauma or war.

In 2005, the United States was involved in two major wars on “terror” in Afghanistan and Iraq following the September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks on the World Trade Centre. This universalization of a historic event is a common convention of adventure family films produced in the United States but also reflects the specific time period of production marked by extensive public discourse following the election of President George W. Bush underlined by religious imagery and allegory with regards to the war on terror and the culture wars rhetoric within the national discourse. Russell argues that the film may be examined “as a Christian allegory to be interpreted, but also an allegory of national redemption with considerable relevance to modern America” (73). However, in the official promotional discourse for the film, Andrew Adamson, the director of the film, articulates his message for the film as following a family values discourse without an explicit religious message. For example, in The Chronicles of
Narnia: The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe: Official Illustrated Movie Companion
(2005) Adamson states:

I also want families to take away from it other than an enjoyable experience, a sense of what a family is, a sense of unity and sticking together, of supporting each other...a family that is empowered through their unity. Those are the main things I want people to take away from the film. (Moore 2005: 135)

Nevertheless, as illustrated by the public discourse around the film and Walden Media as a company, the aim is to appeal to both Evangelical audiences, and a broader non-religious viewership interested in family-oriented films with moral lessons and educational merit.

Another significant influence on this film adaptation is the production within the context of a blockbuster-oriented budget of $180 million (“The Box Office Mojo” 2005). Perry Moore notes that "There was only one major fantasy franchise left of the magnitude and renown of Harry Potter and The Lord of the Rings; The Narnia Chronicles" (2005: 3). The multimodal design and cross-media play at levels of both texts and audiences reflect these intertextual connections with these other blockbuster family fantasy franchises at the level of production. Another significant issue around this production is that this film was produced in the context of the success of other Disney tween franchises such as High School Musical and the Disney Princess brand. Cary Bazalgette and Terry Staples (1995) argue that a key difference between films produced in the United States and Europe is the casting of its child actors: “In the United States, children who appear in family films must be perfect. They must have star appeal as well as ‘sexual appeal’” (95). In contrast, “children’s film movement in Europe has always held that the child protagonists in a children’s film should not be desirable moppets”
(Bazalgette and Staples 95). Across the design of the film itself, the paratextual franchise texts and fan cultures, the appeal of the child stars is central to the Disney/Walden Media adaptation.

Figure 11: The Pevensie children (Lucy, Edmund, Susan, Peter) in the Disney/Walden Media film (2005)

6.4.1 Lucy through the wardrobe in the Disney/Walden Media film feature: Ideational function

Distinct from the written text and the BBC adaptations, the film focuses on the four siblings’ experience of the war, emphasizing the child protagonists’ psychological experience of displacement from London, the absence of their father who is fighting in the war and the horror of bombs in the city where they live. The film opens with an aerial view of World War II bombers over London. The children and their mother are shown evacuating to a bomb shelter and Edmund (Skandar Keynes) runs back to save a picture
of his father. Peter must go back to grab him to evacuate producing a scene of immediate trauma. The train station scene contextualizes the scene clearly during World War II with posters from the period and shots of Peter eyeing groups of soldiers at the train station. Reaffirming the moral development discourse associated with Susan (Anna Popplewell) and Peter (William Moseley) in the novel, the parting words of the children's mother in the film include a request for Peter to “be a man” and for Susan to be a “good girl” and for them both to look after their younger siblings (*The Chronicles* Walden Media 2006).

As elaborated in the analysis part of the Disney/Walden Media film franchise, the four Pevensie children are visually represented across franchised products as the most salient figures in the narrative. The distinctions in appearance between the four siblings are more clearly defined in this film adaptation compared to the BBC adaptation. (See Figure 11). Due to distinct clothing, height, and actual age differential of the actors, Lucy (played by Georgie Henley) is much smaller physically than her siblings. In comparison, Susan and Peter look notably older than their younger siblings. This visual representation of Lucy as small and young reaffirms her role as an innocent child throughout the Narnia adventure.

In the recent Disney Walden/Media film adaptation of the *Lucy through the Wardrobe* textual segment, the most significant change from the original text is the transposition of the children's house exploration to a raucous game of hide and seek (*The Chronicles* Walden Media 2006). This upbeat pacing is enhanced by the film soundtrack that includes the song “Oh Johnny Oh Johnny Oh!” an American dance music hit that was popular in the 1940s (The Andrews Sisters 2005). The film director Andrew Adamson explains this intentional change by the producers: “I thought it made more sense if we actually started with the children bored not knowing what to do on a rainy
day...and actually finding the wardrobe as a hiding place. And it made a lot more sense that she would then step into it" (The Chronicles Walden Media 2006: DVD audio commentary). As Adamson’s commentary highlights, this change indicates two shifts in discourse. On a representational level, the emphasis is moved away from Lucy’s particular qualities of innocent wonder and curiosity that attract her to the wardrobe in Lewis’s text; however, the representation of the hide and seek game through the upbeat musical score, in conjunction with the fast-paced shots of the siblings running and hiding continues to articulate a Romantic discourse of idealized childhood innocent playfulness and levity. Adamson’s argument that the recontextualization of the discovery of the wardrobe as a hiding place would make ‘more sense’ to the viewers, reinforces the significance of Lucy’s role as a focalizer but also specifies the interpersonal function of the text for hypothetical contemporary young viewers who may question the logic of the original narrative.

When Lucy enters the room with the wardrobe, the score indicates a shift in modality with the abrupt ending of the upbeat music. The scene begins silently, the sound of a fly buzzing, then a line of piano builds suspense as Lucy enters the empty room. The wardrobe further indicates a shift to a fantasy modality as it is covered with a sheet. As she removes the sheet from the wardrobe, mysterious music plays and a close up shot of Lucy’s face reveals her delighted expression when she sees the wardrobe. Lucy’s entry into the room with the wardrobe begins silently, separating the experience from the upbeat hide and seek game. As Lucy removes the sheet from the wardrobe, mysterious music plays, and a close-up shot reveals a delighted expression. (The Chronicles Walden Media 2006). This representation of the wardrobe scene functions to emphasize the discourse of innocence in the original text through the Lucy’s expression of wonder and
awe, and the use of visual and auditory cues to further articulate this experience as one of wonder and magic.

This filmic adaptation constructs a visually explicit kindred and close relationship between Mr. Tumnus and Lucy. The closeness of this relationship is enhanced through the casting of the actor James McAvoy as a young Mr. Tumnus (James McAvoy) as well as the physical closeness of their first meeting depicted through close camera shots on the faces of the two actors (See Figures 12 and 13). Moreover, a candid awkwardness of the encounter as cultivated through the adapted script of the scene and the interactions of the actors. For example, the faun slouches slightly to speak with Lucy creating a physically close encounter. The combined effect is a nervous but cheerful meeting, more intimate than both the written text and the BBC adaptation.

6.4.2 Lucy as focalizer in the film: Interpersonal function

In the Disney/Walden Media film, the wardrobe sequence is enhanced through the use of camera angles and the musical score. An aerial shot follows Lucy as she moves through the wardrobe backwards. The camera closely captures the perceptual details from the original written text following Lucy’s intense experience inside the wardrobe, pushing through the thick fur coats, and touching the tree branches. Once she has entered the forest, the shot expands to reveal the small figure of Lucy in contrast to the wide expanse of the snowy fantasy world. The moment is enhanced by a crescendo in the music and the audible crunchiness of snow beneath her feet as well as the image of Lucy’s expression of awe. An aerial shot represents Lucy as she moves through the wardrobe going through the wardrobe backwards, hitting the trees and turning to find
herself in snowy forest. (The Chronicles Walden Media 2006). This representation presents Lucy's focalized experience as she discovers the fantasy world of Narnia.

In comparison to the BBC adaptation, the Disney/Walden Media film amplifies Lucy's perceptual and psychological experience from the original text through the crescendo of the musical score and a wide angle landscape shot of Narnia. The fantastical element of the moment is enhanced by the audible crunchiness of the snow, followed by the sounds of horses' hooves and swift movement shots that focalize on Lucy's fear of what may be approaching (Tumnus). The effect of these design choices in the Disney/Walden Media film is the expansion of the experience of wonder and fantasy from Lucy's point-of-view to include the viewers who are positioned by the text as participants in the wardrobe experience.

This filmic articulation of Lucy follows the articulation of discourse of idealized innocence as set up in the original written text; however, at times this filmic representation sets up conflicts with this discourse of childhood innocence; her interaction with a young Mr. Tumnus is not unlike the meeting scene in a teen romance novel including the gift of her handkerchief. Moreover, the public media discourse around James McAvoy a young, attractive actor who was listed in the celebrity magazine People as one of the “Sexiest Men Alive” (2008) influences the relationship between Tumnus and Lucy as represented participants, but also shifts the interpersonal dynamic between Tumnus and the viewer of the film. McAvoy offers the possibility to viewers a role for Mr. Tumnus as a normalized object of heterosexual affection for tween and adolescent female viewers. As elaborated later in this analysis, the tie-in franchise texts and celebrity fan culture around the film positions the actress Georgie Henley as a tween.
girl celebrity and also the male actors who play Edmund and Peter as crush-worthy teen actors.

6.4.3. Textual function: Multimodal composition

Compared to the original novel and the BBC adaptation, the composition of the opening of the film followed by the Wardrobe scene is distinct. The opening action and trauma sequence situates this film within the epic fantasy family adventure or war genre film (Wojcik-Andrews 2000: 161-2). Nevertheless, these changes function to amplify the discourse of Romantic childhood innocence and wonder. This discourse is expanded through the franchise texts examined in the following section (6.5), and then negotiated again through sites of audience discourse.
Figure 12: Lucy meeting Tumnus (Disney/Walden Media 2005)

Figure 13: Lucy and Tumnus (Disney/Walden Media 2005)
6.5 Lucy in Walden Media/Disney franchise tie-in texts

This section expands the multimodal design analysis of Lucy Pevensie in the film to the articulation of related discourse across a number of franchise produced tie-in texts including collectible promotional books and the Lucy avatar in the Narnia video game. While this section does not provide as extensive a multimodal design analysis as the previous section, the focus is on how discourses around Lucy articulated in the multimodal design of the film are expanded through these franchise texts. Moreover, this section addresses how these franchise texts may offer opportunities for cross-media play with discourses around Lucy in the film.

6.5.1 Lucy’s Adventure (2005) and collectible cereal-box texts: Ideational function

The visual representation of Lucy for the Disney/Walden Media film occurs across multiple franchised texts simultaneously. These texts expand upon the social semiotic functions articulated through the multimodal design of the film. In the United Kingdom, four collectible tie-in books were produced in the month-long lead up to the film’s Christmas holiday release (December 2005), and distributed as free collectible gifts in Nestle breakfast cereal boxes. These four tie-in texts each distinctly follow the Narnia narrative from the point of view of one of the child protagonists: Lucy’s Adventure: The Quest for Aslan, the Great Lion; Susan’s Journey: Step Through the Wardrobe; Edmund’s Struggle: Under the Spell of the White Witch; and Peter’s Destiny: The Battle for Narnia. (See Figure 14a and 14b for scanned images of the front and back cover of one cereal box with a collectible book inside).
Figure 14a: Collectible tie-in franchise texts in cereal boxes (December 2005)
Figure 14b: Collectible tie-in franchise texts in cereal boxes (December 2005).
These tie-in books illustrate the representation of individualized characteristics and narrative trajectories associated with each Pevensie child. The cover design of these collectible franchise texts exemplify the use of the Pevensie children as part of the brand image for the film franchise. In their guidebook for packaging designers, Klimchuk and Krasovec (2006) outline the development of characters in the design of brand products: “[c]haracters can be developed to support brand communication, promote product attributes, and become the embodiment of the brand’s personality” (28). The visual images of the central characters are integral to the transformation of The Chronicles of Narnia from a film adaptation to a branded franchise across multiple texts. The brand image of the film franchise (represented in some form on all franchise texts including the DVD cover, film poster, and movie companion book) represents the four siblings in stylized poses: the image of Susan in a long green dress poised determinedly with bow and arrow; Peter cloaked in full armour in the midst of a battle; Edmund proceeding towards the White Queen’s castle; and the image of Lucy looking out curiously as she stands beside the lamppost. (See Figure 14b) In the case of the collectible tie-in texts, each cover visually represents one Pevensie child in their characteristic stylized pose. These visual images employ circumstances of means, for example the bow and arrow for Susan, and circumstances of accompaniment, the ideational linkage between Edmund and the White Witch (Kress and van Leeuwen 1996) to reinforce individual characteristics associated with each sibling. Thus, the visual representation of Lucy looking out curiously by the lamppost on the cover of the tie-in text Lucy’s Adventure reinforces the ideational function of Lucy in the articulation of the discourse of childhood innocence and wonder.
The visual brand images of the Pevensie children reflect gifts given to the Pevensies from Father Christmas. In the original novel, Father Christmas gives gifts of “tools not toys” to Peter, Susan and Lucy on their quest to find Aslan and save Edmund (Lewis 2005: 108). These gifts are circumstances of means, that articulate an ideational link between the character and the object presented to them (Kress and van Leeuwen 1996). Peter is given “a shield and a sword”; Susan “a bow and a quiver full of arrows and a little ivory horn” (Lewis 2005: 108). Father Christmas describes Lucy’s gifts as follows: “a cordial made of the juice of one of the fire-flowers that grow in the mountains of the sun. If you or any of your friends is hurt, a few drops of this will restore them. And the dagger is to defend yourself at great need. For you also are not to be in the battle” (Lewis 2005: 108). These specialized gifts work to emphasize the specific moral and social qualities associated with each child protagonists. However, in the context of the film franchise, these gifts not only function to connect moral and social qualities to distinct characters but they also support the visual branding of the film franchise.

These gifts also emphasize the stereotypical gender roles of the siblings for which Lewis has been extensively criticized. Upon receiving the gifts, Lucy asks Father Christmas “I think—I don’t know—but I think I could be brave enough [to join the battle]” and his response to her is “That is not the point...But battles are ugly when women fight” (Lewis 2005: 109). In an attempt to update the narrative to more current social conventions the film omits this explicitly sexist discourse in Lewis’s narrative. In addition, articulating the mainstreaming of the girl power discourse discussed in the previous chapter, the film reemphasizes Lucy and Susan’s prowess with the dagger and arrow respectively. Nevertheless, while Lucy is visually represented with her dagger in some franchise texts (as discussed in relation to the Lucy avatar in the video game in
section 6.5.2 below), the salient image is of Lucy by the lamppost, or alternatively she is represented in relation to Aslan or Mr. Tumnus reinforcing her Romantic innocence and wonder rather than her bravery.

The introductions to each of the collectible tie-in texts promoted on the back cover of a Nestle brand Shreddies cereal box exemplify the distinct conceptual representations of the four Pevensie siblings articulated through the four tie-in texts. The introduction for Lucy's Adventure (2005) on the back of the box reads:

Join the quest with Lucy... A game of hide and seek turns into the adventure of Lucy's dreams, when she steps through an old wardrobe into a magical world called Narnia. But Narnia is caught in the icy grip of an evil ruler and Lucy knows in her heart she must find the legendary true king Aslan the great lion, to free the enchanted land. (Shreddies 2005: back cover) (See Figure 14b).

These four introductions further emphasize the role of each sibling in the film franchise as representative of particular moral qualities as well as individualized trajectories. The ideational function of this description situates Lucy once again within the discourse of childhood innocence and wonder through the allusion to the “game of hide and seek,” “dreams,” “magical world,” and “enchanted” (Shreddies 2005). In addition, the final sentence “Lucy knows in her heart she must find the legendary true king Aslan” emphasizes Lucy’s purity of faith (Shreddies 2005). Comparatively, the description of Susan’s journey “from ordinary school girl to fearless warrior and queen” exemplifies a gendered maturation discourse compared to Peter’s representation in terms of a “battle” “courage” and his role to “lead an army, save his family and discover his destiny.”

Comparatively, Edmund is characterized by “struggle” with “evil powers” (Shreddies 2005).
6.5.2 Lucy's Adventure: Interpersonal function

*Lucy's Adventure* (2005) expands the interpersonal offer of Lucy as a focalizer in the written text and film adaptation. This text emphasizes Lucy’s role as focalizer for the wardrobe experience: “It seemed to be a very big wardrobe and Lucy had to really stretch and stretch and then she felt something... ‘Ouch!’ Lucy frowned. That was strange - she had touched something prickly. Why would there be something prickly in the wardrobe? She took a step forward. Crunch.” (*Lucy’s Adventure* 7-8). In its representation of the internal monologue of the protagonist, and the updating of the language to shorter phrases (i.e. “Crunch.”), and contemporary vernacular i.e. “That was strange” replaces Lewis’s use of “This is very queer” (Lewis 1950: 8). This text expands Lucy’s role as focalizer beyond the original written text to an interpersonal offer towards a contemporary viewer. At the same time, the role of this Lucy focused text among four collectible texts, illustrates an interpersonal offer for multiple focalizers. The distinctive character images of the siblings produce opportunities to address specific niche groups of consumers, viewers and readers through the offer of four child focalizers. The back cover of the *Lucy* text, for example, addresses the reader in the imperative to “Collect all four brilliant books, and read about Peter, Edmund and Susan’s adventures too!” (*Lucy’s Adventure* 2005: back cover). However, distinct from the film, these franchise texts narrow the interpersonal offer of each text through address to specified consumers through gender and age signifiers.

6.5.3 Lucy in Step into Narnia: A Journey through the Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe (2005): Ideational function

Another franchise tie-in text called *Step into Narnia: A Journey through The Lion,
*the Witch and the Wardrobe* (2005) by E. J. Kirk presents a scrapbook-style guide to the written narrative by Lewis as well as references to the film. The compositional style draws on a range of different typological font styles and sizes to represent quotes from the texts, captions for images, and plot development. A number of different types and sizes of images are superimposed on each two-page spread. These images draw upon a number of modes and media including photographic images of objects such as the wardrobe, and Lucy’s dagger; Pauline Bayne’s illustrations from the novel; and film stills from the Walden Media/Disney feature. This scrapbook collage style connotes the style of girls’ magazines and annuals. In addition, the use of red and pink as colour schemes for Lucy and Susan’s pages indicate a gendered representation in comparison to the darker colour palette for the pages devoted to Peter and Edmund. Moreover, the Pevensie boys are visually represented in action poses (i.e. Edmund approaches witch’s castle and Peter fighting in battle). Moreover, Peter’s page includes an activity called "Other Famous Leaders" that requires the reader to “match the leader with their country” that locates Peter among Alexander the Great, Julius Caesar and Genghis Khan (Kirk 2005a: 19).

A two-page spread is dedicated to the character Lucy. A salient element of this spread is a fact sheet of information titled “Lucy about me” (Kirk 2005a:12). The fact sheet is depicted to resemble a note tacked onto a bulletin board. The answers are represented use a font typeface that resembles cursive handwriting. The interpersonal offer of this fact sheet is similar to a fact sheet in a magazine or annual about a celebrity:

**Nickname:** *Lu*

**Narnia name:** *Queen Lucy*

**Year born:** *1932*
Family order: Youngest

Personality: Usually cheerful, always truthful, always brave

Favourite thing: Making friends

Known for: Discovering Narnia

Best friend in Narnia: Mr. Tumnus, the faun

Most exciting moment: Riding on Aslan's back

Heroic moment: Tending to the wounded after the final battle against the Witch.

Gifts from Father Christmas: Cordial bottle: Made of diamond, not glass; contains the juice of the fire-flowers that grow in the mountains of the sun used for healing wounds and making sick people healthy. Small dagger: To defend herself when she is in trouble. (Kirk 2005a: 12)

This information about Lucy represented on this page reinforces the ideational function of Lucy's representation in both the film and original written text. The emphasis in this representation is on her constancy (usually, always) in relation to her qualities of cheerfulness, truthfulness, and bravery. In the description, she is also connected to the mythical Narnian creatures of Mr. Tumnus and Aslan. Moreover, the allusion to the gifts from Father Christmas also function to reinforce her closeness to magic and fantasy through the origin of the cordial and its contents. These gifts also emphasize her traditionally feminine qualities through the cordial bottle with its allusion to Lucy's role as a healer and the description of the small dagger solely for defense.

6.5.4 Lucy's diary: Interpersonal function

This text provides another expansion of the interpersonal offer of Lucy as focalizer. This interpersonal offer is produced through the other significant element of this two-
page spread: a diary entry written by Lucy. This diary entry written in first person functions to cultivate a closer personal connection between Lucy and the reader of the text than available in the book or film:

Dear Diary, Today I discovered a magical world! I stepping into the wardrobe at the Professor's house and ended up in a very strange place called Narnia. I met a Faun, had tea in his lovely cave and listened to him play that flute. (That put me to sleep.) Then he told me about the evil White Witch. Narnia was exciting and scary and wonderful, all at the same time! (Kirk 2005b: 12-13)

This diary entry further expands upon the interpersonal offer of Lucy as focalizer in the written text and film adaptation. Through the diary format, the writing style represents the young, enthusiastic, and personable voice of Lucy through the use of exclamation points and asides. This representation of Lucy's perspective also emphasizes her youth, innocence, and exuberance over fear (particularly in terms of the Tumnus episode and the evil White Witch).

6.5.5 Lucy as avatar in the franchise video game: Ideational function

The Chronicles of Narnia: The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe video game, produced as part of the film franchise by Buena Vista Games (2005), exemplifies a distinct articulation of discourse related to Lucy. This section does not provide a complete analysis of this game and the experience of its players. Rather, the analysis focuses on how the discourses articulated in the film representation are re-articulated through the design of the Lucy avatar and her role in the game. (See Figure 15 for a screen shot of the Lucy avatar.)

The video game is an action adventure 15 level game that is geared towards
younger players and fans of the film. As a player of this game you are required to choose skills provided by each of the four Pevensie siblings. Greg Mueller, one reviewer of the videogame on gamespot.com, describes the role of each sibling in the gameplay:

 Each character has special moves and abilities that are required to overcome certain obstacles. Peter is the strongest of the bunch, so you can use him for fighting off enemies or breaking through barriers. Susan is your ranged attacker, and she can throw snowballs and tennis balls, as well as use a bow and arrow. Edmund is a decent melee fighter, but he's also light and athletic enough that he can climb trees or posts and walk on delicate surfaces like thin ice or weakened floorboards. Lucy is small, so she can crawl through small passages to reach arenas that the other children can't. Lucy can also charm animals and use them to attack, and she can use a first-aid skill to heal all the children. (My italicized emphasis. Mueller 2005)

Thus, the ideational function of the Lucy avatar provides consistency with her representation in the film and other franchise texts. Lucy is small; however, in the context of the game this quality is perceived as a physical asset in the game play as well as its semiotic function to signify innocence, youth, and vulnerability. Similarly, Lucy’s ability to charm animals in the film supports her role as a Romantic child close to nature and wonder; however, in the game this may also provide a useful skill. The role of Lucy as healer in both the film and video game is her most powerful and agentive quality.

In a special behind-the-scenes feature on gamespot.com, Andy Burrows, the associate producer of the video game, describes Lucy’s character in the game as: "the trusting soul...who proves to be as fierce and determined as any of the White Witch’s minions...Her hardy spirit gets release through the little dagger and the skill of climbing on top of the wolves (among others) and controlling them while they do their best to
shake her off” (Burrows 2005). While continuing to sustain Lucy’s role as “a trusting soul” with healing powers and closeness to animals, the game re-articulates Lucy as a fiercer version of her character in the film. Despite these enhanced qualities and skills in the game context, in comparison to her siblings, Lucy continues to be the least active and the most defensive avatar in the gameplay.

Figure 15: Lucy as avatar in *Chronicles of Narnia* videogame (Buena Vista 2005)
6.5.6 Lucy avatar: Interpersonal function

The visual representation of the Lucy avatar in the game is modeled on Georgie Henley who plays her in the film. Although she moves in a stylized manner like a plastic figure/model, the avatar closely resembles the actor resulting in an interpersonal offer to focalize the game play through Henley’s particular dramatic interpretation of Lucy. However, the perspective of the video game is not represented from a first person point of view, and the camera angles are reminiscent of the film with fixed camera angles that the player cannot control. This may decrease the interpersonal offer of Lucy as a focalizer for the game play. Moreover, the game provides an offer of engagement for the player with various characters. As a player, you can move between the four siblings to complete different challenges or you can team up two of the siblings in a cooperative action for specific challenges. At an ideational level this promotes one message that underlines the film: the strength of teamwork and family. Nevertheless, due to this teamwork component, Lucy is positioned in battle with various ogres, minotaurs and other creatures from the Narnia fictional universe. In other franchise texts, these engagements are primarily associated with the representation of Peter.

Various reviews of the game on gamespot.com (including Mueller cited above) critiqued aspects of this cooperative function of the game. Although I was unable to play and discuss this game with the participants in my fieldwork, in discussions around the film, a few had played or expressed interest in playing the game in the future. One participant, John, who had played the game, expressed frustration with the limited avatar selection, namely that you are required to play as the Pevensie siblings: "It's fun but you can't play Aslan. He's autoplay" (McMillan Fieldwork 2006: Focus group transcript). The offer to play a combination of the Pevensie characters expands the interpersonal offer of
engagement; however, the limited offer of the Pevensie children as the only possible avatars restricts the play possibilities for a viewer/player to focalize through the perspectives of other mythological creatures (e.g. Mr. Tumnus; the ogres), the White Witch or Aslan among other Narnians.

6.5.7 Offer for cross-media play with Lucy discourses in franchise texts

These franchised tie-in texts exemplify offers of paratextual play characterized by repetition and variation. In terms of the Lucy oriented collectible tie-in text Lucy’s Adventure, the representation of Lucy, both in the cover image and the written text, exemplifies repetition that reinforces the discourse of Romantic childhood in relation to the collectible texts that articulate qualities associated with her siblings. Moreover, the repetition of this discourse around Lucy provides an offer for repetitive paratextual play, while the variation element of paratextual play is offered through the new formats and multiple focalizers.

As a franchise text related to the film, the video game offers potential paratextual play in relation to the film through repetition and variation. While the Lucy avatar repeats and reinforces discourse around Lucy, there are significant variations on this discourse from the film and franchise tie-in texts, representing Lucy with particular agentive powers in the game space. Nevertheless, due to the team-work element of the text and the third person point-of-view, the interpersonal offer of Lucy as a focalizer is decreased. The game also provides an offer of cross-media play to fans with the inclusion of bonus material that may be unlocked during the game. This bonus material includes behind-the-scenes footage for the film and a segment on the making of the game and provide an offer of both paratextual play and behind-the-scenes modality play. This
second category of cross-media play is discussed in relation to the DVD bonus features and the behind-the-scenes movie companion book in the next sections.

6.6 Behind-the Scenes franchise texts

This section expands the multimodal design analysis of Lucy Pevensie in the film to the analysis of related discourse articulated in two behind-the-scenes franchise texts: Perry Moore’s *Official Illustrated Movie Companion* (2005) and *The Chronicles of Narnia: The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* DVD bonus features (2006). This section draws upon the multimodal design analysis with a focus is on how these behind-the-scenes franchise texts expand upon the discourses related to Lucy in the multimodal design of the film. Moreover, this section addresses how these franchise texts re-articulate these film discourses around Lucy (through ideational, interpersonal and textual functions) as well as distinctly offer the potential for cross-media play with the discourses of the film.

6.6.1 Lucy/Georgie Henley in The Official Illustrated Movie Companion: Ideational function

*The Chronicles of Narnia: The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe: The Official Illustrated Movie Companion* (2005) is written primarily by Perry Moore, one of the film producers, with segments written by the director, and contributions from different actors and members of the production team. The text charts the filming process chronologically and includes behind-the-scenes information, photographs, as well as original sketches for costume and set pieces. This franchise text expands upon the film discourse related to Lucy Pevensie through a narrative that represents the behind-the-scenes experiences of
the film production process. In addition, this text exemplifies an explicit offer of behind-the-scenes modality play with discourses associated with Georgie Henley, the child actor who plays Lucy Pevensie in the film. This section addresses three modes in the Movie Companion text that articulate discourses related to Lucy Pevensie: the primary written narrative on the making-of-the film by producers, directors, production crew, and actors; behind-the-scenes photographs of the child actors and production crew; and behind-the-scenes scrapbook material produced by Georgie Henley.

Firstly, the written reflection by Moore in the Movie Companion exemplifies a representation of Georgie Henley that alludes to ideational qualities attributed to the character of Lucy. Primarily, Moore describes the child actor drawing on the discourse of wonder in Romantic childhood: “there’s something extra-special about Georgie...It’s the same quality that makes Lucy Pevensie so special; Georgie has an infinite sense of wonder” (Moore 86). In another section, Moore reflects:

[s]omeone had to make Lucy Pevensie real. That was perhaps our greatest task: finding the little girl whose imagination and faith in things hard to believe in would launch us into the world of Narnia. She had to be unique-wise beyond her years, but innocent as the purest child. (2005: 86)

These reflections by Moore highlight a number of qualities including imagination, faith, purity, innocence, and wisdom to characterize Georgie within the same discourse of innocence and wonder associated with Lucy. Thus, the producers of the Disney/Walden media franchise articulate this discourse of childhood innocence and wonder across the franchise both within the textual discourse around Lucy in the film and franchise texts, and in the extra-textual representation of Georgie Henley. The aim here seems to be to create a higher modality for the idealized nature of Lucy’s character through the
representation of Georgie as a ‘real’ person who shares various qualities with the fictional character.

Moore’s reflective narrative that runs through this companion text also articulates strong developmental discourse in relation to the child actors including Georgie:

There are so many ways Georgie has grown over the course of the film. Physically, she's right behind Skandar [who plays Edmund] as far as growth-spurts go. At last check she'd grown three inches. By the time they reach the coronation scene, you can see that Lucy the girl is showing signs of becoming Lucy the young woman. I think it choked up her mom to see Georgie in that Queen's dress for the first time. And she's still the same girl we fell in love with in that first audition. Some things will never change. (Moore 86)

Moore represents Georgie in relation to a discourse of maturation. Moore’s representation of Georgie further blurs the identities of Lucy and the child actor through his references Georgie’s physical transformation exemplified by the observation of “Lucy the girl is showing signs of becoming Lucy the young women” (86). Moreover, the coronation of Queen Lucy is represented as an emotional moment for Georgie’s mother who is depicted as responding to the coronation scene as the experience of her daughter Georgie, not the fictional character Lucy. The coronation scene, a common feature of Disney films and coming-of-age maturation narratives (similar to graduation, the prom, marriage or coronation in the case of the film Princess Diaries 2) is emphasized in various manners in the Movie Companion text. The text includes film stills of the scene from the film, costume sketches of Lucy’s different outfits including her royal costume for Queen Lucy in the coronation scene.
Figure 16: Georgie and William behind-the-scenes photograph (Moore 2005)

6.6.2 Lucy/Georgie Henley in the Movie Companion: Interpersonal function

The scrapbook segment of the companion book includes information provided by Georgie Henley herself that continue to reinforce her shared characteristics with Lucy while simultaneously providing a strong interpersonal offer to the reader. This segment cultivates a close personal proximity for the reader with a contemporary preadolescent female actor. This section includes an interview with Georgie's Stunt Double, Actress...
Kayleigh Caldwell:

GEORGIE: I'm here with my double, Kayleigh Caldwell. She is the most lovely girl I've ever met. She's bubbly, and she's pretty and she's wearing a fantastic necklace, trousers, shoes, and top today and she looks stunning. (Moore 119)

This transcribed interview is positioned beside a photograph of the two girls standing beside each other posed wearing matching white tank tops that read "Kapow! Girl Power" (Moore 119). The visual and textual representation of Georgie's interaction with her double functions to represent Georgie in relation to girl power discourses. The tank tops they are wearing in the photograph situate Georgie in relation to the popular and commercial culture discourses of tween girlhood. Georgie's description of Kayleigh using the terms "lovely" "bubbly" "stunning" in conjunction with her discussion of clothing and accessories reinforce that articulation of girl power through style and fashion. This provides an interpersonal offer to contemporary viewers to perceive Georgie in relation to contemporary tween girl culture. This representation conflicts with the academic, tomboyish, imaginative and magical child represented in the majority of discourse around Georgie.

Following the blurring of Georgie and Lucy's identities, Moore’s representation of the child actors emphasizes that the relationships between the four actors also resemble the sibling relationships represented on screen. Moore writes with regards to William Mosley (Peter) and Georgie Henley's relationship: "She looks up to him like a brother, and he takes care of her as if she were a little sister" (Moore 81). Behind-the-scenes candid photographs taken by child actors and production staff are included throughout the written text and function to cultivate a high modality in terms of the 'real' representation of Georgie Henley, and her relationships with the other cast members.
These photographs are given captions by Moore. For example, a candid photograph of Moseley and Henley hugging each other on set includes the caption: "I love this shot Anna took of William giving Georgie a little cuddle in between takes. If you look to the right, you can see our first AD. [Assistant Director] K. C. poking his head around the corner to come drag them off to set" (Moore 35). (See Figure 16 for this photograph.)

The photograph is slightly unfocused confirming the candid nature of the captured moment that works to confirm that these actors behave like ‘real’ siblings who “cuddle” behind-the-scenes as well as on camera. The caption also indicates that Anna [Popplewell] has taken this photo and thus, offers an even closer proximity for the reader/viewer to the behind-the-scenes experiences of the child actors.

As discussed previously, unlike the majority of narratives of tween girlhood on current film and television, Lucy and Susan are not represented in the morally charged Narnia maturation narrative in relation to potential heterosexual romance. However, the behind-the-scenes franchise texts extensively emphasize the close personal relationships between the young female actors and their male counterparts. While Moore’s emphasis is on the sibling-like relationships between the stars, a heterosexual proto-romance discourse of tween girlhood is offered to the reader/viewer through the close personal relationship represented between Georgie Henley and the actors who play her brothers, particularly Moseley. These relationships are drawn upon extensively in fan cultures that focus on potential romance in the sibling relationships. Notably, in the Disney/Walden Media film sequel The Chronicles of Narnia: Prince Caspian (2008), a flirtation is represented between Susan and Caspian that does not exist in Lewis’s novel Prince Caspian: Return to Narnia (1954).
In addition to the sibling relationships, the *Movie Companion* also elaborates the relationship between Lucy and Mr. Tumnus through the representation of the relationship between Georgie Henley and James McAvoy (who plays Mr. Tumnus). Moore describes the believability of their relationship on screen as a result of their off-screen friendship: "What charges their scenes with so much emotion and depth is the magical friendship that Georgie and James McAvoy enjoy in real life" (81). Moreover, he observes that "[t]heir chemistry is palpable; you can see two people who enjoyed hanging around each other, and it makes such a difference to the movie" (83). The high modality of the Tumnus/Lucy relationship is portrayed to the reader through the depiction of first-hand observed evidence of the relationship between the actors by Moore.

The director Andrew Adamson also confirms this 'magical relationship' in his written section of the *Movie Companion* text:

> the thing that I could never have hoped for or anticipated was how much he [McAvoy] developed a kinship with Georgie-they genuinely liked each other. They would goof around between takes. That's so important to the role. And they would do Posh and Beckham. You would hear them between takes doing their little skits...That connection comes through on the screen. (Moore 129)

The relationship is represented as silly and fun (i.e. "they would goof around") as well as drawing on popular culture terms that would address young readers such as the allusion to the two actors pretending that they were the celebrity couple Victoria (Posh Spice) and David Beckham (i.e. "they would do Posh and Beckham"). Furthermore, Georgie describes her first meeting with McAvoy in the language of physical attributes and fashion or style signifiers that are often used in magazines and adolescent fiction (as illustrated in the case study on the Olsens): "He had piercing blue eyes, lovely eyes, nice
curly chestnut hair... And he was wearing this cool vintage jumper and trainers" (Moore 83). Through this description, Georgie Henley represents McAvoy as a potential heterosexual object of romantic interest. Building on this, in another description of a scene, Georgie describes a moment where McAvoy helps her before she fell and injured herself:

‘We had to jump over a mattress,' Georgie recalls, 'and one time when I jumped I tripped and almost landed on my stomach. But before I hit the ground, James jumped out and caught me. He had his arms wrapped around me and said, ‘White knight in shining armor?’ Then he said, 'Are you all right, darling?’ (Moore 83)

There are two levels to this representation. On one level is the representation of James/Tumnus as Georgie/Lucy’s saviour in a moment of crisis, in another is a self-parody by McAvoy of the gesture as a romantic narrative. Georgie’s representation both represents James/Tumnus as her romantic saviour as well as her humorous friend. In both cases, the result is the cultivation of a high modality for a close relationship between Lucy and Mr. Tumnus developed through the blurring of information about the interactions between the actors Georgie Henley and James McAvoy. This supplemental behind-the-scenes information provides an offer to a viewer/reader of behind-the-scenes modality play as well as intertextual expanded-story play in relation to Lucy and Tumnus that is taken up in the digital fan fiction discussed in the final part of this chapter.

6.6.3 DVD bonus features: Ideational function

The DVD bonus features of The Chronicles of Narnia: The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe (2006) provide three key functions that act as paratexts to the film text itself: the ‘bloopers’; pop-up trivia provided by Lewis’s step-son and film co-producer
Douglas Gresham; and two audio commentaries to supplement the screening of the film. One commentary option is with the director and production team and the second commentary option is with the director and the four child actors. Rather than provide an extensive analysis of all three modes in the DVD bonus features, this section highlights some of the key elements of each that contribute to the articulation of discourse around Lucy Pevensie and the wardrobe scene.

Significantly, similar to the reflective narration by Moore in the *Movie Companion*, the DVD audio commentary by the producer and director emphasizes the dominant discourse of childhood innocence and wonder in relation to Lucy. For example, in the audio commentary for the wardrobe segment with the adult producers, Andrew Adamson, the film’s director, reaffirms the Romantic discourse around Lucy from the Lewis text: “It is a lot about the wonder of childhood and the openness of the childish imagination. And I think that is what Lucy represents and what comes across so well in this scene. It’s just that sense of possibility and openness” (Disney Walden Media 2006: DVD audio commentary). Comparably, the audio commentary with the director and the four child actors who play the Pevensies reaffirms discourse around Lucy through the blurring of physical and social qualities of Lucy and Georgie. For example, in the scene prior to the wardrobe discovery, Lucy is represented sitting in bed worried about their new life at the Professor’s house, surrounded by her siblings who stand around her. The director Andrew Adamson and the actors Anna Popplewell (Susan), William Moseley (Peter), Skandar Keynes (Edmund) and Georgie Pevensie (Lucy) respond to this scene in the audio commentary:

Anna with voice of Andrew: Oh Geor--gie. (high pitched squeal).

William: So small
Georgie: I’m not a small person

Skandar: Look how small you are!

Georgie: My hair is like really short. Like a doll.

Andrew: I remember how much William liked that [his] hair cut.

William: Disgusting.

Skandar: Mine was cool. I could put it up.

Andrew: I remember how shocked I was when I saw your hair Anna [after it was cut for the film]. You arrived with such long, long hair...

Georgie: Gorgeous! (The Chronicles Walden Media 2006: DVD audio commentary)

Through the informal interaction and sibling-like quarrelling, this audio commentary primarily represents the interactions between the actors outside the film as resembling the sibling relationships in the film itself. This representation of the behind-the-scenes world as similar to the film characters cultivates a high modality for the fiction text. The comments by the actors reaffirm Lucy’s role as small, young, innocent through an emphasis on her smallness. At the same time, this commentary articulates distinctions between the actors and the characters they represent, particularly cues related to appearance. This dialogue around the hair styles indicates the distinctions between the ‘real’ hairstyles preferred by the actors and the short, formal hair styles represented in the film (‘disgusting’) that signify the time period, social class and in terms of Henley and Susan, reflect the appropriate hair styles for their ages and character traits (as defined by the film designers). Georgie Henley’s own response “My hair is like really short. Like a doll” draws attention to some of the physical cues to indicate Lucy’s child-like qualities in comparison to her siblings through the short hair bob. While distinct from the Lucy’s
two hair plaits represented in Baynes's illustrations, the hair bob may visually signify the age of a preadolescent girl while longer hair worn in a particular fashion is often associated with an adolescent female. This commentary articulates a discourse of maturation in relation to the physical maturation and changes of the actors in their lives outside the film as well as the distinction between Georgie and the character representation of Lucy. This dialogue around hair-styles and other visual cues around physical appearance are the focus of response in both digital fan cultures around Georgie Henley and in the focus group responses in the fieldwork.

The bloopers mode involves a reel of behind-the-scenes humorous moments in the filming where actors forget their lines, trip and fall, and miss their cues. Other parts of the bloopers include a montage of short clips set to a soundtrack of upbeat pop music (without vocals) that includes clips of actors making silly faces to the camera, the crew wearing summer clothes while filming a winter shot, and scenes of shooting with the Narnian creatures wearing bright green leggings with red dots to shoot scenes involving CGI animation *(The Chronicles Walden Media: DVD bloopers)*. The ideational function of the bloopers mode represents Lucy in relation to the behind-the-scenes behaviour of Georgie and the other actors on the film, particularly the child actors who play the Pevensies. Key moments for Georgie Henley in the bloopers include: Henley making creepy and silly faces at the camera, falling as she runs across the snow, and getting caught in the large white sheet as she uncovers the wardrobe *(The Chronicles Walden Media: DVD bloopers)*. Following the representation of Georgie Henley in the other behind-the-scenes material, the bloopers once again blur the ideational function of Lucy in terms of idealized childhood that would be difficult to situate in contemporary tween commercial and popular culture through the revelation of Georgie as a silly, cheerful, and
out-spoken preadolescent girl who goofs around with the actors who play her siblings. In addition, the bloopers contribute to the representation one of the life of a child star as fun and collegial. Primarily, the representation involves an interpersonal offer of a close social distance to Georgie, the stars, and the others on set. The representation contributes to the representation of Georgie as a potential friend for an implied viewer.

6.6.4 DVD bonus features: Interpersonal function

In terms of the interpersonal function, through the audio commentary, bloopers and pop-up trivia functions of the DVD bonus features, the degree of modality of Narnia as a believable fantasy world is decreased through the revelation of the behind-the-scenes modes of production. However, in terms of the modality of the characters, the blurring of the qualities of the characters (Lucy and the other children) with the qualities of the actors (Georgie Henley and others) cultivates a greater believability and cultivates a personal closeness between the viewer and the represented participants in the film. Moreover, the interpersonal function of the DVD bonus features creates a closer proximity between various levels of interpersonal participants. On one level, the relationship between the interactive participants (actors, producers, directors, audience viewers) is expanded. On a second level the relationship between the interactive participants, and the representational participants (characters in the film) is intensified through the blurring of discourse around the identities of the child actors and the identities of the characters. Consequently, the relationship between the viewers and the characters may be strengthened. On the third level, the relationships between the representational characters is also given a higher modality due to the blurring of the relationships between the actors and the relations between the Pevensie siblings.
Distinct from the audio commentaries and the bloopers, the pop-up video segment raises the degree of modality of the text through a connection to the behind-the-scenes world of the author. The degree of modality is validated through the introductory voice of Douglas Gresham, Lewis’s step-son, who exemplifies authenticity in terms of his closeness to the original text and author. Through the use of Gresham’s voice, this text produces a different relationship between interactive participants than cultivated by the other DVD bonus features. Gresham provides a closeness to the author that offers a high modality for the information presented around the ‘real’ girls that may have inspired the represented participant of Lucy in the Narnia narrative (The Chronicles Walden Media: DVD pop-up video). Thus, the relationship between interactive participants is between the implied child or adult viewer and Gresham, an adult male with a close personal proximity to the original author.

6.6.5 Offer of cross-media play with Lucy discourses in behind-the-scenes texts

The Movie Companion and the DVD bonus features offer opportunities for various categories of cross-media play. Firstly, in terms of paratextual play, the DVD bonus features offer play characterized by repetition and variation. For example, the two options for audio commentary and the Douglas Gresham pop-up video function provide explicit offers to the viewer for repetition of the textual discourse through repeated viewing of the film with some variation of the film experience through the audio commentary and pop-up video functions. As discussed in relation to the interpersonal function of these variations exemplifies shifts in the degree of modality that also specifically provide an offer of behind-the-scenes modality play. Information about the ‘real’ personalities of the actors and the relations between them, as well as the real
background to the story in terms of C.S. Lewis’s life and inspirations are revealed through shared information. In addition, the viewer is offered to experience the screening with the child actors through the audio commentary, an interpersonal offer that involves a close personal proximity that may be produced between the viewer and the child actors. Finally, the Bloopers also provide a key offer of behind-the-scenes modality play as well as an offer for phantasmagoric play through the physical comedy, anarchic images, and represented frivolity and silliness of the behind-the-scenes experience.

6.7 Sites of audience discourse around Lucy Pevensie and Georgie Henley

6.7.1 Georgie Henley fansite: Behind-the-scenes modality play

In comparison to the film discourse discussed in the previous section, digital fan cultures illustrate how discourses around Lucy Pevensie and Georgie Henley are distinctly transformed by young consumers. The majority of digital culture around Georgie Henley exemplifies the category of behind-the-scenes modality play offered by the DVD bonus features and the Movie Companion. For many young readers and viewers, there are many online forums including fan-generated websites, child-produced spoof videos, photo-collages, and fan fiction posted online in private and public forums related to the film franchise. One popular fansite, georgiehenley.com articulates discourse around Georgie Henley in the format of a fansite for a tween celebrity such as Miley Cyrus (who plays the title character in the Disney Hannah Montana franchise). For example, Georgie’s fansite includes: biographical information, links to a chat forum, an image gallery with magazine scans, press shots, film stills, production shots, and photographs.
This short excerpt below from this fansite illustrates a characteristic dialogue that occurs in the online forums around Henley. This excerpt from December 2007 represents the responses of fan consumers to a film still (See Figure 17) from the Narnia film sequel *Prince Caspian* released in 2008:

**Sunday 02nd December 2007 • First look at Lucy!**

*Thanks to lisa, we have our first look at Georgie as Lucy in Prince Caspian.*

*Doesn't she look grown up?*

*Yes! She's beautiful, as always! I LOVE her longer hair...gorgeous!*

*by Lisa at 03 Dec 2007 01:24 am*

*Hey Sally, the trailer of Prince Caspian will be released on Mexico this tuesday at 9:00pm, i'll do some caps, you can put them on the site*

*by iris at 03 Dec 2007 01:28 am*

*She is beautiful, and yes, the long hair is gorgeous!*

*by Ella at 03 Dec 2007 02:05 am*

*Aww she looks sooo sweet!!!She is veryyyyyyy pretty!!Thanks for posting :)*

*by Anja from Russia at 03 Dec 2007 01:56 pm*

*Of course, she is wonderful. leia, have you got images with Scandar, Ben, Anna and William?*

*(georgiehenley.com 2007: fan forum)*

This chat forum excerpt above re-articulates many of the discourses in the behind-the-scenes franchise texts. This forum highlights various elements that have salience on these sites: firstly, Georgie's relation to her co-stars Skandar, Ben, Anna and William who play the Pevensies; secondly, the simultaneous physical maturation of Lucy and Georgie through the image from the upcoming film; thirdly, many elements of this excerpt
articulate Georgie’s qualities that are associated with innocence and goodness (i.e. “she looks sooo sweet”). These comments are characteristic of comments on the website as well as discourse around Georgie in the franchise texts that tend to emphasize her cuteness, sweetness and smallness. However, the discussion of Georgie’s “long hair” and changed appearance are reminiscent of the interchange between the four child actors around hairstyles in the audio commentary of the film. Similarly, this conversation around Georgie’s new hairstyle articulates a discourse of coming-of-age and maturation. Other comments “Doesn’t she look grown up?” also allude to both Lucy and Georgie’s maturation. As discussed in reference to Lucy’s short bob, the trope of the changed hairstyle is often employed as a visual signifier for emotional or social transformations in tween and teen filmic narratives. The discourse of maturation is articulated more extensively in fan videos around Lucy discussed in the next section.

6.7.2 Lucy-Breakaway fan video: Intertextual-cross-over play

Various popular fan culture activities exemplify the category of intertextual cross-over play with discourses from the film and franchise texts. This section examines the creation of a montage music videos that edits and re-mixes clips from favourite films. A number of fan videos that may be found on Youtube (and other fan venues) integrate elements of the Narnia film with the narratives, characters and themes of other texts. In the digital cultures of young people, the emphasis on production is often through this act of ‘re-mixing.’ Lankshear and Knobel (2007) define ‘re-mixing’ as a literacy practice "where a range of original materials are copied, cut, spliced, edited, reworked, and mixed into a new creation" (8). These fan videos often illustrate alternative narratives created by young digital producers. One fan video, “Lucy-Breakaway” (mogi93 2006) re-mixes
scenes of Lucy set to the song “Breakaway” by Kelly Clarkson, from the soundtrack of
the popular coming-of-age film *Princess Diaries 2: Royal Engagement* (2004). This re-
imixing results in the production of a coming-of-age transformative discourse of
maturation for Lucy Pevensie. A transformative coming-of-age discourse is central to
*The Princess Diaries* books and film adaptations. The quirky outsider Mia discovers that
she is a princess of a small (fictional) country called Genovia and under the tutelage of
her grandmother, the Queen, she struggles first against and then towards the development
of the social, physical and emotional qualities required of a princess.

Figure 17: Film still from *Prince Caspian* (2008)
Classic literary transformative narratives of social and moral development such as *Anne of Green Gables* and *Little Women* (discussed in Chapter Five) may be considered models for *The Princess Diaries* books and film adaptations. The use of the song “Breakaway” in this fanvideo draws upon multiple levels of intertextual meaning associated with tween girlhood and specific contemporary tween girl texts. Written by teen pop-punk star Avril Lavigne and performed by American Idol winner Kelly Clarkson, the song was released on both *The Princess Diaries 2* soundtrack (2004) as well as Kelly Clarkson’s album of the same name. Significantly for the Lucy fanvideo, the music video for “Breakaway”, recorded for *The Princess Diaries 2*, is included as one of the film’s DVD bonus features. The lyrics of the song (printed below) are aspirational lyrics that illustrate the archetypal coming of age experience in adolescent fiction, film and music drawing on the themes of agency, empowerment, breaking away from the past to move forward. The lyrics of the song paired with a pop music structure, build up through the first two verses into a crescendo of the chorus:

> I'll spread my wings and I'll learn how to fly.
> I'll do what it takes till I touch the sky.
> Make a wish, take a chance,
> Make a change, and break away.
> Out of the darkness and into the sun.
> But I won't forget all the ones that I love.
> I'll take a risk, take a chance,
> Make a change, and break away. (Clarkson 2004)

The music video for this song was tied into both the theme of the film and the theme of the song’s lyrics, following a young girl (a young Kelly Clarkson in the small town
dreaming of breaking away, the music video cuts between scenes of the young girl
dreaming of becoming a pop star to scenes of performer Kelly Clarkson in the present at
a (fictional) premiere of the film *The Princess Diaries 2*. This narrative of the young
Kelly dreaming of becoming a star is interwoven with scenes from the film of Princess
Mia transformation from awkward young teenager to adult princess.

This fan video is modelled on Mia's transformation in the *Princess Diaries* film
narratives (2001; 2004), and Kelly Clarkson's coming-of-age visual and textual narrative
in the music video for the song "Breakaway." The fan video "Lucy-breakaway", matches
the song "Breakaway" with edited clips of Lucy throughout the Narnia film that include
early scenes of Lucy full of wonder, discovering Narnia and concludes with images of
Queen Lucy in royal costume at the conclusion of the film (mogi93 2006). Through
multiple levels of intertextuality, the fan producer has resituated Lucy in a tween girl
discourse outside of Lucy's original articulation through discourse as an innocent
Romantic child. This type of play with cross-media discourses exemplify the possibility
for a disruption of the discourse of Romantic innocence; however, in disrupting the
childhood discourse, the representation instead articulates a normative adolescent
discourse of maturation.

6.7.3 Intertextual-expanded story/phantasmagoric play: Lucy/Mr. Tumnus

There are multiple examples of digital fan cultures around Lucy Pevensie and
Georgie Henley that exemplify the category of intertextual expanded story play and
phantasmagoric play that cultivate the relationships and potential romances between
characters in Narnia that are not explicitly represented in the film or franchise or may be
taboo. These include fan communities around Lucy and Edmund; Lucy and Peter; and
Lucy and Mr. Tumnus. The examples of Mr. Tumnus/Lucy fandom are numerous from fan sites dedicated to their relationship in the book and feature film. Similar to the re-mix fan video of “Lucy Breakaway”, the writer of the fanfiction text “Everywhere” (2007) provides an example of fantasy fan fiction around the Lucy Pevensie and Tumnus relationship (BlackMoonWhiteSun 2007). This fan fiction text integrates the lyrics of a Michelle Branch’s song about lost love “Everywhere” (Branch 2001) within a fictional narrative about Mr. Tumnus and Lucy, that follows the style and narrative conventions of an adolescent romance novel.

This fictional story exemplifies phantasmagoric and intertextual play with the discourses around Lucy Pevensie. The narrative expands upon the potential maturation and sexuality of Lucy in conflict with the Romantic child discourse in the written text, the BBC adaptation and the Disney/Walden Media film franchise. The tag line for this story reads “It’s been nine years since Lucy’s seen her beloved Mr. Tumnus but everywhere she turns, she sees curly locks and red mufflers. It’s time they were reunited, don’t you think? The song nor The Chronicles of Narnia belong to me. They’re the work of Michelle Branch and C.S. Lewis” (BlackMoonWhiteSun 2007). This introductory tag-line situates this narrative as both a sequel (nine years ahead in the future of The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe narrative) and an expanded story that focuses on a relationship that is not fleshed out in the primary text. Moreover, the tone of the tag line (everywhere she turns, she sees curly locks and red mufflers) and the imperative voice (Don’t you think?) situates the story in the realm of adolescent fiction and particularly teen romance narratives (BlackMoonWhiteSun 2007). The description of ‘curly locks’ also humanizes the faun character placing him as the romantic protagonist of adolescent fiction rather than a mythological creature. Thus, while the intrinsic fantasy content at the crux of this
story: a romantic and potentially sexual relationship between an adult half-human/half-animal mythological creature and a preadolescent girl is phantasmagoric in nature, the other discourses drawn upon in the story, such as the setting and plot conventions of an adolescent romance novel, function to minimize the phantasmagoric elements.

In order to produce this romantic narrative within the normative conventions of coming-of-age discourses, Lucy is represented as an adolescent female protagonist, beyond the discourses of tween girlhood, particularly the discourse of Romantic innocence that is articulated in both the novel and the Disney/Walden Media film adaptation. This adolescent Lucy is exuberant as she races towards an individual she believes to be Mr. Tumnus wearing a red muffler: "She flung her arms around the person’s waist and exclaimed, 'Oh, it's so good to see you again.'" (BlackMoonWhiteSun 2007). In the story, Lucy dreams that she is with Mr. Tumnus in Narnia at a Valentine’s Day ball. In this dream sequence, she is 'Queen Lucy,' an older incarnation of the child Lucy with "Her long golden hair was tied into a knot on top of her head" and a "mocking scornful look" (BlackMoonWhiteSun 2007). The narrative primarily follows the conventional narrative from adolescent romance fiction of a burgeoning romance between a sheepish male revealing his love to a mocking and exuberant royal female.

Comparable to the use of Kelly Clarkson's song in the "Lucy-Breakaway" fanvideo (mogi93 2006), the use of the lyrics Michelle Branch’s song "Everywhere" situates the writer and the story within a discourse of pop music written and performed by young female artists. Moreover, the use of lyrics interspersed with a written fictional narrative is a common stylistic convention in fan fiction but also in contemporary young adult fiction. The lyrics of the song frame the content of the story, namely the repeated rhyming lines "when I wake you’re never there/But when I sleep you’re
everywhere/You’re everywhere” (Branch 2001). The significance of the song as an element of the story is evident through the content of the lyrics. In addition, the use of the center margin results in the stanzas of the song positioned as the most visually salient element on the page.

The phantasmagoric elements however are referenced in various ways. First, the narrator describes “couples of different ages and species danced, holding each other tightly. The Faun looked over to her” (BlackMoonWhiteSun 2007). In this revision of the final narrative of Narnia, the Christian utopia created by Lewis in The Last Battle (1956) is subverted by this fan writer’s vision of Narnia as an idealized image of inter-species and inter-generational coupling. Moreover, despite the conventions of courtship that allude to Victorian and Edwardian novels of maturation, within this fantasy space, Tumnus is a “stammering” and sheepish man, and Lucy is an active sexual agent who “stood on tip-toe and kissed him firmly on the lips… kissed his lips and mounted her horse…[and] pulled her hand away from the Faun’s and wrapped both of her arms around his shoulders” (BlackMoonWhiteSun 2007). In this story, the return to Narnia through death allows her to return to her love Mr. Tumnus. The fantasy space of Narnia in this text not only allows the children to live forever in Narnia but allows for her to engage in a relationship that would not be appropriate in reality.

6.8 Cross-media play in the Narnia focus group responses (Grade 3 class, Toronto, June 2006)

During fieldwork in a Grade three class in Toronto, Canada (2005-2006), one set of semi-structured focus group discussions concentrated on cross-media Narnia texts including the BBC serial, the feature film, and other associated texts. These informal
conversations during the viewing experience exemplify the dynamic articulation of
discourse in peer group settings. The central discourse articulated may arise from the
texts under discussion, from other intertextual references, and from the context of
viewing and discussion in itself. Many of these cross-media interactions illustrate what
may be defined as *textual dabbling*, a form of ‘textual poaching’ (Jenkins 1992) that does
not necessarily exemplify a committed investment in a specific cross-media world or
franchise. Moreover, these engagements by participants in the fieldwork exemplified
play with the discourses of the texts that is distinct from the fan fiction and fan videos
analyzed in this chapter. These engagements with discourse involve cross-media play
that is distinct from the textual poaching outlined by Jenkins and illustrated in the fan
productions discussed above. The cross-media play I observed in the focus groups was
also distinct from the investment in the texts of the cross-media world exemplified by the
committed Olsen fans who have engaged with various texts over a longer time frame (as
discussed in Chapter Seven).

Following the screening of the Lucy through the Wardrobe scene in the
Disney/Walden Media film (2006) with the whole class, focus groups of four to five
children sat closely together around a twelve-inch laptop and watched the same scene in
the 1988 BBC television serial on DVD (*The Chronicles BBC 2005*). I audio-taped the
responses of participants during the screening as well as the conversations to follow. The
three transcripts I have selected for analysis exemplify the key types of cross-media play
that were observed in all of the Narnia focus groups. I employ these selected transcripts
to highlight key patterns in this audience study as well as to elucidate cross-media
practices that are comparable but distinct from the digital fan cultures around Lucy and
Georgie Henley. The responses draw primarily on cross-media play that is phantasmagoric but also reveal elements of the other categories of cross-media play.

6.8.1 Focus Group transcript 1: Are there bloopers? Are there bloopers?

This focus group transcript is taken from the beginning of one focus group discussion. These comments were made as I loaded the BBC serial DVD to start the screening of the Lucy through the Wardrobe segment.

(McMillan fieldwork 2006: focus group transcript)

I have selected the transcript to begin the analysis of this audience segment as it exemplifies a characteristic discussion at the beginning of the focus group sessions around Narnia and the other tween texts. In the fieldwork, I observed that the DVD bonus features, particularly the bloopers, have great significance and priority for young
viewers in their DVD viewing experiences. Similarly, during the pilot study, Elizabeth would often request that we watch the DVD bonus features or bloopers first before a film feature in relation to films she had previously viewed as well as those she had not.

As discussed in the analysis section on behind-the-scene franchise texts, the DVD bonus features are significant to the expansion and cultivation of modality claims around Lucy’s character in relation to Georgie Henley. In addition, the DVD bonus features provide various offers for cross-media play with the text: paratextual repetition and variation play; behind-the-scenes modality play; and phantasmagoric play. From the focus group discussions, I observed that the bloopers primarily provided a form of phantasmagoric play. The participants did not articulate extensive verbal responses to this element of the text. Rather, the bloopers provided non-verbal responses: laughter, physical humour and a shared moment of comedy for different groups.

In addition, the bloopers provided a type of repetition and variation play i.e. the pleasure of repetition in the re-watching the bloopers and anticipating the humorous moments that they recalled from the previous screening. Before viewing the Lucy through the wardrobe scenes, one student Christina asked: “Have you seen the bloopers [for Disney/Walden Media Narnia]? I love it when Lucy falls on the ground...” (McMillan fieldwork 2006: focus group transcript). She waited in anticipation throughout the bloopers until the moment when Lucy slips and falls during a scene. This comment about the bloopers highlights the humour in Lucy falling rather than Georgie Henley the actor. Thus, this bloopers moment involves a behind-the-scenes reference than provides a comedic moment for the actor as well as the fictional character of Lucy (i.e. “I love it when Lucy falls....”). Moreover, as discussed in the multimodal analysis of the DVD
bonus features, this humorous moment exemplifies the offer of an accessible anarchic moment in relation to the most idealized character in the narrative.

As observed at the end of the excerpted transcript, the BBC collector’s edition of *The Chronicles of Narnia* television serial does not include bloopers. Rather, it includes a separate “Special Features” DVD with “Behind the Scenes” information about costume and set design, special effects and outtakes, *Blue Peter* interviews, a cast reunion interview from 2003, character and actor biographies, and a “Narnia Trivia” feature (*The Chronicles* BBC 2005). Despite this addition of DVD bonus features (that would not have existed in an earlier home release on VHS or the original television broadcast), the young people in the study were irritated that the features were not on the same DVD as the show itself, and primarily disappointed that there were “no bloopers.” When two of the six focus groups watched the special features DVD upon request at the end of the focus group discussion, they became quickly bored by the features and seemed confused about how the *Blue Peter* interviews were “Behind the Scenes”. They were described as “weird” and “boring.” (McMillan fieldwork 2006: focus group transcript).

Part of this rejection may be a rejection of the Romantic nostalgic discourse articulated in these DVD bonus features. Unlike the anarchic and behind the scenes additions to the plot addressing the young viewers in the feature film DVD, these special features were geared towards a nostalgic adult viewer who would have watched the television serial as a child. The box of this collector’s edition DVD directly addresses the nostalgic adult viewer who would have watched this adaptation of the text as a child. The DVD box directly addresses this nostalgic viewer in the imperative with the use of words that allude to the viewer’s memory of the text’s excitement and magic: “Relive the excitement of these *memorable* productions in this magical *collector’s* edition DVD”
(italics added for emphasis) (The Chronicles BBC 2005: DVD box). This Romantic discourse articulated through the interpersonal address to the nostalgic adult viewer is central to this re-release, particularly appealing to teachers and parents who will both remember this text as well as engage with this idealized discourse of children's texts as modes to experience wonder. Moreover, the Blue Peter segments are also British in content and the Canadian participants in my study did not have any connection or context for this show. These features also seem to be geared towards viewers in the United Kingdom who may also have watched Blue Peter during the 1980s and 1990s and would have nostalgic remembrances of the children's programme as well as the adaptation of Narnia.

An offer of paratextual and behind-the-scenes modality play is apparent in both the Disney/Walden Media and the BBC DVD bonus features. However, for the participants in my study, the bloopers for the Disney/Walden Media are the most salient element of the DVD bonus features and function as a vehicle for phantasmagoric and behind-the-scenes modality play in relation to discourses around Lucy. Thus, in relation to the BBC's Narnia, the absence of the phantasmagoric and anarchic element in the form of the bloopers, in conjunction with the absence of an invested connection to the BBC adaptation (due to age, and cultural background), the offer of cross-media play is rejected by the participants. Interestingly, the rejection of the BBC DVD bonus features draws attention to the elements of the Disney/Walden Media DVD that may hold the appeal for the participants. In the following transcript, the analysis addresses the focus group response to the BBC serial representation of the Lucy through the Wardrobe scene.
6.8.2 *Focus Group transcript 2: She looks like Uncle Vernon.*

This transcript excerpt represents the responses of another focus group during Lucy’s first wardrobe scene in the 1988 BBC television serial. This screening followed the viewing of the same scene in the Disney/Walden Media adaptation.

Christina: Wow they’re so happy. The way she puts her hair doesn’t match her body.

Stephanie: I think she should have her hair longer. I think it will look better. Lucy. Seriously.

Jonathan: Maybe Lucy will get thin.

* (Laughter) *

NH (researcher): Look at the other characters too. Not just Lucy.

Jonathan: * (Laughter) We are…

Vladimir: It’s hard to because she blocks up the screen.

* (Laughter) *

Pauline: It’s true.

Jonathan: Oh the wardrobe.

Pauline: Here it is

Jonathan. It’s a different way she went through the wardrobe... Lucy...

Christina: They didn’t play hide and seek anymore.

Jonathan: And Lucy is fatter I think she can’t go inside the wardrobe.

Stephanie: Yeah. Yeah. She won’t fit.

Pauline: Yeah the wardrobe’s going to crack.

Stephanie: It will break down.
Pauline: She looks like Uncle Vernon.

(Laughter)

Vladimir: Listen! (still some laughter)

Jonathan: She’s opening the door...

Let’s be quieter.

(The following comments are in whispers with some laughter while watching.)

Christina: That’s weirder.

Jonathan: That’s funny.

Christina: She has a weird accent.

Stephanie: She is so fat. She looks like a...[laughter]. She looks like a mushroom. Mushroom!

(McMillan fieldwork 2006: focus group transcript)

There are various ways to analyze the discourse articulated in relation to Lucy in this focus group response. I will examine how this focus group transcript primarily exemplifies phantasmagoric play with the discourses of the text. This phantasmagoric play observed in this example is distinct from the phantasmagoric play with discourses examined in the fan fiction about Tumnus and Lucy. Rather this response to the discourses of the text reiterates Sutton-Smith’s discussion of the body-oriented, exaggerated, cruel and violent jokes of young people (See Section 3.6.5). This focus group response exemplifies phantasmagoric play through the use of physical and anarchic humour to both reject the BBC representation as a group as well as engage in the pleasurable activity of a cumulative violent and cruel joke around Lucy in this particular text. While the response does not re-articulate the dominant discourses of
Romantic innocence and maturation around Lucy in the book, film and franchise texts, notably, the image of Lucy breaking the wardrobe is related to the physical humour of Lucy falling and tripping in the DVD bloopers. Moreover, the pleasure in watching the bloopers as a group is also comparable to the pleasure of the phantasmagoric play with Lucy and the through the wardrobe narrative.

While the primary category of cross-media play here is phantasmagoric, there are also elements of intertextual-expanded-story and intertextual cross-over play. In terms of expanded story play, Jonathan’s initial joke about Lucy “And Lucy is fatter I think she can’t go inside the wardrobe” sets a new premise for the other participants to expand the story. The anti-Lucy narrative by building on the cruel joke with increasingly hyperbolic results: she won’t fit, it will crack, break down. The joke is brought to a climax with Pauline’s comment “She looks like Uncle Vernon,” an intertextual cross-over reference to the name of Harry Potter’s heavy-set uncle in the popular series that sends the group into another round of laughter. Thus, the intertextual play in this focus group involves the articulation of the discourses of the Lucy through the wardrobe narrative into a new genre comparable to the cross-media play observed in Tumnus fan fiction and the Lucy fan video discussed in the previous section. However, unlike the fan fiction and fan video, Lucy has been re-articulated in a comedic or parodic context rather than following the conventions of the adolescent romance context. Moreover, unlike the time invested and individualized productions of the fan fiction and fan video (although for an audience of online readers and viewers), this focus group responses exemplifies a common anarchic, chaotic, spontaneous, and candid viewing response to texts that occurs in peer and sibling groups of viewers at home, school, and other recreational contexts.
This disruptive response to the scene results from disappointment or dissatisfaction with the representation of Lucy in the BBC adaptation as well as the paratextual play with repetition and variation at hand in this segment. The viewing experience begins with comments about the distinctions between the adaptations (i.e. “It’s a different way she went through the wardrobe”; “They didn’t play hide and seek anymore.”) However, the paratextual play offered by the franchise texts (discussed earlier in this case study) reinforces the discourses around Lucy in the text with only slight variations (usually in format or shifting focalizations of the narrative). In comparison, the viewing of the BBC adaptation provides a similar activity of repetition offered by the franchise texts (the through the wardrobe episode in a new format); however, the variation is more significant from the text with which they are most familiar particularly in terms of the character who plays the role of the focalizer for the experience of the scene. The modality claim of the scene (that Narnia is a real fantasy space) depends upon the viewer’s focalization of the experience through Lucy’s point-of-view.

These two transcript excerpts illustrate how the BBC adaptation triggered harsh critical judgments from all of the participants in the study who evaluate associated Narnia texts in the cross-media world (including those outside the franchise) drawing on their knowledge of and experience with the recent film and its contemporary special effects, casting, costuming and media affordances (in terms of the DVD bonus features). The differences between the BBC and Disney/Walden media adaptations of this scene, outlined in the multimodal design analysis, are rooted in distinct production contexts. In terms of this focus group response, the cultural distinctions between the casting of child
actors in children's cinema in Europe versus the United States are central to the rejection of Lucy's representation (Bazalgette and Staples 1995: 95).

The response to the BBC adaptation by the participants in the study may also reveal the difference in expectations during the time period of production with the time period of audience engagement as well as cultural distinctions. Nevertheless, the discussion in the reunion of the child actors from the BBC Narnia in 2003 reveals key information about audience responses during the 1980s and early 1990s. Sophie Wilcox (who played Lucy) recounted the complaint letters received at the BBC including: “they sent one [a letter] about me popping out of my cardigan” (The Chronicles BBC 2005: Special Features). Similarly, Richard Dempsey (who played Peter) received letters that read: “Why couldn't they get a real child to play Peter instead of this overgrown pompous yuppy dwarf?” (The Chronicles BBC 2005: Special Features). This recollection of audience responses from when the serial first aired reveals that issues with casting may have as much to do with distinctions between this adaptation from Lucy in the original novel as the distinctions in the BBC casting of child actors that did not follow the conventions of children's films in the United States. (See Figures 8 and 9 for film stills of BBC Pevensies).

As illustrated by the franchise behind-the-scene texts and the digital fan cultures, the role of the celebrity discourses of the young actors outside the text (and the related discourses of identity as style and physical appearance) are significant to the young viewers of the Disney/Walden Media film and franchise. Thus, the casting of Lucy in the BBC Narnia contrasts with the tendency for American films to cast attractive children with star appeal. Moreover, the various offers of behind-the-scenes modality play through the blurring of Georgie and Lucy across the franchise texts, is a significant
element for contemporary North American viewers and may have distinguished the representation of Lucy further. Building on these issues, the final focus group transcript addresses the response to the representation of Mr. Tumnus in both the Walden Media and BBC adaptations.

6.8.3 Focus Group transcript 3: I love Mr. Tumnus

A focus group of participants who had previously expressed a fondness for Mr. Tumnus in the Disney/Walden media film, anticipated the entrance of Mr. Tumnus in the BBC serial following Lucy’s movement through the wardrobe. (See Figure 10 for film still of BBC Mr. Tumnus.)

Elena: What does Mr. Tumnus look like? Can we see Mr. Tumnus please?
Angela: Cross your fingers everybody.
Lily: Hopefully he looks better than Lucy.
Elena: Can we please...
Angela: Let’s hope Tumnus is not different. Not ugly.
Elena: Can we please see Mr. Tumnus. I love Mr. Tumnus. I mean I love to watch what he looks like...

(Tumnus enters the scene)

Angela: That is so out of control. (Laughter) Whoa. His legs are really hairy.

(McMillan fieldwork 2006: focus group transcript)
This final transcript excerpt articulates a number of key discourses related to the representation of Mr. Tumnus and his relationship with Lucy. While distinct from the explicit proto-sexual romance and maturation narrative produced in the Tumnus/Lucy fan fiction, the potentially sexual undertones of the Lucy and Mr. Tumnus’s relationship are at hand in this focus group response. The interaction reveals both paratextual play, and phantasmagoric play with this discourse.

The paratextual play around Mr. Tumnus is similar to the play with discourse articulated in the Lucy through the wardrobe response in the previous section; however, comments such as “Let’s hope Tumnus is not different” reveal the pleasure in the anticipation of difference based on previous textual experiences. In addition, the phantasmagoric play related to Mr. Tumnus as a potential romantic interest for Lucy is extended to a potential romantic interest for the viewers. A potential romantic relationship between Lucy and Mr. Tumnus is cultivated primarily through the representation of their initial interaction in the Disney/Walden Media adaptation. Building on this filmic representation, the behind-the-scenes franchise texts blur the relationship between the actors James McAvoy and Georgie Henley with the relationship between the fictional characters they play. In the behind-the-scenes texts, McAvoy is represented as a flirtatious (but appropriate) companion behind-the-scenes for Henley. Thus, as discussed in terms of the multimodal design analysis, the casting of McAvoy, an attractive, relatively young actor, normalizes the interaction between the adult male faun and the human young girl.

The representation of Tumnus in the Disney/Walden media adaptation (through costuming and CGI animation) follows the visual representation of the faun in Pauline Baynes’s illustrations as similar in height to Lucy with a bare human male torso except
for the red muffler, and curly brown hair. The Disney/Walden film and franchise normalize the Tumnus and Lucy interaction, in order to place Lucy, a tween heroine in a popular franchise in relation to discourses of tween and adolescent female narratives of maturation and romance. Tumnus is the only potential romantic object in the fictional narrative for Lucy (outside of a sexual relationship with her brothers which is also socially taboo and the impetus for fan fiction). Thus, because of this normalization of Tumnus as an object of affection, the eight- and nine-year-old girls in the study often stated their “love” for Tumnus (McMillan 2006: focus group transcript). However, it is unclear if the ‘love’ for Tumnus is comparable to a favourite animal/anthropomorphic character rather than an explicit romantic object. In the transcript, “I love Mr. Tumnus” is revised to “I love to see what he looks like”, which points to the tension between the phantasmagoric element of the relationship between a young girl and a faun, and the normalizing of Tumnus as a young, attractive male with an emphasis on his human qualities rather than his animal qualities.

In comparison, the BBC adaptation represents Tumnus as an older, taller adult male wearing an animal costume as well as a full suit jacket. The response to this representation (“That is so out of control. (Laughter) Whoh. His legs are really hairy”) reflects this difference in design and casting and the distinction in the discourse around the Lucy/Tumnus interaction. It also reflects the emphasis on Tumnus as a mythological creature (and thus furry) rather than an adult male as well as an older doddering English faun on his way to tea. These choices in the BBC adaptation become comedic to the girls in the study because he is represented as anything but a potential romantic object for a preadolescent or adolescent female. The humour results from the extreme distinctions in
discourses around Lucy and Tumnus, as well as the specific nature of Mr. Tumnus’s representation.

6.8.4 Cross-media play as a discursive practice in the focus groups

These three transcript excerpts highlight a number of key issues that arose in the fieldwork more generally. Firstly, the salience of tie-in franchise texts particularly those that offered behind-the-scenes modality play such as the DVD bonus features, and particularly the bloopers related to a film. Because of this finding in the fieldwork, I chose to closely analyze the discourses articulated around Lucy in these franchise tie-in texts. These analyses in the earlier part of the chapter provide a context to return to the audience responses in order to examine how cross-media play as a discursive practice negotiates and re-articulates the discourses of the multiple franchise texts. Secondly, the focus group responses reveal elements of intertextual expanded-story play and cross-over play; however, in a manner that may not necessarily be categorized as involving the same investment and commitment of the fan productions. Finally, the focus group engagements primarily reflect the use of phantasmagoric play to engage with different adaptations of a familiar text. These anarchic, spontaneous, and comedic responses exemplify a common type of engagement to these texts by young people.

6.9 Conclusion to the case study analysis

This analysis of Lucy Pevensie within the cross-media world of The Chronicles of Narnia: The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe demonstrates how discourse articulated in a canonical children’s literature text may be transformed across media and cultural contexts. Moreover, tracing the articulation of discourse across franchised texts
highlights how the discourses of moral and social maturation and Romantic childhood (rooted in the discursive history) are first articulated in the original novel and then reaffirmed through the recent film and franchise. The adaptation of the novel in the BBC serial and Disney/Walden Media film reflect distinct production and institutional contexts that in turn influence the articulation of discourses around Lucy Pevensie.

Most significantly, the recent film, affiliated franchise texts as well as audience responses indicate the significant role of behind-the-scenes modality play in contemporary cross-media worlds. The blurring of the qualities attributed to Lucy Pevensie with Georgie Henley and vice versa plays a key role in the tension that is created between the representation of Lucy Pevensie as an asexual Romantic child of innocence and wonder and Georgie Henley as a tween star consistently represented within a discourse of physical and sexual maturation. While these discourses around Lucy may be distinct from the original Lewis novel, they continue to conform to many of the normative discourses of tween girlhood outlined in Chapter Five.

Various franchise texts offer different opportunities for paratextual and behind-the-scenes modality play with the film discourse; however, it is unclear to what extent these provide opportunities for other types of play with discourse. The fan fiction discussed in relation to Mr. Tumnus and Lucy as well as the focus group responses during fieldwork reveal the potential for phantasmagoric play to disrupt the dominant discourses of the texts. Moreover, the digital fan cultures around Lucy Pevensie and Georgie Henley (both fan videos and fan fiction) often involve intertextual cross-over and expanded-story play that draws upon discourses outside the cross-media world.

The following chapter, builds upon the issues raised in this case study in terms of the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play in the articulation of discourses of
tween girlhood. The tensions that arise between intersecting discourses through the blurring of real and fictional identities of tween girl protagonists are the focus of the following case study. The roles of these discursive practices are further examined in a new context: the cross-media world around Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen.
CHAPTER SEVEN
THE CROSS-MEDIA WORLD OF
MARY-KATE AND ASHLEY OLSEN

7.1 Introduction to the case study analysis

In Chapter Six, the analysis examines the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play in the articulation of discourses around tween girlhood through the preadolescent protagonist Lucy Pevensie. In comparison, this chapter provides an examination of the cross-media world related to a celebrity-oriented franchise specifically targeting tween girls as consumers. Unlike the Narnia franchise, the ‘ur’ text of the Olsen phenomenon is not a children’s literature classic or even a specific film or video game, but rather Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen themselves as celebrity icons. The franchise has evolved and expanded its fictional narratives alongside the development of the Olsens from child stars to young adults. At the level of audience consumption, reading a mary-kateandashley brand book provides one venue to engage with discourses around the Olsens articulated across franchise texts, fan cultures and public media texts. The blurring of celebrity and fictional identities at hand in the discourse around Georgie Henley and Lucy Pevensie, discussed in the previous chapter, becomes the central issue within the cross-media world of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen. Significantly, this issue is a central feature for most current tween franchises.

7.2 Production/institutional context: A cultural biography of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen

The biography of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen runs in tandem with the cultural biography of mary-kateandashley as a cross-media franchise. Since their birth on June
13, 1986, Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen have literally grown up in the media spotlight. They began their acting careers when they were nine months old with the shared role of baby Michelle Tanner on the American sitcom *Full House* (1987-1995). The twins shared the role to comply with child labour laws. *Full House* was a family-oriented television sitcom that followed the lives of a widowed father whose brother-in-law and best friend move in to help him raise his three young daughters. The show paired growing up themes with comedic situations. As Michelle’s character grew older on the show, her role was that of the cute younger sister who would sporadically say lines like ‘You got it dude!’ and ‘You’re in big trouble, mister…’ for comedic effect (*Full House* 1987-1995). In 1990, a Michelle doll was sold that spoke many of these characteristic lines (Sotiropoulos and Cornish 2008: 465). This show was particularly popular among school age children and the Olsen fan base grew from this initial audience.

During their time on *Full House*, the twins also starred in several direct-to-video movies including *To Grandmother’s House We Go* (1992) aimed at child viewers who would recognize the girls from television. The success of these early home videos lead to the creation of the company Dualstar in 1993 focused on products related to the Olsen sisters. The girls were named as directors of the company and thus, “at age 6, the Olsen twins became the youngest entertainment producers in the history of Hollywood” (Sotiropoulos and Cornish 2008: 465). The establishment of Dualstar marked the early merchandising of the girls themselves across media. Over the decade that followed, they produced and starred in a number of video series including *The Amazing Adventures of Mary-Kate and Ashley* (1994-1997) and *You’re Invited…* (1995-1999), as well as the television programs *Two of a Kind* (1998-1999), *so little time* (2001-2002), and an animated series called *Mary-Kate and Ashley in Action!* (2001-2002). (See Figure 21 for
Almost all of these videos and television series were paired with book series that followed or provided spin-off stories about the characters. Most of these shows and videos were repeatedly aired on Fox and ABC Family after their original broadcasts and later sold as home videos on VHS and DVD. The feature film for theatrical release, *New York Minute* (2004), was a box office flop and marked the conclusion of the girls’ joint acting career.

In light of the success of the direct-to-video productions, Dualstar developed the cross-media franchise *mary-kateandashley* that included books, films, clothes, accessories, fragrances, magazines and other merchandise. From 2001, the majority of products produced by Dualstar were aimed towards the tween female consumer as a niche market, particularly fashion accessories and clothes for young girls. In tandem with these products, in 2000, Mattel also produced Mary-Kate and Ashley dolls, part of a Barbie line of celebrities. A major extension of the brand is the clothing and beauty line “Mary-Kate and Ashley: Real fashion for real girls” sold in Wal-Mart stores, Claire’s accessories as well as other outlets. These cross-media texts and products have been distributed internationally in the UK, Canada, France, Spain, Australia, Germany, Belgium, Switzerland and Austria. The official website [marykateandashley.com](http://marykateandashley.com) was launched in 2000 and integrated fashion magazine features (such as advice, music, book and film reviews, and fashion news) with an online shopping catalogue for their products from books to mobile phone downloadable ring-tones. In October 2006, [marykateandashley.com](http://marykateandashley.com) launched e-commerce sales of its *marykateandashley.com* brand products. In 2005, Dualstar partnered with the Sprouse brothers, the twin brothers who star in Disney’s successful television program *The Suite Life of Zac and Cody* (2005-
Figure 18: *The Amazing Adventures of Mary-Kate & Ashley* (1994-1997)

IMAGE REDACTED DUE TO THIRD PARTY RIGHTS OR OTHER LEGAL ISSUES
2007), in order to launch a brand for tween boys that will include books, DVDS and fashion ("Celebrity Merchandising" 2006).

In 2005, Mary-Kate and Ashley took full ownership and became co-presidents of Dualstar. In 2007 Forbes magazine ranked them together as the eleventh-richest women in entertainment, with an estimated net worth of $100 million (Goldman and Blakeley 2007). Both girls began undergraduate degrees at New York University in 2004, but have yet to complete their studies. While Ashley is focused on the business side of their high-end fashion line, Mary-Kate has taken small acting roles in films and television (outside of their own company’s productions) including recurring appearances on the Showtime series Weeds (2005-) and starring in the independent film The Wackness (2008) with Sir Ben Kingsley.

Growing up in the media spotlight, the Olsens have often been the focus of public media discourse, from idealization as American child icons to tabloid news around eating disorders, rocky romantic relationships and hypothesized drug addictions. While some groups emphasize the role of the Olsens and Dualstar as a young human rights conscious company (with the Walmart pledge for maternity leave in 2004), there also “exists a vibrant online culture devoted to ‘Olsen bashing’” (Sotiropoulos and Cornish 2008: 466). Most notably, PETA and other animal rights groups have named the girls “the Trollsen twins” as well as “Hairy-Kate and Trashley” as a critique of the Olsens for wearing fur (See Figures 21a and 21b). However, increasingly the roles of the twin sisters in the popular media are as celebrity fashion icons. They were the ‘faces’ of Badgley Mischka in 2006 and Mary-Kate’s “boho-chic” look, similar to styles popularized by Sienna Miller and Kate Moss in Britain, is followed closely by fashion and gossip magazines
(Sullivan 2006). Their most recently produced text is a co-authored non-fiction book called *Influence* (2008) which includes interviews by the girls themselves with significant figures in fashion and design that have inspired their own personal styles including Diane von Furstenburg and Karl Lagerfeld. The current emphasis of Dualstar is towards the company’s designer couture fashion label ‘The Row’, and two mid-range lines called “Elizabeth and James” and “Olsenboye.” As of June 2010, the *mary-kateandashley.com* website directly links to the Olsenboye fashion catalogue.

The initial selection of the Olsen phenomenon as a case study for this research was primarily due to the popularity of the books and DVDs, particularly from the *so little time* book and television series, among the participants in my pilot study in London, UK (2004-2005), and fieldwork at McMillan Public School in Toronto, Canada (2005-2006). Since this fieldwork, a number of other tween franchises have stepped into the public media spotlight as influential cultural phenomena, particularly the commercial successes and global distribution of film sequels and franchise texts affiliated with Disney’s *High School Musical* (2006) and *Hannah Montana* (2006-2011). However, Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen’s tween brand continues to be a model for more current tween franchises. Industry and public media discourse often cite the *mary-kateandashley* brand as a pioneering example of a cross-media franchise that is intentionally aimed at the tween girl consumer (“Celebrity Merchandising 2006). Moreover, their success in niche marketing has inspired other celebrity and character-oriented fashion franchises aimed at young consumers. In July 2006, the *Los Angeles Times* reported: “Starting this fall, Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen—the twin actresses turned merchandising moguls—will have some young celebrity company in store aisles. Eighteen-year old actress and singer Hilary Duff and 13 year old Dylan and Cole Sprouse—twin actors and heartthrobs for the
prepubescent set-aim to mimic the success of the *mary-kateandashley* brand, with plans to bombard stores with a host of products from clothing to home décor” ("Celebrity Merchandising" 2006).

The Olsen franchise as a case study allows for a view of a tween girl franchise and its affiliated fan cultures as they have evolved over more than decade. Moreover, the years between 1990 to 2008 have marked the increasingly significant role of cross-media cultures and practices at the levels of production and consumption for young readers and consumers. The expansion of the brand across media to include newer technology also has occurred in tandem with the Olsens' own development. The Olsen franchise has increasingly integrated new technology, practices and cultures in their texts and products for children and young people. Moreover, multi-platform franchising, mobile technologies and user-generated venues have become increasingly sophisticated, globally distributed and more accessible to young consumers. The examination of cross-media play and multimodal design in the cross-media world of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen continues to be relevant and applicable to newer franchises and fan cultures.

7.3 Sites of discourse for analysis

This chapter examines diverse sites for analysis including franchise texts, fan cultures, and public media discourse. The analysis begins with an examination of how discourses of tween girlhood (outlined in the discursive history in Chapter Five) are articulated through the multimodal design of one specific series from the franchise: the *so little time* companion book and video series. The examination goes on to explore how the interpersonal metafunction of the design is expanded through Dualstar's brand products in home and fashion/style merchandise. Furthermore, the analysis examines
how discourses articulated in these franchise texts are complicated by public media discourse around the celebrity of the Olsens. The role of discourse outside of the franchised texts themselves is significant to understanding the ways readers engage with the textual discourse of franchised books, videos and other products. Thus, the chapter addresses sites of discourse both inside and outside the tween franchise. The final section examines the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play at sites of audience discourse including the survey and interview responses of fans as well as an example of anti-Olsen digital culture. As a counterpoint case-study to compare to discourses related to Lucy Pevensie in The Chronicles of Narnia, there are various parallels in the sites of discourse selected for analysis. However, this case study focuses specifically on the issues of behind-the-scenes modality play raised in the previous chapter and closely examines the movement of discourse between franchise texts and sites of discourse outside of the franchise.

7.4 Multimodal design analysis of so little time book and television/DVD series

Since the release of their first book series in 1990, Mary-Kate and Ashley have starred as central protagonists in a number of companion book and television series. The so little time book, television and DVD series (2001-2004) is the focus for this analysis section. This series is geared towards a tween audience (ages nine to twelve on the website), and concentrates on the everyday lives of two teenage sisters Riley and Chloe Carlson, played by Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen. The tenth book in the so little time fiction series A girl’s guide to guys (2003), and its companion television episode, “Riley’s new guy” (first aired January 19, 2002 on ABC Family and distributed on DVD in 2004) are used in this analysis as focus texts to examine how the multimodal design of
mary-kateandashley franchise texts articulate intersecting discourses of tween girlhood. The following social semiotic analysis addresses how the ideational, interpersonal, and textual metafunctions of multimodal design contribute to the articulation of the competing discourses of social development and girl power that result in a highly regulated and developmentally appropriate discourse of choice and empowerment. Moreover, the analysis elucidates how the modality of the texts functions to blur discourses associated with Mary-Kate and Ashley from outside of the fictional narratives with those within the narratives.

Figure 19: Book cover for *A girl’s guide to guys: so little time series* (2003)
7.4.1 Cover design of *A girl's guide to guys* (2003): Ideational metafunction

The cover design of *A girl's guide to guys* (2003) from the *so little time* series exemplifies the most salient element in all *mary-kateandashley* franchise texts: the photographic image of the Olsens. (See Figure 19 for the image from the book cover and Figure 20 for the image of the DVD cover for the *so little time* series). Photographs of Mary-Kate and Ashley posed together are characteristic of all of the cover designs for the book and DVD series. In terms of the ideational function, the cover design of this text exemplifies a conceptual pattern of representation rather than a narrative representation. Characteristic of the numerous *mary-kateandashley* products, the book jacket of *A girl's guide to guys* focuses on a stylized colour photograph of the girls posed in front of a marina. This image reveals little information regarding the fictional characters or plot of the book itself, rather the photographic image connects this book to other representations of the girls' physical and social maturation throughout the franchise. Moreover, the photographic image reinforces the representation of the real life development of the Olsens in their celebrity lives alongside the maturation of the fictional characters that they play. This photographic image is one of many photographic images that represent the sisters at different ages and reflect the defined ages of the fictional characters in the narrative, as well as the target age of the readers for each series. The visual depiction of characters maturing over a series of books is a common design feature of novels of maturation and their sequels; however, the photographic representation of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen highlights how a discourse of development is articulated through two interrelated levels of semiotic meaning: firstly, through fictional narratives that follow the development of fictional preadolescent and adolescent characters played by the
Olsens; and secondly, through references to the physical and social development of the Olsens in their ‘real’ celebrity lives.

The cover designs of the *mary-kateandashley* series books function as brand images for the franchise as a whole rather than an introduction to the narrative within the text. The photographic image of the girls constructs a fantasy of an American tween and adolescent lifestyle that is carefree, alluding to the independence and commercial aspects of adulthood without the responsibilities of adult life. The Olsens’ attributes as represented participants play ideational functions in terms of the articulated discourse related to the *mary-kateandashley* brand (Kress and van Leeuwen 1996). The photograph depicts the girls smiling and posed as though for a portrait. One sister has her arm around the other and their heads are close together in a friendly fashion. Both sisters are wearing white, tight, sleeveless tops and oversized, aviator-style sunglasses. The one sister’s strapless top has a blue bow with white stars evoking strong connotations to the American flag. The other sister is wearing a necklace with a simple green pendant. Their clothing is immaculate and the girls seem perfectly manicured and composed. Ironically, in this photographic representation, the twin sisters radiate a sense of effortlessness despite the careful construction of their image. The photograph also exemplifies the conventions of holiday snapshots: the participants appear spontaneous and posed simultaneously. The photographic representation of Mary-Kate and Ashley exemplifies their controlled, carefully manicured, and unfrazzeled demeanor. Their light coloured clothing conveys a sense of cleanliness, neatness and simplicity. In addition, both the clothing and setting connote a casual California life-style. This photographic image articulates the combination of girl power and normative feminine development discourses that are repeatedly referenced throughout the franchise.
Interestingly, this photographic representation of the Olsens ideationally resembles the images of the ‘New Woman’ in the early 20th century; the popular interpretation of the suffragette movement exemplified by images of independent and fashionable young women in popular series fiction and women’s magazines. In her examination of early 20th century American magazine cover girls, Carolyn Kitsch (2001) highlights how the popular image of the Gibson Girl (the creation of illustrator Charles Dana Gibson originally drawn for the cover of the Ladies’ Home Journal) visually represents an idealized American girl as beautiful, wealthy, carefree, fearless, and “always well-dressed and self-possessed” (Kitch 39). Similarly, the photographic image of the Olsens exemplifies a mainstream interpretation of the discourse of late 20th century girl power.

The image of the Olsens may also be connected to other early 20th century popular magazine cover girls that followed the Gibson Girl. Comparable to the photographic representations of the Olsens, “the Fisher Girl...was sexual yet also, somehow wholesome; hers was the come-hither look of the girl next door who was just realizing her charms. Like the Gibson Girl, the Fisher Girl was well dressed and appeared genteel” (Kitch 46). Similarly, the visual representation of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen, and the brand image they present, articulates tween girlhood as simultaneously regulated and empowered; sexual and wholesome. This articulation of girlhood may also be compared to the representation of Nancy Drew across various book series. With regards to the representation of Nancy Drew, Elizabeth Marshall (2003) observes: “[e]ven when jumping onto a moving train (one can only marvel that she doesn't lose a pump), playing golf, or hiding in confined spaces, Nancy's body is usually under control” (205). The Olsen texts are aimed at preadolescent readers and depict for them an idealized
adolescence of wealth, beauty and fashion with little information about the physical, sexual or emotional growth experiences that are often associated with the characteristics of Western adolescence and coming-of-age narratives in fiction and film. It is significant to note that while the photographic image of the Olsens on the surface denotes a contemporary image of tween girlhood through the image of the ‘real’ girls, the connotations of this stylized image reflect discourses of innocence and wholesomeness associated with Romantic childhood as well as a discourse of adolescent girlhood from an earlier period in cultural history.

This photographic image conveys little information about the specific narrative within the text *A girl's guide to guys* (2003) itself, but rather this image has been deployed as a vehicle to support the *mary-kateandashley* brand concept. In the cover image, narrative information functions through circumstances of accompaniment (Kress and Van Leeuwen 1996). At all levels of production and consumption, the discourses related to the Olsens revolve around the ideational function of the girls as twin sisters. The twin sisters are almost always depicted together, and even when represented separately their actions continue to be defined in relationship to the other. In addition, the logo *mary-kateandashley* visually represents the girls as intrinsically connected as their names run into each other with no space between.

The photographic image of the Olsens that is repeated across all franchise texts may be considered an iconic image. Similarly, Susan Hayward (1996) uses the iconic image of Marilyn Monroe to elucidate three levels of signification that produce meanings for viewers:

At the denotative level this is a photograph of the movie star Marilyn Monroe. At a connotative level we associate this photograph with Marilyn Monroe's star
qualities of glamour, sexuality, beauty - if this is an early photograph - but also with her depression, drug-taking and untimely death if it is one of her last photographs. At a mythic level we understand this sign as activating the myth of Hollywood: the dream factory that produces glamour in the form of the stars it constructs, but also the dream machine that can crush them - all with a view to profit and expediency. (310)

The photographic image of Marilyn Monroe exemplifies the semiotic concept of *provenance* i.e. how meanings may be brought to an image by its signifiers and where these meanings come from. In comparison, the photographic image of the Olsen twins has become iconic in North American popular media culture through the repetition of photographic images across media.

The photographic image of the girls on the book jacket may reveal the three levels of signification in a similar manner as the image of Marilyn Monroe, with distinct meanings and effects. At the denotative level, the cover of *A girl's guide to guys* (2003) is a photograph of the child celebrities Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen. On a connotative level, the image may be associated with the discourses of normative tween girlhood that represent the Olsens as young, happy, fun, fashionable, attractive, wealthy, Caucasian, heterosexual, All-American, sexual but wholesome, inseparable twin sisters. However, similar to the image of Marilyn Monroe, the photographic image of the Olsens may also be associated with public media discourse around their coming-of-age lives outside the fictional narratives. The image primarily articulates the girl power discourse through associations to their roles as successful young female producers of a fashion and entertainment company that represent the young women as "independent, successful, and self-inventing" (Harris 2004: 16). However, in the same way the image of Marilyn
Monroe may provide connotations of her depression and early death (Hayward 1996: 310), the photographic image of the Olsens articulates the discourse of the ‘at-risk girl’ through associations to the public media representations of the sisters as troubled adolescents with eating disorders and tumultuous romantic relationships. Thus, the photographic image simultaneously articulates the competing discourses of girl power and the ‘at-risk-girl’. At a mythic level, the photographic image of the Olsen twins cultivates the myth of the idealized child star (O’Connor 2008) while also reflects the positive and the negative myths of Hollywood associated with the image of Marilyn Monroe.

7.4.2 Real books for Real Girls: Interpersonal metafunction

The interpersonal metafunction of the cover design of *A girl’s guide to guys* (2003) is primarily focused on cultivating a relationship between the reader/viewer/consumer and the producers of the text, presented as Mary-Kate and Ashley themselves. The interactive participants (producers and consumers) and represented participants (fictional characters, celebrity producers) of the text are all interconnected and mediated through the name and image of the two girls. The writer is not named on the cover (but rather on an inside title page). The producers/writers/stars of the text are all presented as Mary-Kate and Ashley themselves. This complicates the conventional relationship between producer and consumer of children’s literature texts. Traditionally, children’s texts involve a dual address to the implied child reader and to the implied adult (parent/teacher/librarian) consumer of the text. In addition, the producers (writers, editors, publishers) of children’s literature are usually adults. Although, Mary-Kate and Ashley are not technically the writers of this book, they are
represented for the reader as both the stars and the producers of the world they have created across media.

A close personal proximity between producers and consumers of the text is cultivated through the branding of ‘real books for real girls’ on the book jacket. The visual and textual elements of the book jacket present information in the form of statements or definitive offers that imply acceptance and agreement. Along the left hand side is a vertical sidebar with a faded (pink filtered) full-length photo of the girls displayed. Above this image the branded tag line announces “Mary-Kate and Ashley: real books for real girls” (A girl’s guide 2003: cover). This is a familiar slogan from other franchise products that similarly indicate: ‘real style for real girls’; ‘real games for real girls’; ‘real dolls for real girls’ etc. The implication is that a close relationship is attempting to be made between the producers and reader of this text. Moreover, the statement on the back cover “It’s what YOU read” is not written explicitly in the imperative; however, in its form as a strong statement and a heavy emphasis on “you” with capitalisation and colour difference, the imperative is implied (A girl’s guide back cover). Significantly, this imperative format is central to the branding of the book and related products. While the book declares, “It’s what YOU read”, the cover of the DVD states “It’s what YOU watch.” Thus, the branding of this text represents a confident offer of information and entertainment from “real girl” to “real girl.” While the representation of Lucy Pevensie in the previous case study involves an implicit address to the reader as a tween girl from the ‘real’ girl Georgie Henley to the viewer through the behind-the-scenes franchise texts, in comparison the mary-kateandashley franchise texts explicitly address the reader/consumer and directly cultivate a relationship between the interactive participants at all levels of discourse in the cross-media world.
The interpersonal function of the *mary-kateandashley* tween brand representation on the book jacket illustrates the contradictory intersection of discourses of social and moral maturation with a girl power discourse. Moreover, the slogan of ‘real girl to real girl’ exemplifies a mainstreaming of a girl power discourse in the context of texts aimed at preadolescent and adolescent consumers (Harris 2004). The ‘real girl’ slogan may be perceived as an adaptation of the “For Girls By Girls” slogan that may hold connotations to popular feminist discourses associated with the riot grrrl movement, and the emergence of the ‘zine scene’ in the United States during the 1990s (Robbins 1999). However, the ‘For Girls by Girls’ slogan is strongly associated with the self-published work of zine writers, and riot grrrl punk musicians who intentionally situated themselves outside of the control of major record labels (Kearney 2006). Thus, the mainstream use of this discourse (namely to cultivate a closer relationship between producers and consumers of the *mary-kateandashley* brand products) exemplifies an ideological shift that significantly contradicts the discourse’s original context. A discourse of moral and social maturation also conflicts with the girl power discourse that may be associated with the ‘real girl’ branding. The checklist (with checked boxes shown) on the back cover of *A girl’s guide to guys* also articulates a social developmental discourse that may be linked back to the etiquette guides for young women in the 18th and 19th century and fashion magazines aimed at female consumers. The checklist addresses the reader in the imperative “Don’t accept a date on less than three days notice. Make sure you’re busy the second time he asks you out” (my emphasis) (*A girl’s guide* 2003). The pedagogic tone of this text reveals the interpersonal function of the narrative as a model for social behaviour.
Figure 20: *So little time television series (DVD 2005)*

IMAGE REDACTED DUE TO THIRD PARTY RIGHTS OR OTHER LEGAL ISSUES
7.4.3 so little time book and television series: Ideational function

The so little time book, television and DVD series (2001-2004) concentrates on the everyday lives of two teenage sisters Riley and Chloe Carlson, played by Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen. The tagline for the series “Chloe and Riley Carlson…So much to do…so little time” expands the discourses articulated in the cover design and implies a hectic adolescent or adult lifestyle that goes beyond school and family duties and may allude to popularity, sophistication and other responsibilities that the girls’ wealth/fame/attractiveness may entail. The Californian upper-class lifestyle represented in the so little time book cover imagery is reflected in both the descriptions and actions of the characters. The series is set in Malibu, California and focuses on the girls’ school, social and family lives. Recently separated, the girls’ ambitious fashion designer mother lives in the beach house with her daughters, while the laid back father, also a fashion designer, lives in a luxury trailer home nearby. The book and episode titles in the so little time series fall under two thematic foci: dating/love relationships (i.e. titles such as “how to train a boy”; “instant boyfriend”; “secret crush”; and “love factor”) or friendship (i.e. titles such as “just between us”; “tell me about it”; and “girl talk”) (So little time 2001-2004). Moreover, many of the titles in the series have a playful pedagogy underlining them. For example, the title “How to flunk your first date” pairs the language of school achievement with dating or social development.

Similar to their earlier book and film series, the sisters play the roles of the central protagonists in these fictional narratives; however, their names are changed to identify them as fictional characters. The allotment of fictional names that are closely related to the names of the actor or celebrity is a common convention in popular children’s and tween-oriented texts. For example, most recently the actor Miley Cyrus plays Miley
Stewart/Hannah Montana in Disney’s tween-oriented franchise *Hannah Montana*. In the *so little time* series, ‘Chloe’ (played by Ashley) is the uptight, consumer focused, conservative sister, and ‘Riley’ (played by Mary-Kate) is defined by her free-spirited, eco-friendly, liberal nature. The main tension in the plot of Mary-Kate and Ashley narratives (conveyed across all the media and modes used in the franchise) often stems from the conflicts that arise from the twins’ distinctive personalities. As discussed in the discursive history chapter, two distinct characters in novels of maturation are employed by writers to illustrate different moral and social development trajectories. Usually one character acts as a foil for another character, often a sister or close friend, to model the differences between appropriate and unconventional social behaviour. The kindred spirits Anne and Diana in *Anne of Green Gables* or contrasting identities of the tomboy Jo with her moral and her frail sister Beth in *Little Women* as well as the close but often contrasting relationships between sisters in Jane Austen’s novels provide earlier examples of this narrative convention.

Twins provide a more explicit mode to illustrate dualities in the identity of a central figure. The representation of dual identities in novels of maturation is linked closely to the interpersonal function of the twin discourse for young readers. Sarah Mitchell (2008) observes:

> At its core, the idea of the twin raises questions about identity and issues of self; a set of identical twins is the most literal way to represent two identical worlds diverging, giving way to different possible selves. Moreover, for a young reader the identification with central protagonists may move between twins easily as they represent the possibility for different characteristics within a similar identity. (Mitchell 2008: 587)
As part of a discourse of development, twin siblings, particularly twin sisters, have been a common motif in fiction and film for preadolescent readers including Laura Lee Hope’s *The Bobbsey Twins* book series, and twin-based fictions of Lucy Fitch Perkins such as *The Chinese Twins* (1934), the Disney *Parent Trap* movies and the *Patty Duke Show* (Mitchell 2008: 588-89). Francine Pascal’s *Sweet Valley High* (1984-present) was a particularly popular book series for tweens and teen readers in the 1980s and 1990s. The *Sweet Valley High* series was also a commercially driven series that resulted in a number of spin-off book series and adapted for television. *The Sweet Valley High* series may be seen as a recent precursor to the story-lines and characters from the Olsen franchise. The identical blonde twins included Jessica, who was more studious and conservative and Elizabeth Wakefield, who was more extroverted and more of a daredevil.

In the multiple book and video series, Mary-Kate and Ashley’s fictional characterizations are used to illustrate possible social or moral trajectories. For example in *The Sleepover Secret* (2002) from the *Two of a Kind* book series, Mary-Kate is depicted as more tomboy-like in appearance and behaviour than Ashley who is more interested in make-up and boys. “Oh, Jennifer! Ashley gushed. “That shade of blusher makes you look so...so mature!” Jennifer pulled the blusher brush away from her face. She sucked in her cheeks and stared in the handheld mirror. “It’s called the natural look!” Mary-Kate stood up and tugged at her oversize Chicago Cubs T-shirt. “Natural? You’ve been glopping that stuff on your face for the last hour!” (The Sleepover 20). This interaction between the sisters at the sleep-over closely echoes interactions between distinct characters in many novels of maturation, including Jo and Meg in *Little Women*. 
The distinctions that play out between the sisters in terms of behaviour and developmental experiences often trigger the conflicts that occur in the book and television series. For example, when Mary-Kate reveals that she has kissed a boy, Ashley must deal with the consequences of her sister’s social development ahead of hers: “This is an absolute nightmare, Ashley thought. I’m two minutes older than Mary-Kate. And she kissed a boy already? I never kissed a boy!” (The Sleepover 33). A central element of the plot focuses on the sisters learning or dealing with each other’s different qualities and developmental experiences.

Although comparable to Lewis’s relational representation of the Pevensie siblings, following the dominant discourse of commodity feminism, distinctions in identity in the Olsen texts are articulated through consumer choices rather than explicitly referencing qualities of goodness, intelligence or honesty. For example, in both the companion book (2003) and video of The Challenge (2003), the girls play two twins named Shane and Lizzie who are chosen for a Survivor-like reality television show. The producers of this show comment on how different the twins are: “they’re total opposites...Lizzie’s into ambition. The other one, nutrition Lizzie wants to hang out with political types at Georgetown U. The one is a vegetarian who wants to go to Berkeley” (The Challenge 2-3). In this example, distinctions are marked by fashion (tie-dye vs. leather skirt) and university choices (Georgetown vs. Berkeley) as a way to articulate personality traits.

As highlighted earlier in this section, in the so little time series, ‘Chloe’ (played by Ashley) is represented as the conservative sister, and ‘Riley’ is defined by her free-spirited personality. In the television episode, the tension between the two girls’ distinctive personalities is often alluded to through small visual differences in their
appearance. On the cover photograph for *A girl's guide to guys* (2003), both girls have blonde hair, although one has straight hair and the other curly. Playing on prior knowledge of the twins, a reader might deduce that the curly haired sister is the free-spirited Mary-Kate and the straight-haired sister is the more sedate Ashley. The clothes the girls and other characters wear on the show are casual yet fashionable. In keeping with the representation of the girls on the cover of the book jacket, their clothes are carefully conservative yet stylish.

On the television program, outside of the circumstances of accompaniment implied by the representation of the sisters themselves, the four major settings (circumstances) of the narrative are the beach house, the school Malibu High, the father's RV, and the Newsstand, the coffee shop that the girls and their friends often hang out (this also follows sitcom genre conventions). The sets are always interior settings that and represent basic sitcom style backdrops. The settings are introduced to the viewer using illustrative colour filters amidst a triptych of film images. For example, the setting of the Newsstand is introduced using three panels that show the viewer cappuccinos being made, people drinking coffee, and the neon sign of the coffee shop. The school setting is depicted with a green filter that emphasizes the school but also the conditions of the narrative, i.e. palm trees. This continues throughout the setting triptychs, which emphasize leisure, California beach-life, and consumer lifestyles.

In the *so little time* book series, this Californian upper-class lifestyle represented in the book cover imagery is reflected in both the descriptions and actions of the characters. The majority of descriptive information in the text is filled with signifiers for the girls' lifestyle and socio-economic background. Moreover, many of these lifestyle choices reveal information about characters and identity. A close textual analysis of an
excerpt from the book *A girl's guide to guys* (2003: 32-34) reveals that the action in the narrative is predominantly related to lifestyle choices and/or dating relationship related actions. The majority of descriptive information in the text is filled with signifiers for the girls' lifestyle and socio-economic background. The types of actions in the narrative are predominantly related to lifestyle choices. The action is often in the form of a verb that must be fulfilled by a commodity, for example, "they picked up some iced cappuccinos at the Newsstand" (*A girl's guide* 33). Moreover, many of these lifestyle choices continue to reveal information about characters and identity. In the first two pages of the chapter, the signifiers of this lifestyle include "Rollerblading on the boardwalk"; "iced cappuccinos"; "her house, which was right on the beach"; "the family housekeeper, Manueo" (*A girl's guide* 32-33).

The narrative action takes place in the past continuous tense or the past or present perfect tense. The narration moves from past perfect, "Riley had once heard her dad" to simple past tense (*A girl's guide* 32), "they picked up some iced cappuccinos at the Newsstand" (*A girl's guide* 33), to past continuous, "now they were walking back to her house" (*A girl's guide* 33). The consequential effect of these tense choices is that the reader is positioned as though they are watching a play or television program in action (or possibly as though the narrator was re-playing the scenes for us). In terms of the actions that relate to decision-making in relationships the two girls follow distinct story lines although leading to similar conclusions. The actions of the boys tend to be active (and often aggressive), "grabbed Riley around the waist," "leaned forward to kiss her", while the girls' actions tend to be reactive to the boys' actions "wriggling away"; "pulled away again" (*A girl's guide* 33-34). Even in an excerpt that takes place over instant messenger, the boy's actions (i.e. messages) and Chloe's reactions (i.e. response
messages) follow similar patterns to the in person interactions presented in both the third­
person narration of the print-text and in the physical interactions in the television
episode.

These developmental narratives of adolescent dating in so little time focus on
social and lifestyle experiences rather than the physical experiences of maturation.
Marshall’s observations about Nancy Drew (2003) are relevant to the fictional
representations in these texts:

the physical changes we often associate with female adolescence-developing
breasts, widening hips-are curiously absent from the Nancy drew mysteries. Let's
just say, Nancy never misses a sleuthing gig because of menstrual cramps.

(Marshall 204)

Similar to the novels of maturation discussed in Chapter Five including Anne of Green
Gables, and girls’ series book texts like Nancy Drew, the fictional characters in the Olsen
franchise texts exemplify an absence of physical and sexual maturation. Rather the focus
is on the control of normative maturation through appearance, behaviour and dating
etiquette that only involves kissing. For example, Riley’s story line focuses on her
reactions to the actions of the male characters; Chloe’s story line involves her making
choices to be active or passive in reaction to her peers and her boyfriend.

The overall action of the television program is quite static in terms of physical
movement. This is distinct from other texts in the Mary-Kate and Ashley franchise.
Many of the videos directed at younger viewers follow a children’s adventure genre (e.g.
The Amazing Adventures; Mary-Kate and Ashley in Action). However, the narrative in
the so little time series follows the romantic narrative in conjunction with family sitcom
conventions. The action mainly involves sitting, and talking. The consumer choices
emphasized in the written text continue to be referenced in the television episodes. For example, at one point in the television episode, Riley holds up a pair of flip-flops and says, “I spent $100 on these shoes” (“Riley’s new guy” 2004). In another scene Chloe describes Riley’s new romantic interest: “He is totally cute in that I totally need someone to dress me kind of way”, and at one point Riley exclaims “Thank you Amazon.com!” (“Riley’s New Guy” 2004). In both the book and the television episode the narrative is based on relational actions not physical actions.

The excitement of the print and television text rather relies on the multiple layers of visual effects and shifts. In fact, the speed of the narrative depends upon the fast-paced movement between modes and the number of modes at play at one time. The pleasure of engagement with these texts lies in the engagement with playful use of form rather than a particularly fast-moving plot or complex characterization. This convention is postmodern in nature and is frequently used in MTV music videos. This convention also evokes other products in the Mary-Kate and Ashley franchise that utilize youth-oriented connotations, fragmented narratives, and funky/arty colour filters. Distinctions between the television episode and the book may be attributed to both genre differences and changes related to medium and mode. These changes do result in a variety of shifts in discursive meanings some explicitly intentional, others more nuanced changes.

Interestingly, the use of new and mobile technologies in the plot itself and the integration of new technological conventions into the textual design are more prevalent in the print text than in the television storyline. For example, the rules of how to get a guy are in the form of a dating guidebook in the television episode (“Riley’s new guy” 2004), while in the book, the rules are found by the group of friends on a website. The focus of an entire chapter is on the examination of this website that does not exist in the
television episode. The final section of the chapter also involves an instant messenger
dialogue between Chloe and Lennon, her romantic interest, but takes place in person in a
short scene in the television episode (A girl’s guide 9-14).

7.4.4 so little time book and television series: Interpersonal function

The narrative point-of-view builds on this connection between lifestyle choices or
behaviour and identity development. In A girl’s guide to guys, the majority of the textual
content of this book is written in third person narration, alternating between Riley’s and
Chloe’s point-of-view depending on the section. In addition, there are moments in the so
little time book series where the protagonists interrupt the third person narration with
asides, voice-overs and breaks out of character. For example, one chapter begins with a
third person narration that follows Riley’s point-of-view: “Riley had once heard her dad
use the expression…” (A girl’s guide 32). However, shortly after this introduction, the
text is interrupted by a sudden stylistic and narrative shift to Riley’s first person
narration:

[Riley: But that was when Dad was working. You see, he and my mom were both
high-powered fashion designers. They were even partners. Then Dad got burned
out on the whole executive thing and decided to take a break from the pressure
for a while. Now he lives in a trailer and reads a lot of books on finding your
Inner Self. Mom is still a high powered everything.] (A girl’s guide 32)

This indentation of a paragraph in conjunction with a stylistic shift to bold typeface, and
a narrative shift to first person, results in a textual segment that seems like an excerpt
from a play script or screenplay.
The tone of this segment itself, essentially a short soliloquy spoken to an audience of readers, gives the impression of an aside to the audience made by a character in a play, on television or a voice-over in a film to reveal a protagonist’s inner thoughts. For example in the excerpt above, background information about Riley’s parents’ relationship and break-up is revealed. This textual device acts as a soliloquy would function in a play. A soliloquy may be defined as:

the act of talking to oneself, whether silently or aloud. In drama it denotes the convention by which a character, alone on the stage, utters his thoughts aloud; playwrights use this device as a convenient way to convey information about a character’s motives and state of mind, or for purposes of general exposition, and sometimes to guide the judgments and responses of the audience. (Abrams 1993: 196-7)

Related to this is the stage device of the “aside”, where the character expresses to the audience his or her intention in a short speech which, by convention, is inaudible to the other characters on the stage (Abrams 1993: 197). Commonly used in theatre, these devices have been revived in a number of innovative ways in modern and post-modern theatre as well as film and television.

While first-person narration (a common device in teenage fiction) involves a similar process of identification and performance; the invitation to perform Riley with the interjection of a soliloquy complicates this address of the reader/audience. While the soliloquy segments certainly reference theatrical or filmic conventions, of oral telling, the tone of the soliloquy also references written telling through instant messaging on a computer or a mobile phone. For example, in Riley’s second soliloquy segment, her commentary (particularly the concluding ‘Ha-ha’) has a written commentary tone, “It’s
like a world record for me to get asked out four times in one day – even four times in one week or one month. Maybe it’s my new perfume or something. Ha-ha” (A girl’s guide 33). If understood in this manner, this textual device alludes to a theatrical interruption but also an editorial interjection by a writer/editor/actor, namely Riley, in the act of reading and editorializing the manuscript. Thus, much of the action in the written narrative takes place as a mental process, inside Riley’s head but is represented textually in a number of ways: in the information given from Riley’s point-of-view but in the voice of the third person narrator; in the voice of Riley through the soliloquy segments; and inside Riley’s “thoughts” within the third person prose. For example, we learn of Riley’s hesitance about a physical relationship with Malcolm through third person narration of Riley’s thoughts “And she wasn’t sure she was ready for that. Maybe on the second date” (A girl’s guide 33) as well as “he leaned forward to kiss her. Huh? Riley thought” (A girl’s guide 34).

Often the soliloquy or aside when transposed to film or television takes on the form of ‘voice-over’ narration. This internal reflection revealed in a frank tone to an audience is characteristic of many television shows or films about adolescence for young viewers. This voice-over or aside was popularized in many 1980s and 1990s films and television programs for teenage viewers and continues to be quite common in recent television shows for tween viewers. However, the use of this stylistic shift to represent a soliloquy or aside in the visual design of a book is quite unique. The soliloquy segments in this text complicate the narrative in a number of ways. While they allow the reader to hear what is going on inside Riley’s head, they also provide an opportunity for the reader to ‘perform’ the character of Riley if they wish.
Comparatively, the point-of-view of the narrative of the television episode is mainly third person. The medium of the sitcom also allows the viewer to jump between perspectives in a way that the print text does not. Although the book as a text utilizes a variety of point-of-views in the narration, the general perspective is first person. For example, the sitcom uses a hand held camera that follows the peer group of boys, allowing the viewer to access other narrative points of view. There are a few key segments that are told from the first person where similarly Riley speaks directly to the camera from her “thinking spot” at an old lifeguard station (“Riley’s new guy” 2004). A voice over acts as a focalization device for the viewer in the television episode. However, as the voice in her head is often distinct from her real desires and responses, the intimate nature of the first person soliloquy segments within the print text is lost. The representation of the same narrative in different modes (both book and television episode) affords opportunities for multiple perspectives to be offered for readers/viewers.

Thus, the interpersonal offer in *so little time* is expanded not only through the back and forth between perspectives as well as between the similar narratives in the book and film formats. The key offer of the *so little time* book series to be read in tandem with the television series/DVD is paratextual play. The offer is to engage with the discourses of the narrative through repetition and variation between the two media formats. Some of the other franchise book series also explicitly offer expand-the story play through multiple spin-off texts, prequels and sequels to television series episodes and films. For example, a prequel for the film *New York Minute* (2004) represents the narrative from one the sisters’ perspective (e.g. *New York Minute: There’s Something about Roxy* 2004), while other texts focalize the experiences of Mary-Kate or Ashley through a diary format (e.g. *Two of a Kind Diaries: Calling All Boys* 2000). Similar to the Lucy avatar in
the *Narnia* video game or the Lucy collectible tie-in texts, the dominant discourses related to these tween girl protagonists are reinforced and repeated across various texts with little ideational shifts. Nevertheless, due to the multiplicity of texts, the offer to engage with discourse across various different media is evident. As will be discussed further in the analysis of the audience study, different consumers may choose to engage with the textual discourses to varying degrees.

7.4.5 *so little time* DVD bonus features: Offer of behind-the-scenes modality play

The *so little time* television series DVD includes a number of inter-episode sequences in the DVD bonus features of the television series that play with notions of reality and fantasy in relation to the Olsens as performers and real people. These segments are a characteristic element in DVD bonus features, and supplemental information for other franchise texts in this cross-media world. In these segments, Mary-Kate and Ashley are essentially performing as themselves in their roles as actors on the show. The content of these clips is the life of the two girls outside of the show and yet focuses on issues related to the show such as plot lines and the boys that will play their love interests. In one inter-episode sequence, the girls discuss how Chloe (played by Ashley) always gets the good romance plot lines while Riley (played by Mary-Kate) always gets the do-gooder plot lines. “Why can’t they make Riley a bit more edgy?” Mary-Kate demands. The girls decide that they best way to address these issues is to express their concerns to (and buy gift baskets for) the writers, who are elusive characters that are hidden behind a closed door marked ‘Writers’. In this comedic turn, the girls illustrate that they do not even have full control over their characters; it is “the writers” who control the television narrative. This element of self-reflective play within the text
itself in the television series does not exist in the book. In another segment, the girls are represented in bed at the end and then there is a wide-angle zoom-out of the camera to reveal the set of the show and the crew. ("Riley’s New Guy": Bonus features)

The composition of the narrative is post-modern in nature, using wobbly hand-held camera shots, colour filters, split screens. These modal choices play with reality and fantasy of the characters/actors and also the representation. These camera styles were at one point aesthetic markers of counter-culture or alternative film production but in this case are more clearly connected with MTV culture, style and indicate that this text may be situated in current multi-media and multimodal trends in cultural products for young people. The hand-held camera in these inter-episode segments particularly shift the viewer’s position as a spectator to a proxy-participant in the action. The viewer/camera-person is positioned as a third person in the peer group of Mary-Kate and Ashley.

This segment exemplifies an offer of behind-the-scenes modality play with the discourses of the cross-media world through a type of behind-the-scenes modality play or self-parody. Many of the DVDs produced by the franchise provide examples of this type of play with modality both in the paratexts (DVD bonus features and tie-in texts) as well as within the multimodal design of the primary representation itself. For example, the concluding scene of the DVD film of The Challenge, a number of male characters from other mary-kateandashley franchise texts appear and ask the sisters if they have forgotten about them (The Challenge 2003). The humour of this segment relies upon knowledge of the franchise from other viewings and readings. This type of both behind-the-scenes modality play and intertextual cross-over play is characteristic of many of the tween-oriented television programs, including Hannah Montana, that often have special features and episodes that involve the meeting of characters from different cross-media
franchises. Unlike the *Narnia* texts that continue to articulate some distinctions between fictional and behind-the-scenes discourse, the *Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen* cross-media world exemplify behind-the-scenes modality play at every possible site of discourse.

The following sections illustrate how the discourses articulated through the multimodal design of the brand image, book and video series, and DVD bonus features are further expanded through diverse sites of discourse. The examination continues with an analysis of official corporate discourse around new franchise home products, public media discourse around the Olsens, fan responses in an audience study on long-term Olsen fans, and finally anti-fan digital culture.

7.5. *Dualstar press release for franchise home products: Offer of paratextual and behind-the-scenes modality play*

This section examines how offers of cross-media play are provided at diverse sites of discourse outside of the main narrative franchise texts (books/DVDs). This section addresses the articulation of tween girlhood at the site of the *Dualstar press kit* (2007) related to the *mary-kateandashley* home and fashion lines, as well as public media discourse articulated through various magazine feature stories on the Olsens.

The official discourse of Dualstar Entertainment is articulated through the corporate overview and press releases related to Dualstar’s new product lines included in the *Dualstar press kit*. These sites of discourse primarily articulate a discourse of commodity feminism expanded from the fictional narratives across a range of fashion and home products. These merchandise lines in the franchise articulate the explicit offer to an implied tween girl consumer that articulates the discourse of style as a mode to construct individualized identities. The discourse in the press kit expands the fictional
discourses in the book and television series that represent consumer culture as a way to semiotically articulate tween girlhood as a discursive identity. The press kit expands this with connections to the behind-the-scenes persona of Mary-Kate and Ashley as fashion icons who also use commodities and fashion to articulate discourses of individualized identities. This aspect of public media discourse is actively promoted by Dualstar discourse. The press release for the mary-kateandashley home furniture line for tweens and teens articulates many of these key elements of public media discourse around the Olsens as fashion icons (March 12, 2007):

Each piece has distinctive design elements that can be customized, allowing consumers to create their own unique bedroom style through a variety of finishes and pieces. The mary-kateandashley home essentials also provides safety features such as rounded top corners and side roller glides to keep drawers securely in place... ‘Ashley and I recognize stylish furniture options for teens are hard to find’, said Mary-Kate Olsen. ‘Our new furniture collection is consistent with our overall home line. We offer girls the opportunity to create a unique space of their own that is fun, sophisticated and feminine.” (Dualstar press kit 2007).

As Reid-Walsh and Mitchell observe in their examination of children’s bedrooms as cultural spaces (2002), the bedrooms of young people often become sites to display individual style, often drawing on signifiers of adolescent and tween culture such as the posters of favourite stars, and to negotiate the discourses of tween girlhood through social semiotic means (Reid-Walsh and Mitchell 2002). The interpersonal offer of the mary-kateandashley home line provides both the opportunity to use the products to display fandom for the Olsens but also similar to the identities modelled in the fictional texts the products offer a discourse of customization, a model for how the individual
style may be articulated through various products from clothing to home décor. Similarly, the designer lighting for the tween marketplace (released January 2007), expands the twin-identity through style choice discourse that pervades all of the texts and products in the line. For example: Mary-Kate’s chandelier is black and shiny and the lighting fixture associated with Ashley draws on pastel shades.

Many of the products offer the discourse of commodity feminism through limited choices and the potential for the consumer to customize products. While one series of lamps features “smoked black glass with pink facets for the style savvy. Another collection highlights a traditional flair, offering antique white chandeliers with a mixture of pink and clear crystals...a customizable ‘create-a-shade’ line has been fashioned for the eclectic personality. This unique creation will allow the individual to select the color and pattern of the shade” (Dualstar press kit 2007). In their discussion of brand and packaging design, Klimchuk and Krasovec (2006) emphasize the significant trend of customization in the contemporary design of branded franchises. They give the example of Jones Soda brand as a successful example of customization:

Its [the brand’s] soul lies in the personalized, capricious imagery used for different flavors. By allowing consumers to submit their own photographs to be used on labels, the packaging design of this brand literally reflects the individuality of its products and its consumers. This fresh design approach breaks apart the consumers’ preconceived notion of a national beverage brand and hits the mark in projecting a unique and customized brand personality that’s always about the consumer. (49)

While the fictional narratives of the mary-kateandashley brand model this discourse of customized identities, the franchise products expand the interpersonal offer of the
fictional texts to focalize through Mary-Kate or Ashley and now this may be continued through the customization of home products.

This offer of customization may also be categorized as an offer for paratextual play with repetition and variation. The offer to customize a home line, according to the choices linked with Mary-Kate and Ashley’s personalities, provides the opportunity to repeat the ideational discourses of the fictional narratives while variation is offered through new products and new formats for this discourse. Within the realm of the cross-media world of the mary-kateandashley brand, discourses to articulate identity are offered in multiple modes across various sites from books to DVDs to home line. However, despite this offer of multiple opportunities to engage with the discourses, the possible options for engagement are carefully controlled through repetition and variation only through limited options of customization.

In addition to this offer for paratextual play, the official corporate discourse of Dualstar reinforces the relationship between producer and consumer through the repeated emphasis on the involvement of ‘real’ girls Mary-Kate and Ashley in the design of franchise products. In this introduction to the newest line, a number of the key themes that underline the brand discourse are explicitly articulated:

the contemporary line has long been a goal of Ashley’s and Mary-Kate’s and they are closely involved in the design, marketing and publicity plans currently under development...the line is a true labor of love for the fashion trendsetters who are the sole designers of the line and have worked closely on every aspect from sourcing, fabric development, and product manufacturing and sales as well. It is also an unprecedented move in the fashion industry, marking the first time
designers of a mass brand have moved into the highest tier of distribution with couture line.” (My emphasis, *Dualstar press kit 2007*)

Firstly, the emphasis in this description of the line is the hands-on contribution of the Olsens in the design of their line. From this corporate discourses, the emphasis once again is that at all levels of production and design, the personal and professional lives of Mary-Kate and Ashley are explicitly blurred. Thus, along with the paratextual play, another offer of behind-the-scenes modality play is provided through the products that are linked closely through brand discourse to the hands-on involvement of Mary-Kate and Ashley themselves.

7.6 Public media discourse: *Offer of behind-the-scenes modality play and intertextual expanded-story play*

As celebrities on television and film since birth, as well as successful businesswomen with their multiple products lines, Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen have been the focus of media coverage for their entire lives. Public media discourse is significant to both how readers, viewers and consumers engage with their products, but also how the texts themselves provide various offers for behind-the-scenes modality play. As illustrated in the DVD bonus features, the interpersonal offer for the reader consumer relies on a close personal closeness created between the reader/viewer and the producers/represented participants. Some of the key themes of public media discourse represent Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen as: All-American, tween and teen stars, business women, fashion icons and celebrities involved in personal drama or scandal. The messages that conclude each individual narrative (in books, television episodes or video features) tend to be episodic in scope, related to the development of appropriate social
behaviour and relationships. A broader narrative for the maturation discourses is articulated through public media discourse that follows the Olsens as ‘real’ girls rather than the characters across multiple texts in the franchise and outside of the franchise.

While early teenybopper magazines articulated the image represented by their home videos as All-American tweens, later magazine and tabloid coverage have represented the Olsens as troubled teens with eating disorders, relationship problems and potentially drug addictions. Most recent tabloid news focuses on Mary-Kate’s link to actor Heath Ledger’s fatal drug overdose (2008). Similar to the public media discourse around Shirley Temple as she evolved from child to teenage girl star (discussed in Chapter Five), the Olsens’ maturation in public media discourse exemplifies similar tensions between developmental discourses and Romantic childhood innocence. For example, while one Vogue magazine article is titled “Billion dollar babies” (Sullivan 2006) the tag-line on the cover of Harper Bazaar (Australia) reads “Mary-Kate Olsen: Million dollar babe” (2006) (“Mary-Kate Olsen: Harper’s” 2006). The subtle word play in both these magazine article titles illustrate the continued slippage between their identities as idealized child stars and sexualized young women.

Public media discourse also continues to emphasize the girls’ coming of age as business women, fashion icons, and also as individuals with their own identities. The public media and particularly a range of magazine articles over the past five years provide an offer of intertextual expanded story play i.e. expanding the fictional narratives of their preadolescent, and adolescent selves into their lives as young adults. These public media texts continue to reinforce the maturation discourses of the fictional narratives through the narration of the development of Olsens outside the fictional texts. Appearing alone on the cover of Nylon (2009), the byline of a feature article on Ashley
Olsen articulates the dominant discourses and conventions of a coming-of-age teen novel “Being Ashley Olsen: You may know her as one half of America’s favorite twin set but nowadays Ashley Olsen is learning how to stand alone” (Crisell 2009: 124). Similarly, Ashley is also quoted as saying “I just want to stay really true to myself. I want to gain credibility...as who I am today. Not as the girl people saw me as in the past” (Waterman 2007a: 181). In comparison, a cover story in Canadian Fashion magazine (2009) alludes to the coming of age transformation of Mary-Kate: “making the leap from tween princess to art-house starlet involved some soul searching” (Lenander 2009: 16) This article also represents the discourse of style as a mode to explore coming-of-age and identity through clothing and fashion choices: “Around this time she also became Mary-Kate, The Fashion Icon” citing Olsen as stating that she “was finally allowed to dress the way I wanted to” (Lenander 2009: 16).

A 2006 Vogue article continues to re-articulate the girls’ ‘fictional’ identities and provide high modality claims that their book and television series do blur into their ‘real’ identities:

If you grew up, as many young women who now buy adult fashions did, reading the Mary-Kate and Ashley adventure-book series, you would have found their respective roles as low-key, bohemian sister and a perfection-seeking, way-together sister in New York Minute, their 2004 big-screen producing debut, reminiscent of the real Mary-Kate and Ashley, though not literally Mary-Kate and Ashley, since those traits, as their fans are totally aware, are shared by both sisters, to lesser or greater degrees (Sullivan 2006: 264).

This narrative represented in this article provides an example of the characteristic discourse in relation to the Olsens in the public media that sits between audience fan
discourse, official franchise discourse, and public media discourse. Expanding upon this article Mary-Kate and Ashley also appear on the cover of the December/January 2007 issue of Teen Vogue (Waterman 2007a; 2007b). Following the interpersonal offers of many of the franchise texts, this issue of Teen Vogue has a special “exclusive double cover” dedicated to the twins: Mary-Kate appears on one cover and Ashley appears on the other. Two distinct feature stories “All About Ashley” (Waterman 2007a) and “Mary-Kate’s moment” (Waterman 2007b) reaffirm the distinctive traits allotted to the two sisters from their identities in fiction, film and their cultivated celebrity/public media persona. Supporting the discourse of customized identities from the mary-kateandashley franchise texts, the behind-the-scenes side-bar of the cover shoot feature emphasizes each girl’s distinct, individual fashion style, and music taste. For example, Mary-Kate’s music taste is described in relation to her fashion sense “she adores vintage when it comes to clothes and music. ‘I love my rock n’ roll’ she says especially the Stones, Zeppelin, and Pearl Jam” (Waterman 2007b: 50).

Although not officially a franchise text, the Teen Vogue magazine narrative imitates the same manner by which Ashley and Mary-Kate are described in their book series. Ashley is described in terms of her style choices and business skills: “her polished, luxe take on L.A. dressing and a no-nonsense approach to business gave this Olsen an edge all her own” (Waterman 2007a: 50). In comparison, Mary-Kate’s style is described in relation to her dramatic flair: “her love of drama infuses her much-mimicked style” (Waterman 2007b: 185). The article’s description of Ashley’s arrival at the photo-shoot echoes the narrative action style of written narratives in the so little time book series: “Our tiny cover girl arrived at the photo studio sipping an iced cappuccino and clad in a belted, men’s-style-pin-striped button-down shirt over black leggings and ankle
boots” (Waterman 2007a: 48). Similar to the so little time narrative style, this description of her arrival represents Ashley’s actions as defined by her consumption choices. The primary offer of cross-media play here is behind-the-scenes modality play. Comparable to the behind-the-scenes franchise texts of Narnia, this magazine confirms for the reader that the identities of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen outside of the franchise echo the fictional narratives within the franchise. However, the reader of this magazine is also offered paratextual play through information about how to “get Ashley’s/Mary-Kate’s look” by purchasing showcased make-up, and perfume from the mary-kateandashley franchise line (Waterman 2007a). The reader is also are provided with an itemized list of the designer clothing the sisters are wearing in the cover photographs. This combination of behind-the-scenes and paratextual play is primarily offered by the franchise texts themselves, but then are rearticulated through the multimodal design of public media texts. In the next section of the analysis, the audience discourse exemplifies how fans draw upon these intersecting sites of discourse in their responses to the cross-media texts of the Olsens.

7.7 Audience discourse: Olsen fans and cross-media play

Questionnaires and face-to-face interviews with fans of the Olsens also articulated a blurring of public media discourse, and franchise discourse from the various cross-media texts [See Appendix for sample of the questionnaire; and Chapter Four for context of the audience study]. Notably the responses illustrate how readers/viewers/consumers interweave discourses from these various sites to articulate narratives of their own personal discourses as fans. In line with the offers from the fictional narratives and other associated texts. The most significant category of cross-
media play in the cross-media world of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen involve various forms of behind-the-scenes modality play. In this section, I highlight some of the key variations on this type of play from the audience study responses.

7.7.1 Growing up with the Olsens: Behind-the-scenes modality play

All of the fans of the Olsens in the audience study grew up in tandem with the Olsens, and are now in their teens and early twenties. Significantly, many of the fans watched the various Olsen television programs and videos while they were very close in age to the child stars. For example, Lucy remarked “There is an Olsen installment at every stage of my childhood!” (Lucy). Similarly, Julie charted her viewing:

Full House-age 7-13
Two of a Kind-age 13/14
It Takes Two-age 12
Billboard Dad-age 13
Winning London-age 15
New York Minute-age 19
So little time- age 18/19 (Julie)

For the fans in my audience study, this experience of close connection through chronological age intensifies the behind-the-scenes modality play with these texts. The ‘real’ connection these fans felt to the girls was often attributed to their similar ages and experiences. Similarly Stephanie wrote, “I identified with them as being the same age as me, and have seen them grow up and learning the same things as me.” Holly also referred to the intensified interest in their lives because she is the same age as the Olsens, “Just being the same age and growing up with them as they grew up on tv ”(Holly). Leah
specifically connects her relation to the Olsens as a ‘tween’: “I could relate to them as a tween. I’m a sort of close age to them and thus could generally relate to the problems they were facing at the same time” (Leah). These responses not only illustrate an intensification of the connection to their ‘real’ life narratives but also illustrate an imitative re-articulation of the developmental discourses of the texts. Many of these comments articulate both an identification with the age of the Olsen sisters but also re-articulate the discourse of social development as a part of tween girlhood represented in the franchises’ shows and books (“learning the same things”; “problems they were facing”).

Because the Olsen franchise literally developed texts as they aged, unlike most texts aimed at specific age niches of childhood, fans did not need to initially ‘grow out’ of these texts, they could continue their play with increasingly different niche market products with the familiarity of the same characters. For example, one respondent discussed attending the feature film New York Minute (2004) for her sixteenth birthday: “The movie [New York Minute] came out around my birthday, I got [turned] 16. We were 5 girls going to a huge cinema, we ate way too much and had a lot of fun. Simple Plan, who take part in the movie are one of my favourite bands. I have seen them live 3 times so far and they are great!” (Simone). Comparable to some Harry Potter fans who would have literally grown up alongside Rowling’s book series and the associated film series over the past decade, some Olsen fans exemplify an even longer term commitment (beginning in the early 1990s) with this specific cross-media world.
7.7.2 Practices of repetition and variation: Behind-the-scenes modality play and paratextual play

While arguably the repetition among the franchise texts implies a type of paratextual play by fans, most fans referred to some form of paratextual play that engaged explicitly with the repetition and variation with the franchise texts. Most identified on the questionnaires the videos and features they owned and re-watched many times. Ritual viewing of different kinds was common to almost all participants. For example, two respondents recounted their after-school viewing of *Full House*:

*Full House* was one of my favourite television shows growing up. I remember running home from school every day to watch it before dinner. It was part of my after school routine for all of elementary school" (Julie).

Watched probably every season-definitely a favourite afterschool program!” (Holly).

Because the show *Full House*, the first program the Olsens acted on as children, was often broadcast between four o’clock and five thirty in the afternoon (in many countries according to the responses), it is described as daily after-school viewing for many of the respondents.

Various Olsen fans who grew up in diverse global locations also illustrate the ways they evolved into early fans of the Olsens drawing on paratextual play that relied upon emerging technologies. For example, Lucy from New Zealand shared that she “started printing pictures at my Dad’s office (this is when the internet was fairly recent)
and looking for their stuff everywhere I could.” Jacqueline, who lives in Germany, recounted here experience of searching for more information about Mary-Kate and Ashley on her new computer: “back in 2000 we moved and my room was finally big enough for an own computer... and since I had a computer now and internet access... I had to search about them ... (cuz there was srsly nothing to find bout them in germany or in german at all, ” (Jacqueline). Distinct from the experiences of most of the North American respondents who discussed accessing Olsen texts from various locations, the paratextual play for Jacqueline to find photographs and information was intensified by the difficulty to find information about the Olsens in Germany. Similarly, Lucy who lives in New Zealand also discussed the collection of various texts and products as a challenging game: “I remember my sister and my Dad went to America a few times when I was about 13 and I sent them with lists of the videos I wanted! I even printed pictures of the covers! I got a few this way. I remember even spending money to get the video tapes redubbed into a NZ format!” (Lucy)

While many of the fans discussed collecting the books, videos, recent fashion products, and other franchise texts such as the talking Michelle doll (see section 7.2), the collection of the multitude of photo representations of the Olsens was the most common fan activity. Moreover, many of the fans in this study discussed collecting photos or images of the Olsens. One fan obsessively engaged with this activity: “I used to count the photos of had of the girls regularly and I even had a graph that I would add to when I got new pictures. When I was 12 (the girls would have been 8, so this was long before they were in every magazine), I had over 1200 pictures” (Leslie). However, there are a number of other examples of paratextual play with the repetitive representations of the twins’ distinct identities that due to the high modality of the photographs articulate a
form of behind-the-scenes modality. On the most surface level, the photographic or 
filmic image of the girls often involves an implicit game of 'spot the difference' whereby 
the viewer may attempt to find a number of distinctive features between the two girls. 
The tension between the two girls’ distinctive personalities is alluded to through small 
visual differences in their appearance in a photograph. This spot-the-difference activity 
relies on both extra-textual knowledge as well as textual knowledge.

A similar ‘game’ with the text (which was also observed in the field work focus 
groups as well as in pilot study) involves firstly, the practice of distinguishing between 
the girls in one of their films or television episodes, followed by the identification with 
one girl or the other. One fan reflects on her success in identifying which girl is playing 
Michelle on episodes of Full House: “I love watching her carefully to see if I can spot 
whether it’s Mary-Kate or Ashley playing her. I tend to have no problem doing so from 
about the third season onwards, which I must admit I’m quite proud of” (Francesca). 
Another fan also describes watching the re-runs of the show Full House to identify which 
twin is on screen: “To me, they are harder to tell apart when they are younger (not 
impossible, just harder), so I play a little game to see if I can tell them apart when they 
play the one role as Michelle” (Candace). A number of Youtube re-mix videos articulate 
this activity through the re-mix of clips from Full House with the identification of Mary-
Kate or Ashley subtitled onto each scene to indicate the producer’s extra-textual 
knowledge of the twins (mkashley.com: fan forum).

Mirroring the articulation and interpersonal offer of dual identities in the texts, 
many of the fan responses in my audience study articulated a maturation discourse that 
relates to this behind-the-scenes modality play in their own identifications with one or 
both of the twins:
I used to identify more with Mary-Kate more, and I’m not really sure why; I think it’s because I was more into sports and not that into boys as a young teen, which is the way Mary-Kate was portrayed in the movies. I remember wishing I was left-handed, because Mary-Kate is. I remember wanting to get my hair cut the way Mary-Kate’s was in Billboard Dad, and wanting to copy the clothes they wore in that movie. (Francesca)

When I was younger, I was more tomboyish which Mary-Kate was always cast as. I think people tended to stereotype her into this role. For example, her character in It Takes Two and Two of a Kind was my favourite. I related to her character, but not necessarily over Ashley. Now that I am 22 like them, I love Ashley’s fashion sense, so I find myself watching her. I don’t have a favourite though. (Lucy)

Usually, I related to Ashley’s characters because she always played the girly, fashionable one. But as time went on, I started to look back and realize that Mary-Kate was more like me because of her individuality and sarcasm. (Candace)

Similarly, for Elizabeth and her friends in my pilot study (2005), the adaptation of the characters of the Mary-Kate and Ashley from the book to the television program, exemplified this type of paratextual/behind-the-scenes modality play that involved shifting their relationship with one sibling to the other across different franchise texts:

Elizabeth: My favourite would have to be Mary-Kate
Deena: Because she’s very punky
Elizabeth: She’s just like me in many ways. She likes sports. She’s calm.
She’s tall. I used to like Ashley but then my mind changed to Mary-Kate. When I started watching Nickelodeon I decided I liked Mary-Kate better.

(Pilot study 2005: Olsen discussion transcript)

Although the texts in this case study predominantly focus on only two characters with limited options between them, the cross-media articulation of multiple possible articulations across distinct texts (even with incremental shifts between articulations) was significant and appealing to the fans in the study.

7.7.3 Behind-the-scenes modality play with public media discourse

While most statements of identification with Mary-Kate or Ashley from the audience studies (outlined above) relate to lifestyle, personality or behaviour characteristics explicitly represented in the design of the fictional franchise texts, other respondents identified with qualities explicitly alluded to in public media discourse around the Olsens’ ‘real’ identities. For example Leah recounts her various levels of connection to Mary-Kate: “I seem to relate to Mary-Kate a bit more than Ashley—we both had anorexia, and I tend to dress a little eclectically like her, favouring op stores and designers equally” (Leah). This statement illustrates the multiple levels in which the respondent has engaged in behind-the-scenes modality play with the discourses of girlhood represented through the Olsens. This response particularly articulates discourse in relation to Mary-Kate as represented in fictional narratives as well as public media discourse: as an eating disorder survivor, and as an ‘eclectic’ dresser. This respondent’s
interweaving of public media discourse with the fictional discourse occurs in this cross-media world at levels of both production and consumption.

Many fans also express a response to public media discourse around the twins as adults. These responses to public media discourse exemplify a tension rather than a blurring between the idealized lighthearted childhoods represented in the various books and video series and the representation of their lives as adults in public media discourse. Many respondents described their feelings for the Olsens now in terms of a discourse of Romantic childhood innocence. Lucy articulates this discourse through a nostalgia for the younger, more innocent versions of the sisters in their early career:

I also like that they were good role models. They were just kids being kids. There was no ‘trying to grow them up too fast’ element... Sometimes it’s sad to think their childhood days are long gone, but I guess I’ve grown up just as much as they have. (Lucy)

Following this discourse of Romantic childhood is also a response to the discourse of moral development that underlines the texts:

But the Mary-Kate and Ashley I loved were the kids who made fun videos. I really miss the old days when Mary-Kate and Ashley were little kids... Their old videos and movies may have been a little far-fetched and cheesy, but they were fun, the girls never really took themselves too seriously, and they offered good, clean entertainment in a world where sex sells. It’s too bad that era couldn’t last longer! (Leslie)
This allusion to ‘good clean entertainment’ and the articulation of a discourse of childhood innocence responds to the discourse of appropriate maturation that underlines the franchise texts, particularly the book and video series. Not unlike Shirley Temple before them, the multiple visual images through photography and film of the Olsens as beautiful child stars inspire this discourse of fetishized child innocence in the memories of the fans (Kincaid 1992; Walkerdine 1997). In contrast, the depiction of Lucy in the *Narnia* texts as representative of childhood innocence and wonder is not articulated in the franchise texts themselves but rather in the nostalgic tone in the personal narratives of the fans.

Some of the responses on the questionnaire also indicate a nostalgia for a time before the cross-media merchandising of the Olsen franchise developed extensively around 2001. One fan response integrates both a discourse of fallen child innocence of the child star along with a negative portrayal of the commercialization of the franchise:

> Additionally, they were doing very little acting but going crazy with their mary-kateandashley product line. It was disgusting to see how they had a clothing line, furniture line, a crazy book line, shampoos, cosmetics, etc....None of these products are entertainment. At this time, they were just making money out of their names, but weren’t doing any acting. I completely lost interest in them when they started smoking, indulging in drinking and partying, having anorexia problem, dating boyfriend after another, and became such terrible and messy dressers. I can’t believe they can dress like bagladies and not comb their hair but still be called “fashion icons.” (Lucy)
This response mirrors the discourse of tabloid coverage of celebrity scandal and articulate a moral development discourse that places the adult lives of the Olsens in terms of inappropriate behaviour ("dating boyfriend after another", "anorexia problem" and "messy dressers") outside of the normative maturation for preadolescent and adolescent girls articulated within the franchise texts. The various qualities highlighted notably contrast with the controlled manicured and conservative images of the franchise texts.

In contrast to this discourse, some of the respondents championed the Olsens for becoming fashion-oriented business people, others expressed sympathy and concern about living in the spotlight and being able to move on from their image. "I still admire and follow their careers after all these years. They must have staying power!" (Lucy). Multiple respondents articulate the discourse of girl power in terms of the role of the Olsens as successful businesswomen in both fashion and media, more than actors: "they’re amazing business women and should be very proud of what they’ve accomplished" (Julie). In the examination of popular series texts such as those produced by the Olsen franchise, there is a tendency to overlook the discourses that circulate around these texts at various sites within and outside the franchise texts. Although outside of the corporate and public media discourse, it is difficult to access information about how much power Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen have over design and decision-making within their company. However, for many of the fans in this audience study, Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen are represented in the discourse as successful producers of popular culture as well as executives of a successful company is significant to cross-media play with the discourses of this cross-media world.

Yvonne Tasker examines public and industry discourse around the roles of Barbara Streisand as producer, co-writer and star of feature films among other successful
female producers in Hollywood (Tasker 1998). She argues that the majority of the analytical focus addresses the production of women as actors in Hollywood films, and tends to overlook the active female producers of mainstream popular culture. Among the various discourses that articulate tween girlhood as a shifting discursive identity across various sites of this cross-media world, the role of the Olsens as powerful producers of mainstream culture draws attention to the need to examine the role of extra-textual discourses of girlhood around cross-media franchises, and the type of cross-media play that may be offered by these various levels of discourse.

7.7.4 Meet the Trollsen Twins: Phantasmagoric and intertextual expanded-story play

The previous sections of this Chapter examine diverse sites of discourse including the discourse in the multimodal design of the franchise texts, public media discourse, corporate discourse and audience discourse. The final section of analysis reflects another site of audience discourse outside of the franchise and fan cultures from the online culture focused on ‘Olsen bashing’ (Sotiropoulos and Cornish 466). There are many examples of this form of Olsen bashing, primarily produced by adults. A key example of ‘Olsen bashing’ is a text that involves both intertextual and phantasmagoric play in the form of a parodic interactive website called “Meet the Trollsen Twins” (“Meet the Trollsen Twins” 2010). The website is produced by the organization People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals (PETA) and is positioned as a spin-off website from the central organization homepage. The website is designed as a playful critique of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen’s choice to wear and sell fashion items that use animal fur. The site is significant as it involves the representation of the Olsen twins as grotesque trolls who kill animals while closely parodying the multimodal design and discursive content.
of the *mary-kateandashley* official website and franchise texts. (See Figures 21a and 21b for screen shots from the “Meet the Trollsen Twins” website)

With regards to parody, Harries (2000) argues that “[a]t the heart of parodic discourse is its function as an *imitative* form of intertextuality: a previous text is reformulated in the new, parodic text through a strategy of repetition that incorporates and refashions the texts” (26). The design of the website in terms of the textual metafunction reflects this imitative quality of parody in its close compositional imitation of the franchise texts. Thus, the most salient image on the web-page is the image of the sisters themselves who, in an imitation of the official franchise website, are positioned above the menu bar. However, in this representation the ‘Trollsen’ are depicted as grotesque troll characters with large eyes, crispy and grey hair and pale splotchy faces. These representations are grotesque exaggerations or distortions of the Olsens’ physical features; however, similar enough to their real features to be recognizable to a viewer/user familiar with them. The images of the twins have been labelled with new names “Hairy-Kate” and “Trashley.” These names are positioned above their faces in a pink font that resembles hand-writing. The background of the website is composed of various levels of crimson and pink parodying the use of pink as a dominant colour on their franchise texts. However, in this context the crimson backdrop includes various splotches that denotes blood associated with the animals killed for their fur clothing items.

In terms of an interpersonal function of the design, the address of the website is to a viewer/user who is also familiar (at least to some extent) with discourse around the
Olsens. While this website represents an explicit critique of the Olsens situated outside of the Olsen franchise texts, and also conventional Olsen fandom, the details of the website design indicate a familiarity with the franchise discourses and design conventions. Moreover, the humour of the website derives from the user/viewer’s knowledge of these details. The site imperatively addresses the reader in the same manner marykateandashley draw upon the imperative to demand or offer information to readers/viewers/users: “Tell the Twins to Go Fur-Free...the twins’ heartless decision to wear fur and include it in their new clothing line The Row (more like ‘Death Row’), is worse than a fashion no-no—it’s cruelty to animals” (“Meet the Trollsen Twins” 2010).
This invitation imitates the language on the website through both the imitation of the tone and address of the franchise texts but also engages in various forms of language play.

The menu bar as well as hypertext images on the page (similar to the Olsens and other websites geared towards a preadolescent or adolescent user) provide a number of options for engagement on the website. These include a combination of options that parody activities offered on the franchise website (e.g. Dress up the Troll sens, Talk to the Troll sens, Free Stuff, and Buy Merch). In addition, other options relate directly to PETA and their organization’s agenda (e.g. Pledge to be Fur Free and Take Action).

A central image on the homepage is a dressing room door with a pink star and sign that reads “Hairy-Kate and Ashley.” The instructions read: “Click on the door to dress up the Troll sens.” The door is represented as slightly ajar with a bloody reptilian tail sneaking out through the opening. The message written in blood on the floor beside the tail reads “Now with exotic skins.” Many of the images are violent and grotesque. However, the two-dimensional cartoon-style of imagery in conjunction with the colour palette results in a low modality of the representation for the viewer/user. The ‘Dress up the Troll sens’ activity is one of two key interpersonal offers for engagement on the website. The dress-up interactive activity imitates the digital dress-up dolls of the Olsens and other celebrities through dragging and dropping fur items onto an emaciated, image of one of the girls wearing only undergarments (a convention of the digital doll sites). As the user drags the cursor over the various fur items, an alliterative label (an imitation of the labels of Olsen fashion and cosmetic products) reveals the name of the item (e.g. butchered beaver boots, choked chinchilla hat) (“Meet the Trollsen Twins” 2010).
The second central offer of engagement is the “Full House of horrors” that imitates the logo of the television program *Full House* that the Olsens acted on as young stars. The image is a haunted house with cartoon depictions of dead animals hanging from the balcony, tree and roof. The video provided is a ‘re-mix’ of an episode from *Full House* with the integration of a character called ‘Future Man’ who has been edited into various scenes from the sitcom (Lankshear and Knobel 2007). Future Man engages in a dialogue with the characters in the show including parodies of the dialogue and comedic timing of the show as well as jokes around the future careers of all of the actors. The video culminates in Future Man sharing a photo album that includes photos of the Olsens.
wearing fur followed by video footage of animal cruelty. The contrast between the low modality of the two-dimensional cartoon representations on the site and the high modality documentary footage of animal cruelty produces a jarring effect for the viewer. The video concludes with the Tanner family kicking the toddler Michelle (played by the Olsens as toddlers) out of the house due to her treatment of animals through wearing fur. The blurring of the identities of Michelle, the character on *Full House* who will become Mary-Kate and Ashley the celebrities is comedic but also follows the characteristic blurring of fictional and 'real' identities within this cross-media world.

The success of this parody depends upon knowledge of the show *Full House* and the irony that is produced through the use of the episode as a pedagogic tool. Humour derives from knowledge of the explicitly pedagogic tone around lessons related to moral and social behaviour such as cooperation, telling the truth, and getting along with siblings. The final interpersonal offer from the website is the merchandise which includes masks of the TrollSENS promoted for use as Halloween costumes. Thus, imitating the offers of the franchise texts themselves: an offer to play with the characters in some manner, engagement in cross-media representations (video, interactive website) as well as the offer to purchase and consume related products.

The overall effect of the website for the user/viewer is ironic humour. This text explicitly critiques the use of fur by the Olsens but also the normative conventions of the tween girl franchise including the use of pink to indicate gendered space, and the offer to engage in a characteristically regulated and specific manner with the characters through a dress-up doll activity with specific choices of items with which to dress the doll. Interestingly, the ironic humour is directed at a viewer who is familiar with the discourses and conventions of the Olsen franchise texts. Thus, the pleasure derives in one
way from the carnivalesque imagery, and the disruption of the discourses produced by
the Olsen texts. However, due to the low modality of the website, the shock and
grotesque nature of the content is less shocking and strange than it may have been.
Moreover, because of the use of close imitation of the design and discourses (following
the imitative qualities of parody alluded to by Harries 2000), the form of play and the
pleasure that may result can also be categorized as "repetition and variation" play and
shares similarities with the conventional play practices of the fans in the audience study.
Nevertheless, this website indicates extensive knowledge of the Olsen texts both in
content and multimodal design that may be drawn upon in an explicit social and
politicized critique.

7.9 Conclusion to the case study

This chapter provides an analysis of multimodal design and cross-media play in
relation to discourses articulated through Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen as a cross-media
world. Distinct from the case study on Lucy Pevensie in The Chronicles of Narnia, rather
than the cross-media franchising of a canonical children's text, this cross-media world
centres around a franchise centred on former child celebrities. Unlike the various
incarnations of Narnia since the publication of C.S. Lewis's original novel in 1950, this
cross-media world reflects the repetition of similar discourses produced by the same
company and repeated across multiple media formats over more than two decades.

In addition, because of the nature of the franchise, behind-the-scenes modality
play and paratextual play takes centre stage in this analysis. Thus, the blurring of
discourses, observed in relation to Georgie Henley and Lucy Pevensie, is expanded
across various sites of discourse in the cross-media world of the Olsens. As discursive
practices, multimodal design and cross-media play involve the engagement with both extra-textual and textual discourse around tween girlhood through the representation of the Olsens at every site of articulation. The various sites of discourse in this cross-media world including franchise, official corporate press, public media, fan and anti-fan exemplify the ways discourses of tween girlhood may be drawn upon in ambiguous and often contradictory manners. For example, the discourses of maturation in the franchise texts may be contradicted strongly with discourses of girl power and at-risk girlhood in the public media discourse.

The audience studies reflect an interweaving of these various levels of discourse over long periods of time and engagement with various different texts and extra-textual sites of discourse raising questions around agency and structure for further discussion and continued research. In the following chapter, the conclusion to this thesis compares and contrasts the key findings of this case study analysis with the analysis of Lucy Pevensie in the previous chapter.
CHAPTER EIGHT

CONCLUSION

8.1 Introduction

This thesis presents a multi-levelled examination of discourses of tween girlhood as articulated within two distinct cross-media worlds. This chapter discusses some of the key findings from these two case studies, and highlights the significant issues raised in the analyses. In this chapter I return to the two central research questions posed at the introduction to this thesis:

1) What are the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play in the articulation of discourses of tween girlhood within the cross-media worlds?

2) How are these discourses of tween girlhood within the cross-media worlds rooted in a cultural history of representations?

This chapter discusses how this examination provides some answers to these research questions as well as raises issues for further investigation. The first section of the conclusion compares and contrasts the role of the discursive history of tween girlhood in the two cross-media worlds. The second section addresses the key findings related to the roles of multimodal design and cross-media play as discursive practices. The third section assesses the challenges presented by the theoretical frame and methodologies for the study of texts and audiences. This thesis concludes with a reflection on the implications and potential applications of this study in future research on the cross-media texts, practices and cultures of young people.
8.2. The discursive history of tween girlhood in the cross-media worlds

The tracing of a discursive history in this study illustrates the continued presence of historical discourses in contemporary cross-media cultures and articulations of girlhood. The discursive history of tween girlhood in Chapter Five traces a number of intersecting discourses that are examined in the contemporary articulations of tween girlhood of the case studies. Notably, the articulations of discourses around Lucy Pevensie and Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen distinctly exemplify the historical tension between developmental discourses of moral and social maturation and a discourse of Romantic childhood. In both cases, the normative representations of Anglo-American, Caucasian, upper middle-class, preadolescent female protagonists also articulate the hybrid discourses of sexualized innocence, and normative maturation at various sites within the cross-media worlds. These historical discourses are further complicated by the intersection of contemporary discourses of girl power, commodity feminism, and the at-risk girl (Harris 2004) particularly in the Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen case study. These hybrid articulations of tween girlhood as a ‘new’ discursive identity are heavily underscored by historically rooted contradictions and tensions between discourses.

The analysis of Lucy Pevensie from The Chronicles of Narnia illustrates that the key discourses from Lewis’s original novel are drawn upon and reaffirmed in Disney/Walden Media film and franchise. Despite the translation from literary to film franchise culture in the context of contemporary discourses of tween girlhood, Lucy is re-articulated as a Romantic child of wonder and innocence through the multimodal design of the film franchise texts. In comparison, the cross-media world of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen principally articulates normative social and moral development discourses rooted in the novel of maturation, school girl fiction and series fiction such as
the Nancy Drew series. However, at the same time a competing discourse of girl power (often through a discourse of commodity feminism) is explicitly offered through the interpersonal function of the franchise texts. The result is an offer for the individual’s control over their maturation through the guise of girl power. As discussed in the following sections, the case studies reveal the significant roles of multimodal design and cross-media play as discursive practices at the site of audiences to potentially subvert or reject these discourses.

8.3 Multimodal design and cross-media play as discursive practices

While many researchers within the area of New Literacies and media studies focus on the opportunities and affordances of new technologies and practices, it is significant to note the limits to which these practices can provide opportunities to critique discourses within franchised texts. The findings of the case study analyses illustrate that multimodal design and cross-media play as discursive practices provide opportunities for the engagement and negotiation of discourses related to tween girlhood as a discursive identity. A key issue around this potential for agency in the cross-media worlds is the ambiguous role of multiple tie-in franchise texts: many of these texts function to reinforce discourses across the franchise while simultaneously offering multiple modes for engagement with the textual discourse. The multiplicity of texts in both cross-media worlds offer the potential for disruption of normative discourses; however, in most cases, these texts primarily work to re-articulate the central discourses of a franchise in a new format. For example, the Narnia franchise texts often function to reinforce discourses from the film through the repetition of ideational function of Lucy’s representation across various formats. Nevertheless, the interpersonal function of Lucy’s representation varies
across franchise tie-in texts, and in some specific articulations these variations reflect expansions or diversions from the dominant representation. In the videogame, for example, although the Lucy avatar re-articulates the discourses of innocence and wonder, the interpersonal function of the avatar transforms her closeness to animals (associated with the discourse of Romantic childhood), to a useful skill of charming animals in battle. These repeated incarnations of Lucy across franchise texts raises questions around the extent to which paratextual play may be perceived as a discursive practice. While the other categories of play indicate both a negotiation and an articulation of discourses, the paratextual play observed in this case study primarily involves a pleasurable practice focused on the re-articulation of franchise discourse through repetition and slight variation.

These findings are significant to the discussions of agency and structure that are central to research around children’s media culture, as well as debates in media and cultural studies more broadly. In his chapter in *The Palgrave Handbook of Childhood Studies* (2009), Buckingham proposes a nuanced perspective to the structure and agency debate. In relation to his research on children and television, he argues that children are active in their use of media texts as resources to negotiate identity; however, despite this active stance, they draw upon the texts and discourses presented to them and are limited by the contexts in which the texts are produced and consumed (Buckingham 2009). Significantly, the sites of audience engagement, analyzed in the case studies, reveal that consumers are not limited by discourses articulated in franchise texts. However, following Buckingham’s observations in relation to children and television, these case studies also reveal that despite the expansion of articulations of discourse within a cross-
media world, consumers are still limited by the number of available ‘appropriate’ discourses to articulate tween girlhood as a discursive identity.

While some observed practices within the fan cultures subvert the dominant discourse of childhood innocence associated with Lucy Pevensie, even in the most notable subversion (the representation of Mr. Tumnus and Lucy’s romantic and sexual relationship), the discourses articulated are often those related to normative girlhood. Thus, although these fans are able to disrupt the discourse of Romantic innocence of Lucy within the original text as well as the recent feature film, they do conform to the ‘trump’ discourse of coming-of-age transformation that underlines the majority of popular texts aimed at adolescent females (Currie et al. 2007). It is also evident through the multimodal design analysis that the film franchise cultivates this type of cross-media play with sexual maturation discourses around Lucy. My audience focus group data provides a counter-point to these online fan cultures elucidating how diverse texts may be used in peer groups to subvert the intended discourses through phantasmagoric play. Nevertheless, the responses of the focus groups to the BBC Lucy through the wardrobe scene, although anarchic in nature, the group’s anarchic play functioned to reject the BBC’s alternative visual representation of Lucy discourse, and in turn reinforce the normative representation of Lucy Pevensie as a small, young Romantic girl-child in both Lewis’s novel and the Disney/Walden media film. In addition, the rejection of the BBC serial in all of the focus groups reflects the expectation of young consumers for behind-the-scenes discourse particularly in terms of engagement with the fictional character of Lucy through engagement with Georgie Henley as a real celebrity.

The most interesting findings in the analysis of the franchise texts in both case studies were related to the blurring of discourses related to celebrity identities outside of
the texts, with the fictional identities in the texts. In both case studies, this practice occurred both through the modality of the multimodal design, and through cross-media play at sites of both textual discourse and audience discourse. The Narnia franchise and fan cultures illustrate the blurring of discourses around Lucy Pevensie with those associated with Georgie Henley, the actor who plays her. Behind-the-scenes oriented franchise texts such as *The Movie Companion* (2005) and audio commentary for the film on the DVD, exemplify how discourses articulated through the representation of Lucy as a fictional character are blurred with discourses related to Georgie Henley. This blurring in the articulation draws upon discourses outside of the original text and the film adaptation in itself; however, the result is the reaffirmation of discourses within the film through a paralleling of qualities of Henley and the other child actors with the Pevensie children they play in the film. Fan cultures around Lucy and Georgie articulate discourses outside of the texts; however, these discourses often emphasize other discourses of maturation related to adolescent romance. These fan texts reveal a significant point around the agency of preadolescent fans in the context of cross-media franchises. This fandom around Lucy exemplifies that preadolescent consumers are not necessarily limited or restricted by the franchise discourse. However, they may be limited by the available discourses of tween girlhood that they draw upon outside of the franchise.

Comparatively, the interrelations between the public media discourse around the ‘real’ lives of Mary-Kate and Ashley, and the fictionalized narratives of their franchise texts transcends all levels of discourse from the Dualstar corporate discourse to the anti-Olsen digital cultures. The significance of behind-the-scene modality play is central to the consumers of the Olsen texts. This type of blurring of discourse (that may be traced
back to the weaving of ‘real’ and fictional identities for Shirley Temple and others) may be observed increasingly in contemporary franchises aimed at tween and teen consumers (i.e. the *gossip girl* and *Hannah Montana* franchises). The responses of the fans in the audience study who chronologically ‘grew up with the Olsens’ exemplify long-term investment, commitment and a changing but ongoing relationship with both the fictional characters of cross-media texts and the celebrities that play them. This blurring of identities drives their investment in the characters and the texts across multiple spaces, texts, and time periods. As a researcher, I am aware that these sustained relationships have the potential for abuse by producers of these franchises to engage consumers for extended time periods within the same franchise. Nevertheless, these sustained relationships reveal a complex dynamic with discourse outside of the franchise that may or may not be articulated within the franchise texts.

Significantly, the role of Mary-Kate and Ashley as ‘producers’ of the franchise, is an element that is often overlooked in critical analyses of popular texts for girls. For example, Sharon Lamb and Lyn Mikel Brown (2007) remark that in popular films and television aimed at tween and adolescent girls the "cute boys almost always get to drive cool vehicles" while outside of a few exceptions girls always "ride on the back of motorcycles or the passenger seats" (89). Moreover, they dismiss the Olsen franchise texts as among "the worst of the series books are those that shamelessly promote television shows such as *The Cheetah Girls* and *Lizzie McGuire*, and, of course, the ever popular Olsen twins" (Lamb and Mike Brown 178). These critiques of series and franchise texts for tweens overlook the central elements of the appeal for the Olsen texts. The appeal for many of the long-term fans in my audience study is situated in the high modality of the franchise: Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen’s offer of close social distance to
readers/viewers/consumers as 'real' young women. For many of the long-term fans, Mary-Kate and Ashley's ideational and interpersonal representation as producers is defined by fans through the articulation of girl power discourse.

In the majority of research in cultural and media studies, young producers of culture are often examined in the context of fan cultures and productions. Moreover, in the majority of current research in girlhood studies and New Literacies research, girls are examined as cultural producers primarily with regards to alternative or independent cultures of film and media production and reception (Kearney 2006; Davies 2006; Jenkins 2006). Distinctly, Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen articulate a discourse of girl power at various sites through their role as 'real' powerful, beautiful and wealthy directors of a highly successful media, merchandise and fashion corporation. Nevertheless, the girl power discourse offered by this public role of the girls as powerful producers is limited to some extent by the fictional and franchise texts produced by the franchise, as well as discourses articulated through news and tabloid media. The fictional representations and merchandise they produce functions to re-articulate discourses of a limited accessibility to this type of girl power associated with the image of Caucasian, wealthy, blonde, beautiful, All-American celebrities. Nevertheless, as observed in the analysis of the fan responses, the dismissive critiques of these popular franchise texts (exemplified by Lamb and Mikel-Brown's commentary above) neglect the key component that underlines the popularity of the Olsens, and the overarching representation of girl power that underscores all of the sites of discourse in this cross-media world.

Discussions of agency must take into account these elements of articulations at different sites that may contribute to the discourses related to fictional characters. The
significant roles of female producers and directors in mainstream media culture is often overshadowed by the analyses of girls as objects of discourse within the film texts (Tasker 1998). These findings support the relevance of a theory of cross-media play that takes into account engagement with discourses at various sites of articulation both within and outside franchise texts.

8.4 Reflections on the theoretical frames and methodologies

The case study analyses reveal the potential application of multimodal design and cross-media play as theoretical and analytical tools to examine cross-media discourse. In addition, the analysis particularly illustrates how theories of cross-media play may nuance the analysis of discourse and multimodal design. However, while a case study examination of a cross-media world provides the opportunities to reveal the dynamics of various sites of articulation, some of the specific nuances at these various sites may be lost.

The case study of Narnia provides a wide-ranging view of the various levels of cross-media discourse. The strength of this macro-approach lies in the revelation of interesting patterns across the various sites. For example, the fieldwork transcripts are placed in tandem with digital fan culture discourse revealing interesting patterns for comparison and contrast. A limitation arises in the de-emphasis on the details of the contexts at these various sites of discourse in order to sustain coherence of the analysis. The analytical frames to examine multimodal design and cross-media play proved to be difficult to apply due to the nature of social semiotic analysis, and the varied nature of the data. The adaptation of the analysis of multimodal design with the cross-media play categories provided a manner to connect the discourses in both audience and textual
sites. However, the detail of the discourse analysis at points is a bit inconsistent in order to address these various cross-media practices. Finally, while I attempted to simplify the analysis of the social semiotic functions across the franchise texts, and audience discourse, interesting patterns and nuances may be lost in the attempt to find consistencies and coherence between the audience and textual data. For example, in the analysis of the “Lucy-Breakaway” fanvideo (mogi93 2006) in Chapter Six, the selected focus on the articulation of discourses of tween girlhood through the multimodal design, does not address the dynamic interaction between the producer and other Youtube users in response to the video.

8.5 Implications and applications for future cross-media research

This study may be perceived as a working model for future research in cross-media texts and practices in various intersecting fields. Firstly, although outside the scope of this specific analysis, the cross-media practices and texts examined in this study have potential applications and implications for research with a focus on literacy and learning. In her study of the recreational literacies of young adults, Mackey (2007) theorizes the thick play of the research participants in terms of expertise and mastery in literacy learning. She particularly discusses the potential for the application of 'thick play' as learning tools in classrooms. Comparatively, the case study analyses in this thesis may be applied in pedagogic and learning-oriented research to explore potential ways that adaptations, merchandise and digital fan cultures provide opportunities for critical engagement with cross-media texts. For many participants, the official website of a book, film or franchise provides only one entry among many into a number of online forums. These digital productions and spaces exemplify how new media provides
opportunities for active engagement with the discourses and design features of older media. Moreover, this study illustrates the significance of the multimodal design of franchised texts as well as paratextual elements in terms of the negotiation and articulation of discursive identities. This may have pedagogic implications for educators to address the role of cross-media design in pedagogical approaches to print texts as well as media texts.

A published chapter (Hamer 2009) inspired by this doctoral research explicitly uses The Chronicles of Narnia as a model for how to use cross-media phenomenon to jump-start literacy teaching and learning at the primary school level. Building on these approaches for the primary classroom, I also perceive the pedagogic application for this study in the post-secondary teaching of young people’s texts and cultures to undergraduates and pre-service teachers. In order to engage readers who experience texts outside of the classroom as cross-media phenomena, it is crucial that educators of all levels from early childhood educators to post-secondary instructors provide opportunities for students to share their extra-curricular media knowledge, skills, and experiences. These skills may range from technical skills from experiences with the production of remix fan videos, to behind-the-scenes information gained through viewing the of a film DVD (for example background information about C.S. Lewis’s experiences during World War II that may contribute to the written analysis of the print text).

Related to the pedagogic implications of this research, this model may be expanded into an extensive ethnographic research study. Due to my background and interest in children’s literature and literary theory as well as geographic, financial, and other constraints, the audience studies provided only one thread of this multi-layered case study approach. I foresee the possibility of future research that expands the ethnographic
element of the study. Following theoretical work by Leander and McKim (2003) on the ethnography of literacy between online and offline spaces, an expansion of this doctoral research may involve audience studies that focus on specific individual participants and follow them across home, school, and digital cultures of engagement related to a particular cross-media world. Moreover, as addressed in the theoretical frame, an ethnographic study over a longer time period with individual participants would provide the opportunity for an expansion of the theory of cross-media play to include a theory of embodied play and an extended theory of cross-media discourse across material and digital spaces.

Another potential application of this study for future research would be the inclusion of various other franchises and cross-media worlds that provide representations and adaptations that are more significantly located outside of normative articulations of girlhood through Caucasian, Anglo-American, and upper middle class female protagonists. This expanded study may include the analysis of a mainstream franchise around an African-American heroine such as Disney’s That’s So Raven. Another case study that would provide an interesting comparison with the two mainstream franchises in this thesis, may be the animated film, graphic novel and musical adapted from Neil Gaiman’s novel Coraline (2003). Coraline articulates the normative discourses of tween girlhood observed in The Chronicles of Narnia; however, unlike many of these other case study examples, Gaiman’s representation integrates subversive commentary on the cultural history of many discourses within the textual design. In addition, a case study of a cross-media world around Coraline would also provide the opportunity to expand on issues raised in this study regarding the diversity of audience engagement from toddlers to adults.
8.6 Concluding thoughts

The cross-media worlds of tween franchises provide rich sites to critically examine the roles of cross-media practices in the articulation and negotiation of discourses around identity, particularly for young people. Moreover, cross-media practices of production and consumption have become central to the commercial and media cultures of young people. This research is particularly relevant to the development of new critical frames and approaches to the study of cross-media cultures in terms of the integration of analytical approaches to texts and audience studies. Few research studies have extensively applied the rigorous cross-media analysis of both texts and audience practices in the context of cross-media cultures of young people. This thesis may be viewed as an example of how a case study approach to a cross-media phenomenon may integrate social semiotic approaches to multimodal design with the analysis of discourses at the site of audiences and institutions. There are various avenues for the potential expansion and application of this project in both future research and pedagogic contexts. Thus, this research significantly contributes to the emerging work on cross-media texts, practices and cultures in the intersecting fields of children’s literature criticism, New Literacies, girlhood studies, and the study of children’s media cultures.
REFERENCES


---. *After the Death of Childhood: Growing up in the Age of Electronic Media.*


Burrows, Andy. "Developing the Characters for *The Chronicles of Narnia* videogame."


*Carrington, Victoria. "I'm in a Bad Mood. Let's Go Shopping": Interactive Dolls,*


Cherland, Meredith Rogers and Carole Edelsky. "Girls and Reading: The Desire for


Cooper, Dianne. "Retailing Gender: Adolescent Book Clubs in Australian Schools."


Glaser, Bridgette. "Gendered Childhoods on the Discursive Formation of Young Females


Gota, Maya; Dafna Lemish, Amy Aidman, Heysung Moon. *Media and Make-Believe Worlds of Children: When Harry Potter Meets Pokemon in Disneyland.* Lea's


High School Musical: Sing It! (Game and microphone). Disney Interactive Studios.


Hornberg, Brian Alan. "Beyond the Word/Image Dialectic: A Visual Grammar for


Kirkham, Pat and Sarah Warren. "Four Little Women: Three Films and a Novel."


La Monica, Paul R. “Disney’s billion dollar tween machine.” CNNMoney.com.


---. "Did Elena Die? Narrative Practices of an Online Community of Interpreters."


McDonogh, Gary and Robert Rotenberg, eds. The Cultural Meaning of Urban Space.


“Meet the Trollsen twins.” *Peta2.com*. PETA (People for the Ethical Treatment of


---. "A Lunessa fairytale-episode 8 (Nei Silenzi).” *Youtube.* Youtube. 15 November


The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe.


---. “Room to Dance.” *In Front of the Children: Screen Entertainment and Young


Tasker, Yvonne. *Working Girls: Gender and sexuality in popular cinema*. London:


The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe. Dir. Bill Melendez. Bill Melendez Productions, Children's Television Workshop, TV Cartoons. Original television broadcast:
April 1, 1979 (UK/USA). Television.


*The Princess Diaries 2: Royal Engagement.* Dir. Garry Marshall. Perf. Anne Hathaway,


Occupant Films, SBK Pictures, 2008. Film.


APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1: PRELIMINARY READING QUESTIONNAIRE FOR PILOT STUDY AND FIELD WORK

Reading background questionnaire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Female/Male</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

What books have you read? Please put an “X” in all the boxes that apply to you.
For example, if you have read the book and saw the movie, put an “X” in both the Read the book and Saw the movie/DVD boxes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone, J.K. Rowling</th>
<th>Read the book</th>
<th>Read part of book</th>
<th>Someone read the book to me</th>
<th>Read others by the same author/series</th>
<th>Huge fan of book</th>
<th>Not a fan</th>
<th>Saw the movie/DVD</th>
<th>Heard about it</th>
<th>Don’t know it</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe, C.S. Lewis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lost Treasure of the Emerald Eye, Geronimo Stilton</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horrid Henry and the Mummy’s Curse, Francesca Simon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dare Game Jacqueline Wilson</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Princess Diaries, Meg Cabot</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlie and the Chocolate Factory, Roald Dahl</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two of a Kind diaries, Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alice in Wonderland, Lewis Carroll</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anne of Green Gables L.M. Montgomery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hana’s Suitcase Karen Levine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ramona Quimby, Age 8, Beverly Cleary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Series of Unfortunate Events, Bad Beginning Lemony Snicket</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utterly Me, Clarice Bean, Lauren Child</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Double fudge, Judy Blume</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What other books do you like? List some of your favourites on the back of this page.
APPENDIX 2: BACKGROUND INFORMATION ABOUT MCMILLAN PUBLIC SCHOOL (FIELD WORK SITE)

- Toronto District School Board, Public School, Junior Kindergarten-Grade 5, North Toronto
- The old school was built in 1927, and the new McMillan Public School was completed in 1998.
- Currently serves over 600 students and is diverse in its makeup (see demographic breakdown chart)
- English as a second language support assists many of the students.
- Daycare programs are available and a nursery program for preschool children
- McMillan is a wheelchair accessible building
- Green Level National Quality Institute (NQI) school
- In 2006 it was recognized by the Health and Physical Education Department as a number one school for Toronto Schools on the Move

Student demographic breakdown (Spring 2006)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total number of students:</th>
<th>642</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Junior Kindergarten - Grade 3</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 4 - Grade 5</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender:</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Percent.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>302</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>340</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary language other than English:</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Percent.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students born outside of Canada:</td>
<td>565</td>
<td>88%*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students living in Canada for 2 years or less</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students living in Canada for 3 - 5 years</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Calculation does not include students for whom language information is missing

Percentage of Students at or above the provincial standard (Levels 3 and 4), 2005-2006

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test subject</th>
<th>School</th>
<th>Board</th>
<th>Province</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade 3 Reading</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 3 Writing</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 3 Mathematics</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 3: CONSENT FORM FOR FIELD WORK

Canada and UK: Grade 3 Books and media research project

Your child's grade 3 class at McMillan school has been chosen to be part of a research project comparing the book and media preferences of 8 and 9 year old students in the United Kingdom and Canada. Naomi Hamer, a PhD student at the University of London, Institute of Education, United Kingdom, will be visiting our classroom throughout the month of June 2006. She will be leading discussions and activities related to books geared at this age group.

Any data collected will be used for educational purposes only and all names will be changed. Please note that no photographs or videos will be taken during regular class time.

Thank you for your assistance with this project. It will be a great opportunity for the students to discuss books and media and take part in an enriched international experience.

If you have any questions or concerns regarding this research project please contact:

Naomi Hamer
PhD candidate
Institute of Education
University of London
naomihamer@yahoo.com
Phone: 416 783-0258

PLEASE SIGN AND RETURN AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. THANK YOU!

I give permission for ___________________________ to participate in the books and media project with Naomi Hamer.

___________________________________________  ___________________________
parent/guardian signature date

Special Video Consent
In addition, there will be a number of special workshops to give the students extra time to share their thoughts about books and media that will be videotaped. Any data collected will be used for educational purposes only. If you give permission for your child to participate in these extra sessions please sign the video consent below.

I give permission for ___________________________ to participate in the videotaped sessions for the books and media project with Naomi Hamer.

___________________________________________  ___________________________
parent/guardian signature date
FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION QUESTIONS (SEMI-STRUCTURED; VARIOUS MEETINGS)

- What did you think about the DVD clips? Which did you like better? Why? What are some of the differences between the two adaptations? Different points of view? Character? Setting? Special effects?
- Does it make a difference if you see the film first? Would you usually watch the film/tv show or read the book? What do you prefer? Why (visual qualities etc.)
- From the cover how do you know who would read this book? What age group? For girls and boys? Is this a film/book that both girls and boys would like? Would someone older or younger than you like this book/movie? Would boys like the movie better?
- What do you think of the different covers? Can you tell from the cover if you will like this book? What can tell you tell from the cover about the story inside? When I was reading this book, I only knew this one cover. Do you still like books if they don’t have fun pictures or graphics? Does it matter if it has the film characters on the cover? If there is a photograph on the cover?
- Does this book remind you of other books you have read or other covers you have seen? Is there a difference between books you read for school and books you would read for fun or at home?
- What makes a good story or a good movie? Are the characters the most important part or are things like action, plot, humour, and information more important? Is there a certain kind of story you like best? Do you think it is important that films/tv/books are close to real life or is it better if they are about a make-believe world?
- Is Lucy the same as she is in the book? How is she different in the different interpretations? Did you imagine pictures in your head that are different than the characters in the TV version or in your head? Does it matter if the character is different from the book?
• Do you relate to one character more than another when you are reading or watching? Who? Why? Why would you relate to Lucy more than Susan? Do you need to be similar to the characters in the story?

• Have you been to Narnia.com? or played the Narnia video game? What is on it? Is it the kind of site/game you like? Why or why not? How did you find out about the site or game? Where do you find out about books? From friends?

• Who are the special features aimed at? Do you always watch the special features after you have watched the movie? Before?

• What is the most important part of all the Narnia products for you? Do they you like the books best? The characters? The pictures? The stories? The toys? The games? Why?

• Who would you usually watch something like this with? Your friends? At home? With your brothers and sisters? How would watching it at home be different than now?

Focus group questions:

Show a DVD clip, opening credits and opening sequence- look at the menu page, special features etc. (for Hana’s suitcase also discuss the opening of the play)

DVD/book comparison- intro discussion

• What did you think about the DVD clip? How does it compare with the book?

• Who do you think would like the DVD version compared to the book? (Both girls and boys would like? Older or younger than you? Why?)

• Does the book/movie remind you of other books you have read or shows you have seen? How is it different than Narnia or The Challenge?

• Who would you usually watch something like this with? Your friends? At home? With your brothers and sisters? How would watching it at home be different than now?

• Would you usually watch the film/TV show or read the book? What do you prefer? Why (visual qualities etc.) Does it matter what order you read the book first or see the movie first?
• Depending on text: Charlie and Lola compared with Clarice Bean? Do you think the same people watch C & L and will read Clarice Bean? What would a TV show of C.B. be like? (Similar to Hana’s suitcase—if it were a show not a documentary?)

T.B. if this was a movie not a TV show what would it be like? **If you were going to make this book into a film or TV show what would it be like?** (Animated, live action, what would you change or not?)

Covers (Have main book for discussion on the table to look at along with other focal book covers including mk & a, narnia etc.)

• Did you know anything about the book before you read it? Did you know the author or other characters? Heard of the movie?

• Do you usually choose your own books or does someone else? Who recommends books to you? Do you trade books with friends? Where do you get your books from library, book sale, school/class library, and bookstore? Is there a section you usually go to?

• How do you decide which book to read? (Look at the cover, read the back etc.?)

• Let’s say all these books were at the book sale last week. How would you decide between all these books (looking at the covers lying on the table)? Is this the type of book you would usually read? Why or why not?

• From the cover who do you think would like to read this book? (What age group? For girls and boys? Is this a book you would read at school/home/library with friends? How does it compare?)

• How is reading a book like Clarice Bean different than Hana’s suitcase or MK & A?

• Discuss other possibilities for the cover of this book.

**Inside the book (related to post-it sharing)**

**Design features—**

• What do you think about the design of the book? (Do you like the way the pages are set up? Are they different than other books you read?)
• What features of the book (the cover, the pictures, the type of lettering) do you like? Are they usually what you would read? Why do you think the author/publisher chose this cover or this font etc?

• Do you like it when books imitate websites or chatroom (other media) depicted in the book? Why or why not?

Reading process
• What did you first think about when you saw the book? Did you start at the beginning and skim and look at the pictures? Did your ideas about the book change as you were reading? Would you jump back and forth to your favourite parts? Read the extra sections at the back? Does it depend on the book?

• How is reading a book different than reading a magazine or searching a website?

• Tell me a little about where you put post-it notes. Why did you put them where you did?

• When do you read (before bed, at school)? Who do you talk about the books you read to? What sorts of things do you talk about?

Characters and story preferences
• What makes a good book for you? What is most important? The characters, action, plot, humour, information...?

• Which characters do you like in the book? What did you like about the character? Different than in the movie version? Why?

• Do you think it is important that films/TV/books are close to real life or is it better if they are about a make-believe or fantasy world?

Website
• Do you have access to the Internet at home? Only at school? At your friends’ house? Do you often go to the website related to a book or show/film you like? Do you play the videogame and watch the DVD? How do you find out about the websites? Is it different than choosing a book?

• Which of the websites do you like the best (of the focal books)? Why? What makes a good website? Do you like to play the games most? Trivia?
Photographs? Video clips? Which parts do you like the best? What do you get from the site that you won’t get from the book?

• How do you know if you will like a website? Who do you think will like this website?

• If you were going to design your own website for this book (or your favourite book) what would be in it?

Products

• Do you like it when there are more products? How does it change what you feel about the book?

• What is the most important part of all the products related to this book? The books? The characters? The pictures? The stories? The toys? The games? Why?
### APPENDIX 5: SAMPLE PRELIMINARY ANALYSIS FOR FIELD WORK TRANSCRIPTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE &amp; TIME (APPROX)</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>KEY POINTS TO DISCUSS FROM TRANSCRIPT</th>
<th>ANALYSIS THEMES</th>
<th>THEORY / METHODOLOGY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Audiofile: W_10017narnia1.wma | After playing the full class two scenes from the new Narnia adaptation by Disney 1) Lucy through the wardrobe 2) Entering Aslan’s camp; then reading the text version out loud of the same scenes. I meet with small groups of boys and girls. Group 1: Christine, Josh, Victor, Puyan, Stephen Watch Narnia in the classroom in a small group on my ibook during recess  
* The main point of the discussion is to compare the older and newer film adaptations; also conversation about books and other products (cereal box) | * Lucy is “fat”; she’s ugly;  
* Costumes are so fake/Aslan looks like a toy “it is a toy” “that is so fake” robot ‘pretty good for the 1980s Now they make it more real”  
* We want to see the war!  
* Lucy couldn’t fit onto one page  
* What kind of cereal do you like?  
* cooler covers?  
* Would you related to one Edmund goes to white witch castle; Lucy, Peter  
* Trump cards (4 £? is that really 4 £?)  
* which texts do you like the best? The book (schoolly answer) the videogame  
* I played it before with my friend  
*website is | *authenticity of fantasy (modal distinctions ) Narnia world; fake, costumes, toys; characters look different than in current film version; Lucy is fatter/uglier beauty expectations of filmic mode for certain kinds of effects, and visual aesthetics of actors  
* interest in action versus character | Modality –compositional - conventions of contemporary media representation triggers evaluative social mode  
*interpersonal-consumer culture capital (cereal box/trump cards) narrative/representational function (Edmund going to castle-shifts in rep of event or characters)  
* is this a compositional/modality issue-closely related to identification with characters and thus interpersonal- attempt to create realistic representation of children older version disjuncture with expectations for medi and mode  
*School literary culture-book culture  
*connection to video game (out of school social world rather than compositional
books

extra
* go to website
to play a game
*Narnia game-
Japanese
version- you
cannot pick
Aslan is
automatic play
*do you have
pictures of
England?
Are you still
going to find
Pete? (the
missing cereal
box book) Am
I
going to finish
my collection
*Narnia.com
not much to say
* the old one
sucks; I can’t
even look at
the
characters they
are so ugly I bet
they didn’t even
put on make-up

access them
*consumer
culture/fan
culture/ pop-
peer culture/
collections
details of game)

*narrative details of video
(Japanese version) and
culturally distinct game
versus film version
-game rules-options – also
special fan knowledge- hig
peer culture capital

*social world outside of
texts entirely (researcher
from England-connecti
between participants)

*collecting, fan/peer
culture- special feature
interpersonal/orientatio.

I
speaking to me (researcher
as a fan/collector like them
will I find Peter

* overarching comment ab
ugly Lucy- compositional as
modality
expectations/conventions;
identification with characte
is stymied by unfulfilled
expectations and thus less
value given to text
## APPENDIX 6: PRELIMINARY MULTIMODAL ANALYSIS CHART: NARNIA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Original novel</th>
<th>Disney film</th>
<th>Lucy's Quest book</th>
<th>BBC serial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>MODES</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Which modes are used in this scene audio, film, written language etc.?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IDEOATIONAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who or what are the important characters/settings/objects in this scene? What do they represent in the story as a whole?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTERPERSONAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whose point of view is the story told from? How? Who is the targeted viewer/reader?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>COMPOSITIONAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How is the scene composed? What is the central image in the scene? How are certain parts of the scene given more significance?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MEDIA (book, DVD, television)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What special features does the type of media bring to the scene?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 7: PERMISSION FORM FOR OLSEN STUDY INTERVIEWS

Permission to use interview
Researcher-Naomi Hamer

This interview will be part of a research project examining the book and media preferences of preadolescents in the United Kingdom and Canada.

Any data collected will be used for educational purposes only. The interview will be audio-recorded. Please note that no photographs or videos will be taken. Names will be changed if indicated on the form below.

Thank you for your assistance with this project. Your participation is greatly appreciated. If you have any questions or concerns please contact:

Naomi Hamer
PhD candidate
Institute of Education
University of London
naomihamer@yahoo.com
Phone: 416 783-0258

I give permission for this interview to be used for academic research and educational purposes.

__________________________________________
Name of Participant/Interviewee

__________________________________________
Participant/interviewee signature Date

My name may be used for academic research and educational purposes. YES / NO
APPENDIX 8: FAN QUESTIONNAIRE-GROWING UP WITH THE OLENS

Name (optional):
Age:
Occupation:
Nationality:
Current place of residence (country, city):
Place(s) of residence between 1987-2000 (country, city):

Please write in as much detail as you wish for each of the following questions. If possible, type your responses in bold typeface or a distinct font.

1) How did you become a fan of Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen initially?

2) Which of their home videos and television programs did you watch? How old were you?

Please note in the chart below which of the following videos and television shows you have viewed. Note which were your favorites or any special memories in the corresponding spaces provided. Feel free to write as much as you want and expand the rows in the chart as required.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Video/Show</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Full House (TV)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two of a Kind (TV)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary-Kate and Ashley in Action (TV)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Adventures of Mary-Kate and Ashley</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You're Invited to Mary-Kate and Ashley's</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Grandmother's House We Go</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Double Double Toil and Trouble</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How the West Was Fun</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Little Rascals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It Takes Two</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Billboard Dad</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switching Goals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passport to Paris</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winning London</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holiday in the Sun</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When in Rome</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Challenge</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York Minute (Feature film)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>So Little Time (TV)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4) How did you access the videos? Did you own them? Rent them? Borrow them from the school or public library? Watch them by yourself, with siblings or at a friend’s house?

5) Did you read books from any of their books series? Which ones?

6) Did you purchase other Olsen products? Where?

7) Have you ever created, visited or participated on a Mary-Kate and Ashley Olsen related website?

8) As an adult remembering the experience, what do you think drew you to their videos/books/other products?

9) Did you identify with Mary-Kate and/or Ashley? Why?

10) What other memories do you have related to the Olsens from your childhood and adolescence?

11) When did you stop watching/reading Olsen videos/books? To what extent are you still interested in their current careers and personal lives?

12) Any other comments about the Olsen twins that you would like to add?

Thank you very much for taking the time to respond to these questions. Please email your completed questionnaire and permission form to hamer.naomi@googlemail.com.